

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
Bangladesh, September 2009

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street NE, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Mohammed Abu Eusuf
Organization: Department of Development Studies,
University of Dhaka
Address: Dhaka – 1000, Bangladesh
Telephone: +880-1711287444
E-mail: eusuf101@yahoo.com

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	3
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire.....	4
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links	5
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal...	7
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	8
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	9
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	10
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	22
Comprehensiveness	32
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	40
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	47
Section Three: The Budget Process	54
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	55
Legislative Approval of the Budget	59
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	65
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution.....	78

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	2009-2010
Executive's Budget Proposal	2009-2010
Supporting Budget Documents	2009
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2009-2010
In-Year Reports	2008-2009
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	Not Available
Audit Report	Not Available

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not produced
Budget Summary	Budget in Brief 2009 -10, June 11, 2009 http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/budget/09_10/brief/en.pdf
Executive’s Budget Proposal	Combined Demand for Grants 2009-2010, June 11, 2009 http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/budget/09_10/cdg/en/Sum1.pdf
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, June 11, 2009 http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/budget/09_10/ber/bn/Bangla-09_.pdf Annual Development Program (ADP). Ministry of Planning. (available to public but only hard copy). June 11, 2009.
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Budget Speech 2009 - 10, June 11, 2009 http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/budget/09_10/speech/bs_09_10_en.pdf
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Medium-Term Budget Framework (2009-10 to 2010-12), June 11, 2009 http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/budget/09_10/mtbf/en.pdf
Citizens Budget	“Not Produced”
Enacted Budget	Appropriations Act 2009, 30th June 2009 “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet”
In-Year Reports	Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, April 2009 Released July 2009 http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/budget/mfr/mfr_april_09.pdf
Mid-Year Review	“Not Produced”

Year-End Report	"Not Produced"
Audit Report	"Produced but Not Available to the Public"
Other Documents	Annual Financial Statement 2009-2010, June 11, 2009 http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/budget/09_10/afs/en.pdf Supplementary Budget 2008-09, June 11, 2009 http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/budget/09_10/sup/en.pdf
Relevant Ministries & Departments	Ministry of Finance http://www.mof.gov.bd/ National Board of Revenue http://www.nbr-bd.org/ Planning commission http://www.plancomm.gov.bd/

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive's Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
	Pre-budget	Executive's Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes					Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public						
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive's Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	No	No	No	Yes	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	Yes	Yes	No	No	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark "Yes" if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes	Yes	
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public					Yes
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes	Yes			
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	Yes	No	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	Yes	No	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	Yes	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	Yes	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	Yes	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	No	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	Yes	Yes	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	Yes	Yes	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	No	NA	NA	NA

⁺Mark "Yes" if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Note 1: The Open Budget Survey research process was carried out over a 12-month period and the final version of the Open Budget Questionnaires reflect decisions made after multiple rounds of discussions between Survey researchers, peer reviewers, and the International Budget Partnership (IBP) (in several countries these decisions also considered comments received from governments). When peer reviewers or governments agreed with the answers provided by researchers, they often provided no comment. Thus for many questions, the section in the questionnaire that should contain peer reviewer comments is left blank. However, if the government did not provide any comments to a question (because it did not dispute the answer), the section within the questionnaire that is meant to reflect government comments specifies the answer that the government agreed with (by default).

Since the IBP continued its discussions with the researchers even after receiving peer reviewer and government comments, for some questions these discussions resulted in a mutual decision to change the answers, even if the peer reviewers and governments agreed with the original answer provided by the researcher. Such changes may have happened as a result of:

1. A more consistent application of the Survey methodology;
2. New information identified by the researcher or by IBP that had a bearing on the answer for a particular question; or
3. Decisions made to ensure cross-country comparability of answers.

