

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

ARGENTINA

September, 28 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

| | |
|----------------------|--|
| Name: | Gabriel Filc and Federico Marongiu |
| Organization: | CIPPEC |
| Address: | Callao 25 1^a Capital Federal Argentina |
| Telephone: | 4384-9009 |
| E-mail: | gfilc@cippec.org |

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE ARGENTINA

| | |
|--|----|
| Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents | 4 |
| Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire | 5 |
| Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links..... | 6 |
| Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal..... | 8 |
| Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports | 9 |
| | |
| Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal | 10 |
| Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond..... | 11 |
| Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year..... | 23 |
| Comprehensiveness..... | 32 |
| The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring..... | 40 |
| Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring | 44 |
| | |
| Section Three: The Budget Process | 51 |
| Executive’s Formulation of the Budget | 52 |
| Legislative Approval of the Budget..... | 57 |
| Executive’s Implementation of the Budget..... | 62 |
| Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution | 73 |

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, "Not Available."

| Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire | |
|---|------------------|
| <i>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</i> | |
| | Budget Year Used |
| Pre-Budget Statement | Not Available |
| Budget Summary | 2007 |
| Executive's Budget Proposal | 2007 |
| Supporting Budget Documents | 2007 |
| Citizens Budget | Not Available |
| Enacted Budget | 2007 |
| In-Year Reports | 2007 |
| Mid-Year Report | Not Available |
| Year-End Report | 2006 |
| Audit Report | Not available |

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

| Budget Document | Full Title, Date, and Internet Link |
|---|--|
| Pre-Budget Statement | Not produced |
| Budget Summary | A summary appears in the Mensaje de Elevación del Proyecto de Presupuesto (09/2006): http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf |
| Executive’s Budget Proposal | Proyecto de Ley de Presupuesto General de Gastos y Cálculo de Recursos de la Administración Nacional (09/2006): http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/ley/pdf/proy2007.pdf |
| Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal | Anexo estadístico y ubicación geográfica (09/2006): http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensadossiete.html#anexo |
| Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal | Experiencia piloto de programas orientados a resultados (09/2006): http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensadossiete.html#experiencia |
| Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal | |
| Citizens Budget | Not produced |
| Enacted Budget | Ley de presupuesto nacional 2007 (12/2006) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/ley2007/leydossiete.html |
| In-Year Reports | Boletín Fiscal (06/2007; 09/2007; 12/2007; 03/2008): http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/1ertrim07/1ertrim07.pdf |
| Mid-Year Review | Not produced |

| | |
|-----------------------------------|---|
| Year-End Report | Cuenta de Inversión (07/2007): http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/02intro.htm |
| Audit Report | Produced, but not available* |
| Other Documents | |
| Relevant Ministries & Departments | Ministerio de Economía (Ministry of Economy) www.mecon.gov.ar Oficina Nacional de Presupuesto (National Office for Budget) www.mecon.gov.ar/onp |

*An Audit Report is not produced, but the SAI does release some information. See question 115 in section 3 of this questionnaire.

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

| DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS | | | | | | |
|--|------------|------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|-----------------|
| <i>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i> | | | | | | |
| | Pre-budget | Executive’s Budget Proposal | | | | Citizens budget |
| | | Main document | Budget summary* | Supporting Document 1 | Supporting Document 2 | |
| A. Not produced, even for internal purposes | Yes | | | | | Yes |
| B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public | | | | | | |
| C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request | | | | | | |
| D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.) | | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | |
| <i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i> | | | | | | |
| | Pre-budget | Executive’s Budget | | | | Citizens budget |
| | | Main document | Budget summary* | Supporting Document 1 | Supporting Document 2 | |
| 1. The release date is known at least one month in advance | NA | Yes | No | No | No | NA |
| 2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media | NA | No | No | No | No | NA |
| 3. Released to public same day as official release to media | NA | Yes | No | No | No | NA |
| 4. Available on the Internet free of charge | NA | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | NA |
| 5. Free print copies available, limited distribution | NA | Yes | | Yes | Yes | NA |
| 6. Free print copies available, mass distribution | NA | No | No | No | No | NA |
| 7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺ | NA | No | No | No | No | NA |
| 8. Written in more than one language | NA | No | No | No | No | NA |
| 9. News conference is held to discuss release | NA | No | No | No | No | NA |

