International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

NIGERIA

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC  20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org
This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Engr. Ralph Ndigwe
Organization: CIRDDOC, NIGERIA
Address: 16, 5TH AVENUE, CITY LAYOUT, ENUGU, NIGERIA.
Telephone: 234-8052811250
E-mail: rndigwe@yahoo.com; cirddoc@aol.com
International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
NIGERIA

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal
 Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond
 Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year
 Comprehensiveness
 The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring
 Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

Section Three: The Budget Process
 Executive’s Formulation of the Budget
 Legislative Approval of the Budget
 Executive’s Implementation of the Budget
 Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Year Used</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Full Title, Date, and Internet Link</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>2007 BUDGET SPEECH, October 11, 2006 (54 PAGES)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>2007 DRAFT APPROPRIATION BILL, October 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>MINISTRIES MEDIUM TERM SECTOR STRATEGIES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Produced, but Not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>DETAILED WORKINGS OF OVERHEADS AND PERSONNEL COSTS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Produced, but Not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>APPROPRIATION BILL 2007, December 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>BUDGET DETAILS OF THE 2007 APPROPRIATION ACT (449 pgs)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Review</td>
<td>Produced, but Not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>Produced, but Not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Documents</td>
<td>MINISTERIAL PRESS BRIEFING ON THE 2007 BUDGET (<a href="http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/2007Minister'sBriefing.vDG.2-new.ppt">http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/2007Minister'sBriefing.vDG.2-new.ppt</a>; also widely publicized in the media)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant Ministries &amp; Departments</td>
<td>FEDERAL MINISTRY OF FINANCE (FMF); THE BUDGET OFFICE OF THE FEDERATION; NATIONAL PLANNING COMMISSION. CENTRAL BANK OF NIGERIA (CBN)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
<td>Pre-budget</td>
<td>Main document</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-budget</td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities*</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS</th>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities*</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked “not applicable/other,” please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. **Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?**

   a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.
   b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.
   c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
   d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

2. **Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?**

   a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.
   d. No expenditures classified by function are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET) or TO THE BUDGET SPEECH http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf

   **Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET) or TO THE BUDGET SPEECH http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

   a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
   b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No program-level data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET) or TO THE BUDGET SPEECH http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) which is not available to the public

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” In Nigeria, there are Medium Term Sector Strategies (MTSS) that cover 2007-2009. Annual budgets for Ministries Departments and Agencies derive from the specific MTSS for the period. Much as the MTSS is not a budget document per se, the budget relates and is based on it, to that extent, the researcher is wrong. The MTSS is not publicly available as you need to have personal contacts and connections to access it.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “b” to reflect that the information is not available to the public during the time when the executive’ budget proposal is under consideration in the legislature. Moreover, the researcher and reviewer both note that the MTSS document is not available to the public.
6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Multi-year estimates are not provided in the budget proposal

Comment:
You can find this in Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) page 17 (Aggregate expenditure levels 2007-2009); pg 21-22 (2007-2009 expenditure envelopes). But this document is not available.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
   d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET) or TO THE BUDGET SPEECH
http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf Pg. 28- Non-oil Revenue

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET) or TO THE BUDGET SPEECH

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET)

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET) or TO THE BUDGET SPEECH http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf

Comment:
**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?

   a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
   b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
   c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
   d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Total Debt Stock and debt service obligation as at June 2006 are stated. Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET) or TO THE BUDGET SPEECH http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf Pg. 32- Debt Service

Comment:
**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Citation: | Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation (PUBLIC BUT NOT ON INTERNET) or TO THE BUDGET SPEECH  
http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf (Pg. 33-34- EXTERNAL DEBT) |
| Comment: | NO INTEREST PAYMENTS ON THE DEBT ARE PRESENTED IN THE BUDGET, JUST TOTAL DEBT. |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: |   |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: | b |
13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
The executive budget does not present additional information regarding the breakdown of government debt; they are presented as total amounts. They can be found in other publications of government agencies which might not be available.

