

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

LIBERIA

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: J. Aloysius Toe & Jasper Cummeh III
Organization: Foundation for Human Rights and Democracy (FOHRD) in collaboration with the Center for Transparency and Accountability (CENTAL)
Address: J. Aloysius: Congo Town, Tubman Boulevard, Sinkor A. G. Road. Corner of Carey/Macdonald Streets, Monrovia, Liberia
Telephone: Aloysius: +231 66 6 88 19
Jasper: +231 7 7855-147
E-mail: Aloysius: aloysiustoe@yahoo.com
Jasper: jasper_cummeh@freeagenda.org

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE LIBERIA

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	4
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	5
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links.....	6
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal.....	8
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	9
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	10
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	11
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year.....	25
Comprehensiveness.....	33
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring.....	40
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	44
Section Three: The Budget Process	51
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	52
Legislative Approval of the Budget.....	57
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	62
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	75

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, "Not Available."

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
<i>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</i>	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	2007/08
Executive's Budget Proposal	Not Available
Supporting Budget Documents	Not Available
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2007/08
In-Year Reports	Not Available
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	2005/2006
Audit Report	Not Available

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Produced
Budget Summary	<p>"REPOSITIONING FOR NATIONAL RENEWAL, POVERTY REDUCTION AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT, May 15, 2007; "http://www.mofliberia.org/presidentbudgetmessage.pdf</p> <p>2007/08 Budget Fact Sheet, May 21, 2007; www.emansion.gov.lr</p>
Executive’s Budget Proposal	Not Available
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Not Available
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Not Available
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Produced but not available to the public
Citizens Budget	Not Produced
Enacted Budget	FY 2007/08 Budget, available at www.emansion.gov.lr
In-Year Reports	Not available

Mid-Year Review	Not Produced
-----------------	--------------

Year-End Report	Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf
Audit Report	Not produced
Other Documents	n.a.
Relevant Ministries & Departments	

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive's Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
<i>For the following reports, place "Yes" in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive's Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes					Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public		Yes				
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)			Yes			
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark "Yes" if yes, "No" if no, or "NA" if Not Available.</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive's Budget				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	No	No	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	No	No	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	No	No	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	No	Yes	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	No	No	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	NA	No	No	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	No	Yes	NA	NA	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark "Yes" if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
<i>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes		Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public		Yes			
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request				Yes	
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes				
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	No	NA	NA	No	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	No	NA	NA	No	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	No	NA	NA	No	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	NA	NA	Yes	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	No	NA	NA	No	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	NA	NA	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	No	NA	NA	No	NA
8. Written in more than one language	No	NA	NA	No	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	NA	NA	No	NA

⁺Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked "not applicable/other," please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." This is probably possible, however, several civil society organizations did also make request and were provided copies of the documents. For example, Green Advocates and the Budget Network (of twenty-one institutions including the University of Liberia Student Union) requested , received and held a two-day symposium on the campus of the University of Liberia to debate the 2007/2008 Executive Budget Proposal. Emphasis was made on the factors influencing the derived expenditure as classified by Administrative Unit.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, "d." In accordance with the criteria defined in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i> we define publicly available information as that information which any and all citizens might be able to obtain through a request to the public authority issuing the document.</p> <p>In order to test whether each and every citizen would have been able to obtain this budget document upon request, our partners in Liberia undertook a survey whereby fifteen organizations requested the executive's budget proposal to the authority issuing this document (in this case the Budget Bureau at Ministry of Finance): to some of the groups access to the document was denied.</p> <p>The purpose of the IBP's Open Budget Initiative is to ensure the timely and simultaneous availability of the budgetary documents to all interested parties. Therefore, according to the principle of equitable access to information, which is one of the criteria of the OBI methodology applied for selecting the answers for all countries, we consider the Executive's Budget Proposal as not available, and therefore we retain answer "d" for all questions related to this document.</p>	d