For more information on these changes for any question please write to info@internationalbudget.org.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Statement II: Non-Development and Development Expenditure by Ministry/Division, Budget in Brief 2009-2010, Page 6-13</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All expenditures for the Budget 2009-2010 are provided by Ministry/Division.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In each year budget document publishes by the Finance Division shows detailed expenditures by ministry/division and respective department/directorate/agency wise as well. These are numerical information. Budget for the autonomous body functioning under any ministry/division is also shown but not in detail.</p>	a

<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010 P. 15, 17 - 19, 31; Budget Speech P. 27 - 79</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All expenditure for the Budget 2009-2010 is classified by functional classification.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In each year budget document publishes by the Finance Division shows detailed expenditures (coding are: constitutional, ministry/division/agency, functional, economic) by ministry/division and respective department/directorate/agency wise as well. These are all numerical information.</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P. 33-35</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All non-development expenditures of 2009-2010 are classified by economic classification.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In each year detailed budget documents are published with the reflection of economic coding particularly for non-development budget. And in case of development budget allocations are not shown economic code wise.</p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>4. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Annual Development Program (ADP) 2009-2010</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All program specific data are provided in the Annual Development Program (ADP).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In addition to showing expenditures for individual programs in the Annual Development Program (ADP), a large number of programs are also shown in the non-development budget. This is because programs are also being implemented under the non-development budget.</p>	a
<p>5. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Medium Term Budget Framework (MTBF) 2009-10 to 2011-12 pg. 50.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Budget 2009-2010 of 20 ministries were prepared under MTBF covering 63% of total program expenditure.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> For the Fiscal Year (FY) 2010-11 33 ministries/divisions have formulated their budget under the MTBF process, which covers 69% of the total budget. MTBF is a process which follows estimation of the budget for one year and projection for next two years.</p>	a

6. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?
- a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
 - b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
 - c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
 - d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
 - e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Medium Term Budget Framework (MTBF) 2009-10 to 2011-12

Comment:

The Budget 2009-2010 for 20 ministries was prepared under MTBF covering 63% of total program expenditure. Please see "Foreword" of MTBF 2009-2010 by Finance Minister.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Government Comment: For the Fiscal Year (FY) 2010-11 33 ministries/divisions have formulated their budgets under the MTBF process, which covers 69% of the total budget. MTBF is a process which follows estimation of the budget for one year and projection for next two years.

b

<p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Statement I: Broad details of Revenue Receipts, P. 3 & 5, Budget in Brief 2009-2010</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Different sources of tax revenue are identified. As per graph 1 (pg 3) the distribution of tax revenue according to the National Board of Revenue- (NBR) is as follows: VAT 37.4%, import duty 17.1%, income tax 27.1%, supplementary duty 17.2% and Others 1.2%.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Comment is fine.</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Statement I: Broad details of Revenue Receipts, P. 3 & 5, Budget in Brief 2009-2010</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Different sources of non-tax revenue are identified; for instance Dividend & Profit, Tolls and Levies and Administrative Fees and Charges.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In each year a book namely “Consolidated Fund-- Receipts” is published by the Finance Division, in which non-tax revenue details have been reflected.</p>	a
<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Medium Term Budget Framework (MTBF) 2009-10 to 2011-12, pg 20, Tables 2.1 'Medium Term Macroeconomic Framework FY 10-FY-12, and pg 29 3.2 Summary Statement of Budget Balance' FY 10-FY12.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are provided in the above mentioned document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a

<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Medium Term Budget Framework (MTBF) 2009-10 to 2011-12, pg 62, Tables 5.5 “Revenue Projection in the Medium Term.”</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>11. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget). b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year. c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year. d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Information for outstanding government debt is highlighted in the Medium Term Macroeconomic Framework (MTMF). This is prepared for the Coordination Council--a committee headed by the honorable Minister for Finance and other members are Secretary, Finance, Secretary, Economic Relation Division, Chairman, National Board of Revenue (NBR), Governor, Bangladesh, Secretary, Planning Division.</p>	d
<p>12. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented. b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P. 1, 15</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Interest payments on the debt are provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a

