

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
Saudi Arabia, September 2009

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street NE, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Open Budget Initiative
Organization: International Budget Partnership
Address: Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
Telephone: (202) 408-1080
E-mail: www.openbudgetindex.org

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	3
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire.....	4
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links	5
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal...	7
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	8
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	9
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	10
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	21
Comprehensiveness	29
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	36
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	40
Section Three: The Budget Process	48
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	49
Legislative Approval of the Budget	54
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	59
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution.....	70

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not available
Budget Summary	2009
Executive's Budget Proposal	Not available
Supporting Budget Documents	Not available
Citizens Budget	Not available
Enacted Budget	Not available
In-Year Reports	Not available
Mid-Year Report	Not available
Year-End Report	Not available
Audit Report	Not available

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not produced
Budget Summary	" Press Release," Ministry of Finance, 22 December 2008; http://www.mof.gov.sa/en/docs/news/index.asp?n_ID=471
Executive's Budget Proposal	Produced (in the shape of a draft budget), but not available to parliament or the public
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Not produced
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Not produced
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Not produced
Citizens Budget	Not produced
Enacted Budget	Produced, but Not Available to the Public
In-Year Reports	Not Produced
Mid-Year Review	Not Produced

Year-End Report	Produced, but not available to the public
Audit Report	Produced, but not available to parliament or the public
Other Documents	<p>Most other documents that will be cited in the answers below are not budget documents. The only documents containing fiscally relevant information pertaining to annual budgets and shorter-term fiscal developments are monthly, quarterly, and annual statistical tables from the Saudi Arabian Monetary Agency as well as the annual statistical yearbooks (which are usually issued with a delay of at least one year), cf.:</p> <p>http://www.sama.gov.sa/sites/SAMAEN/ReportsStatistics/statistics/Pages/MonthlyStatistics.aspx, http://www.sama.gov.sa/sites/SAMAEN/ReportsStatistics/statistics/Pages/QuarterlyStatistics.aspx, http://www.sama.gov.sa/sites/SAMAEN/ReportsStatistics/Pages/AnnualReport.aspx.</p> <p>The statistical yearbook is available through an old version of the Central Department of Statistics website (http://www.cdsi.gov.sa/showsection.aspx?lid=26&id=318), but it is not clear whether it will remain available.</p> <p>The Ministry of Economy and Planning publishes five-year plans that include budgetary projections. The current plan (8th Development Plan) is for the period of 2005-2009 (http://www.mep.gov.sa/home/Home/English/8Plan/Contents.htm). Because this document is not released annually, it has not been considered as a "supporting budget document."</p>
Relevant Ministries & Departments	Ministry of Finance, Saudi Arabian Monetary Agency, General Auditing Bureau, Ministry of Economy and Planning, Central Department of Statistics, Department of Zakat and Income Tax

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes			Yes	Yes	Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public		Yes				
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)			Yes			
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes		Yes	Yes		
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public	Yes			Yes	Yes
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)					
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA

⁺Mark "Yes" if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Note 1: The Open Budget Survey research process was carried out over a 12-month period and the final version of the Open Budget Questionnaires reflect decisions made after multiple rounds of discussions between Survey researchers, peer reviewers, and the International Budget Partnership (IBP) (in several countries these decisions also considered comments received from governments). When peer reviewers or governments agreed with the answers provided by researchers, they often provided no comment. Thus for many questions, the section in the questionnaire that should contain peer reviewer comments is left blank. However, if the government did not provide any comments to a question (because it did not dispute the answer), the section within the questionnaire that is meant to reflect government comments specifies the answer that the government agreed with (by default).

Since the IBP continued its discussions with the researchers even after receiving peer reviewer and government comments, for some questions these discussions resulted in a mutual decision to change the answers, even if the peer reviewers and governments agreed with the original answer provided by the researcher. Such changes may have happened as a result of:

1. A more consistent application of the Survey methodology;
2. New information identified by the researcher or by IBP that had a bearing on the answer for a particular question; or
3. Decisions made to ensure cross-country comparability of answers.