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

| DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS | | | | | |
|--|----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|--------------|
| <i>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i> | | | | | |
| | Enacted budget | In-year reports | Mid-year review | Year-end report | Audit report |
| A. Not produced, even for internal purposes | | | Yes | | |
| B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public | | | | | Yes |
| C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request | | | | | |
| D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.) | Yes | Yes | | Yes | |
| <i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i> | | | | | |
| | Enacted budget | In-year reports | Mid-year review | Year-end report | Audit report |
| 1. The release date is known at least one month in advance | Yes | Yes | NA | Yes | NA |
| 2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media | No | No | NA | No | NA |
| 3. Released to public same day as official release to media | Yes | Yes | NA | Yes | NA |
| 4. Available on the Internet free of charge | Yes | Yes | NA | Yes | NA |
| 5. Free print copies available, limited distribution | Yes | No | NA | Yes | NA |
| 6. Free print copies available, mass distribution | No | No | NA | No | NA |
| 7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺ | Yes | | NA | | NA |
| 8. Written in more than one language | No | No | NA | No | NA |
| 9. News conference is held to discuss release | No | No | NA | No | NA |

⁺Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked "not applicable/other," please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.

| The Executive's Budget Proposal | |
|---|----------|
| Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond | |
| <p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Planilla detalle Jurisdicción Entidad http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensadossiete.html A particular example of one administrative unit is: JURISDICCION 1: PODER LEGISLATIVO NACIONAL http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/jurent/pdf/p07j01.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is worth mentioning that the data is not consolidated (i.e. it does not include National and sub national governments). The information provided only accounts for the National/Federal government. As Argentina is a federal country where a considerable share of social spending is decentralized, the fact that the information is not in a consolidated manner (taking into account all levels of government) affects the possible analysis of the data. This comment is valid for all the questions involving fiscal data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The information accounts only for the Central government as Argentina is a federal country where considerable share of total (and especially social) spending is decentralized.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>2. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> ADMINISTRACION NACIONAL: COMPOSICION DEL GASTO POR FINALIDAD-FUNCION Y CARACTER ECONOMICO http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/capitulo1/anexa101.pdf ADMINISTRACION NACIONAL: COMPOSICION DEL GASTO POR FINALIDAD-FUNCION Y POR JURISDICCION http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/capitulo1/anexa103.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|--|----------|

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>3. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> National Government Level (Central + Decentralized), ADMINISTRACION NACIONAL: CALCULO DE RECURSOS POR CARACTER ECONOMICO Y POR CARACTER INSTITUCIONAL http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/capitulo1/anexa108.pdf</p> <p>Central Government Level, ADMINISTRACION CENTRAL: CARACTER ECONOMICO DE LOS RECURSOS POR JURISDICCION Y SUBJURISDICCION http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/titulo2/anexa205.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|--|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>4. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. No program-level data are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Planilla detalle jurisdicción entidad http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensadossiete.html#titulos An example for Legislative Branch: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/jurent/pdf/p07j01.pdf</p> <p>A less detailed spreadsheet where appears information for most of the programs: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/ley/pdf/anexo_estadistico/capitulo1/cap1pla7.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Even though the information is divided according to the Administrative Unit that manages the program, under "Detalle jurisdicción entidad" is possible to get detailed information on every program. Therefore, an "a" answer would be the most appropriate.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</u></p> | a |
| <p>5. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The estimates are available in the Executive's message (Mensaje de elevación), section 5.2.2. Expenditure projections. (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is also a multi annual budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Presupuesto Plurianual: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/plurianual/plurianual0709.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In the executive’s budget (mensaje de remisión) appears information on economic classification (pag. 229-230). More information is available in the multi-annual budget which is usually presented once the budget law has been approved.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d” even though the Executive does submit to the Congress a pluri annual budget that does include information about macroeconomics, detailed revenue collection, aggregate expenditure and fiscal results, it is not submitted by the time the budget proposal is under consideration in the Congress. For example, the 2007 multi-annual budget was submitted to the Congress in March 2007</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>b</p> |
|---|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This appears in the Executive's message, sections 2.1, 2.2 and 3.1: Tax policy and Tax estimations. (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Tax policy and Tax estimations. (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 5.1.1: Revenue projections. (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|--|----------|

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Presupuesto Plurianual http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/plurianual/plurianual0709.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In the executive’s budget (mensaje de remisión) appears information on individual sources of revenue and by revenue classification (pages 223-224 and 229-230). More information is available in the multi-annual budget which is usually presented once the budget law has been approved.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” They are not included in the executive’s budget, but they are available in the multi annual budget which is not submitted as a supporting budget document but as a stand-alone document. From the 2007 experience, the multi annual budget was presented in March 2007 after the Budget was approved and enacted. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/plurianual/plurianual0709.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|--|----------|