<p>13. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</p> <p>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P 1-2 Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 254, 287</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Only information on debt classification (domestic and external) is provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review P. 2-3</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some discussion is included in the Medium Term Macroeconomic Framework (MTMF) in Chapter One (Macroeconomic Situation).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	C
<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No sensitivity analysis on the budget is included in any of the budget documents.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d

<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget Speech 2009 -2010, P.24-69</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Ministries/divisions that are formulated budget under the MTBF process establish link to their policy objectives with their resources and resources to the performance. In the MTBF book, links that affect expenditure are clearly highlighted.</p>	<p>b</p>
<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget Speech 2009 -2010, Pg-96-111. The discussions are mostly descriptive in nature and no quantitative estimates are presented.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>C</p>

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Statement II, Budget in Brief P. 6-13</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit (Ministry/Division) for BY-1.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Detailed budget document particularly for the non-development budget reflects budget for the FY 2008-09, Revised Budget for FY 2008-09 and Budget for the FY 2009-10. And information of this document is classified by administrative units (ministry, department/directorate/agency).</p>	a

<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Statement II (A), Budget in Brief P. 17-19</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> All expenditures are classified by functional classification and shown in the Budget book as FY 2008-09, Revised Budget FY 2008-09 and FY 2009-10.</p>	a
<p>20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Statement IV, Budget in Brief P. 33 -35</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> All expenditures are classified by economic classification in the detailed budget document and shown in the Budget for the FY 2008-09, Revised Budget FY 2008-09 and FY 2009-10</p>	a

<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Annual Development Program 2009-2010.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Program specific information for BY-1 is provided in the above mentioned budget document. For instance it includes expenditure information for each development project.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Information on program level expenditures is shown for BY-1 for the programs financed from the non-development and development budgets.</p>	a
<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009 pg 246 and 247.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Actual data is provided for the months July-March of 2008-2009.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a

<p>23. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</p> <p>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 3, 231-234</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Estimates of aggregate level of expenditure are provided for 2006-2007 and 2007-2008.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>24. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 3, 231-234</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure for all programs are provided for 2006-2007 and 2007-2008.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	b
---	---

<p>25. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). Before BY-3. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 3</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Actual outcomes of all expenditures are available for 2006-2007 & 2007-2008.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a
<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P. 6-13</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Prior year (2008-2009) data is always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year (2009-2010) data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	a

<p>27. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Statement I, Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P. 5</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All tax revenues (income tax, VAT, import duty etc.) are identified individually for BY-1 (2008-2009).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a
<p>28. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Statement I, Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P. 5</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All non-tax revenues (dividend and profit, interest, administrative fees and service charges, fine, etc.) are identified individually for BY-1 (2008-2009).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> And reflected in the Consolidated Fund--Receipts book.</p>	a

<p>29. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 40</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Actual data on revenues are available for July - March of 2008-2009.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a
<p>30. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 37</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Aggregate revenue data is presented for BY-2 and prior years (1999 - 2000 to 2008-2009).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a

<p>31. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 37-40</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Detailed analysis of revenues (both individual sources and by classification) is presented.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Also in the MTBF book (2009-10 to 2011-12) such prior year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification.</p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>32. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). Before BY-3. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 37</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Actual outcomes of all revenues for 2007-2008 are presented.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Actual revenue outcomes for two years are also reflected in the MTBF book (2009-10 to 2011-12).</p>	a
<p>33. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P. 41; Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 286-287</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Debt information (in terms of domestic and external, bank and non-bank) is available for 2008-2009.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	b

<p>34. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). Before BY-3. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 286-287</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> 2007-2008 is the most recent year for which debt figures reflect actual outcomes.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> When budget is prepared for the FY 2009-10.</p>	a
Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In every year's budget, the finance division and planning division keep some block allocation (extra-budgetary fund) in the non-development and development budget to meet unexpected demands. This information is also highlighted in the detailed budget and Annual Development Program (ADP) documents.</p>	d