For more information on these changes for any question please write to info@internationalbudget.org.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with Saudi bankers, economists and former senior Ministry of Finance functionary</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is an annual press statement issued in December when the budget is officially enacted by the cabinet. This press statement is issued shortly before the fiscal year begins on January 1. The press statement is issued by the Ministry of Finance and published by major national newspapers. The statement indicates the aggregate levels of income and expenditure of the previous year and expected income and the sectoral breakdown of planned expenditure for the new budget year (education, health, municipalities etc.). The sectoral figures are divided into current and capital expenditure. Usually, allocations for specific non-ministerial government organizations are also provided. The information is broadly helpful, but very generic. This is the only publicly available document on a Saudi budget when it gets enacted, although some further figures on planned spending are usually issued through the government's Statistical Yearbook further into the budget year.</p> <p>The purpose of Questions 1-55 in the questionnaire is to evaluate the information that governments make public in their executive's budget proposal and supporting documents during the time that the budget proposal is under consideration in the legislature -- prior to its enactment. This set of document is sometimes known as the annual consolidated budget presentation.</p> <p>However, there is no elected legislature in Saudi Arabia, and the appointed "Majlis Ash-Shura" does not have budgetary powers. (Its most daring act so far was to refuse a planned income tax on foreigners in 2003, which met great resistance in business circles who rely mostly on foreign workers). There have been some demands from the Majlis to be granted budgetary powers, but its mid-term prospects to receive them are rated as rather dim, especially as the recent oil boom has obviated the need to impose any taxes that might be politically contentious. Some Majlis members reportedly also do not want to deal with budgetary issues as they are afraid of becoming privy to corruption in the process.</p> <p>As such, no executive's budget proposal and supporting documents is</p>	d

<p>made available to the public prior to the budget’s enactment. All pre-budget government documents about planned annual spending are secret. Questions 1-55 have been mostly marked as “d” to reflect this practice (with the exception of a few questions that have only three possible response options. The latter have been marked as “b” to reflect the lack of publicly available information.) Where appropriate, remarks are added as to where specific types of information are available OUTSIDE of the executive budget proposal.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	
<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

5. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?
- Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.
 - No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Estimates of aggregate levels of expenditure over five-year periods are presented in the Ministry of Economy's Development Plans (currently the 8th Development Plan, 2005-2009). The plan is available on the internet (<http://www.mep.gov.sa/index.jsp;jsessionid=766CE5CE2CF6DDCD033CB46A5DD3F127.alfa?event=ArticleView&Article.ObjectID=3>). These documents are released every five years and are not part of an executive budget proposal; the spending guidelines (in chapter 4, broken down by five broad categories of spending) are indicative and usually not adhered to by the Ministry of Finance in its annual budget negotiations.

b

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

10. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

- a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).
- b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.
- c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.
- d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

The five-year plans (see question 5 above) contain ballpark figures on oil and non-oil income projections over five years, which usually turn out to be quite inaccurate.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

d

<p>11. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget). b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year. c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year. d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Figures on government debt are sometimes issued by the Minister of Finance himself on an ad hoc basis. The annual budget statement in December 2009 contained figures on government debt, but not all previous statements did. Otherwise, no systematic information is made available.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>12. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented. b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	b

13. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?

- a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
- b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Government debt is domestic and held by private banks and public investment funds; while the Monetary Authority issues monthly figures on banks' claims on the government, a consolidated breakdown of government debt is not available, and no specific figures are available on the total amount of government bonds outstanding.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

