

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE
Argentina, September 2009

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street NE, Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name: Federico Marongiu
Organization: CIPPEC
Address: Callao 25, Buenos Aires, Argentina
Telephone: 54-11-4384-9009
E-mail: infofiscal@cippec.org

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	3
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire.....	4
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links	5
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal...	7
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	8
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	9
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	10
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	21
Comprehensiveness	30
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	38
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	42
Section Three: The Budget Process	49
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	50
Legislative Approval of the Budget	56
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	60
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution.....	70

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not available
Budget Summary	2009
Executive's Budget Proposal	2009
Supporting Budget Documents	2009
Citizens Budget	Not available
Enacted Budget	2009
In-Year Reports	2009
Mid-Year Report	Not available
Year-End Report	2007
Audit Report	Not Available

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not produced
Budget Summary	Mensaje de Presupuesto 2009 (Release Date: September 15th, 2008) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf
Executive's Budget Proposal	Proyecto de Ley 2009 (Release Date: September 15th, 2008) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/proy2009.pdf
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Planillas anexas al articulado 2009 (Release Date: September 15th, 2008) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensadosnueve.html#planillas
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	Anexo estadístico y ubicación geográfica 2009 (Release Date: September 15th, 2008) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensadosnueve.html#anexo
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive's Budget Proposal	
Citizens Budget	The document is not produced at all
Enacted Budget	Presupuesto Nacional 2009 - Ley 26422 (Approved on November 5th, 2008 - Made available to the public November 15th, 2008) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/ley2009/ley/ley2009.pdf
In-Year Reports	Ejecución Presupuestaria de la Administración Nacional - Base Devengado- Mensual 2009 - (The latest one is the one for May 2009) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejectexto/ejec_admin_doscuatro.html?var1=ejecadmindsnueve
Mid-Year Review	Not produced
Year-End Report	Cuenta de Inversion 2007 -The release date for the 2007 was June 27th, 2008. The availability on the Internet it must have been one month later http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2007/tomoi/02intro.htm

Audit Report	Not Available
Other Documents	
Relevant Ministries & Departments	Ministerio de Economía (Ministry of Economy) www.mecon.gov.ar Ministerio de Economía – Oficina Nacional de Presupuesto (Ministry of Economy – National Budget Office) www.mecon.gov.ar/onp

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes					Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public						
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)		Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive’s Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	NA	Yes	No	No	No	NA
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	NA	Yes	No	No	No	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	NA	Yes	NA	Yes	Yes	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities ⁺	NA	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	NA
8. Written in more than one language	NA	No	No	No	No	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	NA	No	No	No	No	NA

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

⁺Mark “Yes” if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes		
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public					Yes
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes	Yes		Yes	
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them?</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	No	No	NA	No	NA
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	No	NA	Yes	NA
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	No	No	NA	No	NA
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	Yes	Yes	NA	Yes	NA
8. Written in more than one language	No	No	NA	No	NA
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	No	NA	No	NA

⁺Mark "Yes" if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Note 1: The Open Budget Survey research process was carried out over a 12-month period and the final version of the Open Budget Questionnaires reflect decisions made after multiple rounds of discussions between Survey researchers, peer reviewers, and the International Budget Partnership (IBP) (in several countries these decisions also considered comments received from governments). When peer reviewers or governments agreed with the answers provided by researchers, they often provided no comment. Thus for many questions, the section in the questionnaire that should contain peer reviewer comments is left blank. However, if the government did not provide any comments to a question (because it did not dispute the answer), the section within the questionnaire that is meant to reflect government comments specifies the answer that the government agreed with (by default).

Since the IBP continued its discussions with the researchers even after receiving peer reviewer and government comments, for some questions these discussions resulted in a mutual decision to change the answers, even if the peer reviewers and governments agreed with the original answer provided by the researcher. Such changes may have happened as a result of:

1. A more consistent application of the Survey methodology;
2. New information identified by the researcher or by IBP that had a bearing on the answer for a particular question; or
3. Decisions made to ensure cross-country comparability of answers.

For more information on these changes for any question please write to info@internationalbudget.org.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Planilla detalle por jurisdicción y entidad: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/titulo3/anexa3a1.pdf http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/titulo3/anexa3a2.pdf An example of an administrative unit expenditure would be: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/jurent/pdf/P09J01.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is worth mentioning that the data is not consolidated (i.e. it does not include National and sub national governments). The information provided only accounts for the National/Federal government. As Argentina is a federal country where a considerable share of social spending is decentralized, the fact that the information is not in a consolidated manner (taking into account all levels of government) affects the possible analysis of the data. This comment is valid for all the questions involving fiscal data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> In addition to the comment, Article 8 Law 24156 (Financial Administration and Control Systems for the National Public Sector) stipulates that such law is applied to the National Public Sector and gives details of how it's integrated. Neither the provinces nor the municipalities are included in that detail.</p>	a

<p>2. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Administracion Nacional: Composicion Del Gasto Por Finalidad-Funcion y Caracter Economico http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/capitulo1/anexa101.pdf Administracion Nacional: Composicion Del Gasto Por Finalidad-Funcion y Por Jurisdiccion http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/capitulo1/anexa103.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> National Government Level (Central + Decentralized), Administracion Nacional: Calculo De Gastos Por Caracter Economico Y Por Caracter Institucional http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/capitulo1/anexa107.pdf Central Government Level Administracion Central: Composicion Del Gasto Por Jurisdiccion, Subjurisdiccion Y Caracter Economico http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/titulo2/anexa202.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	-----------------

<p>4. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. No program-level data are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Planilla detalle jurisdicción entidad http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensadosnueve.html#titulodos An example for Legislative Branch: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/jurent/pdf/P09J01.pdf A less detailed spreadsheet where appears information for most of the programs http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/anexo_estadistico/capitulo1/cap1pla7.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Even though the information is divided according to the Administrative Unit that manages the program, under "Detalle jurisdicción entidad" is possible to get detailed information on every program.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>5. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The estimates are available in the Executive's submission message (Mensaje de Elevación) - section 5.2. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is also a multi-year budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>6. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> In the executive's budget (mensaje de remisión) appears information on economic classification (pag. 233-236). More information is available in the multi-annual budget which is usually presented once the budget law has been approved.</p> <p>Presupuesto Plurianual: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/plurianual/plurianual09.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>7. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This appears in the Executive's message, sections 2.1, 2.2 and 3.1: Tax policy and Tax estimations. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>8. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Tax policy and Tax estimations. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>9. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 5.1.1: Revenue projections. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>10. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> In the executive's budget (mensaje de remisión) appears information on individual sources of revenue and by revenue classification (pages 230-231 and 233-236). http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf More information is available in the multi-year budget which is usually presented once the budget law has been approved.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>11. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget).</p> <p>b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year.</p> <p>c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year.</p> <p>d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Mensaje de Remisión (Executive 's Budget) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is worth mentioning that the data is not consolidated (i.e. it does not include both the National and sub national governments). The information provided only accounts for the National or Federal government. As Argentina is a federal country where a considerable share of social spending is decentralized, the fact that the information is not in a consolidated manner (taking into account all levels of government) affects the possible analysis of the data. This comment is valid for all the questions involving fiscal data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Article 8 Law 24156 stipulates that such law is applied to the National Public Sector and gives details of how it's integrated. Neither the provinces nor the municipalities are included in that detail.</p>	a
<p>12. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented.</p> <p>b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, sections 3.1.3 and 3.1.4 http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</p> <p>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The main information is available on the executive's budget on Section 2.4 http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf Also there are some details on Page 241 of the Executive's Message: Information on maturity profile and main instruments</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>14. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 1:Global economic context http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>15. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The only information provided in the executive's message is related to the official projections - no alternative scenario is provided. On the Central Bank website, however, it is possible to access the projections calculated by several private sources: http://www.bcra.gov.ar/estadis/es070100.asp</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.5: Public Expenditure http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is not provided.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year	