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The Debt Management Office (DMO) provides on its website [http://www.dmo.gov.ng](http://www.dmo.gov.ng) additional information on national debt. The DMO analysis is also publicly available on the internet and even the budget speech by the President to the National Assembly provides such details.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “d” as the specific intention of Questions 1-55 in the questionnaire is to evaluate the information available to the public in a country’s annual consolidated budget presentation (that is, the executive’s budget proposal and its supporting documents.)
14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

   a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.
   b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
See also Budget Speech pg. 25-29

Comment:
ALSO IN Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) pages 10 (table 4- Key Assumptions & Targets and See also Budget Speech pg. 25-29), WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
A more appropriate response to this question would be “a” as the executive budget speech discusses extensively these key assumptions leaving out no necessary details.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency across countries.
15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.
   
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   
   d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.
   
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: Budget Speech (Impact - Pg 50-52) http://www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf

Comment: See Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) pages 3-10 and, WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” After the President reads the budget speech, the Hon. Minister of Finance and sometimes the Governor of the Central Bank of Nigeria does a detailed sensitivity analysis of all macroeconomic choices and assumptions.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency across countries.
16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
See Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) pages 3-10 and, WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The discrepancy is based on importance or otherwise of details and this is subjective. Much as the information may not be totally all that there are to know, I think that the ones left out are not so important.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency across countries.
17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
See Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) pages 3-10 and, WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b” for exactly a similar analysis of my response to question 16.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency across countries.
### Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year

18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

   a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.
   b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.
   c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
   d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation PRODUCED AND PUBLICLY AVAILABLE BUT NOT ON THE INTERNET

   **Comment:**
   HIS INFORMATION IS ALSO CONTAINED IN THE FISCAL STRATEGY PAPER, WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.
   d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation PRODUCED AND PUBLICLY AVAILABLE BUT NOT ON THE INTERNET

   **Comment:**
   HIS INFORMATION IS ALSO CONTAINED IN THE FISCAL STRATEGY PAPER, WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation PRODUCED AND PUBLICLY AVAILABLE BUT NOT ON THE INTERNET

Comment:
THIS INFORMATION IS ALSO CONTAINED IN THE FISCAL STRATEGY PAPER, WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
   b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
   c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
   d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation PRODUCED AND PUBLICLY AVAILABLE BUT NOT ON THE INTERNET

Comment:
THIS INFORMATION IS ALSO CONTAINED IN THE FISCAL STRATEGY PAPER, WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation PRODUCED AND PUBLICLY AVAILABLE BUT NOT ON THE INTERNET

   Comment:
   THIS INFORMATION IS ALSO CONTAINED IN THE FISCAL STRATEGY PAPER, WHICH IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pgs 17 -22, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:  
   This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pgs. 17-22, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:  
   This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pg. 7 (Chart 1 & Table 2), HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

   a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.
   b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.
   c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.
   d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pg. 8 (table 3), HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” such comparison and deviations exist and are presented and the researcher agrees in his comment and I see a contradiction between his comment and response. The issue of availability to the public is different from existence of such documents.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency across countries.
27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pg. 14, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pg. 16, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>29.</strong> In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>30.</strong> In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pg. 16, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) pgs 11-16, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pg. 16, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO THE PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
   b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
   c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
   d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) pgs 18-19, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” While presenting the 2007 budget proposal to the National Assembly the then President in reviewing the 2006 budget said inter alia “for Debt Service, implementation stood at N159 billion or 55% of the appropriated sum of N290 billion”

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” as per the researcher’s comment.

34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pg. 18, HOWEVER THIS IS NOT AVAILABLE TO PUBLIC

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
### Comprehensiveness

35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?

   - a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   - b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.
   - c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   - d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
   - e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   The budget does not give information on extra-budgetary funds.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?

   - a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   - b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.
   - c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   - d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.
   - e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   This is presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper (Pre-Budget Statement) Pg. 15, Table 9 (summary of Outflows from the Federation Account)

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” the Federal Ministry of Finance publishes in popular media details of allocations to all states and local government councils from the federation account every Month. This is a major budget support documentation.

