

International Budget Partnership  
**OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE**

# **VENEZUELA**

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership  
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities  
820 First Street, NE  
Suite 510  
Washington, DC 20002  
[www.internationalbudget.org](http://www.internationalbudget.org)  
[www.openbudgetindex.org](http://www.openbudgetindex.org)

**This questionnaire was completed by:**

<b>Name:</b>	<b>José Manuel Puente</b>
<b>Organization:</b>	<b>Transparency Venezuela and Institute for Advance Studies in Administration (IESA)</b>
<b>Address:</b>	<b>Av. Andrés Eloy Blanco. Edf. Camara de Comercio de Caracas, piso 2, Ofc. 215. Los Caobos, Caracas 1050, Venezuela</b>
<b>Telephone:</b>	<b>(58) (212) 555 42 21</b>
<b>E-mail:</b>	<b>jose.puente@iesa.edu.ve</b>

# International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE VENEZUELA

<b>Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents</b> .....	4
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire .....	5
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links.....	6
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal.....	8
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports .....	9
<b>Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal</b> .....	10
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	11
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year.....	20
Comprehensiveness.....	30
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring.....	37
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring .....	40
<b>Section Three: The Budget Process</b> .....	47
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget .....	48
Legislative Approval of the Budget.....	52
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	56
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution .....	67

## **Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents**

## Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

*Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, "Not Available."*

<b>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</b>	
<i>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</i>	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	Not Available
Executive's Budget Proposal	2007
Supporting Budget Documents	2007
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2007
In-Year Reports	2006
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	2006
Audit Report	2006

## Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

*Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.*

*If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”*

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Produced but Not Available to the Public
Budget Summary	Not Produced
Executive’s Budget Proposal	<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	<p><a href="http://www.onapre.gov.ve/informacion/Proyecto_Ley_2007/Ley2007.html">http://www.onapre.gov.ve/informacion/Proyecto_Ley_2007/Ley2007.html</a></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Exposición de Motivos 2007</li> <li>2. Proyecto de Decreto de Distribución General 2007:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Proyecto de Decreto</li> <li>- Distribución General por Organismos</li> <li>- Resumen de la Distribución General por Organismos</li> </ul> </li> <li>3. Proyecto de Ley Especial de Endeudamiento Anual para el Ejercicio Fiscal 2007</li> <li>4. Clasificador Presupuestario de Recursos y Egresos</li> <li>5. Instructivos N°: 11, 12, 15, 16 y 19</li> </ol>
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/pdf/PRESUPUESTO2005/09%20MarcoPlurianual.pdf">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/pdf/PRESUPUESTO2005/09%20MarcoPlurianual.pdf</a>
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	<a href="http://www.mpd.gob.ve/pdeysn/pdesn.pdf">http://www.mpd.gob.ve/pdeysn/pdesn.pdf</a>
Citizens Budget	Not Produced
Enacted Budget	<a href="http://www.ocepre.gov.ve/">http://www.ocepre.gov.ve/</a>

In-Year Reports	<a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/c1/Publicaciones.asp?Codigo=4683&amp;Operacion=2&amp;Sec=True">http://www.bcv.org.ve/c1/Publicaciones.asp?Codigo=4683&amp;Operacion=2&amp;Sec=True</a>
Mid-Year Review	Not Produced

Year-End Report	<a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/infoeco2006.pdf">http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/infoeco2006.pdf</a>
Audit Report	<a href="http://www.cgr.gov.ve">http://www.cgr.gov.ve</a>
Other Documents	<a href="http://www.mf.gov.ve/-InformeVenezuela2006">http://www.mf.gov.ve/- Informe Venezuela 2006</a> <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/informeasamblea2006.pdf">http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/informeasamblea2006.pdf</a> <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/mfa2006.pdf">http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/mfa2006.pdf</a>
Relevant Ministries & Departments	<a href="http://www.ocepre.gov.ve/">http://www.ocepre.gov.ve/</a> <a href="http://www.mf.gov.ve">http://www.mf.gov.ve</a> <a href="http://www.mpd.gob.ve/">http://www.mpd.gob.ve/</a> <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/">http://www.bcv.org.ve/</a> <a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/index.asp">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/index.asp</a> <a href="http://www.mpps.gob.ve/ms/index.php">http://www.mpps.gob.ve/ms/index.php</a> <a href="http://www.me.gov.ve/">http://www.me.gov.ve/</a>

**Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal**

<b>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</b>						
<i>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>						
	Pre-budget	<b>Executive’s Budget Proposal</b>				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes			Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public	Yes					
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)		Yes		Yes	Yes	
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>						
	Pre-budget	<b>Executive’s Budget</b>				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance		Yes		Yes	Yes	
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media		Yes		Yes	Yes	
3. Released to public same day as official release to media		Yes		Yes	Yes	
4. Available on the Internet free of charge		Yes		Yes	Yes	
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution		No		No	No	
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution		No		No	No	
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities <sup>†</sup>		Yes		Yes	Yes	
8. Written in more than one language		No		No	No	
9. News conference is held to discuss release		No		No	No	

\*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

<sup>†</sup>Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

**Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports**

<b>DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS</b>					
<i>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes		
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public					
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	Yes	Yes		No	No
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	Yes	Yes		No	No
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	No		No	No
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities <sup>+</sup>	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
8. Written in more than one language	No	No		No	No
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	No		No	No

<sup>+</sup>Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

## Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

*Notes on abbreviations:*

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

*Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked "not applicable/other," please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.*

<b>The Executive's Budget Proposal</b>	
<b>Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond</b>	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.</li> <li>Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.</li> <li>Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</li> <li>No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>: Example pages 134-135</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An important portion of the budgetary activity in Venezuela is carried out in the form of off-budget activities which are undertaken under the auspices of extra-budgetary funds. These are activities that are not included in the annual consolidated budget presentation, and as a consequence, are not subject to the same level of transparency, scrutiny or accounting standards as the "official" budget. In particular, FONDEN, the most important extra-budgetary fund in Venezuela, according to official figures accumulated in 2007 US\$ 10,110,000 which is equivalent to 25% of the total annual budget (US \$ 40.400.000).</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c

<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</li> <li>All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</li> <li>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.</li> <li>No expenditures classified by function are presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>: Example: Ministerio de Defensa page 160</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The “Exposición de Motivos” shows all expenditures classified by functional classification; but these don’t quite fit international IMF standards.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose my answer because the “Exposición de Motivos” shows expenditures classified by functional classification; but these do not always fit international IMF standards.</p>	C
<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</li> <li>All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</li> <li>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.</li> <li>No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table: 6-16.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C

<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.</li> <li>b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</li> <li>c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>d. No program-level data are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</li> <li>b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> <a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/pdf/PRESUPUESTO2005/09%20MarcoPIurianual.pdf">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/pdf/PRESUPUESTO2005/09%20MarcoPIurianual.pdf</a>:page 4 Table 2</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<p>6. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).</li> <li>b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.</li> <li>c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.</li> <li>d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>7. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.</li> <li>b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages 82-83</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>8. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.</li> <li>b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.</li> <li>d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>: Title: Presupuesto de Ingresos y Gastos y operaciones de financiamiento de la República page 14.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>9. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.</li> <li>b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> <a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/pdf/PRESUPUESTO2005/09%20MarcoPlurianual.pdf">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/pdf/PRESUPUESTO2005/09%20MarcoPlurianual.pdf</a>: page 4- Table 2</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).</li> <li>b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.</li> <li>c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.</li> <li>d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/pdf/PRESUPUESTO2005/09%20MarcoPIurianual.pdf">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/pdf/PRESUPUESTO2005/09%20MarcoPIurianual.pdf</a>: page 4- Table 2</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  Multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).</li> <li>b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.</li> <li>c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.</li> <li>d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Se Exposición de Motivos 2007. Table 6-26 shows the outstanding debt is reported up to a semester before the budget year.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c

<p>12. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.  b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.  c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. page 156</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a
<p>13. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.  b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.  c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.  d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.  e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>.page 158.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c

<p>14. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.</li> <li>Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages 10-11</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>15. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages 10-11</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>16. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. Example page 126</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>17. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<b>Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year</b>	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.</li> <li>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.</li> <li>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</li> <li>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos: //www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219. statistical information-table 6-1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	C

<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</li> <li>b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</li> <li>c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.</li> <li>d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219.statistical information-table 6-20</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Researcher’s response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” Table 6-20 in “Exposición de Motivos 2007” shows all expenditures classified by functional classification; but these don’t quite fit international IMF standards. With very minor exceptions, all outlays under the category “gastos no clasificados sectorialmente” belong to the 701 General public services COFOG category.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose response “c” consistent with researcher’s observation in Question 1.</p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------

<p>20. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</li> <li>All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</li> <li>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.</li> <li>No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information-table 6-15</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>21. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.</li> <li>Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.</li> <li>Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.</li> <li>No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.</li> <li>b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.</li> <li>c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.</li> <li>d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information-table 6-1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a
<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</li> <li>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information-table 6-1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

24. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?
- Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
  - Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
  - Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
  - No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
  - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Exposición de Motivos:[http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id\\_gen=219](http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219). statistical information table 6-1, 6-20 and 6-15.

