

**International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
Vietnam, September 2009**

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street NE, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Ms. Pham Thuy Anh, Nguyen Thi Bat PhD
(consultant)
Organization: Center for Cooperation Human Resource
Development
Address: Building K, La Thanh hotel, 218 Doi Can, Ba Dinh,
Hanoi, Vietnam
Telephone: 84.4.37622318
E-mail: thuyanh@cndvietnam.org.vn

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	3
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire.....	4
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links	5
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal...	7
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	8
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	9
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	10
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	18
Comprehensiveness	27
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	34
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	38
Section Three: The Budget Process	48
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	49
Legislative Approval of the Budget	54
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	59
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution.....	72

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	2009
Executive's Budget Proposal	Not Available
Supporting Budget Documents	Not Available
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2009
In-Year Reports	2009
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	2007
Audit Report	2007

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Produced but not available to the public
Budget Summary	The 2009 socio-economic development and budget plan, Feb 2009 http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6031&ItemID=59293
Executive's Budget Proposal	Produced but not available to the public
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Produced but not available to the public
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Produced but not available to the public
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Produced but not available to the public
Citizens Budget	Not produced
Enacted Budget	Budget Plan for Year 2009, Dec 2008 http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=57342
In-Year Reports	<p>Quarter I - 2009, April 25, 2009, http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=59862</p> <p>Quarter II - Estimates 6 months 2009, July 2009 http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=61744</p> <p>(Already produced and published on the Ministry of Finance website, but not yet approved by the National Assembly since the NA meets only twice per year. NA is meeting in Nov to approve this quarter report)</p> <p>Additional information about national debt is published as quarterly Bulletin External Debt in MOF website at http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5591 (Choose Bulletin External Debt)</p>
Mid-Year Review	Not produced

Year-End Report	State Budget Disclosure of Final Accounts for Year 2007, July 2009 http://www.mof.gov.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=6296
Audit Report	Disclosure of State Audit Report 2007 http://www.kiemtoannn.gov.vn/website/docbao_read.aspx?ID=641&LangID=1
Other Documents	NA
Relevant Ministries & Departments	Ministry of Finance, http://www.mof.gov.vn General Department of Taxation, http://www.gdt.gov.vn/ State Audit Office of Vietnam, http://www.kiemtoannn.gov.vn

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes						Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes	
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)			Yes			
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	NA	Yes	NA	NA	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	NA	No	NA	NA	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes		
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public					
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	No	No	NA	No	No
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	No	No	NA	No	No
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	No	No	NA	Yes	Yes
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	No	NA	No	No
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	No	No	NA	No	Yes
8. Written in more than one language	No	No	NA	No	No
9. News conference is held to discuss release	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes

⁺Mark "Yes" if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Note 1: The Open Budget Survey research process was carried out over a 12-month period and the final version of the Open Budget Questionnaires reflect decisions made after multiple rounds of discussions between Survey researchers, peer reviewers, and the International Budget Partnership (IBP) (in several countries these decisions also considered comments received from governments). When peer reviewers or governments agreed with the answers provided by researchers, they often provided no comment. Thus for many questions, the section in the questionnaire that should contain peer reviewer comments is left blank. However, if the government did not provide any comments to a question (because it did not dispute the answer), the section within the questionnaire that is meant to reflect government comments specifies the answer that the government agreed with (by default).

Since the IBP continued its discussions with the researchers even after receiving peer reviewer and government comments, for some questions these discussions resulted in a mutual decision to change the answers, even if the peer reviewers and governments agreed with the original answer provided by the researcher. Such changes may have happened as a result of:

1. A more consistent application of the Survey methodology;
2. New information identified by the researcher or by IBP that had a bearing on the answer for a particular question; or
3. Decisions made to ensure cross-country comparability of answers.

