International Budget Project

OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

BULGARIA

October 2005

International Budget Project
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Latchezar Bogdanov  
Organization: Industry Watch 
Address: 16 G.M. Dimitrov Blvd, Sofia 1797 Bulgaria  
Telephone: (+359) 889 209 752  
E-mail: bogdanov@iwatchbulgaria.com  
Internet Website: www.iwatchbulgaria.com

Name: Georgi Angelov 
Organization: Open Society Institute - Sofia 
Address: 56, Solunska str., 1000 Sofia Bulgaria  
Telephone: (+359) 887 901 889  
E-mail: george@osf.bg  
Internet Website: www.osf.bg
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents ..............................................4
   Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire .......... 5
   Table 2. Internet Links for Key Budget Documents ............................................... 6
   Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal ..... 7
   Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports ............................ 8

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal .................................................. 9
   Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond ........................................................... 10
   Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year ......................................................... 23
   Comprehensiveness ............................................................................................... 33
   The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring ............................................... 40
   Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring .......................... 43

Section Three: The Budget Process ................................................................. 48
   Executive’s Formulation of the Budget ................................................................. 49
   Legislative Approval of the Budget .................................................................... 53
   Executive’s Implementation of the Budget ......................................................... 58
   Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution .......................... 66
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
**Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire**

*Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
<th>Budget Year Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>2004</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.*
Table 2. Internet Links for Key Budget Documents

Please provide the Internet link for the document, or indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced, But Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, But Not on the Internet.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Website</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td><a href="http://www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=7">http://www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=7</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Not Produced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td><a href="http://www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=465">http://www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=465</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Review</td>
<td>Produced, But Not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>Publicly Available, But Not on the Internet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Documents</td>
<td><a href="http://www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=7">http://www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=7</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant Ministries &amp; Departments</td>
<td><a href="http://www.minfin.bg/?language=english">http://www.minfin.bg/?language=english</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>For the following reports, place “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?**

For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EXECUTIVE’S BUDGET</th>
<th>PRE-BUDGET</th>
<th>MAIN DOCUMENT</th>
<th>BUDGET SUMMARY*</th>
<th>SUPPORTING DOCUMENT 1</th>
<th>ADDITIONAL DOCUMENT 2</th>
<th>CITIZENS BUDGET</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities*</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No (some documents for 2004 available in English)</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
### Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<p>| For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available. |
|----------------|----------------|-----------------|-----------------|--------------|</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities*</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year
Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked “not applicable/other,” please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1.</strong> Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: This information is presented in Appendix 1 of the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” entitled “Budget 2005 by Responsibilities,” available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril1_Report%20Budget_2005_NA.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

Small units are just listed and their financing is not explicitly stated, and some of these small units sometimes accrue considerable amount of budgetary funds.

| 2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification? | b |
| a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. | |
| b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. | |
| c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. | |
| d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. | |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | |

Citation and/or comment: This information is presented in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria”, Part 3, Chapter 2 entitled “State Expenditures by Functions” (pp. 54-74), available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

The categorization is not compatible with international standards especially in the subgroups of the major functions.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: This information is presented in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria”, Part 3, Chapter 1 entitled “Public Expenditures by Economic Elements” (pp. 41-54), available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf
   The categorization is not entirely compatible with international standards especially in the subgroups of the major categories.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:
   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

   a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
   b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No program-level data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: This information is presented in Part 3, Chapter 1 “Public Expenditures by Economic Elements” (pp. 41-54) in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria,” available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:
   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**The researcher marked this answer as “b.”** The Bulgarian government prepares a Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, called “Budget Forecast for 2006-2008.” However it does not reflect the same levels of revenue and expenditure in years in which it overlaps with the budget. For example, the Medium-Term Expenditure Framework was prepared in May 2005 and the budget revenues and expenditures for 2006 are decided finally in October 2005. The “Budget Forecast for 2006-2008” is available at: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/MTFF%2006-08-Final-F-1.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/MTFF%2006-08-Final-F-1.pdf)

**Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer:** Multi-year projections - “Budget Forecast for 2006-2008” - are not released annually alongside the budget, and are not based on the same macroeconomic assumptions as the budget, nor do the projections reflect the same levels of revenue and expenditure in years in which they overlap.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” There is a separate section entitled “Policy Directions for the Main Fields of Expenditure for the Period 2006 - 2008” in the Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008 (pages 36-61). It includes information on expenditures for the year (2005) when the document was produced and aggregate estimates for the years 2006 - 2008. For example, a table with expenditure estimates (or projections) - calculated by the administrative units along with calculations based on permanent prices - is presented on page 37. Estimates of the aggregate and more detailed levels of expenditure are presented further in the text and in the tables.

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   The researcher marked this answer as “d.” The Bulgarian government prepared a Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, called “Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008.” However, it does not reflect the same levels of revenue and expenditure in years in which it overlaps with the budget. The “Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008” is available at: http://www.minfin.bg/docs/MTFF%2006-08-Final-F-1.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” See the comment above (question 5). Budget expenditure estimates, presented in greater detail are included in the section “Policy Directions for the Main Fields of Expenditure for the Period 2006 -2008” of the Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008 (pages 36-61).

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

   IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>7.</th>
<th>Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

The researcher marked this answer as **“c.”** In the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria,” (page 30) all major tax revenues are identified. However, the data are too aggregated and there is no data on different excise taxes and corporate taxes, and the property taxes are not shown at all (they are part of the “other taxes” category). The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

**Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer:** Less than two-thirds of taxes are identified individually by their source. For example, in the budget it is not stated what percentage of the excise revenues comes from fuel, tobacco or alcohol duties. Therefore, the source of the excise is not shown. As to property taxes – they are shown in the budget, but within a broader group of taxes – “other taxes” with no individual data.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” In my view, in “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria,” (page 30) there is a sufficient level of detail about the different sources of tax revenue to merit the answer “b.” For example, taxes (that represent more than 80 percent from all projected revenues for 2005) are broken down into (1) direct taxes, including corporate taxes (with two subcategories), personal income taxes, professional, health and pensions insurance etc., and (2) indirect taxes, including VAT, excises, duties, etc.

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** The answer “c” is correct. Regarding the comment, the property taxes are municipal taxes and normally they are not shown in the state budget. Even currently, they are gathered separately.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?

   a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “c.” In the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria,” (page 39) all major non-tax revenues are identified. However, the data are too aggregated and there are no data on different types of fees (they comprise one third of the non-tax revenues) or on different types of property incomes. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” On page 39 of the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria,” there is information on at least two-thirds of all non-tax revenues. This includes information for revenues from state property, concessions, sale of state property, transfers from the national bank. It is true that there is no detailed data on the state taxes and fees but I doubt whether if such data was presented it would tell us anything more and change the quality of the information dramatically.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “b.” The information is not presented. The Bulgarian government prepares a Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, called “Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008.” However, it does not reflect the same levels of revenue and expenditure in years in which it overlaps with the budget. The “Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008” is available at: http://www.minfin.bg/docs/MTFF%2006-08-Final-F-1.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” Aggregate revenue estimates are presented on page 28 in the report cited above. They are: 2006 – BGN 17 666.7 millions (39.6 percent from GDP); 2007 – BGN 19 217.5 millions (39.4 percent from GDP); 2008 – BGN 20 542.8 millions (38.7% from GDP).

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “d.” The information is not presented. The Bulgarian government prepares a Medium-Term Expenditure Framework, called “Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008.” However, it does not reflect the same levels of revenue and expenditure in years in which it overlaps with the budget. The “Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008” is available at: http://www.minfin.bg/docs/MTFF%2006-08-Final-F-1.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” In the “Budget Forecast for 2006 – 2008”, pages 29-35, there is information on revenue estimates covering the majority of all major budget items for the years 2006- 2008.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?
   
   a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
   b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
   c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
   d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: In the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria,” (refer to page 86) the forecast for the domestic and external government debt in the beginning of the budget year is presented. The internal and external borrowing for the budget year (refer to page 89) is also presented. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?
   
