

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
China, September 2009

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street NE, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Open Budget Initiative
Organization: International Budget Partnership
Address: Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street NE, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
Telephone: (202) 408-1080
E-mail: www.openbudgetindex.org

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	3
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire.....	4
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links	5
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal...	8
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	9
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	10
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	11
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	21
Comprehensiveness	30
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	37
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	41
Section Three: The Budget Process	49
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	50
Legislative Approval of the Budget	55
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	60
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution.....	78

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	2009
Executive's Budget Proposal	Not Available
Supporting Budget Documents	Not Available
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	Not Available
In-Year Reports	2009
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	2008
Audit Report	2008

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Produced
Budget Summary	<p data-bbox="662 478 1430 554">关于 2008 年中央和地方预算执行情况与 2009 年中央和地方预算草案的报告 2009 年 3 月 15 日</p> <p data-bbox="662 617 1430 735">Reports on the Implementation of the central and local budgets for 2008 and the Draft Central and Local Budget for 2009. March 15, 2009.</p> <p data-bbox="662 772 1430 831">http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/200903/t20090316_122544.html</p>
Executive’s Budget Proposal	Produced but Not Available to the Public
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Produced but Not Available to the Public
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Produced but Not Available to the Public
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	
Citizens Budget	Not Produced
Enacted Budget	Produced but Not Available to the Public

In-Year Reports	<p>2009 年一季度财政收支情况。 The first-quarter report on revenue and expenditure of 2009 April 13 , 2009 http://gks.mof.gov.cn/quokusi/zhengfuxinxi/tongjishuju/200904/t20090413_132140.html</p> <p>2009 年 1-3 月地方税收收入情况分析。 The report on the tax revenue from January 1 to March 31 of 2009 April 24, 2009 http://szs.mof.gov.cn/shuizhengsi/zhengwuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200904/t20090424_136730.html</p> <p>2009 年一季度税收收入的结构分析（ 税政司 2009 年 4 月 ） The report on the tax revenue structure of the first quart of 2009 April 2009 (Tax Administration Division in April 2009) http://szs.mof.gov.cn/shuizhengsi/zhengwuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200904/t20090422_135789.html</p> <p>2009 年 3 月份全国彩票销售情况.2009-4-16 the report on the sale of national lottery of the first 5 months of 2009 http://zhs.mof.gov.cn/zonghesi/zhuantilanmu/caipiaoquanli/200904/t20090416_133451.html</p> <p>2009 年 1-5 月全国国有及国有控股企业经济运行情况。2009-6-22 The report on the economic performance of the national state-owned and state holding enterprises. June 22, 2009 http://qys.mof.gov.cn/qiyesi/zhengwuxinxi/qiyeyunxingdongtai/200906/t20090618_169087.html</p> <p>2009 年 5 月份财政收支情况。2009-6-15 The report on revenue and expenditure of the first 5 months of 2009. June 15, 2009 http://gks.mof.gov.cn/quokusi/zhengfuxinxi/tongjishuju/200906/t20090615_167878.html</p>
Mid-Year Review	Not Produced

Year-End Report	<p>关于 2008 年中央决算的报告 ——2009 年 6 月 24 日 The year-end report on the actual budget of 2008 June 24, 2009. http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhuantihuigu/2008nianzyjuesuan/</p>
Audit Report	<p>《关于 2008 年度中央预算执行和其他财政收支的审计工作报告——2009 年 6 月 24 日在第十一届全国人民代表大会常务委员会第九次会议上》 审计署审计长 刘家义 The audit report on the actual budget and other financial revenue and expenditure of central government of 2008. June 25, 2009. http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1087/n524092/1835784.html</p>
Other Documents	<p>中华人民共和国国民经济和社会发展第十一个五年规划纲要 (全文) 2006 年 03 月 16 日 16:15 The outline of 11th 5-year plan of national economic and social development of People's Republic of China March 16, 2009 来源 : 新华网 http://news.xinhuanet.com/misc/2006-03/16/content_4309517.htm</p> <p>2008 年 1-6 月国有及国有控股企业经济运行情况 (2008-9-10) The title of this document in English is "2008 January-June State-Owned Enterprises and State-Controlled Shared Stock Enterprises Economic Transactions Situation" http://qys.mof.gov.cn/qiyesi/zhengwuxinxi/qiyeyunxingdongtai/200809/t20080910_73077.html</p> <p>2008 年上半年税收增长的结构分析 (2008-8-14) PR1 COMMENT: The title of this document in English is "Organizational Analysis of 2008 First-Half [Jan-June] Tax Income Increase" PR 2 COMMENT: The title of the document is "Mid-year analysis of tax receipts for first half 2008" http://www.mof.gov.cn/shuizhengsi/zhengwuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200808/t20080815_63466.html</p> <p>2008 年上半年国债管理报告。2009-10-13 PR1 COMMENT: The title of this document in English is "2008 First-Half National Debt Management Report" PR 2 COMMENT: The title of the document is "Mid-year report of state debt issuance." http://gks.mof.gov.cn/quokusi/zhengfuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200810/t20081013_81645.html</p>
Relevant Ministries & Departments	<p>Ministry of Finance People Republic of China National Audit office of People Republic of China</p>

