

**International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
Cameroon, September 2009**

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street NE, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name:	Eoussa Léonard
Organization:	Budget Information Centre
Address:	P.O BOX 928 Bonanjo, Douala - Cameroun
Telephone:	+ 237 7500 0320 - 2206 4278
E-mail:	openbudget@ymail.com, onisc.infos@gmail.com,

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	3
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire.....	4
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links	5
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal...	7
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	8
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	9
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	10
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	19
Comprehensiveness	28
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	34
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	38
Section Three: The Budget Process	45
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	46
Legislative Approval of the Budget	53
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	59
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution.....	71

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	2009
Budget Summary	2009
Executive's Budget Proposal	Not Available
Supporting Budget Documents	Not Available
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2009
In-Year Reports	Not Available
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	Not Available
Audit Report	Not Available

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Circular n°001/CAB/PR of 18 September 2008 relating to the preparation of the Budget of the State for the 2009 Financial Year - published in its entirety in the Cameroon Tribune Friday, September 19, 2008 - Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet
Budget Summary	Government's Economic, Financial, Social and Cultural Programme for the 2009 financial year; Wednesday, November 19, 2008 http://www.spm.gov.cm/detail_art.php?id_art=1817&type=simple&lang=en Also published in its entirety in the daily Cameroon Tribune.
Executive's Budget Proposal	Financial Bill 2009 - Produced but Not available to the Public
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Financial Bill 2009 - Economic and Financial Report of 2008, Produced but Not Available to the Public
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Settlement Bill of the Republic of Cameroon for the 2007 Financial Year. Produced but Not Available to the Public
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Projects Log Book - Public Investment Budget per Division and per Budgetary Head - 2009 Financial Year - Produced but Not Available to the Public
Citizens Budget	Not Produced
Enacted Budget	Budget Law of the Republic of Cameroon for the 2009 Financial Year (Law n° 2008/012/of 29 December 2008); Wednesday, December 31, 2008 http://www.impots.cm/index.php?page=lois-des-finances Also published in its entirety in the Cameroon Tribune
In-Year Reports	Produced but Not Available to the Public However, a brief summary is done, and released in the daily news paper, such as "Exécution du Budget de l'Etat à fin mars 2009" or State Budget Execution at the end of March 2009 - published in its entirety in the private daily newspaper Le Messenger - Thursday, June 9, 2009

Mid-Year Review	Produced but Not Available to the Public, even if a brief summary is presented in the daily news paper, see "Exécution budgétaire à fin juin 2009"
Year-End Report	Produced but Not Available to the Public 2008** The Year-end report is integrated in the Economic and Financial report of the 2009 Financial bill supporting documents, which is also Produced but Not Available to the Public
Audit Report	Produced but Not Available to the Public
Other Documents	<p>Law n° 2007/006 of 26 December 2007 Relating to the Fiscal regime of the State - published in its entirety in the Cameroon Tribune - Friday, December 28, 2007</p> <p>Circular N°009/0002/MINFI of 14 January 2009 Instructions relating to the execution and control of the execution of the budget of the State and Subsidized Bodies for the 2009 Financial Year - published in its entirety in the Cameroon Tribune, Monday, January 19, 2009</p> <p>The 2009 State budget at glance - Produced by the Ministry of Finance - Free print copies available, but very limited distribution Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet</p> <p>Circular N°0001/MINFI/GDI/LC/L of January 2nd, 2009 Clarifying the modalities of application of taxes measures of the law n°2008 / 012 of December 29, 2008 relating to the Budget Law of the Republic of Cameroon for the 2009 Financial Year - published in its entirety in the Cameroon Tribune Monday, January 05, 2009, and available on the internet at www.impots.cm</p>
Relevant Ministries & Departments	<p>Ministry of Finance http://www.finances.cm/ Prime Minister's Office http://www.spm.gov.cm/ Supreme State Audit Office (Contrôle Supérieur de l'État) Ministry Economy, Planning and Regional Development Financial and Enquiry Commission of the National Assembly Directorate General of Taxation http://www.impots.gov.cm</p>

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive's Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
	Pre-budget	Executive's Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes						Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public		Yes		Yes	Yes	
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes		Yes			
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive's Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	No	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	No	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	Yes	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	Yes	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	NA	No	NA	NA	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark "Yes" if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes					
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes				
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	NA	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	NA	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	Yes	NA	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	Yes	NA	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	NA	NA	NA	NA

⁺Mark "Yes" if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Note 1: The Open Budget Survey research process was carried out over a 12-month period and the final version of the Open Budget Questionnaires reflect decisions made after multiple rounds of discussions between Survey researchers, peer reviewers, and the International Budget Partnership (IBP) (in several countries these decisions also considered comments received from governments). When peer reviewers or governments agreed with the answers provided by researchers, they often provided no comment. Thus for many questions, the section in the questionnaire that should contain peer reviewer comments is left blank. However, if the government did not provide any comments to a question (because it did not dispute the answer), the section within the questionnaire that is meant to reflect government comments specifies the answer that the government agreed with (by default).