   a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.
   b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: This information is presented in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 50). The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (pages 86-87) presents information on the composition of government debt. Information is provided relating to domestic/external division, currency denomination, interest rates composition (fixed vs. floating rates). The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

   Additional information on the maturity of the debt and some data on the interest rates are presented in the Ministry of Finance’s Monthly Bulletin “State Debt.” The bulletin is available at: [www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=656](http://www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=656)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.

b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.

c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.

d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “a.” The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (pages 15-16) presents information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based, such as inflation, real growth of GDP, unemployment rate, foreign exchange rates, international interest rates, current account. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” This is because the information in this part does not overlap with the real situation on the market. For example, the price of oil is set at $30 per barrel, which is obviously no longer realistic.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “a” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: In the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 91) there is some narrative discussion of the risks before the budget. However, no sensitivity analysis is presented. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:** I agree that the information on the possible impact of various macroeconomic factors on the budget included in the “Report on the Law on the State Budget of Bulgaria” is rather poor and does not contain a profound analysis. However, to some extent, there is a relevant discussion on the possible impact of domestic demand, oil prices, and US dollar exchange rate on the budget. This shows there is an idea (though vague) that possible risks for the budget should be taken into account and made known to the public.

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: In the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” some data on new policies is presented. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “b.” The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” presents data on new policies proposals, but some details are excluded. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer: There is some information on the effects of income tax, excises, and VAT changes on revenue, so “b” is relevant.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The report lacks important details – too many statements go unsupported by real figures.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment: This information is presented in Appendix 1 of the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” entitled “Budget 2005 by Responsibilities.” It is available at: <a href="http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril1_Report%20Budget_2005_NA.pdf">www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril1_Report%20Budget_2005_NA.pdf</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification? |
|   | **c** |
| a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. |
| b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. |
| c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. |
| d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |
| Citation and/or comment: This information is presented as a spreadsheet in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria.” |
| Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: |
20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** This information is presented in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria,” Part 3, Chapter 1 entitled “Public Expenditures by Economic Elements” (pages 41-54). It is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)
   The categorization is not entirely compatible with international standards especially in the subgroups of the major categories.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
   b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
   c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
   d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” contains no program-level data. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (pages 17-21) presents data for the expenditures and revenues for the first seven months of the year prior to the budget year and an estimate is made for the budget until the end of the year. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</td>
<td>a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 41) presents data for the aggregate level of expenditure for three years before the budget year. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 41) presents economic classification for three years before the budget year. No data is provided for administrative and functional classifications. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 41) presents data on the economic classification that reflects actual outcomes for two and three years before the budget year. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: This practice is not very widespread.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “c.” In the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria,” (page 30) all major tax revenues are identified for three years before the budget year. However, the data presented are aggregated. There is no data on the different types of excises and corporate taxes; and the property taxes are not shown at all – they are part of the “other taxes” category. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” I think that the information presented on page 30 in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” is detailed enough to award “b” to this question. For example, taxes (that represent more than 80 percent from all projected revenues for 2004) are broken down into (1) direct, including corporate taxes (with two subcategories), personal income taxes, professional, health and pensions insurance etc., an (2) indirect taxes, including VAT, excises, duty taxes, etc.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: The answer “c” is correct. Though it should be mentioned that the BY-1 is not the outcome but the budgetary prognosis.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “c.” The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 39) presents all major non-tax revenues for two years before the budget year. However, the data presented are aggregated and there are no data on the different types of fees (they comprise one third of the non-tax revenues) or different types of property incomes. The report is available at:

   www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” See the comment for question 8. The table presented on page 39 in the report cited above contains information for the year before the budget year as well.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (pages 17-21) presents data on revenues for the first seven months of the year prior to the budget year and an estimate is made for the budget until the end of the year. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 30) presents data for the aggregate level of revenues for three years prior to the budget year. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- **a.** Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
- **b.** Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
- **c.** Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
- **d.** No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 30) presents data for three years prior to the budget year and revenues are listed in the same classification as the data for the budget year. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