<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Combined Demand for Grants 2009-2010</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> As such budget documents do not reflect any quantitative intergovernmental transfer information, but some of the funds are provided/allocated to particular ministries/divisions to undertake a construction works and are later transferred to an organization (i.e. Public Works Department under the Ministry of Housing and Public Works) for implementing the program.</p>	<p>C</p>
<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Combined Demand for Grants 2009-2010</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> “c” is fine.</p>	<p>C</p>

<p>38. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009-10 pg 44</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> The Budget Brief and other detailed budget document (ministry wise) reflect information on subsidies (irrigation, fertilizer and electricity), other quasi-fiscal costs provided to the Bangladesh Petroleum Corporation and grant-in-aid to the corporations (City Corporation) and state-owned enterprises and so on.</p>	C
<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on financial assets is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information on financial assets held by the government is presented.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Information regarding financial assets is reflected in the detailed budget and in the budget brief (i.e. equity), but not in detail. Therefore "c" should be the answer.</p>	d

<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information on non-financial assets held by the government is presented.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	d
<p>41. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information on expenditure arrears is presented.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	d

<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010 pg 39</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Also in the MTBF book.</p>	b
<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information on future liabilities is presented.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> This kind of information is included in the website of the Finance Division.</p>	d

<p>44. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 288, Annual Development Program 2009-2010.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Sources of donor assistance are identified by country/organization in the Bangladesh Economic Review. ADP provides project specific detailed information regarding donor assistance.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> This is also in the MTBF book.</p>	C
<p>45. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information on tax expenditures is presented in the budget documents.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d

<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No earmarked revenues are identified individually in the budget document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “as per the Section 15 (4) of the Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009, Finance Minister of the Finance Division has to present a “Trend of Income Expenditure and Economic Analysis Report” to the Parliament in every quarter of the fiscal year. A recent report was presented in Parliament in March 2010 in which detailed earmarked revenues have been highlighted. Besides, earmarked revenues are also highlighted in the Medium Term Budget Framework (MTBF) book published each year along with other budget documents. The answer should be “b.”</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

- a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
- b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
- c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
- d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

6.2% of the total budget 2009-2010 was allocated for defense (Budget in Brief P. 15). But no specific information is provided for national security and military intelligence.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." There is no basis to conclude that more than 8% of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. As the budget shows 6.2% under this head, it is safe to conclude that this percentage won't exceed 8%.

Researcher Response: I chose my answer because option d has two parts: "More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items" and "the percentage is not available to the public." The reviewer didn't get my point i.e. I meant second part of option "d," "the percentage is not available to the public" while reviewer thought that I meant first part of option d. Hence, the confusion arises.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" because according to the researcher's comment the percentage of expenditure dedicated to secret items is not available to the public.

Government Comment: Yes.

d

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget Speech 2009-2010, P. 15-27</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Budget Speech provides strong links between the national budget and governments' stated policy goals by functional category.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In addition, 33 ministries/divisions formulating budgets under the MTBF are linking their policies with their budget and budget with their performance. This is done by considering each ministries/divisions function, strategic objectives, and so on. All MTBF line ministries/divisions are also linking their policies with their budget by functional codes where budget have been shown separately (both narrative and quantitative) (see MTBF book published by the Finance Division each year during budget declaration in June.</p>	b