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes					Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public		Yes		Yes	Yes	
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)			Yes			
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes		
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public	Yes				
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)		Yes		Yes	Yes
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	NA	No	NA	No	No
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	No	NA	No	No
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	No	NA	No	No
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	NA	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes
8. Written in more than one language	NA	Yes	NA	No	No
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	No	NA	No	No

⁺Mark "Yes" if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Note 1: The Open Budget Survey research process was carried out over a 12-month period and the final version of the Open Budget Questionnaires reflect decisions made after multiple rounds of discussions between Survey researchers, peer reviewers, and the International Budget Partnership (IBP) (in several countries these decisions also considered comments received from governments). When peer reviewers or governments agreed with the answers provided by researchers, they often provided no comment. Thus for many questions, the section in the questionnaire that should contain peer reviewer comments is left blank. However, if the government did not provide any comments to a question (because it did not dispute the answer), the section within the questionnaire that is meant to reflect government comments specifies the answer that the government agreed with (by default).

Since the IBP continued its discussions with the researchers even after receiving peer reviewer and government comments, for some questions these discussions resulted in a mutual decision to change the answers, even if the peer reviewers and governments agreed with the original answer provided by the researcher. Such changes may have happened as a result of:

1. A more consistent application of the Survey methodology;
2. New information identified by the researcher or by IBP that had a bearing on the answer for a particular question; or
3. Decisions made to ensure cross-country comparability of answers.

For more information on these changes for any question please write to info@internationalbudget.org.

The Executive's Budget Proposal		
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond		
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d	

<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was “d”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” In the budget summary, expenditure for the budget year has been classified into agriculture, education, health, social security, defense, diplomacy, and science & technology.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries. In all countries where the Executive’s Budget Proposal package is not made available to the public, and the only available document is a Budget Summary, the latter document cannot be used to answer any of questions 1-55. This approach is followed in order not to reward bad practice: the Executive’s Budget Proposal should be released in its entirety, in order to allow the public to understand the government’s policies for the coming budget year, and to give the public the possibility to meaningfully participate in the budget process.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> We know that the budget is to be classified by economic classification under functional classification according to the “Guide to the Budget Preparation for the Central Government, 2007.” But that is not available to the public.</p>	d
<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget). b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year. c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year. d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented. b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

14. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

- a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.
- b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

This document is not available to the public.

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." The Central Economic Working Conference (中央经济工作会议) held at the end of each year plays a key role in making macroeconomic forecasts. The official media releases the authoritative information after the conference (see link: http://news.xinhuanet.com/newscenter/2008-12/10/content_10485187.htm). Since the conference is held before the State Council (国务院) submits its budget proposal to the Standing Committee of National People's Congress (全国人民代表大会常务委员会), this forecast can be considered as projections upon which the budget is made.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" because although it is useful to note that some information is presented in the media release of the Central Economic Working Conference, this information does not form part of the Executive's Budget Proposal, which is the document used to evaluate questions 1-55. No other document can be used to evaluate those questions.

d

<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>25. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> These documents (the executive budget proposal and supporting budget documentation) are produced for internal purposes only, and they are not made available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	
<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> "Tax Yearbook of China" (《中国税务年鉴》) and "Finance Yearbook of China" (《中国财政年鉴》) provide comprehensive information on tax rates, fees, and other revenues sources, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. The website of the State Administration of Tax also provides similar information. See http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/n480462/n6395945/n6395990/index.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> "Personal Income Tax Law of China" lists the distribution of the tax burden. See http://news.xinhuanet.com/fortune/2005-10/27/content_3692396.htm</p> <p>The question is not too clear. In my understanding, the analysis of tax burden means to analyze the incidence of every tax. If this is it, we cannot find any official documents disclose this information. We do find some analysis on part of China's taxes by scholars (here:</p>	C

<http://news.sina.com.cn/c/2007-05-25/151913076437.shtml>), but according to IBP's criteria, this is not included in the questionnaire, am I right?

Furthermore, the first source above is the China's personal income tax law. It indicates the rates and the taxed incomes blanket. It can be one kind of that information because income tax cannot be transferred. But what about the indirect tax burden like value-added taxes? For these taxes, it needs to list not only the taxpayers, and also the incidence of the tax. So far I have not found any official document to provide this information. So I am not sure if answer "c" or "b" should be chosen.

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: I think a better answer for this question would be "c." The website cited above provides information on the distribution of the tax burden, as indicated, as well as information on different taxable types of income, etc. More of this sort of information is also available at the State Administration of Taxation website, at <http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/n8136506/index.html>.

