International Budget Partnership

OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

BURKINA FASO

September, 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC  20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org
This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: SILWE Ségorbah, OUBDA Francis, TARPAGA Ambroisine

Organization: Centre pour la Gouvernance Démocratique
Address: s/c du PNUD, 01 B.P. 575 Ouagadougou 01, BF
Telephone: (226) 50 37 48 25
E-mail: cgdbf@hotmail.com
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents .......................................................... 4
  Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire .................. 5
  Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links .......................... 6
  Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal .......... 8
  Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports ................................. 9

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal .............................................................. 10
  Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond ................................................................. 11
  Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year .............................................................. 19
  Comprehensiveness .................................................................................................... 28
  The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring .................................................... 35
  Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring ............................. 38

Section Three: The Budget Process ............................................................................. 47
  Executive’s Formulation of the Budget ................................................................. 48
  Legislative Approval of the Budget ................................................................. 52
  Executive’s Implementation of the Budget ........................................................... 57
  Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution ............................................. 68
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Year Used</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Full Title, Date, and Internet Link</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>“Circulaire budgetaire 2007.” Produced on May 1st, 2006, but not available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>“Exposé des motifs pour le projet de loi de finances, gestion 2007.” Produced (at the same time with the Executive's budget proposal) but not available to the Public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>“Situation d'exécution de la loi de finances au 31/03/07.” Publicly Available on July 2007, but not on the Internet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Review</td>
<td>“Situation d'exécution de la loi de finances au 30/06/2007.” Publicly available in August 2007, but not on the Internet.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Year-End Report | Publicly Available, but not on the Internet  
“Situation d'exécution de la loi de finances au 31/12/2006,” disponible à partir de mars 2007 |
|-----------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
Publicly Available, but not on the Internet |
| Other Documents | Publicly Available, but not on the Internet  
“Circulaire budgétaire,” à partir du 31 mai de l'année précédant celle pour laquelle le budget qui est élaboré |

**Relevant Ministries & Departments**

- Premier ministère : http://www.primature.gov.bf/
- Direction des études et de la planification : http://www.finances.gov.bf/SiteFinances/ministere/sc/dep.html
- La Direction Générale du Trésor et de la Comptabilité Publique (DGTCP) : http://www.finances.gov.bf/SiteFinances/ministere/sc/dgtcp.html
- La Direction centrale des marches publics (D.C.M.P.) : http://www.finances.gov.bf/SiteFinances/ministere/sc/dcmp.html
- Ministère de l'économie et du développement (MEDEV) : http://www.medev.gov.bf/SiteMedev/index.jsp
### Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

**DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS**

*For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

*For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities*</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.*
### Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

#### DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS

*For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?

*For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked “not applicable/other,” please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.
### The Executive’s Budget Proposal

#### Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)? | a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.  
b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.  
c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.  
d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation:                                                               | d                                                                       |
| Comment: The Executive's budget proposal is still not available for the public. Therefore, we cannot affirm a priori that, because of an administrative classification of the enacted budget, the Executive's budget proposal presented to the Parliament also corresponds to this administrative presentation. So, we prefer to be prudent from question 1 until question 55. |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**                                           |                                                                         |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**                                          |                                                                         |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification? | a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.  
b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.  
c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.  
d. No expenditures classified by function are presented.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
<p>| Citation:                                                               | d                                                                       |
| Comment:                                                                 |                                                                         |
| <strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong>                                           |                                                                         |
| <strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong>                                          |                                                                         |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No program-level data are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** But for aggregate expenditure only for each ministry.

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the
different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the
different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of
goods and services) for the budget year?

a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 10. | In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)? |
| a. | Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). |
| b. | Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. |
| c. | Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. |
| d. | No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. |
| e. | Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: |   |
| Comment: |   |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** | Only for aggregate revenue. |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** |   |
| d |   |
11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?
   
   a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
   
   b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
   
   c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
   
   d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
   
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).
   
   **Citation:**
   
   **Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?
   
   a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.
   
   b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.
   
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).
   