Since the IBP continued its discussions with the researchers even after receiving peer reviewer and government comments, for some questions these discussions resulted in a mutual decision to change the answers, even if the peer reviewers and governments agreed with the original answer provided by the researcher. Such changes may have happened as a result of:

1. A more consistent application of the Survey methodology;
2. New information identified by the researcher or by IBP that had a bearing on the answer for a particular question; or
3. Decisions made to ensure cross-country comparability of answers.

For more information on these changes for any question please write to info@internationalbudget.org.

The Executive's Budget Proposal		
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond		
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In practice, all expenses are classified by administrative unit that is by ministries and departments. But since neither the executive's budget nor its supporting documents are publicly available to ordinary citizens, even upon request, it will not be possible for us to answer. That is why we give the score "d" to this question. This comment will apply to all similar questions in this section.</p> <p>In the production of budgetary information in Cameroon at the time of elaboration, the government uses a wide range of documents. Indeed, the finance bill which also contains the draft budget consists of three volumes of documents, as follows: the Yellow volume, the Red volume and the Green volume. The first two volumes, the yellow and red volumes, present capital expenditures and expenditures for the operation of the general administration and of sovereignty. All expenditure items and allowances by item are indicated in an exhaustive and detailed manner. The red or yellow volumes are presented in a document with the spending by service of every ministry or body of the State. The green volume is constituted of about seven books (the budget proposal, the settlement bill of the BY-2 exercise, the economic and financial report, the management of debt, agreements and loans, the State's transfers to parastatal and other establishments, spending by economic and functional classification, the project for public investment, etc.). These various documents each address a particular aspect of the Budget. The green volume's books are among the documents which the EBO uses.</p> <p>As we pointed out, these documents - as many others - are produced. However, they are unfortunately not open to the public. The fact that these documents are not available to the public makes citizens' engagement on questions related to the budget difficult, and explains people's non participation in the budgetary debate. People do not have evidence to build an argument for their discussions with the government. For example, if the yellow and red volumes were widely available, requestors of copies or of certified acts would not have to pay for the print outs of these copies because the allowances for the purchase of paper and ink for all public services of the administration are indicated in the yellow and red volume. As a consequence, people continue to pay for services for which resources are allocated in the budget. This situation</p>	d	

<p>feeds corruption in the administration and is comparable to the embezzlement of public funds.</p> <p>The government should rather make budget documents public and distribute them widely, because if documents are published, citizens will read them, and this will lead them to question themselves and the government. This questioning will produce the beginnings of a debate. Wanting to understand, citizens will go discuss documents with competent state employees at the level of their community. The participation of citizens in the budgetary debate will then be strengthened.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	
<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Indeed, Government expenditure is classified by function (office). Looking at the regulatory law which is adopted by the National Assembly, we see the functional classification of Government expenditure. But given that the bill of regulatory law which must facilitate the justification of Government expenditure during a budgetary year is not publicly available, and given that its discussion in the National Assembly is closed to the public, we maintain the score “d” for this question as for the previous one and subsequent questions.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget). b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year. c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year. d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented. b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A settlement bill for BY-2 precedes the draft budget, in which expenditures are presented at an aggregate level by government department and by economic and functional classification. Unfortunately, this document is available only after its adoption by Parliament.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The percentage of expenditure dedicated to secret items is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring</p>	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	
<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

- a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
- b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

IMF *Letter of Intent* published on June 18, 2009:
<http://www.imf.org/external/np/loi/2009/cmr/061809.pdf>

Comment:

On the very last page of the Letter of Intent, Inoni Ephraim, the Prime Minister, in point 21 states that, "The government of Cameroon authorizes the IMF to publish this letter."

C

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b."

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b."

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should remain as indicated in the questionnaire, which means I maintain the score "d" for this question. By associated conditions, we see the global amount of the assistance, the duration of the contract or the subsidy, and the interest rate for the reimbursement. In addition, it is the government's responsibility to provides information for citizens, as well as the IMF's responsibility to inform the world of its activities.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire* page 36, states that "should be grounds for a "c" answer if at least some other information is made available."