However, the State Administration of Taxation website has also a more detailed breakdown of what the actual tax burden amounted to in specific years, for particular groups, i.e. "income from VAT was XX, income from Stamp Duty was YY." The level of detail is not great, but some info is there, so that "d" - No analysis, is a bit far fetched. An example of the information available, in English, is at: <http://202.108.90.130/n6669073/n6888425/index.html>

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: I think "d" is fine. The Personal Income Tax (PIT) is a minor tax source in China, and there are too many exemptions that the tax law does not take into account. If we are looking for the distribution of major tax burdens, then the information available falls far short.

Researcher Response: There is some information on tax burden released as indicated in both the comments from peer reviewer one and me, although it lacks important details.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries. Some information is presented, although it lacks very important details.

58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

- a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
- b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Some information can be found in the sources provided by the second peer reviewer, but it lacks important details. One can see the information concerning the management of foreign aid (for the internal control) and also some detail on projects, but the conditions associated with foreign aid (for example, under what situation foreign aid can be applied) are not clearly disclosed.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: For the conditions of ODA, information can be found in Administrative Measures on International Financial Institutes' and Foreign Governments' Loan (国际金融组织和外国政府贷款管理办法) (http://www.chinacourt.org/flwk/show1.php?file_id=112382) and Administrative Measures on Foreign Government's Load (外国政府贷款管理办法) (http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengwengao/caizhengbuwengao2008/wengao200812qi/200903/t20090305_119039.html).

Also, the international department of MOF gives the information on the conditions of specific assistant projects. Details can be seen at <http://www.mof.gov.cn/guojisi/pindaoliebiao/zhengcefabu/>. Other sources include the *Finance Yearbook of China*. Taking the 2008 edition as example, there is an article called National Debt Management (国家债务管理), one section of the article is about assistance from IFIs including detailed projects (see *Finance Yearbook of China* pp. 173-175). There is also a table called Outstanding External Debts (外债余额) providing statistical data for five years (see *Finance Yearbook of China* pp. 479).

C

<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment in question 58. Some information can be found in the sources provided by the second peer reviewer (Q58), but it lacks important details. One can see the information concerning the management of foreign aid (for the internal control) and also some detail on projects, but the conditions associated with foreign aid (for example, under what situation foreign aid can be applied) are not clearly disclosed.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>c</p>
<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Reports on the Implementation of the Central and Local Budgets for 2008 and the Draft Central and Local Budget for 2009. March 15, 2009. http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengxinwen/200903/t20090316_122544.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The document provides substantial information describing the budget and its proposals.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not produced.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> I did not find a publicized glossary of budget-related terminology. However, anecdotally, this type of information <i>is</i> made available to the public, in the form of books/guides that are issued by a press associated with the Ministry of Finance.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Definitions are provided in the statistical yearbooks and occasional publications of the MOF, but they are often broad and lack details.</p>	C

63. Do citizens have the right *in law* to access government information, including budget information?
- Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
 - Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
 - Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
 - No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

The subnational government fiscal transparency survey, conducted by the Shanghai University of Finance and Economics, indicates that the average scores for the provincial government is less than 250, compared to a full score of 1180. See the "Report on China's Fiscal Transparency in Provincial Level of 2009," after page 14, Publisher: Shanghai University of Finance and Economics, 2009.

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "c"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Here a "b" answer may be more appropriate. Under the Regulations on Open Government Information (政府信息公开条例,) implemented since May 2008, citizens have the right in law to access government information upon request (see <http://www.mof.gov.cn/gp/index.html>). But implementation is sometimes spotty. For example, citizen inquiring about the 4 trillion yuan stimulus package have been rebuffed.

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer for the reasons I mentioned above.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries.

C

64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?

- a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
- b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Departmental budgets are usually not available to the public. But occasionally, when someone insists on, s/he may get the information, like Wu Junliang (吴君亮) in Shenzhen. He got the budget of Health Department. But he did not disclose it to others.

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." Citizen can obtain disaggregated financial information through the open information list (see link <http://www.mof.gov.cn/gov/search.jsp?page=3&searchword=isPub%3D%271%27&sortfield=LIFO&channelid=75089&prepage=20&searchword2=>), where some program level information is on the list. But these are minor portions of expenditures.

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer "d," because even departmental budgets are not available to the public, not to mention more disaggregated information on individual program. The fact that last year 114 departmental budgets were disclosed by Guang Zhou Government is regarded as a big event and a very unusual matter in China's access to information history.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries.

d

<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> So far, non-financial information is not available to the public, not even for internal use in the government. This information was obtained through interviews: one with a public official from the Jiangsu province and another with a budget official from the Finance Department of China.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process	
Executive's Formulation of the Budget	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The release date is set in permanent law. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive announces the budget in the annual conference of National People's Congress held every March. Before this date, there is no announcement of the release time. But the public knows the release date because every year it happens then. The Executive's Budget Proposal, however, is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The preparation process of the Executive's Budget Proposal is secret, including the timetable.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?

- a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.
- b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.
- c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.
- d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Given that the executive does not release the timetable to the public, it is not known whether the timetable is adhered to or not.

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: I agree with the response above. However, I would also note, as the researcher indicates in answer to 66 above, that the budget for each year is announced regularly and on schedule at each year's National People's Congress, in March (so at a macro level, the executive appears to adhere to its timetable for budget preparation).