   **Citation:**
   
   **Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
| 13. | Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year? |
|---------------------------------------------|
| a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. |
| b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| 14. | Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? |
|---------------------------------------------|
| a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. |
| b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** The answer is yes, but the MTEF which presents these projections is not made available to the public.
15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: The MTEF includes three scenarios (trend scenario, pessimistic and optimistic scenarios). But this document is not made available to the public.

16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   Peers Reviewer One Comment:

   Peers Reviewer Two Comment:

---

18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

   a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.
   b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.
   c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
   d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   Peers Reviewer One Comment:

   Peers Reviewer Two Comment:
19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?

a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.
d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?

a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.
d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** Yes, but the document is not made available to the public.
21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?
   a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
   b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
   c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
   d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?
   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** The answer would have been “a” were the budget available to the public.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)? | a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.  
  b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.  
  c. Not applicable/other (please comment). |          |         |

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)? | a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).  
  b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.  
  c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.  
  d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.  
  e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |          |         |

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
### Question 25

In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

- a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

| Citation: | d |
| Comment: | |

**Peer Reviewer One Comment**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

### Question 26

Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

- a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.
- b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.
- c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.
- d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

| Citation: | d |
| Comment: | |

**Peer Reviewer One Comment**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** This is done, but since the documents are not made available, the answer is “d.”
27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation,</td>
<td>a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more</td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong> The information exists but is not made available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates</td>
<td>months of actual revenue collections.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</td>
<td>b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>months of actual revenue collections.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>revenue collections.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation,</td>
<td>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years</td>
<td>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and</td>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>prior years)?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong> The information exists but is not made available.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** Details exist but are not made available.

---

32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>33.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>34.</th>
<th>In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Before BY-3.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td>The answer would have been “a” were the information made available to the public.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Comprehensiveness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?
   a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment: The public is not informed officially.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: The answer would have been “c” were the information made available to the public.

38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?
   a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td>No, information on financial assets is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  
Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
<td>No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  
Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

   a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** The answer would be “b” if the information produced by the debt service were available to the public.
43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

   a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

   a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

   a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

   a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring

48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?

a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.

b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.

c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.

d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.

b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.

c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.

d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|   | a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.  
|   | b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.  
|   | c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.  
|   | d. No non-financial data are presented.  
|   | e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: |   |
| Comment: |   |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: |   |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |   |
| 51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing? | d |
|   | a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.  
|   | b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.  
|   | c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.  
|   | d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.  
<p>|   | e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: |   |
| Comment: |   |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: |   |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |   |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>52.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No performance indicators are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>53.</th>
<th>Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. All performance indicators are well designed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Most performance indicators are well designed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?

a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector? | a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.  
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.  
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.  
d. No, information is not presented.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | b | | **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**  
**Comment:** The tax rates or fee schedule for all revenue sources are available in the enacted budget. |
| 57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden? | a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.  
b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.  
c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.  
d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | d | | **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**  
**Comment:** |
58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** When foreign assistance is received, the public is informed by radio, television or newspaper about the nature of the assistance (amount of grant, subvention, or loan) and the nature and localization of the program or investment for the assistance.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, it does not provide a summary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The information is available, but only on request.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” On the Ministry of Economy and Finance web site, there is a note “Note de presentation du budget 2007” signed by the Minister of Finance which presents such information.


**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because I think that in practice, this document is not available to the public.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 
Comment: 
**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Same web site as above. The above mentioned Note is intended to inform the citizens of the aggregate data of the budget.

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because the information presented is about the total amounts of resources, expenditures and budget deficit.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “d.” Although there is no standard definition of citizens’ budget, this document is not only a summary of the budget proposal. It is meant to be a simplified version of it, whereby the content is expressed in a terminology that common citizens can understand. Such a document is not produced in Burkina Faso.

62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?

   a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.
   b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, definitions are not provided.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 
Comment: 
**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
63. Do citizens have the right in law to access government information, including budget information?

- a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
- d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
There isn't total transparency in the budget process because public servants don't want to give all information, and sometimes they are afraid of what their boss would say (for example)

**Comment:**

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “d,” because the right has not been codified in law. On request citizens can access budget information.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose to keep my answer “b” because though it has not been codified in the ‘loi de finances,’ (Finance Law) the Constitution mentions it in its article n° 8 and 101.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “c” consistent with guidance provided in the IBP Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire, regarding the adoption of the right in Constitution, but the subsequent failure to adopt right to information implementing legislation.

**Article 8**

*Les libertés d’opinion, de presse et le droit à l’information sont garantis. Toute personne a le droit d’exprimer et de diffuser ses opinions dans le cadre des lois et règlements en vigueur.*
(ENG: The freedom of opinion, of the press and the right to information are guaranteed. Every person has the right to express and to disseminate his/her opinions within the framework of the laws and regulations in place.)

**Article 101**

(Loi N° 002/97/ADP du 27 janvier 1997)

....

La loi détermine les principes fondamentaux:
- De la protection et de la promotion de l’Environnement;
- De l’élaboration, de l’exécution et du suivi des plans et programmes nationaux de
développement;
• De la protection de la liberté de presse et de l’accès à l’information;
• De l’organisation générale de l’Administration;
• Du statut général de la Fonction Publique;
• De l’organisation de la Défense Nationale;
• De l’Enseignement et de la Recherche Scientifique;
• De l’intégration des valeurs culturelles nationales;
• Du régime de la propriété, des droits réels et des obligations civiles et commerciales;
• Du droit du Travail, du droit syndical et des institutions sociales;
• De l’aliénation et de la gestion du domaine de l’État;
• Du régime pénitentiaire;
• De la mutualité et de l’épargne;
• De l’organisation de la production;
• Du régime des transports et des communications;
• De la libre administration des collectivités territoriales, de leurs compétences et de leurs ressources.

(ENG: The law determines the following fundamental principles:
• Protection and promotion of the Environment;
• Aiding and creation national development programs;
• Protection of Freedom of the Press and Access to Information;
• The general organization of the Administration;
• The general status of the Public Administration;
• The organization of the National Defense,
• Teaching and Scientific Research;
• Integration of the national cultural values;
• A proprietary system, the true rights, and the civil and commercial duties;
• Right to Work, right to unionize and to form social organizations;
• Alienation and management of the State domain;
• Penitentiary system;
• Mutual insurance systems and savings;
• Management and Production;
• Transportation and communication systems
• Free administration of the semi-autonomous regions, of their competencies and their resources.)
64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?

a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.

b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.

c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.

d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Researcher’s Response to this Question was “b.”

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The “Loi de finances pour l’exécution, du budget de l’Etat” for each year gives highly disaggregated information. The document is available to the public.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer “b” because some of these expenditures are not available to the public, like intelligence-related expenditure, presidency, etc. The “Loi de finances pour l’exécution, du budget de l’Etat” is the enacted budget and it doesn’t present highly disaggregated information.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Budget practices are improving year after year, although many goals have yet to be accomplished.

Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a” because the pre-budget for each ministry gives this non-financial information. It is available to the public.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer “b” because the pre-budget and the executive’s proposal are not available to the public.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
Section Three: The Budget Process
### The Budget Process

#### Executive’s Formulation of the Budget

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</td>
<td></td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The release date is set in permanent law.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive’s budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget’s formulation)?</td>
<td></td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** OK. The time table for preparation for the budget exists but is not issued to the public.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

48
68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?

   a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.
   b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.
   c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.
   d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment**: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a,” because the timetable of the preparation of the budget is the same for each year.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment**:  

**Researcher Response**: I suggest the answer should remain as I indicated in the questionnaire, “d.” According to the Guide of the Questionnaire, this question asks whether the timetable is released to the public. Excluding the budget parliamentary session indicated in the Constitution, there is no timetable officially published by the Executive for the other steps.

**IBP Comment**: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** OK. The budget is only presented to members of the legislature for discussion and adoption.

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment:
The pre-budget statement is produced but not available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment:
The pre-budget statement is produced but not available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

- **a.** Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- **b.** Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.
- **c.** Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- **d.** No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The pre-budget statement is produced but not available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

**Legislative Approval of the Budget**

74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?

