This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: SIBA SANKAR MOHANTY, AMITABH BEHAR, AND RAMANAND RAM
Organization: CENTRE FOR BUDGET AND GOVERNANCE ACCOUNTABILITY (CBGA)
Address: A-11, Second Floor
Niti Bagh, New Delhi
India-110049
Telephone: (+91 11) 41741285/6/7
E-mail: cbadelhi@vsnl.net
Internet Website: www.ncasindia.org
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents ........................................... 4
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire ........... 5
Table 2. Internet Links for Key Budget Documents .............................................. 6
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal ....... 8
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports .............................. 9

Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal ............................................... 11
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond .......................................................... 12
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year ....................................................... 20
Comprehensiveness .............................................................................................. 28
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring ............................................... 35
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring ......................... 39

Section Three: The Budget Process ................................................................. 44
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget ............................................................... 45
Legislative Approval of the Budget ..................................................................... 49
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget .......................................................... 54
Executive’s Year-End Report and the Supreme Audit Institution ......................... 64
Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

*Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, “Not Available.”*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire</th>
<th>Budget Year Used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Not Available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Budget Proposal</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enacted Budget</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Report</td>
<td>2005-06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>2004-05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Audit Report</td>
<td>2003-04</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Internet Links for Key Budget Documents

Please provide the Internet link for the document, or indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced, But Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, But Not on the Internet.”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Document</th>
<th>Website</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-Budget Statement</td>
<td>Produced, but Not Available to the Public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget Summary</td>
<td>Budget at a Glance: <a href="http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/glance.htm">http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/glance.htm</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Budget Documents</td>
<td><a href="http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/ubmain.htm">http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/ubmain.htm</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizens Budget</td>
<td>Key to budget: <a href="http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/keybudget.htm">http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/keybudget.htm</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Budget Highlights: <a href="http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/high.htm">http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/high.htm</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Budget at a Glance: <a href="http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/glance.htm">http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/glance.htm</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Year Reports</td>
<td>CGA Reports: <a href="http://cga.nic.in/">http://cga.nic.in/</a>;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Medium Term Fiscal Plan: <a href="http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/frbm/frbm2.pdf">http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/frbm/frbm2.pdf</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Statement under Section-7 of the FRBM Act Deviations from the announcements: <a href="http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/frbm/frbm4.pdf">http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/frbm/frbm4.pdf</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Category</td>
<td>Documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Year Review</td>
<td>Outcome Budget:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year-End Report</td>
<td>Implementation Budget:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relevant Ministries &amp;</td>
<td>Finance Ministry:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Departments</td>
<td>Other relevant Ministries/departments for specific sectors can be</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Pre-budget</td>
<td>Main document</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-budget</th>
<th>Executive’s Budget Proposal</th>
<th>Citizens budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Main document</td>
<td>Budget summary*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities*</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. News conference is held to discuss release</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

*Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A. Not produced, even for internal purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enacted budget</th>
<th>In-year reports</th>
<th>Mid-year review</th>
<th>Year-end report</th>
<th>Audit report</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The release date is known at least one month in advance</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Released to public same day as official release to media</td>
<td>No Available to media on the day it is presented to Parliament.</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Available on the Internet free of charge</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Free print copies available, limited distribution</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Free print copies available, mass distribution</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Readily available outside capital/big cities</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Written in more than one language</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

| 9. News conference is held to discuss release | No | No | No | No | No |

Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:
BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)
BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year
BY-1 = one year before the budget year
The Executive’s Budget Proposal

Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond

1. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year those are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

   a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit.
   b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately.
   c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
   d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Except for the secret services, all expenditures are classified into administrative units. Refer to the Expenditure Budget – Volume I and II.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function.
   d. No expenditures classified by function are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Since 1968, the government has presented a functional classification of the budget with a lag of one year, i.e. a year after the budget proposal. Due to this time lag the functional classification report cannot be considered a part of the executive’s budget proposal. Further, the document is not presented to Parliament for approval.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree with the response to this question as the functional details are a mere statement by the executive and not a part of the annual budgeting exercise.
3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Since 1968, the government has presented an economic classification of the budget with a lag of one year, i.e. a year after the budget proposal. Due to this time lag, the economic classification report cannot be considered a part of the executive’s budget proposal. Further, the document is not presented to Parliament for approval.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

   a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures.
   b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No program-level data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to the Expenditure Budget, Volume II.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** While I would agree with the response, it is necessary to stress that some of the program-level data includes totals for a number of programs. E.g. the budgetary allocation would mention the allocation to ‘village and small scale industries,’ which is the total for more than one scheme for the purpose.
5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** Budgeting in India is an annual exercise and no expenditures for future years are included.