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: The government doesn't make a clear timetable for releasing the budget, although people know the timing of the NPC. Actually, people only know that the NPC's meeting will be held in early March, but they do not know the exact time and the NPC does not start the meeting on the same day every year.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.

d

<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interview</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interview</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive does not produce a Pre-Budget Statement.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A Pre-Budget Statement is not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A Pre-Budget Statement is not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to the Budget Law, the executive submits the budget to the finance committee of the legislature one and a half months before approval. And the Executive's Budget Proposal will be approved in the annual conference of National People Congress held in March. Then the congressmen only have one day to read and approve the Executive's Budget Proposal.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The committee receives the proposal in February and the full National People's Congress gets the budget proposal in March: in that month the Congress approves the budget. There is a subcommittee of the finance committee, called Working Committee, which helps the finance committee to do the preliminary review on the budget.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "c"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Budget Law of China is from 1994: http://www.chinaacc.com/new/63/74/1994/3/ad78648011122349914248.htm</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Members of NPC have several days (may be up to one week) to read and approve Executive's Budget Proposal, because the budget is disseminated on the first day of the assembly, but approved on the last day.</p> <p>On the Budget Committee of the NPC Standing Committee The Budget Committee of the NPC Standing Committee (全国人大常委会预算工作委员会): it is not a subcommittee, it is a permanent working committee.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> In China, the budget approval by legislature is divided into 2 steps: one is the initial review by the Finance and Economic Committee one month earlier, and the second is the approval by the whole NPC members in March. This information can be found in the Budget Law. And yes, the working committee is a permanent working committee, but it is a subcommittee of the Finance and Economic Committee.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.</p>	C

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public hearings on the national budget are held. In recent years, some local governments did the experiment on budgetary public hearings (it is very basic).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public hearings on the national budget are held. In recent years, some local governments did the experiment on budgetary public hearings (it is very basic).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public hearings on the national budget are held. In recent years, some local governments did the experiment on budgetary public hearings (it is very basic).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is not available.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Evidence from interviews with two congressmen: all spending information, including that on secret items, is given to them in an aggregated manner.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

80. Does the legislature have authority *in law* to amend the budget presented by the executive?

- a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority *in law* to amend the budget.
- b. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, with some limitations.
- c. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.
- d. No, the legislature does not have any authority *in law* to amend the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

In China's Budget Law, the legislature is given the right to scrutinize and approve the Executive's Budget Proposal, but it is not given the right to amend the budget. Please see chapters 2 and 5 of the Budget Law. <http://www.chinaacc.com/new/63/74/1994/3/ad78648011122349914248.htm>

Comment:

Although China's Budget Law sets the right for the legislature to approve the budget, this requirement is too general (it consists only of one sentence). It does not specify whether the legislature has the right to revise or amend the budget. This really gives a big space for the executive to change the budget during the budget process.

Peer Reviewer One Comment: I agree with the researcher's conclusion that the best answer is "d." Budget Law of China is from 1994: <http://www.chinaacc.com/new/63/74/1994/3/ad78648011122349914248.htm>
The legislature does not appear to be given the right to amend the budget.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Neither the Budget Law nor the NPC Rules of Order (全国人大议事规则) provide any authority to the legislature to amend the budget. So the answer is "d." Article 12 of the budget law says the NPC has the authority to change or reject the suggestions of the NPC standing committee, but that is not the same as changing the Executive's Budget Proposal.

d

<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals or the approved budget is not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Enacted Budget is produced but not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengshuju/</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Financial revenue and expenditure data are made available monthly, at the URL indicated above. Data are typically available 1-2 weeks after the end of a month. Year-to-date reports on state owned enterprises and state-controlled joint-stock companies are also available in the same website. Revenue and expenditure data are highly aggregated and presented in narrative format. A typical report will present detail of revenue and expenditures for the previous month, compare these figures to last year’s numbers, and end with a summary of year-to-date major trends in government spending (e.g. “expenditures on transportation and logistics increased by 70% over the past 10 months”).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> From an interview with a budget official of Finance Department, it is known now that at least 2/3 expenditures are covered in the budget and also in the in-year budget reports.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is difficult to test how much actual expenditure has been covered in the In-Year Reports. This is because China's budget is not only incomprehensive, but also non-transparent. All budget reports only cover part of the whole budget, but no one knows exactly how much this part accounts for in the whole budget. The off-budget amount changes all the time, according to government's policies. So no officially publicized information indicates these data. And generally experts/scholars estimate the number in academic articles. We really did not know how to answer this question in an exact manner, so we went to an official of finance department and got this answer.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> From the In-Year Reports it is difficult to tell exactly what portion of total revenue and expenditures is represented. As described in the above comment in question 83, In-Year Reports provide broad figures only, in a narrative format, without detailed analysis of the data. There is no way of knowing whether the numbers presented are complete or not.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In China, information on expenditures organized by administrative units is produced, but it is not released to the public. Every budget report to the public is very simple. The quarterly one is only one page long, and includes mainly narration.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information can be found in 2009 年一季度财政收支情况. The first-quarter report on revenue and expenditure of 2009, April 13 , 2009. http://gks.mof.gov.cn/guokusi/zhengfuxinxi/tongjishuju/200904/t20090413_132140.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Comparison is only made for aggregate amounts of expenditure.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Monthly revenue and expenditure reports provide comparison for aggregate amounts as well; for example: http://gks.mof.gov.cn/guokusi/zhengfuxinxi/tongjishuju/200911/t20091113_231936.html</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Report on actual fiscal revenue and expenditure" (monthly, from January to October of 2009) now can be found in the following website: http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengshuju/index_1.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Certain reports on this website are more informative than others; analytical reports such as http://szs.mof.gov.cn/shuizhengsi/zhengwuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200904/t20090424_136730.html ("Analysis of 2009 January-March Tax Income Situation") tend to provide more information on revenue sources (rather than aggregate numbers only). Monthly reports differentiate between local and national income and expenditure, while quarterly reports break down income farther, distinguishing between "large caliber" and "small caliber" tax income. Some insight into what these terms mean may be gained here: http://info.e-to-china.com/investment_guide/47286.html</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
---	---