d

<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The government's macro-economic forecasts are not usually published; the main exception is the 5-year forecast in the five-year plans.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such analysis is published in any form.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Beyond sector-level spending figures, the annual budget statements can include data on the costs of individual projects and policies planned for the year, but these are not systematically compared with pre-existing policies and projects.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public information on past spending is available apart from aggregate figures on capital and current spending. Some additional data on past “planned” spending is available in Statistical Yearbooks.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>22. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure.b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure.c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure.d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>23. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>27. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Income data on past years is broken down by oil and non-oil in annual reports of the Saudi Arabian Monetary Agency</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Generally, only figures on past oil and non-oil revenue are available.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such figures are available in annual reports of the Monetary Agency.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>32. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Actual revenue figures of the previous year are usually presented in the Monetary Agency's annual report in summer.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>33. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>34. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 11.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is available anywhere.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is available anywhere.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is available anywhere; the budget summary sometimes presents figures on budgets for special government commissions, universities etc., but not public companies strictly speaking.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>38. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Information on financial assets controlled by the Monetary Authority (which constitute the majority) is issued by it on a monthly basis, usually with a delay of about two months.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is publicly available anywhere.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>41. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is publicly available anywhere. In lean years, delayed payments to contractors have posed a significant problem.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is publicly available anywhere.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is publicly available anywhere.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is publicly available anywhere.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such information is publicly available anywhere.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Given that all expenditure in Saudi Arabia is in effect secret, the question is not really applicable. The share of planned defense spending in total spending is announced in the annual budget statement.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	
<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Experience as consultant in Saudi Arabia, as well as interviews with senior Saudi bankers and former senior Ministry of Finance functionary</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Information on tax base, rates and rules is available online from the Department of Zakat and Income Tax: http://www.dzit.gov.sa/en/index.shtml Tariff information is available on the Saudi customs website: http://www.customs.gov.sa/CustomsNew/tariff/trfmain_E.aspx</p> <p>This information is not linked to revenue or a publicly available budget, however.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	C

57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?

- a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

See question 56.

Comment:

The only taxes currently levied are Islamic wealth tax on companies (zakat) as well as income tax on foreign businesses. There is no personal income tax and no VAT. Most state income is derived from international oil sales. While tax rates are easy to find out (see question 56), a quantitative breakdown of different parts of non-oil state income is not available, hence the tax burden's distribution is impossible to estimate. Non-oil state income - including income from state-owned companies - is presented as an aggregate figure in the Monetary Authority's annual reports.

C

Researcher Response to this Question was "c"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question is "b."

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should remain as I indicated in the questionnaire "c." I chose my answer because I believe that "distribution" refers to which strata and sectors of business and population at large bear which burden in aggregate terms. Such information is not publicly available.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" because this question is asking about whether an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden across different segments of the population (typically arrayed by income) is provided. Since this information is not publicly available, the correct response is "c."

<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Saudi Arabia does not draw on financial assistance from IFIs; instead, it hires their services on a contract basis.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	e
<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Past interaction with World Bank, GTZ and UNDP experts in Saudi Arabia.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Saudi Arabia does not receive aid payments from multilateral agencies (there are some smaller technical, cultural and socio-economic cultural cooperation projects, e.g. through the US Middle East Partnership Initiative, but no detailed information is made available on them from the Saudi side). See also question 58.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	e

60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?

- a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative.
- b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative.
- c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative.
- d. No, it does not provide a summary.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Interviews with Saudi bankers, government consultants and former senior Ministry of Finance functionary.

Comment:

There is an annual press statement issued in December when the budget is officially enacted by the cabinet. It is issued by the Ministry of Finance and published by major national newspapers. The statement indicates the aggregate levels of income and expenditure of the previous years and expected income and the sectoral breakdown of planned expenditure for the new budget year (education, health, municipalities etc.). The sectoral figures are divided into current and capital expenditure. Usually, allocations for specific non-ministerial government organizations are also provided. The information is broadly helpful, but very generic. This is the only publicly available document on Saudi budgets at the time of enactment. Here is the December 2008 statement for the FY 2009 budget in English:

http://www.mof.gov.sa/en/docs/news/index.asp?n_ID=471

The equivalent Arabic document had already disappeared from the Ministry's website at the time of writing and could not be retrieved through the site's search function.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: Answer "c" is correct. The press release for the 2010 Budget was issued after the questionnaire was completed but within the timeframe of this peer review. A link is included for reference:

<http://www.mof.gov.sa/en/docs/news/budget1431.pdf> (English)

<http://www.mof.gov.sa/ar/docs/news/budget1431.pdf> (Arabic)

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

C

<p>61. Does the executive publish a "citizens budget" or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Nothing is available beyond the summary document mentioned in question 60, which is accessible, but not framed as "citizens' budget."</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

63. Do citizens have the right *in law* to access government information, including budget information?
- a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
 - b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information.
 - c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information.
 - d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information.
 - e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Field research in Saudi Arabia between 2003 and 2008.