For more information on these changes for any question please write to info@internationalbudget.org.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Since the Executive's budget proposal is not made available to the public, option "d" is chosen for all questions from 1 to 55 with 5 options a-b-c-d-e as defined by OBI methodology. For some questions with only 3 options a-b-c, option "b" is chosen.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Dear colleagues at Open Budget Initiative 2010, Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the questionnaire. I have gone through it carefully, question by question, and made reference as well to the detailed instructions. After doing so, I find nothing to correct or modify. The reviewers have done an excellent job and have stuck to the guidance and intended meaning of the questions. They have also distinguished appropriately between English-language and Vietnamese-language source material. There is every reason to believe, in my view, that the information presented here is complete and properly interpreted.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>2. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. No expenditures classified by function are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>11. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget). b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year. c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year. d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>12. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented. b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>25. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	
<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Information on tax rates, fees for revenue sources can be found in the website of the General Department of Taxation at: http://www.gdt.gov.vn/. Or on the website of the Ministry of Finance at http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=279&FolderCode=11&CateCode=7</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Information about tax rate, fee and levies for all revenue sources is made publicly available in the website of the General Department of Taxation (GDT) as well as the of the General Department of Customs (www.customs.gov.vn). There are books with details about taxation policy as well as tax rates - these books are publicly available. In these books and websites, extensive information on tax rates, fees and other revenues sources is included, but there is no information about all commercial projects. "b" is the correct answer. In addition, information about Vietnam's commitments to international institutions and accordingly tax and duties can be found at the website of the National Committee for International Economic Cooperation (www.nciec.gov.vn) with parts of the website available in English.</p>	b

<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.b. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details.d. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information on the distribution of the tax burden can be found.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?

- a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
- b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Information on Aid Effectiveness Initiatives including Action Plan for year 2008 and Platform can be found in the Ministry of Planning and Investment website at <http://oda.mpi.gov.vn/index.jsp?sid=1&id=87&pid=86>. Information on the Hanoi Core Statement on Aid Effectiveness and other related information can be found at <http://oda.mpi.gov.vn/index.jsp?sid=1&id=84&pid=81>

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: In November 2008, when discussing the draft Law on National Liabilities, the Ministry of Finance reported to the National Assembly about the national liabilities, including information about borrowings from international financial institutions. This information is available in the website of the National Assembly (www.na.org.vn). However the Executive does not make (and eventually has never made) public such a document containing conditions associated with assistance international financial institutions such as IMF, IFC, WB. In light of this question and given answers, the best choice would be "d." (To note: when the IMF terminated its structural program support to Vietnam in 2005 because Vietnam did not disclose the figure on foreign exchange reserves as requested by IMF - there was no official announcement from Vietnam government on that termination and its root-causes).

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed to "c." Information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented though not very comprehensive.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.

C

59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?
- Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality.
 - Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded.
 - Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
 - No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Information on Aid Effectiveness Initiatives including Action Plan for year 2008 and Platform can be found at the Ministry of Planning and Investment website at <http://oda.mpi.gov.vn/index.jsp?sid=1&id=87&pid=86>. Information on the Hanoi Core Statement on Aid Effectiveness and other related information can be found at <http://oda.mpi.gov.vn/index.jsp?sid=1&id=84&pid=81>

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: There is high-level information about conditions associated with borrowings and/or grants from development partners. There are bi-annual Consultative Group (CG) meetings between government and development partner to discuss about Vietnam development. CG is the platform for donors to indicate and commit support to Vietnam. Information about CG is available at the WB website at www.worldbank.org.vn. Details of conditions associated with donors are not systematically made public with parts of information available on a piecemeal basis. The link in the Citation section above is barely about the Hanoi Core Statement (a local version of the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness). There is some information about conditions but not in a comprehensive manner. The 2nd Reviewer is aware of the Development Assistance Database (DAD) link at the web site of MPI (www.mpi.gov.vn). That database is not accessible when this review was undertaken. The DAD Vietnam was launched through the Ministry of Planning and Investment (MPI) and track most of donor activity with about 50 donors participating in entering data. The DAD Vietnam also includes historical data from the past decade of ODA to facilitate monitoring and evaluation as well as aid tracking. Nevertheless, an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries has never been made public in a systematic manner.