<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The released In-Year Reports include some important tax revenue; no non-tax revenue information is included. This information can be found in the following website and also was obtained from the interview with officials from the finance department of both central and local levels. Some information can be found in this website http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengshuju/index_1.html But the percentage cannot be obtained from it.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is hard to judge the percentage of revenue included in the In-Year Reports, because of the incomprehensive and nontransparent budget. The choice of "b" is mainly based on the interview with officials.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is some information in this website, but the percentage can not be identified according to this. http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengshuju/index_1.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Choosing "b" is also based on the interview with officials. See Q.87.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The above website provides monthly updates on government revenue and expenditures, broken down by central and local revenue and expenditures. These data are provided in aggregate (not much detail on where the money is coming from and where it is going), but comparisons for the broad totals that are given <i>are</i> made to the previous year's figures for the same period. However, answer "b" is probably a fair response, based on the lack of detail provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information can be found in http://www.mof.gov.cn/guokusi/redianzhuanti/guozaiguanli/</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Borrowing information is on the first page of the website of the Finance Department. The name of it is "Debt Management" which is in the lower right corner of the page. When one opens this column, one can see there all the information on borrowing by the government. Borrowing information is not shown in the In-Year Report, but it is indeed released to the public.</p> <p>Peer Reviewer One Comment: The URL provided above links to a page of the Ministry of Finance website on "National Debt Management," which provides access to documents on the national debt, updated monthly. These documents are separate from the Ministry of Finance monthly data on revenue and expenditures, but the information is made available to the public.</p> <p>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?
- Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
 - Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
 - Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
 - No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

This information can be found in
<http://www.mof.gov.cn/guokusi/redianzhuanti/guozaiguanli/>

Comment:

The information related to the composition of government's debt is on the first page of the website of the Finance Department. The name of it is "Debt Management" which is in the lower right corner of the page. When one opens this column, one can see there all information of borrowing by the government. This information is not shown in the In-Year Reports, but it is indeed released to the public.

b

Researcher Response to this Question was "a"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." The information provided by the Ministry of Finance is extensive and updated often, but data are presented haphazardly, in individual report documents, in a format that is difficult to digest. It is difficult to assess, from the data presented on this website, what the current status of China's national debt obligations are, or to determine answers to the questions noted above (interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt).

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I chose my answer "a" because extensive information including interest rate, maturity profile of the debt and domination of the currency are listed there. This conforms to the requirement of "a," although it does not look like an In-Year Report. See the following website:
<http://gks.mof.gov.cn/redianzhuanti/guozaiguanli/>

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "b" in light of Peer Reviewer One's comment and the response provided by the Researcher.

<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. d. In-year reports are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information can be found in http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhengwuxinxi/caizhengshuju/index_1.html For example, monthly reports of 2009 fiscal revenues and expenditures from January to October are there.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Reports are typically released 1-2 weeks after the month's end.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> China did not produce a mid-year review of the budget. But the related information was included in some other documents, such as the structural analysis on the growth of tax revenue of the first 6 months of 2008, found in:</p> <p>1.http://www.mof.gov.cn/shuizhengsi/zhengwuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200808/t20080815_63466.html The report on the debt management of the first 6 months of 2008</p> <p>2.http://gks.mof.gov.cn/guokusi/zhengfuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200810/t20081013_81645.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
- b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

China did not produce mid-year review on budget. But it produced some other documents, as indicated below, which include some related information.