   **IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “d” as the specific intention of Questions 1-55 in the questionnaire are to evaluate the information available to the public in a country’s annual consolidated budget presentation (that is, the executive’s budget proposal and its supporting documents.)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</th>
<th>b</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td>Refer to the Executive budget proposal of the Federation at PUBLICLY AVAILABLE, BUT NOT ON THE INTERNET</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td>The Budget states key transfers to public corporations and parastatals. eg. pg 496 of the Executive's Budget proposal on Nigeria Railway Corporation. THE HARD COPY.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</th>
<th>d</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td>No information presented on quasi-fiscal activities in the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>39.</strong> Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on financial assets is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td>No information is presented in the Budget on financial Assets held by the Federal Government.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>40.</strong> Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td>The Executive's Budget Proposal does not present information on non-financial assets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

   a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Refer to 2006 Presidents budget speech at www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf

   Comment:
   Information on aggregate key expenditure arrears such as debt service charges, pension arrears, and payment to contractors is presented in the budget proposal.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   This information is only presented in the Fiscal Strategy Paper Pgs 18 - 19, which is produced but not available to the public.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
### 43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

- a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Refer to 2006 Presidents budget speech(Pg. 46- pensions) at www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf and the Executive's Budget proposal PUBLICLY AVAILABLE BUT NOT ON THE INTERNET

**Comment:**
The Executive's budget proposal contains information on future liabilities, especially pension liabilities.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

### 44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

- a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
- b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
- c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
- d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Details on donor assistance is not contained in the budget proposa or supporting documents. Donor assistance to Nigeria represents less than 1% of the annual budget of the country.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>45.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The Executive's budget proposal does not yet provide information on tax expenditures.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>46.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
Refer to 2006 Presidents budget speech at www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf(Pg. 27- REVENUE PROJECTIONS)

**Comment:**
All earmarked revenues are clearly identified in the budget document above.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Security Votes are not clearly stated in the budget. Exact amount not available to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring

48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?

a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.

b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.

c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.

d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to the President's 2006 budget speech at www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf

Comment:
The President's Budget Speech highlight the key policy goals and their implications for the 2007 budget.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” the presentation in the president’s budget speech is not detailed but the ministry of Finance or the Central Bank of Nigeria would normally provide a budget breakdown including policy frameworks that underpin the appropriations and this breakdown is publicly available.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries.
49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented in any of the publicly available budget documents.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?

   a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.
   b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.
   d. No non-financial data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No information on the number of beneficiaries for expenditure programs.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>51.</th>
<th>Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>52.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Performance indicators are presented for all programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No performance indicators are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

Performance Measures and Indicators are not specified for each program in any of the publicly available budget documents.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All performance indicators are well designed.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Most performance indicators are well designed.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Performance Measures and Indicators are not specified for each program in any of the publicly available budget documents.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Performance Measures and Indicators are not specified for each program in any of the publicly available budget documents.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to the President's 2006 budget speech at www.budgetoffice.gov.ng/pub/bs2006.pdf (Pg 44- MDGs)

Comment:
The MTSS, an essential component of the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework represents a crucial link in the process of translating the long-term poverty reduction strategies of the Federal Government as articulated in the NEEDS (National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy) and the MDGs, into the spending reality of the Annual Budget. This document is produced but not available to the public yet.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

**Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring**

*Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

The Government through the media often informs the public of the tax rates and fees for government revenue e.g. the custom duties, VAT, etc. The rates are also contained in the fiscal policy document released early in the year by the budget office.

But as for Production Sharing Agreements, Joint Venture Agreements, Stabilization Agreements, etc. that government entities enter into with private companies in oil, gas or mining sectors, they are not made available to the public. In the immediate past, activities in the extractive industries have been shrouded in secrecy in spite of efforts by the National Assembly to make them accountable. Maybe with the change of government in Nigeria we might begin to see some changes.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>57.</th>
<th><strong>Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
This is provided by the Tax Authorities in their publications.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The choice of “d” contradicts the comment. Moreover, in this section, the instruction says the information need not be included in the executive budget proposal or budget supporting documents but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency across countries.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>58.</th>
<th><strong>Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is usually made public by the Government, and it often generates public discussion, e.g. the Debt Relief Package from the Paris Club that provides that Nigeria pay off $12.4 billion for final exit from the Paris Club.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Information on the conditions of donor assistance is not presented by government, though information on donor assistance is easily available through the media.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, it does not provide a summary.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation: APPROPRIATION BILL 2007</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The 2007 Budget is summarized in the Appropriation Bill 2007, but it is not very informative. For instance it does not classify the budget into salaries and wages, overheads, etc. It presented only the recurrent and capital expenditure of the Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The government does not produce a citizens budget yet.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?