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed to "c."

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.

C

<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> A quite informative budget summary for the year 2009 can be found in the website of the Ministry of Finance at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6031&ItemID=59293 Note: document named "The 2009 soci-economic development and budget plan."</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Budget for FY 2009 (both detailed budget and summary) is available in MOF website; final accounts for 2007 budget is published in a book which is available widely. It is expected that final accounts for FY 2008 will be published later thought not sure when.</p>	b
<p>61. Does the executive publish a "citizens budget" or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> A Citizens Budget is not produced in Vietnam.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A Citizens Budget is not produced in Vietnam, whereas the civil society is under-developed. "d" is the correct choice for this question.</p>	d

<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. No, definitions are not provided. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Definitions about terms are made public through different channels, for example the budget year book and the bulletins on external debt (see http://mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5591).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "c"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "b" as definitions about terms are made public through different channels, for example the budget year book and the bulletins on external debt (see http://mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5591).</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer two "b."</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "b" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> In law, citizens have right to access government information including budget information (Article 69, 1992 Constitution). However, in practice it is very difficult for a normal citizen to get this information (not publicly available) unless he/she is working for a related agency.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Access to information in general is a constitutional right. However, in practice it is very difficult to have access to government's information including the budget. The National Assembly has planned discussing and passing a Law on Access to Information, but this law has not been enacted yet. Follow this link to access to a draft version of the law: http://www.article19.org/pdfs/laws/vietnam-law-on-access-to-information.pdf</p>	C
<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Since the Executive's budget proposal is not made available to the public, citizens do not know about the individual programs and level of details the proposal presents. However, useful expenditure information on</p>	C

national programs are published in the website of the Ministry of Finance at: <http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6087&ItemID=52931> (named Final Accounts on Expenditures on National Target Programs). In addition, people can also find informative reports/articles on expenditures of most national programs on the Government Web Portal at: http://www.chinhphu.vn/cttdtcp/vi/ct_da_ptkinhtequocgia/muctieuquocgia.html (this section is not available in English in the website).

For smaller programs within ministries or government agencies, people can request information directly from the ministries or agencies or they can find some information in the Annual Statistical Book. In addition, people can find the information in articles/reports or TV news. For example, information (including financial and non-financial) on many individual projects of various ministries can be found in audit reports published in the website of the State Audit Office at: http://www.kiemtoannn.gov.vn/website/docbao_com.aspx?ID=7&LangID=1

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "d" because the executive's budget is not made public, hence citizens cannot obtain information which is more disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal. In practice, it is very difficult for ordinary citizens to obtain additional information (other than what already publicly available) about budget or expenditure of a particular program or initiative. Government agencies do not have the practice of disclosing information and/or responding responsibly and responsively to request of citizen.

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two, "d." I chose my answer because indeed the executive's budget is not made public, hence citizens cannot obtain information which is more disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal. In practice, it is very difficult for ordinary citizens to obtain additional information (other than what already publicly available) about budget or expenditure of a particular program or initiative.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*. It appears that a limited amount of information is publicly available, from sources other than the executive's budget proposal.

65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive's budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?

- a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.
- b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Since the Executive's budget proposal is not made available to the public, citizens do not know about the individual programs and level of details the proposal presents. However, people can find very informative reports/articles on all national individual programs (11 programs in total) in the Government Web Portal at:

http://www.chinhphu.vn/cttdtcp/vi/ct_da_ptkinhtequocgia/muctieuquocgia.html) (this section is not available in English in the website).

The non-financial information found include: Purposes of the program, groups of beneficiaries, duration of the program, expected outcomes, main projects and activities of the program, financial sources, management of the program, etc.