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>11. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).</p> <p>b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.</p> <p>c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.</p> <p>d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Mensaje de Remisión (Executive's Message) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is worth mentioning that the data is not consolidated (i.e. it does not include both the National and sub national governments). The information provided only accounts for the National or Federal government. As Argentina is a federal country where a considerable share of social spending is decentralized, the fact that the information is not in a consolidated manner (taking into account all levels of government) affects the possible analysis of the data. This comment is valid for all the questions involving fiscal data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>12. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.</p> <p>b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.4: Revenue projections (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>13. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</p> <p>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This information did not appear in executive's budget for 2007, but it is available in the executive's budget for 2008, Page 233 of the Executive's Message: Information on maturity profile and main instruments. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2008/mensaje/mensaje2008.pdf.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some information, for instance debt issued and cancelled in the previous year appears in section 2.4 of the Executive's Message: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2008/mensaje/mensaje2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| <p>14. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <p>a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.</p> <p>b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 1.1:Global economic context (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The only information provided in the executive's message is that related to the official projections - no alternative scenario is provided. On the Central Bank website, though, it is possible to access the projections calculated by several private sources: http://www.bcra.gov.ar/estadis/es070100.asp.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>d</p> |
|---|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.5: Public Spending and its Priorities (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> There is not enough information to identify the specific impact of the proposed policies in the budget. The figures include not only proposed changes but also changes regulated by other laws that do have an impact in public spending.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |
| <p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is not provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year | |
|---|---|
| <p>18. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Statistical Annex: Comparative Tables of the Executive's Message (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/ley/pdf/Anexo%20Estadistico/Capitulo1/cap1pla1.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>19. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Statistical Annex: Comparative Tables of the Executive's Message (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/ley/pdf/Anexo%20Estadistico/Capitulo1/cap1pla1.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>20. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Statistical Annex: Comparative Tables of the Executive's Message (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/ley/pdf/Anexo%20Estadistico/Capitulo1/cap1pla4.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>21. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is presented only for the programs included in the Result Oriented Programs Pilot Experience (Experiencia piloto de programas orientados a resultados). We provide the Programa Familias information as an example: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2008/prog_resultado/DESARR OLLO%20SOCIAL.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive's budget includes data from the first six months of the previous year. As the year progresses the executive's budget is updated with the information of the first seven months of the current budget year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.2:Expenditure by Function Analysis (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.2: Expenditure by Function Analysis (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A large proportion of total expenditures reflect the actual incomes of BY-2, but some of this information could be estimates that are revised later.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Mensaje de Remisión (Executive's Message) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf and http://sg.mecon.gov.ar/ejecucion</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The aggregated level of data makes it possible to compare the budget-year data to the prior budget year estimates.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>27. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 3.1.1. Economic Analysis of Resources (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Economic Analysis of Resources (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.2: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>30. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Although this information does not appear in the budget year's executive's budget, it is available since the BY-2 executive's budget is also posted on the Finance Minister's website (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2005/mensadoscinco.html).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>31. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Although this information does not appear in the budget year's executive's budget, it is available since the BY-2 executive's budget is also posted on the Finance Minister's website (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2005/mensadoscinco.html).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Economic Analysis of Resources (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.4: (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The debt stock is available in the Executive's Message, Section 2.4: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|---|----------|

| Comprehensiveness | |
|--|---|
| <p>35. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Fiduciary Funds: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/capitulo1/fondosfidu.pdf Decentralized Organisms: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/titulo3/anexa3a1.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Fiduciary Funds work as trust funds where an entity contributes resources that will be managed by a trustee to finance a specific project. Some examples of decentralized organisms in Argentina are: National Institute for Water; National Communications Commission; National Entity for Electricity Regulation; National Institute of Livestock and Agriculture Technology; Military Geographic Institute.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | C |

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Economic Analysis of Resources (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The answer is “b” rather than “a” because it covers only the automatic transfers.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The information on intergovernmental transfers is present in two sections of the Executive’s Message: In an aggregated manner in section 3.1.1 and with more detail (by tax and province) in section 5.2 - multi annual projections. It is worth noticing that these transfers are not approved in the Budget as they are regulated by other instruments</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p> | <p>b</p> |
|--|----------|