- **a.** The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.
- **b.** The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.
- **c.** The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.
- **d.** The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
According to the article 87 of Constitution (Law N° 002/97/ADP of January 27, 1997): "The assembly meets each year by right in two plain sessions. The length of each session would not exceed ninety days. The first session opens up the first Wednesday of March and the second the last Wednesday of September. In this second session, the Executive's budget proposal is examined by the Parliament."

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
75. **Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?**

   a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.
   
   b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.
   
   c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.
   
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.
   
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

The legislative Committee of the Parliament (COMFIB) may hear any person when it considers the budget (any ministry or public servant, independent expert, etc.). However, these hearings are not public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

76. **Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?**

   a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   
   b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   
   c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   
   d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
   
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  

Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  

Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

80. Does the legislature have authority *in law* to amend the budget presented by the executive?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget, with some limitations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the legislature does not have any authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” According to the role of the parliament, the legislature has unlimited authority to amend the budget.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose to keep my answer “b” because, for example, the Parliaments’ new propositions must neither increase the expenditure nor decrease the resources into the executive’s proposition.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?

   a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.
   b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.
   d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The UEMOA budgetary nomenclature is more or less respected

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The presentation of the budget is only based on each department’s total.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose to keep my answer “b” because there are sub-departmental details in the executive’s proposal that is submitted for the legislature’s approval.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
### Executive’s Implementation of the Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Citation:

#### Comment:
The name of the in-year report is: “Situation d'exécution de la loi de finances au 30/03/2007"

#### Peer Reviewer One Comment:

#### Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
A monthly report (Tableau des Operations Financieres de l’Etat – TOFE) is prepared but not shared with the public on a website for instance. It is, however, sent to budget support donors.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No in-year reports are released to the public.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Citation:

#### Comment:
The part of the expenses covered by the reports during the year is decreasing compared to 2006 because of a growing lack of transparency in the management of the public funds.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

#### Peer Reviewer One Comment:
A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The objective of this in-year report is to assess the budget execution of each revenue item and each expenditure item.

#### Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
The TOFE covers all expenditures.

#### Researcher Response:
Excluding the cases I noticed in question 64, I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer One.
84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by *administrative unit*?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail.</td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Citation:* "Situation de l'exécution du budget de l'Etat au 31 Mars 2007"

*Comment:*

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.</td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Citation:* "Situation de l'exécution du budget de l'Etat au 31 Mars 2007"

*Comment:*

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.
b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.
c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.
d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:
The name of the document is “Situation d'exécution de la loi de finances au 30/03/2007”

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?

a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.
b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.
c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
"Situation de l'exécution du budget de l'Etat au 31 Mars 2007"

Comment:
The part of the revenue covered by the reports during the year is decreasing compared to 2006 because of a growing lack of transparency in the management of public funds.

Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” Same comment as in question 83.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer One.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “a” based on the researchers comment.
88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

   a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.
   b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.
   c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
   d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
"Situation de l'exécution du budget de l'Etat au 31 Mars 2007"

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Comparisons are not made.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I chose to keep my answer “c” because data on realizations rates are given. Data on the rates of realizations are given between actual year-to-date revenue and the original estimate for that period. However, the figures are quite aggregated. For example, these could be found in the “Situation de l’Exécution du budget de l’Etat au 31 mars 2007” publication, mentioned in my “Citation.”

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?

   a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.
   b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.
   c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.
   d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” This release does not exist.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer One.

90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comment:

In-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing are only related to actual expenditures and revenues.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?

- a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.
- b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.
- c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.
- d. In-year reports are not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The in-year reports are published at least two and a half months after the end of the period covered by the report.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

- a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.
- b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.
- c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
"Situation de l'exécution du budget de l'Etat au 30 Juin 2006"

Comment:
The mid-year report now contains some analyses in order to allow understanding of modifications in the Executive’s budget implementation.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   "Situation de l'exécution du budget de l'Etat au 30 Juin 2006"

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

   a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.
   b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).
   d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   "Situation de l'exécution du budget de l'Etat au 30 Juin 2006"

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.

b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.

c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.

d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
"Situation de l'exécution du budget de l'Etat au 30 Juin 2006"