   a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.
   b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, definitions are not provided.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
There are no non-technical definitions of budget terms.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
63. Do citizens have the right *in law* to access government information, including budget information?

a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation:*

Comment: A Freedom of Information (FOI) Bill was passed early in the year but the former President, who left office in May 2007, refused to accent to it owing to little disagreement with the house on naming the Bill. This would have given the citizens the right in law to access government information. The Bill has just again been forwarded to the incumbent in July 2007 and his accent is being awaited.

*Peer Reviewer One Comment:*  

*Peer Reviewer Two Comment:*
<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

Comment:
It is hardly possible for an individual to request and obtain information on disaggregated program expenditure.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Financial information on expenditures in a more highly disaggregated format is contained in the digest of statistics of agencies and units of ministries, which are available to the public though not widely circulated. For example, National Universities Commission (NUC) Statistical Digest provides highly disaggregated information on expenditures of federal government hospitals and health centers. See NUC Digest of Statistics, various issues.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries.
65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comment:
It is hardly possible for an individual to access this sort of information since there is no right under the law for such disclosure.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:
A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Such information can be found in the digest of statistics and other publications of units and programs of ministries.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries.
Section Three: The Budget Process
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Budget Process</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Formulation of the Budget</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The release date is set in permanent law.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
The executive seeks an appointment with legislature in advance for the presentation of the Annual Budget

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Citizens get to know about the release date just a day or two before it is presented to the legislature, though the media would have speculated about the presentation a week or two earlier.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency across countries.
67. **Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive’s budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget’s formulation)?**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, a timetable is not issued to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
This was confirmed from the Budget office (Mr. Adeniran) that the timetable is for internal use and not released to the public.

**Comment:**
The time table is only given to the MDAs (Ministries, Departments & Agencies) and not to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

68. **Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?**

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The public is unable to know since the timetable is not released to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comment:
Ministries, Departments and Agencies of the executive had consultations with their relevant oversight and appropriation committees in the legislature to determine budget priorities. These committees include members of both the ruling party and the opposition. Mr. Solomon Ntuen (Secretary Senate Appropriation and Finance committee) confirmed this to me when I interviewed him in August 2007 in Abuja.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

   a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
   b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
   c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
   d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Comment:
There are no public consultations on determining budget priorities. But when the budget is prepared consultations are held with certain stakeholders like the Civil Society Organisations.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
### 71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?

- a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.
- b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.
- c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.
- d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The Fiscal Strategy Paper is usually released between August and September, but not to the public. The Fiscal year starts January 1st.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

### 72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Yes it does but not released to the public yet.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Yes but the document is not released to the public. It is only available to the MDAs(Ministries, Departments & Agencies).

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legislative Approval of the Budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

Comment:
The budget is presented to the legislature by October preceeding the Budget Year that begins in January.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” To take a few examples, the legislature received the budget as follows: 2008 budget (8 November 2007); 2007 budget (11 October 2006); 2006 budget (6 December 2005). See http://www.dawodu.com/speech.htm and *The Guardian* (Lagos), 9 November 2007, p.1.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The legislature received the 2007 budget proposal from the executive on Oct 11 2006 about 10 weeks to the January 01 2007 start date.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “b” to maintain consistency across countries.
75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?

| a. | Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. |
| b. | Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. |
| c. | Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. |
| d. | No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. |
| e. | Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation:

Comment:
In the public hearings the executive defend their provisions publicly but no testimonies are heard from the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

| a. | Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. |
| b. | Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. |
| c. | Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. |
| d. | No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. |
| e. | Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation:

Comment:
These testimonies are also held before the Media so citizens can follow if they tune in.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
The public does not give testimonies in the legislative Budget Sessions with MDAs (Ministries, Departments & Agencies).

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: 

78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
They do not release any reports to the public but the hearings are usually transmitted live or delayed on radio and television so that the public can follow the proceedings.

Peer Reviewer One Comment: 

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: 
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>79.</th>
<th>Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

This was confirmed to me by the Secretary Senate Committee on Appropriation and finance - Mr. Solomon Ntuen when I visited his office in August 2007.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>80.</th>
<th>Does the legislature have authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget, with some limitations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the legislature does not have any authority <em>in law</em> to amend the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

Refer to Section 59(1)a of the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria on the mode of exercising Federal Legislative power on budget-related bills. This provision refers to "an appropriation bill or a supplementary appropriation bill, including any other bill for the payment, issue or withdrawal from the Consolidated Revenue Fund or any other publi fund of the Federation of any money charged thereon or any alteration in the amount of such a payment, issue or withdrawal."

**Comment:**

The 2007 budget was ammended by the Legislature from N2,266,394,423,477 to N2,309,223,949,983.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?

- a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.
- b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
- c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.
- d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Refer to DETAILS OF THE 2007 APPROPRIATION ACT (449 pgs)

Comment:
The approved budget includes some program level details.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

**Executive’s Implementation of the Budget**

82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

- a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.
- b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.
- c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.
- d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

**Comment:**
Produced but not available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---
83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

   a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.
   b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
   c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit?

   a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail.
   b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals.
   d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

   a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.
   b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
   c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

   a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.
   b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.
   c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.
   d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 87 | What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections? | a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.  
b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.  
c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.  
d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | Citation:  
Comment:  
In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public. | d |

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| 88 | Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year? | a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.  
b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.  
c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.  
d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | Citation:  
Comment:  
In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public. | d |

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>89.</th>
<th>Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

Comment: In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>90.</th>
<th>Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

Comment: In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer One Comment</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</th>
<th>IBP Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)? | a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.  
b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.  
c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.  
d. In-year reports are not released.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | | | | | d |

Citation:

Comment:
In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” because our financial guidelines provide for in year reports and actually they are produced but not available.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” to reflect the lack of public availability of in-year reports.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Comment</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer One Comment</th>
<th>Peer Reviewer Two Comment</th>
<th>IBP Comment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted? | a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.  
b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.  
c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.  
d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | | | | | d |

Citation:

Comment:
In-Year Reports are produced but not released to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
**93.** Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Mid-Year Review are produced but not released to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**94.** What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The executive does not release mid-year review to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Mid-Year Review are produced but not released to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

---

96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain *minimal* level specified in law or regulation)?

a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Statutorily the executive is supposed to seek approval before virement but this is not always the case with the past administration.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.

b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.

c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.

d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Refer to the Nigerian Maritime Authority (NMA) Isreali Contract Scandal allegedly involving Andy Uba Snr. Sp. Asst. to the President. The case of BPE's sale of public companies like the refineries also readily comes to mind. It is strongly believed that due process was not followed by the previous administration.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:
A more appropriate response to this question would be “c” Former Minister of Finance (2003-2006), Dr. (Mrs.) Ngozi Okonjo-Iweala and Director-General of Due Process, Dr. (Mrs.) Oby Ezekwesili informed the panel of the House of Representatives probing the power sector that the President granted waivers of due process in all the $16 billion contracts awarded. The probe has revealed that even blacklisted companies were awarded contracts. Many Nigerians believe that the same could be true of many other contracts awarded between 1999 and 2007 and therefore, are calling for a probe of other contracts awarded by the Obasanjo eight-year Administration. For example, the Conference of Nigerian Political Parties (CNPP) has urged the Auditor-General to produce audit report for 2007. Nigerian Tribune (Ibadan) 14 April 2008; The Punch (Lagos), 28 March 2008, p.1.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries.
98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Most governments in Nigeria submit supplementary budget at the end of the year after the money had been spent but in some instances the federal government had submitted supplementary budget before spending.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Insufficient information is available to the public about supplementary budgets.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  
Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
### Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution

101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The executive does not release a year-end report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No. year-End Reports are made available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
No. year-End Reports are made available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No. year-End Reports are made available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?

   a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
   b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
   c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
   d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No. year-End Reports are made available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No year-End Reports are made available to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No year-End Reports are made available to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:  
Comment:  
No. year-End Reports are made available to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:  

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:  

108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:  
Comment:  
No. year-End Reports are made available to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:  

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:  

109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No. year-End Reports are made available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
No. year-End Reports are made available to the public.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

*The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution*
111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.
d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Final audited accounts of MDAs (Ministries, Departments & Agencies) are not released to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?

a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.
b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.
c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.
d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Audit reports are not released to the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment: Indeed, auditing of government expenditures has taken place only once (in 2002) since 1999

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?

   a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report’s content.
   b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   Audit reports are not released to the public.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

   a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
   b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   Refer to the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria-Sections 169, 170 and 171(1&2).

   **Comment:**
   The President appoints the Auditor-General of the Federation and retains the power to remove the Auditor-General.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

   **IBP Comment:**
   The head of the SAI can be removed only by the legislature, and not by executive’s initiative. See article 87 of the Constitution: “A person holding the office of the Auditor-General for the Federation shall be removed from office by the President acting on an address supported by two-thirds majority of the Senate praying that he be so removed for inability to discharge the functions of his-office (whether arising from infirmity of mind or body or any other cause) or for misconduct.
115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
The audited Federal Government account is not released to the public. The last time an auditor-general tried to do that he was removed by the former President.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Section 85(2) of the 1999 Constitution provides that the Public accounts of the Federation and of all Offices and Courts of the Federation be audited and reported on by the Auditor General.

Comment:
The Office of the Auditor-General of the Federation has the powers to audit the public accounts of the government.

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Section 85(3) of the 1999 Constitution severely limits the power of SAI.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency of assumptions across countries.
117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
The budget for the auditor-General's Office is usually inconsistent with its needs to fulfill its mandate.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
refer to section 85(3) of the 1999 Federal Constitution.

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?

a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.

b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.

c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.

d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.

e. Not applicable.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No not at all.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.

b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.

c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.

d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation:</th>
<th>See section 85(5) of the 1999 constitution.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>The Auditor-General shall, within ninety days of receipt of the Accountant-General's financial statement, submit his reports under this section to each House of the National Assembly and each House shall cause the reports to be considered by a committee of the House of the National Assembly responsible for public accounts.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The only 2002 audit report was not scrutinized.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency across countries.
121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

   a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
   b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
   c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
   d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   Such reports are not made public.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

   a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
   b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   Such reports are not made public.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.
b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.
d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
This is not known to the public since all security matters are kept from the public domain.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:


Additional Comments:
Please use this section to add any additional comments.

Researcher Additional Comments:
The capacity for legislative scrutiny of the budget, and of exercising appropriate oversight, seems limited. The first constraint is the nature of Nigerian politics. Candidates and voters are uninterested in public policy issues; in Nigeria, politicians campaign and citizens vote on the bases of consanguinity - blood, ethnic, family, section, social, business relationship, and for cash. Second, the National Assembly does not have a budget office; the Assembly or its Public Accounts Committees do not have a dedicated, competent source analysis. Competent manpower is still hard to come by. Politicians still want to employ their kit and kin, friends instead of going for competent hands.
Third, reactions to budget presentation are politicized. The most cogent example is the fate of the Fiscal Responsibility Bill. Passage of the bill is seen as likely to reduce the influence of godfathers. Stakeholders perceive that its scope and extent may be significantly diluted. Fourth, delivery of the budget document is often late.

Peer Reviewer Two Additional Comments: The only additional general comments that I need to make is that Civil Society in Nigeria is championing the campaign for a regime of freedom of Information and it has passed various stages preparatory to being enacted as law. This Act when functional will compel public servants to make information available to any interested citizen so long as s/he can justify the need for the information. Until then some information cannot be accessed but it is important to say that people access information informally.