International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
Nepal, September 2009

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Taranath Dahal, Krishna Sapkota
Organization: Freedom Forum
Address: Thapathali, Kathmandu, Nepal
Telephone: 977-1-4102030/4102022
E-mail: info@freedomforum.org.np, freedomforum@enet.com.np
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents ........................................ 3
   Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire...... 4
   Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links .......... 5
   Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal... 7
   Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports .................. 8

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal .............................................. 9
   Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond .............................................. 10
   Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year .......................................... 20
   Comprehensiveness .................................................................................. 29
   The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring .................................... 37
   Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring ................. 42

Section Three: The Budget Process .......................................................... 48
   Executive’s Formulation of the Budget .................................................... 49
   Legislative Approval of the Budget ........................................................ 53
   Executive’s Implementation of the Budget .............................................. 57
   Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution ................................. 69
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
<th>Budget Year Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>Fiscal Year 2009-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>Fiscal Year 2009-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td>Fiscal Year 2009-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>Fiscal Year 2008-09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
<td>Fiscal Year 2008-09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>Fiscal Year 2008-09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>Fiscal Year 2007-08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Document</td>
<td>Full Title, Date, and Internet Link</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>Produced but not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities*</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
### Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS</th>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities*</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Note 1: The Open Budget Survey research process was carried out over a 12-month period and the final version of the Open Budget Questionnaires reflect decisions made after multiple rounds of discussions between Survey researchers, peer reviewers, and the International Budget Partnership (IBP) (in several countries these decisions also considered comments received from governments). When peer reviewers or governments agreed with the answers provided by researchers, they often provided no comment. Thus for many questions, the section in the questionnaire that should contain peer reviewer comments is left blank. However, if the government did not provide any comments to a question (because it did not dispute the answer), the section within the questionnaire that is meant to reflect government comments specifies the answer that the government agreed with (by default).

Since the IBP continued its discussions with the researchers even after receiving peer reviewer and government comments, for some questions these discussions resulted in a mutual decision to change the answers, even if the peer reviewers and governments agreed with the original answer provided by the researcher. Such changes may have happened as a result of:

1. A more consistent application of the Survey methodology;
2. New information identified by the researcher or by IBP that had a bearing on the answer for a particular question; or
3. Decisions made to ensure cross-country comparability of answers.

For more information on these changes for any question please write to info@internationalbudget.org.
# The Executive’s Budget Proposal

## Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1.</strong> Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|   | a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.  
   |   | b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.  
   |   | c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.  
   |   | d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.  
   |   | e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| **Citation:** | “Red Book-2” provides sufficient details on administrative units.  
| **Comment:** |   |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** |   |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** | Although details are provided by administrative units, in many cases the expenses are lumped together under incidental heads and this information is not transparent. Generally owing to political pressure, particularly during the last months of the year, money is transferred from incidental heads and allocated to new programs. |

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>2.</strong> Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|   | a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.  
   | b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.  
   | c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.  
   | d. No expenditures classified by function are presented.  
   | e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| **Citation:** | “Red Book-2” provides sufficient details on administrative units.  
| **Comment:** | Presently classified expenditure gives enough information to bring it in line with GFS 2001 of IMF, yet it is not fully compatible with international standards. |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** |   |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** |   |
3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation: “Red Book-2” provides sufficient details on administrative units.

   Comment: Presently classified expenditure gives enough information to bring it in line with GFS 2001 of IMF, yet it is not fully compatible with international standards.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

   a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
   b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No program-level data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation: “Annual Development Program Book” gives detail on entire programs to be carried out within the fiscal year

   Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Medium Term Expenditure Framework provides estimates for three years (2009/10 - 2011/12), Released Date: July 2009

Comment:
The Government of Nepal has started to present multi-year period expenditures to the parliament from 2009-10. It only presents the projection of expenditure.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:
Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
The Medium Term Expenditure Framework provides estimates for three years (2009/10 - 2011/12), Released Date: July 2009

Comment:
These estimates cover all classifications except the economic classification.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:
Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
   d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   “Budget Speech - Annex 2” Page 70-73

   Comment:
   Peer Reviewer One Comment:
   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   “Budget Speech-Annex-2” Page 72

   Comment:
   Peer Reviewer One Comment:
   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   “Medium term Expenditure Framework,” Released Date: July 2009

   **Comment:**

   **Researcher Response to this Question was “b”**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

   **IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose response “b” because revenue estimates for the multi year period are not presented.

10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

    a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
    b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
    c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
    d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
    e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   “Medium Term Expenditure Framework” Released on July 2009

   **Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong>: Budget documents present the debt outstanding for the current year. The debt presented is for the specific year and the information provided does not include the total cumulative outstanding debt.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong>:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
13. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Researcher Response to this Question was “d”**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Government debt is classified as external and internal debt. But other information such as maturity profiles is not presented.

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

   **Researcher Response:** I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer One to “c.” I choose this answer because the Government budget is classified as external and internal debt. It is mentioned in the Red Book-2, Estimates of Expenditure for Fiscal Year 2009-10 (Report 31, Page 1-2), however it does not show maturity profile of debt.

   According to the Red Book, debt has been classified into two categories: repayment of domestic debt and repayment of foreign debt (bilateral and multilateral). The total repayment of domestic debt, including recurrent and capital and principal repayment is NRs. 14,169,113,000 while total repayment of foreign debt is 14,542,189,000 (this includes 11,329,756,000 as multilateral debt and 3,212,433,000).

   **IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose response “c” as per the researcher’s comment.
14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

   a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.
   b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Budget Speech, Page 65

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Budget Speech

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was “c”

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d” because there is reference to macro economic assumptions in the budget narrative but the analytical basis for these references is not provided.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should remain as I indicated in the questionnaire. I choose this answer because the 2009-2010 budget speech shows the situation of macroeconomic fundamentals and assumptions. The budget speech has clearly mentioned that the GDP growth rate is likely to register at 3.8 per cent at basic price and 4.7 per cent at produces' price; annual average inflation is expected to surge by 13 per cent; export and import are expected to go up by 28.6 per cent and 12 percent respectively; revenue collection will stand at Rs. 142 billion 211.3 million-increased by 32.14 per cent and total expenditure will remain at RS 213 billion 578.3 million. This information is presented in the budget speech, page 2 under the heading if budget review and budget implementation of the current fiscal year.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose response “c” as per the researcher’s comment.
16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
Budget Speech

Comment:
Huge variance is observed between estimates and actual expenditures and a detailed explanation is lacking for this.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
Budget Speech

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment: Peer Reviewer One Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| 19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification? |
| a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. |
| b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. |
| c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. |
| d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Comment: Presently classified expenditure gives enough information to bring it in line with GFS 2001 of the IMF, yet it is not fully compatible with international standards. |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td>Presently classified expenditure gives enough information to bring it in line with GFS 2001 of IMF, yet it is not fully compatible with international standards.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Besides actual expenditures revised expenditure estimates are also incorporated.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Red Book-2

**Comment:**
Besides actual expenditures revised expenditure estimates are also incorporated.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).

b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.

c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.

d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Red Book-2 and Budget Speech

Comment:
Red Book-2 provides aggregate expenditures for previous years by economic and administrative classifications whereas the budget speech provides aggregate expenditure as per functional code.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   www.mof.gov.np/publication/yearlyreview/annualreport63-64.pdf

   Comment:
   The current practice is to provide a brief update on macroeconomic outcomes only.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

   a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.
   b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.
   c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.
   d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Red Book-2

   Comment:
   Expenditure estimates are adjusted for administrative and economic classifications only.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Budget Speech-Annex 5

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Budget Speech-Annex 5

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.
- b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.
- c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.
- d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Budget Speech-Annex 5

**Comment:**
11 months of actual revenue are presented

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
Budget Speech-Annex 2 and 5

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Budget Speech Annex 2 and 5

Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Budget Speech Annex 2 and 5

Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
   b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
   c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
   d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Budget Speech (Page 69), Economic Survey and Consolidated Financial Statements-2007-08

Consolidated Financial Statements are not posted in internet.