Comment:

Please see comment under Question 1

**Researcher's Response to this Question was "b."**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be "None of the answers seem to apply." "Exposición de Motivos 2007" does show prior year expenditures by economic, administrative and functional classifications (Tables 6.1, 6.15 and 6.20), but not disaggregated at the program level.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I chose my answer "b" because the "Exposición de Motivos" presents more detailed information than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates. Tables 6-1, 6-15 and 6-20.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer, "b" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*.

b

<p>25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</li> <li>b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</li> <li>c. Before BY-3.</li> <li>d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information 6-1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.</li> <li>b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.</li> <li>c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.</li> <li>d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information-table 6-1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<p>27. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</li> <li>Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.</li> <li>Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.</li> <li>No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table 5-1.1 to 5-1.3</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>28. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</li> <li>Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.</li> <li>Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.</li> <li>No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table 5-1.1 and 5-1.2</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.</li> <li>b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.</li> <li>c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.</li> <li>d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table 5-1.3</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>c</p>
<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.</li> <li>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table 5-1.1 to 5-1.3</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).</li> <li>Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.</li> <li>Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.</li> <li>No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table 5-1.1 to 5-1.3</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</li> <li>Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</li> <li>Before BY-3.</li> <li>No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table 5-1.1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.</li> <li>b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.</li> <li>d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table 6-24; 6-25; 6-26</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).</li> <li>b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).</li> <li>c. Before BY-3.</li> <li>d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. statistical information table 6-26</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<b>Comprehensiveness</b>	
<p>35. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>:</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Fonden, Fondespa and Fondo Miranda III are good examples of these extra-budgetary funds. In particular, FONDEN, the most important extra-budgetary fund in Venezuela, accumulated in 2007 US\$ 10,110,000 which is equivalent to 25% of the total annual budget of that year (US \$ 40,400,000).</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>36. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages 136,168,208-214</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Off-budget expenditure passed along to lower levels of government.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages 148,153, 158</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. Example page 40</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on financial assets is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. page 111 and statistical information table 6-7,6-8, 6-9.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Only changes in financial assets are reported. No information is given as to holdings per se.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to keep my answer “c” because the “Exposicion de Motivos” presents some information about financial assets. Table 6-8.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.</p>	c
<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. Example page 251- Resultado Financiero la República-Base Caja.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>c</p>
<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. page 140</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</li> <li>b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.</li> <li>c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</li> <li>d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219. table page 137</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>c</p>

<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</li> <li>b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</li> <li>c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</li> <li>d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> The appropriate response to this question is “d.” See answer 35. There is not complete information about extra-budgetary funds, so the percentage of secret expenses is unknown.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

<b>The Budget Narrative &amp; Performance Monitoring</b>	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/variados/variados-2.asp?id_gen=219. page 73</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Non-financial data are presented for all programs.</li> <li>Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</li> <li>Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.</li> <li>No non-financial data are presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages 160-161.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.</li> <li>The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.</li> <li>The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.</li> <li>No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages 160-161.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>52. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.</li> <li>b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</li> <li>c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>d. No performance indicators are presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All performance indicators are well designed.</li> <li>b. Most performance indicators are well designed.</li> <li>c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.</li> <li>d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The programs do not have performance indicators.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <p>a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.  b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.  c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.  d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.  e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>55. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.  b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.  c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.  d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.  e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages 158, 162, 173.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<b>Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis &amp; Monitoring</b>	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	