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>37. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 4: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf (page 168)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Details are provided for specific transfers but for most of the transfers to public enterprises specific details are not provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |
| <p>38. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive's Message presents information regarding quasi fiscal activities for BY-1 in section 4.4.g: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.4 http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>c</p> |
| <p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is not provided in the Executive's Budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>d</p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is not provided in the Executive's Budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| <p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The information is scarce. There is some information regarding endorsements in section 2.4 of the Executive's Message: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is not provided in the Executive's Budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| <p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Due to Argentina's GDP per capita, it does not receive donor assistance or the amount is minor.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The budget does not allow identifying donor assistance. There is no guarantee that the national government Argentina does not receive any donor assistant financial or in kind.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | e |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.3: Tax Expenditure Estimation (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Economic Analysis of Resources (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Sources of revenue are identified but the classifications used are broadly defined. Some of the earmarking of the revenues can be inferred from the Budget proposal but they are not identified explicitly.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Some of the earmarking of the revenues can be inferred from the Budget proposal but they are not identified explicitly.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in section 3.2.2 of the Executive's Message: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The information is vague. It mentions only the total amount for intelligence and defense and only a couple of programs are disaggregated.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
|--|---|

| The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring | |
|---|---|
| <p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.5: Public Spending and its Priorities (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |
| <p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is no information in the executive's budget, it is only included in the multi-annual budget</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>50. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Non-financial data are presented for all programs. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. No non-financial data are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Proyecto de Presupuesto. Detalle de Programas Orientados a Resultados. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/prog_resultado.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is an ongoing pilot experience which includes several result oriented programs. The non-financial data is presented for these programs.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | C |
| <p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | C |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>52. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Performance indicators are presented for all programs. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. No performance indicators are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Proyecto de Presupuesto. Detalle de Programas Orientados a Resultados http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/prog_resultado.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is an ongoing pilot experience which includes several result oriented programs. The performance indicators are presented for these programs</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | C |
| <p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All performance indicators are well designed. Most performance indicators are well designed. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The indicators aimed to assess procedures either do not exist or they are insufficient. Examples of these indicators are Medical Consultations and Immunization Rates.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The indicators aimed to asses procedures either do not exist or they are limited, such as medical consultations. In the case of immunization rates, there is an almost perfect linkage between vaccination and prevention of diseases, so it is a good indicator.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | C |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Proyecto de Presupuesto. Detalle de Programas Orientados a Resultados. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/prog_resultado.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are available only for the indicators included in the pilot experience.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>55. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p>Detalle de Programas Orientados a Resultados http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2007/mensadossiete.html#experiencia</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |

| Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring | |
|---|---|
| <i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i> | |
| <p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in a document called the Current Taxes in Argentina issued by the Undersecretary of Public Incomes (http://www.mecon.gov.ar/sip/dniaf/tributos_vigentes.pdf)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available in the executive's budget document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Anuario estadísticas tributarias: http://www.afip.gov.ar/institucional/estudios/</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are some documents on tax incidence published by the AFIP.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> This question is asking about this information in general, not only in the Budget proposal. There are some documents on tax incidence produced and published by the AFIP (revenue's agency).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is not provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Due to Argentina's GDP per capita, it does not receive donor assistance or the amount is minor.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The amount of bilateral or multilateral donations is relatively small. There is no information in the budget but the Ministry of External Relations does produce some information about cooperation, even it needs to be updated (last information is from 2005).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | e |
| <p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. No, it does not provide a summary. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is available in the Executive's Message: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/proy2007/mensaje/mensaje2007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The first part of the executive's message describes the budget and its main goals, but it does not appear as a separate document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is, however, a piece of information regarding the execution of the budget for citizens' knowledge: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/consulta/index0a.html</p> <p>The site (it is not a document) is called <i>Consulta para el ciudadano sobre el presupuesto de la administración pública nacional</i> which stands for "Citizens' access to information on the Budget of the National Administration."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>d</p> |
|---|----------|

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. No, definitions are not provided. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Manual of the Public Budgetary System: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/manuales/el_sistema_presupuestario_publico.pdf Manual of Budgetary Classifiers: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/manuales/clasificador03.pdf Glossary: http://sg.mecon.ar/ejecucion/ (Glosario)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The National Office for Budget publishes manuals (glossary) that includes thorough definitions such as the two links above that are available online to the public. However, the language is too technical for lay persons to follow. . The Glossary for the Citizen is a useful tool but lacks important details.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The NOB publishes the manuals (glossary) but they are available to the public but they are too technical. Even though, there is a less technical glossary in the website http://sg.mecon.ar/ejecucion/ that is oriented for citizens, as was mentioned above.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Many definitions included in the Glossary can be understood easily. Nevertheless, it is possible that some of them need a detailed explanation for non-specialists.</p> | <p>C</p> |
|--|----------|