<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The 2007/2008 Executive Budget proposal, showing some expenditures classified by function, were made available to University Libraries, some civil society organizations and the media. Some civil society organizations and the media even debated the proposal during its consideration by the National Legislature.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.”</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” However, there are suggestions from stakeholders including civil society to elevate the program-level data to include pro-poor priorities.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The Liberian budget has not been elevated to the level of multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure this is probably due to the fact that Liberia runs a cash based budget.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “b.” See comment under Question 1</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” However, it is important to emphasize that multi-year estimates are still not considered in the Liberian Budget — past and present.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Sources of the revenues are disclosed in the 2007/2008 Executive Budget proposal and were made available to the public prior to consideration by the Legislature. Some of the most intense debate around the document related to estimates link to specific sources. For example revenue derived from public parastatals, customs, etc. Liberia does not have a VAT, a variant called the General Sales tax (GST) was recently introduced</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Sources of the non-tax revenues, such as property incomes and sales of goods and services, are disclosed in the 2007/2008 Executive Budget proposal and were made available to the public prior to consideration by the Legislature. For example, the 2007/2008 budget indicated 15 million as to be derived from Mittal Steel Corporation, a steel company in Liberia. However, we note the absence of revenues from grants.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).</p> <p>b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.</p> <p>c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.</p> <p>d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.</p> <p>b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” Under the General Claims category of the 2007/2008 Executive Budget Proposal, arrears, principal and interests on debts are included and presented.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “b.” See comment under Question 1</p>	b

<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Discussions of the macroeconomic forecast are usually vague with most of the essential and important details lacking.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c” some information is presented but details are excluded</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). Before BY-3. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Only aggregate transfers to public corporations and Commissions are reflected in the 2007/2008 Executive Budget Proposal.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	d

<p>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>41. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” For example, under Other Claims, CODE: 5-5-52, the 2007/2008 Executive Budget proposal made measure of Pension Contributions.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	d

<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The 2007/2008 Executive Budget proposal identified sources of revenues.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d.” See comment under Question 1</p>	d
<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>52. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</p> <p>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available to the public. We surveyed 15 prominent civil society organizations regarding their experience in obtaining the document while it was under consideration by the legislature. We found that several made requests but were not provided with a copy of the document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring</p>	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	

<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information is provided to the public on the tax rates or fee schedules from all revenue sources</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No analysis on the incidence of tax is presented by the executive</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information is provided on the assistance from IFIs.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information is presented on conditions associated with aid, though the government has just recently received direct budgetary support</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> 2007/08 Budget Fact Sheet, May 21, 2007; www.emansion.gov.lr</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interview with Antony Myers, Research Analyst, Bureau of the Budget</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A glossary of budgetary terms has not been presented in any budget document</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information. d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Monitoring Access to Information Report, CENTAL, June 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> International best practices concerning Access to Information does not recognize the expression of Freedom of Information intents in constitutions. The provisions of the constitution though organic prepares the foundation upon which further legislation is made and codified to give citizens the manner and procedures that should be used to access information. The constitutional expression is not recognized because it does not state how information is accessed, and what constitutes a breach of this law thereof or what penalties thereto are given in the event a citizen is refused information. Using the normal legal process as a redress is in the far extreme and is usually found in those jurisdiction where the law is absent and punishment remains the judge’s discretion. Good Governance Practices establishes administrative channels for first instances of redress for denial of request for information, and these channels of redress would then examine whether any exemption(s) have been established by law or whether the basis for denial is justifiable. As of now there is no access to information law, and no EXEMPTIONS have been laid down. Liberia’s constitution expresses the intent for “unlimited access” to information,</p>	d

while international legal framework and practices recognizes the need for exemptions. Without recognized, legally established exemptions laid down in law, denial of information on the grounds of exemption is arbitrary.

As of April 15, 2008; The Liberian Media Law Working Group and several Civil Society Organizations, including the Actions for Genuine Democratic Alternatives (AGENDA), Liberia National Law Enforcement Association (LINLEA) and the Center for Media Studies and Peace Building (CEMESP), etc submitted three draft bills to the National Legislature, including a Freedom of Information Bill. The bill's Public Hearings has just been concluded, and the House of Representatives Committee is currently giving further scrutiny to the bill.

Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question might be "c." The Constitution guarantees citizens the right to knowledge and information, including government information, except when expressly restricted by law. (Ch. III, Art. 15: "c. In pursuance of this right, there shall be no limitation on the public right to be informed about the government and its functionaries.") The Constitution furthermore provides the right of every citizen to seek legal redress in case of violation of any of the rights provided for in the constitution (Ch. III, Art. 26). However, according to the Global Integrity report of 2006 (<http://www.globalintegrity.org/reports/2006/LIBERIA/scorecard.cfm?subcategoryID=13&countryID=20>), there is no access to information legislation, specifying *how* the constitutional right guaranteed in Article 15 c can be exercised, and what constitutes infringement of that right. (We've not been able to access the CENTAL report cited above, we did not find it on the CENTAL website).

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." The Constitution of Liberia, in article 15c, guarantees this right in law to the citizens the right to information."

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting the answers across countries.

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <p>a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</p> <p>b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</p> <p>c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</p> <p>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Telephone interview with Brown Sarlee, Comptroller, Ministry of Internal Affairs</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <p>a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</p> <p>b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</p> <p>c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</p> <p>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Telephone interview with Brown Sarlee, Comptroller, Ministry of Internal Affairs</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process	
Executive's Formulation of the Budget	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The release date is set in permanent law. b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not announce a release date of the National Budget to the Public. The Executive Budget proposal is not available to the public, rather it is presented to the Legislature</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive’s budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget’s formulation)?</p> <p>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Bureau of the Budget guidelines for submission of budget proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Bureau of the Budget through its Director holds a press conference at which he informs the public about the submission process</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> According to the January 2008 draft of the Liberia PEFA report, the budget process is driven by the deadline for submission of the budget to the legislature, which is set in each annual budget law for the following year. For the last 2 years this deadline has been 20th May. The Bureau of the Budget is then responsible for preparing the annual budget calendar to meet this deadline.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------

<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The submission is usually delayed because Government agencies are slow in submitting their proposals</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The dates of submission and adoption by the legislature for the last 3 budgets: FY 2007/08 submitted 17th May 2007 and adopted 17th July 2007 FY 2006/07 submitted 29th June 2006 and adopted 23rd August 2006 FY 2005/06 submitted after the start of the fiscal year and adopted 19th August 2005 (Source: January 2008 draft of Liberia PEFA report)</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interview with Anthony Myers, Budget Analyst, Bureau of the Budget</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> On behalf of the President, the Budget Director engages the legislature to get a feel of what they think as per proposals the president would be making</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C

<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Anthony Myers, Budget Analyst, Bureau of the Budget</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive only consults agencies of government, not people in the constituency. Recently, the Executive has started county consultations for County Agenda, as part of the PRS process, such consultations would have helped in the budgetary process but this model is not in use.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not prepare or release a pre-budget statement</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not prepare or release a pre-budget statement</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not prepare or release a pre-budget statement</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Daily Observer, Vol.11 No. 361, Tuesday December 4, 2007 "2008/2009 Budget Guidelines Out"</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget year begins on July 1, and the Executive submits the budget in May</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The deadline for submission of the budget to the legislature is set in the annual budget law and for the last 2 years the date has been 20th May. For FY 2007/08 this deadline was adhered to, but for FY 06/07, it was submitted at the end of June, only days before the start of the budget year and in 05/06 it was submitted after the start of the budget year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Hearings are held but not to discuss the merits and demerits of the macroeconomic framework, rather to discuss figures and allocations</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No. Public hearings are held on the budget in its entirety, not on specific agencies, say for an example Security Sector</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No. Public hearings are held on the budget in its entirety, not on specific agencies, say for an example Security Sector</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The committee releases no report to the public, rather they report directly to Plenary on their findings</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <p>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</p> <p>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> If a member(s) of the Security Committee in the Legislature has any qualms of spending items listed on the Security budget, of course they can summon the appropriate security agency, but detailed disclosure on specific spending items are limited for now to: equipment, personnel, gasoline and fuel, etc, i.e. administrative overheads. Adequate in depth disclosures are not made about programs, for an example Restructuring of the Army. In this case, though the funding is non budgetary but members of the legislature, especially those on the Security Committee, have complained publicly about not having much knowledge about the program and its expenditure. They accused Dyn Corp, an American based Security firm of keeping all information to themselves. Even the Defense Minister complained about this in the newspapers.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations. c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited. d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 34(d) of the Liberian Constitution</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The legislature can amend the budget in part or can counter proposed changes that might alter the Executive Proposal</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> FY 2007/2008 Budget</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Program level details are given but not for all administrative agencies</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

Executive's Implementation of the Budget

82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

- a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.
- b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.
- c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.
- d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

In-year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

No in-year reports on *actual spending*. However, quarterly reports on fiscal outturn including spending *on a commitment basis* (including an excel annex on spending by Ministry and Agency) are available for fiscal year 2007-2008 on the website of the Ministry of Finance (<http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreports.htm>). The reports for Q1 and Q2 for the current fiscal years were published about 3 months after the end of the quarter in question. Annual fiscal reports are available on this site for fiscal years 2004-2005, 2005-2006, 2006-2007.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I chose my answer "d" because at the time the research was conducted this information was not available on the Ministry's website. Although, earlier it was available but was removed without an explanation as to why this was done. Concerned about this, I sent a letter both to the Minister and to the Website Administrator in April 2008, but neither of them responded to my inquiry. Other colleagues too searching the site in parts of the world raised similar concerns, so I was certain that this could not be a fault of my computer, and I could not quote or reference a report that was not available for cross checking. Of late the report has reappeared on the site, but in my view its stay on the site may not be guaranteed, because it could be removed at anytime, since in fact it was moved the last time without an explanation, even though there was a query for one, therefore I consider it safe enough to 'ignore' it, as acknowledging it would be inconsistent with the methodology of this research; therefore I appropriately make this disclosure.

d

<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In-year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In-year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In-year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> In-year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed.</p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The quarterly fiscal outturn reports available on the website of the Ministry of Finance (http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreports.htm), contain information on actual government revenue collection by GFS classification. These reports are released approximately 3 months after the end of the quarter in question.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.”</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	d

<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In-year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> It is difficult to ascertain the exact share of revenues covered. However, partial evidence from for instance the January 2008 draft of the Liberia PEFA report indicates that not all sources are covered in the budget or expenditure reports. For instance, donor funds, which represent significant amounts, are not reflected in these reports.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I chose my answer “d” because at the time at which these reports are supposed to be released they are not. They are released long after the periods have elapsed, even the legislature has complained about not getting performance reports at the time the budget is prepared and submitted. Recently, the Senate complained that it was under pressure to pass the budget even though reports they requested including bank reconciliation to ascertain the balance in the government’s account. Reports are not timely, and the methodology of this research emphasizes on time and procedure that are open and transparent. Hence we consider them not to be released to the public.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed</p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” Comparisons are made, <i>for all revenue sources cited in the table</i>, with the original projected amounts for the period.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I chose to keep my answer “d” because at the time at which these reports are supposed to be released they are not. They are released long after the periods have elapsed, even the legislature has complained about not getting performance reports at the time the budget is prepared and submitted. Recently, the Senate complained that it was under pressure to pass the budget even though reports they requested including bank reconciliation to ascertain the balance in the government’s account. Reports are not timely, and the methodology of this research emphasizes on time and procedure that are open and transparent. Hence we consider them not to be released to the public.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answer across countries.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Analyst, May 23, 2007 ' We will not Borrow" www.analystliberia.com</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In-year reports are sometimes late but published in the newspaper since the inception of the new government, however, the government has placed a moratorium on borrowing.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In-year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. d. In-year reports are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In-year reports are not timely released or not released at all. They might be released long after the period which they represent has elapsed.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The mid-year review is discussed internally between government agencies, it is not open to the public for participation, only the aggregate information is given via news stories.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The mid-year review is discussed internally between government agencies, it is not open to the public for participation, only the aggregate information is given via news stories</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The mid-year review is discussed internally between government agencies, it is not open to the public for participation, only the aggregate information is given via news stories</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The mid-year review is discussed internally between government agencies, it is not open to the public for participation, only the aggregate information is given via news stories</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive has a hundred percent ceilings for shifting funds; therefore, it does not need a legislative approval to do this.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> LPRC Oil Deal; See "PPCC Rejects Liability In LPRC Oil Deal," Liberian Observer, March 20, 2007;http://www.liberianobserver.com/news/fullstory.php/aid/6258/PPCC_Rejects_Liability_In_LPRC_Oil_Deal.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> LPRC a public corporation that receives subsidy from government, and is 100% Government owned flouted the Procurement Law</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c
<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Two Supplemental budgets were presented to the Legislature since the Sirleaf administration took power. It is difficult however to say whether it was before the funds were spent or after. On both occasions, these budgets were presented at the end of the third quarter. It is quite possible that these funds might have already been spent, however, for the benefit of the doubt I would assume that they weren't until at such time there is evidence to prove otherwise.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "a."</p>	a

<p>The Supplemental Appropriations of the Revenue Code of Liberia Act of 2000, states that “The President may from time-to-time request the Director General of the Budget Bureau to prepare for transmission by the President to the Legislature, proposals and explanations for such additional appropriation as in the President’s judgment as necessary because of laws enacted after the transmittal of the budget or are otherwise in the national interest.” Therefore, it becomes difficult to agree with the researcher(s) on the 100% free-hand transfer of fund attributed to the Executive.</p> <p>The term “from time to time” as made mentioned in the Revenue Code of Liberia Act of 2000 means that the legislature’s approval is at all times required,</p> <p>There is a law that requires each and every supplemental budget to be presented to the Legislature for approval before its implementation.</p> <p>Also the Constitution of Liberia guarantees that: under Chapter 5 (The Legislature), Article 34d(ii): “No monies shall be drawn from the treasury except in consequence of appropriations made by legislative enactment and upon warrant of the President; and an annual statement and account of the receipt and expenditure of all public monies shall be submitted by the office of the President to the Legislature and published once a year.”</p> <p>In addition, “Transfers of Appropriation Prohibited Unless Expressly Authorized” as contained in the Revenue Code of Liberia Act 2000 states that: “All monies appropriated for the various functions, projects and activities contained in the annual budget and in supplementary or additional appropriation acts shall be available solely for the specific purposes for which appropriated.”</p>	
---	--

<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Telephone conversation with Anthony Myers, Budget Analyst, Bureau of the Budget, August 18, 2008.</p> <p>Telephone Conversation with Representative Worlea Saywah Dunah of Nimba County, August 19, 2008</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Two Supplemental Budgets were submitted since the Sirleaf Administration, each submitted within the third quarter of the year</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> See Act to Approve the Budget for the Fiscal Period beginning July 1, 2007-June 30, 2008.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> With the Act approved the President is authorized to expend all monies contained in the budget as per appropriation</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. The executive does not release a year-end report. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The General Auditing Commission is still trying to organize itself to conduct audits. To date it has not conducted an Audit.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No explanation is provided</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No explanation is provided</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Preliminary Report on 2005-2006 Fiscal Outturn, September 5, 2006 http://www.mofliberia.org/fiscalreportsjuly05tojune06.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information is provided on what extrabudget</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p><i>The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution</i></p>	

<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The General Auditing Commission has just been established and is undergoing set up, it is yet to conduct an audit</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> It is interesting to note however that the GAC, for the first time, released a document reviewing the draft budget for 2007/08 (http://www.gacliberia.com/budgetreview.html). This analysis generated significant public interest in the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The General Auditing Commission has just been established and is undergoing set up, it has yet to conduct an audit.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Conversation with Janga Kowo, General Auditing Commission, April 2008</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No audits have been conducted, the SAI is still organizing its work schedule</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed. b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> GAC Act of 2005</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Auditor General office is autonomous, and it falls under the oversight of the Legislature. The AG may be removed for cause, through impeachment proceedings or for acts as established by a court of law</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No audits have been conducted, the SAI is still organizing its work schedule</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> GAC Act of 2005; Interview with Janga Kowo, Special Assistant to the Auditor General</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The AG has the discretion to determine which audits are to be conducted and why. Also, why there are statutory audits, the AG can at any time conduct an Interim Audit, if there are sufficient reasons; or Subpoena anyone to appear and give testimony under oath.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> John Morlu's letter to the Senate, March 22, 2007. Ref: GAC/OAG/SEN/RL00001</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c
<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No audits have been conducted for many years</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u> Telephone conversation with Francois Junius, Foresic Audit Manager, General Auditing Commission, August 19, 2008.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such mechanisms if any have yet to be established, as of now there are none. Any member of the public can walk in the offices of the Commission, a file a complaint, and accordingly action would be taken. But there is no formal mechanism such as deliberate information to the public requesting filing such information through such channels as: (a) website (b) telephone hotline (c) writing a letter/mail (d) dropping off information in boxes at public places (e) faxing strategic documents to the commission that could aid its work. Such might be in the future. But at the same time, it is important to note that the commission is supported by law to do this.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized. No, audit reports are not scrutinized. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No audits have been conducted for many years</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No audits have been conducted for many years</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No audits have been conducted for many years</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs. b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details. d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No audits have been conducted for many years</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

Additional Comments:

Please use this section to add any additional comments.

Researcher Additional Comments:

We didn't spend the money
Rights Comm. Denies Receiving US \$598,000

The Independent National Commission on Human Rights (INCHR) has denied receiving US \$598,713 from the Government as revealed in the Ministry of Finance's "Adjusted Budget" figures showing how much each Government entity received during the fiscal year 2006/2007. The Ministry of Finance published finance document show that the Human Rights commission was allotted US \$598, 713. But it overspent its allotment to the tune of US \$598, 713 getting in the excess of US \$17, 446.

"We did not spend this entire amount," the INCHR Personnel Director, Wilma Seakpeni told this paper Tuesday. "The original appropriation was \$229,267," Wilma Seakpeni said, adding, "The adjusted appropriation is the same."

Democrat: "Are you sure that as at the end of June, 2007, (which is the last month of the 2006-2007 fiscal year) you did not spend this entire amount?"

"I am sure that as of June 2007, we did not even spend this entire amount (\$229,267). We did not go over (board)," Seakpeni said. The denial by the INCHR that it receives USD \$598,713 from government coffers as its allotment for the 2006/2007 fiscal year comes a day after Finance Minister, Dr. Antoinette Sayeh defended the huge difference in the published document.

Dr. Sayeh defended the huge difference in expenditure saying

It is attributed to the fact that Civil Servants salary arrears and pay increases were done out of one envelope and were not reflected in the adjusted budget. But officials at the INHCR say even if the 6 months NTGL salary arrears for employees at that institution which amounts to US \$49,189 in total were added to the \$229,267 allotted to them for the 2006/2007 budget year, it still falls below the government's published figures of US \$598,713. The INCHR was established in 1997 by ex-President Charles Taylor and was reconstituted by an Act of Legislature in 2004 based on the recommendation by the Accra Comprehensive Peace Agreement. It is yet to be fully functional due to the lack of commissioners. President Ellen Johnson Sirleaf is yet to name the commissioners since a vetting process was completed last December. When asked at the Press Conference Monday, how the INCHR could spend US \$598,713 when it is not fully functional. Dr. Sayeh who appeared to have no knowledge about its (INCHR) existence, referred the question to her Deputy for Administration, Mr. Tarnu Marwolo. Mr. Marwolo said through commissioners were yet to be appointed to head the INCHR, the appreciation made was for the staffs that are running the Commission.

The above story epitomizes what has taken place in the budgetary process over a long period of time, however, persistent Civil Society and Media scrutiny of the budget process is now opening up avenues for people to be aware and to speak up. Gradually, people will come to grips with government's budgetary process and also understand how they can be proactive at every stage of the process.