This information can be found in the following 3 documents:

1. The report on the economic performance of the national state-owned and state holding enterprises of the first months of 2008. (September 10, 2008)

2008年1-6月国有及国有控股企业经济运行情况 (2008-9-10)

http://qys.mof.gov.cn/qiyesi/zhengwuxinxi/qiyeyunxingdongtai/200809/t20080910_73077.html

2. The report on the tax revenue structure of the first 6 months of 2008. (August 14, 2008)

2008年上半年税收增长的结构分析 (2008-8-14)

http://www.mof.gov.cn/shuizhengsi/zhengwuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200808/t20080815_63466.html

3. The report on the management of the national debts of the first 6 months of 2008 (Oct. 13, 2009)

2008年上半年国债管理报告。2009-10-13

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/guokusi/zhengfuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200810/t20081013_81645.html

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

- a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.
- b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
- c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).
- d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: China did not produce mid-year review on budget. But it produced some other documents, as indicated below, which include some related information.

This information can be found in the following documents:

The report on the economic performance of the national state-owned and state holding enterprises of the first months of 2008.
(September 10, 2008)

2008年1-6月国有及国有控股企业经济运行情况 (2008-9-10)

http://qys.mof.gov.cn/qiyesi/zhengwuxinxi/qiyeyunxingdongtai/200809/t20080910_73077.html

The report on the tax revenue structure of the first 6 months of 2008 .
(August 14, 2008)

2008年上半年税收增长的结构分析 (2008-8-14)

http://www.mof.gov.cn/shuizhengsi/zhengwuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200808/t20080815_63466.html

The report on the management of the national debts of the first 6 months of 2008 (Oct. 13, 2009)

2008年上半年国债管理报告。2009-10-13

http://gks.mof.gov.cn/guokusi/zhengfuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200810/t20081013_81645.html

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> A mid-year budget review is not produced in China.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 53 and 54 in chapter 7 of the Budget Law http://www.chinaacc.com/new/63/74/1994/3/ad78648011122349914248.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> According to the Budget law, the executive seeks the input of legislature only in the case of imbalance between the revenues and expenditures in the budget execution. In other cases, including fund transfers among departments, the executive takes the whole responsibility.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Who violates the procurement law? A startling list! 触目惊心政府采购“违规清单”都有谁 http://news.sina.com.cn/c/2006-09-19/121610056547s.shtml</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> China has strengthened the management of procurement in recent years, but there are still some irregularities.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
--	---

<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The document is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Given that China's legislature does not have the right to revise or amend the budget, the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> In the Budget Law, there is a section on Budget Adjustment (预算调整): if the budget is adjusted for large expenditures such as the Sichuan earthquake and the fiscal stimulus program in 2008 (see link http://www.chinaacc.com/new/63/74/1994/3/ad78648011122349914248.htm) , it should be approved by the NPC. But for supplemental budgets (追加预算), there is no need for NPC approval. In the Implementation Regulations of the Budget Law (预算法实施条例), article 59 states that the executive at the same level should approve supplemental budgets including the use of reserves. (See link http://www.jmsedu.net/info/jiaoyu/05/Product3/Law/12_Finance_revenue/12_Finance_revenue1112.htm).</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is not available.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 51 of the Budget Law http://www.chinaacc.com/new/63/74/1994/3/ad78648011122349914248.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> According to article 51 of the budget law, the executive decides when to use contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget. The legislature has no right to approve them.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. d. The executive does not release a year-end report. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information can be found in "The year-end report on the actual budget of 2008" June 24, 2009. http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhuantihuigu/2008nianzyjuesuan/2008zyjuesuanbaogao/200907/t20090706_176618.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The year-end report is released about 6 months after the budget year. China's budget year starts on January 1 and ends on December 31.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhuantihuigu/2008nianzyjuesuan/2008zyjuesuanbaogao/200907/t20090706_176618.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> One can not find any information in the Year-End Report indicating that it has been already audited. The audited data is in the audited report. The Year-End Report and the Audit Report are produced by different institutions. The former is made by the finance department and the latter is made by the audit office. These two reports are disclosed almost at the same time.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information can be found in the year-end report on the actual budget of 2008 June 24, 2009. http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhuantihuigu/2008nianzyjuesuan/</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Comparisons are made. There are two parts in the Year-End Report. The first part gives the general numbers and shows the difference between the actuals and the budget estimates in general. The second part analyzes every main kind of revenue and expenditure, including: the actual number, the budget estimates, the difference between the two and simple reasons.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?

- a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
- b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
- c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
- d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

This information can be found in
The year-end report on the actual budget of 2008
June 24, 2009.

<http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhuantihuigu/2008nianzyjuesuan/>

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "d." While comparison between budgeted amounts and actual expenditures is provided in the website indicated above, there is no discussion or explanation regarding the causes of discrepancies between figures. Budget and actual expenditure data are provided at an aggregated level, according to function (e.g. "national defense," or "public health"). While differences in amounts between forecast and actual spending are shown clearly, they are not explained.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Researcher's answer is appropriate. The Year-End Report presents (1) the enacted (actual) level and the budgeted levels for aggregate revenues and expenditures, (2) differences between the enacted level and the budgeted levels of departmental totals (or functional totals) on revenue and expenditure including revenues on VAT, excise tax, custom tax, business tax, income tax, non-tax revenue and so on, and expenditures on agriculture, education, health, social security, culture, environmental protection, public security, national defense, general public service and so on. The report measures the difference by using the ratio of actual to budgeted. For example, total fiscal revenue is 103% of enacted budget. It also offers some brief explanations for the differences.