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information. d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no Law of Access to Public Information, but there is a presidential decree which rules on these matters and that only applies to the National Executive Government, which we consider "in law" (even though it can be revoked by the President). However, many offices of the National Executive government excuse themselves under the Law of "Procedimientos Administrativos" which preexists and contradicts the decree.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>b</p> |
|---|----------|

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Taking into account our experience in several projects on transparency of information, it is more possible to obtain financial information as an NGO than as an individual citizen despite the fact that theoretically, there should not be any difference. More seriously, the delay and level of detail of the answer vary widely depending on the administrative unit involved in delivering the data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | C |
| <p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Same as previous answer with the peculiarity that this kind of data may involve personal information (e.g. data on social programs beneficiaries) which is usually not provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | C |

Section Three: The Budget Process

| | |
|--|---|
| The Budget Process | |
| Executive's Formulation of the Budget | |
| <p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The release date is set in permanent law. b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Law 24156 - article N# 26: http://www.infoleg.gov.ar/infolegInternet/anexos/0-4999/554/norma.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The release date is set for September 15th of each year based on Law 24156. However, generalized access occurs a few days later. The information is uploaded on the Ministry of Economy website several days after the executive project is presented in Congress. In 2002 the executive's budget was presented in February 2002 because of the economic crisis that rendered the Budget presented in September 2001 completely useless.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The above statement is slightly misleading. A version of the budget project was submitted to the Congress by the Executive in September 17th 2001 but as the government changed abruptly a new proposal was submitted on February 6th 2002.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <p>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> <u>Cronograma de elaboración del Presupuesto Nacional</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/instrutexto/archivos/res1762007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The dates for the executive's budget presentation and for the approval by Congress are set by law. The Congress is not forced to approve it. In the case this happens, BY-1 budget stays in effect.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The Financial Administration Law only states when the proposal from the Executive has to be submitted to the Congress but does not establish that the Budget has to be approved by a certain date. The Law also includes detailed measures how the government should operate in the case that the Budget were not approved by the beginning of the fiscal year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
|--|---|

