

IDS Working Paper 240

Governance hybrids: pro-poor, rights-based approaches in rural Peru

Aaron Schneider and Rebeca Zuniga-Hamlin

February 2005

INSTITUTE OF DEVELOPMENT STUDIES
Brighton, Sussex BN1 9RE
ENGLAND

Aaron Schneider is a Fellow at the Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex and Rebeca Zuniga-Hamlin is a freelance consultant and Director of the Central American Women's Network. Key inputs were also provided by Alexandra Hughes. Nicholas Benequista provided valuable editing and assistance. They welcome comments and suggestions at a.schneider@ids.ac.uk, alexandra.hughes@tvcabo.co.mz, and rebeca@mundonica.com.

Governance hybrids: pro-poor, rights-based approaches in rural Peru
Aaron Schneider and Rebeca Zuniga-Hamlin
IDS Working Paper 240

First published by the Institute of Development Studies in February 2005
© Institute of Development Studies 2005
ISBN 1 85864 856 4

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.
All rights reserved. Reproduction, copy, transmission, or translation of any part of this publication may be made only under the following conditions:

- with the prior permission of the publisher; or
- with a licence from the Copyright Licensing Agency Ltd., 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE, UK, or from another national licensing agency; or
- under the terms set out below.

This publication is copyright, but may be reproduced by any method without fee for teaching or non-profit purposes, but not for resale. Formal permission is required for all such uses, but normally will be granted immediately. For copying in any other circumstances, or for re-use in other publications, or for translation or adaptation, prior written permission must be obtained from the publisher, and a fee may be payable.

Available from:
Communications Unit
Institute of Development Studies
at the University of Sussex
Brighton BN1 9RE, UK.
Tel: +44 (0)1273 678269
Fax: +44 (0)1273 621202
Email: publications@ids.ac.uk
www.ids.ac.uk/ids/bookshop

Printed by XPS Limited, Brighton UK
IDS is a charitable company limited by guarantee and registered in England (No. 877338).

Summary

How do we understand the hybrid forms of governance that occasionally emerge when rights-based approaches (RBA) are introduced into contexts of extreme poverty? Poverty is multidimensional, and any attempt to respond to poverty must offer internally consistent responses to each of the dimensions. RBA offers a coherent set of economic, social and political responses to poverty that promise substantive change in the social order. In rural Peru in 2002, a host of local and national movements were eager to experiment with new RBA alternatives to address intense poverty. The introduction of RBA did not occur in a vacuum, however, and existing clientelist practices mixed with RBA to produce governance hybrids. At first glance, this combination seems unusual. Clientelism and RBA are usually seen as mutually exclusive, polar opposites; clientelism reproduces poverty while RBA transforms it. Yet, the current study demonstrates a variety of hybrid RBA and clientelist practices that imply different degrees of benefit for poor citizens. At a conceptual level, this study suggests we need to reevaluate discrete categories of rights and clientelism and allow for a continuum that would include a number of intermediate, hybrid steps. Policymakers may want to take these hybrids into account when designing their interventions to move in the direction of greater rights, rather than watered down RBA or reversion to clientelism.

Keywords: rights, citizenship, democracy, decentralisation, clientelism, politics, party, Peru, governance.

Contents

	Summary	iii
	List of tables and boxes	vi
	Acknowledgements	vii
	Policy report executive summary	ix
	Regional findings	ix
	Local findings	x
	Future implications	xii
1	Introduction	1
2	Poverty	2
	2.1 Economic exclusion	3
	2.2 Cultural exclusion	3
	2.3 Political exclusion	3
3	Poverty in Peru	4
	3.1 Economic exclusion	4
	3.2 Cultural exclusion	5
	3.3 Political exclusion	6
4	Responses to poverty: clientelist networks	7
	4.1 Clientelism and economic exclusion	8
	4.2 Clientelism and cultural exclusion	8
	4.3 Clientelism and political exclusion	9
	4.4 Clientelism is resilient and adaptive	9
5	Responses to poverty: rights-based approaches (RBAs)	10
	5.1 RBA and economic exclusion	11
	5.2 RBA and cultural exclusion	12
	5.3 RBA and political exclusion	14
	5.4 RBA establishes a new social order	15
6	Opportunities for RBA-guided responses	16
7	RBA-guided responses in Peru	17
	7.1 Regional civil society	18
	7.2 Regional authorities	18
	7.3 Local civil society	18
	7.4 Local authorities	19
8	The hybrid nature of governance	21
	8.1 RBA watered down by clientelism	21
	8.2 RBA and rival clientelism	22
	8.3 RBA advanced through clientelism	23
9	Conclusion	24
	Appendix I: RBA at DFID	26
	Appendix II: RBA principles	28
	Appendix III: Evolution of the RBA	29
	Appendix IV: International electoral assistance experience	31

Appendix V: Maps	35
Map 1 Peru	35
Map 2 Anta	35
Map 3 Tambobamba	36
Map 4 Macusani	36
Map 5 Ollachea	37
Appendix VI: Comparing El Gol and non-El Gol districts	38
Case comparison findings	40
Case comparison methodology	45
Appendix VII: Policy report: findings and implications	47
Local findings	47
Regional findings	47
Implications	47
Appendix VIII: Development administration lessons	48
Appendix IX: El Gol partners, activities and coverage	49
Appendix X: Interviews	51
Appendix XI: Abbreviations and translations	53
References	55

Tables and Boxes

Table A1 District demographics (percentages)	38
Table A2 Percent support for priorities	41
Box 5.1 Responding to poverty	16

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to express sincere thanks to the many members of Peruvian civil society, media, local government, and national government who made this study possible. DFID governance staff around the world were also extremely helpful. In particular we would like to thank the DFID Peru office, especially Marfil Francke for encouraging and nurturing this project; Mark Lewis for his oversight and observations; Carlos Santiso for his frequent contributions and insights; and Milagros Brescia and Doris Naola for invaluable administrative support. At IDS and in frequent “virtual” conversations, Alexandra Hughes provided essential comments and advice on rights-based approaches to development. Ros Eyben, Jo Wheeler, and John Gaventa offered valuable suggestions. Essential editing and assistance was provided by Nicholas Benequista.

In Peru, we were assisted by too many individuals and organisations to count. Special thanks are due for offering time and thoughtful comments during interviews to Cesar A. Aguilar Andrade, Carlos Torres, Hernan Sullco Tito, Neri Contreras, Paulina Romero, Dante Coasaca Nuñez, Juan Gustavo Hernández, Ligia Alencastre, Sergio Pacheco, Yanet Baca, Marcos Zeizzer Polatsik, Arturo Maldonado, Claudio Zavala Gianella, Eduardo Barzola, Elizabeth Quiros, Elizabeth Vargas Machuca, Fernando Romero, Javier Torres Seoane, Jorge Luis Sáenz A., Juan Mendoza, Julio Díaz Palacios, Lourdes Blanco, Luis Pineda Blanco, Manuel Gomez, Maria Amparo Joseph H., Martin Soto Guevara, Professor Alejandro Diez Hurtado, Rodrigo Arce Rojas, Willi Alis, Luis Ronquillo, Enrico Villena, Ines Condori, Dep. Ernesto Herrera, Dep. Ernesto Herrera Becerra, Dep. Ing. Walter Alejos Calderon, Dep. Javier Diez Canseco, Mayor William M. Gonzalez Nuñez, Mayor Sabino Molina Pacha, Mayor Luis Alfredo Calderon Jara, Mayor Marcos Henry Zuniga Gutierrez, Mayor Wilber Rosas, Mayor Michel F. Portier Balland, and the Council members of Macusani, Anta, Ollachea, and Tambobamba. All mistakes, oversights, or omissions are the sole responsibility of the authors.

Policy report executive summary

In 2002 the Department for International Development (DFID) provided electoral assistance for local and regional elections. Partners included 23 NGOs and local and national government actors. Their mission was to create an electoral process that was more inclusive of poor, excluded people in rural Peru. This mission quickly expanded beyond mere electoral monitoring and civic education and undertook a wider transformation of citizen attitudes, government practices, and national institutions. The programmes undertaken by the various partners were gathered under the heading, El Gol, and they targeted five Andean Highland departments of Peru.

The current report is the product of an evaluation of several aspects of the project. The research included interviews with El Gol partners, local government officials, international donor representatives, and members of civil society.

The El Gol programme applied a rights-based and pro-poor approach to electoral assistance with particular attention to poor, rural, local districts. The report evaluates the impact of El Gol using a political framework that emphasises the operation of rights-based and pro-poor approaches in the context of clientelist local authorities. The most interesting finding may be that pro-poor, rights-based and more inclusive participatory practices can encourage transformation of clientelist settings to promote outcomes that benefit the poor.

Regional findings

The regional reality in Peru includes weak parties, feeble civil society, and an elite class that has reinserted traditional clientelist practices to regional institutions. Incipient opposition and popular movements were making inroads, but they had largely failed to penetrate political power at the regional level. El Gol employed a bottom-up strategy that fortified pro-poor mayors and a centre-periphery strategy that attempted to use a Lima-base to influence the rules shaping regional behaviour. Several regional observations deserve note:

- Coalitions of pro-poor mayors and opposition movements pressure regional authorities and force a distribution towards the rural areas.
- The same actors have claimed and created spaces for voice and participation of the poor and those who represent them at the regional level.
- Lima-based lobbying created legislation that strengthened the weight of participatory and consultative entities in regional government.

Despite these important advances, a few warnings about the constraints on a pro-poor and rights-based approach at the regional level are in order.

- The national government is sceptical of the potential for effective regional governance, and the timid Organic Law of Regions reflects that unease.

- Revenues and authority transferred to the regions are wholly inadequate to undertake major functions, and some of these functions transferred are probably more appropriately located at another level of government.
- Authorities in the regions are sceptical of institutions biased towards pro-poor and rights-based approaches, such as the Regional Coordination Councils (CCRs).
- Regional authorities are minimising the importance of the CCRs and using patronage to influence the behaviour of province and district mayors.
- The CCRs themselves are flawed. The 40 per cent threshold for civil society participation and the registration requirement for civil society organisations are likely to constrain the capacity of many opposition groups.
- CCRs are structured largely as consultative and consensus-building institutions, and they therefore lack real teeth to hold regional authorities accountable. As a result, they are unlikely to evolve into anything like a participatory or representative regional level legislative branch.

The main conclusion to be drawn from this analysis is that one of the biggest problems for civil society in Peru is the weakness of political society. Political parties are not doing their job at the regional level. The pro-poor and rights-based approaches that El Gol advanced made some important, though limited progress in strengthening civil society. For civil society to encourage a change in political practice at the regional level, mayors and progressive movements must insert themselves at the regional level in a coordinated way. They will require resources and allies beyond their borders. El Gol NGO partners provided some of the resources, capacity and alliances that were necessary in the short term. In the longer term, more reliable institutional allies will be necessary.

Local findings

New local authorities face the challenge of building viable institutions in the context of a weak state, fragmented civil society, and intense poverty. In particular, the challenges of constituting local authorities has remained factionalised into pro- and anti-Fujimori sections of the local elite. The institutions that could operate in this context combined pro-poor, rights-based approaches in the context of pervasive clientelism. It has to be acknowledged that local social practices were unlikely to disappear overnight, and they continued to exhibit traditional clientelism. Such social norms militate against the full realisation of rights and pro-poor participation, particularly for women, and perpetuate inefficient and unequal public policy. These traditional clientelist techniques build support for elites and sustain their power by exchanging material benefits for obedience for poorer citizens.

Despite the political, economic, and social inequalities that reinforce traditional clientelism, the rights-based and pro-poor approach of El Gol made important strides in strengthening citizenship.

Districts in which El Gol partners had worked used rights-based and more participatory approaches to channel benefits to poor supporters and potential allies, and in so doing, shifted the terms of clientelist exchange. Several positive local trends deserve note:

- More inclusive and participatory approaches meant the engagement of poor citizens, or those who represent them, in policy formulation and decision-making.
- Poor citizens were given ownership and responsibility to ensure the success of policies.
- Poor citizens offered their own resources and time to the public good, and they used participatory spaces to hold authorities accountable.
- Authorities in El Gol provinces tended to favour long-term, rural, and participatory priorities. Non-El Gol provinces maintained a short-term, urban, and material focus.

The key innovation in rural Peru was a strategic structure of participation. By biasing the sites of participation and the pattern of decision-making towards the poor and rural districts, voices of poor, *campesino* citizens were privileged. As a result, these groups could mobilise to obtain material resources and realise their rights. The new institutions further privileged these groups by tying rights to active participation. This reinforced the notion that citizens receive their benefits on the basis of their active links to local authorities.

As was evident at the regional level, one cannot ignore the importance of political society to solidifying and realising citizenship gains. The advances that El Gol contributed in realising citizenship rights tended to be geographically, electorally, and fiscally bounded. In other words, in districts where progressive leaders committed themselves to participation, El Gol programmes advanced active citizenship. In neighbouring districts and higher levels of government, traditional elites dominated and presented real threats that clientelism would return.

The sustainability of localised experiments in rights based approaches is likely to depend on the ability to institutionalise and spread progressive movements. New authorities in poor districts where El Gol attempted to build active citizenship faced continued problems related to scarcity and institutional weakness. Some local leaders dealt with scarcity by searching for additional resources beyond their borders and in so doing, could erect fragile institutions geared towards the participation of the poor, or those who represent them. The main protection from a return to clientelism was additional resources through cross-jurisdiction and inter-governmental cooperation. Governments linked across districts and provinces granted leaders a wider area to draw resources and pool administrative, material and other assets. These alliances could also be used to secure resources from higher level governments.

In sum, what began as an electoral assistance programme was actually an effort to bring a rights-based and pro-poor approach to local governance. El Gol partners contributed to a transformation in traditional patterns of unequal and inefficient clientelism. In its place, a new and improved style of governance was emerging. The construction and use of pro-poor mechanisms of participation and pro-

poor policies were central to this approach, and it transformed some of the terms of clientelist exchange. The result was improved governance at the local level. Still, a real risk exists that new patterns of governance can slip back into old patterns of clientelism:

- The privileged sites of participation for the poor cannot be allowed to disappear or slip into exclusionary mechanisms captured by the rich.
- To date, cross-district alliances have largely concentrated on securing additional resources for each district. This effort should be formalised and institutionalised, if possible.
- Local leaders should consider coordinating the way in which they build political support. A shared set of institutions, policies, and practices can ensure that cross-district collaboration continues on the basis of participatory institutions and pro-poor policies.
- Weak institutions at the regional level should be strengthened through cross-district alliances based on rights-based and pro-poor approaches.
- Political parties are currently weak, but they might be the most decisive actors in aggregating provincial movements. To sustain improved governance, rights-based, pro-poor policies should be at the centre of partisan efforts to create district, provincial and regional voices.

Future implications

The key conclusions of these findings relate to the transformation of clientelism through the construction of active citizenship and formal institutions that support it. Clientelist practices thrive on poverty and weak institutions. In patron-client networks, disempowered citizens depend on powerful informal authorities, and the result is inequality, weak democracy, and continued poverty. These examples of poor governance remain pervasive in many parts of rural Peru because there is little local demand for citizenship; alternatives to traditional leaders are weak; and few resources exist to build formal institutions. Quite simply, there are few alternatives to clientelism. The El Gol project was quite ingenious in articulating an alternative form of local governance based on rights.

One aspect of the El Gol project deserves particular note because it was unusual. Local, regional, and national NGOs served as an imported middle class for rural communities where there was hardly any autonomous capacity for change. El Gol partner NGOs articulated demands for citizenship, provided the leadership and capacity that could contribute to formal institution-building, and worked to secure resources from outside. In short, El Gol provided an alternative to clientelism because it forged an alliance between the rural poor, indigenous progressive leaders, and middle class NGO allies.

