

International Budget Partnership  
**OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE**

# **MOROCCO**

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership  
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities  
820 First Street, NE  
Suite 510  
Washington, DC 20002  
[www.internationalbudget.org](http://www.internationalbudget.org)  
[www.openbudgetindex.org](http://www.openbudgetindex.org)

**This questionnaire was completed by:**

<b>Name:</b>	<b>BOUSSETTA Mohamed</b>
<b>Organization:</b>	<b>Transparency Maroc</b>
<b>Address:</b>	
<b>Telephone:</b>	<b>212 37681405</b>
<b>E-mail:</b>	<b>mboussetta@menara.ma</b>

# International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE MOROCCO

<b>Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents</b> .....	4
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire .....	5
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links.....	6
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal.....	9
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports .....	10
<b>Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal</b> .....	11
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	12
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year.....	23
Comprehensiveness.....	39
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring.....	48
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring .....	55
<b>Section Three: The Budget Process</b> .....	62
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget .....	63
Legislative Approval of the Budget.....	67
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	71
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution .....	83

## **Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents**

## Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

*Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, "Not Available."*

<b>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</b>	
<i>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</i>	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	Not Available
Executive's Budget Proposal	2007
Supporting Budget Documents	2007
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2007
In-Year Reports	2006
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	2006
Audit Report	Not Available

## Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

*Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.*

*If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”*

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Produced
Budget Summary	Not Produced
Executive’s Budget Proposal	La loi de finances 2007- <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAIL_INTERNET_MFP/VIE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF_2007/NOTE%20PRESENTATION%20LF%202007/np-fr.zip">http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAIL_INTERNET_MFP/VIE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF_2007/NOTE%20PRESENTATION%20LF%202007/np-fr.zip</a> (french) <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/arabe/LoiDeFinances/loi2007/np_ar/np_ar.zip">http://www.finances.gov.ma/arabe/LoiDeFinances/loi2007/np_ar/np_ar.zip</a> (arabic)
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Rapport économique et financier -2007 <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAIL_INTERNET_MFP/VIE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF_2007/REF_FR2007.PDF">http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAIL_INTERNET_MFP/VIE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF_2007/REF_FR2007.PDF</a> (french)
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Note de présentation-2007 <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/portal/page?_pageid=33,2532461&amp;_dad=portal&amp;_schema=PORTAL">http://www.finances.gov.ma/portal/page?_pageid=33,2532461&amp;_dad=portal&amp;_schema=PORTAL</a> (french)
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Rapport sur les Compte Spéciaux du Trésor-2007</li> <li>- Projet de loi de finances de l’année</li> <li>- Projet de loi de finances: comptes spéciaux du Trésor</li> <li>- Services de l’Etat gérés de manière autonome : SEGMA</li> <li>- Rapport sur les Entreprises et Etablissements Publics</li> </ul> All available in French here: <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAIL_INTERNET_MFP/VIE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF_2007/NOTE%20PRESENTATION%20LF%202007/np-fr.zip">http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAIL_INTERNET_MFP/VIE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF_2007/NOTE%20PRESENTATION%20LF%202007/np-fr.zip</a>  In Arabic here: <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/arabe/LoiDeFinances/loi2007/np_ar/np_ar.zip">http://www.finances.gov.ma/arabe/LoiDeFinances/loi2007/np_ar/np_ar.zip</a>

Citizens Budget	Not Produced
Enacted Budget	<a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAL_INTERNET_MFP/VIE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF_2007/CORPS%20DE%20LA%20LOI%202007/Lf%20fr.pdf">http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAL_INTERNET_MFP/VIE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF_2007/CORPS%20DE%20LA%20LOI%202007/Lf%20fr.pdf</a> (french) <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/arabe/LoiDeFinances/loi2007/loifinance2007.htm">http://www.finances.gov.ma/arabe/LoiDeFinances/loi2007/loifinance2007.htm</a> (arabic)
In-Year Reports	<a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/portal/page?_pageid=33,14828299&amp;_dad=portal&amp;_schema=PORTAL">http://www.finances.gov.ma/portal/page?_pageid=33,14828299&amp;_dad=portal&amp;_schema=PORTAL</a>
Mid-Year Review	Not Produced