For smaller programs within ministries or government agencies, people can request information directly from the ministries or agencies or can find some information in the Annual Statistical Book. In addition, people can find the information in articles/reports or TV news. For examples, information (including financial and non-financial) on many individual projects of various ministries can be found in audit reports published in the website of the State Audit Office at:

http://www.kiemtoannn.gov.vn/website/docbao_com.aspx?ID=7&LangID=1

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: If citizen request non-financial information from a ministry, it is difficult to have an answer, let alone a complete answer (unless that citizen is a special citizen like member of the National Assembly or a public figure). A more appropriate response to this question therefore would be "d."

Researcher Response: I retain my view that "b" is an appropriate answer since non-financial information about expenditures is made public quite

b

comprehensively as cited.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.

Section Three: The Budget Process

<p>The Budget Process</p>	
<p>Executive’s Formulation of the Budget</p>	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The release date is set in permanent law. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Executive's budget proposal is not made available to the public. However, typically the proposal is submitted one month before the National Assembly meets.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was “c”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d” as the Executive’s Budget Proposal is not made public, hence there is no release date for it.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I retain my view that “c” is an appropriate answer since the Executive does make an announcement of when it submits the proposal to the National Assembly for approval (about one month in advance).</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.</p>	<p>C</p>

67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

- a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
- b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

In June every year, the Ministry of Finance issues a circular guiding the preparation for state budget for the following year. For example, preparation guidelines for the state budget for FY 2010 are included in Circular 127/2009/TT-BTC issued by the Ministry of Finance on June 19, 2009. Information can be found at:

<http://vbpg.mof.gov.vn/SearchDoc.aspx>

Note: click on the document link to get access to the contents (available in Vietnamese only)

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "a" as the State Budget Law and the annual Budget Circulars clearly stipulate key milestones and detailed timetable for budget formulation. Both the law and the circular are publicly available.

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer two "a."

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "a" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.

a

68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?

- a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable.
- b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable.
- c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable.
- d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Although there is no official report on whether the Executive adheres to its timetable for budget preparation, it can be seen that the proposal is indeed completed and sent in advance of the NA's meeting in November for discussion and approval. A clear example is the proposal for budget year 2009, which was discussed and approved during the NA's meeting in Nov. 2008 and was published in the Ministry of Finance's website in December 2008.

a

Researcher Response to this Question was "b"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "a" because ultimately the budget has to be submitted to the National Assembly to be discussed and approved at its year-end session (normally in October-November) and the Annual Budget Circular works back from this date. So adherence to the timetable is the choice.

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two "a."

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "a" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.

<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Executive does hold consultations with the Committee of Finance and Budget (a component of the National Assembly) as part of its process of determining budget priorities. This Committee has 35 members who are also NA members representing different provinces and cities in Vietnam.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not normally hold consultations with general public as part of its process of determining budget priorities.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The pre-budget statement is not made available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The pre-budget statement is not made available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The pre-budget statement is not made available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>Legislative Approval of the Budget</p>	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. b. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. c. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. d. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The budget proposal is sent to the NA in October to prepare for the yearly NA meeting in late October. to Nov. every year. Budget for the following year is always an item for approval at the November NA meeting.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The legislature receives the budget before its year-end meeting which normally takes place in October-November. The correct choice is “b.”</p>	<p>b</p>

75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?
- Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies.
 - Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies.
 - Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard.
 - No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard.
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: There are meetings between the select committee of the national assembly (Committee on Finance and Budget) and the Ministry of Finance (with participation from Ministry of Planning and Investment) in preparation for the full session of the National Assembly. At these meetings MOF and MPI (on behalf of the executive) have to defend their budget proposal including providing additional information about the macro economic and fiscal framework. Not sure what "public hearing" means, but perhaps a more appropriate response would be "b."

Researcher Response: I retain my view as "d" is an appropriate answer, according to the IBP's definition of "public hearing" in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*.

d

76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?