<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> "Government's Economic, Financial, Social and Cultural Programme for the 2009 financial year;" Wednesday, November 19, 2008 http://www.spm.gov.cm/detail_art.php?id_art=1817&type=simpl&lang=en</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The economic agenda which summarizes the Budget contains quantitative and qualitative data which are either financial or social objectives. Regarding the brief presentation of the Budget 2009, we notice that the government's main lines of action are enumerated. The projects are quantified, which provides a database for civil society's follow-up work for independent citizen control. Citizens who read this brief presentation know the number of roads that the government intends to rehabilitate or build, the number of classrooms and the number of housing units.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>61. Does the executive publish a "citizens budget" or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget proposal as it is presented does not clarify the definitions of the used terms. However, when we refer to the law "loi portant régime financier de l'Etat," in particular articles 8 and 9, terms such as Function, Program, Activity and chapter, section, article and paragraph are defined within the Budget Law document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

63. Do citizens have the right *in law* to access government information, including budget information?
- Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
 - Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
 - Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
 - No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

The constitution of Cameroon does not include a provision that guarantees citizens access to government information.

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." Citizen rights and freedoms including the right to information and conditions to development are enshrined in the Preamble of the Constitution, and freedom of information and of the press and media's access to information laws have been enacted. However, implementation remains an issue, together with citizens' - including journalists' - capacity to engage public authorities in accordance with legal provisions, and with integrity.

d

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should remain as I indicated in the questionnaire: "d." I do not agree with the Peer Reviewer, because it seems that there is some confusion about the question. The preamble of the constitution states freedom of communication, association, press and meeting. But the same constitution states that these freedoms are specified by particular texts. Till now, there are only particular texts with Associations, NGO, Trade workers unions, and private press freedom. In the private press text, there is a chapter standing with social communication, but in this text, there is no reference to citizen information. So we conclude that there is no mechanism according to the law to access information. It should be clear that Government must deliver information to the public about public affairs.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The question asks if a "Freedom of Information" law exists; such a law does not exist in Cameroon.

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process		
Executive's Formulation of the Budget		
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The release date is set in permanent law. b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d	

<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <p>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "d"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "c."</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I suggest the answer should remain as I indicated in the questionnaire answer: "d." The executive does not release its timetable to the public. And I think this is the main reason why the Peer Reviewer did not give a citation for reference documents. They have never seen it in a public release information channel. If one could find it somewhere, there should be an indication. So the score of this question should be maintained as "d."</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The peer reviewer has not provided enough information to suggest otherwise.</p>	<p>d</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release its timetable to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The government does not hold consultations with members of parliament during the elaboration of the budget, because the document of the draft budget is often finalized when members of parliament are already in full parliamentary session for the examination of the budget. The government's delay in the elaboration of the draft budget is one of the causes of the absence of consultation. But in the opinion of members of parliament and even state employees of the Ministry of Finance who requested anonymity, this delay is voluntary because the government does not want to justify certain expenditures.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Circular n°001/CAB/PR of 18 September 2008 relating to the preparation of the Budget of the State for the 2009 Financial Year - published in its entirety in the Cameroon Tribune Friday, September 19, 2008.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Since 2003, the financial year is aligned with the calendar year in Cameroon; it begins in January and it ends in December. In practice, the pre-budget statement is usually released at least two months (but less than four months) before the budget year. For example, the 2009 pre-budget statement was released on September 19th, 2008, and the 2007 pre-budget statement was published on September 7th, 2006.</p> <p>For the budget summary, the Prime Minister began presenting the budget to the National Assembly in 2009. Before 2009, it was the Minister of Finance who presented the budget and this presentation was not released by the media. Since 2009, the event became public and the entire speech of the Prime Minister is reported in the columns of the Cameroon Tribune, the national public daily newspaper. The public is thus informed a day later about government commitments for the upcoming budget year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Circular n°001/CAB/PR of 18 September 2008 relating to the preparation of the Budget of the State for the 2009 Financial Year - published in its entirety in the Cameroon Tribune Friday, September 19, 2008</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Details on the macroeconomic framework in the pre-budget statement include the gross domestic product (GDP) growth rate, inflation rates and the global budgetary balance on a commitment basis.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government's policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?
- Yes, an extensive explanation of the government's budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
 - Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government's budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.
 - Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
 - No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

In the circular N°001 CAB / PR of September 18th, 2008 relative to the preparation of the Budget for the fiscal year 2009, the major objectives of the budget are:

The search for strong economic growth by the re-launching of public investments and the improvement of national production's competitiveness with the aim of public conservation of Cameroonians' purchasing power and the control of the accounts' deficit.