6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?
   a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually.
   d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to the Annual Financial Statement (Revenue Receipts) or Receipts Budget.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?
   a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually.
   d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to the Annual Financial Statement or Receipts Budget.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree with the response. All sources of governmental income (including those such as market borrowings, internal and external, are included).

9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?
   a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: No estimate beyond the BY is presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree, no multi-year budgeting is undertaken in India.
10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** No estimate beyond the BY is presented.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?

   a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).
   b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.
   c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.
   d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to: [http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex3.pdf](http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex3.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response. All government liabilities, including domestic and foreign debt, are included in the annual budgetary exercise.

12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

   a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.
   b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to the Annual Financial Statement. However, information on interest rates is not presented.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?

- a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
- b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to: [http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex3.pdf](http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex3.pdf)

**Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer:** I agree with peer reviewer comments. However, given the fact that external debt comprises less than 3% of the government’s total liabilities, it is a matter of judgement whether we can consider the composition of external debt important. Further, details of external debt are provided in the budget documents. Refer to: [http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2006-07/rec/annex2.pdf](http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2006-07/rec/annex2.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** While information regarding the internal debt is rather detailed (save for interest rates), the same level of detail is not available for external debt. Also, as far as external debt is concerned, information available comprises of only ballpark figures with very few details such as interest rates, sources, etc. In view of this, “b” is a better response though it is not ‘additional information’ but a part of the annual budgetary reporting exercise.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?

   a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.
   b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The fiscal strategy statement and the speech of the finance minister present information on the macroeconomic forecast. Further, the Economic Survey, which is generally published a couple of days before the budget proposal, presents a lot of information on the macroeconomic forecast. However, it is not part of the executive’s budget proposal.

Even if we include the Economic Survey as a supporting document, the response “c” may still be appropriate as it does provide some discussion on macroeconomic assumptions, but lacks important details regarding such assumptions.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree, although in view of a fairly well established custom, the Economic Survey, published every year a couple of days before the annual budget presentation, should be treated as a supporting budgetary document laying down the macroeconomic issues over the past year, some of which are addressed by the budget.

15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Some information is presented in the budget speech, but important details are missing. For example, in the 2005-06 budget, the government launched a National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (NREGS) and allocated Rs. 11000 crore for it. However, the budget does not disclose the fact that previous employment generation schemes with an allocation of Rs. 6000 crore including the food for work program have been merged in the new employment scheme. This might create a misleading impression that the NREGS includes new expenditure allocations for Rs 11000 crore where as actual increase is just Rs. 5000 crore. Further, the information presented in the budget does not give any impact assessment of policy proposals. Refer to: http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2006-07/eb/new-service.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:
   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to the budget speech.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:
   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
### Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year

18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

- a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1.
- b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately.
- c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately.
- d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:* Refer to the Expenditure Budget Volume II, available at: [http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/eb/vol2.htm](http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/eb/vol2.htm)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree. Budgetary exercise in India is central in all government expenditures. This leads to a timeline wherein the annual budget for the next year is presented before the end of the current financial year. Owing to this, a lot of data is released after the budgeting annual exercise is technically over. However, these datasets are crucial to understanding the budgeting exercise in India. In this sense, the budget-related exercise carries on throughout the year. For instance, functionally classified datasets for governmental expenditure are not a part of the formal budget papers but are easily available at a later date and feed into the analysis of the budget for the current year as well.

19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?

- a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
- b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
- c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1.
- d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

*Citation and/or comment:* Since 1968, the government has presented a functional classification of the budget with a lag of one year, i.e. a year after the budget proposal. Due to this delay, the functional classification report cannot be considered a part of the executive’s budget proposal. Further, the document is not presented to Parliament for approval. However, since the report for the previous budget year is available along with the current-year budget, this information is being used to answer the question.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree. See comment to question 18.
20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?

   a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards.
   b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards.
   c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1.
   d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Since 1968, the government has presented an economic classification of the budget with a lag of one year, i.e. a year after the budget proposal. Due to this time lag, the economic classification report cannot be considered a part of the executive’s budget proposal. Further, the document is not presented to Parliament for approval. However, since the report for the previous budget year is available along with the current year budget this information is being used to answer the question.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1.
   b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1.
   c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1.
   d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to:  