- a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
- b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
- c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
- d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

The executive representatives have their own session at the NA meeting to explain the budgets proposed and to hear comments/address questions from the NA members. During the November NA meeting this year, the Prime Minister and ministers of different ministries including the Ministry of Finance have had an interpellation with NA members to address their questions as well as to receive their comments. Brief information in English about this interpellation can be found at: <http://vietnamnation.vn/tintucshow.php?tinid=1428&dmtin=6>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: The NA sessions discussing the budget are broadcasted live on national TV.

C

<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Hearings on the individual budgets are held during the NA meeting, thus a normal citizen is not allowed to attend.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <p>a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures.</p> <p>b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Information on secret items is confidential.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <p>a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</p> <p>b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations.</p> <p>c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited.</p> <p>d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> In law, the legislature has full authority to amend the budget proposed by the Executive. This is regulated in Article 15, Chapter II of the State Budget Law. Full information on the law can be found at: http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/pe/countrybudgetlaws.cfm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals or the approved budget is not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Approved expenditure budget includes departmental totals and some additional details such as expenditures for sub-departments, investment development, for contingency, reform of salary policies, and so on. Information can be found at the following link: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=57342</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance major national programs and provincial totals).</p>	b
Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> In-year reports on actual expenditures are released quaterly. Information can be found at the following link: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> For the year 2009, the first quarter report was approved by the NA and is published in the website of the Ministry of Finance. This report covers all actual expenditures thus the answer is "a." However, the second quarter report is just an estimate, since it has not been approved by the NA. It thus contains only estimated expenditures (Since the NA meets only twice per year in Vietnam, the second quarter report is typically not approved until November of the year when the NA meets). However, since this specific question is about the Executive's Implementation of the Budget, not about the Legislature's approval of the budget, the appropriate answer should be "a," not "c." 2009 quarter reports can be found at the following link: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year reports provide expenditures organized by functional unit only, not by administrative unit. Information can be found at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=59862</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The first in-year report compares actual year-to-date expenditure with the previous year and the comparison is made for all expenditures. For the second in-year report (estimate), please see the explanation in question 83. Information on the reports can be found at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=59862</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue (taxes, fees, charges, non-taxes, and capital revenues) are released quarterly. Information can be found at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=59862</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue including revenue from taxes, from fees/charges/non-taxes, from capital revenues, and brought-forward revenue. Information can be found at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=59862</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year reports compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with the estimate for the whole year for all revenue sources. Information can be found at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=59862</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year reports on actual borrowing (including the deficit as well as domestic and abroad financing/borrowing) are released quarterly. Information can be found at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=59862</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Additional information about national debt is published as quarterly Bulletin External Debt in MOF website at http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5591 (Choose Bulletin External Debt)</p>	b

90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?

- a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.
- b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Information on total interest payment is presented in the in-year reports (in expenditures table). Information can be found at:
<http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219&ItemID=59862>.
But there's no information on interest rate.

Comment:

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b," since the information about national debt is published as a quarterly Bulletin External Debt in MOF website at:
<http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5591> (Choose Bulletin External Debt)

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two, "b." I chose my answer because the information about national debt is published as a quarterly Bulletin External Debt in the MOF website at: <http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5591> (Choose Bulletin External Debt)

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "b" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.