<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Medium Term Budget Framework (MTBF) 2009-2010 to 2011-2012. For instance, pg 87 Medium Term Expenditure for the Ministry of Education is presented in line with key policy objectives.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> MTBF currently provides strong linkage between national budget and government's stated policy goals for 20 ministries.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> From FY 2010-11, 33 ministries/divisions budget are formulated under the MTBF, where budget is estimated for one year (2010-11) and projected for two years (2011-12 and 2012-13). In these ministries/divisions Medium Term Budget Framework (MBF), extensive information on the link between the budget and the government's policy goals over the multi-year has been narrated/highlighted.</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>50. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget Speech 2009-2010, P. 54 - 60; Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 179-192</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Detailed non-financial data including the number of beneficiaries is provided for most of the programs (e.g., old age allowance, employment for the hard core poor etc.) both in the Budget Speech and Bangladesh Economic Review.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In addition, Medium Term Budget Framework (MTBF) book prepared by the line ministries/divisions highlighted number of beneficiaries covered under poverty reducing programs, particularly as the Key Performance Indicators (KPIs). Moreover, number of Social Safety net and Social Protection programs being implemented by the government, expenditure pattern and their coverage (beneficiaries) are put into the website of the Ministry of Finance at the moment of Budget declaration in the Parliament. These reports are available in the web and as published documents in the Finance Division.</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?
- The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
 - The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
 - The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
 - No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Budget Speech 2009-2010, P. 54 - 60; Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 179-192

Comment:

Detailed non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.

C

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." The non-financial data is too limited to provide adequate information on performance indicators.

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed to "c" as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" since the non-financial data is only somewhat useful for assessing the impact of an expenditure program.

Government Comment: As said earlier the MTBF document highlights the number of information/data as KPIs, output and outcome and therefore, so it is easy to assess program performance. There is also provision of quarterly review of non-financial data by the line ministries/divisions.

<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 179-192</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Performance indicators (e.g., poverty rate, access to sanitation and safe drinking water) are presented for some expenditure programs.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In the MTBF document, number of expenditure program is shown to be assessed by designing Key Performance Indicators (KPI). For example, rate of beneficiary under old age allowance program, number of disabled beneficiary, and rate of coverage of vulnerable group development (VGD) program and so on.</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All performance indicators are well designed. Most performance indicators are well designed. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Bangladesh Economic Review 2009, P. 153-170, 179-192</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some performance indicators are well-designed (e.g., enrollment rate, adult literacy rate, infant mortality rate, maternal mortality rate etc.)</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "answer should be "b." In fact, we take extra care in designing KPIs while preparing MBF. Moreover, comprehensive trainings are provided to the line ministry officials for helping them to properly designing the KPIs. It is being designed with liking policy, planning and budgeting. So it can be said that progress has been made in this regard.</p>	C
<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Medium Term Budget Framework 2009-2012 pg 94</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	C

<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget Speech 2009-2010, P. 56 - 57</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Employment generation program for the extreme poor located in the poverty prone areas, allowance for the disabled etc.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In addition, MTBF documents highlight allocation and prioritization of expenditure with a special focus on poverty reduction. A number of SSNP and Social Empowerment programs are undertaken to reduce poverty, and these are highlighted in the SSNP part of the budget speech and in the Social safety net report that is posted n the website of the Finance Division.</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	
<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> National Board of Revenue, Bangladesh at: http://www.nbr-bd.org/</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	a
<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. Only direct and indirect tax schedule is provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	d

58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

- a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
- b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

No information on conditions with regard to IFI assistance is presented in the budget document.

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose response "b" since the 2006 IMF Letter of Intent for Bangladesh is available on the IMF website at:
<http://www.imf.org/external/np/loi/2006/bgd/010906.pdf>

Government Comment: OK.

b

<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information explaining conditions with regard to IFI assistance is presented in the budget documents.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d
<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P. 1 - 2</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> "Budget at a Glance" provides the summary which is very useful.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a

<p>61. Does the executive publish a "citizens budget" or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive doesn't publish a citizens budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	d
<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No non-technical definitions of budget related terms are provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." Definitions are provided in the book "Budget in Brief." Necessary footnotes, endnotes and clarifications are also provided in other published documents.</p>	d

<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information. d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Right to Information Act, 2009</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Right to Information Act, 2009 was notified in the Bangladesh Gazette on 6 April 2009. It received the President's assent on 5 April 2009.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Highly disaggregated information is often available upon request.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Highly disaggregated non-financial information related to expenditures including the number of beneficiaries is often available upon request.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” One can easily download all necessary information related to non-financial expenditures from the Finance Division's web address. Therefore the response to this question should be “a.”</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process	
Executive's Formulation of the Budget	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The release date is set in permanent law. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This year the Minister of Finance announced the release date of the national budget 2009-2010 on 16 May 2009. Usually, the government announces the release date more than two weeks in advance.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	C
<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Budget Calendar, Secretariat Instructions 1976, pg 78. The Ministry of Finance coordinates it.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a