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
22. **In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?**

   a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.
   b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.
   c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.
   d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to a Kerala state government circular which states that state government finance departments are required to prepare the revised budget estimates based on five or more months of actual data:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>23. <strong>In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   **Citation and/or comment:** Actual expenditure and not expenditure estimates is presented for BY-2 and earlier years.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Actual aggregated information is presented in the budget and program-level data is not presented.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to the annual financial statement.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?

   a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data.
   b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable.
   c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist.
   d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: There are a few cases where ministries do change, merge together, or cease to exist, as has happened with the Ministry of Disinvestments. But in most cases, the information is comparable.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to the annual financial statement and receipts budget.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

   a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually.
   c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually.
   d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to the annual financial statement and receipts budget.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

| 29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)? |
|---|---|
| a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. |
| b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. |
| c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. |
| d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

   **Citation and/or comment:** Refer to a Kerala state government circular which states that state government finance departments are required to prepare the revised budget estimates based on five or more months of actual data. [http://www.kerala.gov.in/dept_finance/budgstimat2003_4.htm](http://www.kerala.gov.in/dept_finance/budgstimat2003_4.htm)

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response. See comment to question 18.
30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.
   b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Actual expenditure is presented for BY-2 and not the expenditure estimates. For example, refer to the annual financial statements or to: http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex5.pdf

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: Answer “a” is correct relating to revenue receipts but not to expenditure. In fact actual, revenue receipts are presented for BY-2 but not the revenue estimates. Refer to the revenue receipt budget document for the year 2005-06.

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

   a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
   b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
   d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Actual data is presented for all possible classifications of revenues such as income tax, indirect taxes, etc and for non-tax revenues. Refer to the Annual Financial Statement.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to the annual financial statement and annexes in the revenue budget.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year.
   b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded.
   c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented.
   d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   The researcher marked this answer as “b.” Refer to Annexure 3 of the receipts budget: http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex3.pdf

   Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer: I agree with peer reviewer comments. However, given the fact that external debt comprises even less than 3% of total liabilities of the government, it is a matter of judgement whether we can consider the composition of external debt important. Further, details of external debt are provided in the budget documents. Refer to: http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2006-07/rec/annex2.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree with the response with the caveat that information for external debt is not as detailed.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.
34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

   a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
   b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
   c. Before BY-3.
   d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

---

Comprehensiveness

35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to Annexure 3 of the receipts budget at: [http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex3.pdf](http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex3.pdf)

However, all information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented in the budget.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?

   a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The budget presents information on transfers (both as loans and grants) to state governments.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?

   a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information is presented in the annual financial statement and the expenditure budget Volume 1. Refer to:

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
<p>| | | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
<td>Though a number of quasi-fiscal activities are undertaken in the year by government financial institutions, they are not reflected in the budget documents explicitly.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, information on financial assets is not presented.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citation and/or comment:</td>
<td>Refer to Receipts Budget.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?

   a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: No information is presented on non-financial assets.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?

   a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: No information is presented on expenditure arrears.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: For example, refer to: http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/eb/guaran.pdf

   Information on explicit government guarantees is presented but information on implicit guarantees and other contingent liabilities, such as the possible need for the central government to recapitalize weak banks or for state governments to make good on the arrears of State Electricity Boards, is not presented due to moral hazard concerns (International Monetary Fund ROSC).

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?

   a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response. Future liabilities are not presented but liabilities for the budget year are detailed. Refer to: http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/eb/sbe40.pdf
44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

   a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to:  
   http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/rec/annex2.pdf

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?

   a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The budget speech and the Finance Bill present information on tax exemptions, etc.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?

   a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: For example, refer to the education fees collected for enhancing education, available at:  

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.
   d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Defence expenditure is roughly 16 percent of the budget expenditure. However, military intelligence expenses are not presented in the budget. A member of parliament, Mr. Nilotpal Basu (Rajya Sabha) said that the percentage of expenditure on secret items related to national security and military intelligence is not revealed even to legislators. However, in his opinion, the figure is around 8 percent of the total budget.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree with the response. However, the proportion of defence budget spent on actual military activities, as opposed to ‘social’ expenditures such as salaries, allowances and facilities for servicemen and their families, is the subject of endless debate.
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring

48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).