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer "b" given what I wrote above and given the second peer reviewer's comment. The Year-End Report does provide the information focused on functional programs. It does not only focus on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals,) although the explanation is very simple and lacks of important detail.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries. Both enacted and actual levels are shown, but an explanation is not provided.

C

105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

This information can be found in:

The year-end report on the actual budget of 2008

June 24, 2009.

<http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhuantihuigu/2008nianzyjuesuan/>

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "c"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "d." No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. While a comparison between budgeted amounts and actual expenditures is provided in the website indicated above, there is no discussion or explanation regarding the causes of discrepancies between figures. Budget and actual expenditure data are provided at an aggregated level, according to function (e.g. "national defense," or "public health"). While differences in forecast and actual spending are shown clearly, they are not explained.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer "c" because there is some explanation, although it is very simple. For example, it is said in the report that the domestic VAT is yuan 349.776 billion, 100.7% of the enacted budget. The increase of VAT is caused by the lasting increasing of industrial and commercial value added.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries.

C

<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information cannot be found in year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information cannot be found in year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information cannot be found in year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information cannot be found in year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

- a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

The year-end report on the actual budget of 2008

June 24, 2009.

http://www.mof.gov.cn/mof/zhuantihuigu/2008nianzyjuesuan/2008zyjuesuanbaogao/200907/t20090706_176618.html

Comment:

In the year-end report on the actual budget of 2008, the "governmental funds" (政府性基金), which were regarded as extra-budgetary funds before, were not included in the budget before 2007. After 2007, they are included. Now China still has extra-budgetary funds, but they account for a very small percentage, and not important - according to an interview with a public official from the Finance Department.

C

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "d." The year-end report makes no mention of extra-budgetary funds (预算外资金). The Government funds mentioned by the researcher are budgetary resources that are treated as below the line items.

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer "b" because since 2007, China reformed its budget system and put most extra-budgetary funds into the budget, under the name of "governmental fund - 政府性基金."

Given that this reform is still ongoing, there are currently some other extra budgetary funds still outside the budget, but the amount is getting smaller and smaller. An important amount has been put into the budget.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" in light of peer reviewer's comment.

The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The audit report on the actual budget and other financial revenue and expenditure of central government of 2008. June 25, 2009. http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1087/n524092/1835784.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> China's budget year ends on December 31. And the audit budget report is released about 6 months later.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to article 3 of the Regulation of the Implementation of China’s Audit Law, “all public expenditures, including the budgetary and the extra-budgetary should be audited annually.” (See: http://www.people.com.cn/item/faguiku/czh/F35-1020.html)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> If the question refers to the audited percentage for all expenditure in the budget, I will give the answer “a.” If it refers to all expenditure including the part financed by extra-budgetary funds, governmental debts and etc., then I cannot give the exact answer, because no statistics indicates how much it is.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report’s content. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The audit report on the actual budget and other financial revenue and expenditure of central government of 2008. June 25, 2009. http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1087/n524092/1835784.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

- a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
- b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

According to the Constitution of the People's Republic of China (中华人民共和国宪法), the Auditor General is nominated by the Premier (国务院总理), and decided by the National People's Congress (全国人大) or by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress (全国人大常委会) when the National People's Congress is not in session, and appointed by the Chairman (中华人民共和国主席) of the People's Republic of China. (Article 62, Sec.5; Article 67, Sec. 9; Article 80)
(For full text of the Constitution, see http://www.ahga.gov.cn/government/fagui/xianfa1/low_view1.htm, Chinese and English version)

According to Audit Law of China, the National Audit Office shall be set up by the State Council to be responsible for the audit work all over the country, under the leadership of the Premier of the State Council. The Auditor-General shall be the administrative leader of the National Audit Office (Audit Law of China, Article 7)

An auditor shall be protected by law when carrying out his functions in light of the law. No organization or individual may refuse or obstruct auditors' performance of their functions in light of the law, or retaliate against auditors. The persons-in-charge of the auditing entities shall be appointed or dismissed in light of statutory procedures. None of them may be dismissed or replaced at random, unless they carry out illegal activities, neglect their duties, or are no longer qualified to their posts. (Audit Law of China, Article 15)
(For English version of full text of Audit Law of China, see http://www.bjreview.com.cn/document/txt/2006-12/13/content_50657_2.htm, for Chinese version, see http://www.chinacourt.org/flwk/show1.php?file_id=108447)

Comment:

The law mentioned above would support an "a" answer. However, in practice it is the executive that has the power to remove the head of the SAI.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

b

<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> 关于 2008 年度中央预算执行和其他财政收支的审计工作报告——2009 年 6 月 24 日在第十一届全国人民代表大会常务委员会第九次会议上》 审计署审计长 刘家义 The audit report on the actual budget and other financial revenue and expenditure of central government of 2008. June 25, 2009. http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1087/n524092/1835784.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> According to article 3 of the Regulation of the Implementation of China’s Audit Law, “all public expenditures, including the budgetary and the extra-budgetary should be audited annually.” See: http://www.people.com.cn/item/faguiku/czh/F35-1020.html. But in reality, there is no obvious information indicating how many extra-budgetary funds are audited, because of the lack of comprehensiveness of the government’s budget. Therefore the exact answer cannot be provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have *the discretion in law* to undertake those audits it may wish to?