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Even though the executive adheres to the timetable, in the sense that it complies with the date of deliverance to the Congress, it is not possible to control the internal deadlines. The timetable was not accomplished several times in the last 25 years. The most recent violation took place during the 2002 budget process. From 1995 onwards – the regulating law was approved in 1992 - the Executive presented the proposal later than the established dates in 1995 and 2001.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> From 1995 onwards – the regulating law was approved in 1992 - the Executive presented the proposal later than the established dates in 1995 and 2001. The delay in both cases was than less than one week. As was mentioned above, the 2002 budget was presented again in February 2002 because of the economic crisis.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|--|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It depends on the relative power of the president and legislators. The Executive usually holds consultations with very few legislators, among them the president of the budget committee. The main objective of these meetings is to gauge the legislator's view on some potentially problematic budget issues.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |
| <p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive releases a document to the public that has some characteristics of a pre-budget statement (informe de avance del presupuesto) 6 months in advance of the start of the budget year. This is in accordance with Law N° 24629, Art. 2. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/info_avance/2008.pdf. However this document only provides macroeconomic data and the previous year's budget information.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| <p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government's macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the government's fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Informe de Avance http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/info_avance/2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The document (Informe de avance) does not qualify as a pre-budget statement because it does not provide the information for BY+1. It does explain key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but it does not provide information on spending, revenues or debt for the budget year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Informe de Avance http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/info_avance/2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The document (Informe de avance) does not qualify as a pre-budget statement because it does not provide the information for BY+1. It does presents the main goals of the government's fiscal policy. Nevertheless, it lacks aggregated and detailed data on expenditures and income/revenues for 2007 and 2008.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| Legislative Approval of the Budget | |
| <p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 26: http://www.infoleg.gov.ar/infolegInternet/anexos/0-4999/554/norma.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The discussion starts (depending on the political situation) in the beginning of September and the budget is discussed intensively from mid November to early December. There is not much time for a serious analysis, especially because of the lack of a Congressional Budget Office.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Ministry of Economy presents to the legislative committee the macroeconomic and fiscal framework at the time that it sends the budget proposal. The Press can assist with the presentation but there is no room for debate. This year (Proposal 2008) questions from the legislators were not allowed.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>C</p> |
|--|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This site below gathers information about legislative committees' sessions. www.laborlegislativa.com.ar</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Hearings that cover key administrative unit are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <p>a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.</p> <p>b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.</p> <p>d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> There are handwritten versions but it is difficult to get them.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| <p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <p>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</p> <p>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is provided regarding the total amount, but disaggregated spending information on intelligence is not provided.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <p>a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</p> <p>b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations.</p> <p>c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</p> <p>d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> As in most Latin American countries there is a restriction on the Legislature which prohibits it to change the fiscal result.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <p>a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.</p> <p>b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</p> <p>c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.</p> <p>d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Every program appears under the jurisdiction which executes it. This is accessible at: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/ley2007/jurent/pdf/D07J80.pdf We give the example of the Health Ministry: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/ley2007/jurent/pdf/D07J80.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| Executive's Implementation of the Budget | |
|---|---|
| <p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Boletín Fiscal: In Year: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/1ertrim07/1ertrim07.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Fiscal Newsletter (Boletín Fiscal) provides a report organized by several criteria every three months. The Query for the Citizen (Consulta para el Ciudadano) publishes less detailed information, but it has simple graphs which help to understand the data provided. The Cash Basis (Base Caja) expenditures are published monthly.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. No in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> <u>Boletín Fiscal</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/1ertrim07/1ertrim07.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Tables 12 and 13 of http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/1ertrim07/1ertrim07.pdf Citizen Query: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/consulta/detallado/index0.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It does not cover all programs in detail.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Fiscal Newsletter: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/1ertrim07/1ertrim07.pdf Citizen Query: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/consulta/detallado/index0.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are comparisons both with the original estimate for that period, and with the same period in the previous year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> Tax revenues are released monthly. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/sip/basehome/pormes.htm. Non Tax Revenues are also released monthly on a Cash Basis http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejectexto/cuenta_nac_dosuno.html?var1=cuenta_nacdossiete</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is published by the Undersecretary of Public Revenues (Subsecretaria de Ingresos Publicos) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/sip/basehome/pormes.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The comparison is available in the Fiscal Newsletter that is published quarterly. The comparison is done between the actual quarter and the same quarter from the previous year. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/html/2005.htm. The National Inland Revenue Office (Administración Federal de Ingresos Públicos-AFIP) also publishes quarterly reports comparing the same quarter from the previous year</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Fiscal Newsletter: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/1ertrim07/1ertrim07.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</p> <p>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Fiscal Newsletter: Table 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 49 and 50. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/1ertrim07/1ertrim07.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is information on interest rates and currency denomination, but information on the exact year of maturity after 2008 is not published. Taking into account the amount of information provided the answer could be A.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|---|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. In-year reports are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> <u>Ejecución presupuestaria del sector público nacional</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejectexto/ejec_sector_doscuatro.html?var1=ejec_sectordosiete and http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejectexto/cuenta_nac_dosuno.html?var1=cuenta_nacdossiete</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It depends on the report. For example, reports that include program, institution or function analysis are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. Cash basis expenditures are released 20 days after the end of the month.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| <p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| <p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Ministers Cabinet Chief has powers that allow him to shift funds between administrative units without any input from the Congress. He can not increase total expenditures but he can shift funds.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> This power to modify budget is not an extra power, the Chief of Cabinet is entitled by the FAL and other laws regulating the budget process.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

- a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
- b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
- c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
- d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Report by Clarin newspaper on Skanska and Environment Secretary affairs:
<http://www.clarin.com/diario/2007/05/23/elpais/p-00801.htm>
<http://www.clarin.com/suplementos/zona/2007/07/08/z-01453283.htm>

Comment:

The most relevant cases of problems in the procurement of goods and services are the ones cited. It is difficult to decide between "c" and "b." We will accept the reviewer's decision.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c."

Even if it is true that the quantities of cases of irregularities which are made public are not so many, it should be noted that those that were published are of a very significant dimension. Added to *Skanska*, the Government is also questioned for irregularities in the distribution of official publicity between 2004 and 2007.

(<http://www.clarin.com/suplementos/zona/2008/04/20/z-03615.htm>)

(http://buscador.lanacion.com.ar/Nota.asp?nota_id=1007291&high=albistur)

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain consistency across countries.