- **a.** Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- **b.** Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- **c.** Before BY-3.
- **d.** No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 30) presents data for two and three years prior to the budget year for revenues that reflect actual outcomes. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
   b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
   c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
   d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (pages 86-90) presents data for government debt. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf Additional information on the maturity of the debt and some data on the interest rates are presented in the Ministry of Finance’s Monthly Bulletin “State Debt.” The bulletin is available on the Internet at: www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=656

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 

34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (pages 86-90) presents data on government debt for the year before the budget year and two years prior to the budget year. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 


### Comprehensiveness

35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

**The researcher marked this answer as “b.”** Appendix 8 of the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” presents a list of extra-budgetary funds. The Appendix is available at: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril-08-%20lbsf-yes.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril-08-%20lbsf-yes.pdf)

Information on extra-budgetary funds is also presented in Appendix 1 of the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (for example page 59 for “Teachers Pension Fund”). Available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril1_Report%20Budget_2005_NA.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril1_Report%20Budget_2005_NA.pdf)


**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” Listing them is not enough; there must be more information on these.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. In addition, some information on extra budgetary funds such as the teachers’ pension fund is available.
36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?

- **a.** Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- **b.** Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.
- **c.** Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- **d.** No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Data on intergovernmental transfers and some narrative discussion is presented in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (pages 75-78), available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

Additional data is also presented in Appendix 4 on the local services delegated by the government and financed by the government budget. The report is available at: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/pril-04-standarti.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/pril-04-standarti.pdf)

A mechanism for defining subsidies for municipalities is presented in Appendix 3 of the report, available at: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril-03-Mehanizam.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril-03-Mehanizam.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?

- **a.** Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- **b.** Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.
- **c.** Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- **d.** No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Appendix 1 (pages 52-54) presents data and some discussion on the subsidies for the public TV and radio stations, available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril1_Report%20Budget_2005_NA.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Pril1_Report%20Budget_2005_NA.pdf)


The information on subsidies is not extensive and is sometimes missing.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** No information is presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation. There have been instances where public companies have come to the rescue of other bankrupt public entities in order to reduce unemployment or continue to sell their products or services without collecting payments. However, such quasi-financial activities have not been reported in the budget documents.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on financial assets is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” (page 19) presents data on the fiscal reserve of the government (financial assets held in the central bank and commercial banks). However, no additional data are available and no data for government shares in different companies is presented. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?

   a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: This information is not presented in the budget documents.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

   a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” states that all arrears will be paid before the beginning of the budget year (a requirement of the International Monetary Fund). However, this is the only information available. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td>c</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” presents data for several projects that received government loan guarantees. However, no additional information is available in the budget documentation. The report is available at: [www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf)

Information on the total value of guaranteed loans is presented in the Ministry of Finance’s Monthly Bulletin titled “State Debt.” The bulletin is available at: [www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=656](http://www.minfin.bg/inpage.php?id=656)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
<td>d</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on future liabilities is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Information on future liabilities is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

   a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The researcher marked this answer as “c.” The “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” presents information on aggregate level of donor assistance. It provides information on revenues from the EU funds, but only as an aggregate total. No additional information is available. The report is available at: www.minfin.bg/docs/Report%202005%20-%20Final-DV.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: I agree no extensive information is included in the “Report on the 2005 Law on the State Budget of the Republic of Bulgaria” but extensive information about the foreign donor assistance can be easily found on the Ministry of Finance website and other publicly available websites. Most of the donor assistance to Bulgaria comes from institutions like the European Commission or the World Bank who work under strict transparency obligations.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire.

45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information on tax expenditures is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: No earmarked revenues are identified individually. One needs prior knowledge to know that some revenues are earmarked.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The percentage is not available to the public because these expenditures are not identified individually and they are part of the military or security budgets, which are not given in detail.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Budget Narrative &amp; Performance Monitoring</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** This is not a very well observed practice.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

| 49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)? |
| a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. |
| b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. |
| c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. |
| d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?

   a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.
   b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.
   d. No non-financial data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: For some programs such data is presented but these programs represent less than 2/3 of the total.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?

   a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
   b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
   c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
   d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?

   a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.
   b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No performance indicators are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: No performance indicators are presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?