- a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
- c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
- d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: According to article 5 of Audit Law of China, auditing entities shall independently exercise their power of audit supervision in light of the law, and not be interfered by any administrative entity, social organization or individual.

According to article 7 of Audit Law of China, the National Audit Office shall be set up by the State Council to be responsible for the audit work all over the country under the leadership of the Premier of the State Council. See: http://www.chinacourt.org/flwk/show1.php?file_id=108447

Comment:

In practice, however, the SAI does not have independence.

b

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "a." According the Audit Law of China – which is what this question is asking - the Supreme Audit Institution does appear to have discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to, on its own initiative. Note that this does not include audits of the PLA: however, audits of the military and People's Armed Police are handled through a separate institution, per regulations determined by the Central Military Commission. Another site with the budget law: <http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1087/n1599/325639.html>

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Answer "b" is correct.

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer "b" because the SAI is a government agency; it makes no attempt to audit the government, would the Government (executive) not like it to be done. The head of the SAI should obey the government.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "b" to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries, in light of the researcher's comments.

117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Like other government's agencies, the SAI applies for its budget from the government. For this question, we do not know which answer should be chosen because agencies' budgets are not disclosed to the public. And no complains are found from the audit agency. So here we choose "b," but we actually do not have evidence to completely support this answer.

Peer Reviewer One Comment: I agree that the answer should be "b." Article 11 of the Budget Law stipulates funding to be allocated in the budget:
<http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1087/n1599/325639.html>

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: "b" is appropriate. According to the notice on central departmental budget, the SAI would be treated like all the ministries and agencies under the executive, with the same standard appropriation for personnel and running costs (see http://www.mof.gov.cn/yusuansi/zhengwuxinxi/gongzuodongtai/200807/t20080723_58533.html).

b

<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information was obtained from an interview with an audit official in Shanghai. The situation is the same at the national level.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>Peer Reviewer One Comment: I am not sure about funds for domestic and international intelligence agencies. However, audits of the PLA and PAP are handled through a separate agency, the Audit Office of the PLA. Military audit policy is determined by the Central Military Commission.</p> <p>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u> In the website of National Audit Department of China, there is space, a column (信访举报) for the public to complain, inquire and report. Communications from the public during the past year can also be seen. http://203.207.93.61:8088/consult/index.jsp?category=1 In 2009, the number of the communications was 992 (as per the cut off date of September 15, 2009).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized. No, audit reports are not scrutinized. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The audit report is submitted to the Finance Committee of National People's Congress. This information can be got in http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1087/n524092/1835784.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

- a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
- c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
- d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

屡审屡犯审丑疲劳 盖因审计部门后台太软

Repeated (same) violations of the budget by the government agencies
<http://finance.sina.com.cn/review/20050930/14142013141.shtml>

56 部委被审出问题资金逾 348 亿 多部门屡审屡犯

56 central government agencies repeatedly make the same violations of the budgets, which leads to RMB34.8billion problematic budget fund.
<http://www.zjj.gov.cn/zjjrdxw/20070628/090158.shtml>

Comment:

It is sure that the executive has not taken any steps to address audit recommendations from the findings that indicate a need for remedial action. The information given in the above website indicates that a lot of government agencies (56 in 2008) have been repeatedly violating the budget requirements for many years, regardless of the audit report's recommendations.

d

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." According to the report "2007 central budget implementation and identification of problems and rectification results of the audit of revenues and expenditures (2007 年度中央预算执行和其他财政收支审计查出问题的纠正情况和整改结果)," most audit findings have been addressed and related policies have been implemented to correct the problems (see <http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1072/n1282/1809789.html>).

Researcher Response: If this question focuses on who produces the report (the Executive), then I still keep my answer "d." If it focuses on whether a correcting report is released and does not care about who makes it, then I agree with PR2, choosing "b."

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" given that the question is indeed asking whether the Executive releases such a report.

<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> 2009 年第 1 号：“2007 年度中央预算执行和其他财政收支审计查出问题的纠正情况和整改结果” “The correcting results of problems defined by the National Audit Office in the audit of 2007 budget execution of the central government.” http://www.audit.gov.cn/n1057/n1072/n1282/1809789.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Audit information on the police department can be found in: http://news.qq.com/a/20090902/000034_7.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> I cannot find any audit information on military and intelligence services. According to “Regulations on Audit of Chinese People's Liberation Army,” the Audit Office of CPLA is responsible to the Military Commission of the CPC central Committee.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c