Year-End Report	Loi de reglement Bulletin officiel For exemple : Loi de règlement 1998- 1999 BO du 13-01-2005.
Audit Report	Not Produced
Other Documents	Rapport sur les dépenses fiscales -rapport sur les Services de l'Etat gérés de manière autonome-2006 <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/Loi de finances /loi de finances 2006h.htm">www.finances .gov.ma/Loi de finances /loi de finances 2006h.htm</a> .
Relevant Ministries & Departments	Ministere des finances et de la privatisation



**Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal**

<b>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</b>						
<i>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>						
	Pre-budget	<b>Executive’s Budget Proposal</b>				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes		Yes			Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public						
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)		Yes		Yes	Yes	
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>						
	Pre-budget	<b>Executive’s Budget</b>				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	No	NA	No	No	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	No	NA	No	No	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	No	NA	No	No	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	Yes	NA	Yes	No	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	No	NA	No	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities <sup>+</sup>	NA	No	NA	No	No	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	NA

\*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

<sup>+</sup>Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

**Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports**

<b>DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS</b>					
<i>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes		Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public					
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes	Yes		Yes	
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	No	No	NA	No	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	No	No	NA	No	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	No	No	NA	No	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	No	NA	No	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	No	NA	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities <sup>+</sup>	No	No	NA	No	NA
8. Written in more than one language	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	No	NA	No	NA

<sup>+</sup>Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

## Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

*Notes on abbreviations:*

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

*Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked "not applicable/other," please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.*

<b>The Executive's Budget Proposal</b>	
<b>Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond</b>	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <p>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.</p> <p>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.</p> <p>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</p> <p>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The administrative classification is the only one used in all the financial laws at the moment.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</li> <li>All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</li> <li>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.</li> <li>No expenditures classified by function are presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The 2007 executive’s budget proposal does not include functional classification.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c” The executive budget proposal (loi de finance) includes functional classification. This is because administrative units overlap with functions. See “Comptes d’Affectations Speciales” p. 138, bulletin official n. 5487 bis, Loi de Finance 2007. However, these functional expenditures are not listed systematically.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I agree with Peer Reviewer Two on answer “c.”</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” as the budget proposal includes some functional classifications.</p>	<p><b>c</b></p>
--	-----------------

<p>3. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</li> <li>All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</li> <li>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.</li> <li>No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some expenditures are classified by economic classification.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C
<p>4. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.</li> <li>Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</li> <li>Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>No program-level data are presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See "note de presentation" de la loi de finances 2007.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some programs are being included and mentioned (e.g. Fondation Hassan II), however, not systematically.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C

<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.  b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.  c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  The estimation of many years were not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).  b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.  c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.  d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.  e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  The draft finance act comprises only the estimates for two years: those relating to the current year and those relating to the previous.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

7. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?
- All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
  - Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
  - Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
  - No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
  - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007

Comment:

The tax revenues are classified in four major categories:

- Direct taxes (IGR IS.)
- Customs duties
- Indirect taxes (VAT.)
- Registration and stamps

b

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response would be "a." Taxes are identified individually in the annex A of the public finance law.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be "a." 2007 estimates of sources of income are identified and quantified. Import duties, TVA and special taxes (wines, beer...) are listed individually, but no breakdown of income tax is provided.

**Researcher Response:** I chose answer "c" because some sources of tax revenue are identified individually.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "b" since almost all taxes are listed individually except the income tax which is not broken down.



8. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?
- All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
  - Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
  - Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
  - No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
  - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007

Comment:

Four non fiscal revenue categories are laid down:

- Monopolies and operations
- 'Domaine' revenues
- Privatisations
- Other incomes.

b

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response would be "a." Non-tax revenues are identified individually in annex A of the public finance law.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." While the Projet de Loi de Finance only includes (detailed) estimates for the year 2007, the 'note de presentation' includes (less detailed) sources of non-tax revenues for 2006 that are more than two-thirds.