- a. All performance indicators are well designed.
- b. Most performance indicators are well designed.
- c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.
- d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?

- a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
- d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

- a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Some information is presented, but generally it lacks detail.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
### Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

*Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources? | a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates and fee schedules is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.  
b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.  
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.  
d. No, information is not presented.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

| Citation and/or comment: | Generally, most changes in the tax rates are presented in budget documents. However, the executive does not provide full descriptions of either the tax rate or the fee schedule. |

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden? | a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.  
b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.  
c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.  
d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

| Citation and/or comment: | |

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “a.” The information on the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions is usually made public by the IFIs. The World Bank publishes the information on [www.worldbank.bg](http://www.worldbank.bg). The International Monetary Fund publishes information on: [http://www.imf.org/external/country/bgr/rr/rrindex.htm](http://www.imf.org/external/country/bgr/rr/rrindex.htm). The European Union publishes information on: [www.evropa.bg](http://www.evropa.bg).

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” I agree that comprehensive information is available to the public but this is not done by the government. Most of the information posted on the sites cited above is available in English only and I believe the executive should do more in order to ensure that the public has easier access to information in their native language on these issues.

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” The idea here is whether such information is given by the executive and not by the IFI. And somehow the executive doesn’t explain all the conditions and this is not because they exist on the sites of the IFI but because they hide behind the IFI for much more than it is expected.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “a” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire. For the purposes of answering the question, the executive itself need not disclose the information, but it can authorize the World Bank or IMF to disclose the information on its behalf.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>59.</th>
<th>Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>60.</th>
<th>Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, but the summary is not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, it does not provide a summary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>61.</th>
<th>Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, it does not publish a citizens budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, definitions are not provided.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

63. Does the executive make available to the public a summary of the budget process?

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, it includes a summary of the budget process that is very informative.</td>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, it includes a summary of the budget process that is somewhat informative.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, but the summary of the budget process is not very informative.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, it does not include a summary of the budget process.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

64. Do citizens have the right in law to access government information, including budget information?

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.</td>
<td>b</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** There is a law giving citizens the right to government information. However, the required fees are prohibitive for some and certain information is not accessible due to exceptions in the law.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   a. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.
   b. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The same as question 64.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

66. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The same as question 64.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The researcher answer lies closer to d than b.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
Section Three: The Budget Process
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Budget Process</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Formulation of the Budget</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The release date is set in permanent law.</td>
<td>![a]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment: The deadline of 31 October is set in the State Budget Compilation Act (1996), art. 20.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for its budget preparation process?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.</td>
<td>![a]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment: The budget preparation timetable is published in the Council of Ministers’ Decree (in State Gazette).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
69. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Short delays usually occur during the last stages before the approval of the draft budget by the government (which takes several days). 2005 was marked by delayed due to parliamentary elections and formation of the new government. Due to these changes, some ministries were delayed in proposing their draft budgets.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

70. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The executive usually contacts committee chairs and majority party leaders. Opposition members of parliament (MPs) are contacted if they are active in the budget & finance committee or the economic policy committee, but the communication is informal.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: The answer “c” is correct. Also the executive sends the control figures to the units and they have little freedom in increasing these control figures.
71. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

- a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
- b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
- c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
- d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Barring a few exceptions, the consultations are carefully conducted to suit the government’s public relations needs. The National Development Plan is discussed more broadly.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

---

72. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?

