

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

EGYPT

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name:	Dr Lobna M. Abdellatif
Organization:	Partners in Development (PID)
Address:	18, Jole Jamal, 4 th Floor, Elmohandseen
Telephone:	(002) 0101694949
E-mail:	lobnama (lobnama@aucegypt.edu)

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE EGYPT

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	4
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	5
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links.....	6
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal.....	8
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	9
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	10
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	11
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year.....	25
Comprehensiveness.....	35
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring.....	45
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	49
Section Three: The Budget Process	56
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	57
Legislative Approval of the Budget.....	62
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	66
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	77

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, "Not Available."

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
<i>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</i>	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	2007/2008
Executive's Budget Proposal	2007/2008
Supporting Budget Documents	2007/2008
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2006/2007
In-Year Reports	2006/2007
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	Not Available
Audit Report	Not Available

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Produced
Budget Summary	Fiscal statement, May 2007 http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/MOFNews/WhatsNew/wh atnews-a-19-5-07.htm http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/financialstatement1-07.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/financialstatement2-07.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/financialstatement3-07.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/financialstatement4-07.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/financialstatement5-07.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/financialstatement6-07.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/financialstatement7-07.pdf
Executive’s Budget Proposal	State Budget Proposal, April 2007 http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/MOFNews/WhatsNew/wh atnews-a-17-5-07.htm http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/2-2008.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/3-2008.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/4-2008.pdf http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/5-2008.pdf
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Economic authorities budget, April 2007 http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/Bian%20Ehsaaie2008.pdf
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Economic and Social Development Plan (ESDP), April 2007 http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20A.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/KH%20B.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20c.pdf

	http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20d.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20e.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20f.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20g.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20h.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20table.pdf
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	
Citizens Budget	Not Produced
Enacted Budget	State Budget for the fiscal year 2006/2007, July 2006 http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/Main%20Topics/Budget
In-Year Reports	<p>The Financial Monthly http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/publications/Reports%20and%20Indicators/monthly%20reports</p> <p>Egyptian Economic Monitor (Quarterly Report) http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/publications/Reports%20and%20Indicators/Quarterly%20Digesta</p> <p>Egyptian Economic Review http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/publications/Reports+and+Indicators/Monitor+June+2007.htm</p>
Mid-Year Review	Not Produced
Year-End Report	Not Available
Audit Report	Central Audit Organization Report, May Produced but not available to the public
Other Documents	
Relevant Ministries & Departments	Ministry of Finance, Ministry of State of Economic Development, Central Audit Organization, Central Bank of Egypt

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
<i>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes					Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public						
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities [†]	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

[†]Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
<i>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes		
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public				Yes	Yes
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes	Yes			
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
8. Written in more than one language	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA

⁺Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked "not applicable/other," please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <p>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.</p> <p>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.</p> <p>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</p> <p>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" contains government expenditures which are classified by administrative unit (Central Administration, Local Administration, Service Authorities). In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/2-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>2. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" contains government expenditures which are classified by functional classification (Public Services, Defense and National Security, Public order and Security Affairs, Economic Affairs, Environmental Protection, Housing and Community Amenities, Health, Education, Recreation, Culture and Religious Affairs, and Social Protections). In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/4-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" contains government expenditures which are classified by Economic Classification compatible with international standards. In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

4. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?
- Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
 - Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
 - Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
 - No program-level data are presented.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

In the executive budget:

-20% of current expenditure is presented as individual programs (the rest is prepared according to line item budgeting)

-All investment expenditure is presented as individual programs.

However, according to article no. (4) of the budget law no. 53 of the year 1973, the executive's budget ought to take into consideration the classification of expenditure estimates to detailed individual programs both investment and current. Yet this was not enacted realistically up till now but according to the new amendment to the budget law (87) enacted in the year 2005, expenditure estimates for all individual programs are to be presented within the executive's budget in five years from the entrance of this law into force.

c

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "e." Like most emerging market countries at this stage of institutional development, Egypt has not yet developed a comprehensive program-based medium-term budget framework. Consequently, the budget may be fully transparent in reporting available program-based expenditure, which amounts to less than two thirds of spending.

Researcher Response: I retain my view that "c" is the most appropriate answer. And the analysis of executive's budget highlights that less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented in Program-level.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.

<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget Summary "Fiscal Statement" presents multi -year estimates of aggregate expenditure (Page 89). http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/state%20budget/State-Budget2007-2008/Fiscal%20Statement.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Economic and Social Development Plan (ESDP) presents some of individual programs. Available only in Arabic Language: http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20A.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/KH%20B.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20c.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20d.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20e.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20f.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20g.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20h.pdf http://www.mop.gov.eg/kh%20table.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
---	-----------------

<p>7. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" identifies the different sources of tax revenue (Taxes on Income, Profits and Capital Gains, Taxes on Property, Taxes on Goods and Services, Taxes on use of Goods and on Permission to use Goods and perform Activities, and Taxes on International Trade) In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf In English Language: Ihttp://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" identifies the different sources of non-tax revenue (Grants, Equity Dividends, Sales of Goods and Services, Fines, Penalties and Forfeits, and Other revenues). In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf In English Language: Ihttp://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf (Table 3 and Table 4).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Budget Summary "Fiscal Statement" presents multi -year estimates of aggregate level of revenue (Page 89). http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/state%20budget/State-Budget2007-2008/Fiscal%20Statement.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/state%20budget/State-Budget2007-2008/Fiscal%20Statement.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
--	-----------------

11. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?

- a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
- b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
- c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
- d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Information related to the composition of government debt is presented for two years prior to the budget year (BY-2) within the executive budget. For instance, in 2005\2006 budget, figures for 2003\2004 debt composition are presented.

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c" or possibly "e." Figure 9 on page 48 of the Financial Statement provides a 5-year time series of the public debt ending on December 31st 2006. The 2007/08 fiscal year begins on July 1st 2007. Consequently, the government debt appears to align closely with the start of the 2007/08 fiscal year. Figure 7 also presents government borrowing requirements in the current fiscal year.

Researcher's Response: I suggest the answer should be changed to "c." I agree with the Peer Reviewer two Comment

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "d" in light of researcher's and peer reviewer's comments: the question is asking whether the budget proposal presented data on the total government debt outstanding for the upcoming fiscal year, in this case the fiscal year starting on July 1, 2007 and ending on June 30, 2008. No data on debt is presented for the BY in question, therefore the most appropriate answer is "d."

d

<p>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented. b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" identifies the payment of interest on the debt for the budget year. In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf (Table 9).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> No information related to the composition of government debt for the budget year is presented. Only part of these components is present for data two-years back and the whole data (two years prior to the budget year) is available upon request from the ministry of finance or the central bank of Egypt.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Figure 9 on page 48 of the Financial Statement decomposes government debt into gross and net domestic and foreign public debt as a share of GDP.</p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response:</u> I suggest the answer should be changed to “c.” I agree with the Peer Reviewer two Comment.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 11.</p>	d

<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast and factors affecting it is available in the economic and social development plan (ESDP), which is the major supporting budget documentation, still it lacks many details. These forecasts are available in part 5 of the attached version of the (ESDP).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c
<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented. Neither is any sensitivity or quantitative analysis present in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?
- Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
 - Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.
 - Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
 - No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

No information showing the impact of policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, on expenditures, is presented. neither for the budget year nor for any preceding years.

Comment:

Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c” The English language press release entitled “The 2007/08 Budget and Fiscal Sustainability” provides an extensive list of fiscal measures impacting the 2007/08 Budget in Table 1, ranging from tax policy reform to public-private partnerships (PPPs) for infrastructure development. However, the discussion lacks important details about the multi-year estimated fiscal impact, planned sequencing of implementation and potential contingent liabilities from pursuing PPPs.

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed to “c.” I agree with the Peer Reviewer two Comment.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d.”

The document mentioned by the peer reviewer describes the impact of policies on expenditures, but no reference seems to be made to the distinction between new and existing policies.

d

<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Economic and Social Development Plan includes some discussions of the macroeconomic forecast and indicators, but it doesn’t show how policy proposals in the budget as distinct from existing policies affect revenues.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Please refer to comments in previous question.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I suggest the answer should be changed to “c.” I agree with the Peer Reviewer two Comment.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” Please see comment under question 16.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" contains government expenditures which are classified by administrative unit (Central Administration, Local Administration, Service Authorities). In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/2-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>19. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" contains government expenditures which are classified by functional classification (Public Services, Defense and National Security, Public order and Security Affairs, Economic Affairs, Environmental Protection, Housing and Community Amenities, Health, Education, Recreation, Culture and Religious Affairs, and Social Protections). In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/4-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>20. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" contains government expenditures which are classified by Economic Classification compatible with international standards. In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> In the executive budget: -The current expenditures are presented according to line item budgeting with the exception of 20% of the items that are classified by individual programs. -The investment expenditures are classified by individual programs. However, these expenditures are presented also according to line item budgeting classified by administrative, functional, and economic classification.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c” or “e.” Consistent with the comment on question 4, Egypt has not yet developed a comprehensive program-based medium-term budget framework. Consequently, the budget may be fully transparent in reporting available program-based expenditure. Answer “c” could be interpreted to suggest that the government is withholding program-level expenditure details.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I retain my view that “c” is the most appropriate answer. And the analysis of executive's budget highlights that less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented in Program-level.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	<p>c</p>
--	-----------------

<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> All (BY-1) estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect the actual expenditure of this year.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure have been presented for years: (BY-1), (BY-2), (BY-3), and (BY-4).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> More detailed classifications than just the aggregate level of expenditure have been presented for years: (BY-1), (BY-2), (BY-3), and (BY-4).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to the last Constitutional amendments, the time lag between the year-end report and budget proposal decreased from two years to one year, then the answer should be (a), and the actual outcomes of all expenditure are presented for the budget year (BY-2)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> There are significant breaks in the classification system beginning in 2001/02 owing to the adoption of the <i>GFSM 2001</i> standard under a cash accounting basis (please refer to the 2006 IMF Article IV staff report for additional details). While the tables and figures in the 2007/08 state budget do not include figures before 2001/02, the fiscal accounts (including figures for the overall fiscal deficit and public debt) are not comparable before 2001/02.</p>	c
<p>27. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" identifies the different sources of tax revenue (Taxes on Income, Profits and Capital Gains, Taxes on Property, Taxes on Goods and Services, Taxes on use of Goods and on Permission to use Goods and perform Activities, and Taxes on International Trade) In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> State Budget Proposal "Statistical Statement" identifies the different sources of non-tax revenue (Grants, Equity Dividends, Sales of Goods and Services, Fines, Penalties and Forfeits, and Other revenues). In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf In English Language: Ihttp://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf (Table 3 and Table 4).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> All (BY-1) estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect the actual expenditure of this year.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The estimates of the aggregate level of revenues have been presented for years: (BY-1), (BY-2), (BY-3), and (BY-4).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> More detailed classifications than just the aggregate level of revenue have been presented for years: (BY-1), (BY-2), (BY-3), and (BY-4).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to the last Constitutional amendments, the time lag between the year-end report and budget proposal decreased from two years to one year, then the answer should be (a), and the actual outcomes of all revenues are presented for the budget year (BY-2)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/state%20budget/State-Budget2007-2008/Fiscal%20Statement.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

34. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?
- Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
 - Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
 - Before BY-3.
 - No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

According to the last Constitutional amendments, the time lag between the year-end report and budget proposal decreased from two years to one year, then the answer should be (a), and the actual outcomes of debt figures are presented for the budget year (BY-2)

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b."

According to Table 1 in <http://www.mof.gov.eg/arabic/pdf/1-2008.pdf> and since the outcomes of the 2005/2006 are tentative, the more appropriate answer would be "b": Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3) because we talk about the budget of 2007/2008

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: An appropriate response to this question would be "a." As a point of clarification for the citation, the 2005/06 outturn is denoted as an "initial" estimate but the figures have been heavily scrutinized by IMF missions and staffs of the Ministry of Finance and the CBE. A number of issues have slowed finalization of the 2005/06 outturn, including slow reconciliation of changes in debt stocks with financial requirements, decisions regarding the proper accounting treatment of local currency deposits that have been blocked for repayment of foreign currency liabilities, and valuation losses related to those deposits

Researcher Response: I retain my view that "a" is the most appropriate answer. For the budget year 2006/2007 the budget data for fiscal year 2004/2005 present actual outcomes. Then the gap is just two years.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "b" in light of peer reviewers comments (PR1: the outcomes of the 2005/2006 are *tentative*; PR2: the 2005/2006 is denoted as an *initial estimate*), and to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.

b

Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The most important types of extra-budgetary funds include special funds and accounts managed by local government units for development purposes of governorates, besides special funds initiated by public services authorities like universities. Data of attainable funds presented include aggregate revenue and expenditures without some detailed figures. However, there are remarks regarding these funds presented in audit reports of the Central Auditing Organization (CAO).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>Peer Reviewer Two Comment: The citation could also mention that fiscal data related to the main extra-budgetary funds in the general government consolidation lack sufficient detail, such as the social insurance funds and National Investment Bank (NIB). The central government made important changes to eliminate circular financial relationships among general government entities. Accrued interest payments among different levels of government will also be resolved These revised financial arrangements involve complex changes in the sources of funding and liabilities of the general government sector, which could be usefully spelled out in greater detail in the state budget.</p>	<p>C</p>

<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive’s budget in Egypt is classified by administrative unit to: Central government units, public services authorities, and local government units. And since most of public revenues are collected centrally and presented within Central government units’ budget, public services authorities, and local government units mostly incur both current and capital deficits that are usually financed through transfers from central authorities to these units. These intergovernmental transfers take the form of subsidies and are presented in the budget in aggregate forms.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

37. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?
- Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
 - Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.
 - Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
 - No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

There are two major types of transfers to public corporations presented in the budget. The first is current and capital transfers to Public Economic Authorities; including current transfers to authorities like central water and sanitation authorities, and transportation authorities. Such transfers take place to cover part of services' cost to reduce cost incurred by citizens (as a form of aid), and are presented in detailed figures in the budget. Whereas capital transfers are set to cover loan installments of some authorities including railways authorities and transportation authorities that suffer low financing capabilities. The second type of transfers to Public corporations are transfers to public banks set to contribute to these banks' capital in some years. These transfers do not appear in the budget draft to the parliament, as they are later set by general directives that bear the power of law, hence they only show in the actual figures presented in the final budget report.

C

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: In 2005/06, the state budget shifted a previously unrecorded implicit domestic fuel subsidy totaling almost 7% of GDP onto the budget. The cost of the fuel subsidy had previously been covered by the public enterprise for petroleum (EGPC). While this change in accounting represented a large step and positive forward in terms of making transparent a large quasi-fiscal activity, the state budget should also list transfers between the budget sector and EGPC in connection to the domestic fuel price subsidy, income tax payments, dividend payments and royalties. In addition, the state budget could usefully include an annex outlining receipts and transfers to all major public enterprises that are not consolidated in the state budget sector, especially if they conduct quasi-fiscal activities or incur contingent liabilities for the budget sector. Examples of public corporations in this connection include EGPC and the Social Development Fund.

<p>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Examples of Quasi-fiscal activities in Egypt include activities of Public Economic Authorities, which were previously presented within the executive’s budget, and were later separated according to the law no. (11) for the year 1979. Most of these authorities continued to provide services to the public in different economic sectors (including transportations, water and sanitation, agricultural activities, and others) with social prices. These prices are controlled by the government, and in return these authorities receive subsidy from the state budget to partially cover its current deficit and transfers for the repayment of debt installments. Data on these subsidies and transfers are presented in the executive budget for the budget year. In addition, these authorities pay taxes and transfer its surplus to the government.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on financial assets is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No detailed financial statement is prepared on national basis, thus no information on financial assets held by the government is presented. However, the final budget report (in actual figures) includes some un-detailed figures on public financial assets.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> I think C is the more suitable answer according to the information in table 13 in http://www.mof.gov.eg/arabic/pdf/1-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The statistical tables provide information about the acquisition of financial assets, which is a key component in the <i>GFSM 2001</i> framework to reconcile the overall fiscal balance, borrowing requirements and the change in government debt.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No detailed non financial statement is prepared on national basis, thus no information on non-financial assets held by the government is presented. However, the final budget report (in actual figures) includes some un-detailed figures on public non-financial assets.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>Peer Reviewer One Comment: the same answer for question 39 above, a more appropriate response to this question would be "b" or "c" according to the information in table 12 in http://www.mof.gov.eg/arabic/pdf/1-2008.pdf the documents present information on non-financial assets held by the government.</p> <p>Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Table 12 on page 25 of the Statistical Annex provides aggregated details about the program of fixed investment during the fiscal year. However, the Financial Statement does not include a comprehensive inventory of the government’s non-financial assets and any related contingent liabilities related to that inventory</p> <p>IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	-----------------

<p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Economic and Social Development Plan (ESDP), which is one of the supporting budget documentation, provides details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “e.” The practice of earmarking revenue is not a prevalent budgetary practice in Egypt aside from foreign grant-financed project investment.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I suggest the answer should be changed to “e.” I agree with the peer Reviewers.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	d

<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> the percentage is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Some details on the link between the expenditure estimates in the budget and the government’s stated policy goals are presented in the ESDP, for instance, the ESDP includes information on government anti-poverty policies and the increase in funds directed to these areas including aid policies and subsidies.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Economic and Social Development Plan (ESDP) explains how the proposed budget is linked to government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period, but some information is presented.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>c</p>
<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive’s budget in Egypt, is not yet classified by expenditure programs, however, the latest amendment to the budget law according to law no. (87) of the year 2005 states that classification by expenditure programs will be applied within 5 years of the entrance of the law into force.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</p> <p>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p>Peer Reviewer One Comment: The second section of the state budget 2007/2008 (http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/financialstatement3-07.pdf) present information on policies that are intended to benefit the country’s most impoverished people.</p> <p>Peer Reviewer Two Comment: The English language press release entitled “Budget and Fiscal Sustainability” incorporates a discussion about anti-poverty policy priorities. Beginning on page 29, the Financial Statement links subsidy reform, education and health spending to the broader policy goal of targeting public expenditure to mitigate rising income inequality.</p>	c
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	

<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</p> <p>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, information is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> In Arabic Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/1-2008.pdf In English Language: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/statistical-statement-2007-2008.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <p>a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</p> <p>b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Some conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions are presented within the ESDP, including directing funds to specific sectors or projects. Whereas, more detailed information is presented on the total donor assistance received within the budget year in the final report in actual figures. Still this information lacks important details such as:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> Quantitative information concerning the use of these funds. <input type="checkbox"/> Quantitative conditions associated with assistance from IFI. <input type="checkbox"/> Extensive narrative discussion of these conditions. <p>The thing that disables the civil society from monitoring any of the assistance presented. More information is available upon request from the ministry of international cooperation</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>c</p>
--	----------

<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Economic and Social Development Plan (ESDP) contains some information related to the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>c</p>
<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <p>a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/eldalel%20elmopaset.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information. d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The right to access government information has not been codified into law.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process	
Executive's Formulation of the Budget	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The release date is set in permanent law. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Egyptian Constitution in article (115), and Budget Law No 53 for the 1973 in articles (13), (15), (16).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mof.gov.eg/Arabic/PDF/Budgetpreparationl07-08.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	-----------------

69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?
- Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
 - Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
 - Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
 - No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

According to the last Constitutional amendments, the executive holds consultations with a wide range of legislators.

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c," for the budget to get approved; yes there is very limited consultations with few members of the legislature

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "d." The government does not typically consult with the legislature on the formulation of budget priorities. The government provides comprehensive consultation *following* the formal budget submission to the legislature.

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer one "c." I agree with the Peer Reviewer.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries, in line with the comment of the second peer reviewer. The comment provided by the researcher refers to what should happen by law, while the question is asking about what happens in practice.

Only *after* the Ministry of Finance has prepared the budget proposal and sent it to the legislative authority, the plan and budget committee prepares a report about the budget which is sent to the parliament to vote on it. At this stage the committee holds hearings with representatives from ministries, public services authorities, and local units, in order to discuss the budget proposal of each unit. Moreover, specialized committees in the Parliament (such as health, education, or housing) hold hearings with the Executive each concerning its specialization. These committees then submit their reports to the plan and budget committee to take it into account when preparing its reports about its budget proposal. In case they reach an agreement on amending the budget proposal, this is done when voting on the budget proposal.

d

<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The pre -budget is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The pre -budget is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Egyptian Constitution in article (115).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “a.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question could be “b.” In my experience, the budget was not submitted</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I retain my view that “a” is the most appropriate answer.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “b.” Article 115 of the Constitution states that the budget proposal is sent to the legislative authority at least 2 months before the start of the budget-year. Moreover, the question refers to what happens in practice: the budget proposal for the BY 2007/2008 has been submitted in April 2007, which is a bit less than three months before the beginning of the BY. This evidence supports answer “b.”</p>	b

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The committees do not hold public hearings.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <p>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</p> <p>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Plan and Budget Committee.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> It is clear in most but all third world that the legislative committee cannot get all the details about this kind of spending,</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> It seems highly unlikely that the legislative committee is provided full information about all secret activities. Defense and intelligence related expenditure is presented at a highly aggregated level or remains off-budget</p>	b
<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <p>a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</p> <p>b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations.</p> <p>c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</p> <p>d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Egyptian Constitution in article (115).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The in-year reports provide information about the currency denomination of the debt. However, reports lack important information about average borrowing rates, maturity structure and the difference between gross and net debt. The latter difference is important in Egypt given the government sector's sizable deposits in the banking system.</p>	c

<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. d. In-year reports are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The Financial Monthly provides data on the expenditure breakdown approximately a month following the end of the previous month. Note that the outturn refers only to the state budget sector and not the general government sector.</p>	a
<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> According to my own search there is no such mid-year review.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> According to my own search there is no such mid-year review</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> According to my own search there is no such mid-year review</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</u></p>	d

<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> According to my own search there is no such mid-year review</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</u></p>	d
<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The government doesn't need the approval of the legislative authority to shift funds between administrative units. Law number (53) for the year 1973 and its amendments states in article number (24) the possibility of shifting funds between administrative units of the budget within the appropriations of chapter one and in accordance with the regulations set by the general directives attached to the annual budget law (these directives are part of the annual budget law and are approved by the legislature when votes are taken on the budget proposal) without the need for the approval of the legislature.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Government procurement law number (89) for the year 1998 emphasizes in article (2) the commitment to public action, competitiveness, and transparency. According to auditing institutions no violations occurred during the last year. The auditing institutions mainly refer to the Central Audit Organization (CAO), which is an independent auditing institution affiliated to the president. The role of the CAO is identified by law number (144) for the year 1988. It is responsible for auditing the final accounts and balance sheets of the budget units, economic authorities, and public enterprises. The CAO forwards a report to the people’s assembly that includes all its observations. This report is not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Sometimes not always as the researcher mentioned. Yes there is a government procurement law and other regulations emphasizes on these issues but not in real world.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to the 2005 amendment of the budget law no (87), supplemental budgets should be approved before the funds are released. The practice coincides with the law.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to latest available data for the fiscal year 2005/2006, the supplemental budgets are about 10 percent of the original budget</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Law number (87) for year 2005 to adjust law number (53) issued in year 1973 states in article (10) that in cases of urgent circumstances, an item of general contingencies is added to spending not taking into account the different budget classifications. This is done under the condition that these contingencies do not exceed 5% of public expenditures excluding interest payments. Also such contingencies must be approved by the parliament when the budget proposal is being discussed.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. The executive does not release a year-end report. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article (118) of constitution states that the ministry of finance sends the detailed year end report to the parliament and the central audit organization within 6 months after the end of the budget year.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Egyptian Economic Review http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/publications/Reports+and+Indicators/Monitor+June+2007.htm</p> <p><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The "Egyptian Economic Review" is a quarterly review and not a Year-End one.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The answer has been marked "d" consistent with the peer reviewer's observations.</p> <p>Please note that this document was issued after the cut-off date of September 28, 2007, for research in all countries: http://www.mof.gov.eg/English/publications/Reports%20and%20Indicators/Analytical%20Brief</p>	d

<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> All data on actual outcomes are thoroughly examined by the ministry of finance and the Central Audit Organization.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “a.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The answer has been marked “d” consistent with the peer reviewer’s observations.</p>	d
<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “a.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The answer has been marked “d” consistent with the peer reviewer’s observations.</p>	d

<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “b.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The answer has been marked “d” consistent with the peer reviewer’s observations.</p>	d
<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “a.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The answer has been marked “d” consistent with the peer reviewer’s observations.</p>	d

<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The follow up reports of the economic and social development plan include some discussions of the differences between initial macroeconomic estimates and its actual results. But this discussion is of a narrative nature; it doesn't include any quantitative indicators.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The answer has been marked "d" consistent with the peer reviewer's observations.</p>	d
<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The follow up reports of the economic and social development plan and the budget year end report include explanations on the difference between planned and actual appropriations which directly serves the poorest population groups. Such appropriations include subsidies, appropriations for rural development, upgrading informal settlements, and the like. Still this information suffers some limitations, as the number of population intended to benefit from these appropriations is not specified. Accordingly, the impact of the difference between the enacted level of funds and the actual outcome can’t be accurately measured.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “b.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The answer has been marked “d” consistent with the peer reviewer’s observations.</p>	d

<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> One of the most important types of extra budgetary funds in Egypt is the special accounts and funds established by local government units to serve certain needs related to governorates’ development. Such accounts and funds also include special funds established by some public services authorities like universities. Revenues and expenditures of what's known of these funds are presented in the budget as revenue against expenditure with the same value without enough details. For instance, the number of these accounts and funds is not accurately specified and there are no details of any kind about the revenues and expenditures of these accounts. In addition, the ministry of finance has no control over these accounts. Budget year end reports and auditing reports prepared by the central accounting agency show the actual expenditures of these funds.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “c.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The answer has been marked “d” consistent with the peer reviewer’s observations.</p>	<p>d</p>
<p><i>The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution</i></p>	

<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Final audited accounts are not released to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The reports have not been released to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed. b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The decision to remove the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (in our case, the head of the CAO) from office requires only a presidential decree and not the legislature or judiciary</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Central Auditing Organization (CAO) has full legal authority to undertake whatever audits it wishes, and report any financial breaches in the executive's budget. Central Audit Organization (CAO) is an independent auditing institution affiliated to the president. The role of the CAO is identified by law number (144) for the year 1988. It is responsible for auditing the final accounts and balance sheets of the budget units, economic authorities, and public enterprises. The CAO forwards a report to the people's assembly that includes all its observations.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The CAO cannot be considered an auditing institution independent of the executive given its affiliation with the president. The <i>Lima Declaration of Guidelines on Auditing Precepts</i> issued by the United Nations provides international standards on, among other things, institutional arrangements to guarantee independence. Question 114 makes is clear that the executive may remove the head of the CAO, and therefore the CAO is not an independent auditing body.</p>	a

<p>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The people’s assembly determines the budget of the Central Auditing Organization and directs efficient funds for it to fulfill its mandate independently.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. e. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized. b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized. c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized. d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Report is prepared for internal purpose only.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Legislators get general audit reports on secret items without important details</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
--	----------