Comment:

There are no conventional bureaucratic accountability mechanisms in Saudi Arabia (ombudsmen etc.). There are options to sue state agencies through the "Board of Grievances" or to petition the appointed quasi-parliament (the "Majlis Ash-Shura") or senior princes. None of these formal and informal mechanisms are tied to an explicit right to receive government information however, and they are not usually used to that end. The only formal document listing civil rights in Saudi Arabia, the Basic Law, contains no right to information:

<http://www.saudinf.com/main/c541f.htm>.

The State Department's 2008 report on human rights in Saudi Arabia points out that there are no laws guaranteeing citizens' right to access government information:

<http://www.state.gov/g/drl/rls/hrrpt/2008/nea/119126.htm>

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

d

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See questions 61 and 63; the “closing accounts” detailing actual spending in a given fiscal year are kept secret even within the government.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

- a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
- b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

See questions 63 and 61. Ministries usually do not have press staff or official speakers (there are a few exceptions, such as health and interior, but their speakers perform press work rather than tending to citizen inquiries). Information departments in state agencies usually limit themselves to printing general brochures about their organizations. The Ministry of Finance's Arabic website has detailed information on various public projects, broken down by sector and government agency, but without giving figures on the associated spending (<http://www.mof.gov.sa/ar/docs/contracts/index.htm>).

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

d

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process	
Executive's Formulation of the Budget	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The release date is set in permanent law. b. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. c. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. d. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with Saudi bankers and former senior Ministry of Finance functionary, survey of Saudi press and official websites since 2003.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget statement (cf. question 60) is usually released in the second or third week of December on a Monday night after the cabinet meeting which ratifies the budget, but the exact date is not announced in advance. A select few people, such as senior bankers, are apprised of the date a few days ahead. Distribution happens through the Saudi Press Agency and the Ministry of Finance.</p> <p>Article 76 of Saudi Arabia's Basic Law states, "The law shall determine the State's fiscal year. The budget shall be issued by a Royal Decree which shall spell out revenue and expenditure estimates for the year. The budget shall be issued at least one month before the beginning of the fiscal year. If, owing to overpowering reasons, the budget is not issued on time and the new fiscal year has not yet started, the validity of the old budget shall be extended until a new budget has been issued." (http://www.mofa.gov.sa/Detail.asp?InNewsItemID=35299). Thus while a particular date is not specified, the equivalent of a "no later than" formulation set in permanent law means there is a clear deadline. In the past six years, the announcement of the budget has occurred within a relatively close range of dates: 12/22/2008, 12/10/2007, 12/18/2006, 12/13/2005, 12/08/2004, 12/15/2003.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Answer "a" is correct. The 2010 budget announcement was made on 12/21/2009.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or sub national government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <p>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See section 2.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <p>a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with Saudi bankers and former senior Ministry of Finance functionary.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The budget statement is published with regularity before the end of the calendar year, usually in December, but the exact date is never announced before. See question 66.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

- a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators.
- b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded.
- c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature.
- d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Interview with senior Saudi bankers and Majlis Al-Shura members; my own research on parliamentary politics in Saudi Arabia.

Comment:

There is no elected legislature in Saudi Arabia. The appointed "Majlis Ash-Shura" does not have budgetary powers (its most daring act so far was to refuse a planned income tax on foreigners, which met great resistance in business circles who rely mostly on foreign workers). There have been some demands from the Majlis to be granted budgetary powers, but its mid-term prospects to receive them are rated as rather dim, especially as the current oil boom has obviated the need to impose any taxes that might be politically contentious. Some Majlis members also do not want to deal with budgetary issues as they are afraid of becoming privy to corruption in the process.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

d

70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?

- a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies.
- b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded.
- c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies.
- d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Interviews with Saudi bankers and former Ministry of Finance functionary.

Comment:

The only substantive consultations happening are those between line agencies and the Ministry of Finance, as well as between the Ministry of Finance and the royal court. Intra-governmental budget negotiations usually start in autumn (September or October), when line agencies submit their spending proposals to the Ministry of Finance. Even these line ministries are usually not aware of the budget demands and negotiations of agencies other than themselves, and ministers only see the full budget draft when it reaches the cabinet for ratification. The Ministry of Finance is the dominant player in the budgeting process, and it is highly secretive. There is no involvement of the public.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

d

<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 60.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Some macro-economic figures are included in the budget summary, but those refer to the last year; projections of the coming year are not publicized.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 69.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?

- a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.
- b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

See question 69. Answer "b" might appear problematic, as it sounds as if the legislature got SOME information on secret expenditure, whereas in fact it gets none in the Saudi case. I would suggest adding another answer option here for future questionnaires.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

b

<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 69. The Majlis Ash-Shura law makes no mention of budgetary powers: http://www.shura.gov.sa/wps/wcm/connect/ShuraEn/internet/Laws+and+Regulations/The+Shura+Council+and+the+rules+and+regulations+job/</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The approved budget includes program-level detail. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). The approved budget includes only departmental totals. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals or the approved budget is not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See however question 69 - the quasi-legislature in Saudi Arabia actually is not involved in the budgetary process</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with Saudi bankers and former senior Ministry of Finance functionary.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Such reports are not released and according to my interviewees not even produced internally. What exists in terms of mid-year follow-up is merely an internal aggregate expenditure number the Ministry of Finance sticks to in order to limit excess spending beyond the levels appropriated in the annual budget. This is a policy rather than a document however.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. No in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 82</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. b. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. d. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The only in-year information available is on the level of government-held foreign assets. This is published by the Saudi Arabian Monetary Agency on a monthly basis (cf.: http://www.sama.gov.sa/sites/SAMAEN/ReportsStatistics/statistics/Pages/Home.aspx). Otherwise no specific information on revenue is available apart from the aggregate numbers on oil and non-oil income published at the end of every budget year.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> SAMA monthly statistical bulletins (see question 86) contain figures on private banks' borrowing to the government, but borrowing from other agencies (such as the General Organization for Social Insurance or the Pensions Fund) is not accounted for.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAMA bulletins mentioned in question 89 do not contain such figures.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. In-year reports are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. d. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with senior bankers, European contractors in Saudi Arabia.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are great differences depending on the government agency. Defense and Interior are almost completely opaque, while in other cases (large infrastructure, utilities etc.) bidding has become more competitive, although implementation of the process is often ad hoc can be heavily dependent on international consultants. Smaller tenders can often be non-transparent.</p>	<p>C</p>

Saudi Arabia has not subscribed to WTO rules on government procurement. It is generally recognized that "big players" (i.e. princes and well-connected courtiers) play a role in many consortia applying for big tenders, but the government creates some level of competition by at least inviting bids that involve many different well-connected factions that hence have to compete among themselves on price and quality. There is very little international and no local reporting on this however.

The State Department's 2008 investment climate statement on Saudi Arabia reports that:
"Foreign firms have identified corruption as an obstacle to investment in Saudi Arabia. Government procurement is an area often cited, as is de facto protection of businesses in which senior officials or elite individuals have a stake. Bribes, often disguised as "commissions," are reputed to be commonplace." (<http://www.state.gov/e/eeb/ifd/2008/101779.htm>)

Transparency International ranked Saudi Arabia 80 out of 180 countries in its 2008 Corruption Perceptions Index.

A 2004 procurement law has made the publication of tenders obligatory; a new government procurement law and corresponding bylaws were issued in 2006/07 following WTO accession in 2005. The procurement process in non-royal government agencies, especially for flagship projects in the electricity, water and transport sectors, is often seen as better organized than in poorer neighboring countries. Some foreign businessmen report a positive impact of e-tendering on certain smaller contracts.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The legislature has no leverage over the budgeting process, and no formal supplementary budgets exist (see question 99).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with Saudi bankers and former senior Ministry of Finance functionary.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are no formal supplementary budgets; the Ministry of Finance rather releases funds to other agencies on an ad hoc basis, either by going beyond the agreed aggregate spending or by releasing funds that other agencies have not used up fully. The government's aggregate overspending (the only known figure at the end of the year) has hovered around 15% of budgeted annual spending in recent years. See also question 82.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 69.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