<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Yes, the government adheres to the dates in its timetable.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a
<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some powerful members of the legislature are always consulted. This information was gathered by interviewing some members of Parliament during the course of completing this questionnaire.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> There are 36 Parliamentary Standing Committees, for example, the Parliamentary Standing Committee for Commerce, Finance and so on. While preparing the budget and determining budget priorities all the members of the mentioned committees are consulted. So answer should be "a."</p>	c

<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A series of pre-budget consultations are held with the economists, business associations leaders, economic reporters and other civil society groups etc.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes, we also consulted representatives of non-government organization (NGO), professionals, journalists and the like.</p>	b
<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Government doesn't release a pre-budget statement to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In each year less than two months before the budget declaration, honorable Finance Minister hints towards some of the salient features of the budget to the stakeholders invited in the pre-budget sessions, and to the public through media. But the government does not release any pre-budget statement.</p>	d

<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Government doesn't release a pre-budget statement to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Not in detail but some of the highlights are presented during pre-budget session.</p>	d
<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Government doesn't release a pre-budget statement to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Not in detail but some of the highlights and some explanation are presented during pre-budget session.</p>	d

Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The legislature receives the budget on the same day when it is presented to them.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "d"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." The legislature gets only few days to discuss the budget before approving it finally.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I suggest the answer should be changed to "c" as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "c" as per the comments of Peer Reviewer One and the researcher.</p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>C</p>

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public hearings are held by legislative committees on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public hearings are held by legislative committees on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> No public hearings are held on individual budget.</p>	d
<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public hearings are held by legislative committees.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> No public hearings are held on individual budget.</p>	d

<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public hearings are held by a legislative committee.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> No public hearings held on individual budget.</p>	d
<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures. b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Parliamentary Standing Committee for the Ministry of Defense is currently provided extensive information on all spending on secret items. This information was acquired from interviewing a member of parliament who is a part of the Parliamentary Standing Committee for the Ministry of Defense. This is a recent practice since 2009.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	a

80. Does the legislature have authority *in law* to amend the budget presented by the executive?

- a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority *in law* to amend the budget.
- b. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, with some limitations.
- c. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.
- d. No, the legislature does not have any authority *in law* to amend the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Article 90 of the Constitution of the People's Republic of Bangladesh. This is because Article 90 says: No amendment shall be proposed in Parliament to any such Bill which has the effect of varying the amount of any grant so made or altering the purpose to which it is to be applied, or of varying the amount of any expenditure charged on the Consolidated Fund.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Government Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "a," because Article 89 (2) of the Constitution of the Government of Bangladesh regarding Procedure relating to annual financial statement says that: "So much of the annual financial statement as relates to other expenditure shall be submitted to Parliament in the form of demands for grants, and Parliament shall have power to assent to or to refuse to assent to any demand, or to assent to it subject to a reduction of the amount specified therein."

d

<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals or the approved budget is not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Appropriation Act 2009 (not available on the internet but hard copies are available to the public on request).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Division wise expenditures are available since 2008 on the internet.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Detailed expenditure book namely, “detail description of demands for grants and appropriation” is published after the budget declaration in the Parliament, and this book is available in the Finance Division upon request. Answer would be “b.”</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, Ministry of Finance.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position being published by Ministry of Finance is considered here as In-year report. As of 15 September 2009, Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, May FY2008-09 is available.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> As per the Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009, Section 15 (4), a quarterly report on Income-Expenditure Trend and Economic Analysis has to be presented before the Parliament. The latest report was presented in March 2010 by the honorable Finance Minister.</p>	a
<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. No in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, May FY2008-09, P.1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> According to the above mentioned report "Revenue expenditure incurred during July 08 - May 09 is about 74.1% of the budget for FY09."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	b