The priorities of policies and actions of the government are:

- The creation of wealth and jobs through the realization of big agricultural and industrial projects;
- The development of road, harbor and railroad infrastructures;
- The development of electrical energy and renewable energies, in particular solar energy;
- The improvement of populations' access to water, electricity and decent accommodation;
- The intensification of headways achieved in the education and health sectors;
- The development of information technologies and communication;
- The effective improvement of the quality of public spending and the intensification of the fight against corruption.

Comment:

The government's objectives and priorities of action are broadly presented in the pre-budget statement. The actions are presented by sector: institutional, economic, social, health, etc. The only issue is that, in the presentation of these priorities in financial allocations, questions always remain because ministries concerned by these priority actions do not always receive the budgetary subsidies to justify the priorities expressed in the circular.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

b

Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 39 paragraph 1 of the law n°2007/006 of December 26th, 2007 on the financial and fiscal regime of the State stipulates that, "The finance bill of the year, including the compulsory appendices foreseen in the article 36 above, must be deposited on the desk of the parliament at the latest fifteen (15) days before the beginning of the session."</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c
<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> During the budgetary session, in particular during the examination of the draft budget law, all members of the government are heard by the finance committee to support their expenditure estimates.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "b"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "d."</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> The answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two. There are no public hearings, but instead, an opening questions party is held where some ministries are questioned by parliamentarians for their branch budget. The media and the public are part of this exercise, because it is held in commission.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> Based on a review of comments, IBP editors chose answer "d."</p>	<p>d</p>
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <p>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</p> <p>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Members of parliament receive no information about secret spending. Moreover, the law n°2007 / 006 of December 26th, 2007 on the financial regime of the State stipulates in article 70 page 31, that no document can be refused to the special rapporteurs of the commission of the National Assembly in charge of public spending and control of the use of public money, notwithstanding "subjects of secret character touching the national defence, the investigation secrecy and the medical secrets."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations. c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited. d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to the law n°2007 / 006 of December 26th, 2007 on the financial regime of the State, article 44: "no proposal of amendment in the Budget Law can be presented by a member of parliament if it has the effect of reducing public resources or increasing public expenditures without reducing expenses or creating new revenues of equal importance."</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The text of the law suggests the possibility of amending the budget proposal. However, the government's practise - which limits the time for the examination of the budget proposal - does not allow members of parliament to examine the budget proposal in depth or to present propositions of amendment; moreover, the absence of public hearings during budget examination considerably limits parliament's effectiveness in this regard.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals or the approved budget is not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Part II - Title 1 of "Budget Law of the Republic of Cameroon for the 2009 Financial Year" (Law n° 2008/012/of 29 December 2008); Wednesday, December 31, 2008 http://www.impots.cm/index.php?page=lois-des-finances</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The public investment budget voted by the National Assembly and released to the public only details total allocations to ministerial chapters. The allocations to investment and operating expenditures are only available as aggregates. The downgrade of the score for this question from 2008 reflects the fact that supporting documents of the executive's budget proposal which detail expenditures are not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The government does not release to the public budget execution reports. However, following government commitments to international financial institutions, we observe a minor improvement with the publication of summary information on revenue collection and aggregate spending at the end of the first and second quarters of the current financial year. For example, the press release which describes budget execution at the end of the first quarter presents revenues by source and expenditures by function.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The press release which presents the state of execution of revenues and expenses in the course of the year includes aggregate information. This information is presented by functions and in the aggregate. For example, wages, expenditure on goods and services, investment expenditure, etc.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> See comment for Q 82.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment Q82</p> <p>The government does not publish the budget execution reports. Regarding commitments with the international financial institutions, we observe a slight change with the publication of a summary report that covers revenue and breaks down expenditures by general area at the end of the first quarter and of the first half of the current budget year. For example, the statement that reports on the budget execution at the end of the first quarter presents actual revenue figures by source and expenditures by function.</p> <p>The report on the budget now being executed or the quarterly report presents actual revenue by general area according to types of revenue sources: oil, tax, non-tax. Several taxes are cited, for example, the corporate income tax, the VAT and excise taxes, the special tax on petroleum products (TSPP), etc.</p> <p>Execution of the Government Budget as of end-March 2009 (in billions of</p>	d