- a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.
- b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.
- c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.
- d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The MoF only holds a press conference in the month of August or September to announce budget priorities, but no separate document is released.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>73.</th>
<th>Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
<td>See question 72. Although no separate document is prepared, the MoF releases some information. For example, through its Agency for Economic Forecasts and Analysis, the Ministry of Finance presented a detailed macroeconomic framework (2006-2008) as part of the Budget 2006 process, available at: <a href="http://www.aeaf.minfin.bg/cms/docs/bg/ops/m_economy/budget2006_sept.pdf">www.aeaf.minfin.bg/cms/docs/bg/ops/m_economy/budget2006_sept.pdf</a>. In addition, in May prior to elections, the outgoing government for the first time prepared a 3-year (2006-2008) budget forecast, available at: <a href="http://www.minfin.bg/docs/MTFF%2006-08-Final-F-1.pdf">http://www.minfin.bg/docs/MTFF%2006-08-Final-F-1.pdf</a>. However, it was not part of the budget procedure for 2006 and we do not know whether this practice will be continued.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>74.</th>
<th>Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
<td>See questions 72&amp;73. Until 2004, overviews of macroeconomic policies – budget deficit, major tax changes, and overall spending changes – were announced through a press conference. However, they lacked narrative explanation, for instance, on the economic theory behind the link between budget and priorities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Legislative Approval of the Budget

#### 75. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?

- a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.
- b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.
- c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.
- d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** The deadline is 31 October — set in the State Budget Compilation Act (1996), art. 20; also see question 67.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

#### 76. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?

- a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.
- b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.
- c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.
- d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** The constituencies that testify are typically a limited number of think-tanks, major trade unions and major business associations. Media representatives are present, but cannot ask questions or comment during the hearings.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>77. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>78. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
79. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?

   a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.
   b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.
   d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Members of the committee give interviews and respond to media questions, but no official statement or report on the hearings is released on behalf of the committees.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

80. Does the executive present more details or provide a better explanation of any budget proposal, if members of the legislature (including from minority parties) request such information?

   a. The executive responds to such legislative requests, and it generally provides an appropriate and timely response.
   b. The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are sometimes not appropriate or timely.
   c. The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are typically not appropriate or timely.
   d. The executive responds selectively or ignores such legislative requests.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Due to the constrained time frame for budget approval, some questions go unanswered. The members of the legislature themselves withdraw some of their requests due to the length of time required to respond. In these matters, party affiliation of the MP requesting the information is not of importance.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
81. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee) given information for the budget year on the spending of secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature is provided some information on spending on secret items, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Some information is provided in the form of specially produced reports circulated exclusively among the MPs. Reports are typically produced in response to a special request made by the budget & finance committee or the parliament’s speaker.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

82. Does the legislature have authority to amend the budget presented by the executive?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority to amend the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has authority to amend the budget, with some limitations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the legislature has authority to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the legislature does not have any authority to amend the budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The State Budget Compilation Act requires that any changes made by the legislature should not impair significantly “the balance of revenue and expenditure.” In fact, very few significant changes in the executive’s budget have been made by the legislature in the last 6 years. However, the Bulgarian constitution de jure provides unlimited legislative authority to change or amend laws, i.e. Parliament might decide not to obey its own previous law by amending it.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
83. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?

   a. The approved budget includes program-level detail.
   b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals.
   d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The approved budget includes departmental totals and sometimes additional information, for example for larger projects such as the repairs for the Courts of Justice building.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

84. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

   a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.
   b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.
   c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.
   d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The breakdown is only by economic classification. Refer to the report for July 2005, available at: http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Rep_Bud_07-05_BG.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
85. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

- a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.
- b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
- c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. No in-year reports are released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The breakdown is only by economic classification. All spending is reported on a cash-basis, so no actual expenditure can be left unreported. Refer to the report for July 2005, available at: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Rep_Bud_07-05_BG.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Rep_Bud_07-05_BG.pdf)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

Executive’s Implementation of the Budget

86. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.
- b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
- c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Actual expenditures are compared to estimated expenditures (from the enacted budget) in the monthly release that is published on the Ministry of Finance’s website. However, the previous year’s monthly numbers are easily accessible for comparisons. Refer to the report for July 2005, available at: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Rep_Bud_07-05_BG.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Rep_Bud_07-05_BG.pdf)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>87. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</td>
<td>a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
<td>Revenues and expenditures (see questions 84 &amp; 86) are listed in the same report, released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>88. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</td>
<td>a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
<td>Refer to the report for July 2005, available at: <a href="http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Rep_Bud_07-05_BG.pdf">http://www.minfin.bg/docs/Rep_Bud_07-05_BG.pdf</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>89. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</td>
<td>a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
<td>See comment for question 86.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
90. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?