**Comment:**
Information regarding aggregate debt for the year is available in the budget speech. But more detailed information regarding debt, including its composition for preceding years is available in the “Economic Survey,” “Consolidated Financial Statement” and the Nepal Rastra Bank (Central Bank) Trimester Report.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Economic Survey Fiscal Year 2008-09

Comment:
The Economic Survey for Fiscal Year 2008-09 demonstrates total foreign debt and internal debt from fiscal year 2000-01. It has also presented the comparative situation of debt during both the fiscal years.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Comprehensiveness

35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| d |  |
37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?

   a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Red Book Part 2 “Appropriated from Consolidated Fund”

Comment:
Generally transfers including subsidy grants and share and loan investments for public corporations are reflected in the Red Book.

Researcher Response to this Question was “c”

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b” as key transfers to the public corporation are presented in Red Book.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I choose this answer because the Red Book does not provide any information on transfers to public corporations.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose response “d” since the Red Book does not provide information on transfers to public corporations.

38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?

   a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on financial assets is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
Since there is cash accounting system, it does not show information regarding financial assets.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>40. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
As there is cash accounting system in government, it does not show information regarding the government's non financial assets.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

   a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   This information is not presented in the budget document. Nevertheless, individual entities maintain their accounts which are submitted for auditing.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   Even though some entities maintain contingent liabilities, they are not presented on a consolidated basis in the budget.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?
   a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   An accrual accounting system has not been adopted.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?
   a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   “Donor-wise Source Book” also called “White Book” and “Statement of Technical and Other Assistance”

   Comment:

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Yes, details by donor source are presented in the above cited book and statements. These details include information on in-kind aid also.
45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

   d

---

46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

   a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   It is not required for the budgetary process in Nepal.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

   d
47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
“Red Book-2”

Comment:
It is understood that the negligible percentage of expenditure allocated to secret items is not made public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
### The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government's stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year? | a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.  

b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.  
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.  
d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**

“Policies and Programs (President’s Statement),” “Budget Speech”  

**Comment:**  
Policy, Goals and Programs and Budget Speech define and guide the government policy goals by functional categories culminating in budget for the year.

**Researcher Response to this Question was “c”**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b” as the Annual Program for the Fiscal Year 2007/8 published by the National Planning Commission contains information about non financial data, but does not contain adequate detail. This document is published and it is accessible to public.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

**Researcher Response:** I suggest that the answer should be changed as suggested by the Peer Reviewer. I choose this answer because the Annual Program for the fiscal year 2009-10 published by the National Planning Commission) has established the link between proposed budget and government's stated policy.

The National Planning Commission (NPC) makes public two annual program books that incorporate program plans at the central and district levels. The programs in these publications are planned on the basis of the strategic pillars set by NPC's three year interim development plan (2007-2010). The major strategic pillars of this plan are governance, sustainable development, societal transformation, inclusive development, physical infrastructure and employment promotion. The government's budget is allocated on the basis of these strategic pillars, which reflect the government's stated policy. The budgetary allocation is detailed in the Red Book.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose response “b” as per the researcher’s response.
49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**
   “Policy Goals and Programs (President’s Statement)” and “Budget Speech”

   **Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?

   a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.
   b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.
   d. No non-financial data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation:**

   **Comment:**
   Non financial data is presented as a supporting document at the time of the budget formulation process, but not released to the public. The intended output goals are also presented with the programs.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**
   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?

   a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
   b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
   c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
   d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   Getting sufficient information of non-financial data is difficult.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?

   a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.
   b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No performance indicators are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Annual Development Program Book