<p>18. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Statistical Annex: Comparative Tables of the Executive's Message http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/anexo_estadistico/cuadros_comparativos/cap1cu04.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>19. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Statistical Annex: Comparative Tables of the Executive's Message http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/anexo_estadistico/cuadros_comparativos/cap1cu02.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>20. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Statistical Annex: Comparative Tables of the Executive's Message http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/anexo_estadistico/cuadros_comparativos/cap1cu03.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>21. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is presented only for the programs included in the Result Oriented Programs Pilot Experience (Experiencia piloto de programas orientados a resultados). We provide an example the file for the Educational Equity Program (Programa para la Igualdad Educativa): http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/prog_resultado/PIIE.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Executive's budget includes data from the first six months of the previous year. As the year progresses the executive's budget is updated with the information of the first seven months of the current budget year.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appeared in previous years in the Executive's Message, section 3.2: Expenditure by Function Analysis. In the 2009 Executive Budget the information is mostly for BY-1, except for some physical goals http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>24. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appeared on previous years on Section 3.2: Expenditure by Function Analysis. In the 2009 Executive Budget the information is mostly for BY-1, except for some physical goals and specific expenditures where it is for BY-2 http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>25. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). Before BY-3. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A large proportion of total expenditures reflect the actual incomes of BY-2, but some of this information could be estimates that are revised later.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Mensaje de Remisión (Executive´s Message) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf and http://sg.mecon.gov.ar/ejecucion</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The aggregated data makes it possible to compare the budget-year data to the prior budget year's estimates.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>27. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 3.1.1. Resources http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Resources http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Although this information does not appear in the budget year's executive's budget, it is available since the BY-2 executive's budget is also posted on the Finance Minister's website.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Although this information does not appear in the budget year's executive's budget, it is available since the BY-2 executive's budget is also posted on the Finance Minister's website.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1: Resources http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.4: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>34. In the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.4: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Fiduciary Funds http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/capitulo1/fondosfidu.pdf Decentralized Organisms: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/ley/pdf/planillas_anexas/titulo3/anexa3a1.pdf Also on the Executive ´s message there is some explanation on extra-budgetary funds on Sections 4.1 and 4.2 http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Fiduciary Funds work as trust funds where an entity contributes resources that will be managed by a trustee to finance a specific project. Some examples of decentralized organisms in Argentina are: National Institute for Water; National Communications Commission; National Entity for Electricity Regulation; National Institute of Livestock and Agriculture Technology; Military Geographic Institute.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>36. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Resources http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive's budget only covers automatic transfers and not non-automatic ones.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "c"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." The Government provides extensive information on the intergovernmental transfer. Please provide examples to justify the "c" grade.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response:</u> The Executive Budget Proposal contains all the geographic allocation of all national expenditures in an aggregate manner, covering all transfers. The Enacted Budget, passed only a couple of months later, contains very detailed information on intergovernmental transfers. Although for non-automatic transfers, the published documents do not present its criteria of distribution, they do present amounts.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the data across the countries.</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>37. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 4.3 http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "c"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." The "proyecto de ley de presupuesto" does include information about transfers to public corporations, not in an extensive way. I would rather classify it as "b" unless examples are provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain the consistency of the data across the countries.</p>	c
<p>38. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.4 http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not provided in Executive´s Budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>41. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>42. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The information is scarce. There is some information regarding endorsements in section 2.4 of the Executive's Message: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is not provided in the Executive's Budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Due to Argentina's GDP per capita, it does not receive donor assistance or the amount is minor.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>e</p>

<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.3: Tax Expenditure Estimation http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, section 3.1.1: Resources http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Sources of revenue are identified but the classifications used are broadly defined. Some of the earmarking of the revenues can be inferred from the Budget proposal but they are not identified explicitly.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items. d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in section 3.2.2 of the Executive's Message: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The information is vague. It mentions only the total amount for intelligence and defense and only a couple of programs are disaggregated.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in the Executive's Message, Section 2.5: Public Spending http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no information in the executive's budget, it is only included in the multi-year budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Proyecto de Presupuesto. Detalle de Programas Orientados a Resultados. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensadosnueve.html#experiencia Also on Public Expenditure analysis by Function (Section 3.2 on the Executive’s Message) there is information on beneficiaries and physical goals. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>

<p>52. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Proyecto de Presupuesto. Detalle de Programas Orientados a Resultados. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is an ongoing pilot experience which includes several result-oriented programs. The performance indicators are presented for these programs.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The indicators aimed to assess procedures either do not exist or they are insufficient. Examples of these indicators are Medical Consultations.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> The comment is out of context, the adequacy of the indicator will depend on the program that it tries to evaluate (i.e. for a children well being program, medical consultations are indeed a good indicator).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C

<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Proyecto de Presupuesto. Detalle de Programas Orientados a Resultados. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensadosnueve.html#experiencia</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> They are available only for the indicators included in the pilot experience.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>55. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Executive's Message http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf Detalle de Programas Orientados a Resultados. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensadosnueve.html#experiencia</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive's budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	
<p>56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> This information appears in a document called the Current Taxes in Argentina issued by the Undersecretary of Public Incomes http://www.mecon.gov.ar/sip/dniaf/tributos_vigentes.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Not available in the executive 's budget documents.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There are some documents on tax incidence produced and published by the AFIP (revenue's agency). Anuario estadísticas tributarias: http://www.afip.gov.ar/institucional/estudios/</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The information is not provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Due to Argentina's GDP per capita, it does not receive donor assistance or the amount is minor.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	e

<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> This information is available in the Executive's Message http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/proy2009/mensaje/mensaje2009.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The first part of the executive's message describes the budget and its main goals, but it does not appear as a separate document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>61. Does the executive publish a "citizens budget" or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is a site (not a document) called "Consulta para el ciudadano sobre el presupuesto de la administración pública nacional" which stands for "Citizens' access to information on the Budget of the National Administration." In that site there is information about the budget's execution http://www.mecon.gov.ar/consulta/index0a.html</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Manual of the Public Budgetary System http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/manuales/el_sistema_presupuestario_publico.pdf Manual of Budgetary Classifiers http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/manuales/clasificador03.pdf Glossary: http://sg.mecon.ar/ejecucion/ (Glosario)</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The National Office for Budget publishes manuals (glossary) that includes thorough definitions such as the two links above that are available online to the public. However, the language is too technical for lay persons to understand. The Glossary for the Citizen is a useful tool but lacks important details.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. b. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. c. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information. d. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no Law of Access to Public Information, but there is a presidential decree which rules on these matters and that only applies to the National Executive Government, which we consider "in law" (even though it can be revoked by the President). However, many offices of the National Executive government excuse themselves under the Law of "Procedimientos Administrativos" which preexists and contradicts the decree.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence. b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Taking into account our experience in several projects on access to information, it is more possible to obtain financial information as an NGO than as an individual citizen despite the fact that theoretically, there should not be any difference. More seriously, the delay and level of detail of the answer vary widely depending on the administrative unit involved in delivering the data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Same as previous answer with the peculiarity that this kind of data may involve personal information (e.g. data on social programs beneficiaries) which is usually not provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
--	----------

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process	
Executive's Formulation of the Budget	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The release date is set in permanent law. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Law 24156 - article # 26: http://www.infoleg.gov.ar/infolegInternet/anexos/0-4999/554/norma.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The release date is set for September 15th of each year based on Law 24156. However, the public is able to access the document a few days later. The information is uploaded on the Ministry of Economy website several days after the executive project is presented in Congress. In 2002, the executive's budget was presented in February 2002 because of the economic crisis and government change that rendered the Budget presented in September 2001 completely useless.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "a"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> Actually, for 2002, the budget was indeed presented in September 2001 but the crisis made it obsolete, it is not that the executive presented the budget proposal in February 2002 without having it presented as established by law.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "a" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	a

<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <p>a. Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. b. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Cronograma de elaboración del Presupuesto Nacional http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/instrutexto/archivos/res1762007.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The dates for the executive's budget presentation and for the approval by Congress are set by law. The Congress is not forced to approve it. In the case this happens, BY-1 budget stays in effect.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <p>a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Even though the executive adheres to the timetable, in the sense that it complies with the date of deliverance to the Congress, it is not possible to control the internal deadlines. The timetable was not adhered to several times in the last 25 years. The most recent violation took place during the 2002 budget process. From 1995 onwards – the regulating law was approved in 1992 - the Executive presented the proposal later than the established dates in 1995 and 2001 but only by a few days. On 2002, due to the huge economic crisis the Budget was presented a second time in February, because the first one was useless.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It depends on the relative power of the president and legislators. The Executive usually holds consultations with very few legislators, among them the president of the budget committee. The main objective of these meetings is to gauge the legislator's view on some potentially problematic budget issues.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "c"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "d." The budgetary policy, according to the National Constitution, is exclusively defined by the National Executive Power.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	C
<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. b. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. c. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. d. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The executive releases a document to the public that has some characteristics of a pre-budget statement (informe de avance del presupuesto) 6 months in advance of the start of the budget year. This is in accordance with Law N° 24629, Art. 2. However this document only provides macroeconomic data and the previous year's budget information.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "d"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "e." The document required by Law 24629, article 2, must be presented to the Legislative Power and is technical in nature.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government's macroeconomic and fiscal framework?

- a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government's fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Informe de Avance:

http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/info_avance/2010.pdf

Comment:

The document does not qualify as a Pre-budget statement. It does not provide information on BY+1

Researcher Response to this Question was "d"

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "e." The document required by Law 24629, article 2, must be presented to the Legislative Power and is of technical nature.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "d" to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the *Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire*.

d

<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Same as previous question</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was “d”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “e.” The document required by Law 24629, article 2, must be presented to the Legislative Power and is technical in nature.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the guidance provided to researchers for correctly completing the questionnaire in the <i>Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire</i>.</p>	<p>d</p>
---	----------

Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The discussion starts (depending on the political situation) in the beginning of September and the budget is discussed intensively from mid November to early December. There is not much time for a serious analysis, especially because of the lack of a Congressional Budget Office.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Ministry of Economy presents to the legislative committee the macroeconomic and fiscal framework at the time that it sends the budget proposal. The Press can assist with the presentation but there is not much room for debate.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The site below gathers information about legislative committees' sessions. www.laborlegislativa.com.ar</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Hearings that cover key administrative unit are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are handwritten versions but is very difficult to get them.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures. b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> This information is provided regarding the total amount, but disaggregated spending information on intelligence is not provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations. c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited. d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The legislature has the authority in law to amend the budget, but they can not change the fiscal result.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The approved budget includes program-level detail. b. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The approved budget includes only departmental totals. d. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals or the approved budget is not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Every Program appears under the jurisdiction which executes it. We give the example of National Health Ministry http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/presutexto/ley2009/jurent/pdf/D09J80.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Ejecución presupuestaria de la Administración Nacional - base devengado http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejecu_mensual/archivos/junio09.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is also a quarterly report called Boletín Fiscal that provides a report organized by several criteria every three months. The Query for the Citizen (Consulta para el Ciudadano) publishes less detailed information, but it has simple graphs which help to understand the data provided.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. No in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejecu_mensual/archivos/junio09.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejecu_mensual/archivos/junio09.pdf Also the quarterly report has more details: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/4totrim08/4totrim08.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It does not cover all programs in detail.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "a"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be "b," as it does not cover all the programs in detail and option "a" calls for program-level detail.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "b" to maintain consistency with the assumptions used in selecting answers across countries. The question is asking whether all programs are covered, but does not enquire about the detail in which the programs are covered. However, in light of Peer Reviewer One and Researcher comment "b" is considered appropriate.</p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejecu_mensual/archivos/junio09.pdf Fiscal Newsletter: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/4totrim08/4totrim08.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In the monthly report there is comparison with the original estimate. In the quarterly Fiscal Newsletter there are comparisons both with the original estimate for that period, and with the same period in the previous year.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Tax revenues are released monthly. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/sip/basehome/pormesy tasa.htm http://www.mecon.gov.ar/sip/basehome/pormes.htm Also non tax revenues are reported monthly on a cash basis http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejectexto/cuenta_nac_dosuno.html?var1=cuantanacdosnueve</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. b. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. c. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The information is released monthly by the Undersecretary of Public Revenues and also by the Revenues Agency (AFIP) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/sip/basehome/pormesyntasa.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The comparison is done for all revenues resources on the montholy report: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejecu_mensual/archivos/junio09.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Fiscal newsletter: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejectexto/bole_trim_dosuno.html?var1=boletrimdosucho Finance Secretary Debt Report http://www.mecon.gov.ar/finanzas/sfinan/deuda_ultimo.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is detailed information on the Fiscal Newsletter (Tables 37 to 71) http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/boletin/4totrim08/4totrim08.pdf There is very detailed information on the Finance Secretary Debt Report http://www.mecon.gov.ar/finanzas/sfinan/deuda_ultimo.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. In-year reports are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Cash basis report: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/onp/html/ejectexto/cuenta_nac_dosuno.html?var1=cuantanacdosnueve</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It depends on the report. For example, reports that include program, institution or function analysis are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. Cash basis expenditures are released 20 days after the end of the month.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain <i>minimal</i> level specified in law or regulation)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units. b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment. c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented. d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The Ministers Cabinet Chief has powers that allow him to shift funds between administrative units without any input from the Congress. He can not increase total expenditures but he can shift funds.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. b. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. c. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. d. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are relevant cases of problems in the procurement of goods and services. Some of them we cite with newspapers clippings: http://www.clarin.com/diario/2009/05/23/elpais/p-01924536.htm http://www.perfil.com/contenidos/2009/08/29/noticia_0011.html</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). b. Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Supplemental budgets should be approved by law, but in practice they are always implemented through Necessity Decrees that are later approved by the Congress. The issue is that there is a big backlog in the approvals of the Necessity Decrees by the Congress, so the resolutions might come after the fiscal year was over.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. b. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. c. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. d. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is difficult to answer this question because the behavior has changed a lot since the economic recovery in 2003. As the government started to underestimate its revenues, the supplemental budgets became larger.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. b. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. c. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. d. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are no operative contingency funds. The Fiscal Responsibility Law plans the creation of a Counter Cyclical Fund but it has not been properly established.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. d. The executive does not release a year-end report. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> It should be published six months after the end of the fiscal year, but usually it is published later (only some weeks). The report is available to the public and it is published in the month of June of year AP+1. For example for year 2008 the report message can be checked at: http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2008/tomoi/02intro.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited. b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited. d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecan.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2008/tomoi/02intro.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The year-end report shows the differences but not at an exhaustive level. It lacks some details on program goal for example.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. b. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). c. The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). d. No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecan.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2008/tomoi/02intro.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2008/tomoi/06comentarios.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is only explanation regarding differences on expenditures and resources but not on the macroeconomic data.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is information regarding physical outcomes (Sistema de seguimiento fisico financiero) by program. http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2008/tomoi/01aintroduccion.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> http://www.mecon.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2008/tomoi/06comentarios.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There are some comments on the budgetary execution in the year-end report and it gives an idea of the reasons for the main changes in expenditures when compared to the original budget. It does not explain, however, the differences in detail. It only mentions the main items.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> We provide the information regarding the programs under the Education Ministry as an example: http://www.mec.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2008/tomoi/13jur70.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The explanation exists for some programs but is somewhat vague.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The main information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, but the information is not detailed. There is no explanation on detailed expenditures in extra-budgetary funds. For example for Fiduciary Funds: http://www.mec.gov.ar/hacienda/cgn/cuenta/2008/tomoi/15fondos.htm</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C

The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. d. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year by the Auditoria General de la Nacion and the Congress.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The reports from the Auditory Authority only cover a small proportion of total expenditures.</p> <p><u>Researcher Response to this Question was "c"</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer "d" because, as previously stated in question 111, audit reports are released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year.</p>	d
<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There are several audit reports for several departments (http://www.agn.gov.ar/informes.htm) but it does not have an annual audit report.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <p>a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed.</p> <p>b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> Constitution: "This body which provides technical assistance to the Congress, with financial independence, will be integrated following the law which regulates its creation and functioning, that will have to be approved by the members of each Chamber. The President of this body will be appointed upon the proposal put forward by the opposition political party with the greatest number of legislative members in the Congress." (Original Spanish: "Este organismo de asistencia técnica del Congreso, con autonomía funcional, se integrará del modo que establezca la ley que reglamenta su creación y funcionamiento, que deberá ser aprobada por mayoría absoluta de los miembros de cada Cámara. El presidente del organismo será designado a propuesta del partido político de oposición con mayor número de legisladores en el Congreso.")</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There can be administrative summaries against the public servant and it can also lead to political judgment carried out by the Congress. Also, the Judicial authorities can take part if there are denunciations.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>a</p>
--	----------

<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Several examples of audits of extra-budgetary funds can be found in the SAI webpage. We provide the link to a couple one of them : http://www.agn.gov.ar/informes/informesPDF2009/2009_128.pdf http://www.agn.gov.ar/informes/informesPDF2009/2009_041.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a
<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In Argentina the audit authority is headed by the opposition. But the board of directors that takes all decisions is confirmed by members both from the ruling party members and from the opposition (which are a minority when voting). The Auditoria General de la Nación audits the expenditures referred in Art. 118 of Law 24.156, with a planning that will point out the control areas and the resources for each of them, defined on the basis of importance, significance and risk.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Budgetary Law (Ley de Administracion Financiera): "The powers and duties of the General Auditors Institution include: a) to propose the yearly action plan and the budget proposal for the institution."

Original Spanish: "Son atribuciones y deberes de los Auditores Generales reunidos en Colegio: a) Proponer el programa de acción anual y el proyecto de presupuesto de la entidad."

Comment:

It is proposed by the general auditors and then approved by the legislature.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

a

<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, intelligence services)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> SAI organizational chart: http://www.agn.gov.ar/doc-tecnicos/organi.pdf</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The reports are on specific programs, but they do not include the whole defense sector.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u> Rules regarding the presentation of information to the SAI: http://www.agn.gov.ar/informes/Reglamento-Presentaciones%20Reol.%2050%20del%202004.PDF</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> It is not possible to quantify the effects of this normative.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C

120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?

- a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized.
- b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized.
- c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized.
- d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Ley de Administracion Financiera, Art. 129 -

"In order to carry on its functions the Mixed Parliamentary Commission for the Revision of the Accounts must:

d) Request to the national General Audit Institution all the information that deems to be appropriate about the activities implemented by the above mentioned institutions.

e) Analyze the periodic reports about the implementation of the approved activities, make the appropriate observations and indicate the changes that deems advisable to be introduced

f) Analyze the annual memo that the national General Audit Institution should present before May 1 of each year."

Original Spanish: "Para el desempeño de sus funciones la Comisión Parlamentaria Mixta Revisora de Cuentas debe:

d) Requerir de la Auditoría General de la Nación toda la información que estime oportuno sobre las actividades realizadas por dicho ente;

e) Analizar los informes periódicos de cumplimiento del programa de trabajo aprobado, efectuar las observaciones que pueden merecer e indicar las modificaciones que estime conveniente introducir.

f) Analizar la memoria anual que la Auditoría General de la Nación deberá elevarle antes del 1 de mayo de cada año."

Comment:

The reports are scrutinized but there are usually some delays. In other words, the reports sometimes do not get scrutinized on time.

Peer Reviewer One Comment:

Peer Reviewer Two Comment:

a

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> By law, the government is not obliged to take remedial respect to the audits. This is a regulatory shortcoming. Moreover, audits have been commonly presented with significant delays to governments that were already different from those responsible for the Audit's findings.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> A report is not produced.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Regarding the army and police, the SAI is empowered to produce reports and deliver them to the legislature. As we stated earlier, this is not the case regarding the intelligence services.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

Additional Comments:

We would like to bring to your attention the following four items since the questionnaire did not seem to capture some of the real transparency problems.

1) Spending consolidation: Given the federal nature of Argentina's political system, a considerable share of spending - particularly social spending - is executed by subnational governments. The information on this spending is not published with as much consistency, in terms of quality, detail and timing, as the national spending information.

Even though individual spending programs are presented, some of them are so broad that they do not permit a thorough analysis.

2) The Legislature has yielded budgetary powers to the Chief of Cabinet (Executive Power). In 2006 the Legislature gave attributes to the Chief of Cabinet - attributes which allow him to make changes in the budget without the Congress's approval, making it possible to change spending within categories, but still limiting the ability to change the fiscal result or the total amount of spending. This measure, which changes the distribution of power established by the Law of Financial Administration, empowers the government branch that was already the most prominent in the process. Doing so may have pernicious consequences on budget transparency. We must specify though, that the restrictions which are still imposed to the Executive branch regarding budget changes can be avoided by the President by issuing a decree. (decretos de necesidad y urgencia).

3) Regarding the Citizens Budget. The Ministry of Finance has a webpage which intends to present a Citizen Budget. Nevertheless the information provided is not adequate. Please see <http://www.mecon.gov.ar/consulta/index0a.htm>

4) The final comment relates to the controversy about the macroeconomic projections used by the Executive. Key macroeconomic variables such as GDP growth and inflation have been underestimated during previous years. This is due to both political and economic reasons. Underestimating the GDP - and consequently the revenues - allows the National Executive to assign a portion of the extra revenues with a higher level of discretion. Underestimating inflation is more related to the intention of avoiding to fuel inflation by reducing inflation expectations.