b

<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. In-year reports are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> In-year reports on actual expenditure are released to the public in the following month after the reporting period. In budget year 2009 in specific, the first approved quarter report was released in April 25, 2009. The second quarter report was released in 21 July, 2009 (though the second report is just an estimate since it has not yet been approved by the NA. However, as explained in question 83, since the question is asking about the Executive's implementation, not about the Legislature's approval, answer "a" can be chosen for both reports). Information can be found at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=6219</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A mid-year review of the budget is not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A mid-year review of the budget is not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A mid-year review of the budget is not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A mid-year review of the budget is not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain *minimal* level specified in law or regulation)?
- Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
 - Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
 - Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
 - No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).
 - Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Article 43 on Adjustment of budget estimate of Decree 60/2003/ND-CP dated June 6, 2003 stipulates that: (i) In case of big changes in the State budget as compared to the allocated estimates, requiring the overall adjustment, the Government shall make the estimated State budget adjustment and the central budget allocation plans and submit them to the NA for decision at its nearest meeting, and (ii) In case of urgent defense and/or security needs or for objective reasons where the revenue and expenditure tasks of a number of agencies, units and/ or localities should be adjusted but without causing big changes in the budget overall and structure, the Government shall report thereon to the NA Standing Committee for decision and report to the NA at its nearest meeting.

Thus, it can be understood that the Executive has to seek approval from the Legislature for fund shifting if it's a big amendment, and has to give notification (to the Standing Committee of the NA) if the amendment does not cause big changes to the allocated budget.

The Decree can be found at the following link:

<http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=551&page=8>

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

C

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In law, the procurement of goods and services must follow an open bidding process. However, in practice there have been some reported cases of irregularities such as the E-government project and the HCMC National University apartment building project.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "b"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "c," as in practice there were significant reported examples of irregularities. The procurement law requires competitive biddings but in practice, procuring entities try to avoid competitive bidding, for example, by dividing the bids into smaller packages (so the value is less than the required threshold for open competition). Some well-known scandals involving irregularities in the procurement process include PMU 18 and PCI.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer Two "c." See Peer Reviewer Two's comment.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 9 of 2002 State Budget Law stipulates that Central budget as well as local budgets at various levels are entitled to include 2%-5% of the total estimated spending to meet contingent spending. The Government shall decide the use of the provisions in the Central budget and report to the Standing Committee of the NA regularly, and to the NA at its nearest meeting.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Answer "b" is the correct choice. NA is using its ex-post control to approve the budget change, as stipulated in the Budget Law.</p>	b
<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> According to the year-end report 2007, the actual expenditure is 5.64% higher than the estimated amount. 2007 year end report is available at: http://www.mof.gov.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=6297 (see Annex 1, available in Vietnamese)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The state budget law empowers the executive to use the contingency funds without seeking advance approval from the legislative. Nevertheless, the executive must report to the legislative about such usage.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. The executive does not release a year-end report. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The process is about one year and a half in length. Specifically, the year-end report for budget year 2007 was published in July 2009. http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=4912&ItemID=61668</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> It takes up to 15 months after the end of the fiscal year for the final accounts to be available to the public and the National Assembly to approve. Final accounts for FY 2007 were approved by the NA in May 2009.</p>	<p>C</p>
<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Less than two thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The audit only covers a small part of the total budget which typically includes some administrative agencies (provinces), central agencies (ministries), state owned enterprises and national programs.</p>	<p>C</p>

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no explanation regarding the difference between the enacted levels and the actual outcomes for expenditures in the year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no explanation regarding the difference between the enacted levels and the actual outcomes for revenues in the year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no explanation regarding the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome in the published year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no explanation regarding the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome in the published year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no explanation regarding the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome in the published year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no explanation regarding the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome in the published year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds was found in the year-end report.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Final audit accounts for FY 2007 were released in July 2009, which means between 12 and 24 months.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C