F CFA)									
Headings	LF	Proj.03.09	Actual 03.09	Actual 03.08	Actual rate	Discrep.-			
Va		(a)	(b)	(c)	(b/a%)	(b-a)	(b/c.abs-		
(b/c%)									
Int.Rev.	2054.4	541	413.7	503	79.8	-109.3	-71.3	-14.2	
Oil Rev.	519.4	105	43.2	131	41.1	-61.8	-87.8	-67	
SNH royalty	399.4	105	43.2	131	41.1	-61.8	-87.8	-67	
Oil corp. tax	120	0	0	0		0	0		
Non-oil rev.	1535	436	388.5	372	89.1	-47.5	16.5	4.4	
Tax rev.	1429	411.7	374.9	353.3	91.1	-36.8	21.6	6.1	
Tax rev./T	961	297.1	266.2	252.8	89.6	-30.9	13.4	5.3	
Vat	329	78	63.2		59.7	81	-14.8	3.5	
5.9									
Non-oil corp. tax	215.3		119	111.8	106.5	93.9	-7.2	5.3	
5									
Special tax	65.6	16.1	18.5	13.7	114.9	2.4	4.8	35	
T TSSP									
recording									
Tax	73.7	18	15.8	15.4	87.8	-2.2	0.4	2.6	
	93	22	19.1	17.1	86.8	-2.9	2	11.7	
Customs rev.	468	114.6	108.7	100.5		94.9	-5.9	8.2	8.2
Customs duty	224.9		55	51.7	48.7		94	-3.3	3
6.2									
Im VAT +									
Special/imp	222.4	55.2	53.2	47.9	96.4	-2	5.3	11.1	
Export tax	5.6	1.4	1.2	1.1	85.7	-0.2	0.1	9.1	
Non-tax rev.	106	24.3	15.2	18.3	62.7	-9.1	-3.1	-16.7	
Receivables	0	0	-1.7	0.4		-1.7	-2.1	-525	

Government budget execution as of end-March - Division of Economic Affairs – Ministry of Finance - Source *le Messager* n°2871 of Tuesday, June 9, 2009.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment for Q82.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. d. In-year reports are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Concerning the mid-year report, the depreciation of the score is linked to the fact that we applied the methodology strictly as regards the availability of documents as described in the guide for the research.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 54 paragraph 3 of the financial regime stipulates that "parliament shall ratify the modifications thus made to appropriations in the next finance bill of the year concerned."</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Under the current legal framework, the executive seeks legislative approval only after the fact. This precludes any preliminary debate of the new expenses.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In signing of procurement contracts, everybody recognizes that the procedures are often followed. Committees and commissions normally sit to study and deliberate the offers. Except that it has often appeared that the bidders in most cases are none other than committee members disguised as businesses and as front men. Along with this, there is the World Bank 2008 "Doing Business" ranking (Cameroon ranks 164/181), which makes findings about the business climate and ranks Cameroon in the area of transparency of government procurement procedures.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> "In the event of an emergency, decrees for cash advances may allocate additional appropriations without modifying the budget balance closed by the previous Budget Law, by cancelling appropriations or recording new revenues" article 54, paragraph 1 of the law n°2007 / 006 of 26 December 2007, on the financial regime of the State.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> “These cash advance decrees shall be signed within the framework of a cumulative ceiling of appropriations which may not exceed 5 % of appropriations earmarked by the Budget Law of the year concerned” article 54, paragraph 2 of the law n°2007 / 006 of 26 December 2007, on the financial regime of the State.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> When we conducted the previous survey (OBI 2008), the dispositions of the law on the financial regime of the State had not yet been adopted.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Paragraph 2 of article 24 of the law n°2007 / 006 of December 26th, 2007 on the financial regime of the State stipulate that, "The secondary operations of the budget are foreseen, authorized and executed in the same conditions as those of the general budget."</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget review law is enacted as the first part of the Budget Law. Therefore, all expenditures are recognized in the law and adopted.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. d. The executive does not release a year-end report. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Final audited accounts are not released to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Final audited accounts are not released to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Final audited accounts are not released to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed. b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The President of the Republic makes appointments to civilian and military positions according to the Constitution. Thus, appointing civil servants or dismissing them from their duties falls under "the Head of State's discretionary power." He alone decides "who" and "when" he appoints "to what."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Final audited accounts are not released to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Supreme State Audit Office is a delegation of the presidency of the republic. From this status it is clear that the Delegate Minister cannot take initiatives without the approval of the true decision-maker who is the President of the Republic.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Article 33 of the financial regime of the State stipulates that, "under the authority of the President of the Republic, the Prime Minister coordinates the preparation of finance bills, assured by the Finance minister, in dialogue with the constitutional organs, the Ministers or the concerned persons in charge of the services."