**Researcher Response:** I chose to change my answer to "b" because non-tax revenue (least two-thirds) are identified individually.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "b" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*.

<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.  b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.  c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  No estimation was presented for a multi-year period</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).  b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.  c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.  d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.  e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  No multi-year or aggregate or detailed estimates were provided.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).</p> <p>b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.</p> <p>c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.</p> <p>d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The data presented concerns the amount of the debt recovered at the end of the years.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response would be “d.” Data published in the budget documentation reflects the outstanding debt at the end of BY-2</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	d
<p>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.</p> <p>b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> These payments represent the second basic component of the public expenditures. They are laid down in the public budget administrative classification.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</li> <li>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The government’s budget doesn’t present additional information on the structure of the debt.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Domestic vs. foreign debts are listed in the note de presentation. See ‘I.1.3 Depenses de la dette flottante et de la dette amortissable.’</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to “c” because some additional information is presented.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c.”</p>	<p>c</p>
--	----------

<p>14. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.</li> <li>Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport économique et financier .</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Among these hypotheses that are generally considered, there is: the rate of growth, agricultural production and the price of oil per barrel.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>15. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport économique et financier.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Only one scenario is taken into account. No sensitivity analysis is done. For instance, the 2007 finance annual budget finance law is based on the price of oil per barrel. Consequently, the impact of different macroeconomic hypotheses on the budget was not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport économique et financier.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information of this kind is presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information on this impact is presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<b>Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year</b>	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.</li> <li>Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.</li> <li>Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</li> <li>No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The administrative classification is set by the ministry both for this year and the previous year.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “a”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.”</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “a” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	a

<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</li> <li>b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</li> <li>c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.</li> <li>d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.”</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------



<p>20. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</li> <li>All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</li> <li>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.</li> <li>No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some expenditures are classified by economic classification</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>21. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.</li> <li>Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.</li> <li>Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.</li> <li>No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No individual programs are presented. Everything is laid down in an aggregate manner.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.</li> <li>b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.</li> <li>c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.</li> <li>d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The estimates are reported as they were initially presented. No updating has been operated in this regard.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.  b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.  c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  Such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “b”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” (Aggregate expenditures BY-2 are presented in the economic and financial report included in the budget documents.)</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to keep my answer “b” because the data is highly aggregated.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “a” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).</li> <li>b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.</li> <li>c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.</li> <li>d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The estimates of the years prior to last year are never presented in the budget documents or their annexes.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</li> <li>b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</li> <li>c. Before BY-3.</li> <li>d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Recent year presented for which expenditures is BY-2</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “a.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” I cannot find any aggregate or detailed data on actual outcomes in preceding budget years. The rapport financier et économique “Quatrieme Partie” discusses recent trends, as does the ‘note de presentation’ in ‘budget generale’ but it does not present them in a comprehensive manner and mostly refers to preceding budgets rather than actual outcomes. The In Year Report Dec 2006 discusses expenditures (and revenues) for BY- 1 and -2 in a fashion that is not compatible with the budget proposal loi de finances.”</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to “d.” because no actual data for all expenditure are presented.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d.”</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.</li> <li>Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.</li> <li>Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.</li> <li>No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Prior year's data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." The loi de finances contains 'credits for budget year' and 'resources for budget year 2007' which follow the same classification. However, the supporting documents do not list any prior budgets (-1 or -2) in a way that is comparable with the current budget, only aggregates are presented (see in year report Dec 2006 and rapport "financier et économique.")</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to "c" because in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, "c."</p>	<p>c</p>
--	----------