El Gol opted to operate through NGOs and civil society actors who might strategically ally with some local politicians but would mostly operate outside formal electoral politics. This was probably a wise choice given the notorious weakness of Peruvian parties and their poor track record on combating clientelism. On the other hand, parties have one significant advantage over NGOs – they do not depend on the whims of external donors. NGOs have few resources of their own, and the impending closure of

DFID offices suggests resource pressures are likely to increase. By contrast, parties can generate their own resources, and they can sustain cross-class and cross-geographic alliances through attaining public power. El Gol partners indirectly contributed to progressive partisan practices in several localised circumstances. If a more formalised and institutionalised progressive party could emerge, one could more confidently speak of a sustainable alternative to traditional clientelism. For the moment, the El Gol network of NGOs, local leaders, and citizen organisations offers a temporary, though important, alternative.

1 Introduction

How can the development community respond to endemic poverty? The intense and interrelated economic, political and social hardships entailed by poverty make it extremely difficult to design successful responses. In most developing countries, the most common traditional response has been a set of institutions based on principles of clientelism that include particularist exchange, traditional rituals, and rigid hierarchy. Guided by these principles, resources are allocated to communities and individuals in return for political loyalty and personal favours. An alternative response to poverty is guided by a rights-based approach (RBA). The principles of this approach include universal citizenship, enhancing social capital and empowerment, and participatory institutions of governance.

The current study examines conditions of endemic poverty in rural Peru where clientelism has thrived. In these conditions, attempts to replace clientelist relations with practices guided by RBA have produced mixed results. A hybrid governance form emerged that mixed clientelist and RBA elements. This study highlights two policy-relevant conclusions. First, breaking through clientelism requires new structural conditions that include external resources and alliances as well as autonomous empowerment of local actors. Second, even with these ingredients, we need to come to terms with hybrid governance patterns.

This project grew out of a one-month field visit to Peru to evaluate an RBA to electoral assistance in the Andean highlands. The electoral assistance and the subsequent evaluation of which this is a part were generously funded by UK DFID, and the project has benefited from the comments and critiques of DFID staff and their local partners. In addition, early versions of the document were also shared with practitioners and theorists who have been at the forefront of developing RBA. The observation that well-designed, rights-based development plans have produced governance hybrids was a surprise to some.

Two comments have been typical and provoke a few policy-relevant thoughts. For some theorists, the principles of RBA were less than completely applied in practice, and the hybrid results from Peru should not be considered damning of RBA in general. 'It seems that the actual projects of the local authorities were not all that rights-based in practice.' A more sophisticated approach to RBA accepts that there is no such thing as "perfectly functioning RBA", and we should be aiming towards RBA practices that produce the best outcomes given real-world constraints.

From the more practical view of DFID and partner practitioners, the RBA implemented was not given enough time to germinate; 'This project only began shortly before the elections; we should not be surprised that the impact was only partial'. Once again, this study offers relevant advice. Time constraints are relevant real-world constraints to be considered. The impending closure of DFID's office in Peru is a typical scenario of development aid more generally. Funding is fickle, and it can be rapidly withdrawn when foreign policy priorities and economic conditions change in donor countries. Aid interventions, therefore, should be designed with time constraints in mind. Programmes should be designed in discrete stages that are unlikely to be reversed even if a programme is forced to end prematurely.

The study also suggests potential theoretical innovations in rights. Some observed governance hybrids achieved RBA-principles through practices that seem incompatible with rights such as particularist, arbitrary, and exclusionary clientelist networks. The use of non-RBA-guided means to pursue RBA-guided ends suggests a need to reconsider rights categories.

This working paper is an analytic exercise. It is based on an evaluation of development interventions promoted by DFID (Schneider and Zuniga-Hamlin 2005). An evaluation report and subsequent work includes a series of how-to guides and lessons that may be relevant to policymakers. Some of these are included in appendices. One of these appendices covers DFID and international approaches to RBA and guidelines for putting RBA in practice. In addition, another appendix examines a range of electoral assistance experiences to help locate the Peruvian case. Yet another appendix includes some of the specific case-studies used to evaluate the impact of the project.

The bulk of this working paper analyses patterns of social change in conditions of poverty. Addressing poverty requires a coherent and comprehensive response to each of its multiple dimensions. The early sections discuss these dimensions in general and in rural Peru in particular. The next section discusses two responses to poverty: clientelist networks and RBA-guided approaches. Each includes principles that allow a coherent and comprehensive response to multiple dimensions of poverty, but there is a crucial difference. Practices guided by clientelism reproduce conditions of poverty while practices guided by RBA seek to overcome them. The paper proceeds to examine a series of electoral assistance interventions guided by RBA principles, and the subsequent section describes the impact of these interventions. Clear from the discussion is that following RBA principles did not completely overturn clientelist practices but rather produced a hybrid social order. This has major implications for the way we devise RBA-based interventions in the future as well as for how we understand patterns of social change in Peru and elsewhere.

2 Poverty

People in rural Andean society are poor. For them, the heated academic debate about the meaning and measurement of poverty matters little. By any measure (income poverty, relative deprivation, basic needs, non-income poverty, vulnerability, livelihoods, capabilities, well-being, social exclusion, etc.) their experience of poverty is intense. For our analytic purposes, three aspects of rural poverty will be particularly important: economic, cultural, and political. These are most closely related to the social exclusion notion of poverty, but they can be found in all the more complex conceptualisations, including closely related capabilities approaches and human development theories.

Social exclusion thinking began in France in the 1970s and since has spread widely (Maxwell 1999). It focuses on the multiple and interrelated deprivations associated with poverty. Economic, cultural, and political dimensions are complex and interwoven, and any responses must address them in a coherent and interrelated way.

2.1 Economic exclusion

At an economic level, poverty includes the lack of private goods (income and consumption) and public goods (services and social wages). Individuals and groups without access to these material resources suffer the most basic, economic dimensions of poverty. They struggle for basic subsistence, they are unable to make investments that would change their material conditions, and they lack the material wealth needed to secure political and social resources imperative for active participation in wider social processes. Much attention has been paid to whether income poverty is defined with respect to subsistence, a different poverty line, vulnerability, or with respect to relative levels of income (Glewwe and van der Gaag 1988). Either way, to escape poverty, those who suffer economic dimensions of poverty require more private and public resources.

Responses to economic exclusion require several strategies to manage resources. First, more resources are necessary. Without greater absolute levels of resources, it is virtually impossible to provide public and private goods. Second, resources have to be allocated towards ends that are most useful to the poor, such as basic needs and basic services. Finally, resources and services have to be distributed across different members of society, ideally in ways that improve the condition of the poor.

2.2 Cultural exclusion

Frequently, these economic “lower” needs are contrasted to higher needs associated with cultural dimensions (Maslow 1994). Cultural exclusion refers to the isolation of a group from cultural resources such as society’s framework for organising members, establishing solidary relationships, creating symbols and meanings, and defining identities. Those who are culturally excluded find their cultural practices denigrated and their identities defined in ways that deny them access to broader social networks.

To address social dimensions of poverty, the framework of society has to be redefined to address two shortcomings. First, people require agency in articulating and negotiating identities and cultural symbols. In addition, they require access to networks of social capital that can be mobilised for collective endeavour.

2.3 Political exclusion

The political dimensions of poverty, characterised by the weakness or absence of institutions, present an equally vexing challenge. Institutions, both formal and informal, set the rules for interaction among individuals and groups. Where institutions are weak or absent, powerful individuals or groups can manipulate or circumvent them. This systematically disorganises, disarticulates, misrepresents, and excludes those who lack political resources. Even where institutions are present, they do not always provide equal political opportunities to all. Rules constrain the members of society without political resources, denying them a political “voice” and undermining their ability to apply political pressure to secure material and social needs (Chambers 1997).

To address the political dimensions of poverty, a new architecture of power is essential, including institutions that incorporate rather than exclude the poor. In addition, those who are poor must be provided the political resources they lack or enabled to develop them. Political resources include things like leadership, organisation, and coalitions.

Poverty involves all three kinds of exclusion. Responding to only one kind of exclusion is insufficient. A coherent and comprehensive response to each dimension of exclusion is necessary. Two patterns of response will be discussed here, though others certainly exist. The most salient point of the discussion below is that not only is the type of response critical, but that the sequence of its implementation can also have lasting impacts on the viability and sustainability of the outcome. Before considering two alternative and competing responses to poverty, the following section examines the specific forms that poverty takes for the people of the Andean highlands.

3 Poverty in Peru

Multiple dimensions of poverty are experienced in contextually specific ways. Other marginalised parts of Latin America share some aspects with rural Peru, though the specific history of the Andean region has created severe poverty and several decades of upheaval.

3.1 Economic exclusion

In little over a generation, Peru has rapidly urbanised. The percentage of the population living in cities has risen from 41 per cent in 1941 to over 70 per cent currently. Approximately half of the population, close to 12 million people, live in poverty, and half of the poor are younger than 18. Conditions are even worse in the Andean highlands, where close to 80 per cent of the population is poor. Poor land quality means that where poor land quality allows only subsistence farming or extensive grazing, most peasants live in clusters of a few families. Peasants walk for miles across sinuous mountain trails to reach grazing herds of alpaca and llama.

The major crop of the region is potato, over one hundred varieties of which remain in cultivation. Most farmers survive on small plots and produce for their own consumption. Despite efforts to diversify, cheaper goods from mechanised farms and larger estates flood local markets. Uniquely Andean alpaca and llama herds offer a meager subsistence of income from meat and wool, but traditional herding techniques limit the potential for paths out of income poverty. Temporary wage labour offers a livelihood only for those near enough to market towns to make such production worthwhile. In most families, one or more members have migrated to the faraway coast to seek wage-paying positions in the urban sector.

Infrastructure and services in the countryside are also unreliable. Many communities are connected only by dirt roads that are impassable in the rainy season, periodically separating farmers from their herds and fields. The availability of hospital beds and schools in the countryside is far worse than in urban

centres, with devastating impacts. Infant mortality rates in Lima are 24 per 1,000 live births, while in the rural Andean departments the average is around 145. Andean maternal mortality is approximately three times the national average.

3.2 Cultural exclusion

Cultural dimensions of exclusion are palpable in the difference between the cosmopolitan coast and the largely indigenous rural population. The Andes are the home to descendents of the once mighty Incan civilization, whose political and economic influence stretched through the Americas. Rural populations preserve Incan legacies with Aymara and Quechua as their primary means of communication. Spanish is generally spoken as a second language. The patterns of exclusion that tend to result fall especially heavily on poor, rural women. Approximately 30 per cent of the rural population speaks no functional Spanish at all, and of those who speak Spanish as a second language, 72 per cent are poor and 55 per cent are concentrated in the five southern Andean regions. National illiteracy stands at 12 per cent but climbs to 30 per cent in rural areas, with women making up 64 per cent of the total illiterate population (DFID, ONPE 2003).

Traditional customs are maintained in speech, dress, and patterns of communal organisation. Frequently, efforts to sustain customary practices conflict with attempts by cosmopolitan elites to unify the national market, establish a territorially-dominant bureaucracy, and integrate with the global economy.¹ Repeated confrontation has resulted in a national culture that both idealises the historic Incan civilization and systematically denigrates the traditions of the current indigenous population. Tourist agents promote the eerie beauty of Machu Pichu and the floating communities of Lake Titicaca, while poles of national development remain concentrated on the coast.

One expression of cultural exclusion can be found in a rigid social hierarchy. Elite cultural status is enjoyed by the urbanised, white and *mestizo* (“*misti*”) population, while indigenous groups, women, and anyone outside urban concentrations suffer at the bottom. At the bottom of the bottom, peasant families scantily survive in scattered rural villages and towns, and poor, rural women suffer the worst.

For the poor, the impact of these patterns of cultural exclusion is evident in limited social capital and cultural empowerment. Machismo, racism, and urban bias creep into everything from speech patterns to public policy. Indigenous groups frequently possess rich, communal traditions and thick, community ties, but these social capital resources cannot be mobilised to exert influence in the metropolis or to promote broader development. Absentee landowners and other higher status elites often prevail over local elections, disputes, and decisions. Similarly, language differences exclude indigenous populations from

¹ Recently, the target has been coca cultivation, which is a central symbol to many indigenous communal activities as well as a livelihood for many rural residents. National attempts to comply with international standards and eliminate black market trade in cocaine have once again placed nation-building and indigenous culture in conflict.

participation in national debates on identity and meaning. As a result, indigenous culture and history have remained peripheral to the national myth, and indigenous people are excluded from participation in local and national development agendas.

3.3 Political exclusion

Overt and covert violence have been a relative constant in the countryside, leaving behind a political vacuum in which political skills are scarce and formal institutions are weak and biased. Some of the most significant political changes occurred under the military regime that lasted until 1976. In the countryside, the military attempted a land reform that shifted rural surplus to urban, industrial sectors and in the process displaced rural elites (Stepan 1978). Most moved to Lima or provincial capitals and left behind municipalities that were largely ignored by the rest of the country. When the military ceded to elected leaders, these forgotten Andean zones remained temporarily hidden. For a brief moment, pro-poor, indigenous, and rural forces could coalesce in places like Puno and Cusco behind groups such as the United Left Front.

It was not long before these popular movements got caught between two forces. From one side, provincial elites responded with their own organising efforts, and the traditional Centre-Left party, APRA, coopted many popular leaders. From another flank, Sendero Luminoso and other insurgent groups made outright physical attacks on popular groups they perceived as rivals for support. As the guerrilla war escalated, and the confrontation grew more violent, guerrilla forces and an increasingly authoritarian state each employed rival patterns of repression that squeezed progressive alternatives.

The result in the 1990s was that political society had all but disappeared from the Andean highlands. President Fujimori swept to power as a self-styled independent reformer in 1990, defeated the guerrillas, tamed hyperinflation, and assumed a free hand to govern the country. He consolidated autonomous control by closing parliament, persecuting political parties, and staging theatrical populist distributive programmes to create a direct link between his presidency and a base of support (Levitsky 1999; Roberts 1995). These practices demobilised organised political movements and made rural communities even more dependent on central government largesse.

When Fujimori's increasingly rigid and exclusionary regime collapsed in 2000, he left behind a national political elite and civil society that was fragmented and weak and a countryside that was virtually devoid of autonomous political institutions. Political institutions were both weak and inaccessible to the poor. Despite the national transition to democracy, traditional elites found it easy to recapture control, especially at the regional level (Diez Hurtado 2003: 84–6).

Links between the centre and local levels remain weak. The centre continues to dominate the countryside and make use of transfers as political currency. Though transfers are no longer under the sole

control of the Presidency, political networks creep into decision processes.² There are few other mechanisms for communication between the countryside and the centre. The state and civil society developed only destructive capacity to find and attack opposition, demobilise social movements, and distribute meaningless patronage. Parties did not build links to the countryside, nor did bureaucratic rules and technical standards incorporate local demands.³

Political skills in the countryside are also scarce. The violence of the 1980s and 1990s destroyed political leadership, ripped apart civil society, and damaged what limited infrastructure existed. 'A lasting consequence of this cruel internal war is the increased impoverishment of the area. Due to the massive loss of livestock, destruction of infrastructure and housing, forced migration, the peasant's economies are now more vulnerable and dependent from external income sources, peasant communities more divided than ever, their internal organisations weakened and the people's trust in institutions essentially annulled' (Francke 2003: 2).

These multiple dimensions of exclusion in the countryside demand a response. Two have predominated: clientelism and rights-based approaches (RBA). These two responses address the multiple and interrelated dimensions of poverty with coherent and consistent solutions. In theory, their principles and the strategies they imply are polar opposites. Clientelism resolves exclusions in a short-term fashion that exacerbates poverty and inequality in the long-run. RBA offers the hope of real advance and escape from poverty. In practice, however, clientelist elements have been surprisingly resilient where RBA has been introduced. Before examining several specific experiences, a brief discussion of clientelism and RBA follows.