<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information is not presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.seniat.gov.ve/portal/page?_pageid=87,1&amp;_dad=portal&amp;_schema=PORTAL">http://www.seniat.gov.ve/portal/page?_pageid=87,1&amp;_dad=portal&amp;_schema=PORTAL</a>. Tributos Internos- Impuestos Nacionales, Aduanas</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos: <a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/varios/varios-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. pages. 113, 181.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</li> <li>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.</li> <li>b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.</li> <li>c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.</li> <li>d. No, it does not provide a summary.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos: <a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.</li> <li>b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.</li> <li>c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.</li> <li>d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.</li> <li>Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>No, definitions are not provided.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.ocepre.gov.ve/">http://www.ocepre.gov.ve/</a>.Conceptos presupuestarios.; <a href="http://www.mf.gov.ve/-Estadisticas-fiscales-glosario-de-terminos">http://www.mf.gov.ve/-Estadisticas fiscales-glosario de terminos</a>.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.</li> <li>Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.</li> <li>Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.</li> <li>No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.ocepre.gov.ve/">http://www.ocepre.gov.ve/</a>. Leyes e Instructivos. (Constitución Nacional. Capítulo II del Régimen Fiscal y Monetario)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <p>a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</p> <p>b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</p> <p>c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</p> <p>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  Example Ministry of Finances  <a href="http://www.mf.gov.ve/archivos/1004/MEMORIA%20Y%20CUENTA%202006.pdf">http://www.mf.gov.ve/archivos/1004/MEMORIA%20Y%20CUENTA%202006.pdf</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <p>a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</p> <p>b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</p> <p>c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</p> <p>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u>  Example Ministry of Finances  <a href="http://www.mf.gov.ve/archivos/1004/MEMORIA%20Y%20CUENTA%202006.pdf">http://www.mf.gov.ve/archivos/1004/MEMORIA%20Y%20CUENTA%202006.pdf</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------

## **Section Three: The Budget Process**

<b>The Budget Process</b>	
<b>Executive's Formulation of the Budget</b>	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The release date is set in permanent law.</li> <li>b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</li> <li>c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</li> <li>d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.mf.gov.ve/archivos/1203/LOAFSP.pdf">http://www.mf.gov.ve/archivos/1203/LOAFSP.pdf</a>. articulate 38</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a
<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.</li> <li>b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.</li> <li>The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.</li> <li>The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.</li> <li>The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “c.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.”</p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose my answer “c” because one of the “clear” characteristics of the executive budget process in Venezuela is that they have difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable (several interviews with members of the National Budget Office confirm this point).</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “c” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	c
<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.</li> <li>Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.</li> <li>Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.</li> <li>No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c

<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.</li> <li>b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.</li> <li>d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>c</p>
<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.</li> <li>b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.</li> <li>c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive pre-budget statement is prepared for internal purposes only.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The pre-budget statement is produced but is not released to the public.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The pre-budget statement is produced but is not released to the public.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<b>Legislative Approval of the Budget</b>	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.mipunto.com/venezuelavirtual/leyesdevenezuela/leyesorganicas/LEYORGANICADELAADMINISTRACIONFINANCIERADELSECTORPUBLICO.pdf">http://www.mipunto.com/venezuelavirtual/leyesdevenezuela/leyesorganicas/LEYORGANICADELAADMINISTRACIONFINANCIERADELSECTORPUBLICO.pdf</a>  articulate 38</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.</li> <li>Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.</li> <li>Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c

<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</li> <li>b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</li> <li>c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</li> <li>d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.</li> <li>b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.</li> <li>d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The committees do not release reports.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</li> <li>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The legislature is not provided with information on secret items.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</li> <li>b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations.</li> <li>c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</li> <li>d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.mipunto.com/venezuelavirtual/leyesdevenezuela/leyesorganicas/LEYORGANICADELAADMINISTRACIONFINANCIERADELSECTORPUBLICO.pdf">http://www.mipunto.com/venezuelavirtual/leyesdevenezuela/leyesorganicas/LEYORGANICADELAADMINISTRACIONFINANCIERADELSECTORPUBLICO.pdf</a>  articulates 45, 52</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.</li> <li>b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</li> <li>c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.</li> <li>d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  For example:<a href="http://200.44.57.55:7777/onapre/Ley_2007/Titulo_II_2007/Sep_07.pdf">http://200.44.57.55:7777/onapre/Ley_2007/Titulo_II_2007/Sep_07.pdf</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a

<b>Executive's Implementation of the Budget</b>	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</li> <li>In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</li> <li>In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</li> <li>In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> Exposición de Motivos:<a href="http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219">http://www.asambleanacional.gov.ve/ns2/vari0s/vari0s-2.asp?id_gen=219</a>. page 36</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Researcher's Response to this Question was "d."</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> The in-year reports are released to the public every month, but only at the aggregate level. Information is not organized by any of the categories mentioned in the question (administrative unit, etc.). See Cuadro II.2: <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo764sep.pdf">http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo764sep.pdf</a>. Moreover reported actual expenditures for as far as the past year are said to be "provisional." This comment also applies to Questions 83, 85.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be "a." The expenditures of the Treasury classified as ordinary (either operational or not) are presented in Table II.," available at <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo748may.pdf">http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo748may.pdf</a></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose my answer "d" because in-year reports on actual expenditure, organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function are not released.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	d

<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.</li> <li>b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</li> <li>c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>d. No in-year reports are released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The expenditures of the Treasury classified as ordinary (either operational or not) are presented in Table II.,” available at <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo748may.pdf">http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo748may.pdf</a></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose my answer “d” because in-year reports organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function are not released to the public.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail.</li> <li>b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</li> <li>c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals.</li> <li>d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not release to the public.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.</li> <li>b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</li> <li>c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.</li> <li>d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Comparisons are not made.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.</li> <li>In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.</li> <li>In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.</li> <li>In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> Senate regularly produced information on actual revenue collections, but they are not always released every month.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.</li> <li>In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.</li> <li>In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.</li> <li>In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u> <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/c1/Publicaciones.asp?Codigo=5538&amp;Operacion=2&amp;Sec=True">http://www.bcv.org.ve/c1/Publicaciones.asp?Codigo=5538&amp;Operacion=2&amp;Sec=True</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” See <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo764sep.pdf">http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo764sep.pdf</a> Cuadro II.2. All source categories are indicated in the in-year report. The key is that reported actuals are said to be “provisional” calculations.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.</li> <li>b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.</li> <li>c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.</li> <li>d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Please see comment under Question 1</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” See: <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo764sep.pdf">http://www.bcv.org.ve/Upload/Publicaciones/bo764sep.pdf</a> Cuadro II.2. Comparisons are made with same period in the previous year. The key is that reported actuals are said to be “provisional” calculations.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b
<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.</li> <li>b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.</li> <li>c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.</li> <li>d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u> <a href="http://www.mf.gov.ve/frameLista.asp?sec=1203">http://www.mf.gov.ve/frameLista.asp?sec=1203</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</li> <li>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.mf.gov.ve/framelista.asp?sec=1311">http://www.mf.gov.ve/framelista.asp?sec=1311</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.</li> <li>b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.</li> <li>c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.</li> <li>d. In-year reports are not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.bcv.org.ve/c1/Publicaciones.asp?Codigo=5538&amp;Operacion=2&amp;Sec=True">http://www.bcv.org.ve/c1/Publicaciones.asp?Codigo=5538&amp;Operacion=2&amp;Sec=True</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.</li> <li>b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.</li> <li>c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.</li> <li>b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</li> <li>c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</li> <li>d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.</li> <li>b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</li> <li>c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).</li> <li>d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.</li> <li>b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</li> <li>c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</li> <li>d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.</li> <li>b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.</li> <li>c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.</li> <li>d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.mipunto.com/venezuelavirtual/leyesdevenezuela/leyesorganicas/LEYORGANICADELAADMINISTRACIONFINANCIERADELSECTORPUBLICO.pdf">http://www.mipunto.com/venezuelavirtual/leyesdevenezuela/leyesorganicas/LEYORGANICADELAADMINISTRACIONFINANCIERADELSECTORPUBLICO.pdf</a>  articulates 52</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.</li> <li>b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.</li> <li>c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.</li> <li>d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Some procurement processes are open and competitive.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Researcher Response:</u></b> I chose to keep my answer “d” because “formally” the procurement process could be open and competitive but in “practice” is totally different.</p> <p><b><u>IBP Comment:</u></b> IBP editors chose answer, “d” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.</p>	d
<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).</li> <li>b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.</li> <li>Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.</li> <li>Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.</li> <li>Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Supplemental budget are generally more than 10 percent of the original budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.</li> <li>Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.</li> <li>Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b> It is true that contingency funds and funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget, but the question does not seem to address the problem of extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<b>Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution</b>	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>d. The executive does not release a year-end report.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b>  According to Article 28 of the LEY ORGANICA DE LA ADMINISTRACION FINANCIERA DEL SECTOR PUBLICO (2003) the Ministry of Finance must produce this document. This document is different from the one reported in Table 2, which is a more general document published by BCV. See example of the Ministry of Finance en of year report in <a href="http://www.onapre.gov.ve/documentos-publicaciones/Informe%20Global/INFORME%20GLOBAL.pdf">http://www.onapre.gov.ve/documentos-publicaciones/Informe%20Global/INFORME%20GLOBAL.pdf</a>. Important fact: the Ministry of Finance is not systematic about making this document available to the public. It placed the 2004 report on its web page. Those belonging to following years are missing.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.</li> <li>b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</li> <li>c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</li> <li>d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/Informes-Informe de Gestion 2006-Control Fiscal">http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/Informes-Informe de Gestion 2006-Control Fiscal</a>. page 3.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>          “The General Controllershship of the Republic, during 2006 carried out 1090 actions (audits, account exams, evaluations, oversights, valuations, etc.), which, classified by control area include: national public powers: 574, decentralized national administration: 261 and state and municipal public power: 255.” (Informe de Gestion 2006-Control Fiscal, page 3.)</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>c</p>
<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.</li> <li>b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).</li> <li>c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).</li> <li>d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An explanation about the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An explanation about the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome is not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An explanation about the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome is not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d
<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> An explanation about the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome is not presented.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</li> <li>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c
<b><i>The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution</i></b>	
<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	b

<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.</li> <li>b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.</li> <li>c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.</li> <li>d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p><b>c</b></p>
<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.</li> <li>b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</li> <li>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/.Informes-Informe de Gestion 2006-Presentación">http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/.Informes-Informe de Gestion 2006-Presentación.</a></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p><b>a</b></p>

<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <p>a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.</p> <p>b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI may only be removed by the legislature.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a
<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <p>a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI does not audit the extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	d

<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.</li> <li>The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.</li> <li>The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.</li> <li>The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI can not audit “extra-budgetary” funds: For example, Fonden, Fondespa, Fondo Miranda.</p> <p><b><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “b.”</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>IBP Comments</u></b> IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain consistency of assumptions in selecting answers across countries.</p>	C
<p>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b> According to Article 17 of the Organic Law of the General Controllorship of the Republic and the National System of Fiscal Control (Official Gazette No. 37.347 from 17-12-01 available at <a href="http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/">http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/</a>): “The Contraloría prepares its expenditure budget each year, which shall be submitted to the Citizen’s Power for its presentation before the National Executive and its incorporation without modifications to the relative project of Budget Law which shall be submitted for the National Assembly’s consideration. Only the</p>	C

<p>National Assembly may introduce changes to the project which is presented by the Contraloría. The Contraloría shall prepare the financial execution program of the budget resources which are allocated to it and shall inform of it to the National Executive in order for the latter to spend the resources under the terms established in the program. Only the Contraloría may introduce changes in the referred program.”</p> <p>In its Internal Management Report for 2006, the General Contraloría of the Republic stated that it “accomplished its administrative and financial management following scarcity and rationality criteria, according to pre established policies and to the set objectives and goals. The execution allowed for the rational use of human, material and financial resources, for safeguarding the institution’s assets and for generating reliable and prompt information for the available decision-making.”</p> <p>In <a href="http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/pdf/informes/Informe_Gestion_2006/09-GestionInterna.pdf">http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/pdf/informes/Informe_Gestion_2006/09-GestionInterna.pdf</a></p> <p><b>Researcher Response:</b> I chose my answer because according to article 17 of the “Ley Orgánica de la Contraloría General de la República y del Sistema Nacional de Control Fiscal” (Gaceta Oficial No 37.347 del 17-12-01 (<a href="http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/">http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/</a>) above mentioned in the Peer Reviewer’s Comment.</p>	
<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.</li> <li>The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.</li> <li>The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.</li> <li>The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.</li> <li>Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.</li> <li>Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.</li> <li>No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.</li> <li>Not applicable.</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u>  <a href="http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/.Informes-Informe de Gestion 2006-Control Fiscal-Asesoria y Apoyo.page 153">http://www.cgr.gov.ve/smc/.Informes-Informe de Gestion 2006-Control Fiscal-Asesoria y Apoyo.page 153</a>.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u>  “During 2006, 548 cases were put forward, 379 of which were presented in writing and 169 were done so personally.” (Informe de Gestion 2006-Control fiscal-asesoria y apoyo page 153)</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	a
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.</li> <li>Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.</li> <li>Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.</li> <li>No, audit reports are not scrutinized.</li> <li>Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ol> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	c

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.</li> <li>b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.</li> <li>c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.</li> <li>d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.</li> <li>b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.</li> <li>d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The report is not produced.</p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.</li> <li>b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.</li> <li>c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.</li> <li>d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).</li> <li>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</li> </ul> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></b></p> <p><b><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></b></p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------