

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

GERMANY

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name:	Christian Bergs and Dr. Michael Thöne
Organization:	Cologne Center for Public Finance
Address:	Zülpicher Str. 192, 50931 Cologne, Germany
Telephone:	0041-221-426979
E-mail:	bergs@fifko-koeln, thoene@fifko-koeln.de

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE GERMANY

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	4
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	5
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links.....	6
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal.....	9
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	10
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	11
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	12
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year.....	26
Comprehensiveness.....	35
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring.....	44
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	48
Section Three: The Budget Process	55
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	56
Legislative Approval of the Budget.....	61
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	66
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	78

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, "Not Available."

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
<i>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</i>	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	NA
Budget Summary	2007
Executive's Budget Proposal	2007
Supporting Budget Documents	2007
Citizens Budget	NA
Enacted Budget	2007
In-Year Reports	2007
Mid-Year Report	2007
Year-End Report	2006
Audit Report	2005

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not produced
Budget Summary	<p>The Budget Summary is part of the Monthly Report of the Federal Ministry of Finance (see In-Year Reports), e.g. for the Budget 2007 the Summary was published in August 2006: "Monatsbericht des BMF," August 21, 2006, http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2006/08/060818agmb010,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf see pp.63-76</p>
Executive’s Budget Proposal	<p>"Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007)" Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007," August 11, 2006, Deutscher Bundestag Drucksache 16/2300 http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p>
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	<p>"Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," November 7, 2006, http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p>
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	<p>"Finanzbericht 2007 - Stand und voraussichtliche Entwicklung der Finanzwirtschaft im gesamtwirtschaftlichen Zusammenhang," August 4, 2006, Publicly available, but not on the internet</p>
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	NA
Citizens Budget	NA

Enacted Budget	<p>"Gesetz über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007)," December 28, 2006, www.bgbportal.de/BGBL/bgb11f/bgb1106s3346.pdf</p>
In-Year Reports	<p>"Monatsbericht des BMF Mai 2007," May 23, 2007, http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p>
Mid-Year Review	<p>There is no mid-year review in the original sense. Nonetheless the Ministry of Finance publishes monthly reports (see In-Year Reports), which - in the middle of the year - assume some functional elements of a mid-year review; see e.g. the report in August 2006 for the budget year 2006: "Monatsbericht des BMF," August 21, 2006, http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2006/08/060818agmb010,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf see pp.33-62</p>

Year-End Report	"Haushalts- und Vermögensrechnung des Bundes für das Haushaltsjahr 2006 (Jahresrechnung 2006)," April 2, 2007, http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_06/nn_28274/DE/Service/Downloads/Abt__II/Jahresrechnung_202006,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf
Audit Report	"Bundesrechnungshof - Bemerkungen 2006 zur Haushalts- und Wirtschaftsführung des Bundes," November 2006, http://www.bundesrechnungshof.de/veroeffentlichungen/bemerkungen-jahresberichte/resolveUid/0918d41b8d4b8d4ba2eaf0e428c8f8b7
Other Documents	"Bundesbank Monatsbericht Mai 2007," May 21, 2007, http://www.bundesbank.de/volkswirtschaft/vo_monatsbericht_2007.php
Relevant Ministries & Departments	<p>Federal Ministry of Finance "Finanzministerium" (www.bundesfinanzministerium.de)</p> <p>Parliaments Budget Committee "Haushaltsausschuss des Bundestags" (http://www.bundestag.de/ausschuesse/a08/index.html)</p> <p>Parliaments Audit Committee "Rechnungsprüfungsausschuss" (http://www.bundestag.de/ausschuesse/a08/a08_rpa/index.html)</p> <p>Supreme Federal Authority "Bundesrechnungshof" (www.bundesrechnungshof.de)</p> <p>National Bank "Bundesbank" (www.bundesbank.de)</p>

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
<i>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes					Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public						
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	No	No	Yes	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	Yes	No	Yes	No	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
<i>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes					
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public					
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	Yes	Yes	No	No
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
8. Written in more than one language	No	Yes	Yes	No	No
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	No	No	No	Yes

⁺Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked "not applicable/other," please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Very detailed information accounting for administrative units can be obtained in the executive's budget proposal for the year 2007, entitled "Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007), Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007," the ministerial budgets (Einzelpläne) can be found on pp. 105 and following. The budget can be seen on the internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All expenditures for a ministry or its subordinate units and minor agencies are presented in detail, which follows a uniform coding structure that accounts for administrative as well as economic and functional criteria.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executives’ budget proposal for the year 2007, entitled "Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007), Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007,“ contains an overview with regard to functional classification, compare pp. 47-52. The budget can be seen on the internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Comment Question 1. The budget classification meets international standards, which was approved by the IMF, see IMF Country Report No. 03/286, Report on the Observance of Standards and Codes - Fiscal Transparency Module.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>3. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive's budget proposal for the year 2007, entitled "Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007), Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007," contains an overview with regard to economic classification, compare pp. 41-44. The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Comment Question 2.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
---	---

<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is very detailed information about the disposition of funds within the ministerial budgets. Expenditures are broken down into lots of separate expenses, which are explained in an elaborate way (pp. 105 and following). The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Budget is not originally classified by (policy) programs. For this reason specific programs cannot be derived from the budget tables easily. Nevertheless, the level of detail is very high and there are lots of breakdowns below the administrative unit. Unfortunately, detailed breakdowns follow only administrative characteristics, not economic functions. For a few years, the federal budget was also published in spreadsheet-format so everyone could analyze the budget on all these aspects themselves. This practice was suspended a few years ago.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan (Finanzplan), entitled "Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," p. 9, contains estimates of the aggregate level of expenditures for a period of three years beyond the budget year 2007. The plan can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Outside the budget process, in December the central government publishes an annual “Stability and Growth Program” in compliance with EU rules. This program gives multi-year estimates of general and central government aggregates. However, the accounting base differs from the central government budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>6. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan (Finanzplan), entitled "Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," contains expenditure estimates with respect to functional and economic classifications (pp. 13-14; pp. 47-50). Some individual topics are deepened, e.g. the pension scheme (p. 12) or the partial privatization of the national railway enterprise (p. 28). The plan can be seen on the internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The finance plan deals with the key programs that constitute the vast majority of spending.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>7. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan (Finanzplan), entitled "Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," contains the different sources of tax revenue for the budget year as well as estimates for a period three years ahead. (Table 8, p. 60) The plan can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>8. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan (Finanzplan), entitled "Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," contains the different sources of non-tax revenue for the budget year 2007 (Table 9, p. 66). The plan can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>9. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan (Finanzplan), entitled "Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," contains the different sources of tax revenue for the budget year as well as estimates for a period three years ahead (p. 60). The plan can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>10. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan (Finanzplan), entitled "Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," contains multi-year estimations for all individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax and VAT, see Table 8, p. 60). The plan can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf Estimates considering non-tax revenue can be found in the "Finanzbericht 2007," Table 6, p. 251, unfortunately this document is not available on the Internet.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>11. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).</p> <p>b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.</p> <p>c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.</p> <p>d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The net borrowing requirement ("Nettokreditaufnahme") is captured explicitly (Table 1, p. 9) in the medium term finance plan (Finanzplan). Moreover the total government debt at the beginning of the budget year is presented (Figure 1, p. 6). The plan can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>12. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.</p> <p>b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive's budget proposal for the year 2007, entitled "Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007), Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007," contains a chapter named "Bundesschuld" ("Einzelplan 32," pp. 2860 and following) which presents interest payments in a detailed way. The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The composition of the government debt can be derived from the "Finanzbericht" (Budget Document Two in Support of the Executives Budget Proposal). It contains information about the composition of the debt in terms of maturity profile (pp. 352-354) and currency denomination of the debt (p. 345). Moreover there is detailed information about the amount and type of specific securities issued. There is no information about the shares of domestic and external debt in the Budget Documents. Nevertheless this information is publicly available and can be obtained by the National Bank, the "Bundesbank."</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan ("Finanzplan"), entitled "Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," discusses the key economic assumptions in detail on which the budget projections are based (Chapter 7, pp. 86-90). The plan can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It has often been claimed that official macroeconomic forecasts display an “optimism bias.” Empirically, this question is discussed controversially. But the macroeconomic prognoses are government forecasts, not independent forecasts. So, optimism or pessimism, there is a constant danger of a “political bias.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Neither the budget nor any supporting budget documentation includes a detailed risk analysis in terms of sensitivity analysis. Only outside the budget process, in December the central government publishes an annual “Stability and Growth Program” in compliance with EU rules. This program gives multi-year estimates of fiscal aggregates according to different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>16. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht 2007" contains information about key policy proposals and the resulting expenditures (pp.93-98). The fiscal consequences of various policy proposals are highlighted and important elements of expenditure are tabulated (pp. 98-100). See for quantitative estimates considering expenditures Table 13.1, pp. 300-301, Table 13.3, pp. 304-306.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Supplementary budgets do not receive this degree of analytical attention.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>17. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht 2007" presents information about policy proposals in terms of changes in tax laws. See for a narrative discussion p. 150, and for quantitative estimates considering revenue see Table 13.4, pp. 307-309.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Very detailed information accounting for administrative units for the BY-1 (targeted value) can be obtained in the executive's budget proposal for the year 2007, entitled "Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007), Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007," the ministerial budgets (Einzelpläne) can be found on pp. 105 and following. The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>19. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive's budget proposal for the year 2007, entitled "Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007), Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007," contains an overview with regard to functional classification for the BY-1 (targeted values), compare pp. 47-52. The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>20. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive's budget proposal for the year 2007, entitled "Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007), Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007," contains an overview with regard to economic classification for the BY-1 (targeted values), compare pp. 41-44. The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>21. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is very detailed information about the disposition of funds within the ministerial budgets for the budget year as well as for the BY-1 (see response to question 4). Expenditures are broken down into lots of separate expenses, which are explained in an elaborate way (pp. 105 and following). The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment on question 4.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>22. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An analysis of the actual executive's budget data (2007) and the one of the previous year, made clear that the values did not change. It is almost impossible that this exact match of the data did happen by pure chance. It is therefore legitimate to derive that the data has not been updated. The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>23. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan (Finanzplan), entitled "Finanzplan des Bundes 2006-2010," contains the actual outcome of aggregate level of expenditure for the BY-2 (Table 1, p. 9). The plan can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>24. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Prior-year expenditure for 2005 data is presented for all expenditure classifications (functional, economic and administrative) and for the individual programs in the executive's budget proposal (pp. 105 and following). The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>25. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). Before BY-3. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Every single expenditure in detail contains information about the actual outcome of the same expenditure in BY-2. Compare the executive's budget proposal for the year 2007, entitled "Entwurf eines Gesetzes über die Feststellung des Bundeshaushaltsplans für das Haushaltsjahr 2007 (Haushaltsgesetz 2007), Regierungsentwurf zum Bundeshaushalt 2007," pp. 105 and following. The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> If the data of a budget item is not comparable to prior years, the budget contains a comment, in which the reasons for this incompatibility are explained. However, the numbers are not adjusted.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht" contains detailed information about the composition of tax revenue (Table 10, p. 276, targeted values).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht" also contains detailed information about the composition of non-tax revenue (Table 6, p. 251, targeted values).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The BY-1 estimates are identical to those in the budget year; obviously they are not updated.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht 2007" contains data concerning the aggregate level of revenue as well as its composition going back as far as 1952 (Table 6, pp. 245-251).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>31. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 30.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>32. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht 2007" contains actual outcome data for 2005 (Table 6, p. 251).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

33. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

- a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
- b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
- c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
- d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

The medium-term finance plan ("Finanzplan 2007") presents information on the planned level of the government debt for BY-1 (p. 6). The "Finanzbericht" contains extensive information about the debt for BY-2, but not for BY-1 (pp. 350 et following). Both documents are produced mid-year in BY-1 when actual debt data for the current year cannot exist yet.

Researcher's response to this question was "c."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." The Finanzplan does include details about some parts of the composition of the debt, such as "Sondervermögen," although the information is not systematic.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Note that this covers only budgeted debt, not the total of all government liabilities.

Researcher Response: PR 1 relates to BY-2 data. Our comment already stated that these data are more detailed. Yet question 33 relates explicitly to *BY-1*. Here, the only correct answer is "c." See addition to the comment.

(Well, for the German budget process, asking for *detailed* data on the composition of *planned* government debt is not intuitive. Does any other country deliver such data in pre-budget documents?)

RP 2: See remark for Q11.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "c" consistent with the researcher's comment.

C

<p>34. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). Before BY-3. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht 2007" contains actual outcome data for 2005 (see "Finanzbericht 2007," Overview 3, pp. 350-354).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Social security insurance is set up as voluminous extra-budgetary funds. They are partially financed by tax grants. If this is the case, these grants are fully kept record of within the budget documents (e.g. the tax grant in the budget 2007 for the pension system amounts to more than 70 bn €, see "Fiannzbericht 2007," p. 96).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>36. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht 2007" contains a chapter (chapter 5, pp. 155-192), which deals with the financial linkages between the Federal Government ("Bund"), the federal states ("Länder") and the municipalities ("Gemeinden").</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>37. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The budget contains some information about transfers to public corporations. Moreover detailed information is provided in a report which is a stand-alone document and is not related to the Budget Process. The latest report, entitled "Bundesbeteiligungsbericht 2006" can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/lang_de/nn_3384/nsc_true/DE/Service/Downloads/Abt__VIII/Beteiligungsbericht_202006,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Some information is presented on quasi-fiscal activities, e.g. the support for financial institutions which are publicly owned are listed (p. 103 of the executive's budget proposal). Nonetheless there is no systematic presentation of quasi-fiscal activities.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on financial assets is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht" contains information about the financial assets held by the government (table 8.1, p. 344). A listing is presented, but neither there is a discussion of its purposes nor of their market value.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The government publishes an annual report containing all direct and indirect government equity holdings and extrabudgetary funds. Nonetheless the report does not belong to the budget documents. The latest report, entitled "Bundesbeteiligungsbericht 2006" can be seen on the internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/lang_de/nn_3384/nsc_true/DE/Service/Downloads/Abt__VIII/Beteiligungsbericht_202006,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> See citation Question 39.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment on Question 39.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C

<p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Expenditure arrears do not represent a significant problem in Germany.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>e</p>
---	----------

<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Finanzbericht" contains information on contingent liabilities from formal loan and export guarantees, including both a narrative discussion as well as quantitative figures (Overview 4, pp. 355 and following). Furthermore, the assessment in previous years is presented in the budget proposal. The plan can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Contingent liabilities through government-owned financial and other institutions are not included.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Contingent liabilities through government-owned financial and other institutions are not included – see the recent case of IKB bank which will require refinancing through the government-owned “Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau” of several billion Euros.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

43. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

- a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

The medium term finance plan ("Finanzplan") contains detailed information about the future expenditures with regard to civil service pensions up to the year 2050 (Table 13, pp. 78-79). The plan can be found on the Internet at:
http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf

Comment:

The Ministry of Finance produces report on the sustainability of public finances. The first report was published in 2005, the second in 2008. These reports give extensive information on future liabilities, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. But these reports are *not* budget documents, because they are not obligatory and not released annually.

Researcher's response to this question was "a."

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." The official information contains only information relating to the central government civil service. It does not contain information relating to the general pension system.

Researcher Response: As far as budget documents are concerned, we agree with the Peer Reviewer. The answer should be changed to "c." See additional comment: government information of quality "a" is available, but is "off-budget."

C

<p>44. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Germany does not receive any donor assistance. On the contrary, it is a donor country to a large extent and contributes to quite a number of inter- and supranational organizations. The total sum of contributions is reported in the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	e
<p>45. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Tax expenditures are not discussed systematically within the budget documents. Nevertheless, the budget contains some information about 20 voluminous tax expenditures (see pp. 101-102), which are responsible for major parts of deficiencies in tax revenues. The budget can be found on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Moreover, the Ministry of Finance publishes a bi-annual report on subsidies, including tax exemptions. This report does not belong to the budget documents, but it is publicly available and subject to lively debates. The latest report can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_01/nn_3378/DE/Aktuelles/Pressemitteilungen/2007/08/20071508__PM092a,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>46. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All earmarked revenues are identified individually. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Earmarked revenues and the expenditures to which they are assigned have to be identified within the budget (Article 17, Section 3, BHO). The wording of the law can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/bho/BJNR012840969.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are mainly three organizations that receive payments according to the budget: the intelligence service ("Bundesnachrichtendienst BND," 481.85 Mio. €in 2007), the Federal Office for the Protection of the Constitution ("Bundesamt für Verfassungschutz," 149 Mio €in 2007) and the Military Counter-Intelligence Service ("Militärischer Abschirmdienst MAD," 72 Mio. €in 2006).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government's stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The medium term finance plan (Finanzplan) makes clear the main policy goals of the government and how they are implemented by several measures (pp.7 and following). The narrative discussion follows (pp. 10-44) functional categorization. The plan can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is a lack of systematically edited quantitative analysis in this context.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>49. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The actual budget and its measures are embedded into a medium-term finance plan. A multi-year period is also discussed (compare comment on question 48) with respect to major policy goals, but not in detail. The plan can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_28274/DE/Service/Broschueren__Bestellservice/Bundeshaushalt/30111,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</u></p>	b
<p>50. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Non-financial data are presented for all programs. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. No non-financial data are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no non-financial data presented, apart from, for example, the development of unemployment figures over time in a very general context.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Question 50.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Question 50.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Question 50.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Question 50.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</p> <p>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Government publishes a report on poverty and richness in Germany in a three-year cycle. Nevertheless, this report does not belong to the budget documents. The latest report can be seen at: http://www.bmas.de/coremedia/generator/900/property=pdf/lebenslagen__in__deutschland__de__847.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	

<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Ministry of Finance regularly publishes reports on various taxes and other revenue sources. These reports include both narrative as well as quantitative elements (see the internet for a recent list of publications at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_06/nn_302/sid_4ADCBB2D6EF2A304DDB68DF8DE673B90/nsc_true/DE/Steuern/Veroeffentlichungen_zu_Steuerarten/node.html__nnn=true). Moreover, detailed information about taxes can be found in the taxation laws.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Tax burden issues are not subject to periodical analysis. Nonetheless, data on the burden of income taxation has been analyzed repeatedly by the Ministry of Finance and other units of the government.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Germany does not receive net payments from IFI.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	e
<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Question 58.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	e

<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. No, it does not provide a summary. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Minister of Finance delivers an address to the parliament, in which he comments on the crucial topics of the budget. Moreover, the Ministry of Finance publishes a summary of the budget, which is available on the Internet. See for the latest summary: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_06/nn_36606/DE/Finanz__und__Wirtschaftspolitik/Bundeshaushalt/Bundeshaushalt__2007/002.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s response to this question was “a.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Note that supplementary budgets have become the norm since 1990, which can contain important deviations from the initial budget presented to parliament and the public.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> We agree with the peer reviewer. Answer should be changed to “b.” (We need not be content with what we get. Especially when we compare it to UK or NZ.)</p>	b
<p>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Ministry of Finance published a detailed handbook, entitled "Das System der Öffentlichen Haushalte," which explains budget terms and the procedural method of budget planning. The paper is publicly available on the internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_06/nn_4314/DE/Finanz__und__Wirtschaftspolitik/Bundshaushalt/Haushaltsrecht__und__Haushaltssystematik/node.html__nn=true</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

63. Do citizens have the right *in law* to access government information, including budget information?

- a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
- d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

In 2006, Germany enacted a Freedom of Information Act on the federal level (“Informationsfreiheitsgesetz”). In principle, this Act grants every citizen free access to all kinds of government information unless deemed classified or conflicting with privacy. So far, the application of the Act has given rise to criticism due to restrictive interpretation, slow implementation and high fees.

Comment:

Researcher’s response to this question was “a.”

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The degree to which transparency can be derived from the Constitutional Law is up to the government’s discretion.

Researcher Response: We change to “c.” Peer Reviewer Two is right insofar as the access to information cannot be classified as “a.” That was our mistake. But Peer Reviewer Two does not refer to the (relatively) new Freedom of Information Act of 2006. Thus, “d” would also be the wrong answer.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.

C

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The budget itself contains highly disaggregated information about all programs (the budget spans some 3000 pages). Moreover every ministry reports about special programs in its field of responsibility.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Although the budget contains only very limited non-financial information, some ministries and agencies provide data related to non-financial issues. But they do not sum up to more than a third of expenditures.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process	
Executive's Formulation of the Budget	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The release date is set in permanent law. b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The release date is not codified by law exactly. It says that the budget is to be set up before the fiscal year begins, usually in September of the preceding year (BHO, "Bundehaushaltsordnung," § 30). The wording of the law can be seen on the internet at: http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/bho/BJNR012840969.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Moreover a detailed timetable considering the schedule of the individual steps of household preparation is published by the Ministry of Finance more than six months before the budget is enacted in the in-year reports. Compare, for example, the in-year report of May 2007, entitled "Monatsbericht des BMF, Mai 2007," Table on p. 35. The report can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <p>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Comment on Question 66.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <p>a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Usually there is no reason to deviate from the timetable. An exception can be raised e.g. by early elections, which actually happened in 2005.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive's budget proposal is discussed in parliament twice ("1. und 2. Lesung im Bundestag"). Moreover it is discussed within the budget committee.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "d." Note that the members of the executive are typically members of the legislature (this is true certainly for the top executive). Key budget parameters are discussed with the leaders of the coalition parties who are often also members of the legislature. Also, the budget requires a vote in the Upper House, and in preparation of that it is discussed with representatives of the Upper House.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?
- a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
 - b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
 - c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
 - d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
 - e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

The executive holds consultations with a wide range of constituencies throughout the year and — among others — issues-budget priorities are usually discussed intensively. But there is no obligation for the government to do so, let alone a legal requirement.

Researcher’s response to this question was “a.”

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” There are consultations with various constituencies throughout the year, but not as part of the budget process.

Researcher Response: Well, actually both are right. The executive does consult with a wide range of constituencies on all kinds of political questions and priorities. Political priorities are reflected in budget priorities – that is a natural thing. This mechanism speaks for “a.” But, Peer Reviewer Two is also right; the extensive consultations are not a part of the budget process. That speaks for “d.” Basically, the question must be returned to the OBI: If “part of its process of determining budget priorities” means the process of politics please choose “a.” If “part of its process of determining budget priorities” means the budgeting please choose “d.”

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “a” due to the observation that the consultation includes detailed discussions of budget priorities.

a

<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s response to this question was “d.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” This is interpreting the government’s budget proposal as a pre-budget statement (see above).</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> Peer Reviewer Two interprets the Executive’s Budget Proposal as a pre-budget statement. Yet, a pre-budget statement is a different thing. Consequently, we stick to “d.”</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	d
<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>Legislative Approval of the Budget</p>	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Usually the executive's budget proposal is assigned to the parliament in August of BY-1.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget committee holds public hearings in which testimony of various stakeholders is heard. Economists, different organizations like trade unions, federation of employers, civil service employees, associations or trade associations compose comments and are heard publicly. The budget committee determines the focus of these talks and is free to do so. Reports on these hearings are released to the public and are published on the Internet. The latest report can be seen at: http://www.bundestag.de/ausschuesse/a08/anhoerungen/Haushaltsbegleitgesetz_2006/index.html</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> This question should differentiate between the fiscal and the macroeconomic framework: there is no discussion of the latter.</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment on question 75.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment on question 75.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <p>a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.</p> <p>b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.</p> <p>d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment on question 75.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <p>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</p> <p>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Selected members of the budget committee (Vertrauensgremium) are provided full information on the spending of secret items (§ 10a (2), BHO). The wording of the law can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/bho/BJNR012840969.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Moreover, the German Federal Court of Auditors ("Bundesrechnungshof") examines these expenditures.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations. c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited. d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> As mentioned above, the budget is a law in itself and every law has to pass the legislature ("Bundestag"). Amendments are mediated by the budget committee, whose members are also members of the parliament.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is very detailed information about the disposition of funds within the ministerial budgets. These budgets are parts of the aggregate budget, which has to be approved by the legislature. Expenditures are generally broken down into lots of separate expenses, which are explained in an elaborate way (pp. 105 and following). The budget can be seen on the Internet at: http://dip.bundestag.de/btd/16/023/1602300.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Comment Question 4 with regard to the definition of the term "program."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The monthly in-year reports of the Ministry of Finance ("Montasberichte") contain data on actual expenditure regularly. Compare for example the in-year report of May 2007, entitled "Monatsbericht des BMF, Mai 2007," pp. 11-14. The report can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. No in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There are no exceptions to the rule that all expenditures are covered. Compare for example the in-year report of May 2007, entitled "Monatsbericht des BMF, Mai 2007," Table on p.12. The report can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There are some details broken down from the department level. Compare for example the in-year report of May 2007, entitled "Monatsbericht des BMF, Mai 2007," p.12. The report can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht_des_BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There are comparisons with actual year-to-date expenditures with the original estimates in the in-year reports. Compare for example the in-year report of May 2007, entitled "Monatsbericht des BMF, Mai 2007," pp. 12-14. The report can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> Compare for example the in-year report of May 2007, entitled "Monatsbericht des BMF, Mai 2007," pp. 15-18. The report can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Compare for example the in-year report of May 2007, entitled "Monatsbericht des BMF, Mai 2007," Table on p. 15. The report can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year reports of the Ministry of Finance contain information about actual year-to-date revenue collection. The reports are available on the Internet. See e.g. the "Monatsbericht des BMF Mai 2007" (Table on p. 15) at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year reports of the Ministry of Finance contain information about actual borrowing. The reports are available on the Internet. See e.g. the "Monatsbericht des BMF Mai 2007" (p. 11 and p. 19 and following) at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is some information about the composition of government debt concerning the type of bonds issued. See e.g. the "Monatsbericht des BMF Mai 2007" (p. 19 and following) at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_07/nn_17844/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/05/070522agmb009,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. In-year reports are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year reports are usually published about three weeks after the end of the preceding month.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The monthly in-year report, which is published in August, contains a mid-year review. The review of the current budget does not deliver a systematically updated discussion of challenges and risks for the first half of the year. Nevertheless some risks are picked out as a central theme, e.g. the labour market or social security (pp. 33 and following). Moreover there is no complete review of the economic assumptions underlying the budget and the report lacks an updated forecast of the budget outcome for the current budget year. The review is publicly available and can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_01/nn_3378/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht_des_BMF/2007/08/070821agmb004,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment on Question 92.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See Comment on Question 92. Expenditures are discussed on pp. 42 and following. The review is publicly available and can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_01/nn_3378/DE/Aktuelles/Monatsbericht__des__BMF/2007/08/070821agmb004,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See comment on Question 92.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Possibilities of shifting funds are generally allowed by law (Article 20, Section 2 Bundeshaushaltsordnung) and therefore approved from the legislature when enacting the budget. The wording of the law can be seen at: http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/bho/BJNR012840969.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
--	---

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Although the procurement follows an open and competitive process, there were some instances of irregularities in the near past (e.g. there were irregularities associated with the development of the road charge system for lorries, entitled "toll collect").</p> <p><u>Researcher’s response to this question was “a.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” “Transparency International” regards corruption as an increasing problem in Germany’s public service.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> Agree with Peer Reviewer Two. We change the answer to “b.”</p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Supplementary budgets are approved, before the funds are expended. Supplementary budgets follow exactly the same rules in law like duly enacted budgets do.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There have been various supplementary budgets in the last decade, but their dimensions differ substantially from one another. In 1997 the supplemental budget was 3.8 percent larger than originally planned. In 2002 it was 2, in 2003 4.8 and in 2004 0.7 percent larger than intended. The mean of the deviations for these four years is some 2.8 percent.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. d. The executive does not release a year-end report. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Usually the year-end report is published in spring of BY+1.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The data in the year-end report is not audited. Data on actual outcome is audited by the SAI ("Bundesrechnungshof"), who publishes its own report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Differences are explained in detail in the year-end report, published by the Ministry of Finance, entitled "Haushalts- und Vermögensrechnung des Bundes," see Chapter 3, pp. 15-35. The report can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_06/nn_28274/DE/Service/Downloads/Abt__II/Jahresrechnung_202006,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The narrative discussion focuses on department totals, whereas quantitative estimates are provided on program level. The year-end report, entitled "Haushalts- und Vermögensrechnung des Bundes" can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_06/nn_28274/DE/Service/Downloads/Abt__II/Jahresrechnung_202006,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Differences are explained in detail in the year-end report for expenditures as well as for revenues, published by the Ministry of Finance, entitled "Haushalts- und Vermögensrechnung des Bundes 2006," see Chapter 3, pp. 15-35. The report can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/cln_06/nn_28274/DE/Service/Downloads/Abt__II/Jahresrechnung_202006,templateId=raw,property=publicationFile.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Compare comment on question 35. Social security insurances are set up as voluminous extra-budgetary funds. They are partially financed by tax grants. If this is the case, these grants are fully kept record of within the budget documents. This also holds for the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>c</p>
<p><i>The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution</i></p>	

<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Usually the SAI publishes its report at the end of the BY+1. The latest report (published in November 2007) can be found on the internet at: http://www.bundesrechnungshof.de/veroeffentlichungen/bemerkungen-jahresberichte/resolveUid/0918d41b8d4b8d4ba2eaf0e428c8f8b7.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The SAI audits all expenditures. Nevertheless the institution makes use of its right to accomplish random inspections and to highlight some of them. Compare Chapter 3.1-3.2, pp. 7-8 of the latest report. It can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesrechnungshof.de/veroeffentlichungen/bemerkungen-jahresberichte/resolveUid/0918d41b8d4b8d4ba2eaf0e428c8f8b7</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The latest report can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.bundesrechnungshof.de/veroeffentlichungen/bemerkungen-jahresberichte/resolveUid/0918d41b8d4b8d4ba2eaf0e428c8f8b7. Chapter I contains an executive summary and can be found on pp. 11-17.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The SAI, entitled "Bundesrechnungshof," is a supreme federal authority. As an independent body of government auditing it is subject only to the law. The status of the SAI, its Members and its key functions are guaranteed by the Constitution (Article 114 Section 2 of the Basic Law).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Members of the board of the SAI ("Bundesrechnungshof") are independent in a way that judges are. This independence is codified by law ("Bundesrechnungshofgesetz, Article 3, Section 4"). It can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/brhg_1985/BJNR014450985.html</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The SAI has the right to audit potentially all extra budgetary funds. As mentioned earlier, the institution makes use of its right to accomplish random inspections. Therefore not all activities of extra-budgetary funding are audited every single year. For instance, in 2007 the SAI published a special report about the funding of social insurance for people working in the agricultural sector. The report can be seen on the internet at: http://www.bundesrechnungshof.de/veroeffentlichungen/sonderberichte/resolveUId/29c3d10013b67e05266b62b3854ecd5c</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c
<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Bundesrechnungshof is free to determine the timing and nature of audit work. When selecting audit topics the Bundesrechnungshof relies on any information available during audit work but also on petitions from citizens or on issues reported by the public media.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The law considering the SAI, entitled "Bundesrechnungshof," can be seen on the internet at: http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/brhg_1985/BJNR014450985.html</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The "Bundehaushaltsordnung" determines the approach of budgeting the Bundesrechnungshof and contains extensive rights of the SAI when it comes to budgeting its own organization (Article 29, Section 3 Bundehaushaltsordnung). The wording of the law can be seen on the Internet at: http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/bho/BJNR012840969.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> If the proposal of the SAI is different from the government's proposal with respect to the SAI's budget, then the SAI's proposal is valid and assigned to the executive's budget proposal.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to Mr. Michael Kremer, the responsible employee at the Bundesrechnungshof, the Bundesrechnungshof employs designated staff and the staffing levels fulfill the requirements that come along with fulfilling the mandate. (Interview by telephone on September, 24th.) There is a special department (IV.2) that is occupied with the security sector.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. e. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u> According to Mr. Kremer, the responsible employee at the Bundesrechnungshof, the Bundesrechnungshof had more than 800 petitions from citizens. (Interview by telephone on September, 18th.)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized. b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized. c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized. d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The auditing committee ("Rechnungsprüfungsausschuss") of the legislature ("Bundestag"), whose members are also associated with the budget committee, scrutinizes the audit reports.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is no monitoring in a sense that the government reports on steps it has taken to address audit recommendations.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The SAI publishes reports that track actions in response to the agency's recommendations in prior years. For example the report, entitled "Ergebnisbericht 2006" deals with the measures taken by the government in 2003 and 2004. It can be found on the Internet at: http://www.bundesrechnungshof.de/veroeffentlichungen/ergebnisberichte</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The law says (§10a, BHO), that the SAI can audit secret programs and that the corresponding audit reports have to be accorded to the relevant committee. The wording of the law can be found on the internet at: http://www.gesetze-im-internet.de/bho/BJNR012840969.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------