4 Responses to poverty: clientelist networks

The principles of clientelism guide a series of responses to poverty. Despite obvious shortcomings, clientelist practices are typical in poor, rural parts of Latin America ignored by ineffectual states. In the vacuum of formal authority, elite patrons maintain clientelist networks and are extremely difficult to dislodge. James Scott describes clientelism in terms of the asymmetric material and moral ties that exist between two actors. Those at the top of clientelist networks, patrons systematically exclude those at the bottom, their clients. 'The patron-client relationship – an exchange relationship between roles – may be defined as a special case of dyadic (two-person) ties involving a largely instrumental friendship in which an individual of higher socioeconomic status (patron) uses his own influence and resources to provide

² They have to qualify to receive the funds on the basis of capacity and training. Of 498 applications to obtain the guaranteed funds, 241 were processed in 2003. At regional level, 67 were approved out of 198 applications. Useful comments were provided by Martin Soto, an ex-advisor to the Decentralisation Committee and currently a technocrat in the Women's and Development Ministry.

³ In several of the communities studied, these political realities were directly felt. In Haqira in Apurimac, Sendero Luminoso guerrillas had killed two municipal workers in 1995. In Puno, government-organised civil defense patrols had been associated with numerous violations of human rights and one documented atrocity in which a young woman was raped.

protection and benefits, or both, for a person of lower status (client) who, for his part, reciprocates by offering general support and assistance, including personal services, to the patron' (Scott 1977: 126–7).

Political anthropologists, sociologists, and political scientists have long been interested in clientelist practices. As the citation above indicates, these relationships generally involve unequal exchanges of personal and material favours between a patron and a client. Clients depend on patrons for necessities, such as land, work, or access to basic services, and patrons cultivate this dependence by tying benefits, to the extent possible, to obedience. These relationships are variable and diverse, and they have been found in both urban and rural settings (Gay 1994). For our purposes, the fundamental characteristics of clientelism can be understood in terms of a unique response to poverty in the form of patron-client networks. These networks thrive precisely because they address multidimensional aspects of poverty.

4.1 Clientelism and economic exclusion

Patronage networks manage questions of resource scarcity through a series of reciprocal relationships of tribute and favour. A typical pattern is for a pyramid of clientelist relations to manage resources across multiple levels. At the local level, villages and families of clients are dependent on a neighbouring notable or political broker. These patrons, in turn, depend on higher level regional bosses or authorities who patch together various local units. The pyramid continues upwards, with patronage resources flowing downwards in exchange for loyalty, power, and surplus.

In patronage networks, the basis of material relationships is particularist; fitting a pattern of allocation and distribution in which patrons offer particular, specific and divisible benefits to clients. These material benefits might include a road, a job, or even a meal. The key is that they are offered in a well-understood, direct exchange only to those within the patron-client network. Personal favour arbitrates who gets what, and distribution is strategically applied to maintain the dependence of clients on their patron (Erie 1988).

Patrons require sufficient resources to sustain this network of exchange. Frequently, they secure resources from other patrons or external actors, such as higher levels of government. As long as patrons keep a few crumbs flowing downwards, they can pocket the rest while skimming surplus from their clients. To control the costs of the network, patrons limit the number and kinds of claims made by clients.

4.2 Clientelism and cultural exclusion

Clientelist networks also address social dimensions of poverty by offering poor clients a system of meanings and symbols to organise their daily life and to define legitimate forms of behaviour. Patrons establish and reinforce these values through the exchange of gifts and favours, often in elaborate cultural rituals that reinforce multi-stranded moral ties with clients.

One example is the *compadrazgo* system of fictitious family ties in which the patron takes on a rhetorical, religious, and communal role as head of a family of clients. The patron thus assumes moral and religious leadership of the family. At key rites of passage, patrons will be present to legitimise births,

marriages, and deaths. In the public arena, patrons engage in acts of material and moral theatre, staging activities and festivals to remind a community of clients that their identities and cultural network depend on the superior status of their patron.

Skilful patrons aggregate these personal relationships into appeals that tie entire population groups together in a network of personalistic loyalties. Meaning and identities of networks tie all members together on the basis of their relation to a single pyramid of patrons. The resulting social cohesion can provide the foundation for widespread ethnic, regional, and ascriptive identification. To the outsider, it is surprising that status hierarchies of this kind can be so powerful; the clients at the bottom suffer the worst patterns of social exclusion. Still, clients offer their fealty in exchange for the access to the material resources and social cohesion provided by membership.

4.3 Clientelism and political exclusion

The mobilising power of clientelist networks is frequently wrapped into political institutions that sustain order. At precise moments, the informal institutions and networks at the disposition of both patrons and clients are mobilised into public life to stage protests, articulate demands, and win elections. During electoral campaigns, for example, patrons surface, distribute material benefits and symbolic promises, and call on their clients for support. In daily life, the material dependence of clients and the elaborate rituals associated with accepted behaviour further serve to keep clients in line.

The political order provided by clientelist practices occasionally takes a more sinister hue. It is not uncommon for patrons to invest part of their surplus in coercion. Coercion alone cannot sustain a network, but the effective deployment of force can impose a reign of fear over a large population. Fear limits demands and can be used to exclude extra clients that might create a drain on the resources of a network.

Patron-client networks can thus be seen as a less than elegant mechanism of managing poverty. Patrons benefit from the material surplus, moral support, and political authority they impose on clients. In exchange, patrons offer particularist benefits, social cohesion, and political order. To sustain the network, patrons attract additional resources or engage in coercion to control client demands.

4.4 Clientelism is resilient and adaptive

Clientelist networks notoriously endure by allaying or repressing demands for change from below while agilely adapting to the shifting currents of national politics. There are several reasons for its resilience. First, clientelist practices are internally consistent. The responses offered to multiple dimensions of poverty are integrated, mutually reinforcing, and sustainable even at the most marginal conditions. Second, clientelist networks inherently reproduce the conditions for their survival. They sustain a potentially vast number of patrons and clients by delicately balancing scarce resources among unequal partners. In its own way, clientelist practice is perversely adapted to the conditions of poverty. It offers an integrated and sustainable response to economic, social, and political exclusion.

Furthermore, clientelist networks are also adept at enduring political changes at the national level. Local bosses regularly shift their allegiances to remain in line with power brokers further up the chain, while newly elected politicians risk flaring an opposition movement by neglecting clientelist networks once in office. When a local boss is indeed removed from power, either rejected by patrons or clients, a new boss quickly assumes the empty position, maintaining the network by and large intact.

Though functional in their own fashion, clientelist practices are also inefficient, unequal, unjust, and unfair. They reproduce and exacerbate the very conditions of poverty they presume to address. Most observers criticise the obvious inequalities in the positions of patrons and clients and point to consistently inadequate outcomes. At a material level, clientelist practices are insidious. The lowest levels of patron-client networks accumulate few material resources. They are denied services except as occasional favours, they receive only minimal subsistence, and their meager surplus is wasted in the corruption of patrons. Rare opportunities to invest and develop are missed, and poverty is reproduced. In addition, clientelist networks widen relative inequality between patrons and clients.

The structure of social cohesion that patrons offer is also inadequate. Loyalties between clients and patrons legitimise status difference and create a pecking order of rights and responsibilities. Client rights are limited, while the moral requirements of obedience further restrict client agency. In particular, clients are limited in the kinds of demands they can make and in their ability to create horizontal associations outside their vertical ties to patrons (Moynihan and Glazer 1964).

Finally, patrons create a style of political order that is exclusionary, hierarchical, and occasionally coercive. Clients far outnumber patrons, yet their ability to organise, articulate their interests, and gain voice is severely limited. They are only mobilised when it serves to advance the interests of the patron; otherwise they are held in check through demobilisation or force.

It should be noted that clients are not wholly without power within patronage networks. In fact, many studies have demonstrated that clients are skilful at playing patrons against each other, bargaining to obtain improved terms of exchange, and dissembling or foot-dragging to lower their obligations (Scott 1985). Though they are at a serious disadvantage, clients find mechanisms of survival and constantly negotiate their position within relations to patrons.

For clientelist practices to disappear, an alternative source of material resources, cultural practices, and political institutions must emerge. Strategies guided by the principles of RBA advance such an alternative.

5 Responses to poverty: Rights-based Approaches (RBAs)

There have been many attempts to define varied manifestations of RBA, though the core of the approach remains relatively intact.⁴ “This broad approach emphasises the relevance of the whole array of human

⁴ More information on rights-based approaches can be found on Development Resource Centre on Citizenship, Participation and Accountability authored pages on ‘Participation.net: Information for Change’ website, www.pnet.ids.ac.uk, 2004).

rights in development processes. These encompass firstly, the civil and political rights including the right to participation, the right to freedom, the right to self-determination and the right to equality. Secondly, the social, cultural and economic rights such as the right to health, the right to food and the right to livelihood. Thirdly, the so-called solidarity rights in terms of the right to development and the right to environment' (Hellum 2001).

RBA is characterised both by a desired outcome (achieving all rights for all people) and a set of practices (empowering participation). The approach shares theoretical elements with Amartya Sen's capabilities model, in which capabilities are the set of functions individuals can attain. Every development effort, Sen suggests, ought to be directed towards expanding individual freedoms to pursue full functions (Sen 1999). The principles of RBA expand this notion of individual capabilities to the social and communal level by including two additional components. First, the RBA makes explicit not only individual freedoms, but collectively defined rights such as gender rights and environmental rights. Second, the RBA includes an explicit set of responsibilities on the part of collective bodies, especially public authorities.

The principles of RBA thus offer a justification and a mechanism by which poor people can articulate and advance demands. They can directly confront poverty as a denial of capabilities and call on states to address the fundamental violation of rights inherent in poverty. RBA principles imply a web of responsibilities and rights that tie individuals to states in mutually accountable relationships (Eyben 2003). These relationships establish a series of rights and entitlements as elements of citizenship. This contrasts directly with clientelism that denies a collective notion of citizenship and manipulates relationships into modes of particularist exchange and power between patron and client (Cornwall and Gaventa 2000).

The application of RBA principles offers a set of internally consistent responses to the multiple dimensions of poverty in way that is strikingly different from clientelist networks. Clientelist networks address economic, social, and political exclusion in an internally consistent, but fundamentally flawed fashion that perpetuates poverty and exacerbates inequality. RBA-guided strategies, by contrast, offer a response that potentially offers an escape from poverty and inequality.

5.1 RBA and economic exclusion

To address economic dimensions of poverty, the RBA practices prioritise the needs of the poor. At its most limited level, this simply calls for efforts to mitigate the negative consequences of certain policies. The World Bank interpretation of RBA principles, for example, means lending policies that ask, 'how those programmes are implemented and what measures are taken to ensure that the needs of the poor are not neglected' (Gaeta and Vasilera 1998: 3).

RBA-guided strategies seek to redistribute private goods to guarantee at least a minimal level well-being for all. A hungry, homeless or illiterate person will not be able to demand rights and is unlikely to be capable of meaningful participation (Eyben 2003; Mungoven 2003). To participate, they require access to

basic economic rights to meet survival needs (Hughes *et al.* 2004). In practice, RBA-guided strategies set a minimum bound for economic well-being at the level required for active participation; actors have to be materially secure enough to demand and exercise rights to participation (Cornwall 2002).

RBAs also imply an upper bound on inequality (Gaventa and Valderrama 1999). Vast inequalities deny access to those who are economically excluded and silence their voices. This is not to say that RBA-guided strategies pursue total equality. The amount of inequality will depend on the context and the ability of participatory processes to accommodate different capabilities. Still, RBAs call for a more equitable distribution.

In the case of public goods, RBA-guided strategies also offer an alternative pattern of allocation and distribution. RBAs stipulate the provision of public goods on a universalistic basis. Universalism means that all citizens have a right to education, health, and other basic services as entitlements to citizenship. As a citizenship right, public goods become the responsibility of authorities to provide, and because all citizens have equal claims to these goods, they cannot be provided in a discriminatory manner. Individuals cannot be excluded simply because they are a member of one group or another.

In addition, RBA-guided strategies must also deal with the challenge of insufficient resources. To secure extra resources, RBAs involve several strategies. First, they mobilise resources that would otherwise lay dormant. By offering more equitable and pro-poor allocation and distribution, RBAs secure cooperative efforts on the part of poor citizens. Their material resources are limited, but participatory methods can discover alternative patterns of provision that take advantage of local knowledge and practices and are not as dependent on external support.

The poor are likely supporters of these movements, but they cannot always self-provide all the services they will need. Occasionally, they will need resources from allies, and the most viable coalition is with middle sectors. Middle sectors possess resources and, more importantly, they are also potential allies in struggles against particularism, corruption, and inefficiency. These issues form the basis of a middle sector alliance with the poor, and can encourage middle sectors to offer some of the external resources needed to provide public goods to all citizens.

5.2 RBA and cultural exclusion

At the heart of RBA-guided responses to cultural exclusion is the norm of rights. Rights eschew discriminatory status differences and categories such as patron and client. In their place, RBAs introduce citizenship as a universal and equal status. The definition of citizen is taken from internationally accepted legal codes and treaties which do not allow for distinctions such as race, ethnicity, religion, or gender. Such group membership cannot be used as a basis to treat individuals differently or exclude them from citizenship.

As equal citizens, all individuals are entitled to make claims and enjoy full and equal access to public life. For this to occur, individuals require a basic level of cultural dignity and capacity. Just as people

without material resources cannot be expected to participate, neither can people without cultural resources. RBAs seek to build cultural resources through a transformative process that shapes individuals, authorities, and the relationships between them.

With respect to individual transformation, RBAs emphasise action. Direct civic engagement allows people to gain information, express demands, and hold authority accountable. In the process, they become agents, rather than objects, of their own development (Cornwall and Gaventa 2000; Eyben 2003; Cornwall and Gaventa 2001). This agency has a transformative and consciousness-raising impact. According to Pateman (1980), the opportunity and act of participation constructs and builds more self-aware citizens by altering and enhancing their consciousness. People become more aware of their own rights, more socially conscious about the rights of others, and more educated about their corresponding responsibilities to participate in public processes (Eyben 2003). DFID, for example, incorporates these insights into their poverty reduction strategies, asserting that the International Development Targets cannot be attained without the engagement of poor people in the development processes that affect their lives in ways that empower them to take their own decisions (DFID 2000: 7).

Active engagement also helps to resolve some ambiguities about the definition of rights. Debate continues about which rights are fundamental and international, and which are specific to local circumstances. RBAs allow a negotiation between universally defined rights and local understandings of what these mean by letting local actors offer their own subjective visions. According to Nyamu (2000), RBA 'provide a departure point for thinking in a balanced way about "situated citizenship". While we pay attention to the particular, we should not lose site of "across the board" notions of citizenship and how the mutual interactions between these notions of citizenship enables or constrains agency (p. 26).⁵

RBAs also change the nature of links between citizens and authorities. Individuals cease being beneficiaries/clients and become citizens claiming entitlements (Cornwall and Gaventa 2000). Such a shift implies a reciprocal set of obligations for which groups and authorities are accountable. These are enforced through multiple lines of accountability between state and citizen and among citizens (Eyben 2003).

At some level, accountability also requires a cultural transformation of those in authority. They must be aware of their responsibilities and develop technical and communication strategies to respond to individual claims. In addition, they have to give up their arbitrary power over who is included and who is excluded from public activity and benefits.

⁵ This concept is drawn from the work of Nyamu (2001), and refers to 'an understanding of human rights needs and priorities that is informed by the concrete experiences of the particular actors involved in and who stand to gain directly from the struggles in question' (p. 1).