The information presented in these documents does not necessarily link the stated policy goals of the government and the budget but instead provide a description of the programs. For example, the stated policy goal for the government in education is to provide universal education for all. Further, the government stated that it is targeting 6 percent of the GDP as education expenditure. However, the budget documents do not reflect the progress that the government is making on this front.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: No information is presented on multi-year budgets. However, under the Fiscal Responsibility and Budget Management Act, the government is required to present long-term projections on major fiscal indicators like fiscal deficit and revenue deficit. For these indicators, targets are set on a multi-year rolling basis. Refer to: 

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 

50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?

   a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs.
   b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure.
   d. No non-financial data are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Information is presented for very few programs.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: Very little, if any, non-financial data is a part of the budget documents.
51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?

   a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance.
   b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance.
   c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance.
   d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment:

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?

   a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs.
   b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. No performance indicators are presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information on performance indicators is available in different sections in the budget but they can be difficult to identify. For example, refer to Section 9 of SSA (page 119 of the budget document), available at: [http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/eb/sbe57.pdf](http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/eb/sbe57.pdf)

   The outcome budget, which has been developed for the first time in 2005, presents performance indicators for each individual program, refer to: [http://pib.nic.in/release/release.asp?relid=11587](http://pib.nic.in/release/release.asp?relid=11587)

   However, the outcome budget is not part of the executive’s budget proposal.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** Performance data in budget documents are limited to financial expenditures on programs and degree of success in meeting expenditure targets. Simply meeting such targets is a poor indicator of overall performance.
53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?

   a. All performance indicators are well designed.
   b. Most performance indicators are well designed.
   c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not.
   d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to comment for question 52.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?

   a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
   b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
   c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not.
   d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to comment for question 52.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?

   a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Some information is presented in the budget speech.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree. Policies are often announced separately from the budget exercise, before and often after the budget.
### Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring

Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates and fee schedules is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, information is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The Finance Bill presents this information. Available at: [http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/bill.htm](http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/bill.htm). However, details like the rationale, impact and incidence of taxes are not presented.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: No analysis is presented.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

   a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: No explanation is presented. Further, financial conditions like interest rates, maturity period, etc. are presented but information on non-financial policy conditions is missing.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?

   a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: In the 2006-07 Budget Speech (refer to paragraph 46), the finance minister states that, “The programme for repair, renovation and restoration of water bodies is being implemented through pilot projects in 23 districts in 13 states. The design of the programme has been finalized in consultation with the states. 20,000 water bodies with a command area of 1.47 million hectares have been identified in the first phase. The estimated cost is Rs.4,481 crore. The funding pattern (centre, states and external assistance) has been finalized, and I intend to seek, and receive, funds from multilateral agencies. The participating state government will be requested to sign a memorandum of understanding and the water bodies in that state will be taken up for repair, renovation and restoration in 2006-07.”

   The finance minister hints that there will be a MoU but does not explicitly state the nature of the MoU and the conditions therein. Similarly, information stating “we need to comply with the FRBM Act ….” is provided but no detailed information on the specific conditions linked to the donor assistance is presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>60.</th>
<th>Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, but the summary is not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, it does not provide a summary.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Refer to Budget at a Glance, available at: http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/glance.htm

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>61.</th>
<th>Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, it does not publish a citizens budget.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The information is presented in three documents listed in Table 2 above. The “Key to Budget Documents” is not very comprehensive; “Budget Highlights” and “Budget at a Glance” present a broad overview of the budget.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree with the response, though the executive’s efforts to translate technical details into information accessible to a wider audience are extremely limited.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>62.</th>
<th>Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, definitions are not provided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Refer to “Key to Budget,” available at: http://indiabudget.nic.in/ub2005-06/keybudget.htm

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 
63. Does the executive make available to the public a summary of the budget process?

   a. Yes, it includes a summary of the budget process that is very informative.
   b. Yes, it includes a summary of the budget process that is somewhat informative.
   c. Yes, but the summary of the budget process is not very informative.
   d. No, it does not include a summary of the budget process.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response. However, the budgetary process is partly provided for in the constitution, which the executive must follow.

64. Do citizens have the right in law to access government information, including budget information?

   a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
   b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
   c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
   d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   **Citation and/or comment:** The Right to Information Law (RTI) was codified in 2005.