<p>27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</li> <li>b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.</li> <li>c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.</li> <li>d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The tax revenues are broken down in 4 major categories:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Direct taxes</li> <li>- Customs duties</li> <li>- Indirect taxes</li> <li>- Registration and stamps</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</li> <li>Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.</li> <li>Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.</li> <li>No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> These sources are generally come in four broad types:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The revenues of the state monopolies and operations</li> <li>- The ‘domaine’ revenues</li> <li>- The proceeds of privatizations</li> <li>- Other incomes.</li> </ul> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Some individual non-tax revenues may be reviewed in the reports, but the tables present only these four broad categories.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to “d.”</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d.”</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------



<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.</li> <li>b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.</li> <li>c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.</li> <li>d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All the estimates of the revenue are updated after at least 36 months.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.  b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.  c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  The revenue estimates are presented only for the current year and BY-1 and never before.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “a”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” Estimates for BY-2 and actual revenues for BY-3, BY-4, BY-5, BY-6 are presented in the economic and financial report included in the budget documentation.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “a” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).</li> <li>b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.</li> <li>c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.</li> <li>d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal Rapport économique et financier.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> These estimates are not presented, whether aggregate or detailed.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “d.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Estimates for BY-2 and actual revenues for BY-3, BY-4, BY-5, BY-6 are presented in the economic and financial report included in the budget documentation, for major individual taxes.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” In-year reports list them, and differentiate between tax and non-tax revenues. However they make comparisons between months in BY-2, e.g. Dec 2006 vs. Dec 2005, and it is not clearly presented.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I agree with both peer reviewers on answer “b.”</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “b.”</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</li> <li>b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</li> <li>c. Before BY-3.</li> <li>d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Three years prior to the budget year</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” (BY-3= “Three years prior to the budget year”)</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I agree with peer reviewer one on answer “b.”</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.</li> <li>b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.</li> <li>d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport sur la dette publique interne et externe 2007 which includes important details such : rate of interest , the average duration of debt...</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Information is presented but some important details are excluded.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “b.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> Concerning the budget documentation a more appropriate response could be “c.”</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” because general information on the national debt is presented and available, although it might not be specific and detailed.</p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------

<p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</li> <li>b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</li> <li>c. Before BY-3.</li> <li>d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The most recent year is BY-2.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “a”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The latest figures are that of October 2004, i.e. BY-3, see in year report for October 2005.”</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to “b” because the most recent year is BY-3.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<b>Comprehensiveness</b>	
<p>35. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It relates particularly to the Hassan II Fund.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C
<p>36. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> These transfers relate particularly to part of some tax proceeds like those of VAT, Business tax (patente) ... transferred to territorial collectivities.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C

<p>37. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport sur les entreprises et établissements publics For exemples : See annexe 5 du Rapport sur les entreprises et établissement publics pour l'année de 2007 : Transferts de l'Etat aux Etablissements et aux entreprises publics .</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Only the overall amounts of the subsidies and proceeds levied on these companies are presented in the budget documents.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C
<p>38. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Information is presented but it lacks important details. For example: The budget of the Caisse de Compensation is summarized in the budget document.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C



<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on financial assets is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some aggregate information on the financial assets of the state is presented in an appended budget document entitled: report on public companies and institutions.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>c</p>
<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Only the financial aspects of the assets of the State are taken into account in the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some information is presented.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” I don’t see any information on contingent liabilities.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to keep my answer “c” because I refer to Caisse Centrale de Garantie.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>c</p>
--	----------

<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No. Information on future liabilities is not presented</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</li> <li>b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.</li> <li>c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</li> <li>d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information of this type is presented in the budget documents. It is very difficult if not impossible for the public to get this information outside the budget documents.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport sur les dépenses fiscales</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There was a promise that was made with regard to the possibility of presenting this information on the tax expenditures as of the finance act of 2006. The fiscal loses were estimated at 21.4 milliards de dirhams, half of which comes from the VAT. This represents 18.9% of fiscal income of the 2006 budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All earmarked revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>No earmarked revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In practice the overall revenues assigned or allocated are tracked in the Treasury. Special Accounts make up one of the components of the State budget. (See comptes spéciaux du Trésor.)</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “a”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b” (own revenue of a few agencies are not included in the budget documentation).</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>What do you think the final answer should be:</u></b></p> <p>I suggest the answer should remain as I indicated in the questionnaire “a”</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to keep my answer “a.” [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “a” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>a</p>
---	----------

<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</li> <li>b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</li> <li>c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</li> <li>d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget or any other official document doesn't provide any such information to the public.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<b>The Budget Narrative &amp; Performance Monitoring</b>	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The information of this sort is not presented. Supporting documents situate the budget in an overall macroeconomic context but remain very vague and full of general views that do not make a link between budget and policy.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “d”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” In the note de presentation, links are made but they remain vague.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to “c” because some information is presented</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” because the budget is actually linked to general policy goals but in broad and vague ways.</p>	<p>C</p>



<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.</li> <li>b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</li> <li>c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.</li> <li>d. No non-financial data are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No non-financial data are provided.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “d”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The supporting documents, especially in “Note de presentation” concerning the socio-economic program INDH, indicate beneficiaries and other non-financial data.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to “c” because non financial data is provided on less than two-thirds of expenditure.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------

<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.</li> <li>b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.</li> <li>c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.</li> <li>d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Non-financial data are not provided.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.</li> <li>b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</li> <li>c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>d. No performance indicators are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some performance indicators are presented.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” For a performance indicator to be valid, it needs to be explicitly discussed and linked to a particular program. No such information is made available or discussed in the supporting documents.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to keep my answer “c” because Health Ministry is an example of where some performance indicators are presented.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All performance indicators are well designed.</li> <li>b. Most performance indicators are well designed.</li> <li>c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.</li> <li>d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” I do not see any well-designed performance indicators.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------

54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation?
- a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
  - b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
  - c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
  - d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
  - e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

See Projet de Loi de Finances 2007

Comment:

Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response could be "d." The government is preparing few performance contracts, but the results are not yet effective.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be "d."

**Researcher Response:** I chose to keep my answer "c" because of examples like Approche genre, Gestion basée sur les résultats.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*.

d

<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</p> <p>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is very scattered and general: drinking water supply system, rural electrification.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
<p><b>Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis &amp; Monitoring</b></p>	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	

<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Information is presented but some details are excluded.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is impossible or at least hard to get even by professionals and experts, let alone the general public.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d



<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is impossible for the general public to get hold of such information.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This is information that remains confidential and hard to get even for public finance researchers and professionals.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.</li> <li>b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.</li> <li>c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.</li> <li>d. No, it does not provide a summary.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.</li> <li>b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.</li> <li>c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.</li> <li>d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Executive's Budget Proposal</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such document is published.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <p>a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.  b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.  c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.  d. No, definitions are not provided.  e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  See lexique  <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAIL_INTERNET_MFP/VE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF2006/CORPS%20DE%20LA%20LF%202006/FONDEMENT%20JURIDIQUE/LEXIQUE_BUDGETAIRE.HTM">http://www.finances.gov.ma/pls/portal/docs/PAGE/PORTAIL_INTERNET_MFP/VE_PUBLIQUE/LOI%20DE%20FINANCES/LF2006/CORPS%20DE%20LA%20LF%202006/FONDEMENT%20JURIDIQUE/LEXIQUE_BUDGETAIRE.HTM</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  The definitions of budget terms are provided</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “a”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” I cannot find any definitions the documents cited nor on the ministry’s website.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “a” because the definitions of the budget terms are sufficiently provided.</p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.</li> <li>Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.</li> <li>Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.</li> <li>No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The right to access to government information has not been codified.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</li> <li>In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</li> <li>In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is extremely hard even for the professionals to get this information on individual programs. This information that the general has no access to remains general and aggregate.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</li> <li>b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</li> <li>c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This type is not available and remains very confidential</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

## **Section Three: The Budget Process**

<b>The Budget Process</b>	
<b>Executive's Formulation of the Budget</b>	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The release date is set in permanent law.</li> <li>The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</li> <li>The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</li> <li>The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See: Bulletins officiels</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The date of publication is not known exactly in advance. In general it is published few days after its adoption by the parliament (between the last week of December and the first week of January).</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.</li> <li>Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, a timetable is not issued to the public.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See loi organique des Finances</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The timetable is published with insufficient detail.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.</li> <li>b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.</li> <li>c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.</li> <li>d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive adheres to most of the keydates in its timetable.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.</li> <li>b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.</li> <li>d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See loi organique des Finances .</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The preparation is done exclusively by the executive.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d



<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.</li> <li>b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.</li> <li>d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The public is never consulted in this respect. The budget priorities are all set exclusively by the executive.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.</li> <li>b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.</li> <li>c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No pre-budget statement is published.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An explanation is presented.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “b”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> Response “d” would be more appropriate, because there is no published pre-budget statement (see item 71).</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I suggest the answer should be changed to, “c” because of the information derived from lettre de cadrage budgétaire annuelle.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no prior report of this type.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<b>Legislative Approval of the Budget</b>	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See the Loi organique des finances</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The legislature receives the budget between three months and six weeks of the start of the financial year.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.</li> <li>Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.</li> <li>Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The public does not have access to these hearings.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</li> <li>Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</li> <li>Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</li> <li>No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some hearings are held.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c

<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The public has no access to these hearings.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.</li> <li>b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.</li> <li>d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The public is excluded from the work of the committees.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <p>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</p> <p>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are sometimes not appropriate or timely.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <p>a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</p> <p>b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations.</p> <p>c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</p> <p>d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Constiution (art 51 ) and Loi organique des Finances (art 40)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The legislature has limited authority. Legislature proposals that result in the rise of public expenditures or the diminution of revenues are not allowed: Art 40 de loi oeganique des Finances.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c

<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.</li> <li>b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</li> <li>c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.</li> <li>d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See adopted budget</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some details are presented in approved budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<b>Executive's Implementation of the Budget</b>	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</li> <li>b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</li> <li>c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</li> <li>d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapports de la Trésorerie Générale</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In year reports are realized every month.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> The in-year reports are organized according to the economic classification, but neither by administrative units nor by functions</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.</li> <li>b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</li> <li>c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>d. No in-year reports are released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapports de la Trésorerie Générale</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In year reports cover at least two-thirds.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> The in-year reports are organized according to the economic classification, but neither by administrative units nor by functions</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p><b>b</b></p>
--	-----------------



<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail.</li> <li>The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</li> <li>The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals.</li> <li>The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapports de la Trésorerie Générale</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Data published is limited to the administrative classification.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response will be “d.” The “rapports de la Trésorerie générale”(Treasury’s reports) available on the Web are <u>not</u> organized by administrative units.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” If the document the researcher refers to (The Rapports de la Trésorerie) is the same as the monthly report entitled “Bulletin mensuel de statistiques des finances publiques,” then no reports organized by administrative unit are included.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I agree with both peer reviewers on answer “d.”</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.</li> <li>b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</li> <li>c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapports de la Trésorerie Générale</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Overall comparisons per major expenditure categories are made.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.</li> <li>b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.</li> <li>c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.</li> <li>d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> Comment : Monthly reports are published by the General Treasury See: <a href="http://www.finances.gov.ma/Chiffres/tgr/stati_fin_pub_tgr.htm">http://www.finances.gov.ma/Chiffres/tgr/stati_fin_pub_tgr.htm</a></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.</li> <li>b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.</li> <li>c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.</li> <li>d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapports de la Trésorerie Générale</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In-year reports cover two-thirds.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.</li> <li>b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.</li> <li>c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.</li> <li>d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The comparison is done for at least two-thirds of public revenue sources.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.</li> <li>b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.</li> <li>c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.</li> <li>d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport sur la dette publique</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C
<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</li> <li>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapports sur la dette publique</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some information is published in an occasional fashion (press conference, reports and studies on the venue of the ministry of finance and privatization, etc.).</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C