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, May FY2008-09, P. 3 Table a.2: Revenue Expenditure: Ministry-wise Expenditure Pattern Up to May FY09</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Actual expenditures are reported by sector, ministry and economic classification.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	b
<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, May FY2008-09, Table a.1-4, b, c.1-2 (P.2-12)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Comparative scenarios of actual year-to-date expenditures are reported.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	b

<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, Ministry of Finance.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> In addition, the quarterly report as per Section 15 (4) of the Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009 also highlights information on actual revenue collection.</p>	a
<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, May FY2008-09, Table d.1, P.13</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Actual revenue collections are reported covering all sources of revenue.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a

<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, May FY2008-09, Table d.1-2, P.13-14</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Comparative scenarios of actual year-to-date revenue collections are reported that cover all sources of revenue.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a
<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, May FY2008-09, Table f.1, P.17</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Monthly actual borrowing scenarios that cover external and domestic (banking and non-banking) financing are reported.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	a

<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.bangladesh-bank.org/econdata/govtdomdebt.html).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> While the monthly report does not include this information, the Bangladesh Bank provides information on the composition of government debt in a section covering economic data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d
<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. In-year reports are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Monthly Report on Fiscal Position, May FY2008-09 was released in September 2009.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Answer "c" is fine, because we also place a report before the Parliament on a quarterly basis.</p>	C

<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Currently the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. The government recently enacted a law titled 'Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009' on 9 July 2009. As per clause 15(4) of the law, Finance Minister shall place a quarterly report before the parliament explaining the budget status to be effective from FY2009-2010.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes, as per the Act, last report was placed before the Parliament in March 2010.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Currently the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Government recently enacted a law titled "Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009" on 9 July 2009. As per clause 15(4) of the law, the Finance Minister shall place a quarterly report before the parliament explaining the budget status to be effective from FY2009-2010.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes, as per the Act, last report was placed before the Parliament in March 2010. And it is not a mid-year review; it is a quarterly review of updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Currently the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. The government recently enacted a law titled "Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009" on 9 July 2009. As per clause 15(4) of the law, the Finance Minister shall place a quarterly report before the parliament explaining the budget status to be effective from FY2009-2010.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes, as per the Act, last report was placed before the Parliament in March 2010, which provided functional details of the budget.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
- b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Currently the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. The government recently enacted a law titled "Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009" on 9 July 2009. As per clause 15(4) of the law, the Finance Minister shall place a quarterly report before the parliament explaining the budget status to be effective from FY2009-2010.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Government Comment: Yes, as per the Act, last report was placed before the Parliament in March 2010, which provided 5-year details of updated revenue estimates and explained why they have changed from the original estimates.

d

<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive shifts funds without seeking input from the legislature and this is to be approved by the legislature at the end of the year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> "c" is perfect, as per the recently enacted act i.e. The Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009, section 12, there is a provision of revise budget, which needs to be approved by the Parliament. Also as per the Article 91 of the Constitution there is provision of supplementary and access grants to be allocated to the line ministries/divisions. It has to be approved by the President first and then the Parliament.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Although the procurement of goods and services follows an open and competitive process in paper, some irregularities are often reported in practice. As an example please refer to "Irregularities in RHD Project Execution" at: http://www.thefinancialexpress-bd.com/2009/08/03/6.html</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." So far the government of Bangladesh follows the Public Procurement Act 2006 and the Public Procurement Rules 2008 in procuring goods and services.</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

- a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).
- b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Supplementary Budget 2008-2009 is available at:
http://www.mof.gov.bd/en/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=55&Itemid=1

Comment:

Supplementary Budget 2008-2009 was approved in the parliament on 30 June 2009.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Government Comment: As per the Article 91 of the Constitution there is provision of supplementary and access grants to be allocated to the line ministries/divisions. It has to be approved by the President first and then the Parliament. It approves in the mid June, for example, if the budget places in the Parliament in the first week of June, then session is on and after discussion it approves by the Parliament on 15/20 June. As per the provision of the article Parliament approves after the funds are expended. Answer "b" is Ok.

b

<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P.1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Supplementary budget is generally kept less than 5% of the original budget. The Budget for FY2008-09 was revised to 94140 crore from the original 99962 crore.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	b
<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget in Brief 2009-2010, P. 33</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	b

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. The executive does not release a year-end report. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> As per the Public Money and Budget Management Act 2009, Section 15 (4), a quarterly report on "Income-Expenditure Trend and Economic Analysis" has to be presented before the Parliament. The last report was presented in March 2010 by the honorable Finance Minister, where actual outcome for the year are provided. So answer would be "a."</p>	d
<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Quarterly report is placed as per the act, and these are all under the purview of audit.</p>	d

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Quarterly reports highlights explanation of actual outcome, but not in detail.</p>	d
<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "the quarterly report presented in the Parliament in March 2010 broadly explains differences between the enacted expenditure levels and actual outcomes." The answer should therefore be "c."</p>	d

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “The Finance Division does not publish any year-end report, but it presents a quarterly report on Trend of Income-Expenditure and Economic Analysis to the Parliament, in which broadly outcomes for revenues are explained.”</p>	d
<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The Finance Division does not publish any year-end report, but presents a quarterly report on Trend of Income-Expenditure and Economic Analysis to the Parliament, in which broad outcomes of the macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcomes for the year are explained.</p>	d

<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Answer would be "c." The Finance Division does not publish any year-end report, but places a quarterly report on Trend of Income-Expenditure and Economic Analysis to the Parliament, where broadly actual outcome of the non-financial data and the difference between original estimates are explained, it is in fact narrative description not presented as quantitative data/information.</p>	d
<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "KPIs are not included in the quarterly report."</p>	d

<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The Finance Division does not publish any year-end report, but presents a quarterly report regarding the Trend of Income-Expenditure and Economic Analysis to the Parliament in which the broad difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are explained. It is in fact narrative description not presented as quantitative data/information</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report in Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> The Finance Division does not publish any year-end report, but presents a quarterly report on the Trend of Income-Expenditure and Economic Analysis to the Parliament, in which programs and projects taken from the unexpected head/block allocation in the Annual Development Program (ADP) and in non-development budget are briefly discussed, "c" would therefore be the answer.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> As of 15 September 2009, the final annual expenditures for 2006-07 was audited. The Audit report was placed before the parliament but it is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d

<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> As of 15 September 2009, final annual expenditures for 2006-07 were audited. The Audit report is presented to Parliament but not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d
<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Annual audit report 2006-07 includes an executive summary but the report is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	b

<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <p>a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.</p> <p>b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Head of SAI has a constitutional position and therefore cannot be removed from his office except in like manner and on the like ground as a judge of the supreme court (Article 129 (2) of Bangladesh Constitution). The head of SAI can be removed by the three members Supreme Judicial Council headed by the Chief Justice. Two other members are the senior most two judges of the affiliate division</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	a
<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <p>a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	d

<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI has full discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to. Please refer to Article 128 in the Constitution of Bangladesh.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	a
<p>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget of the SAI is determined by the Ministry of Finance in consultation with SAI. It is presented to the parliament as a Charged Expenditure just for discussion but it is no dependent on the Parliament vote.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	b

<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector are undertaken by the respective directorates.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. e. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI doesn't maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized. b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized. c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized. d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some of the audit reports are scrutinized by the Public Accounts Committee.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Yes.</p>	C

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The response "d" is correct. It only needs to specify that an audit report is prepared for internal purposes only.</p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> OK.</p>	d

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs. b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details. d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Government Comment:</u> Expenditures related to national security are not audited, but other than these expenditures all are subjected to audit and these reports are placed before the legislature. So the answer would be "b."</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------