

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
Niger, September 2009

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street NE, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Hassane Boukar & Moussa Tchangari
Organization: Alternative Espaces Citoyens
Address: 72 Rue Ci 47 Cite Poudriere
BP: 10948 Niamey Niger
Telephone: +227 207 42439
E-mail: hassane.boukar@gmail.com;
tchangari@alternative.net

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	3
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire.....	4
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links	5
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal.	10
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	11
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	12
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	13
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	22
Comprehensiveness	30
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	37
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	41
Section Three: The Budget Process	49
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	50
Legislative Approval of the Budget	56
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	62
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution.....	72

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	2009
Executive's Budget Proposal	Not Available
Supporting Budget Documents	2009
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2009
In-Year Reports	Not Available
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	Not Available
Audit Report	Not Available

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Produced but Not Available to the Public
Budget Summary	<p>Exposé des motifs du Projet de Loi des finances pour l'année budgétaire 2009, enregistré à la présidence de l'Assemblée Nationale le 02 octobre 2008 (Presentation of justifications for the Draft Budget Law for the 2009 budget year, registered in the Office of the President of the National Assembly on October 2, 2008)</p> <p>Available to the public, but not available on the Internet.</p>
Executive's Budget Proposal	<p>Projet de Loi du portant Loi de finances pour l'année budgétaire 2009, enregistré à la présidence de l'Assemblée Nationale le 02 octobre 2008. (Draft Law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, registered in the Office of the President of the National Assembly on October 2, 2008)</p> <p>Produced but Not Available to the Public</p>
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	<p>Annexe 1: Détail prévision des recettes LF 2009 (en milliers francs CFA (Annex 1: Details of the revenue forecast for the 2009 FL (in thousands of CFA francs))</p> <p>Produced but Not Available to the Public</p>
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	<p>Annexe 2: Détail dépenses de l'Etat LF 2009 (en milliers de francs CFA) (Annex 2: Details of government expenditures for the 2009 FL (in thousands of CFA francs))</p> <p>Produced but Not Available to the Public</p>
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	<p>Annexe 3: Comptes Spéciaux du Trésor LF 2009 (en milliers de francs CFA) (Annex 3: Special Treasury Accounts for the 2009 FL (in thousands of CFA francs))</p> <p>Produced but Not Available to the Public</p>
Citizens Budget	Not Produced
Enacted Budget	<p>Loi No 2008-48 du 24 novembre 2008 portant Loi de finances pour l'année budgétaire 2009 Publié dans le Journal Officiel de la République du Niger Spécial Numéro 15, du 31 décembre 2008 (Law 2008-48 of November 24, 2008 on the 2009 budget year Budget Law Published in the Official Gazette of the Republic of Niger Special Issue 15 of December 31, 2008)</p> <p>Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet</p>

In-Year Reports	Produced by the Ministry of the Economy and Finance for internal usage but not available to the public Produced but Not Available to the Public
Mid-Year Review	Produced by the Ministry of the Economy and Finance for internal usage but not available to the public Produced but Not Available to the Public

Year-End Report	<p>Produced by the Ministry of the Economy and Finance for internal usage but not available to the public</p> <p>Produced but Not Available to the Public</p>
Audit Report	<p>Produced by the Ministry of the Economy and Finance for internal usage but not available to the public</p> <p>Produced but Not Available to the Public</p>
Other Documents	<p>Constitution du Niger du 18 août 2009 (Niger Constitution of August 18, 2009)</p> <p>- Loi No 2003-11 du 1er avril 2003, portant loi organique relative aux lois de finances (Law 2003-11 of April 1, 2003, on the Organic Budget Law)</p> <p>- Rapport Général de la Commission des finances sur le Projet de Loi de finances pour l'année budgétaire 2009 adopté le 14 Novembre 2008 (General Report of the Finance Committee on the Draft Budget Law for budget year 2009, enacted November 14, 2008)</p> <p>Directive N° 05/97/CM/UEMOA relative aux lois de finances (Bulletin Officiel de l'UEMOA 2ème année n° 7 décembre 1997). [Directive 05/97/CM/UEMOA on the Budget Laws (Official WAEMU Bulletin, 2nd year, No. 7 December 1997)] Available at the following link: http://www.uemoa.int/actes/index_dec.htm</p> <p>- Directive No 02/99/CM/UEMOA du 21 décembre 1999 portant amendement de la Directive No 05/97/CM/UEMOA relative aux lois des finances. (Directive 02/99/CM/UEMOA of December 21, 1999 amending Directive 05/97/CM/UEMOA on the Budget Laws). Available at the following link: http://www.uemoa.int/actes/dec99/DIR_02_99.htm</p> <p>- Directive N° 06/97/CM/UEMOA du 16 décembre 1997 portant règlement général sur la comptabilité publique (Directive 06/97/CM/UEMOA of December 16, 1997 on the general government accounting regulation) Available at the following link: http://www.uemoa.int/actes/index_dec.htm</p> <p>- Directive n° 03/99/CM/UEMOA du 21 décembre 1999 modifiant la directive No 06/97/CM/UEMOA du 16 décembre 1997 portant règlement général sur la comptabilité publique (Directive 03/99/CM/UEMOA of December 21, 1999 amending Directive 06/97/CM/UEMOA of December 16, 1997 on the general government accounting regulation) Available at the following link: http://www.uemoa.int/actes/index_dec.htm</p> <p>- Directive n° 04/98/CM/UEMOA qui fixe les principaux fondamentaux de présentation des opérations du budget général, des budgets annexes et des comptes spéciaux du</p>

Trésor des États membres de l'Union. (Directive 04/98/CM/UEMOA, which sets the fundamental principles for presenting the operations in the general budget, annex budgets and Special Treasury Accounts of the Member States of the Union). Available at the following link:
http://www.uemoa.int/actes/index_dec.htm

- Directive n° 02/2000/CM/UEMOA portant code de transparence dans la gestion des finances publiques (Directive 02/2000/CM/UEMOA on the Transparency Code for Fiscal Management) Available at the following link:
http://www.uemoa.int/actes/2000/DIR_02_2000.htm

- Décret n° 65-69-MFAE du 12 mai 1965 réglementant les régies de recettes et les dépenses du budget de l'État, Journal Officiel du 1er janvier 1966, modifié (articles 12 et 17 nouveaux, ajoute article 15bis) par le décret n° 94-191/PRN/MFP du 10 décembre 1994 (Journal Officiel du 1er avril 1995, page 316
[Decree 65-69-MFAE of May 12, 1965 regulating the revenue offices and the expenditures in the government budget, Official Gazette of January 1, 1966, amended (Articles 12 and 17 – new – add Article 15bis) by Decree No. 94-191/PRN/MFP of December 10, 1994 (Official Gazette of April 1, 1995, page 316)]

Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet

- Décret N° 93-176/PRN/MFP du 3 décembre 1993 portant organisation du contrôle financier (Journal Officiel du 15 mai 1994, page 169 [Decree 93-176/PRN/MFP of December 3, 1993 organizing the financial audit (Official Gazette of May 15, 1994, page 169)

Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet

- Décret n° 2002-196/PRN/MF/E du 26 juillet 2002 portant règlement général de la comptabilité publique, Journal Officiel Spécial n° 7 du 12 mai 2003, page 394 (Decree 2002-196/PRN/MF/E of July 26, 2002 on the general government accounting rule, Special Official Gazette No. 7 of May 12, 2003, page 394)

Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet

- Décret n° 2002-197/PRN/MF/E du 26 juillet 2002 portant nomenclature budgétaire de l'État (Decree 2002-197/PRN/MF/E of July 26, 2002 on the government budgetary classification system)

Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet

- Décret n° 2002-198/PRN/MF/E du 26 juillet 2002 portant Plan comptable de l'État, Journal Officiel Spécial n° 7 du 12 mai 2003, page 417 (Decree 2002-198/PRN/MF/E of July 26, 2002 on the government chart of accounts, Special Official Gazette No. 7 of May 12, 2003, page 417)

Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet

- Arrêté n° 186/MF/E/DGB du 16 juin 2003 fixant la nomenclature des pièces (Order 186/MF/E/DGB of June 16, 2003 establishing the document classification system)

Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet

	<p>- Justificatives des dépenses de l'État, des collectivités territoriales et de leurs établissements publics administratifs, Journal Officiel Spécial n° 7 du 12 mai 2003 P 442</p> <p>(Supporting documentation for the expenditures of the central government, territorial governments and their public administrative establishments, Special Official Gazette No. 7 of May 12, 2003 P 442)</p> <p>Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet</p>
Relevant Ministries & Departments	<p>Ministère de l'Économie et des Finances - Ministry of the Economy and Finance</p> <p>The Ministry of the Economy and Finance can be consulted at the site: http://www.communication-gouv-niger.ne</p> <p>Unfortunately, only the terms of reference for the ministry are online.</p> <p>Address of the Ministry of the Economy and Finance: Avenue des Anciens combattants BP 389 Niamey</p> <p>Telephone : (+227) 20 72 23 74</p> <p>Fax (+227) 20 73 59 34 ; E-mail :Not available</p> <p>- Departments involved:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Direction Générale du Budget - Directorate General of the Budget (DGB) - Direction du Budget - Directorate of the Budget (DB) - Direction du Contrôle Financier - Directorate of Financial Auditing (DCF) - Direction de la Dette Publique - Directorate of the Public Debt (DDP) - Direction de l'Ordonnancement - Directorate of Payment Authorization (DO) - Direction des Investissements et Financements de la Dette - Directorate of Investments and Debt Financing (DIFD) - Direction Générale des Programmes - Directorate General of Programs (DGP) - Direction des Études Financières et des Reformes - Directorate of Financial Studies and Reforms (DEFR) - Direction de la Monnaie du Crédit et de l'Épargne - Directorate of the Currency, Credit and Savings (DMCE) - Direction Générale de l'Inspection des Finances - Directorate General of Finance Inspection (DGIF) - Direction Générale des Impôts - Directorate General of Taxation (DGI) - Direction Générale des Douanes - Directorate General of Customs (DGD) - Trésorerie Générale du Niger - General Treasury Department of Niger (TGN)

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes						Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes	
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request			Yes			
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)						
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	No	No	No	No	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes					
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request	Yes				
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)					
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	NA	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	NA	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	No	NA	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	NA	NA	NA	NA

⁺Mark "Yes" if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Note 1: The Open Budget Survey research process was carried out over a 12-month period and the final version of the Open Budget Questionnaires reflect decisions made after multiple rounds of discussions between Survey researchers, peer reviewers, and the International Budget Partnership (IBP) (in several countries these decisions also considered comments received from governments). When peer reviewers or governments agreed with the answers provided by researchers, they often provided no comment. Thus for many questions, the section in the questionnaire that should contain peer reviewer comments is left blank. However, if the government did not provide any comments to a question (because it did not dispute the answer), the section within the questionnaire that is meant to reflect government comments specifies the answer that the government agreed with (by default).

Since the IBP continued its discussions with the researchers even after receiving peer reviewer and government comments, for some questions these discussions resulted in a mutual decision to change the answers, even if the peer reviewers and governments agreed with the original answer provided by the researcher. Such changes may have happened as a result of:

1. A more consistent application of the Survey methodology;
2. New information identified by the researcher or by IBP that had a bearing on the answer for a particular question; or
3. Decisions made to ensure cross-country comparability of answers.

For more information on these changes for any question please write to info@internationalbudget.org.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The "Projet de Loi du portant Loi de finances pour l'année budgétaire 2009, (Le Budget de l'Exécutif)" (draft law for the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget)) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p>According to the "direction de la législation et du contrôle parlementaire" (Directorate of Parliamentary Legislation and Supervision), the Ministry of the Economy and Finance prepared and submitted the draft budget review law to Parliament in March 2009. Unfortunately, the President of the Republic dissolved Parliament on May 26, 2009 before this draft was enacted. The new Parliament was not elected until October 20, 2009, so that it was not possible to make this document available.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget). b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year. c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year. d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented. b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>22. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>23. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>24. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>25. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). Before BY-3. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>27. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <p>a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>32. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>33. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>38. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>41. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive's budget) is a "document for internal use."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The draft law on the Budget Law for budget year 2009, (the executive’s budget) is a “document for internal use.”</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	
<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A considerable amount of information is available from the DGI and the Chamber of Commerce. However, the information is technical in nature, so that it is difficult for the public to understand it. We have also noted that the DGI wishes to raise the public's awareness of the procedure for paying certain taxes, such as land titles, but the awareness-raising effort is not systematic or ongoing.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "b"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> In my opinion, the response should actually be "c" because the information provided to the public is too technical to be sufficiently exploited and used for the majority of Nigeriens.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "c" because I even checked some information with the Niger Chamber of Commerce, the Treasury, and the DGI, and it is difficult for me to access some information. This shows that preferential tariffs are often applied to certain persons.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I agree with the peer reviewers that the information is too technical and not always readily available to the general public.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. Officials from the Tax Revenue Authority and Treasury disclose this information selectively.</p>	<p>d</p>

57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?

- a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

"With regard to taxes, the proposed measures are in the general context of improving the business environment, tax transition and performance of tax services. They also seek to ease the tax burden on taxpayers. This is the case for the lower rates for the synthetic tax [taxe synthétique] for operators of private telecenters in an environment dominated by mobile phones, the exemption from the single tax on salaries and wages [impôt unique sur les traitements et salaires – UITS], and for the judicial allowance for judges in an effort to improve the productivity of our judicial system." Excerpt from the "rapport général de la commission des finances du Parlement sur la loi de finances 2009" (General Parliamentary Finance Committee Report on the Budget Law) enacted November 14, 2009.

Comment:

Articles 1 to 20 of the Draft Budget Law and the Budget Law for year 2009 address permanent tax and tax rates. For each tax, the amount is given, as well as the collection method and penalties for late payment or non-payment.

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: In my opinion, the response should actually be "c," precisely for the reasons the researcher mentioned: because a reading of Articles 1 to 20 of the 2009 Draft Budget Law provides insufficient analytical information on the distribution of taxes.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." Some important information is still withheld.

Researcher Response: I agree with the peer reviewers.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The analysis presented in the document accounts for a selected group in the population. It does not provide an analysis of the distribution of income tax.

d

<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> IMF <i>Letters of Intent</i> published April 27, 2009: http://www.imf.org/external/np/loi/2009/ner/042709.pdf in English.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The conditions associated with IFI assistance (World Bank and IMF) are never revealed to the public, because very often they contain unpopular measures and the government does not want the public to know about them. The public is informed only when agreements are officially signed. And even then the information is reduced to the amount that these IFIs grant to the government. The same withholding of information on the conditionalities is observed in the representative offices of these institutions based in Niger.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was “d”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i> pg. 36, states that “should be grounds for a “c” answer, if at least some other information is made available.”</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?

- a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
- b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

"Anticipated external resources in 2009 amounted to 302.06 billion, versus 228.91 billion in 2008, for an increase of 73.15 billion, or 31.95%. These resources consist of budgetary loans and assistance, as well as grants (non-repayable aid) and project loans." Excerpt from the "Extrait du rapport général de la commission des finances du Parlement sur la loi de finances 2009" (General Parliamentary Finance Committee Report on the Budget Law) enacted November 14, 2009.

Comment:

The conditions associated with assistance from donor countries are not fully disclosed to the public. During official opening ceremonies or ceremonies for signing agreements for these grants that the media reports on to the public, sometimes certain donor countries and the Ministry of Finance do point out a few tied conditions.

d

Researcher Response to this Question was "c"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: In my opinion, the response should actually be "d," because the information the media provides is only the amount, whether it is bilateral or multilateral, and the donor's identity. This information is insufficient to know all the conditions tied to the assistance.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "d," because even if there is some idea of the resources, it is somewhat minimal to answer "c," because the information on the conditions is not presented.

Researcher Response: I agree with the peer reviewers.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The question asks about whether donor conditions are made publicly available. The researcher states that these conditions are not necessarily publicly available, only total sums of aid and donor.

<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> When the draft budget is presented to Parliament, the media report to the public "l'exposé des motifs de la loi des finances de l'année" (the presentation of the justifications for the year's Budget Law) which is in fact a summary of the budget. This presentation is also attached to the Official Gazette when the Secretariat General of the government publishes the law. The presentation of justifications for the 2009 Budget Law provides a considerable amount of information.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>61. Does the executive publish a "citizens budget" or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The 2009 budget is divided into four books with a total of 418 pages; this makes ownership difficult for citizens who are unfamiliar with budgetary concepts.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> The citizen's budget is not produced.</p>	d

<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No, readers have to find the explanations on their own.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information. d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In 2009, a draft law on the right to access sources of information from the government was initiated by a member of Parliament. However, the proposal was not enacted due to opposition from the administration. In 2009, we noted that directorates of documentation and public relations were created in several ministries. They are in charge of facilitating information to the public in particular. In early September 2009, the “ministère de la fonction publique” (Ministry of the Civil Service) organized a workshop on access to sources of information. However, there is not yet a statutory code for the right to access information.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A circular letter from the Prime Minister in 2006 prohibits civil servants from divulging information “to certain malevolent persons.” Despite the change in administration in 2007, this letter has not been repealed.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

- a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
- b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Everything depends on the civil servant's willingness or the contacts the information seeker has in the government.

Researcher Response to this Question was "c"

Peer Reviewer One Comment: In my opinion, the response should actually be "d," since there is no law on the right to access information. Even in practice, it is generally difficult to obtain systematically reliable information from civil servants.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Researcher Response: I agree with the peer reviewers.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The question does not ask about political will, it asks about practice.

d

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process		
Executive's Formulation of the Budget		
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The release date is set in permanent law. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 39 of Law 2003-11 of April 1, 2003, on the organic budget laws: "the draft Budget Law for the year, including the report and explanatory annexes, shall be submitted to the National Assembly office as soon as the budget session begins." Article 73 of the August 9, 1999 Constitution: "Each year, the National Assembly shall automatically meet in two regular sessions and shall be convened by its President (....). The second session, called the budget session, begins in the first week of October and shall not last longer than sixty (60) days." Article 50 of Decree 2003-234 PRN/MF/E of September 30, 2003 determines the process for the annual preparation of the national budget: "October 1: the draft Budget Law shall be submitted to the National Assembly; the National Assembly shall review and enact the draft Budget Law."</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a	

67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

- a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
- b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Article 50 of Decree 2003-234 PRN/MF/E of September 30, 2003, which determines the process for the annual preparation of the national budget, provided for a timetable for preparing the budget as follows:

- January-February: budget preparatory work begins;
- March: preparation of the macroeconomic and budgetary framework note; preparation of the budget outline; preparation of the economic and financial guidance note;
- April: preparation and submission of the budgetary circular letter to the institutions and line ministries;
- June: preparation and submission of the ceiling letters to the line departments; submission of draft budgets of the institutions and line ministries; preparation and submission of budgetary conferences timetable;
- July: budgetary conferences;
- August: budgetary arbitration; final determination of revenue and expenditures; preparation of the first draft of the Budget Law; preparation of the budgetary manuals;
- September: review of the preliminary Budget Law; finalization of budgetary documents;
- October 1: submission of the draft Budget Law to the National Assembly; National Assembly reviews and enacts the draft Budget Law -
- December: the President of the Republic enacts the Budget Law; publication in the Official Gazette.

b

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "a"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b," because often it is not observed and relevant information is missing.

Researcher Response: I agree with the peer reviewers.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "b" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The question does not ask about political will, it asks about practice.

<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Most of the dates are observed except the date of publication in the Official Gazette. The law provided that publication will occur in December, just after Parliament enacts the budget in November. In general, it takes until January or February of the following year to publish the budget in the Official Gazette, which amounts to a two-month delay. This was the case for the 2009 Budget Law.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

- a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
- b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
- c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
- d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

"The officials from the Ministry of the Economy and Finance noted the different stages of enacting the draft Budget Law. The purpose is to allow the line departments to know not only their budget, but also the breakdown of appropriations by budget heading, for which they are entirely responsible. Moreover, they wished to note that the draft budget submitted to the National Assembly is a government document rather than a document of the Ministry of the Economy and Finance, which is only responsible for preparing and implementing it." Excerpt from the "rapport général de la commission des finances du Parlement sur la loi de finances 2009" (General Parliamentary Finance Committee Report on the Budget Law) enacted November 14, 2009.

Comment:

Based on this citation and on proposals to amend the budget made by the standing committees of the National Assembly, it can be stated that the executive does not consult Parliament in the process of determining budgetary priorities. According to the members of the Assembly Finance Committee and parliamentary officials, the executive branch does not consult the legislative branch in determining budgetary priorities.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

d

<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The citizens learn of the budget once it is submitted to Parliament for review and enactment.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The pre-budget statement is not released to the public; the public learns of it once it is submitted to Parliament.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The pre-budget statement is not released to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The pre-budget statement is not released to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> "The budget year is the same as the calendar year. It begins on January 1 and ends on December 31" Article 2 of Law 2003-11 of April 1, 2003, on the organic budget laws.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> For example, for budget year 2009, the draft Budget Law was registered with the office of the president of the National Assembly on October 2, 2008, which was three months before the budget year began.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> According to the Parliament Finance Committee General Report, enacted November 14, 2008, the committee took the testimony of 28 people as part of the review of the 2009 Budget Law. The list of these persons is attached in the annex. Upon reading this list, it becomes clear that 20 of the 28 people are Ministry of the Economy and Finance employees. The others are officials of the chambers of commerce and a few managing directors of state-owned companies. The opinions of the public and citizens are not collected.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The reading of the Parliamentary Committee General Report on the 2009 Budget Law, enacted November 14, 2009, reveals that the committee held external hearings of certain ministries, development projects and institutions, including in particular: (1) the financial services development project; (2) the Chamber of Commerce, Agriculture, Industry and Crafts of Niger; (3) the Ministry of Commerce, Industry and Standardization; and (4) the Ministry of Transportation and Civil Aviation.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> These hearings were not held in 2009.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?

- a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.
- b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.
- d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

"The purpose of the hearing of the Minister of Commerce, Industry and Standardization is to enlighten the Finance Committee members as to the amount of CFAF 5 billion and CFAF 11 billion to be used respectively for replenishing the OPVN reserve stocks and to establish OPVN working capital." Excerpt from the "Rapport général de la commission des finances du Parlement sur la loi de finances 2009" (Parliamentary Finance Committee General Report on the 2009 Budget Law) enacted November 14, 2009.

Comment:

Written "summary reports" are prepared for the sessions of the standing committees and Parliamentary plenary sessions that are available to the public upon request. Moreover, the Parliament radio station that airs programs in the capital city broadcasts some budgetary debates. However, as their name indicates, these reports exclude certain details.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

b

79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

- a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.
- b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

The information is presented as a total. For example, in the "rapport général de la commission des finances du Parlement sur la loi de finances 2009" (Parliamentary Finance Committee General Report on the 2009 Budget Law) enacted November 14, 2009, the hearing of the Defense and Security Committee revealed the following: "in the area of defense and security, the committee members raised the topic and mentioned all the efforts the government has made, including the enactment of different programming laws for which there should be no interference when they are implemented. That is why they believe it is urgent to release the appropriations provided for this purpose in accordance with the law."

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

b

80. Does the legislature have authority *in law* to amend the budget presented by the executive?

- a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority *in law* to amend the budget.
- b. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, with some limitations.
- c. Yes, the legislature has authority *in law* to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.
- d. No, the legislature does not have any authority *in law* to amend the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Extrait du adopté le 14 novembre 2009

"The proposals and amendments filed by the members of Parliament are inadmissible when enacting them would have the consequence of decreasing government resources or increasing the public debt, unless they are accompanied by a proposal to increase revenue or generate equivalent savings." Article 95 of the new August 18, 2009.

"All the standing general committees submitted requests for additional funds for the ministries and institutions that are under their area of jurisdiction. To illustrate these grievances, all the standing committees submitted an amount of roughly CFA 18 billion." Excerpt from the "rapport général de la commission des finances du Parlement sur la loi de finances 2009" (Parliamentary Finance Committee General Report on the 2009 Budget Law) enacted November 14, 2009.

Comment:

As can be seen, the authority of the members of Parliament to amend the budget is limited.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

b

<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals or the approved budget is not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The three annex books give details of the expenditures by ministry, central directorates, units and programs.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No in-year reports are published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No in-year reports are published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such reports are not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. d. In-year reports are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not publish in-year reports. Also, the fact that in-year reports and mid-year reviews are not published, as in 2008, seriously impairs the public's right to budgetary information, outside the periods when the budget is enacted and the budget review laws are examined.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not publish mid-year reviews.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not publish mid-year reviews.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive does not publish mid-year reviews.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 4 of Law 2003-11 of April 1, 203 on the Organic Budget Law provides that: "only amending Budget Laws can modify the provisions of the initial Budget Law during the year."</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive uses the amending Budget Laws to obtain the legislature's consent.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> At this time, even if we note that government tenders are published in the newspapers, several officials have been arrested and are being prosecuted for unfairness between citizens for the terms and conditions of awarding government contracts.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> As a general rule, amending Budget Laws are enacted before the funds are spent. For 2009, there was no amending budget law.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In the 2009 budget law, in paragraph 649 on other current transfers, there is a budgetary reserve of CFAF 1,180,770,568. The legislature approved this fund before the expenditure was made.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. The executive does not release a year-end report. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The "loi de règlement" (year-end report) for budget year 2007 was prepared by the executive, but had not yet been voted on by the legislature when parliament was dissolved in June 2009. No vote will be taken until the new legislative elections, scheduled for October 2009, and the seating of a new Parliament. Despite this delay, the annual review with the IMF, carried out in early September 2009, ranks Niger at the top of the WAEMU countries in terms of the production of year-end reports.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "c"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> In my opinion, the response should actually be "d" because the year-end report was not produced, let alone released to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The year-end report is not publicly available.</p>	d

<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Produced for internal use, but not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Produced for internal usage, but not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Produced for internal usage, but not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such a report is not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such a report is not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such a report is not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such a report is not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such a report is not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Compared to 2008, a key document is lacking. It is the year-end report commonly called the "Loi de règlement pour l'année budgétaire 2007" (Budget Review Law for Budget Year 2007). As for the year-end report, the distinctive feature of the 2010 OBI is that year-end report was not enacted for 2007. For this reason, there is no documentary statutory basis for us to respond to questions 100 to 110.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Every year the SAI prepares a general public report of the comments made during the various audits carried out during the previous year as well as on the management and results of the enterprises it audits. This report is given to the president of the republic, the president of the national assembly, and to the prime minister. It is made public. The SAI prepares a report yearly on the execution of the Budget Laws that accompany the general statement of compliance.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In reality, these official deadlines are not met. In particular, the 2010 survey shows that the "Cour des Comptes" (SAI), which is supposed to audit the government's financial statements, has not yet been put in place, notwithstanding the enactment in 2007 of the organic law that determines its composition, its organization, its operation and its terms of reference. This considerably reduces the control and auditing mechanisms of the general government budget, and hence the accountability of those who are responsible for the management of public funds.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The reports have not been released to the public, more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The reports have not been released to the public, more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "c"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> In my opinion, the response should actually be "b," because Niger does not produce an audit report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "b" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. The audit report is not publicly available.</p>	b

<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <p>a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.</p> <p>b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> “The first president of the “Cour des Comptes” (SAI) is chosen from among the most senior magistrates of the judicial order with the highest rank. He is appointed by decree of the president of the republic based on a proposal from the minister of justice, after the consent of the “Conseil supérieur de la magistrature” (high council of magistrates). Article 12 of organic law 2007-22 of July 2, 2007 determining the composition, organization, terms of reference and operation of the SAI. “The first president of the “Cour des Comptes” (SAI) is appointed for a period of four (4) [sic]. He can be removed from office only if he resigns or is dismissed and with the consent of the High Council of Magistrates, or if he retires, or if the period for which he was appointed expires.” Article 17 of the same law.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <p>a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It does not release the audit of these funds to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> “The Cour des Comptes (SAI) verifies the legality of revenue and public expenditures. It rules on the financial statements of public accountants. It sanctions de facto management and management errors. The SAI is in charge of auditing budget management and execution; for this purpose it is vested with the power to audit: the management of all public bodies, development projects, organizations that obtain financial assistance from the government, public enterprises, state-owned companies, political parties, social security organizations, etc.” Article 2 of the “Loi sur la cour des comptes” (SAI Act).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Yes, it may decide on its own to undertake an audit.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> "The SAI budget is based on proposals prepared by the financial units and is listed in the draft Budget Law." Article 142 of the SAI Act.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. e. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> However, only certain inspections of finances or certain court investigations have been carried out or begun based on revelations of misappropriation by the independent newspapers. In 2009, we can mention the case of former Prime Minister Hama Amadou, who was indicted by Parliament and incarcerated for 10 months as a result of a court investigation against him after the newspaper "Événement" published an article.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized. No, audit reports are not scrutinized. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> “The “déclaration générale de conformité” (general statement of compliance) (prepared by the SAI) and its annexes, as well as the “rapport sur l'exécution des lois de finances” (report on the execution of the budget laws), are submitted by the administration to the office of the national assembly at the same time as the “projet de loi de règlement” (draft year-end report). These different reports are then published in the Official Gazette of the Republic of Niger” Article 135 of the SAI Act.</p> <p><u>Comment</u> The Parliamentary Finance Committee is asked in the first instance to examine the budget review law, which is in fact the year-end budget execution report. In Niger, as is mentioned in Table 2, the audit report is not produced, let alone examined by the legislature. Based on discussions with the former Finance Committee members, we can say that this procedure has never been carried out.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The public is never informed of the actions the executive takes to address audit recommendations.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs. b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details. d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> According to the testimony of several former deputies who are members of the Parliamentary Finance Committee, these reports are not audited.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d