C

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Supplemental budgets should be approved by law, but in practice they are always implemented through Necessity Decrees that are later approved by the Congress. The issue is that there is a big backlog in the approvals of the Necessity Decrees by the Congress, so the resolutions might come after the fiscal year was over.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The issue is that there is a big backlog in the approvals of the Necessity Decrees by the Congress, so the resolutions might come after the fiscal year was over.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is difficult to answer this question because the behavior has changed a lot since the economic recovery in 2003. As the government started to underestimate its revenues, the supplemental budgets became larger. In 2007 the answer would have been d, as a result of changes in the pension system.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are no operative contingency funds. The Fiscal Responsibility Law plans the creation of a Counter Cyclical Fund but it has not been properly established.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|---|----------|

| Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution | |
|--|---|
| <p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. The executive does not release a year-end report. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It should be published six months after the end of the fiscal year, but usually it is published later. The report is available to the public and it is published in the month of June of year AP+1. For example for year 2006 the report message can be checked at: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/01mensaje.htm The Contaduría General de la Nación only provides the general public sector balance and does not conduct any research on expenditures and budgetary goals. The Congress should approve the End-year report but the last one they approved was the 1998 one. This is due to political decisions.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |
| <p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/02intro.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The year-end report shows the differences but not at an exhaustive level. It lacks some details on program goal for example.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/01bintrouccion.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | a |

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/06comentarios.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>b</p> |
| <p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is only explanation regarding differences on expenditures and resources but not on the macroeconomic data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>d</p> |

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is information regarding physical outcomes (Sistema de seguimiento fisico financiero) by program. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/01aintroduccion.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Even though the data is published it is really difficult to understand it.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |
| <p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Cuenta de Inversión http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/06comentarios.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are some comments on the budgetary execution in the end-year report and it gives an idea of the reasons for the main changes in expenditures when compared to the original budget. But it does not explain the differences in detail; it only mentions the main items.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |

109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

We provide the information regarding the programs under the Education Ministry as an example:

<http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/13jur70.htm>

"During the year 2006 384,552 teachers were trained, quantity which is inferior to what was planned, due to the postponement of activities already programmed for administrative problems in the provinces. En 2006 263 projects were implemented, which entailed 711 training acts in all the provincial jurisdictions."

(Spanish: "Durante 2006 se capacitaron 384.552 docentes, cantidad inferior a la prevista debido a la postergación de acciones programadas por inconvenientes administrativos en las provincias. En 2006 se realizaron 263 proyectos que implicaron 711 acciones de capacitación en todas las jurisdicciones provinciales.")

Comment:

The explanation exists for some programs but it is vague.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

C

| | |
|---|---|
| <p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The main information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, but the information is not detailed. There is no explanation on detailed expenditures in extra-budgetary funds. For example, for Fiduciary Funds: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2006/tomoi/15fondos.htm</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |
| <i>The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution</i> | |
| <p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year by the Auditoria General de la Nacion and the Congress</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The reports from the Auditory Authority only cover a small proportion of total expenditures.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>d</p> |
| <p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are several audit reports for several departments (http://www.agn.gov.ar/informes.htm) but it does not have an annual audit report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>b</p> |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <p>a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.</p> <p>b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Constitution: "This body which provides technical assistance to the Congress, with financial independence, will be integrated following the law which regulates its creation and functioning, that will have to be approved by the members of each Chamber. The President of this body will be appointed upon the proposal put forward by the opposition political party with the greatest number of legislative members in the Congress." (Original Spanish: "<i>Este organismo de asistencia técnica del Congreso, con autonomía funcional, se integrará del modo que establezca la ley que reglamenta su creación y funcionamiento, que deberá ser aprobada por mayoría absoluta de los miembros de cada Cámara. El presidente del organismo será designado a propuesta del partido político de oposición con mayor número de legisladores en el Congreso.</i>")</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There can be administrative summaries against the public servant and it can also lead to political judgment carried out by the Congress. Also, the Judicial authorities can take part if there are denunciations.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|---|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Several examples of audits of extra-budgetary funds can be found in the SAI webpage. We provide the link to one of them (Federal Infrastructure Fund): http://www.agn.gov.ar/informes/informesPDF2006/2006_242.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Even if it is true that most of the extra budgetary funds are audited, not all of those included in the budget were audited during last year. For example, Software Industry Fund, Recovery Bovine Activity Fund and FONAPYME weren’t audited.</p> | a |
| <p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In Argentina the audit authority is headed by the opposition. But the board of directors that takes all decisions is confirmed by members both from the ruling party members and from the opposition (which are a minority when voting). The Auditoria General de la Nación audits the expenditures referred in Art. 118 of Law 24.156, with a planning that will point out the control areas and the resources for each of them, defined on the basis of importance, significance and risk.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | b |