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response. However, most available budgetary information is not dependent on the RTI Act as it is tabled in Parliament and is therefore public documentation.
65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.

   a. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.
   b. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Obtaining highly disaggregated information through a right to information request requires a lot of effort and it is not guaranteed that the information will be made available.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

66. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

   a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
   b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
   c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
   d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Since 2006, several individual programs present disaggregated non-financial information on different items of expenditure. For example, the National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme presents disaggregated data on the scheme. Available at: http://nrega.nic.in/

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
Section Three: The Budget Process
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Budget Process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Executive’s Formulation of the Budget</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

67. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?

   a. The release date is set in permanent law.
   b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance.
   c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance.
   d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The release date is not set in permanent law and the president (at the advice of the Council of Ministers) has the authority to announce the budget release date. As per convention, the budget is released every year on the 28th of February. However, in a few instances budgets are presented in other months. One recent example is in 2004-05 when the budget was presented on July 8, 2004 due to a change in government.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree with the response. Additional information: in some cases (e.g. when general elections are due to be called), a Vote on Account is presented in February, to be followed by a full budget later in the year when the new government has taken office, as was the case in the FY 2004-05. This is done to allow the new government to prioritise its policies in the annual budget.

68. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for its budget preparation process?

   a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
   b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The executive does not release its timetable for preparing the budget to the public.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Options</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>69. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and</td>
<td>a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.</td>
<td><strong>d</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>release of the budget?</td>
<td>b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>timetable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>does not release to the public its timetable.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation and/or comment:</strong> The executive does not release its</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>timetable for preparing the budget to the public.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature</td>
<td>a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range</td>
<td><strong>c</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</td>
<td>of legislators.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>but some key members are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>a few members of the legislature.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>legislature as part of the budget preparation process.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citation and/or comment:</strong> The executive holds consultation with the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>standing committee members of the Finance Ministry.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response. The constituencies are limited to business houses, industry associations, chambers of commerce and occasionally, organised labour.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>72. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:**

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

74. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, an extensive explanation of the government's budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response. However, see the comment about the Economic Survey in question 14.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Legislative Approval of the Budget</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>75.</strong> How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The legislature receives budget documents on the 28th of February and the financial year starts on the 1st of April.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

| **76.** Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard? |
| a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. |
| b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. |
| c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. |
| d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. |
| e. Not applicable/other (please comment). |

Citation and/or comment:
77. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

- a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
- b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
- c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
- d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>78.</th>
<th>Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>79. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>80. Does the executive present more details or provide a better explanation of any budget proposal, if members of the legislature (including from minority parties) request such information?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. The executive responds to such legislative requests, and it generally provides an appropriate and timely response.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are sometimes not appropriate or timely.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. The executive responds to such legislative requests, but its responses are typically not appropriate or timely.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. The executive responds selectively or ignores such legislative requests.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The members of parliament have the power to ask questions and seek oral or written clarification from the executive – the finance minister and other ministers. Members of parliament are required to submit written requests for information to the speaker of the house (Parliament). Some (but not all) of these requests for information are short-listed through a lottery system. The short listed requests for information are then answered by the executive (the relevant ministry) after 21 days (not set in permanent law but by convention). Meanwhile, if the parliamentary session ends, the unanswered requests for information lapse and must be re-submitted in the next session if the member of parliament is still interested in receiving an answer.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response. It is important to keep in mind the elaborate system of ‘cut’ motions which members of parliament may invoke. If such a cut motion is adopted by the parliament on a ‘money bill,’ it has the affect of a vote of no-confidence in the government. However, in the parliamentary system that exist in India, such ‘cut’ motions that may be tabled by the opposition have very little chance of success.
81. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee) given information for the budget year on the spending of secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

   a. Yes, the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items.
   b. Yes, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, the legislature is provided some information on spending on secret items, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, the legislature is provided no information on secret items.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Information was provided by a member of parliament, Mr. Nilotpal Basu (Rajya Sabha), who was also a member of the Defence Committee when he was interviewed.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
82. Does the legislature have authority to amend the budget presented by the executive?

- a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority to amend the budget.
- b. Yes, the legislature has authority to amend the budget, with some limitations.
- c. Yes, the legislature has authority to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.
- d. No, the legislature does not have any authority to amend the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

The researcher marked this answer as “d.” The legislature cannot alter expenditure proposals that are charged (a large proportion of the expenditure budget) but it has substantial powers to amend tax proposals. However, any change in the original budget proposal can be made through an appropriation act only.

**Researcher Response to Peer Reviewer:** I agree with Peer Reviewer Two, but may still prefer to stick to the earlier response as the charged expenditures still continue to be around 73% of the total disbursements from the consolidated fund of India which Parliament cannot amend. When we respond to this question by marking a “c” we acknowledge the authority of the legislature to amend the budget. But such authority is limited to only around one quarter of the size of the budget.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The expenditures that are ‘charged’ to the Consolidated Fund of India are the only constitutionally laid down expenses, on which Parliament may not vote upon. The rest of the budgetary proposals can be amended. See comment to question 80.

**IBP Comment:** IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. In India, the legislature only has power to accept or reject the budget as a whole and a rejection of the budget is considered to be a no-confidence motion that results in the government being removed from power.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>83.</th>
<th>What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>The approved budget includes program-level detail.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The approved budget includes only departmental totals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: In practice, apart from some minor revenue (taxes and fees) proposals, the entire budget is approved by the legislature in the same format as the executive’s budget proposal, i.e. program-level details provided in the budget proposal are also approved.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>84.</th>
<th>How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: The in-year reports are not fully consistent with economic, functional and administrative classifications, and are not published at the end of each month. Sometimes, the reports are published with a lag of 3-4 months. However, the reports cover monthly data.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
85. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?

- a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures.
- b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
- c. Yes, in-year report cover less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. No in-year reports are released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

* Citation and/or comment: The reports are not fully consistent with economic, functional and administrative classifications.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

86. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures.
- b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures.
- c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

* Citation and/or comment: Refer, for example, to the CGA accounts, available at: [http://cga.nic.in/html/data0501.htm](http://cga.nic.in/html/data0501.htm)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

87. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?

- a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month.
- b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter.
- c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually.
- d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

* Citation and/or comment: Refer to: [http://cga.nic.in/](http://cga.nic.in/)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
88. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?
   a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue.
   b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue.
   c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources.
   d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).
   Citation and/or comment: Refer to: http://cga.nic.in/

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>89.</th>
<th>Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
   Citation and/or comment: Refer to: http://cga.nic.in/

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>90.</th>
<th>Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
   Citation and/or comment: Refer to: http://cga.nic.in/

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree with the response, though foreign debt is not detailed.
91. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?

a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

92. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?

a. Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period.
b. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period.
c. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period.
d. In-year reports are not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment:

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to: http://pib.nic.in/release/release.asp?relid=11587

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

94. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

   a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
   b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
   d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: The mid-year budget presents program-level information on performance targets and outcomes. Refer to: http://pib.nic.in/release/release.asp?relid=11587
   Though expenditure is shown by individual program, it does not provide any revised estimate for the budget year. Instead it outlines program-level expenditure estimates. Also refer to the medium-term statement, available at: http://finmin.nic.in/downloads/reports/MidTermReviewDec2005.pdf

   **Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

   **Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
95. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?

- a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures.
- b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs).
- c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals).
- d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: The outcome budget presents information on compliance of individual programs with their original targets. Available at: [http://pib.nic.in/release/release.asp?relid=11587](http://pib.nic.in/release/release.asp?relid=11587)
Further, the mid-year review presents information on expenditures of administrative departments. Available at: [http://finmin.nic.in/downloads/reports/MidTermReviewDec2005.pdf](http://finmin.nic.in/downloads/reports/MidTermReviewDec2005.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

---

96. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels.
- b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided.
- d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Some details of revenue estimates are a part of MTR.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
97. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain level, as specified in law or regulation)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive advises the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: For example, during natural calamities, the government draws resources from the contingency fund and in the legislative session which follows the calamity, the government seeks legislative approval for refunding the contingency fund to bring the balance back to pre-emergency use. When resources are used for non-emergency purposes, prior approval from the secretary of the department of expenditure is required. No prior approval from the legislature is required and a report on the use of these funds is submitted and approval sought from the legislature in the subsequent legislative session.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>98.</td>
<td>During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citation and/or comment: Refer to the report of the Central Vigilance Commission in 2003: [http://cvc.nic.in/ar2003.pdf](http://cvc.nic.in/ar2003.pdf)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?

a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify).

b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify).

c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Supplemental budgets are presented and approved in the following cases:

1. If the executive does not have a full financial year in its term;
2. If the executive announces new fiscal plans in the middle of a budget year; or
3. In case of emergencies.
For the latter, an approval is needed only after the expenditure has been expended.

Article 115 of the Constitution of India relating to supplementary grants states that:

115. Supplementary, additional or excess grants.—
(1) The President shall—
   (a) if the amount authorised by any law made in accordance with the provisions of article 114 to be expended for a particular service for the current financial year is found to be insufficient for the purposes of that year or when a need has arisen during the current financial year for supplementary or additional expenditure upon some new service not contemplated in the annual financial statement for that year, or
   (b) if any money has been spent on any service during a financial year in excess of the amount granted for that service and for that year, cause to be laid before both the Houses of Parliament another statement showing the estimated amount of that expenditure or cause to be presented to the House of the People a demand for such excess, as the case may be.
(2) The provisions of articles 112, 113 and 114 shall have effect in relation to any such statement and expenditure or demand and also to any law to be made authorising the appropriation of moneys out of the Consolidated Fund of India to meet such expenditure or the grant in respect of such demand as they have effect in relation to the annual financial statement and the expenditure mentioned therein or to a demand for a grant and the law to be made for the authorisation of appropriation of moneys out of the Consolidated Fund of India to meet such expenditure or grant.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
100. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?

   a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget.
   b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget.
   c. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget.
   d. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: A report issued by the SAI (available at: http://cag.nic.in/reports/civil/2005_1/index.htm, refer to Appendix VII, page 130) presents information on supplemental budgets during the past seven budget years as follows:

- 1997-98: Supplementary requests are 37 percent of the original budget.
- 1998-99: Supplementary requests are 2 percent of the original budget.
- 1999-00: Supplementary requests are 4 percent of the original budget.
- 2000-01: Supplementary requests are 3 percent of the original budget.
- 2001-02: Supplementary requests are 13 percent of the original budget.
- 2002-03: Supplementary requests are 12 percent of the original budget.
- 2003-04: Supplementary requests are 7 percent of the original budget.

The average supplementary request during this period amounts to 11 percent. However, 1997-98 was an exceptional year and if we exclude it from the calculation, the average supplementary request in the period is 7 percent of the original budget.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
101. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?

   a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget.
   b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year.
   c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget.
   d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to Article 267 of the Indian Constitution, which states that:

Contingency Fund — (1) Parliament may by law establish a Contingency Fund in the nature of an imprest to be entitled “the Contingency Fund of India” into which shall be paid from time to time such sums as may be determined by such law, and the said Fund shall be placed at the disposal of the President to enable advances to be made by him out of such Fund for the purposes of meeting unforeseen expenditure pending authorisation of such expenditure by Parliament by law under article 115 or article 116.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
## Executive’s Year-End Report and the Supreme Audit Institution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>102. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report or another document that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?</td>
<td>c. Reports are released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** The latest year-end report published by the executive is for 2003-04, i.e. BY-2 and is available at: [http://cga.nic.in/appn_accounts/appn_accounts0304/appn_accounts0304.htm](http://cga.nic.in/appn_accounts/appn_accounts0304/appn_accounts0304.htm)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>103. In the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</td>
<td>a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Citation and/or comment:** Refer to the SAI audit certificate for the year-end report for 2003-04, available at: [http://cga.nic.in/appn_accounts/appn_accounts0304/17auditcertificate.pdf](http://cga.nic.in/appn_accounts/appn_accounts0304/17auditcertificate.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
104. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to the 2003-04 year-end report, available at: [http://cga.nic.in/appn_accounts/appn_accounts0304/appn_accounts0304.htm](http://cga.nic.in/appn_accounts/appn_accounts0304/appn_accounts0304.htm). The report presents information on differences between enacted and actual expenditures. However, the explanation is provided in the form of quantitative tables and no narrative explanation is provided.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

105. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below)?

a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to the 2003-04 year-end report, available at: [http://cga.nic.in/appn_accounts/appn_accounts0304/appn_accounts0304.htm](http://cga.nic.in/appn_accounts/appn_accounts0304/appn_accounts0304.htm). The report presents information on differences between enacted and actual revenues. However, the explanation is provided in the form of quantitative tables and no narrative explanation is provided.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**
106. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to the 2003-04 year-end report, available at: http://cga.nic.in/f_accounts/f_accounts0304/finance_accounts0304.htm
The report presents information on differences between enacted and actual revenues. However, the explanation is provided in the form of quantitative tables and no narrative explanation is provided.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 

107. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented in the year-end report.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 

108. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 

109. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment: 

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: 

67
110. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

   a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: An explanation is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

111. Does the year-end report, or another document released to the public by the executive (please specify below), present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?

   a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
   b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded.
   c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
   d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

<p>| |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>d</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
112. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?

- a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year.
- b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year.
- c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year.
- d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to the latest SAI audit report for BY 2003-04, i.e. BY-2, available at: [http://cag.nic.in/](http://cag.nic.in/)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

113. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of expenditure has been audited and (except for secret programs) the reports released to the public?

- a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public.
- b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures have been audited.
- c. Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures have been audited.
- d. No expenditures have been audited, or the reports have not been released to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to the CAG report on government finances for BY 2003-04, available at: [http://cag.nic.in/](http://cag.nic.in/)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
114. Do year-end audit reports of departmental expenditure that are released to the public include an executive summary?

   a. All of these audit reports include an executive summary.
   b. Most of these reports include an executive summary.
   c. Some of these reports include an executive summary.
   d. None of these audit reports include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public.
   e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Refer to the CAG report on government finances for BY 2003-04, available at: http://cag.nic.in/

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

115. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

   a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.
   b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
   c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

   Citation and/or comment: Article 124 clause (4) of the constitution of India reads as follows:

   A Judge of the Supreme Court shall not be removed from his office except by an order of the President passed after an address by each House of Parliament supported by a majority of the total membership of that House and by a majority of not less than two-thirds of the members of that House present and voting has been presented to the President in the same session for such removal on the ground of proved misbehaviour or incapacity.

   Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

   Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
116. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?

a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.
b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.
c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.
d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: All expenditures of the government are audited and released except audit reports on secret items of expenditure, which are generally not released to public. However, with the passage of the Right to Information Law, even this information can be accessed upon request. Source: Interview with legislators.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:

117. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to the scope and jurisdiction section of the CAG, available at: [http://cag.nic.in/](http://cag.nic.in/)

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:
118. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: As is the case with other government departments, the audit department of the Ministry of Finance presents its own demand for grants to the Ministry of Finance. While the administrative expenses of the SAI are charged to the Consolidated Fund of India, the other expenses are voted expenditures that are approved by the legislature along with other items in the budget.

According to article 148 of the Constitution of India, administrative expenditure by the SAI will be charged to the consolidated fund of the executive's budget. Article 148 states that:

(1) There shall be a Comptroller and Auditor-General of India who shall be appointed by the President by warrant under his hand and seal and shall only be removed from office in like manner and on the like grounds as a Judge of the Supreme Court.
(2) Every person appointed to be the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India shall, before he enters upon his office, make and subscribe before the President, or some person appointed in that behalf by him, an oath or affirmation according to the form set out for the purpose in the Third Schedule.
(3) The salary and other conditions of service of the Comptroller and Auditor-General shall be such as may be determined by Parliament by law and, until they are so determined, shall be as specified in the Second Schedule: Provided that neither the salary of a Comptroller and Auditor-General nor his rights in respect of leave of absence, pension or age of retirement shall be varied to his disadvantage after his appointment.
(4) The Controller and Auditor-General shall not be eligible for further office either under the Government of India or under the Government of any State after he has ceased to hold his office.
(5) Subject to the provisions of this Constitution and of any law made by Parliament, the conditions of service of persons serving in the Indian Audit and Accounts Department and the administrative powers of the Comptroller and Auditor-General shall be such as may be prescribed by rules made by the President after consultation with the Comptroller and Auditor-General.
(6) The administrative expenses of the office of the Comptroller and Auditor-General, including all salaries, allowances and pensions payable to or in respect of persons serving in that office, shall be charged upon the Consolidated Fund of India.

Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:

Peer Reviewer TWO Comment: I agree with the response. Also see comments for question 115.
119. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

- a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
- b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
- c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
- d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Refer to a CAG report that presents information on the scrutiny of audit reports by the Public Accounts Committee, available at: [http://cag.nic.in/Activity/2000-2001/chapter5.pdf](http://cag.nic.in/Activity/2000-2001/chapter5.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

120. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

- a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
- c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
- d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation and/or comment: Some information is available with the SAI.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:** I agree with the response though the audit reports, placed before Parliament, are often used by the members of parliament to demand explanations and to increase executive accountability. Also, these reports are often the subject of popular debates through the media.
121. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Citation and/or comment*: A CAG report (refer to page 2) states that “action taken notes” are prepared by the executive in response to audit recommendations and sent to the Public Accounts Committee. However, these “action taken notes” are not generally released to the public and though they can be obtained upon request, they are not very exhaustive and provide very limited information. See: [http://cag.nic.in/Activity/2000-2001/chapter5.pdf](http://cag.nic.in/Activity/2000-2001/chapter5.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment:**

122. Are audit reports related to national security and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to national security and other secret programs.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Citation and/or comment*: Legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items according to Mr. Nilotpal Basu, a member of parliament.

**Peer Reviewer ONE Comment:**

**Peer Reviewer TWO Comment**: I agree with the response, though limited information is provided to parliamentary committees overseeing the Defence Ministry.