5.3 RBA and political exclusion

The RBA-guided response to political exclusion also depends on a mobilised and empowered civil society. To achieve this, RBAs offer a set of institutions that can govern daily life and in which there are equal rights of access. Citizens as claimants are brought into public spaces and empowered to demand further rights and hold authorities to account.

A few words about accountability are relevant because it is so central to the RBA-guided response to political exclusion. Recent literature on the subject discusses several elements of functioning accountability. Schedler (1999) identifies information, justification, and enforcement. “Information” refers to the need for authorities to inform about their actions and decisions. “Justification” requires not only information, but also presentation of the reasons that justify a course of action. Finally, “enforcement” calls for authorities to be punished if their actions are considered to be insufficiently responsive.

To advance accountability in conditions of political exclusion, RBAs seek to establish a new institutional architecture. This has been recognised by the World Bank “good governance” agenda that is designed ‘to fight corruption, improve transparency and accountability in governance, strengthen judicial systems, and modernise financial sectors’ (Gaeta and Vasileria 1998: 3). DFID also underscores the importance of strengthening institutions, ‘Democratic institutions, including fair national electoral systems, effectively functioning parliaments and local government organisations are necessary to enable people to participate in the decisions which affect their lives’ (2000).

In conditions of political exclusion, institutions are absent or weak. Powerful individuals and groups face few constraints since they can manipulate or circumvent rules. As a way to constrain the actions of those with political resources as well as to empower those who lack them, RBAs offer participatory institutions.

This has several impacts. First, participatory methods offer access and voice to previously excluded groups. This means they can negotiate the terms of citizenship and deal with thorny issues surrounding competing rights to come up with acceptable and equitable definitions of rights. International and universalistic practices provide the background to this negotiation, and local specificities and understandings define the terms (Hughes *et al.* 2004).

This is not to say that conflict is absent from participatory institutions. In fact, structuring conflict is one of the key contributions of participatory institutions. Such institutions can be structured to privilege the participation of excluded groups. Where women are traditionally excluded, as in India, spaces can be reserved for them. Where indigenous citizens are excluded, meetings may be held in local languages, traditional dress allowed, and documents printed in indigenous languages. The impact of these institutional adjustments, sometimes minor, enhances the ability of excluded groups to participate.

In addition to increasing access, well-designed participatory institutions increase the voice of excluded groups. DFID asserts that international development targets require engaging and empowering poor people to take their own decisions (2000, p. 7). To make this possible, RBAs emphasise increasing consciousness and skills to exercise voice. These political resources are scarce and they require a shift in the practices and the repertoires of the poor.

Even with a shift in the political resources of poor citizens, alliances with external actors are crucial to political success. To protect themselves against elite interests and assert their rights, poor citizens need additional leadership and organisation. RBAs help secure these political resources by importing them in alliances with middle sectors. Middle sectors possess the leadership, organisations, and material resources to gain access to political spaces.

There are several keys to a cross-class coalition between middle sectors and the poor. At an ethical level, both sectors tend to be attracted by the transparency, accountability and universal rights that underlie participatory institutions. Middle sectors are also attracted by the potential of forming a larger group, especially in developing country contexts where middle sectors are thin. Poor groups are attracted by the potential resources and skills offered by middle sectors. This combination makes RBAs particularly powerful as ways of mobilising political energy, power, and resources (Tomasevski 2000).

5.4 RBA establishes a new social order

The impact of RBA-guided interventions is a fundamental advance from the multiple exclusions of poverty. In terms of economic exclusions, RBAs offer a pro-poor and universalist approach. First, RBAs secure necessary material resources for poor citizens by encouraging them to cooperate to provide services and secure resources on the basis of universal rights. Second, RBAs allocate resources towards pro-poor uses to ensure that poor citizens have their basic needs and services satisfied. Third, RBAs distribute on a non-discriminatory, universalist basis, in which all citizens are entitled to resources as opposed to being dependent on the beneficence of those in power. Finally, RBAs work to oppose inequality that would make it impossible for citizens to participate on an equal footing.

To combat cultural exclusion, RBAs offer an alternative set of moral and cultural tenets. The approach is guided by basic principles of equality and democracy and it follows international standards for measuring and evaluating citizenship. RBAs also work towards the transformation of individual and group culture by engaging citizens in participatory activities that empower them to assert and define their own identities. In the process, RBAs build social capital with which poor people can marshal social networks and resources. In addition, the guiding principles of RBA offer a moral basis to introduce explicit efforts to privilege the rights of the poor, weak, and excluded over the rich, powerful, and included (Sider 2003).

Finally, RBAs offer a set of governance institutions that can be secured without relying on coercion and exclusion. Political institutions guided by the RBA sustain order and legitimacy by creating accountable authorities. The principle institutional innovation that makes this possible is the application of participatory methods. Designed strategically, participatory institutions incorporate previously excluded groups and empower them with new consciousness, skills and organisation. Also, participatory institutions secure additional political resources by encouraging alliances with middle sectors.

The impact of RBA-guided interventions on poverty reduction is potentially significant. Guided by universal norms and rights, RBAs expand the capabilities of the poor on economic, cultural, and political dimensions. RBA-guided strategies on each dimension occur in mutually reinforcing and collectively

progressive patterns. In short, RBAs respond to poverty and sow the seeds of a different social order. This fundamentally differs from clientelist responses to poverty in which internally consistent responses reproduce poverty and inequality.

Box 5.1 Responding to poverty		
Challenges	Clientelism	Rights-Based Approaches
Economic exclusion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extract surplus from clients • Provide services on the basis of particularist exchange • Secure resources through wider patronage networks 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Secure material resources through cross-class and alliances • Distribute material benefits to the poor • Strengthen or create participatory mechanisms that resolve conflict and structure decisions in favour of poor citizens
Cultural exclusion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hierarchy of patrons and clients • Deny legitimacy of client identity and customs • Establish relationships on the basis of particularism and exchange 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recognise the equality of citizens • Empower those who are culturally excluded to apply and interpret international norms about human rights • Establish relationships on the basis of universal entitlements
Political exclusion	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide order through obedience and material benefits • Organise political networks of powerful elite patrons and dependent clients • Exclude potentially disruptive claimants, using force if necessary 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build accountable relationships between citizens and authorities • Strengthen or create participatory institutions to deliberate and make decisions • Structure participatory mechanisms to privilege the poor and form alliances with middle sectors

6 Opportunities for RBA-guided responses

Experiments with RBA-guided interventions and clientelist networks have recently found a laboratory in Peru. By 2000, Fujimori’s regime had deteriorated. Democratic impulses emerged, and political spaces opened. The broad movement for democratisation included an explicit focus on decentralisation and, in the process, created room at the local level for experimentation. Before describing RBA and its impact in Peru, it makes sense to look closely at the local architecture on which RBA would be laid.

Some of the changes occurred at the regional level. Previously, Peru’s 24 regions had been administered by deconcentrated extensions of the central bureaucracy. After the decline of Fujimori’s regime, regional presidents were directly elected again for the first time since 1990. Each region is subdivided into provinces, with provinces further divided into districts with another set of elected leaders.

The structure of province governance is loosely comparable to a hub and spokes in which several districts surround the head of the province, the district head. In the Andes, the districts are generally rural and contain populations that range from a few hundred to several thousand. The provincial head is a slightly more urban centre with a larger budget, some additional responsibilities, and a mayor elected with

votes from all districts in the province. As part of national reconciliation efforts, electoral rules for legislative bodies in the district head and the districts divide council seats according to a formula that gives half the seats plus one to the slate of the winning party, guaranteeing the mayor a majority in the legislature.

In terms of revenues, the only reliable funding at the local level is central government revenue sharing. Municipalities can tax buildings, services, circulation, beer and tolls, but realistically they have little capacity to collect. Transfers to local governments were meant to be approximately 4 per cent of the national budget for 2004. Though they are scheduled to increase that portion to 7 per cent next year and 12 per cent by 2006, local authorities remain sceptical that such increases will materialise. To achieve the targeted percentages, central government transfers include 2 per cent of the national sales tax in a block grant that varies with the number of electors (labeled FONCOMUN).⁶ In addition, earmarked grants are transferred for infrastructure projects (FONCODES) and social programmes (PRONA).

A number of endogenous changes also are underway. Local actors are attempting to develop newly discovered, autonomous social networks. Family and social networks of migrants link Lima to the countryside. Migrants send resources home that offer an income to rural families, and many return to their villages and towns with enhanced status, skills, and potential influence. They also influence national politics. As a growing constituency in regional cities and the national capital, these migrants provide an important pressure on urban elites, bureaucrats, and representatives. The countryside can no longer be ignored and, as a result of several factors, plays an increasingly important role.

One factor that has raised the profile of the countryside is new electoral legislation that has shifted power to the countryside. Formerly, legislators were elected in national elections that favoured urban constituents. Under the new law, legislative seats are allocated by districts, with two-thirds going to regional districts and one-third going to Lima. As a result, numerous ex-mayors from rural districts have now risen to national legislative prominence. They maintain links to their home regions and have played a role in ensuring that a portion of national revenues and power are shared outwards. Greater integration of the countryside and greater attention to rural poverty have created an opportunity to introduce a response to poverty. UK's DFID has used this opportunity to implement projects guided by RBA.

7 RBA-guided responses in Peru

To respond to rural conditions and to take advantage of new opportunities, UK's DFID sought to provide assistance to the 2002 local and regional elections. A 10 month project gathered over 20 organisational partners into a series of initiatives labeled "El Gol". El Gol rapidly evolved beyond traditional election monitoring, observation, and civic education. An ambitious RBA-guided programme targeted the five Southern Andean regions of Apurímac, Ayacucho, Cusco, Huancavelica, and Puno. For

⁶ Several mayors complained about the size of their transfer. The number of electors, they claimed was often distorted by fraud, and certainly inaccurate as a result of high levels of migration. In particular, more urban municipalities faced high levels of in-migration that were not counted in distributing transfers.

the sake of presentation, the current analysis divides these interventions in terms of their institutional and geographic target (regional civil society, regional authorities, local civil society, local authorities), though they were implemented as an integrated and comprehensive response to multiple exclusions. Some of the details of the partners and programmes can be found in Appendices III and IV.

7.1 Regional civil society

Rights-based interventions sought to repair civil society by promoting accountability and participation. One set of interventions focused on a bottom-up strategy of building social capital and political organisation. El Gol partners encouraged collaborative efforts by mayors who represented pro-poor interests and helped them form associations that could pressure regional governments. Regional meetings of mayors were held, and these were articulated upwards towards a national meeting of rural mayors that gathered municipal representatives from 83 districts in several regions.

7.2 Regional authorities

In addition to pressure from below, RBA-guided interventions also focused on the links between the central government and the regions. They found ready material in semi-consultative, anti-poverty bodies, known as the Concertation Boards, that had been established by the provisional Post-Fujimori government in several regions. To make the Concertation Boards more effective, El Gol partners worked to replicate them in other regions and add explicit RBA practices.

Efforts targeted parliamentary discussion of the Organic Law of Regions which sets electoral rules, fiscal power, and spending responsibilities for the regions. To ensure a more rights-based framework, Lima partners engaged in a lobbying and public information campaign. The result was the establishment of consultative regional bodies, the Regional Coordinating Councils (CCR). These councils include regional and local government representatives and guarantee 40 per cent of the Council's membership to civil society organisations. The CCRs operate through consensus decision-making and are given consultation and oversight functions in fiscal and development plans for the region. In addition, the law now guarantees preferential treatment for the poorer regions in the distribution of funds and the allocation of responsibilities. The law also includes a stipulation/provision to strengthen political links across regions by requiring that parties have at least 50 activists in 70 per cent of the provinces or two thirds of the regions.⁷

7.3 Local civil society

El Gol also followed RBAs to transform local civil society with a special focus on the local media. Journalists in rural Peru typically lack skills; many are poor and have only a basic education. *Calandria*, a Lima-based NGO, supported journalists throughout the election campaign. They formed partnerships

⁷ Interview with Congressman Walter Alejos, member of the Committee on Regionalisation and Decentralisation.

with local NGOs and other actors to distribute election materials in local languages and offered training to assess electoral promises and development plans. Subsequent to the elections, journalists were trained to monitor and expose corrupt practices.

Additional training offered RBA-guided skills to local activists and civil society leaders. For example, El Gol partners trained local activists to act as accountability trainers, replicating the training in various communities. The result was a network of activists with the skills to monitor and oversee government activities and a shared experience of training and contact.

7.4 Local authorities

The new electoral rules of 2002 also opened opportunities that RBA interventions could use to strengthen local authorities. Electoral regulations now stipulate that party lists include women. To ensure that women stand for office, get elected, and exercise their voice, El Gol partners trained women candidates and civil society activists to organise and mobilise around gender issues and to demand that women were not put at the bottom of party lists but were included high enough to ensure representation.

Electoral rules also altered the political calculus of mayors with respect to rural constituents. Districts not dominated by a mayor's voters were traditionally ignored by mayors of the head district in a province. These mayors are now elected by voters in all the districts of a province. To get elected, mayors now have to balance their appeals by seeking allies from diverse districts and status groups. This means placing candidates from different constituencies on their ticket as well as directing spending towards different districts once in office.

El Gol interventions also sought to establish more accountable electioneering. Instead of corrupt campaigning and vote buying, education workshops with candidates prior to the elections gave anti-corruption training and programmatic appeals. Candidates were invited to hold public debates in the town centre where they presented a platform and signed a governance agreement to honor campaign promises and respect the outcome of the vote. In two provinces in Cusco, candidates promised to incorporate their platforms into budgetary allocations once elected.

Once in office, local officials were trained in participatory budgeting. Participatory institutions allowed citizens to vote on spending priorities, and local authorities were trained to incorporate these demands and implement them within the budget process. In one Ayacucho province, over 275 participants contributed requests to the budget. In one Cusco province, citizens were organised into vigilance committees to oversee budget implementation. In Carabaya province, elected officials used participatory town meetings to design a new budget for their first year in office. Rather than spending on visible urban projects (i.e., repaving the plaza), the new authorities sought to redirect resources towards social programmes for rural communities. When this did not immediately occur, they restructured participatory institutions in subsequent years to give greater access and voice to the most rural and poor citizens of the province.

El Gol partners also introduced RBA into the core of local institutions. Just as the national Congress debated the Organic Law of Regions, it also discussed a similarly named law for the Municipalities. El Gol

partners participated in this debate to bring greater rights to the residents of rural districts. One contribution was to create a permanent participatory component similar to the Regional Coordination Councils. At the local level, Local Coordination Councils (CCL) include the mayor, council-people, and 40 per cent civil society representation. The CCLs operate through consensus and produce a development plan and a participatory budget that are communicated to the municipal council. Finally, El Gol's lobbying stressed the specific needs of rural municipalities, which had traditionally administered only the most basic services such as licenses and certificates. El Gol partners backed several decrees that give special preference to rural areas in flexible administrative arrangements, a link between national mining taxes and district revenues, and a development plan specifically for rural districts.

El Gol also backed efforts by provincial leaders to form horizontal associations of equals as opposed to vertical associations between patrons and client. In the Huancavelica and Cusco regions, municipalities are joined by topographical coincidence. They have to overcome multiple factors that militate against cooperation such as differing regional authorities, altitudes at or above 3,000 meters, high rates of poverty, and dispersed populations. Still, several municipalities found themselves linked by geography, specifically by a river that began in snow-topped peaks and sliced through each province. This shared resource gave them an automatic mechanism to coordinate and cooperate. Downstream municipalities tend to enjoy slightly better land and conditions, but they depend on upstream municipalities to not overuse the river for irrigation or pollute the waters. Mayors from the different municipalities sought coordinating mechanisms to govern river water, and this cooperation spilled over into shared administrative capacity to pursue inter-jurisdiction infrastructure such as roads. The San Antonio River Association (AMSAT) provides one example of such an organisation, and another was developing at the time around the River Cusco. Other organisations that operate around shared topographic or geographic characteristics are ANMIN (the Association of Municipalities Affected by Mining) and an association of coastal municipalities that replaced an organisation Fujimori founded during his regime.⁸

Political leadership by individual mayors provided an additional input to collaboration among local units. This leadership was partly charismatic as certain mayors enjoyed the respect of their fellows. In general, such mayors had a political history and had attained office in the provincial head. For example, Michel Portier, the mayor of Macusani and provincial head of Carabaya in Puno, a French naturalised Peruvian, had spent years working with the pro-poor Catholic Church and running a radio show in the highlands. His following was related to the notoriety he commanded as a result of radio fame, while his outsider status and years of experience in pro-poor movements gave him legitimacy in the eyes of voters sick of corrupt patrons linked to the Fujimori regime.

Portier, like other savvy district leaders, did not rely only on the appeal of charisma. Taking advantage of the extra funding he received as provincial head, he purchased support among the mayors in the districts that fell within Carabaya province. He promised to share 100 thousand soles (approximately

⁸ The Mayor of Anta explained the role of water in driving cooperation, 'The river is our life. It provides water to irrigate, drink, and build. But it comes from uphill polluted, and we pass it along even more polluted. To clean will cost \$500,000, which is beyond what any of us alone could afford.'

30 thousand dollars) with each of the mayors that agreed to implement a participatory decision-making process in their districts and he sent a technical advisor from his staff to help put the process in place. He also used his administrative staff to assist district-member municipalities to meet the qualification requirements for receiving social programme transfers from the central government.

Another key strategy consistent with the RBA can be found in the link created between urban, middle sectors and poor rural alliances. Most of the El Gol partner institutions were staffed by educated professionals from Lima and provincial capitals. They were drawn to the RBA ethic of El Gol projects and were eager to extend RBA practices to rural districts. Congressman Ernesto Herrera, who had been mayor of a rural district head, recognised the potential of RBA as a basis for cross-class coalition; 'Participation encourages public mindedness among the citizens. Those with some wealth can see what the poor want, and they can accept dividing the resources because decisions are made openly and in a participatory way'.

Institutional rules are the key to secure middle sector compliance while at the same time guaranteeing entitlements to poor citizens. In Santo Tomás district in Cusco, local middle sectors were afraid to invest because the town was constantly torn by violence between urban and rural factions. Now, participatory planning offers a way to settle differences by using explicitly pro-poor criteria that guide decision-making. Under the established formula, projects receive more resources if they (1) create work, (2) reach many beneficiaries, and (3) reach places where public works did not already exist. The result is that public investment targets poor neighbourhoods and rural communities while minimising the ability of the elite to arbitrarily challenge budget priorities.

8 The hybrid nature of governance

The impact of these rights-based interventions has been remarkable given the short time-period in which they were enacted. In only ten months before elections and a year subsequently, RBA-guided responses to poverty have transformed civil society and local and regional authorities. In a structured comparison of districts, political elites in districts that had received El Gol projects favoured long-term development and participatory approaches over short-term and material handouts (see Appendix V).

Still, a close look at the impact of the programmes shows that clientelist patterns remain. The result has been a hybrid pattern of governance that mixes elements of RBA with elements of clientelism. Three hybrid patterns will be addressed below.

8.1 RBA watered down by clientelism

The first indication of a governance hybrid is that RBA-guided efforts have been watered down by resilient clientelism. RBA-guided efforts may push for social change, but they can be reversed or attenuated by clientelist networks and behaviours. In this circumstance, the challenge is to continue pushing forward with RBAs to overcome clientelist obstacles.

One of the clearest examples of this dilution was observed in gender relations. Electoral rules consistent with RBA enhance the voice and access of women by mandating women candidates on party lists. In one Cusco community, a councilwoman used her position to uncover a corruption scandal. ‘Once, a distributor from the PRONA glass of milk programme bought the previous mayor off during the town anniversary. The distributor paid 20,000 soles to get the milk contract. Then, the mayor used the soles to buy beer and sell it at a profit during the anniversary.’ Her ability to expose corruption in prior administrations has only been possible because of RBA-guided changes that both empowered women and placed a priority on accountability.

Still, empowerment of women candidates has been tempered somewhat by persistent clientelist practices. A comment from a mayor of a Puno district in front of the entire council is typical of the way new women legislators are viewed and treated; ‘If there were no law requiring us to get women onto our lists, we wouldn’t bother.’ Because women are elected on the same party-list as the mayor, they are both guaranteed access but tied to the coattails of the mayor. As a result, all legislators, including the women, remain clients that are dependent on the mayors.

A second example of clientelist practices reversing RBA-guided advances could be observed in the campaigns. El Gol events brought district candidates together to present their platforms and sign a set of governance promises. These events sought to introduce elements of the RBA by encouraging more transparent government and universalist promises. For many of the candidates, the gatherings were opportunities to claim a bit of free publicity. Their platforms hardly differed and were not particularly developed. In many cases, traditional clientelist techniques of spreading particularist benefits remained the most successful electoral strategy. In Tambobamba, the mayor complained that his supporters had campaigned tirelessly as they had been trained, but his rival swept in and won a rural community by buying beer and holding a party the day before the election. In Colquemarca, one female council member explained how RBA pro-poor promises are mixed with clientelist patterns of particularist exchange; ‘People who come back from the city say they are the ones who bring development projects because they have connections to important people. If we want more projects, we have to give them our vote.’

8.2 RBA and rival clientelism

The second hybrid pattern is the use of RBA-guided practices by competing patronage networks. Essentially, local actors that are out of power use RBAs as a weapon to confront incumbents. Such movements can have RBA-type impacts even if they include traditional clientelist actors. The key in such circumstances is to force them to act consistently with RBA principles, even if it is insincere.

This is particularly evident at the regional level, where traditional elites have continued to dominate (Diez Hurtado 2003: 74). Traditionally, regional presidents fed their networks with transfers from the national level to pay for large intra-district infrastructure projects and emergency funds for natural disasters. These are typical clientelist devices: they are secured through external patronage networks, they

offer divisible benefits like jobs and infrastructure, and they can be channeled to obedient mayors as part of particularist exchanges for support. To counter these patterns, opposition actors have seized on RBA-guided institutions such as the CCRs.

In the CCRs, local mayors join together and argue for RBA principles such as a pro-poor distribution of resources on the basis of the shared needs of rural municipalities. To organise these efforts in Puno, the district head mayor from Macusani mentioned above took the lead and promised an equal sum to each of the districts that supported him. Their efforts have been successful, and resources have been distributed beyond the narrow networks of the regional president to the poorer, rural districts. This is consistent with RBA principles and potentially transformative for the empowered communities. On the other hand, there are few restraints in place on mayors that lead such efforts. In the case observed, he quite clearly leveraged the resources to establish patronage networks of his own. Though he appears willing to adhere to RBA principles, others might abuse similar positions.

An example of how this reversion might occur is evident in some of the movements around transparency. RBA-guided rules on corruption allowed civil society to recall public officials after the first year in office. Several regional presidents, including the president of Puno, were facing opposition movements and civil society organisations that demanded accountability. Despite firm commitment to RBA principles, these movements were occasionally captured by rival patronage networks. In one instance, a transparency movement was guided at first by a coalition of NGOs and church organisations. They uncovered evidence that a mayor in a Puno district was financing his patron-client network with funds from illicit, cross-border trade, and they initiated an aggressive media campaign. Despite their original RBA principles, the movement was eventually captured by a rival patron who funded and directed an escalating campaign for recall. Eventually, he turned the movement back towards traditional clientelist practices of coercion and intimidation. A mob attacked and lynched the mayor when he returned from a Lima meeting. In this case, RBA principles were claimed by clientelist leaders, but eventually they resorted to traditional patterns of clientelist rivalry.

8.3 RBA advanced through clientelism

Perhaps the most intriguing governance hybrid can be seen in RBA-guided efforts that use clientelist patterns of particularism and exclusion to bias decisions in a pro-poor direction. To pursue their ends, leaders committed to RBA principles can make use of clientelist networks and techniques. In this circumstance, some aspects of clientelism may be allowed to persist at least until RBA-type outcomes can be obtained on their own.

One example has been in the implementation of participatory budgeting in one district in Puno. At first, old clientelist networks held back and watered down RBA advances. Once the district mayor recognised this tendency, he sought to utilise and manipulate clientelist patterns to achieve the pro-poor outcomes he wanted. In his first year, a participatory meeting managed to shift funds from an extravagant stadium project (8,000 seats in a town of 6,000) towards more pro-poor health and education projects.

Still, skilful organisation and the dominant oratory of clientelist associations of teachers and doctors were able to target the spending towards prestigious, bulky investments (a water tank for the hospital and computers for the schools) instead of expenditures that might have more directly benefited the poor.

For the following year, El Gol partners worked with the mayor to manipulate clientelist networks in ways that would advance a more rights-based and pro-poor allocation and distribution. For 2004, 40 per cent of the budget was allocated to poor, rural districts, half to provincial head priorities, and 10 per cent to inter-district projects. In each rural community, meetings determined the allocation of the territorial funds, undermining the ability of old clientelist networks to capture resources.

By designing participatory institutions to privilege the poor, rural districts and to exclude or limit the participation of traditional networks, the mayor altered who had access and whose voices were heard. This made use of the clientelist technique of including some citizens and meeting their demands while excluding or denying the demands of others. What changed was the basis on which exclusion occurred. Benefits were tied to active involvement in the participatory institutions. Those that did not participate, either by choice or because their voices had been structured out of the political debate, did not receive the same benefits.

9 Conclusion

The preceding discussion has considered the nature of poverty and two alternative responses. Poverty is multidimensional, and any attempt to respond to poverty must have internally consistent responses to each of the dimensions. The principles of clientelism and RBA offer internally consistent responses to multiple dimensions of poverty. The crucial difference is that clientelist responses reproduce poverty while RBAs transform the social order. Rural Peru in 2002 was a fertile place for RBA-guided interventions. There was intense poverty, and a host of local and national movements were eager to experiment with new RBA alternatives. The El Gol programme funded by UK's DFID attempted to use the opportunity of local electoral assistance to infuse development efforts with RBA principles. In many respects, the results were commendable, but a curious governance hybrid appears to be emerging. Three patterns to the hybrid were observed. First, RBA principles have been watered down or reversed by resilient clientelist networks. Second, RBA principles have been manipulated by clientelist actors as a weapon to oppose incumbents. Third, at times RBA principles have been paradoxically advanced by clientelist techniques.

At a practical level, this has curious implications. Moving RBA forward should continue to be an objective of development assistance, and complex hybrid governance forms call for attention to specific local circumstances. If RBA-guided interventions are to move forward, they should be cognisant of how to take advantage of clientelist networks to advance RBA principles. Of course, this runs the risk of getting captured by clientelist networks or watered down if the proper checks are not put in place. Still, there may be opportunities, at least in the short term, for clientelist networks to work in tandem with RBA-guided efforts.

At a theoretical level, this calls for a reconsideration of RBA and clientelism principles. When applied in responses to poverty, they appear to be polar opposites. Yet, as observed here, they make strange, but workable, bedfellows. The hybrid governance forms that mix clientelism and RBA principles suggest several intermediate categories in which the two patterns combine. To be useful as a theoretical framework, rights approaches should find ways to incorporate intermediate categories in which rights principles mix with seemingly opposed principles like those of clientelism.

One final observation on political alliances deserves attention here. One cannot help but be struck by the institutional composition of the El Gol NGOs, which are dominated by middle class activists and intellectuals. This is significant for two reasons. First, urban NGOs working in rural areas bring middle-class values, resources, and skills to isolated communities where there is at best a weak middle class. The entrance of these NGOs has a transformative effect in which poor rural citizens gain a new awareness of their rights and an ability to articulate demands. The second significant aspect of extending the reach of urban NGOs to rural areas is that it provides an alternative to traditional clientelist political alliances. Instead of turning to traditional authorities, poor rural citizens can find allies in the urban middle class that staffs NGOs. This generates resources, leadership, and institutional protection for the rural poor. In exchange, middle sectors get the transparent and efficient government that they value.

It is curious that political parties have not learned more from partners like El Gol. This may be testament to the weakness and patronage orientation of most Peruvian parties. The weak and disastrous history of Peruvian parties has driven progressive sectors into NGOs as the only alternative avenue for political articulation. To make an RBA-guided agenda nationally viable, political parties will need to take it on board. The same middle-class urban and poor rural alliance could act as an electorally powerful alternative. El Gol has laid the blueprint and charted the path, now greater uptake is required from the Peruvian political elite.

Appendix I: RBA at DFID

DFID (2000) sees RBA as a means of ensuring that ‘citizens can hold governments to account for all their human rights obligations’, giving ‘priority to linking poor people’s perspectives with national and international policy processes.’ Their “human rights approach to development” is thus based on three cross-cutting principles:

- **Participation:** enabling people to realise their rights to participate in, and access information relating to, the decision-making processes which affect their lives.
- **Inclusion:** building socially inclusive societies, based on the values of equality and non-discrimination, through development which promotes all human rights for all people.
- **Fulfilling obligation:** strengthening institutions and policies which ensure that obligations to protect and promote the realisation of all human rights are fulfilled by states and other duty bearers.

These principles are not as straightforward as they might appear on paper, however. DFID (2000) observes that findings emerging out of participatory methods⁹ have not always fed into state policy and budget formulation processes. And even in countries that have become committed to democratic political participation, and where political processes are relatively free and fair, voting, lobbying and political parties are not sufficient to empower poor people. The poor have expressed a sense of powerlessness over the key decisions that affect their lives, and a lack of information about decisions being made at national and local levels. This, they point out, is a consequence of a combination of factors:

Poverty and social exclusion both tend to accompany limited access to media and information. Illiteracy, linguistic diversity, physical remoteness, poor transport and social isolation can all create communication difficulties even where the press is free.

(DFID 2000: 13)

Another concern that emerged out of the Consultations with the Poor is that of corruption and their lack of access to information that would potentially allow them to monitor government workers and guard against corrupt practices. DFID calls upon civil societies to work towards pressuring governing organisations to act in accordance with agreed human rights principles and obligations, calling on international human rights organisations to work to promote economic, social and cultural rights, and not solely the rights they have traditionally worked towards realising – the political and the civil (DFID 2000).

In elaborating on its “inclusion” principle, DFID highlights discrimination as a form of social exclusion and cause of poverty. It calls for a ‘political commitment to the principle of the universality of rights’, asserting that this will provide a ‘basis for the development of socially inclusive and equitable

⁹ Here DFID draws upon the World Bank’s series of consultation with the poor, synthesised in the document, *Global Synthesis: Consultations with the Poor* (1999).

societies'. They see discrimination occurring as a result of a number of factors including legal inequalities in status and entitlement, where needs and rights of particular people are not recognised in policies or provided for through budgetary allocations, and as a consequence of social norms.

DFID's third principle reiterates the importance of institutional capacity building, noting that states have very different capacities to reform legislation such that it ensures the incorporation of human rights norms into domestic legislation. 'Building governments' capabilities to provide accessible justice and legal redress, based on respect for human rights, is central to the realisation of human rights for poor people' (2000: 14). They go on to note that such legislation alone will not ensure the realisation of human rights, and that constitutional commitments must also be realised.

Constitutional commitments often remain as abstract principles because governments fail to address their obligation through budget and policy formulation processes which allocate resources to particular sectors and define the levels and standards of provision that all citizens can expect.

(DFID 2000: 14)

To ensure appropriate citizen action towards claiming constitutional rights, people require a 'clear understanding of what particular rights mean in terms of concrete entitlements' at a local level. 'Clear performance standards, civil society action and political mechanisms are central to ensuring the accountability of the state for its obligations to promote all human rights.'

Appendix II: RBA principles

For development actors, effective implementation of RBA continues to be challenging. A number of organisations have been working towards developing principles that may guide RBA that challenge existing inequalities and perverse power dynamics. Generally speaking, RBA is conceived of as a vision or a set of guidelines that can be used in strategic and creative ways, but that there is no formula or instruction manual to implementing such an approach.

The following principles and guidelines have been selectively drawn from findings that emerged out of a workshop on rights and power held at the Institute of Development Studies in November 2003, and from the Association for Women's Rights in Development (AWID)'s Facts and Issues: 'A Rights-Based Approach to Development' (2002).

- Identify and strategically exploit entry points and hooks
- Build strategic alliances, coalitions and networks with other actors who share a similar vision
- Increase levels of participation and ownership
- Enable claimed and created spaces
- Strengthen the capacity for agency, aim to change the situation of the beneficiary or beneficiary group from passive aid recipient to rights-holder
- Provide a unifying set of standards and a common language, add a legal force to development work
- Require government to prioritise their resources in accordance with stated human rights principles and obligations
- Make accountability central
- Walking the talk

Appendix III Evolution of the RBA

The current project applies RBA in terms of its response to multiple dimensions of poverty. Some discussion of origins of RBA is useful to understand its analytic utility. In part, rights-based approaches can be traced to international human rights frameworks that underlie international agreements in the United Nations and other multilateral institutions. Such agreements provided a basis by which ratifying countries could be pressured and held to account to fulfil rights (Eyben 2003).

At early moments, the definition of rights reflected tensions between East and West. ‘The West emphasised civil and political [CP] rights, pointing the finger at socialist countries for denying these rights. The socialist (and many developing) countries emphasised economic and social rights, criticising the richest Western countries for their failure to secure these rights for all citizens . . .’ (UNDP, cited by Manzo 2003).

The end of the Cold War made it possible to tear down this barrier between different kinds of rights. Development agencies increasingly recognised the indivisibility and interdependence of rights in their policy documents. For example, DFID has argued that ‘the end of the Cold War has removed many of the ideological barriers to governments’ acceptance of the human rights principles of the interdependence of all rights and the equality of all people’ (2000: 11).

Manzo (2003) also observes that the rise in rights approaches has coincided with the dislocating effects of globalisation. As developing country economies and societies are forced to adjust to a more liberalised and integrated international trading and production regime, economic, social and political realities undergo rapid change. In this context, protecting rights has been an important step to ease and correct some of the subsequent dislocations.

The deepening and broadening of rights has also been the result of specific efforts of local, national, and international struggles. At local levels, women, landless, indigenous and other subordinate groups mobilised around rights to obtain resources and participate in decisions which affected their lives. In the process, they helped to expand and redefine what was considered legitimate within the scope of human rights (Cornwall and Gaventa 2001).

The result has been convergence on what guides a rights-based approach to development.¹⁰ Rights cover all aspects of life essential for a person to enjoy a full life as well as develop their greatest capability. RBA attempts to expand the capabilities of individuals to claim and realise rights. The UN offered its own summation in the 1998 Report of Secretary General to Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC), ‘A “human rights-based approach” ensures that human rights standards, as established in international law, are applied as a criterion for policy orientation and for the solution of problems in specific areas. It introduces a normative basis, which is obligatory for States Parties, and thus requires a legislative response

¹⁰ See Manzo (2003) for an in-depth analysis that situates RBD in global political context and analyses it in relation to the international politics of development, especially the politics of neo-liberal adjustment policies in Africa.

at the State level. A rights approach implies that “beneficiaries” of policies and activities are active subjects and “claim holders” and stipulates duties or obligations for those against whom such claims can be held (“duty bearers”).’

Appendix IV: International electoral assistance experience

El Gol attempted to transform clientelist practices by introducing pro-poor and rights-based approaches. This was a significant departure from traditional elections assistance, which generally does not attempt a fundamental rearranging of power relations. In general, DFID and international electoral assistance focuses on free and fair elections in new democracies. In many of these countries authoritarian rule is a recent memory; political conflict takes occasionally violent forms; extreme poverty affects many; and institutional frameworks are extremely weak. As a result, assistance emphasises basic institutional strengthening, election-day monitoring, and international cooperation (Walker 2003). On these issues, the Peruvian experience strengthens and expands already existing knowledge. In addition, the Peruvian experience expands knowledge of appropriate interventions in contexts of weak parties, incipient democracy, and fragile society.

Even by the most minimal standards, electoral assistance is not always successful. For example, during most of Nepal's history, undemocratic regimes opened only partially and intermittently to democratic processes at only the local level.¹¹ After a quiet revolution in 1992, a UK-style parliamentary democracy with a constitutional monarch was installed. By the time of the 1999 elections, two, perhaps three, viable personalistic and patronage-based parties and a plethora of splinter parties had emerged, largely led by aged veterans of the pro-democracy movement. The international assistance that occurred focused on the elections themselves and included an effective, military-style, UN mission that monitored elections to protect against fraud or intimidation. Subsequent institutional strengthening had been a priority, but most of the funding targeted official institutions or entities were located in the capital city. Some attempt at decentralised governance was initiated, but this was poorly developed and served to fragment an already small country into 75 even smaller and administratively difficult districts. In isolated rural areas, Mao-ist guerrillas blocked electoral participation and electoral assistance. As a result, the monitoring mission barely reached some areas, and civic education and institution-building did not occur. Ultimately, democratic institutions and electoral assistance were served a harsh lesson. The constitutional monarch recently decided to dissolve parliament and reimpose autocratic rule.

Electoral assistance usually does not precede returns to authoritarianism, but neither does it always lead to significant advances in democratic practice. In Zimbabwe, a single, dominant, ruling party was intent on sham elections in 2003.¹² Electoral legislation changed in the week preceding elections; opposition parties were restricted; the media was controlled; police and security forces selectively applied the law; monitoring was by invitation only; and opposition supporters faced violence and intimidation. In this context, free and fair elections were distant hopes for DFID and international donors. Instead, they did what they could to assist local non-governmental organisations as they promoted civic education and

¹¹ The authors would like to thank Ian McKendry, former DFID governance advisor to Nepal, for his insights.

¹² The authors would like to thank Luke Mukubvu, DFID advisor, for his insights on the Zimbabwe experience.

election monitoring. Ultimately, examples such as Zimbabwe and Nepal suggest that election assistance may not always deepen democracy. In such situations, perhaps the best that can be hoped is that election assistance at least does not weaken hopes for democracy.

In Rwanda, election assistance faced a slightly different challenge and emerged somewhat more positively.¹³ Ethnic violence had only recently subsided and the country lacked even the most basic constitutional and governance framework. As a result, there was a real risk of return to politically motivated and ethnically inflamed violence, and the main objective was to make a marginal advance towards electoral democracy. Elections occurred in two stages in which voters first approved a new constitution and next voted in elections for legislators and the president. The elections were not free of irregularities, including the imprisonment of an important opposition candidate and the legal prohibition of an (admittedly ethnic) opposition party. Instead of focusing on these and other irregularities, most assistance aimed to strengthen basic electoral institutions and election-day monitoring and operated through an international consortium of donors working closely with government. The party that won represented a peaceful solution and held together a multi-ethnic coalition, and the results were largely supported by the international community.

In the context of historical ethnic divisions in a new democracy, donors face the task of cultivating an informed and engaged population. In Eastern Europe, many areas had been ethnically cleansed.¹⁴ In particular, elections in small, rural towns were particularly tenuous. Ethnic minority inhabitants had suffered persecution, many had left, and those few that returned or remained faced very real fears of reprisal if they actively participated. In addition, since the end of the conflict, elections for one authority or another had occurred virtually every year, and there was barely room or time for much more than election-day observation by international donors. On the other hand, the Dayton Agreement that brought peace to Kosovo gave international observers a special mandate to wield their influence, and they directed attention to rural areas and returned refugees. Election songs, radio programmes, and lottery schemes aimed to increase participation. Additional interventions required candidates to reveal their campaign finance to ensure that war profiteers were not included on party lists. Despite many flaws, most observers were satisfied that elections in Bosnia and Kosovo marked a significant departure from the ethnic violence that preceded.

In some instances, the major dilemma facing donors occurs after the elections, rather than before or during. In Zambia, multiparty elections began in 1991 after the end of one-party rule under Kaunda.¹⁵ Despite multiparty elections, the rules for participation were increasingly restrictive and opposition parties boycotted the 1996 elections. In 2001, the outcome was decided by 34,000 out of 2.5 million votes, and most observers judged the elections flawed, perhaps to the degree that flaws influenced the outcome. Still,

¹³ The authors would like to thank Rupert Bladon, DFID Governance advisor formerly in Rwanda and currently in Ethiopia.

¹⁴ Tomas Dackwailer, of the New Centre for International Peace Operations, provided generous observations on Bosnia and Kosovo.

¹⁵ Anna Wilde, DFID Governance Advisor, provided valuable comments based on her experience in Zambia.

the opposition had significant representation in the legislature, media was more active, and civil society was building capacity. As a result, most observers emphasised a longer term perspective in their post-election evaluations. Instead of outright condemnation, they offered criticisms and encouragement to greater democratisation in the future. They had to be particularly careful because they did not want valid critiques to be twisted into anti-Western rhetoric by the dominant party. The Zambia experience was contrasted to other situations in which strong condemnation by international observers was made after elections. In Russia's Duma elections, limitations on the media marred proceedings, and international observers chose to criticise. Similarly, in the Zimbabwe example mentioned above, strong condemnation by observers was also judged the only way to maintain pressure on the government.

The international electoral assistance project that perhaps exhibits the most similarities to the Peruvian context occurred in Nigeria. In Nigeria, the transition to democratic rule that occurred in 1999 left the country with a weak constitutional framework for elections.¹⁶ A national electoral commission and various state commissions were left the task of designing an electoral framework, including the timing of elections, the demarcation of boundaries, and the registration of voters and parties. Legislative, executive, and judicial pressures have been brought to bear on the commission, but state election commissions were widely expected to manipulate upcoming local elections.

Similar to Peru, some parts of Nigeria are resource rich. Still, poverty is widespread, and parties fail to mobilise serious cleavages or organise programmatic debate. Instead, the "money politics" of powerful agents dominates local and national politics. Patrons with bountiful funds for campaign finance swing elections by distributing material benefits to buy votes or use repression to exclude participation.

Electoral assistance has focused on institutional strengthening and has broadened to include election monitoring, citizen education, and party-building. In these efforts, civil society organisations have been important collaborators. Still, the Nigerian case exemplifies the challenges faced in incipient democracies where institutional protections are weak, and powerful individuals and actors use wealth and institutional control to bias democratic outcomes.

The Nigerian case brings up some of the most obvious parallels to rural Peru. Electoral assistance in such contexts can clearly not be limited to election-day observation and post-election evaluation, though both are important to nudging young democracies forward. Still, democracy is recent, poverty is endemic, and parties and party systems do a poor job of linking state and society. Institutional development, party-building, and citizen education pose particular challenges in these contexts, and international electoral assistance demands a pro-poor and party-building component. In the Peruvian context, this has included supporting efforts to build a rights-based and pro-poor orientation at the local level.

What is unusual about Peru is that these ideals have partially transformed clientelist practices. The result has not been the complete elimination of clientelism, but rather the beginnings of an alternative.

¹⁶ Many of these observations are drawn from comments by Sam Unom, DFID officer in Nigeria, and documents by Tim Sheehy and Victoria Erdoó-Ibi funded by DFID.

Persistent problems of resource scarcity and political informality remain and provide fertile ground for clientelism. In the paragraphs below, we examine the ways in which rights-based approaches have transformed structures on the ground in the context of electoral assistance.

Appendix V: Maps ¹⁷

Map 1 Peru



Map 2 Anta



¹⁷ Reproduced by kind permission of Instituto Nacional de Estadística y Informática (www.inei.gob.pe).

Map 5 Ollachea



Appendix VI: Comparing El Gol and non-El Gol districts

After several visits to municipalities, interviewing El Gol partners, and discussions with officials, we decided to run an experiment to evaluate the El Gol programme and the nature of political development in the municipalities. Our experiment compared El Gol and non-El Gol districts. Obviously, the experiment did not occur in a controlled environment, and it is difficult to determine what responses truly mean, especially for an outsider that speaks only Spanish, not the indigenous languages (mostly Quechua) spoken by some of the poorest members of the communities visited. In addition, one cannot be sure whether El Gol caused, or encouraged, changing political patterns or whether the communities and El Gol partners self-selected each other based on prior links. Still, interesting trends were evident. Authorities were conscious of the utility of participation as a mechanism to organise and incorporate supporters and they were also keenly aware of the necessity of structuring participation to manage demands in ways that directed resources to the poorest citizens.

Four communities were chosen on the basis of discussions with El Gol partners. Two districts near Cusco (Anta, Tambobamba) and two districts in Puno (Macusani, Ollachea) were selected. The districts shared basic economic and demographic characteristics and all were located in the Andean highlands where poverty is acute and political violence directly experienced. Appendix V displays maps of the districts. In each region, there was one district that had participated in El Gol (Tambobamba and Macusani) and one province that had not (Anta and Ollachea). The design allows us to control for as many similarities as possible while attempting to measure the impact of El Gol.

Table A1 District demographics (percentages)

	Population estimate 2002 (number)	Lack basic needs	Illite-rate over 15	Lack sewerage	Malnourish-ed, 1 st year of school	Agriculture work	Rural
Anta	20153	88.5	25.9	81.7	65.7	66.3	68.9
Tambobamba	12809	98.9	60.7	97.6	77.5	84.6	72.5
Macusani	11434	81.1	29.8	71.4	63	44.9	40.0
Ollachea	3936	90.2	43.6	82.1	72.8	81.5	64.5

Source: Banco de Informacion Distrital (2004).

Anta was the most urbanised of the provinces visited, and it showed all the signs of a small town that was rapidly growing. It is 30 minutes from Cusco, connected by a paved highway and strong links. Many people work in Cusco and return to Anta where there is a bustling commercial centre. Despite this urban head, the population remains largely rural, and even those living in the centre retain land or conduct seasonal work in rural areas. There are nine districts and the Cusco River provides the main source of irrigation. Most land is held in small plots and production is for subsistence, though some production for Cusco markets occurs.

By contrast, Tambobamba is a relatively urban centre located several hours from Cusco by difficult roads over mountainous terrain. The province is officially in Apurimac province, though it is better connected to Cusco. The districts in the province are located at varying altitudes, with some as high as 4,000 meters and none lower than 2,500. Farmers at the higher altitudes face extremely harsh conditions where only subsistence and simple livestock are possible. In the valleys, more extensive herding and irrigation are possible, though not widely spread.

Macusani lies in the northeastern portion of Puno, just in the shadows of the snow-topped peak of Allun Capac. The land is rocky and the climate harsh, and most of the rural communities are dedicated to subsistence farming and livestock. Some of the more distant districts lie in the fertile jungle that begins as soon as the altitude begins to drop, but these are sparsely populated and poorly connected. Mining companies are increasingly interested in some of these zones where precious metals are thought to lie.

Ollachea lies just beyond Macusani on the Trans-oceanic highway that links Peru and Brazil. Unlike the other districts, Ollachea was not a district head, and its population was significantly smaller. Most of the population live in the rocky hills above the town, and the distinctive characteristic of Ollachea is the San Gaban river that slices through the hills to create the steep slopes that nestle the small urban concentration. The frequent rumbling of trucks rattles the settlement, and a commercial life has sprung around services for the passing truckers. The major source of dynamism (and destruction) is the huge hydroelectric plant that lies a few kilometres below the town. Construction of the plant involved 3,000 workers, who descended on the town from 1998 until 2000. A commercial boom ensued, but so did violence, inflation, prostitution, and a host of social problems associated with abandoned children and mothers. The dam is currently self-contained and interacts little with the community, even supplying food for its kitchen from distant markets. The town is currently engaged in a lawsuit that seeks property tax from the company that runs the plant. If successful, the suit would secure four times the annual budget. The plant has clearly shattered the community, and it is doubtful that local authorities could resist if the plant owners decided to increase their political activism. Some evidence of future possibilities was evident in the behaviour of the outgoing mayor. Just after losing the election, he repealed the property tax and settled for a truck instead. When the new mayor announced a lawsuit to secure back taxes, the company reneged on the truck.

These details should make it clear that all provinces in Peru have qualitative specificities that make them unique. The basic similarities they share are rural and poor with weak formal institutions and civil societies decimated by violence. These basic similarities are borne out in the socio-demographic details included below. Macusani was slightly more urbanised than the other districts, and Ollachea significantly smaller in population, but the basic poverty of rural highlands life are clear from the statistics.

Respondents in each district included mayors and members of the city council; and in one district, members of the executive bureaucracy participated. The total number of respondents was 45, and all districts had at least 10 respondents. In each district, we read a series of paired comparisons, and those

present were asked to vote which of the two priorities they preferred. The paired comparisons included four options (jobs, product prices and infrastructure, basic services, and participatory planning). There were six pairs (jobs-prices, jobs-services, etc).¹⁸

We selected these items to trigger certain kinds of cleavage within the districts. 'Jobs' reflected the real need for immediate material benefits. 'Prices' reflected the needs of poor, rural producers for longer-term material benefits. 'Services' were required by all citizens, but one might expect them to be especially appreciated in the long-term by urban sectors. 'Participation' reflected a rights-based approach to development. Obviously, the indicators offer only loose measures of the underlying concepts, but the experiment required surprisingly little explanation. The respondents quickly grasped what they were being asked to compare, and it was evident from their comments afterwards that they were making urban-rural, short-long term, and participation-material comparisons in considering their answers.

The process was explained at the outset, and respondents were presented the paired comparisons with as little definition of the priorities as possible. Explanations of the priorities were offered when asked, and some respondents attempted to provide their own definitions either during or after the vote. Respondents were asked to vote, explain their vote, and then vote again. A discussion followed.

Case comparison findings

Several basic trends were evident in the voting and discussion of the experiment. Generally, the second vote intensified the preferences from the first vote; those who held dissenting opinions were cajoled or convinced that they should switch. Also, political dynamics and cleavages were also clear. Most communities are split between several elite factions. The electoral system gave the mayor an automatic majority in the town council, and those in the governing coalition generally looked to the mayor before deciding what they would vote. The opposition generally included at least one member of the local elite linked to the departed Fujimori regime.

The results reported below indicate the average of the two votes. The quantitative rankings of priorities offer an indication of the difference between El Gol districts and non-El Gol districts. Respondents in El Gol provinces appeared to favour long-term and participation priorities, and there was little difference on urban-rural issues. Respondents in non-El Gol provinces appeared to favour short-term and material projects.

Before turning to the qualitative comments that enlivened and deepened the experiment, it is useful to note the degrees and kinds of differences between El Gol and non-El Gol districts. The clearest distinction was in participation, where the respondents from El Gol districts showed a clear preference for participation (76 per cent) and they almost doubled the preference for participation in the non-El Gol districts (39 per cent). Long-term projects were also preferred in the El Gol districts (64 per cent) though the preference was not so intense and the difference with non-El Gol districts not as significant (44 per

¹⁸ Details on the methodology can be found in Appendix 1.

cent). Finally, urban preferences were slightly more prevalent in the El Gol districts, though opinions were virtually split (56 per cent) and the difference may not be large enough to determine a difference from the non-El Gol districts (45 per cent).

Table A2 Percent support for priorities

	El Gol districts (Carabaya, Tambobamba)	Non-El Gol districts (Anta, Ollachea)
Long-term more important than short-term	64%	44%
Urban more important than rural	56%	45%
Participation more important than material	76%	39%
Respondents (2 rounds of voting)	24	21

It is difficult to interpret a blunt instrument like this experiment when the task is to measure complex preferences of district authorities. One interpretation that has to be considered is that El Gol districts had learned to say what they think external observers like to hear; ‘Participation is a fundamental right . . . Through participation we think about long-term, development priorities’ etc. Contradictions and clarifications that emerged in qualitative comments suggest that this is partly what was occurring; elected officials are savvy communicators, especially when they know that people with links to international donors are in the room. Still, the quantitative results at least suggest that El Gol districts differ from districts where El Gol projects did not operate. More ambitiously, it appears that El Gol local authorities were convinced of the potential of participation to open space for citizen rights while at the same time structuring decisions to achieve pro-poor policies. The qualitative comments that followed the votes offered an even more clear indication.

In El Gol districts, there was a clear understanding of the role of participation in articulating rights and biasing outcomes towards pro-poor policies. The mayor in Macusani was explicit in linking participation to rights and pro-poor policy.

Mayors used to budget as they wished. They did not tell anyone about the works, the salaries, or the costs of anything . . . The result was that all the projects went to the urban centre . . . Now, the motivation and the point of participation is to send money to the poor rural communities.

The mayor from Tambobamba echoed the pro-poor potential of participatory planning.

Before, you could pick up a rock and money from Fujimori would be underneath. The problem was that people did not choose the projects and help to build them. They may not have even addressed people’s real needs. After the project was done, it just sat there and deteriorated. Now, people believe in the projects and put in their own money and sweat to make sure that the projects are successful.

In Macusani, the mayor also exhibited a sophisticated understanding of participation and rights, though he was not idealistic about it.

Still, everyone is jumping at the chance to participate, and this can create problems, as there are too many pent-up demands to satisfy, especially for a poor municipality . . . The territorial division of participation here privileges the rural communities and makes it difficult for the traditional families and urban interests to dominate decisions.

The council members reinforced these impressions from the mayors. One woman council member from Tambobamba explained the way in which participation had altered traditional clientelism to a more rights-based and pro-poor system.

Before, people who campaigned would give food, promise work, and spend money on beer and t-shirts. They even used municipal funds for this, and then they did not keep their promises . . . I won because I listened to their demands. The participatory planning lets people decide what works are coming and encourages them to make popular contributions. This is what it means to be a citizen – to participate, make demands, and take responsibility for the job.

Another Tambobamba councilperson described the potential political utility of participation.

Participation is popular because it is new. Also, it draws on a long history, in which the community provided work to build things like a temple during a *faena*. The key thing that participation does is build leaders. Women, in particular, are traditionally excluded. They can be encouraged to participate by involving them in the decisions that are meaningful: the glass of milk programme for kids, the women's committee for deciding on a community centre. Women need to be given the chance and training to develop leaders. It used to be that being the leader of a community was a punishment or people voted for whoever gave them beer or food. Only the *mistis* or people with land participated. Now, everybody demands their rights.

In Macusani, the mayor recognised the importance of short-term work in helping citizens alleviate poverty, especially in vulnerable moments of emergency. Previously, such jobs had been a familiar instrument to reassert traditional clientelist relationships. He introduced a more rights-based and pro-poor element by using participation.

It used to be that you had to ask the mayor for a favour when your crops failed and he would give you a job. Me, I divide the jobs into one month posts. Most of them are unskilled things like cleaning public spaces and such. I tell the Women's Neighbourhood Committee and the Association of Mothers, 'This is how many jobs there are, who needs them?'. They decide how to share the jobs, and they almost always share them equally and especially with the poorest women . . . Now, I can count on them whenever I need something in the community done.

Similarly, the mayor of Macusani recognised the utility of reaching out to other subgroups, such as un- or underemployed young men. To tie them into his network of supporters, the mayor provided traditional community police networks, *rondas*, with uniforms, lassos (the symbol of their authority) and the transportation for training they received in the regional capital. For community events, the *rondas* were given short-term jobs to maintain crowd security and order. In addition, one of the members of the provincial council elected on the mayor's ticket had been in the *rondas*.

The non-El Gol provinces demonstrated several differences from the El Gol provinces. Some of these differences were evident in the quantitative data presented above. The qualitative comments that accompanied the experiment provide further detail. In Anta, there is a pro-poor mayor who pioneered participation in previous administrations of a smaller rural district in the same province, Limatambo. He was now mayor of the provincial head, but it was clear that rights-based and pro-poor practices were still elusive. One of those present explained in graphic detail.

For me personally, participatory planning is the most important thing we can do. Unfortunately, the average person here could not give a fart about participation. They want work, cement, and projects they can see and touch. The people do not care if a mayor is corrupt, dictatorial and atheist; they only care about work.

The notion of participation as a way to build political support did not appear to operate in the non-El Gol provinces. Political support was a purely short-term, material exchange. One councilperson explained the nature of his political links to citizens.

People ask me for two things in exchange for their vote: work and booze . . . I know that I have a responsibility to provide services, but it is much more important to give out jobs. When a drought or some crisis happens, people are starving. Work can mean the difference between life and death.

The mayor of Anta had implemented a participatory planning mechanism in his home district, and he intended to begin such an endeavour in the future. For the moment, he explained why participatory and long-term planning had not developed.

Our culture used to be rich in planning. Machu Picchu would not exist without serious planning and participation, nor the other wonders of the Incas. But the invaders came, they took the land, they gave it to the Spaniards and the *mistis*. Authoritarian governments continued to the present day. Who can blame us for not trusting planning or investing in land and houses; we have no security! We are afraid to take those risks. They have tried to plan in the past, but it stays as ink on paper. There is no money behind it.

In Ollachea, the mayor was favourable to participation, but he was largely unconvinced that it was realistic in his province.

Participation is important, but we have no idea how to put it in place. We have six thousand people in our town, most are close to extreme poverty and many are single mothers with abandoned kids . . . They know nothing about participation. Really, for them, participation is just extra.

At the insistence of the mayor of Macusani, Ollachea had attempted some open meetings to discuss priorities. The meetings were not understood as part of enhancing rights, however, and there was little pro-poor about the outcome. In addition, little effort was made to reach groups that were traditionally excluded.

The good thing about participation is that people cannot blame the city council after making decisions. People chose the projects, so they cannot attack us if the projects do not work . . . We invite them to meetings in the town, and none of the people from the rural areas show up . . . Sometimes, they are not even told when the meetings occur . . . Only the organised people, like teachers, come. The other people who come look for work, and when there is none, they get angry with us. We lose credibility.

The city council came up with a development plan . . . We went to the participatory meetings, and the projects were approved. Then, all the money was gone, and there was nothing left to fund all the other demands people made . . . Everything was expected to fall on the municipality.

The mayor of Ollachea was sincere in looking for ways to improve participation, and he sensed the political utility of using participation to build a network of supporters. Yet, his idea of a network was much closer to a traditional clientelist exchange than a rights-based and pro-poor network, and he was clearly worried about losing political control over participatory spaces.

We want to pay people to participate and give them a lunch when they do. That would bring them into politics. If we tried to give everyone something, the province would be bankrupt.

The qualitative and quantitative responses from the provincial authorities suggest that much new was occurring in El Gol provinces, even as some things remained the same. To begin it should be clear that in both El Gol and non-El Gol provinces, clientelist practices continued to direct material benefits to particular groups in exchange for political support. Still, the degree of clientelism was different in El Gol provinces. Local authorities appeared to be conscious of participation as a rights-based approach to governance and a way of promoting pro-poor policy. Moreover, they displayed a sophisticated understanding of the way in which formal institutions of participation could be structured for maximum

political effect. They structured participation to overcome opposition, target core supporters with benefits, and distribute benefits to potential allies among the poor. This represents an important advance from traditional clientelist practices that continued in non-El Gol provinces.

Case comparison methodology

Much of our information about the districts was gleaned from discussions with El Gol partners themselves. We followed the basic chronology of El Gol in organising our questions for these actors, asking them what they did first, second, etc. As observers of multiple jurisdictions, we also asked them to help us identify communities for further investigation. In particular, they helped us to identify similarities and differences across the municipalities that we could pursue further and test during our visits.

In each district, we attempted to conduct individual interviews with members of the district administration, the mayor, and the city council. These interviews were semi-structured, following a basic set of questions that were organised chronologically around the activities of El Gol. Each chronological question was followed by a series of probing questions that varied with the responses offered to the chronological questions. As much as possible, we returned to the chronological string of questions to provide some consistency across interviews and comparability in the information obtained.

1. What projects did El Gol partners undertake with you during the campaign? What were your impressions?
2. What projects did El Gol partners undertake with other authorities during the campaign? What were your impressions?
3. What projects did El Gol partners undertake with community-members during the campaign? What were your impressions?
4. What projects did El Gol partners undertake with you during the elections themselves? What were your impressions?
5. What projects did El Gol partners undertake with other authorities during the elections themselves? What were your impressions?
6. What projects did El Gol partners undertake with community-members during the elections themselves? What were your impressions?
7. What happened after the elections? Did you continue with El Gol collaboration? What were your impressions?
8. What happened after the elections? Did other authorities continue with El Gol collaboration? What were your impressions?
9. What happened after the elections? Did members of the community continue with El Gol collaboration? What were your impressions?

It quickly became apparent that our visits were public events in which many members of the community and local authorities wanted to participate. They were all eager to be interviewed, and most individual

interviews quickly evolved into focus group sessions. We modified our approach once this reality became apparent, and designed the comparative study of four El Gol and non-El Gol districts. We chose the four districts of Tambobamba, Anta, Macusani, and Ollachea. Tambobamba and Macusani were districts in which El Gol partners had already done significant work. Anta and Ollachea were expected to be incorporated into El Gol partner projects shortly.

Respondents in each district included mayors and members of the city council; and in one district, members of the executive bureaucracy participated. The total number of respondents was 45, and all districts had at least 10 respondents.

	Tambobamba	Anta	Macusani	Ollachea
Total participants	11	10	12	12
Women	2	2	2	1

In each district, we read a series of paired comparisons, and those present were asked to vote which of the two priorities they preferred. The paired comparisons included four options (jobs, product prices, basic services, and participatory planning). There were six pairs (jobs-prices, jobs-services, etc).

	Product prices and productive infrastructure	Basic services (electricity, water, others)	Participatory planning
Work			
Product prices and infrastructure			
Basic services (electricity, water, others)			

The process was explained at the outset, and respondents were presented the paired comparisons with as little definition of the priorities as possible. Explanations of the priorities were offered when asked, and some respondents attempted to provide their own definitions either during or after the vote. Respondents were asked to vote and explain their vote.

After the first round of voting and discussion, we offered the same sequence of paired priorities to the respondents and they were asked to vote again. After the second vote, there was another discussion.

For the discussion after the first round and second round of voting, we asked a series of questions based on the responses. For example, the respondents in Tambobamba favoured work over product prices by a nine to one margin in the first vote. We asked respondents to explain their own vote and why they thought the overall vote turned out the way it did. In particular, we made sure the dissenting or minority voices could defend their position. In the Tambobamba case, it was the mayor who had voted to favour work.

Appendix VII: Policy report: findings and implications

Local findings	
Context	Clientelism and poverty continue to characterise the local level.
Positive signs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Progressive movements articulate pro-poor and rights-based approaches that slowly transform clientelism. These approaches targeted previously neglected areas and citizens. Citizens gained ownership over projects and rights to hold government accountable. Leaders structured participation to favour poor and rural citizens.
Negative signs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Traditional clientelism continued in most districts. Even progressive leaders faced attacks from traditional client networks. Progressive leaders facing resource and capacity constraints could easily slip into previous patterns of distribution. Local leaders had little capacity to influence the pattern of politics outside their districts.

Regional findings	
Context	Traditional elites are reemerging as democratic processes are opened at the regional level.
Positive signs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Coalitions of pro-poor mayors and movements exert pressure and redirect resources to rural areas, especially through participatory mechanisms. Allies to these movements lobbied in Lima to strengthen participatory and consultative entities in regional government. New consultative spaces such as the CCR’s open room to pressure regional presidents for distribution and transparency.
Negative signs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Traditional clientelism continued among regional elite. Pressure from progressive mayors and civil society easily captured or distorted towards clientelist patterns. National parties doing little to discipline regional presidents nor link them together.

Implications	
Local implications	RBA efforts have created change at the local level. Such efforts have achieved only partial success, however, and they frequently produce governance hybrids that mix clientelism and RBA. A key factor appears to be external alliances. Such alliances are currently only forthcoming from like-minded local leaders and NGOs. To sustain rights-based and pro-poor alternatives, allies at higher levels of government and among the political elite will be necessary.
Regional implications	RBA also holds out hope for reformist coalitions at the regional level. Most of these efforts are led by a few progressive district leaders. National and regional political society remains slow to catch up. Support from national legislators and parties will be important to constructing alternative regional and national movements.

Appendix VIII: Development administration lessons

The unique management style adopted by DFID deserves mention. The context of poverty and exclusion that existed in rural Peru created several challenges for implementation. RBA offered a series of principles for El Gol interventions, and these principles extended to the way in which the project itself was designed. The key components of project administration were participation and creating local social capital to respond to poverty. Local partners were encouraged to develop their own solutions, and bottom-up practices and participation in designing programmes was encouraged.

This set of practices was well suited to RBA and it also fit well with the uncertainties of working in rural Peru. The geographical dispersion of the communities made centralised, top-down control all but impossible. In addition, there was extreme uncertainty surrounding the elections. At no point was it clear what rules would govern the elections nor what the subsequent powers of different regional and local authorities would be. As a result, a flexible management style by DFID and El Gol partners enabled rapid responses to change without losing the core ideals of the project. The result was that rights-based and pro-poor approaches obtained a distinctively local flavour. Each local project developed unique interventions that matched the citizenship demands and institutional needs of the local context.

In the process, the El Gol partners sought not only to respond to a changing context, but also to build local capacity to survive the El Gol project. By equipping local partners with the tools to develop solutions, have a voice, and organise their interests, El Gol sought to make them conscious and purposive actors in development administration. Ideally, this would enhance their ability to operate beyond the end of the project, and prepare them to serve excluded groups in the future.

Appendix IX: El Gol partners, activities, and coverage

There are multiple ways in which to categorise El Gol activities. The partners contracted to design and carry out projects included efforts at provincial and district level, interventions in public opinion and the media, and pressure for national legislation. The organisations were: Asociación SER y Vicarías de Ayaviri, Juli y Sicuani; Colectivo Ayacucho (IPAZ, CEPRODEP, CEDAP, CCC-UNCCCH, Defensoría del Pueblo, FEDECMA, SER, Solidaridad); Centro Bartolomé de las Casas, ADEAS Qullana y CADEP José María Arguedas; Defensoría del Pueblo; Comité Multisectorial de Quispicanchi: Parroquia Santiago Apóstol de Urcos; Asociación de Comunicadores Sociales CALANDRIA; TV Cultura; APRODEH. The following tables borrow from the original evaluation document from the project to describe the activities and geographic scope of the El Gol partners (Romero 2003).

Organisation	Activities	Coverage
SER Vicars of the Southern Andes SEPAR, SISAY y CITAQ	Strengthen links between state and society and participation in general.	Puno Cusco Huancavelica
Bartolomé de las Casas Centre ADEAS Qullana CADEP	Strengthen civil society, leaders, candidates, and elected authority.	Apurímac (Grau and Cotabambas province) Cusco (Chumbivilcas province)
Ayacucho Collective (IPAZ, CEDAP, CEPRODEP, CCC-UNSC, Defensoría del Pueblo, FEDECMA, SER, SOLIDARIDAD)	Build civil society and candidate capacity for local governance.	Ayacucho
People's Defender	Monitor and regulate free and fair elections with particular attention to the rights of the subordinate groups.	Apurímac Ayacucho Cusco Huancavelica Puno
Multisectoral Committee of Quispicanchi (Urcos Parish)	Strengthen citizenship through training in rights and consultative planning committees.	Cusco, Quispicanchi province
RED Perú	Strengthen citizen oversight, improve governance capacity through participatory planning, lobby central government for national legislation on local government.	Apurímac

TV Cultura	Strengthen civil society capacity through television campaigns.	Cusco, Puno, Ayacucho, Huancavelica, Apurímac
CALANDRIA Association of Social Communicators	Strengthen media capacity to evaluate government and promote accountability. Support national legislation on local government.	Cusco, Puno, Ayacucho, Huancavelica
APRODEH	Study perceptions of rights among citizens.	Ayacucho, Cusco Huancavelica, Amazonas, Junín
SER Associaton	Study perceptions and behaviour of local elites.	Ayacucho y Cusco
Centro Bartolomé de las Casas	Study background of local leaders.	Apurímac y Cusco
IPAZ	Electoral ethnography on candidate perceptions of local and regional government.	Ayacucho
ONPE	Essay competition on promoting rural political participation.	National

Appendix X: Interviews

Category	Post	District, Province
APURIMAC		
Civil Society	Community Activists	Tambobamba, Cotabambas
Officials	Mayors and Council members	Tambobamba, Cotabambas
CUSCO		
Civil Society	Cesar A. Aguilar Andrade, Community Activist	Santo Tomás, Chumbivilcas
Civil Society	CADEP NGO	Santo Tomás, Chumbivilcas
Civil Society	Paulina Romero, Community Activist, CADEP	Colquemarca, Chumbivilcas
Civil Society	Ines Condori , Community Activist, CADEP	Santo Tomás, Chumbivilcas
Civil Society	Willi Alis, Community Activist	Llusco, Chumbivilcas
Civil Society	Emilio, Community Activist	Santo Tomás, Chumbivilcas
Civil Society	Eurico Villena, Community Activist	Santo Tomás, Chumbivilcas
Civil Society	Profesor Remigio	Santo Tomás, Chumbivilcas
Official	Neri Contreras, Councilwoman	Quiñota, Chumbivilcas
Officials	Mayor and Council members	Anta
PUNO		
Civil Society	Vicary	Juli, Puno
Civil Society	Leonidas, Neighbourhood President	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Sabino Molina Pacha, District Mayor	Ituata, Carabaya
Official	Mayor and Council members	Ollachea, Carabaya
Official	Ruben Darío, Transport Commission	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Justo Maca Caceres, Territorial Delegate, Mixed Commission	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Asea, Ex-Municipal Candidate	Santo Tomás, Chumbivilcas, Cusco
Official	Nelly Anco, Budget Officer	Macusani, Carabaya

Official	Fabio Porras, Councilman	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Quizpe Gutierrez, Councilman, Economic Commission	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Ali Palomino Quizpe, Councilwoman, Culture and Education Commission	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Julio Ocuno, Councilman, Participation, Citizenship and Human Development Commission	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Arnaldo, Councilman, Personnel and Commerce Commission	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Fidel Montegua, Councilman, President of Local Security (Rondas)	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Maximo Torres, Councilman, Basic Services	Macusani, Carabaya
Official	Pilar Velarda Montesinos, Councilwoman, Agropecuniary Commission	Macusani, Carabaya

Appendix XI: Abbreviations and translations

Acronym (where applicable)	Spanish	English
ACS Calandria	Asociación de Comunicadores Sociales Calandria	Association of Social Communicators
ADEAS Qullana	Asociación para el Desarrollo Andino Sostenible – Qullana	Qullana Association for Andean Sustainable Development
Asociación Ser	Servicios Educativos Rurales	Rural Education Services
CADEP	Centro Andino de Educación y Promoción 'Jose María Arguedas'	Andean Centre for Promotion and Education 'Jose María Arguedas'
CBC – Cusco	Centro de Estudios Regionales Andinos Bartolome de las Casas – Cusco	Bartolomé de Las Casas Andean Regional Studies Centre – Cusco
CCC-UNSCH	Centro de Capacitación Campesina-Universidad Nacional San Cristóbal de Huamanga	Peasant Capacity-Building Centre – San Cristóbal de Huamango University
CCL	Consejo de Coordinación Local	Local Coordination Council
CCR	Consejo de Coordinación Regional	Regional Coordination Council
CEDAP	Centro para el Desarrollo Agropecuario	Centre for Agropecuniary Development
Centro IDEAS	Centro de Investigación, Documentación, Educación, Asesoría, y Servicios	Centre for Research, Documentation, Education, Advice, and Services
CEPRODEP	Centro de Promoción y Desarrollo Poblacional	Promotion and Population Development Centre
CITAQ	Asociación Civil	CITAQ Civil Association
CODEH	Comisión de Derechos Humanos	Human Rights Commission
DFID	Ministerio Británico para el Desarrollo Internacional	Department for International Development
FEDECMA	Federación de Clubes de Madres del Departamento de Ayacucho	Federation of Mothers Clubs of Ayacucho Department
FONCODES	Fondo de Compensación y Desarrollo Social	Compensation and Social Development Fund
FONCOMUN	Fondo Comunitario	Community Fund
IPAZ	Instituto de Investigación y Promoción para el Desarrollo y la Paz de Ayacucho	Institute for Research and Promotion for the Development and Peace of Ayacucho
MIMDES	Ministerio de la Mujer y Desarrollo Social	Ministry of Women and Social Programmes

ONPE	Oficina Nacional de Procesos Electorales	National Office of Electoral Processes
PRONA	Programma Nacional de Apoyo Alimentario	National Programme for Alimentation Assistance
REMURPE	Red de Municipios Rurales de Peru	Network of Peruvian Rural Municipalities
SEPAR	Servicios Educativos Promocion y Apoyo Rural	Educational Services, Promotion and Rural Support
SISAY	Centro de Desarrollo Andino	Andean Development Centre
	SOLIDARIDAD	Solidarity
	RED Peru	Network of Local Agendas
	Mesas de Concertación	Concertation Board
	Colectivo Ayacucho	Ayacucho Collective
	Defensoría del Pueblo	People's Defender
	Comité Multisectoral de Quispicanchi (Parroquia Urcos)	Multisectoral Committee of Quispicanchi (Urcos Parish)
	Vicarías del Surandino	Vicars of the Southern Andes

References

- AWID, 2002, 'A rights-based approach to development', *Women's Rights and Economic Change* 1, August, 1–8
- Banco de Informacion Distrital, 2004, *Informacion Cartografica y Estadistica del Peru*, Instituto Nacional de Estadisticas e Informatica [www.inci.gob.pe accessed 29 March 2004]
- Chambers, R.W., 1997, *Whose Reality Counts? Putting the Last First*, London: ITDG Publishers
- Cornwall, A., 2002, 'Making spaces, changing places: situating participation in development', *IDS Working Paper* 170, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies
- Cornwall, A. and Gaventa, J., 2001, 'From users and choosers to makers and shapers: repositioning participation in social policy', *IDS Working Paper* 127, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies
- 2000, 'From users and choosers to makers and shapers: repositioning participation in social policy', *IDS Working Paper* 127, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies
- DFID, 2000, 'Realising human rights for poor people', *Strategy Paper*, London: DFID
- DFID and ONPE, 2003, *Para Promover la Participación Electoral en Zonas Rurales*, Lima: DFID, ONPE
- Diez Hurtado, A., 2003, *Élites y Poderes Locales: Sociedades Regionales Ante la Descentralización*, Lima: DFID and SER
- Erie, S.P., 1988, *Rainbow's End: Irish-Americans and the Dilemmas of Urban Machine Politics, 1840–1985*, Berkeley: University of California Press
- Eyben, R., 2003, 'The rise of rights: rights-based approaches to international development', *IDS Policy Briefing* Issue 17, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies
- Francke, M., 2003, *Including the Poor Excluded People of Ayacucho in the Construction of the "Truth": Reflections on Methods and Processes for the Realisation of Rights*, Lima: DFID
- Gaeta, A. and Vasilera, M., 1998, *Development and Human Rights: The Role of the World Bank*, Washington, D.C.: World Bank
- Gaventa, J. and Valderrama, C., 1999, 'Background note prepared', paper read at Strengthening Participation in Local Governance, Brighton
- Gay, R., 1994, *Popular Organization and Democracy in Rio de Janeiro: A Tale of Two Favelas*, Philadelphia: Temple University Press
- Glewwe, P and Van der Gaag, J., 1988, 'Confronting poverty in developing countries: definitions, information and policies', *World Bank LSMS Working Paper* 48, Washington, D.C.: World Bank
- Hellum, A., 2001, 'Towards a human rights based development approach: the case of women in the water reform process in Zimbabwe', No 1, *Law, Social Justice and Global Development (LGD)*
- Hughes, A., Wheeler, J. with Eyben, R. and Scott-Villiers, P., 2004, *Rights and Power Workshop: Report*, February, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies
- Levitsky, S., 1999, 'Fujimori and post-party politics in Peru', *Journal of Democracy*, Vol 10 No 1: 78–92
- Manzo, K., 2003, 'Africa in the rise of rights-based development', *Geoforum* 34: 437–56
- Maslow, A. 1994, *Religious Values and Peak Experiences*, New York: Penguin Books

- Maxwell, S., 1999, 'The meaning and measurement of poverty', *ODI Poverty Briefing*, London: ODI
- Moynihan, D.P. and Glazer, N., 1964, *Beyond the Melting Pot*, Cambridge, MA: MIT Press
- Mungoven, R., 2003, 'Common cause – the converging agendas and complementary roles of human rights and development NGOs', *Global Future: A World Journal of Human Development*, fourth quarter: 1–2
- Nyamu, C., 2001, 'Are Local Norms and Practices Fences or Pathways? The Example of Women's Property Rights', in A.A. An'Naim (ed.), *Cultural Transformation and Human Rights in Africa*, New York: Zed Books
- 2000, 'How should human rights and development respond to cultural legitimization of gender hierarchy in developing countries?', *Harvard International Law Journal*, Spring, Vol 41 No 2: 381–418
- Pateman, C., 1980, *Participation and Democratic Theory*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Roberts, K.M., 1995, 'Neoliberalism and the transformation of populism in Latin America: the Peruvian case', *World Politics* 48 (October): 82–116
- Romero Bolaños, F., 2003, *Informe de Sistematización del Programmea Apoyo a las Elecciones Regionales y Municipales en el 2002: Por Gobiernos Locales a Favour de los Pobres*, Lima: DFID
- Schneider, A. and Zuniga-Hamlin, R., 2005, *Pro-Poor, Rights-Based Approaches in the Presence of Pervasive Clientelism: An Evaluation of DFID El Gol Electoral Assistance*, Brighton: Institute of Development Studies
- Scott, J.C., 1985, *Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Peasant Resistance*, New Haven: Yale University Press
- 1977, 'Patron-client politics and political change in Southeast Asia', *American Political Science Review* 66: 91–113
- Schedler, A., 1999, 'Conceptualizing Accountability', in A. Schedler, L. Diamond and MF. Plattner (eds), *The Self-Restraining State: Power and Accountability in New Democracies*, London: Lynne Rienner
- Sen, A.K., 1999, *Development as Freedom*, New York: Alfred Knopf
- Sider, R.J., 2003, 'When rights collide', *Global Future: A World Vision Journal of Human Development*, Fourth quarter: 6–7
- Stepan, A., 1978, *The State and Society: Peru in Comparative Perspective*, Princeton: Princeton University Press
- Tomasevski, K., 2000, *Minority Rights in Development Aid Policies*, London: Minority Rights Group International Economic Papers
- Walker, R., 2003, *Electoral Process: A Guide to Assistance*, London: DFID