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Budgetary Law (Ley de Administracion Financiera): "The powers and duties of the General Auditors Institution include: a) to propose the yearly action plan and the budget proposal for the institution." Original Spanish: "Son atribuciones y deberes de los Auditores Generales reunidos en Colegio: a) Proponer el programa de acción anual y el proyecto de presupuesto de la entidad"</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is proposed by the general auditors and then approved by the Legislature.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>a</p> |
|---|----------|

| | |
|---|----------|
| <p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> SAI organizational chart: http://www.agn.gov.ar/doc-tecnicos/organi.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The reports are on specific programs, but they do not include the whole defense sector.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>d</p> |
|---|----------|

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.e. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u> Rules regarding the presentation of information to the SAI: http://www.agn.gov.ar/informes/Reglamento-Presentaciones%20Reol.%2050%20del%202004.PDF</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is not possible to quantify the effects of this normative.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | c |
|--|---|

120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

- a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
- b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
- c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
- d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Ley de Administracion Financiera, Art. 129 -

"In order to carry on its functions the Mixed Parliamentary Commission for the Revision of the Accounts must:

- d) Request to the national General Audit Institution all the information that deems to be appropriate about the activities implemented by the above mentioned institutions.
- e) Analyze the periodic reports about the implementation of the approved activities, make the appropriate observations and indicate the changes that deems advisable to be introduced
- f) Analyze the annual memo that the national General Audit Institution should present before May 1 of each year."

Original Spanish: "Para el desempeño de sus funciones la Comisión Parlamentaria Mixta Revisora de Cuentas debe:

- d) Requerir de la Auditoría General de la Nación toda la información que estime oportuno sobre las actividades realizadas por dicho ente;
- e) Analizar los informes periódicos de cumplimiento del programa de trabajo aprobado, efectuar las observaciones que pueden merecer e indicar las modificaciones que estime conveniente introducir.
- f) Analizar la memoria anual que la Auditoría General de la Nación deberá elevarle antes del 1 de mayo de cada año."

Comment:

The reports are scrutinized but there are usually some delays. In other words, the reports sometimes do not get scrutinized on time.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

a

| | |
|--|---|
| <p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> By law, the government is not obliged to take remedial respect to the audits. This is a regulatory shortcoming. Moreover, audits have been commonly presented with significant delays to governments that were already different from those responsible for the Audit's findings.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |
| <p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No, a report is not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | d |

| | |
|--|----------|
| <p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Regarding the army and police, the SAI is empowered to produce reports and deliver them to the legislature. As we stated earlier, this is not the case regarding the intelligence services.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> | <p>b</p> |
|--|----------|

Additional Comments:

Please use this section to add any additional comments.

Researcher Additional Comments:

We would like to bring up and call your attention the following four items since the questionnaire did not seem to capture the real transparency problems.

1) Spending consolidation: Given the federal nature of Argentina's political system, a considerable share of spending - particularly social spending - is executed by subnational governments. The information on this spending is not published with as much consistency, in terms of quality, detail and timing, as the national spending information.

Even though individual spending programs are presented, some of them are so broad that they do not permit a thorough analysis.

2) The Legislature has yielded budgetary powers to the Chief of Cabinet (Executive Power). In 2006 the Legislature gave attributes to the Chief of Cabinet - attributes which allow him to make changes in the budget without the Congress's approval, making it possible to change spending within categories, but still limiting the ability to change the fiscal result or the total amount of spending. This measure, which changes the distribution of power established by the Law of Financial Administration, empowers the government branch that was already the most prominent in the process. Doing so may have pernicious consequences on budget transparency. We must specify though, that the restrictions which are still imposed to the Executive branch regarding budget changes can be avoided by the President by issuing a decree. (decretos de necesidad y urgencia).

3) Regarding the Citizens Budget. The Ministry of Finance has a webpage which intends to present a Citizen Budget. Nevertheless the information provided is not adequate. Please see <http://www.mecon.gov.ar/consulta/index0a.html>

4) The final comment relates to the controversy about the macroeconomic projections used by the Executive. Key macroeconomic variables such as GDP growth and inflation have been underestimated during previous years. This is due to both political and economic reasons. Underestimating the GDP - and consequently the revenues - allows the National Executive to assign a portion of the extra revenues with a higher level of discretion. Underestimating inflation is more related to the intention of avoiding to fuel inflation by reducing inflation expectations.