   Comment:
   Output indicators are presented in the program approval format. However, this format is not presented before parliament. However, there is a book on “Annual Programs” in which intended outputs of all the programs are included and this book is also submitted to parliament.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Rating</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals? | a. All performance indicators are well designed.  
b. Most performance indicators are well designed.  
c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.  
d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | d      |
| Citation:                                                               | Comment:                                                               |        |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**                                         |                                                                        |        |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**                                         |                                                                        |        |
| 54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation? | a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.  
b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.  
c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.  
d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | d      |
| Citation:                                                               | Comment:                                                               |        |
| **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**                                         |                                                                        |        |
| **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**                                         |                                                                        |        |
55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

   a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
“Budget Speech (Page 15-18),” “Annual Development Program”

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
### Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

*Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

“Financial Bill”


**Comment:**

It provides detailed information about major revenue sources and highlights the rates and fees.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
I chose this answer because even though the Ministry of Finance analyzes the tax burden this information is not made public. This analysis includes the burden of tax on industry, service and other sectors. It is not made public since tax burden is deemed to be negative so the government does not tend to make public this analysis.

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?

   a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
   b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Internal discussions are held in the process of budget formulation and to follow up on conditionalities.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?

   a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not provide a summary.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
“Budget Speech”

Comment:
In order to disseminate information regarding budgetary provisions, the Budget Speech is published in various ethnic languages.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, definitions are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: 

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
63. Do citizens have the right *in law* to access government information, including budget information?

- a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
- c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
- d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Interim Constitution at: 

**Comment:**
Every Nepali citizen has this right since July 2007. This right has been enshrined in the Interim Constitution of Nepal and Right to Information Act-2007.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>64.</th>
<th>Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>65.</th>
<th>Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
Section Three: The Budget Process
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>The Budget Process</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Executive’s Formulation of the Budget</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The release date is set in permanent law.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive’s budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget’s formulation)?</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:** According to Nirmal Hari Adhikari, Under Secretary of Minister of Finance, the government generally adheres to the detailed timetable for budget formulation.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

| 69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities? |
|---|---|
| a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. |
| b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. |
| c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. |
| d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation:**

**Comment:** According to Brinda Pandey, Constituent Assembly Member, the Prime Minister invites some members of the legislature to discuss the budget before it is finalized, but consultation is very limited in this regard.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** Generally, the budget is discussed by the finance committee of the CA and advice or suggestions are demanded by the finance minister, or, very rarely, the chief executive. However wider consultations are very limited.
70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

- **a.** Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
- **b.** Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
- **c.** Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
- **d.** No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

Even though notices are circulated through TV, Radio, websites, and newspapers to the public to request suggestions, yet there are seldom serious consultations.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>71. Does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legislative Approval of the Budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:  
Comment:  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**  

| 75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard? |
| a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. |
| b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. |
| c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. |
| d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation:  
Comment:  There is no provision of public hearings. Nevertheless, discussions are held by the Accounts Committee and Finance Committee regarding the conformity of the proposed budget with the macroeconomic and fiscal framework.  

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**  
**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**  


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>76.</th>
<th>Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: |

Comment: |
There is no provision for public hearings. |

Peer Reviewer One Comment: |

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>77.</th>
<th>Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation: |

Comment: |
There is no provision for public hearings. |

Peer Reviewer One Comment: |

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

There is no provision for public hearings.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
80. Does the legislature have authority in law to amend the budget presented by the executive?

   a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority in law to amend the budget.
   b. Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the budget, with some limitations.
   c. Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.
   d. No, the legislature does not have any authority in law to amend the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Interim Constitution of Nepal-2007

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?

   a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.
   b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.
   d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals or the approved budget is not released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
### Executive’s Implementation of the Budget

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

#### Peer Reviewer One Comment:

#### Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No in-year reports are released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

Quarterly Economic Bulletin. October 2008 to January 2010

**Comment:**


#### Peer Reviewer One Comment:

#### Peer Reviewer Two Comment: The in-year reports cover almost all expenditures. However, there are problems with turn key projects funded by donors in which timely or detailed information regarding expenses is not presented. Generally, such projects remain outside the purview of the audit. This is a big problem in Nepal since for some years up to 35 percent of the development budget is not audited.
84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
Each administrative unit produces a Statement of Expenditure according to functional coding on a monthly basis for internal purposes. The administrative unit maintains the accounts of program level expenditures.

**Researcher Response to this Question was “c”**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment**: 

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment**: 

**IBP Comment**: IBP editors chose response “d” because no departmental totals are presented in the quarterly bulletin.
85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

   a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.
   b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
   c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:  

   Comment:  
   **Researcher Response to this Question was “a”**

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

   **IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose response “d” because the Economic Bulletin does not compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for 2009 or for the same period in 2008.

86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

   a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.
   b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.
   c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.
   d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:  
   Quarterly Economic Bulletin. October 2008 to January 2010 (pages 58 and 59)  

   Comment:  
   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?

   a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.
   b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.
   c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
   d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
Quarterly Economic Bulletin. October 2008 to January 2010 (pages 58 and 59)

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

   a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.
   b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.
   c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
   d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Quarterly Economic Bulletin. October 2008 to January 2010 (pages 58 and 59)

Comment:
Researcher Response to this Question was “a”

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose response "d" because the Economic Bulletin does not compare actual year-to-date revenue with either the original estimate for 2009 or for the same period in 2008.

89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?

   a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.
   b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.
   c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.
   d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Quarterly Economic Bulletin. October 2008 to January 2010

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?

a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Quarterly Economic Bulletin. October 2008 to January 2010

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?

a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.
b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.
c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.
d. In-year reports are not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
Nepal Rastra Bank makes it public in aggregate after one month.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Time lapses is two to three months.
92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.
b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.
c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.
d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**
“Mid Term Evaluation Report”

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
“Mid Term Evaluation Report”

Comment:

**Researcher Response to this Question was “a”**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** The Mid-year review provides updated expenses but not detailed revised projections. Therefore, the answer is “c.”

**Researcher Response:** I suggest that the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two. The mid term evaluation report does not include revised detailed projections. However the report produced by the executive incorporates updated expenditure estimates.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose response “c” as per researcher’s response.
94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
“Mid Term Evaluation Report”

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**
“Mid Term Evaluation Report - Annex 1”

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**


96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain minimal level specified in law or regulation)?

a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

Generally the Ministry of Finance shifts funds between administrative units by the consent of National Planning Commission. According to the former finance minister Dr. Ram Sharan Mahat, the executive does not seek input from the legislature while making shifts between the units.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** The correct response is "d." The fact that funds are transferred and allocated to new programs towards the end of the fiscal year increases the possibility of misuse of funds enormously.
97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Audit Report of Auditor General's Office
www.oagnep.gov.np
C:\Documents and Settings\Administrator\Local Settings\Temporary Internet Files\Content.IE5\E6H3RD39\Nepali%20fonts[1].zip

Comment:
Peer Reviewer One Comment:
Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).
b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:
There is a provision in the Interim Constitution of Nepal for proposing a supplementary budget. However, it can be submitted only during situations specified by the constitution.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:
Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

   a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.
   b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.
   c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.
   d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   There is no limitation prescribed by the constitution.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

   a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.
   b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.
   d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:

   Comment:
   The contingency budget is indicated in the Red Book under a separate heading and it is administered by the Ministry of Finance. The budget allocation under this heading is approved at the time that the budget is enacted.

   Peer Reviewer One Comment:

   Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive does not release a year-end report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Citation: Consolidated Financial Statements  
http://www.fcgo.gov.np/reports_publications.php |
| Comment: The Consolidated Financial Statements of fiscal year 2007-08 was released in May 2009. |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |

| 102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited? |
| a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. |
| d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation: |
| Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer One Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer Two Comment: |
103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Annual Report of the Auditor General  
[www.oagnep.gov.np](http://www.oagnep.gov.np)

Comment:
Please refer to the Annual Report (English) 2008/2065 for necessary information.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:
Annual Report of the Auditor General  
[www.oagnep.gov.np](http://www.oagnep.gov.np)

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Annual Report of the Auditor General
www.oag nep.gov.np

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Researcher Response to this Question was “a”**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** “a” is not a correct response since sometimes there is a lag of almost two years.

**Researcher Response:** I choose this answer “b” because generally the final annual expenditures of national departments are audited by the Office of the Auditor General (OAG) one year or less after the end of the fiscal year. The OAG audits the annual expenditures of the national department within six months of the end of the fiscal year. The comment by peer reviewer that sometimes there is almost two-year gap is also correct. It was during the time of the direct rule of King in the history of Nepal in 2004-06. At the moment, the audited reports were released after two years of the fiscal year. It was due to the constitutional problem that prevailed during the King's rule that the Auditor General was not appointed for a long time.

**IBP Comment:** Even though the OAG completes its audit within 6 months, it appears based on the researcher’s response that “b” is a more likely response to this question.
112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Researcher Response to this Question was “a”**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:** It is “b” because there is a problem of auditing the turn key projects.

**Researcher Response:** I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two. I choose this answer because there is a problem of auditing turn key projects. The projects funded directly by the donors submit their reports to the government only for information not for audit. Since these funds constitute about one third of annual expenditures, they remain unaudited. Therefore only about two-third of the expenditures are audited and made available to public.

**IBP Comment:** The IBP editors chose response “b” as per the researcher’s response.
113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?

   a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report’s content.
   b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Annual Report of the Auditor General
   [www.oagnep.gov.np](http://www.oagnep.gov.np)

   Comment:

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

   a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
   b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation:
   Interim Constitution of Nepal

   Comment:
   The head of the SAI can be removed by the parliament only.

   **Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

- a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
- b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
- c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
- d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

- a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
- c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
- d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:
Interim Constitution of Nepal Article 123

Comment:
Even though the SAI has authority, it rarely exercises such authority on its own.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

Even though the executive prepares the budget, since the budget also has to be approved by the legislature before being released, it can be said that the legislature determines the budget of SAI.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?

- a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.
- c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate.
- d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation:**

**Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?

a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.
b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.
c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.
d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.
e. Not applicable.

Citation:

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:
120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation:

Comment:
The Public Account Committee studies the report and discusses it in parliament.

**Researcher Response to this Question was “e”**

**Peer Reviewer One Comment**: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b” as the PAC has the authority to scrutinize the audit report.

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment**: Based on recommendations the Public Accounts Committee scrutinizes various cases, summons concerned authorities organizes hearings and recommends cases to the CIAA for further action. Though very limited, some cases have been recommended to the CIAA.

**Researcher Response**: I choose the answer “a” because:
There is a constitutional provision that the Auditor General shall submit to the President an annual report on the work the OAG has performed, and the President through the Prime Minister makes arrangements to submit such reports to the Legislature. The Parliament hands over all the audit reports to the Public Accounts Committee (PAC)-a parliamentary committee for the inspection and scrutiny. The Committee scrutinizes the reports and summons the concerned line ministry or units and thoroughly discusses regarding the arrears or irregularities if found. The Committee works on the basis of the provisions specified by Audit Act and its procedures and furnishes further recommendations or directives to resolve irregularities found during the scrutiny.

**IBP Comment**: IBP editors chose response “a” as per the researcher’s response.
121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: Although the executive does not report publicly on its steps to respond to audit findings, the final report of SAI provides details of the executive's actions and their inadequacies.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**

122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation: 

Comment: 

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation:**

**Comment:**
The reports are provided as per the need and gravity of such issues.

**Peer Reviewer One Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer Two Comment:**