Executive’s Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget’s actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. d. The executive does not release a year-end report. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with Saudi bankers and former senior Ministry of Finance functionary, senior advisor to Central Department of Statistics.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 60 - the only figures that are released at the end of a budget year are aggregate expenditure and income for the year, which are part of a general budget statement. “Closing accounts” detailing actual spending have not been available since the Gulf War 1990/91. Even internally, they are usually only produced after two or more years, although they are reportedly quite detailed (several thousand pages) and well-organized. Most of the auditing is limited to checking accounts however; there is little performance auditing. A formal year-end report is not released.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The Annual Report issued by the Saudi Arabian Monetary Agency SAMA, which is referenced in the comment to question 104, contains limited data on actual budget outcomes from the previous year, specifically in the “Public Finance” section of the report (pp.127-136). The 2009 SAMA report discusses some of the projections and actual outcomes from the 2008 budget, and was published in July. Nonetheless, I agree with answer “d,” as the SAMA report does not seem to meet the threshold for consideration as a year-end report, especially in light of the “closing accounts” mentioned above.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 101.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 101.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?

- a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level.
- b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases).
- c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals).
- d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Interview with senior advisor to Central Department of Statistics.

Comment:

The internally produced closing accounts appear to be very detailed, but they are not published and their circulation even within the government is very limited.

Actual and projected aggregate expenditure levels are compared in the Monetary Agency's annual report (usually issued in late summer, a bit more than half a year after the end of the budget year), but they are not broken down into specific categories.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

d

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interview with senior advisor to Central Department of Statistics</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The section for revenues in the closing accounts is rather short (only some 10-20 pages long in the late 1990s accounts, which were several thousand pages long altogether), due to the overwhelming role of oil income and the absence of income tax, VAT and conventional corporate tax. In any case, they are not published.</p> <p>Revenue projections apart from the multi-year estimates in the five-year plans are generally not published.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Non-financial economic estimates are not published in the first place (apart from the 5-year plans).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such specific figures are published anywhere.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with senior advisor to Central Department of Statistics, former senior Ministry of Finance functionary, Saudi bankers.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are never released to the public. The “closing accounts” as produces by the General Auditing Bureau (“diwan al-muraqaba al-‘ama”) usually take between two and four years to produce, and their circulation is strictly limited even within the government, in particular since the 1990/91Gulf war. See also question 101.</p> <p>Although the Saudi government has designated the General Auditing Bureau as a member of the United Nations International Organization for Supreme Audit Institutions (INTOSAI), suggesting that it is the country’s external auditing body, in fact this body is not independent of the executive and its functions more closely resemble those of an internal audit body.</p> <p>According to Article 21 of the Constitution of the General Auditing Bureau (regarding the Annual Audit Report), “The annual report [...] is to be submitted to His Majesty the King with one copy to be sent to the Council of Ministers and another one to the Ministry of Finance and National Economy” (http://www.intosaiitaudit.org/mandates/mandates/Mandates/Saudi%20Arabia.html#Saudi_Arabia_22).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 101.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No audit reports are released to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <p>a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.</p> <p>b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Interview with former senior Ministry of Finance official</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> All senior appointments are at the king's discretion. According to Article 3 of the Constitution of the General Auditing Bureau, regarding appointment and removal of the GAB's leadership, "The President is to be appointed by virtue of a Royal Edict. He shall not be pensioned off or discharged except by a Royal Order" (http://www.intosaiitaudit.org/mandates/mandates/Mandates/Saudi%20Arabia.html#Saudi_Arabia_2).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <p>a. Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>b. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>c. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds.</p> <p>d. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The General Bureau of Accounting does not release any full reports to the public; its function is internal.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have *the discretion in law* to undertake those audits it may wish to?

- a. The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- b. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
- c. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
- d. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

The formulation on the auditor's website is: "The GAB's Charter had established it mandatory that GAB's Auditees Should provide all accounting records, financial statements and other documents and information available at the disposal of GAB's auditors to enable the auditors discharge the Audit tasks with impartiality and objectivity[...]The Charter had imposed it on the Auditees to provide replies on GAB's observations within a specific timeframe not to exceed a month of-date of reporting such findings."