Comment:

The budget of the Supreme State Audit Office is determined by the same process as that of other public administrations. Following the spirit and the letter of the measures above, we understand clearly that only the government has skills for the elaboration of the budget. Consequently even the budget of the Higher State Control ministry is determined by the process that all public administrations follow.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

- a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
- b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
- c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
- d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

According to the law, the National Assembly Finance Committee has authority for office and field audits of expenditures or revenue and the same law provides that they may not be refused access to any document except for matters of a secret nature that pertain to national defense, investigation secrecy and medical secrecy.

Yet in the current state of things, and based on the statements of the deputies who are members of the Finance Committee in the National Assembly, there is neither an audit report nor any substantive debate on expenditures because the government does not give the parliamentarians sufficient time for debates while the Budget Law and its annexes are being reviewed. This remark was made by Deputy Jean Jacques Ekindi of the Mouvement Progressiste based on a question proposed by the Budget Information Centre during a television program entitled "LA GRANDE TRIBUNE" on the Equinox television channel.

C

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." The Finance and Budget Committee also sits as the audit committee in the legislature. What it does, especially with secret executive reports, if they are presented at all, is not published. But, whatever they are, the audits are far from being systematically comprehensive.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I recommend that the answer should remain as indicated in the questionnaire, which means I maintain the score "d" for this question. The FBC can also sit as the audit committee. But do they ever hear about an audit report of the executive? I think not. Seems as though Peer Reviewer One confuses the audit report and the regulatory law. What the FBC usually receives from government is the regulatory law.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. Question 120 asks whether there is a committee in the legislature that has the specific task of receiving and reviewing the SAI Audit Reports. It does not ask if there is a separate committee that is designated to review SAI Audit Reports or the efficacy of the committee.

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs. b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details. d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	----------

Additional Comments:

In the production of budgetary information in Cameroon at preparation time, the government uses a series of documents that are both diverse and varied. The draft budget law that also contains the government budget consists of three volumes of documents, i.e. the yellow volume, the red volume and the green volume. The first two volumes, i.e. the yellow and red volumes, present the investment and operating expenditures of the general and sovereignty administration. All expenditure items and allocations by item are indicated completely and in detail. The red or yellow volumes are presented in the form of a document with expenditures by unit in each ministry or government agency. The green volume consists of roughly seven books (the draft budget, the draft budget review law for fiscal year year-2, the economic and financial report, debt management and agreements and loans, the transfer from the government to parastatals and other organizations, expenditures by economic nature and function, the public investment project, etc.). Each of these documents is part of a special aspect of the government budget. The books of the green volume are among the documents that the EBO uses.

As we noted, these documents and many others are produced. Unfortunately, they are not available to the public. The fact that these documents are not available to the public makes it difficult for citizens to become involved with budget-related issues and to justify the fact that the people do not participate in the budget debate. This is because they have no way to build a counter-argument for discussions with the government. For example, if the yellow and red volumes were broadly disseminated, requesters of copies or certified instruments would not pay for the printouts of these copies, because in the yellow and red volumes, the amounts of allocations for purchasing paper and ink for the entire government are indicated. Consequently, people continue to pay for services for which the budget provides money. This consequence encourages corruption in the government and is comparable to the embezzlement of public funds.

It is very much in the government's interest to make the budget documents public and to broadly disseminate them. Because if the documents are published, the citizens will become aware of them, which will lead them to ask questions of themselves and of the government. These questions will lay the groundwork for the debate and the willingness to understand, and they will discuss them with the appropriate officials in their locality. As a result, citizen involvement in the budget debate will be strengthened.

Section 1

For the budget summary, in 2009 the Prime Minister began presenting the budget to the National Assembly. Prior to 2009, the Minister of Finance presented the budget synopsis, and the media did not cover the presentation. The media has been covering this event since 2009 and the Prime Minister's entire speech is transcribed in the *Cameroun Tribune*, the national public daily. And so the public is informed one day later of what the government will be doing during the upcoming budgetary year.

Compared to the 2008 study, it was found in Section 1 of the questionnaire that the mid-year report is not available in 2009, while the budget synopsis is available. The decrease in the score is due to the fact that we strictly implemented the methodology with regard to the availability of the documents as provided for in the research guide. The content of the information was taken into account.