<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.</li> <li>b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.</li> <li>c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.</li> <li>d. In-year reports are not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Monthly reports are realized within two months or less.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.</li> <li>b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.</li> <li>c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.</li> <li>b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</li> <li>c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</li> <li>d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.</li> <li>b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</li> <li>c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).</li> <li>d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid -year review of the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.</li> <li>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</li> <li>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</li> <li>No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid -year review of the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.</li> <li>Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.</li> <li>Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.</li> <li>No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from legislature.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.</li> <li>b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.</li> <li>c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.</li> <li>d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some examples well known and proven in this field were reported during the previous year. For example: Marchés de la Carte Nationale Biometrique ou du Train à Grande Vitesse.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).</li> <li>b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a



<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.</li> <li>b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.</li> <li>c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.</li> <li>d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.</li> <li>b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.</li> <li>d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Projet de loi de Finances</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The chapter of incidental expenses and the provisional allocations that have been assigned to no department is provided for in conformity with article 42 of "La loi organique des Finances." But the specific use of such funds is not known and controlled by the parliament.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "a"</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response would be "d." As noted in the comment the specific use of contingency funds is not controlled by Parliament.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, "d" as the total amount is approved before spending, although the specific use is not approved by the parliament.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<b>Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution</b>	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>The executive does not release a year-end report.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See loi de reglement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Reports are released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” There is no publicly available year-end report that includes a discussion of actual outcome – aggregates excepted.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	d

<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.</li> <li>b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</li> <li>c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</li> <li>d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See loi de régleme nt</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The data on actual outcomes are audited.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “a.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Although there is an auditing institution TGR, it releases monthly reports of aggregate data and no detailed audits are made available to the public.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See loi de règlement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An explanation is given but not insufficient.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” In the TGR reports that are released, no explanations are given and no detailed numbers are provided.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> [No additional comment on this was provided]</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.</li> <li>b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).</li> <li>c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).</li> <li>d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See lois de reglement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An aggregated explanation is given.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See lois de reglement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An aggregated explanation is given.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "c."</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be "d." It is so marginal in the report released that it is meaningless.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to keep my answer "c" because an explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See lois de reglement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This kind of explanation is not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See lois de reglement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This kind of explanation is not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d



<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See lois de reglement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This kind of difference between the original performance indicators and the actual is not explained.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See loi de reglement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This kind of explanation is not given.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> See loi de règlement</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This kind of explanation is not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p><b>C</b></p>
<p><i>The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution</i></p>	

<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport de la cour des comptes .</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The audits realized by the cour de comptes are terribly outdated and not systematic – the latest released in 2006 cover the period of 2000-2002.”</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to “d” because final account are not completed within 24 months.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.</li> <li>b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.</li> <li>c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.</li> <li>d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The reports have not been released to the public.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.</li> <li>b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such reports are not released to the public.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> Additional comment: The reports are not released but a summary is published in the Court of Accounts activity report which is available on the Web.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <p>a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.</p> <p>b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The king appoints and dismisses the president of the Tribunal of Accounts who represents the supreme oversight institution.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <p>a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> See Rapport de la cour des comptes .</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI does not audit extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.</li> <li>b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.</li> <li>c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.</li> <li>d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Its budget is included in the budget projections in the framework of finance act. Its resources remain largely below the necessary needs to ensure all its missions.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.</li> <li>c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.</li> <li>d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of ther security sector.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The researcher seems to have made a mistake judging from his comment.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to change my answer to “d” because the SAI does not audits of the security sector.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d.”</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.</li> <li>b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.</li> <li>c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.</li> <li>d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable.</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.</li> <li>b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.</li> <li>c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.</li> <li>d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Audit reports are not scrutinized.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d



<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.</li> <li>b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.</li> <li>c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.</li> <li>d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.</li> <li>b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A report is not produced.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.</li> <li>b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.</li> <li>d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Legislators are not provided audit reports on secrets items, or secret programs are not audited.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------