Comment:
The analysis contained in the mid-year-report does not give enough information on income because the analysis is not deepened. It is, therefore, quite hastily done and does not contain enough elements.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain minimal level specified in law or regulation)?

   a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
   b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
   c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
   d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Supplementary budget

Comment:
The supplementary budget is a rectificative law of finances voted by the Parliament; it allows the Executive to do some modifications, notably the transfers between administrative units, while respecting arrangements foreseen in this law. The title of the supplemental budget is « Loi de finances rectificative pour l’exécution du budget de l’Etat gestion 2007 »

Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The legislature must approve and adopt the budget before the executive shifts funds.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

   a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
   b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
   c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
   d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   There is, within the ministry in charge of finances and the budget, an organ named "Commission de Règlement Amiable des Litiges (CRAL)." This commission is seized by the tenderers of publics markets, who feel frustrated in the procurement of goods and services process. Thus, many cases of litigations, generated by the entry for the procurement of goods and services process, are evoked in the reports of the CRAL.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

   a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).
   b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

   a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.
   b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.
   c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.
   d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

   a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.
   b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.
   d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Article 14 of the law n° 006-2003/AN.

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
### Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year? | a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.  
   b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.  
   c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.  
   d. The executive does not release a year-end report.  
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | a       |
| Citation:                                                                 |                                                                          |         |
| Comment:                                                                 |                                                                          |         |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**                                           |                                                                          |         |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**                                          |                                                                          |         |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited? | a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.  
   b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.  
   c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.  
   d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.  
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | a       |
| Citation:                                                                 |                                                                          |         |
| Comment:                                                                 |                                                                          |         |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**                                           |                                                                          |         |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**                                          |                                                                          |         |
103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?

   a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
   b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
   c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
   d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The Executive tries, from year to year, to come closer to international standards concerning presentation of the management of the public finances (IMF, OECD and WB). However, many improvements remain to be done in certain fields, including transparency.

Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The explanation focuses on all departments to compare predictions with the effective expenditures (dépenses prévisionnelles et dépenses effectivement réalisées de chaque ministère)

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer One.
105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The Executive tries, from year to year, to come closer to international standards concerning presentation of the management of the public finances (IMF, OECD and WB). However, many improvements remain to be done in certain fields, including transparency.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The Executive tries, from year to year, to come closer to international standards concerning presentation of the management of the public finances (IMF, OECD and WB). However, many improvements remain to be done in certain fields, including transparency.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: 

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: 

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment: 

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: 

*The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution*
111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

- a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
- b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
- c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.
- d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?

- a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.
- b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.
- c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.
- d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response would be “a.” The audit by the institution “Cour des Comptes” (SAI) concerns all expenditures.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I suggest the answer be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer One.
113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?
   a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report’s content.
   b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?
   a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
   b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   The SAI exists in Burkina Faso and its name is "Cour des comptes." Its role is to controle and audit any public accounts.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have *the discretion in law* to undertake those audits it may wish to?

a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

This improvement of the "Cour des comptes" is due to improving both the number and quality of the staff).

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response would be “a.” According to the law, the “Cour des Comtes” (SAI) can undertake these audits.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I suggest the answer be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer One.
117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment**: A more appropriate response would be “d.” The budget is determined by the executive: the SAI proposes its budget and the ministry of finance approves this budget and presents it to the legislature to adopt.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment**:

**Researcher Response**: I chose to keep my answer “c” because the SAI determines its budget according to its needs, and the legislature adopts it inside the executive’s proposal.

**IBP Comment**: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?

- a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.
- c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.
- d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?

- a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.
- b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.
- c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.
- d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.
- e. Not applicable.

**Citation:**

Article 6 de la loi organique du 16 Mai 2000

**Comment:**

Broadly speaking, this organic law indicates how are the organs and the working of the "Cour des comptes."

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** OK. The report of SAI which contains recommendations is available for the public.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response would be “a.” Same comment as in question121.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The Audit report of the SAI includes some information on steps taken by executive departments to address audits findings.

**Researcher Response:** I chose to keep my answer “d” because the report mentions recommendations of SAI but not actions taken by the executive to address these recommendations.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.
123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.
b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.
d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: