International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

JORDAN

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC  20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org
This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Ibrahim H.M. Saif
Organization: Center For Strategic Studies (University of Jordan)
Address: Amman - Jordan
Telephone: (962) 6 5355666
E-mail: (962) 6 5355515
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year
Comprehensiveness
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

Section Three: The Budget Process

Executive’s Formulation of the Budget
Legislative Approval of the Budget
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

*Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
<th>Budget Year Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>2006/07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
<td>Not available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>2006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Full Title, Date, and Internet Link</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Publicly Available, But Not on the Internet November 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Produced available to the public Response of Gov. to parliament comments <a href="http://www.mof.gov.jo/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=co7Hd1opeFc%3d&amp;tabid=165&amp;mid=544">http://www.mof.gov.jo/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=co7Hd1opeFc%3d&amp;tabid=165&amp;mid=544</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Review</td>
<td>Produced but not available to the public (Ministry of Finance- produced for internal use)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>Produced and Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Main document</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. The release date is known at least one month in advance

2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media

3. Released to public same day as official release to media

4. Available on the Internet free of charge

5. Free print copies available, limited distribution

6. Free print copies available, mass distribution

7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities

8. Written in more than one language

9. News conference is held to discuss release

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Enacted budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities†</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

† Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked “not applicable/other,” please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.
## The Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The final 2006 Budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some expenditures (security related) are not classified.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| 2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification? |
| a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. |
| b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. |
| c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. |
| d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
The government began to implement the government Finance Statistics Manual (GFSM) 2001 by presenting expenditures by economic classifications according to the new system. Interview with Dr. Ismail Zaghlol, Director of the General Budget Department.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

   a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
   b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No program-level data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   See the note

   Comment:
Program level data is not presented for Ministry of Defense (refer to page 69-71 of the 2006 Budget). The Ministry of Interior's budget lacks important details regarding the intelligence budget.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Publicly available budget documents do not provide any information on multi-year estimates. only information regarding previous years are presented in 2006 budget law.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** Some general estimates (no details) for key variables are presented as a percentage of GDP in the “general budget speech for 2006” for the period 2006-2008. Examples of these key variables are: total, current, and capital public expenditures, domestic and external (grants) public revenues, and finally the expected budget deficit. I didn’t change the answer because this info is in the “general budget speech” and it is not in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation. For more details see the “general budget speech for 2006.”

http://www.mof.gov.jo/LinkClick.aspx

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The 2006 budget document provides 2004 actual expenditure, 2005 and 2006 budget estimates expenditures

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "b" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire
6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Multi-year estimates are not presented at all.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
   d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Tax revenue includes income tax on corporations and individuals. Taxes on domestic transaction (imported goods, domestic goods) in addition to sales tax.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year? | a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.  
b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.  
c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.  
d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: | |
| Comment: | Non-tax revenue includes fees of which (land registration, revenue stamps), interest on profits, mining revenues and pension contribution. |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: | |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: | |

| 9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)? | a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.  
b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.  
c. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
<p>| Citation: | |
| Comment: | |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: | |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>10.</strong> In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td>Multi-year estimates are not presented at all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>11.</strong> Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td>Page 13 General Budget document table 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Response Options</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year? | a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.  
   b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.  
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment). | This information is presented on page 7 of the Executive Budget 2006, and covers both domestic and external debt and interest payment. |         |
| Comment:                                                               | **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**                                                    |                                                                          |         |
|                                                                        | **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**                                                    |                                                                          |         |
| 13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year? | a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.  
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.  
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.  
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.  
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | No information regarding debt maturity was presented. |         |
<p>| Comment:                                                               | <strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong>                                                    |                                                                          |         |
|                                                                        | <strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong>                                                    |                                                                          |         |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The budget speech by the Minster of Finance which is part of the Budget law (page 1-39) presents information on the GDP expected growth, main monetary policy indicators and FDI. However, key assumptions are not presented nor the macro model which was used to reach such conclusion.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
what is normally presented in the executive budget and other supporting budget is an over view of the expected growth and some macro economic indicators without providing any details concerning the model that was followed.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c"**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” None of the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documents follow this kind of analysis. The only scenario is the one based on the expectations that are included in the general budget speech.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because "c" does refer to sensitivity analysis but some information with important details missing, as such we cannot claim that "d" is the answer as it says that no information.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain the consistency of the data across the countries.
16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment: Very little information presented, just a general statement presented.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
some information regarding how growth in GDP would influence revenue was presented in the budget speech. The budget speech is an integral part of the 2006 budget law.

**Researcher's Response to this question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment**: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” There is no info concerning policy proposals in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documents.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment**: 

**Researcher Response**: I chose my answer because pages 3 and 4 clearly cover this issue.

**IBP Comment**: IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concerning items related to security and defense there is no detailed information. For the rest of expenditures at administrative level details are available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification? |
| a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. |
| b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. |
| c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. |
| d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: |
| Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |
20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
   b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
   c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
   d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
Data covers 12 months. (the whole year)

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

---

23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
BY-2 refers to 2004.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment
24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The same details of the enacted budget details presented in a separate column that cover the actual spending of 2004

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
c. Before BY-3.
d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.
b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.
c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.
d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be "e." There is no evidence from the budget 2006 that prior year data are adjusted.

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because data is presented in actual terms and the budget follows the same format. If my understanding of the question is right I would retain my answer.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "a" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire
27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
- b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
- c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
- d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Revenue Section in the executive budget p 17-19.

**Comment:**
It presents tax on income and profits (corporations, Banks and financial institutions, individuals, salaried employees, social services tax). Tax on domestic transaction (imported and exported goods, services, sales tax)

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
- b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
- c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
- d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Revenue Section in the executive budget p 17-19.

**Comment:**
Non-tax revenue includes land registration, Revenue stamps, licenses, interest and profits.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   By-2 refers to 2004

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>33.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The executive budget presents data on debt but not maturity, for example (table 5) p12-13 of the executive budget presents data on sources of finance and expenditures that covers debt.

There are details available in the in-year report rather than the main budget document which presented to the parliament.

**Researcher’s Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” More than the level of debt is presented but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because no detail on maturity is presented to the parliament or other publicly available document.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
c. Before BY-3.
d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Table 5, p. 13 executive budget

Comment:
Only the general figures presented. More details available in the supporting budget document.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
### Comprehensiveness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds? | a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.  
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.  
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.  
   d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.  
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b"**

**PeerReviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Yes there is an item in page 19 in the executive budget (general revenues table) called miscellaneous public revenues but only mentioned the sources of these revenues without any explanation.

**PeerReviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because extra-budgetary funds are presented to the parliament at a letter stage to be approved. I must admit that the answer is between “b” and “c.”

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?

   a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?

   a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Information on State Owned Enterprises (SOEs) was presented in a separate budget and only the total transferred from the central budget to the SOEs presented in the 2006 budget.
   Budget for Independent government institutions

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?

   a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
According to the IMF (ROSC) about financial transparency it states that "There is no centralized reporting of the cost of these quasi-fiscal activities; the latter are identified in the annual reports of the public financial institutions and the central bank, but the costs are not quantified"

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?

   a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on financial assets is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
the budget provides information regarding revenue generated by government equity in various corporations. Page 8 of the 2006 budget law.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Even though there is non-tax revenue such as government revenues from public institutions (i.e. item number 7 in the government revenues in the executive budget/ page 18), there is nothing called financial asset in the executive's budget or any supporting budget documents. I think the return on equity of the government in some corporations is not a financial asset as the researcher mentioned.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain the consistency of the data across the countries.
40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?

  a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.
  b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.
  c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
  d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.
  e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Only on the revenue side, there is information regarding returns on assets such as revenue form land sales, maps and printing) p 19 of the 2006 executive budget.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The only info presented about the non-financial assets is the revenues. Revenues from corporations or institutions that government own or has share on. See item 7 page 18 in the government revenues. Nothing else mentioned about the non-financial assets.

**Peer Reviewer Comment:** In addition, land leasing and others.

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because I agree with the comment which is more in line with "d" answer.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
This happens mostly with regard to capital expenditures, where there is a difference between budgeted and actual spending. The difference represents arrears. This can be found in budget summary and in the Monthly Government Financial Bulletin.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
There is money allocated under chapter 41-1(d) and 41-2-(d) for emergency. See page 3 in executive budget. Spending is subject to the Prime Minster approval.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
though some information are available but it is not included in the executive budget. it appears in the Public speech by the MOF.

Researcher’s Response to this Question was "c."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "d.” No information on future liabilities is presented even in the general public speech 2006.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I chose my answer because the public speech refers to future liability

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.

44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?

a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Researcher’s Response to this Question was "d."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Current and capital expenditures of the Tax Department in the Ministry of Finance are presented in tables 7 and 8 in the executive budget.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.

46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.
b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.
c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.
d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Little is known about the composition of this rather sensitive item. And the percentage is not available to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?

- a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." Only the general public speech has such general explanation but not in details.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because introduction of the 2006 executive budget contains this link.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "b" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

- a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No non-financial data are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
Ministries such as Education and health and social development provide some information at program level.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?
   a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
   b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
   c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
   d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Very little data presented concerning non-financial data.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?
   a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.
   b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No performance indicators are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Performance indicators are presented as a prelude to each ministry budget. It can be found throughout the executive budget (for example, p 76 presented such indicators concerning the ministry of interior.) And P90 concerning the ministry of justice.

Non-financial information that is presented.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?

- All performance indicators are well designed.
- Most performance indicators are well designed.
- Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.
- No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.
- Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Performance indicators are presented as a prelude to each ministry budget. It can be found throughout the executive budget (for example p. 76 presented such indicators concerning the ministry of interior.) And P90 concerning the ministry of justice.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?

- All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
- No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Performance indicators are presented as a prelude to each ministry budget. It can be found throughout the executive budget (for example p. 76 presented such indicators concerning the ministry of interior.) And P90 concerning the ministry of justice.

non-financial information that is presented.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
Budget speech and the introduction the precedes each ministry details budget see for the example the Ministry of social affairs budget p.452

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

**Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring**

*Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</th>
<th>b</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation: See page 12 of the executive budget.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Researcher's Response to this Question was &quot;b.&quot;</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong> A more appropriate response to this question would be &quot;c.&quot; Regarding the tax rate; it may be changed during the implementation of the budget.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Researcher Response:</strong> I chose my answer because mentioned page provide such information and the comments is about change which is not relevant in this case.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IBP Comment:</strong> IBP editors chose answer, &quot;b&quot; to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>57.</strong> Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>58.</strong> Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td>See page 1 article 4 of the budget law 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>Budget speech and pre-budget statements refers in general to some of the conditionality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
The same note made to Q 58.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” I think some information on conditions associated with donor from IFI are presented but for country assistance is not presented at all specially the cash assistance unless the in-kind subsidies because it has a specific purpose.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because there is some information on conditionality that is provided. We are not arguing that all details are presented.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not provide a summary.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:  
Budget Proposal which normally published in the local Media

Comment:  
**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The budget summary is not informative for normal people.

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because the summary is really informative and it is widely debated in mass media.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "b" consistent with the researcher’s comment.

---

61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:  

Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, definitions are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The Ministry of Finance issues a guide to concerned agency put not to the public.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Yes the General Budget Department published four guides on revenues and expenditures and others. They are available on the Internet, see Table 2 in this questionnaire for the links.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because the guide refers to dated back to 2003. If you consider that useful I would agree with the peer reviewer.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
63. Do citizens have the right *in law* to access government information, including budget information?

- a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
- d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

- **Comment:**
  This right does not include access to budget information.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." In democratic country as here in Jordan, the citizens have the right in law to access government information with some restrictions concerning the national security info, as in other democratic countries. However, in practice it is not possible for citizens to obtain government information, including budget information.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because the law has not been codified and it budget information is not part of the law.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Depends on the nature of the program. Citizens in practice can get some highly disaggregated information for some programs.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because in practice such information is not available. Researchers many times were turned down though in unofficial manner. That is, waiting forever so they will not get official decline.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment**: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The same note in question 64.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment**: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Citizens are able to obtain number of employees in the program.

**Researcher Response**: I chose my answer because in theory you can get the number of beneficiaries in the detailed budget.

**IBP Comment**: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
Section Three: The Budget Process
## The Budget Process

### Executive’s Formulation of the Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known? | a. The release date is set in permanent law.  
b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.  
c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.  
d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | **Citation:**  
Budget Statement No. 25 (2005) | **Comment:**  
States that one month before the financial year begin budget proposal should be submitted to the parliament.  
**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** |

67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive’s budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget’s formulation)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.  
b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.  
c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.  
d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | **Citation:**  
Budget Statement No. 25 (2005) | **Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** |
68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?

   a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.
   b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.
   c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.
   d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The executive holds consultations with the financial committee in the parliament.

   **Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because discussion with the financial committee is concerning the approval of the budget and not to set priorities. It is post consultation not a priority and consultation does not cover all the details.

   **IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   Citation:
   Pre-budget statement 25 for the year 2005 was released on the 20 of Sep. 2005

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Little explanation is presented

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."

Peer Reviewer One Comment:
See “the official announcement -number 25- for preparing the law of general budget and the budget of the independent public institutions for the year 2006” pages 2 and 3. It has an explanation concerning fiscal and macroeconomic framework but it lacks important details.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The pre-budget statement introduces all the macroeconomic variables in the Jordanian economy. In addition to monetary and fiscal policies. A note: the statement (No 25, 2005) consists of 45 pages.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>73.</th>
<th>Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>74.</th>
<th>How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

Normally one month period.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?

a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.
b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.
c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.
d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment: The Committee of Finance and Economy in the Parliament holds such hearings but no testimony from the public is heard.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment: The Committee of Finance and Economy in the Parliament holds such hearings but did not cover all executive branches.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?

a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.
c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.
d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?

a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.
b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.
d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment: the committee may release general statements

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c"**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The committee releases reports through mass-media and it is a short report.

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because the media provides general coverage. I agree but newspapers would go into details. My answer is somewhere in between, personally I do not think the coverage is very informative. But this some thing the media should work on and also some of the discussion the media will be excluded.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.
   b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Legislature receives aggregate figures with no details

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| 80. Does the legislature have authority *in law* to amend the budget presented by the executive? |
|---|---|
| a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority *in law* to amend the budget. |
| b. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, with some limitations. |
| c. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited. |
| d. No, the legislature does not have any authority *in law* to amend the budget. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation:

Comment:
Legislature can reduce the expenditures not increase it by law. They can transfer some budget items too.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

b
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>81.</th>
<th>What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The approved budget includes program-level detail.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The approved budget includes only departmental totals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive’s Implementation of the Budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
83. **What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?**

   a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.
   b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
   c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

84. **What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit?**

   a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail.
   b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals.
   d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?
   
   a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.
   b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
   c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

   a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.
   b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.
   c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.
   d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections? | 1. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.  
2. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.  
3. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.  
4. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.  
5. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: | Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: | Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |
| 88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year? | 1. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.  
2. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.  
3. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.  
4. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.  
5. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: | Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: | Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |
89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?
   a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.
   b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.
   c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.
   d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?

   a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.
   b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.
   c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.
   d. In-year reports are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: The executive does not release to the public a mid-year review of the budget.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   
   Comment:
   The executive does not release mid-year report.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

   a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.
   b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).
   d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   
   Comment:
   The executive does not release mid-year report.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.

b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.

c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.

d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The executive does not release mid-year report.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain minimal level specified in law or regulation)?

   a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
   b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
   c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
   d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature.

Comment: Page 4 from the executive budget states that executives cannot shift capital expenditures to current expenditures. However, the parliament, Royal Medical Services, Public Security, and Civil defense are excluded from this conditionality. And in general shifting expenses from one program to another does not need the approval of the legislators.

Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The executive doesn’t have to seek input in advance from the legislature when shifting funds between administrative units.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
The procurement followed an open and competitive process.

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).
b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
In many instances, the government start spending, irrespective of the law, and they seek the approval after spending takes place. This is in practice what is happening.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
It is estimated at about 10 percent in 2006.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
### Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution

101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?

- a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
- b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
- c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.
- d. The executive does not release a year-end report.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Final Account 2006 issues by the ministry of Finance and there is limited access to it. It never posted on the internet and there is delay in preparing it.

If you think the answer should be d, I am not sure if we need to change all answers (101-110) to d.

**Comment:**

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” See the Annual Report issued by the General Budget Department.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because mentioned report passed the cut date of Sep. 2007.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?

   a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
   b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
   c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
   d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?
   
   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:  
   Explanation is not presented.

   Comment:  

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:  
   explanation is not presented.

   Comment:  

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>108.</th>
<th>Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>109.</th>
<th>Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
Explanation is not presented.

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

  a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
  b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.
  c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
  d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.
  e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

*The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution*
111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

   a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
   b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.
   d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
18 months.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The final account released according to article 22/3/A of the law No. 28, 1952. (audit bureau law)

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer because final account released after 18 months and it lacks important details. The comments refer to the law, not the actual implementation.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?

a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.
b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.
c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.
d. No expenditures have been audited; the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: 

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: 

113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?

a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report’s content.
b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: Audit report released after 24 months

Researcher’s Response to this Question was "b."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "a." E.g. growth in revenues in the year 2006 and compare it with the revenues in the year 2005. Internal loans and external loans for the year 2006. current and capital expenditures for the year 2006.

Researcher Response: I chose my answer because there is no executive summary that provide a comprehensive view.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "b" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.
114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

   a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
   b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:  
Comment:  
**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
   b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
   c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
   d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:  
Comment:  
**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have *the discretion in law* to undertake those audits it may wish to?

   a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
   b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
   c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
   d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   The Audit Bureau, which exists according to Audit Bureau Law No 28 of 1952 and its amendments, with the mandate to inter alia:
   1. Monitor the entries of the state, its expenditure, the methods of spending, the accounts related to deposits advances, loans, settlements, and warehouses/storage

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

   a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
   b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
   c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
   d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?

a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.
c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.
d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?

a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.
b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.
c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.
d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.
e. Not applicable.

Citation:

Comment:
Anti-Corruption Commission is entrusted, it can communicates complaints regarding public funds to the audit Bureau which accordingly can act.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, audit reports are not scrutinized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
In practice, financial committees in the parliament may ignore some of the audit reports. Though it is stipulated in the law that they should scrutinize such reports.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
There is no systematic reporting, but the Executive promises to take into consideration comments made by the Audit Bureau.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” As the researcher mentioned, the executive always promises to take care of the audit recommendations but does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** 

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 
Legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items because secret items are not subject to auditing.

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** 

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**