<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. b. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. c. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. d. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> For FY 2007, expenditures of 29 provinces/cities (out of 64) have been audited, those of 17 ministries and government agencies (out of 31) have been audited, and those of 26 general cooperation, banks, and financial institutions have been audited. On average, less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The audit (carried out by the State Audit of Vietnam) only covers a part of the total budget which typically includes some administrative agencies (provinces), central agencies (ministries), state owned enterprises and national programs.</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is no Executive Summary for the whole audit report, but the report does contain informative narrative for each section. For example, there is a summary of main achievements and weaknesses regarding revenue collection, and the same for expenditure, etc. The audit report can be found at: http://www.kiemtoannn.gov.vn/website/docbao_read.aspx?ID=641&LangID=1</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The presentation practice is similar to that in the previous period, but researcher reassessment has led to a change in response.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed. b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 17 of the State Audit Law 37/2005/QH dated June 14, 2005 stipulates that the selection and termination of the General State Auditor position are determined by the National Assembly. http://www.luatgiapham.com/phap-luat/5-luat-kinh-doanh/157-luat-kiem-toan-nha-nuoc-so-372005qh-11-thong-.html</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> State Audit is independent from the executive, and it reports directly and is accountable to the National Assembly.</p>	a

<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Extra-budgetary funds of Thai Nguyen province, and Ho Chi Minh City have been audited and the results were included in the annual audit report (page 24)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> There is no separate audit report for extra-budgetary funds; rather, it is included in the audit report for state budget in general.</p>	<p>C</p>
<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 15 of the State Audit Law stipulates that the SAI has discretion to undertake the audits; however the SAI has to seek approval from the NA's standing committee before implementation.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Article 67 about the SAI implementation Budget of the State Audit law stipulates that the SAI has authority to prepare the budget for itself and to then submit it to the Executive. The Executive in turn will submit the budget plan to the NA for approval. It can be understood that the final decision is made by the NA.

<http://www.luatgiapham.com/phap-luat/5-luat-kinh-doanh/157-luat-kiem-toan-nha-nuoc-so-372005qh-11-thong-.html?start=5>

However, many articles and reports have been found mentioning: the heavy workload taken by the State Audit Office, the big need for expansion of activities (going to establish 4 more State audit units) to fulfill its mandate, plan for new recruitment and further training for human resources, as well as the need for update of working facilities (<http://www.tapchiketoan.com/kiem-toan/kiem-toan-nha-nuoc/mo-rong-pham-vi-kiem-toan-dong-thoi-nang-cao-chat-luong-kiem-toan-cua-kiem-toan-nha.html>) (a report made by Dr. Le Huy Trong, State Audit Office, at ACCA conference on 25 Sep, 2009).

Given the need for expansion of activities to fulfill the SAI's mandate, answer "c" is chosen.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: I agree with the researcher's assessment. Funding for SAI is determined by the legislative. But the SAI is still under-developed partly because of the limited budget available to it hence, for instance, it can not attract good auditors (who might choose a better paid job at a big-four auditing firms).

C

<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The SAI does employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector. There is a unit under the SAI, named Special Audit Unit, which specializes in auditing security and defend sector.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. e. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u> The SAI does not maintain mechanisms of communication with the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> There is a website of the SAI, www.kiemtoannn.gov.vn, but there is no mechanism of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program.</p>	d
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized. b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized. c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized. d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized by the Committee of Finance and Budget of the NA.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No public reports on what steps the Eexecutive has taken to address audit findings was found.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> This is one of the current audit practices in Vietnam. Enforcement and follow-ups to auditors' recommendations and criticisms are weak.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

- a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.
- b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify).
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Comment:

The SAI does give out a lot of recommendations in the audit report, but no report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address these recommendations was found.

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." The audit report has a section covering the issue of to what extent the recommendations have been followed up or acted upon, by the executive. The audit report for FY2007 has a section about implementation of audit reports for FY 2005. This section mainly concerns settlement of budgets (e.g. expenditure to be reduced, revenue to be collected) but not on policy issues.

Researcher Response: I suggest the answer should be changed as suggested by Peer Reviewer two "b." See Peer Reviewer Two's comment.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain the consistency of the assumptions used in selecting answers across the countries. For the purposes of this question a separate report must be released.

d

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs. b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details. d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> For FY 2007, the SAI audited 15 administrative units under the Ministry of National Defense and the Ministry of Public Security and the reports were provided to the legislature. However, the reports lacked important details.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------