(http://www.gab.gov.sa/article_e.php?id=32). The GAB can also audit companies in which the state has a share of more than 25%; cf. "GAB Executive Regulations for the Audit of Private Corporations and Companies in whose Capital the State Contributes or Guarantees a Minimum Profit":

(http://www.intosaiitaudit.org/mandates/mandates/Mandates/Saudi%20Arabia.html#Saudi_Arabia_H2_4

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

b

117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Interviews with former senior Ministry of Finance official, Saudi banker.

Comment:

The budget is determined through negotiations with the Ministry of Finance as is the case with other agencies (see question 70). Royal court and cabinet technically have the final say. There is no evidence that it is particularly under-resourced - its limitations, such as they are, are rather of a directly political nature.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

b

<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interviews with Saudi banker, former senior Ministry of Finance official. For the auditor's formal organizational structure, cf.:http://www.gab.gov.sa/article_e.php?id=33</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is a dedicated department within the general auditing bureau for military sector auditing. The General Auditing Bureau's leverage over security sector agencies is in fact very limited, however, as the latter are controlled by senior royals running the institutions as their personal fiefdoms. The Bureau might be used to investigate specific departments or procedures, but de facto only on the request of the senior princes in charge of the respective agency. Staffing levels hence are not the primary problem.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year.b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year.c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit.d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public.e. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.gab.gov.sa/engcallus.php</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is a phone number and an email address on the auditor's website, but nothing is mentioned about a formal mechanism for suggestions on the audit program.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
---	---

120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

- a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
- b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
- c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
- d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

http://www.gab.gov.sa/article_e.php?id=32; interview with Majlis Ash-Shura member.

Comment:

A copy of the annual report of the General Auditing Bureau is submitted to the Majlis Ash-Shura after being submitted to King and cabinet. It contains generic information on the financial performance of all auditees, i.e. all state agencies. This is however rather generic information which is different from the "closing accounts" that detail actual spending and which are not released to the Majlis. The annual report's information on security agencies is limited in particular.

There are no other formal mechanisms that oblige the Bureau to report to the Majlis. The Majlis might receive some auditing results from individual agencies when inviting them to report about their activities, but the level of detail varies, with security agencies in particular providing very little information.

Peer Reviewer One Comment: This question, as I understand it, addresses whether the audit reports are viewed or scrutinized, rather than the level of detail contained in the reports. Therefore, a more appropriate response to this question is "c." As noted in the comments above, "a copy of the annual report... is submitted to the Majils Ash-Shura." Section Five of the GAB Charter (http://www.gab.gov.sa/article_e.php?id=32) states: "The Annual Report is referred to the Consultative council for review and detailed discussion in the presence of GAB's senior staff invited to account for and respond to enquiries, "Should it be so required." Because "there are no other formal mechanisms that oblige the Bureau to report to the Majlis," answer "c" (which was used in the 2008 version of this questionnaire) is proposed over some of the stronger ones.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

Peer Reviewer Three Comment:

Researcher Response: I chose my answer because the annual report for the General Auditing Bureau does indeed contain general observations about the state's fiscal management. At the same time, it is not really an audit report, as it does not contain the actual audited figures from the GAB's investigation of government income and spending (the "closing accounts"), which are kept secret even within most of the government bureaucracy and are usually produced with significant delay. "c" therefore is an appropriate compromise.

IBP Comment: This question asks whether there is a committee in the legislature that has the specific task of receiving and reviewing the SAI Audit Reports. Since the GAB's Annual Report does not contain the actual audited figures from the GAB's investigation of government income and spending, the correct response to this question is "d."

d

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No such reports are produced (as not even any audit recommendations are published).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no such report; the General Auditing Bureau does not produce substantive reports for the public in general.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Interview with Majlis Al-Shura member</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> See question 120 - all government agencies are covered by the Auditing Bureau's activities, but the closing accounts are not released to the Majlis Ash-Shura, which receives very little information on security agencies.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Three Comment:</u></p>	d
--	---