   a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.
   b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.
   c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.
   d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The monthly budget reports (see questions 84-89) provide
general information on deficit financing. In addition, the Ministry of Finance
produces a specialized monthly report on the Public Debt:

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

91. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related
to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile
of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is
      presented.
   b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not
      presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:
92. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?

   a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.
   b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.
   c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.
   d. In-year reports are not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Typically, the reports are released on the last day of the following month.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The executive does not release a mid-year review to the public.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
94. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: See comment for question 93.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

95. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

   a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.
   b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
   c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).
   d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: See comment for question 93.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
96. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.

b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.

c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.

d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: See comment for question 93.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

97. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain level, as specified in law or regulation)?

a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.

b. Yes, the executive advises the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.

c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.

d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The Minister of Finance has authority to increase expenditures above the aggregate amount approved by the National Assembly if revenues are higher than expected and the budget deficit target will not be compromised.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: There are a lot of possibilities for shifting between administrative units without approval of the National Assembly. The last government 2001-2005 was infamous for extensive spending not sanctioned by the legislators. The law requires legislature approval but we often see (in 2003 and 2004 for example) shifting of funds without approval on an “emergency basis.”
98. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?

a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.
b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.
c. The procurement of goods and services followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.
d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Exceptions typically include national security-related procurements and larger projects in energy and infrastructure. “Irregularities” in this case should not mean violation of the law, but rather choosing non-transparent (e.g. direct contracting) but otherwise legal procedures. Examples include the purchases of military fighters and helicopters by the Ministry of Defense, or the contract to supply the entire public administration with Microsoft software.

| Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: |

99. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).
b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: During the last 5 years it has become common practice for the government to spend the accumulated surpluses (typically revenues exceeded what was approved in the State Budget Act) discretionally in the last quarter of the year. It has done so without asking for legislative approval (i.e. without amendment to the State Budget Act). See comment for questions 97 and 101. The provision used for this action was in art. 35 paragraph 2 of the State Budget Compilation Act. Since November 2005, the parliament has amended the provision to set a threshold of 1.5% — of consolidated revenues planned in the original budget— for such increases in expenditure.

| Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: |
| Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: |
100. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

   a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.
   b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.
   c. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.
   d. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: No supplemental budgets have been approved since 1997. However, during the last 5 years, the government has directed the revenue surplus towards discretionary transfers to different ministries, municipalities, or other public companies (e.g. hospitals or public transport). These funds were more than 4% of 2004’s budgeted expenditures. Excess revenue might exceed 4% of planned revenue, but not all of it is expended as supplemental spending at their discretion. A portion of the expenditure is placed in the fiscal reserve account of the government.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

101. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

   a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.
   b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.
   d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Parliament does not approve the nature of expenditures within the "contingency" item, only the ceiling. As a result, the executive has discretion to decide how to spend the money between different "contingency" projects. Also, a recent amendment in the State Budget Compilation Act (Article 35, paragraph 2) allows the government to allocate up to 1.5% of GDP of the revenue surplus (if any) without the approval of the legislature.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
### Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Selected Option</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 102. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report or another document that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year? | a. Reports are released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.  
b. Reports are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.  
c. Reports are released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.  
d. The executive does not release a year-end report.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | a               |
| Citation and/or comment: Report on the execution of the state budget for 2004 is published at the Ministry of Finance’s website: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/2004g%20-%20doklad%20po%20izpalnenieto%20na%20dar.%20budjet%20na%20RB.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/2004g%20-%20doklad%20po%20izpalnenieto%20na%20dar.%20budjet%20na%20RB.pdf) | Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:  
Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: | a               |
| 103. In the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), have the data on the actual outcomes been audited? | a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.  
b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.  
c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.  
d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.  
e. Not applicable/other (please comment). | a               |
| Citation and/or comment: The year-end report titled “Report on the execution of the state budget for 2004” is made public on the MoF website, available at: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/2004g%20-%20doklad%20po%20izpalnenieto%20na%20dar.%20budjet%20na%20RB.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/2004g%20-%20doklad%20po%20izpalnenieto%20na%20dar.%20budjet%20na%20RB.pdf) | Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:  
Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: | a               |
104. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: An explanation is difficult to provide since the budget is not program-oriented. However, differences are discussed in detail in the year-end report by economic classification and by administrative units. Data on actual expenditures can also be tracked monthly by the public through the MoF’s website.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

105. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below)?

   a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
   b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
   c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
   d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Very few programs are analyzed since the budget process is still historic-based. See comment for question 103.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
106. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The discussion is by each separate revenue source (type of tax or fee). An explanation in the year-end report (report on the execution of the state budget) is much more detailed than the report that is released when the budget for the upcoming year is drafted. However, the cause-and-effect reasoning presented in the report is not detailed since most budgets are not program-oriented and thus no cost/benefit analysis is possible. Very limited information is presented to connect analysis of external environment and macroeconomic development with the outcome of a particular revenue or expenditure.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

107. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Information is provided in the MoF report, available at: [http://www.minfin.bg/docs/2004g%20-%20doklad%20po%20izpalnenieto%20na%20dar.%20budjet%20na%20RB.pdf](http://www.minfin.bg/docs/2004g%20-%20doklad%20po%20izpalnenieto%20na%20dar.%20budjet%20na%20RB.pdf)

However, these indicators are not used to explain most of the differences in actual outcome.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
108. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The answer “a” reflects programs that were designed and presented. In these cases, explanations can be assessed as ‘sufficient.’ Moreover, as mentioned in the comment for question 106, the year-end report provides much more detail than the report that is released with the draft budget.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

109. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Since no performance indicators are set (see comment for questions 52-54) no explanation is made after the end of the year.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
110. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

111. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
112. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.
d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Reports on audits are usually produced within 12 months of the end of the fiscal year, but not released to the public. The Supreme Audit Institution has discretion to publish the reports. It presents a report based on the audit results (but not separate audits of government departments/administrative units) to Parliament, which is publicly available.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

c

113. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the reports released to the public?

a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.
b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures have been audited.
c. Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures have been audited.
d. No expenditures have been audited, or the reports have not been released to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to comments for question 112. The Supreme Audit Institution publishes various reports, including for example the audit report on the execution of the budget of the National Social Security Institute for 2004.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
114. Do year-end audit reports of departmental expenditure that are released to the public include an executive summary?

   a. All of these audit reports include an executive summary.
   b. Most of these reports include an executive summary.
   c. Some of these reports include an executive summary.
   d. None of these audit reports include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to comment for question 112.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

115. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

   a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
   b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Per article 11 of the Supreme Audit Institution Act.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

116. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
   b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
   c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
   d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
117. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

- a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
- c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
- d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: State-owned enterprises and beneficiaries of public funding are excluded. The SAI has to follow an annual audit program, decided upon before the start of the year. Parliament may request a particular audit to be performed.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 

118. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Per article 23 of Supreme Audit Institution Act.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 
### 119. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

- a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
- b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
- c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
- d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** The parliamentary budget & finance committee debates the annual report on the audit activity of the Supreme Audit Institution. Other than that, the legislature has discretion to scrutinize whichever report it wishes to scrutinize. In practice, they view a limited number of reports, mostly ones that were requested by Parliament itself.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

### 120. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

- a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
- c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
- d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

---

74
121. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: It is presented in a series of separate reports, providing comments and recommendations to different departments.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: The report published on the SAI website presents aggregate and general information, and does not contain details and figures or any additional information.

122. Are audit reports related to national security and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to national security and other secret programs.
b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.
d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Secret programs are not audited.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: