

International Budget Partnership
OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE

VIETNAM

September 28, 2007

International Budget Partnership
Center on Budget and Policy Priorities
820 First Street, NE
Suite 510
Washington, DC 20002
www.internationalbudget.org
www.openbudgetindex.org

This questionnaire was completed by:

Name:	Tran Ngoc Tue and Vu Thi Quynh Hoa
Organization:	ActionAid Vietnam
Address:	14-16 Ham Long street, Hanoi, Vietnam
Telephone:	84 4 943 9866
E-mail:	tue.tranngoc@actionaid.org; hoa.vuthiquynh@actionaid.org

International Budget Partnership OPEN BUDGET QUESTIONNAIRE VIETNAM

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents	4
Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	5
Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links.....	6
Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive’s Budget Proposal.....	8
Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports	9
Section Two: The Executive’s Budget Proposal	10
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond.....	11
Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year.....	19
Comprehensiveness.....	28
The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring.....	35
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	38
Section Three: The Budget Process	47
Executive’s Formulation of the Budget	48
Legislative Approval of the Budget.....	53
Executive’s Implementation of the Budget.....	59
Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	71

Section One: The Availability of Budget Documents

Table 1. Budget Year of Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire

Please indicate the budget year of the document used to complete the questionnaire. If the document is not available to the public, please state, "Not Available."

Budget Documents Used in Completing the Questionnaire	
<i>As explained in the guide to the questionnaire, documents from a variety of fiscal years are referred to throughout the questionnaire. Please indicate below for which fiscal year responses to questions relating to each report or experience were based on.</i>	
	Budget Year Used
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Available
Budget Summary	2007
Executive's Budget Proposal	Not Available
Supporting Budget Documents	Not Available
Citizens Budget	Not Available
Enacted Budget	2007
In-Year Reports	2007
Mid-Year Report	Not Available
Year-End Report	2005
Audit Report	2005

Table 2. Key Budget Documents Used: Full Titles and Internet Links

Please provide the full title, date and Internet link for all documents to be cited in Sections 2 & 3.

If an Internet link is not available for the document, please indicate one of these three answers: “Not Produced,” “Produced but Not Available to the Public,” “Publicly Available, but Not on the Internet.”

Budget Document	Full Title, Date, and Internet Link
Pre-Budget Statement	Not Produced
Budget Summary	Socio-Economic Development Targets and Fiscal Plan for 2007 http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5275
Executive’s Budget Proposal	Produced, but Not Available to the Public
Budget Document One in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Produced, but Not Available to the Public
Budget Document Two in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Produced, but Not Available to the Public
Budget Document Three in Support of the Executive’s Budget Proposal	Produced, but Not Available to the Public
Citizens Budget	Not Produced
Enacted Budget	Annexes of Socio-Economic Data, 2006 Fiscal Performance and 2007 Fiscal Planning http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5292
In-Year Reports	Report on Socio Economic Development Results - May and Five Months, 2007 http://www.mpi.gov.vn/plans.aspx?lang=4&magoc=155
Mid-Year Review	Not Produced

Year-End Report	State Budget Disclosure of Final Accounts For 2005 http://www.mof.gov.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=5611 . September 23, 2007
Audit Report	Disclosure of State Audit Report 2005 http://www.kiemtoannn.gov.vn/ThongTinM.htm
Other Documents	Not Produced
Relevant Ministries & Departments	Not Produced

Table 3. Distribution of Documents Related to the Executive's Budget Proposal

DISTRIBUTION OF BUDGET DOCUMENTS						
<i>For the following reports, place "Yes" in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive's Budget Proposal				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes	Yes					Yes
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public		Yes		Yes	Yes	
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request						
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)			Yes			
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark "Yes" if yes, "No" if no, or "NA" if Not Available.</i>						
	Pre-budget	Executive's Budget				Citizens budget
		Main document	Budget summary*	Supporting Document 1	Supporting Document 2	
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance			No			
2. Advance notification of release is sent to users, media			No			
3. Released to public same day as official release to media			Yes			
4. Available on the Internet free of charge			Yes			
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution			Yes			
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution			No			
7. Readily available outside capital and/or big cities [†]			Yes			
8. Written in more than one language			No			
9. News conference is held to discuss release			No			

*A budget summary should be a stand-alone document, which could include a budget speech or a separately published executive summary.

[†]Mark "Yes" if access by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Table 4. Distribution of the Enacted Budget and Other Reports

DISTRIBUTION OF ENACTED BUDGET AND OTHER REPORTS					
<i>For the following reports, place a “Yes” in the appropriate row below to indicate if the report is:</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
A. Not produced, even for internal purposes			Yes		
B. Produced for internal purposes, but not available to the public					
C. Produced and available to the public, but only on request					
D. Produced and distributed to the public (for example, in libraries, posted on the Internet.)	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
<i>For budget reports that are produced and distributed to the public, what steps does the executive take to distribute these reports and to promote interest in them? For each characteristic, mark “Yes” if yes, “No” if no, or “NA” if Not Available.</i>					
	Enacted budget	In-year reports	Mid-year review	Year-end report	Audit report
1. The release date is known at least one month in advance	No	No		No	No
2. Advance notification of release sent to users, media	No	No		No	No
3. Released to public same day as official release to media	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
4. Available on the Internet free of charge	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
5. Free print copies available, limited distribution	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
6. Free print copies available, mass distribution	Yes	No		Yes	No
7. Readily available outside capital/big cities ⁺	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes
8. Written in more than one language	Yes	No		No	No
9. News conference is held to discuss release	No	No		No	Yes

⁺Mark “Yes” if access is available by mail order or by Internet, if Internet service is readily available outside the capital and/or big cities.

Section Two: The Executive's Budget Proposal

Notes on abbreviations:

BY = budget year (year for which the budget proposals are being made)

BY+1 = one year beyond the budget year

BY-1 = one year before the budget year

Please mark your answer by placing the appropriate letter in the box to the right of the question. For all answers marked "not applicable/other," please provide a brief explanation indicating either why the answer choices provided are not applicable or why another response would be more appropriate.

The Executive's Budget Proposal	
Estimates for the Budget Year and Beyond	
<p>1. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by administrative unit. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but some small units are not shown separately. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> In Vietnam, the draft budget proposal is not available to the public during the time that it is considered in the National Assembly. To reflect this practice, all the Questions 1-55 that cover information in the proposed budget have been marked as "d" (with the exception of certain questions that have only three possible response options. These questions have been marked as "b.")</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree that, in Vietnam, the executive's budget proposal is produced but not available to public.</p>	d
<p>2. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures are classified by functional classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. All expenditures are classified by functional classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function. No expenditures classified by function are presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>3. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>4. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level data are presented for all expenditures. b. Program-level data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Program-level data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No program-level data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>5. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented.</p> <p>b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>6. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative).</p> <p>b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs.</p> <p>c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs.</p> <p>d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>7. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of tax revenue amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are identified individually. d. No sources of tax revenue are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>8. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of non-tax revenue are identified individually. b. Sources of non-tax revenue amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are identified individually. c. Sources of non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenue are identified individually. d. No sources of non-tax revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>9. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented.</p> <p>b. No, multi-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented.</p> <p>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>10. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <p>a. Yes, multi-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax).</p> <p>b. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue.</p> <p>c. Yes, multi-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue.</p> <p>d. No, multi-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>11. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present data on the total government debt outstanding for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt both at the start of the budget year and at the end of the budget year (and thereby reflect the net borrowing requirement of the budget). b. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the end of the budget year. c. Yes, the data reflect the outstanding debt at the start of the budget year. d. No, data on the outstanding debt are not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>12. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present interest payments on the debt for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, interest payments on the debt are presented. b. No, interest payments on the debt are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>13. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, currency denomination of the debt, or whether it is domestic and external debt) for the budget year?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented.</p> <p>b. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>14. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based?</p> <p>a. Yes, an extensive discussion of the macroeconomic forecast is presented, and key assumptions (such as inflation, real GDP growth, unemployment rate, and interest rates) are stated explicitly.</p> <p>b. Yes, the macroeconomic forecast is discussed and most of the key assumptions are stated explicitly, but some details are excluded.</p> <p>c. Yes, there is some discussion of the macroeconomic forecast (and/or the presentation of key assumptions), but it lacks important details.</p> <p>d. No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>15. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget (including expenditures, revenues, and debt)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of the major macroeconomic assumptions, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>16. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>17. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how policy proposals in the budget, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policy proposals on revenues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the impact of policy proposals on revenues is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>Estimates for Years Prior to the Budget Year</p>	
<p>18. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1. b. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but some small units are not shown separately. c. Expenditures are classified by administrative unit for BY-1, but a significant number of units are not shown separately. d. No expenditures classified by administrative unit are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>19. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by functional classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by functional classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by function for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by function are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>20. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) that are classified by economic classification?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, and the categorization is compatible with international standards. b. All expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1, but the categorization is not compatible with international standards. c. Some, but not all, expenditures are classified by economic classification for BY-1. d. No expenditures classified by economic classification are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>21. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Program-level expenditure data are presented for all expenditures for BY-1. b. Program-level expenditure data are presented for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures for BY-1. c. Program-level expenditure data are presented, but for less than two-thirds of expenditures for BY-1. d. No program-level expenditure data are presented for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>22. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect six or more months of actual expenditure. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels, but reflect less than six months of actual expenditure. c. Some BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditure. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original enacted levels, or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>23. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of expenditure presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate expenditure are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>24. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for expenditure estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year expenditure estimates are presented for all individual programs, and for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented for one or more expenditure classification (such as functional, economic, or administrative), but only for some individual programs. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for a portion of one or more of the expenditure classifications (such as some functions, or some administrative units) and/or for only some individual programs. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate expenditure only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>25. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>26. Are the expenditure estimates for the years prior to the budget year adjusted, as needed, to be comparable with the budget-year estimates in terms of classification and presentation?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, prior-year data are always adjusted to be comparable to the budget year data. b. Yes, in most cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable. c. Yes, in some cases, prior-year data are adjusted to be comparable, but significant deviations between prior-year and budget-year classifications exist. d. No, prior-year data are not adjusted to be comparable, or no prior-year estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>27. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>28. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify the different sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of goods and services) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. b. Non-tax revenues amounting to at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenue for BY-1 are identified individually. c. Non-tax revenues amounting to less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues for BY-1 are identified individually. d. No non-tax revenues are identified individually for BY-1. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>29. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, how many months of actual data are reflected in the revenues estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates to reflect six or more months of actual revenue collections. b. All BY-1 estimates have been updated from the original estimates, but reflect less than six months of actual revenue collections. c. Some BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates to reflect actual revenue collections. d. The BY-1 estimates have not been updated from the original estimates or no BY-1 estimates are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>30. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, are estimates of the aggregate level of revenues presented for years that precede the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are presented. b. No, such prior-year estimates of aggregate revenue are not presented. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>

<p>31. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, is more detail than just the aggregate level presented for revenue estimates that cover years preceding the budget year by more than one year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, such prior-year revenue estimates are presented for individual sources of revenue, and by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax). b. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented by revenue classification (such as tax and non-tax), but only for some individual sources of revenue. c. Yes, such prior-year estimates are presented, but only for some individual sources of revenue. d. No, such prior-year estimates are presented for aggregate revenue only, or they are not presented at all. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>32. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>33. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the government debt for the year preceding the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information is presented on the level and composition of government debt for the year preceding the budget year. b. Yes, information on the level of debt is presented, but some important details about the composition of the debt are excluded. c. Yes, but only information on the level of debt is presented. d. No, information related to the government debt for BY-1 is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>34. In the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). b. Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3). c. Before BY-3. d. No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

Comprehensiveness	
<p>35. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key extra-budgetary funds, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on extra-budgetary funds is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>36. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on intergovernmental transfers?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on intergovernmental transfers is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key intergovernmental transfers, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on intergovernmental transfers is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>37. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on transfers to public corporations?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on transfers to public corporations is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key transfers to public corporations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on transfers to public corporations is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>38. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on quasi-fiscal activities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on quasi-fiscal activities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and, where possible, quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key quasi-fiscal activities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on quasi-fiscal activities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>39. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, a discussion of their purpose, and an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>40. Does the executive's budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on non-financial assets held by the government?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on non-financial assets is presented, including a listing of the assets, and (where possible) an estimate of their market value. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key information, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on non-financial assets is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>41. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on expenditure arrears?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on expenditure arrears is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key expenditure arrears, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on expenditure arrears is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>42. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities (such as government loan guarantees)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on contingent liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key contingent liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on contingent liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>43. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on future liabilities, such as civil service pensions?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on future liabilities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key future liabilities, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on future liabilities is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>44. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation provide details on the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All sources of donor assistance are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of donor assistance, are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of sources of donor assistance are identified individually. d. No sources of donor assistance are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>45. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year on tax expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on tax expenditures is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key tax expenditures, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on tax expenditures is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>46. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation identify all earmarked revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All earmarked revenues are identified individually. b. At least two-thirds of, but not all, earmarked revenues are identified individually. c. Less than two-thirds of earmarked revenues are identified individually. d. No earmarked revenues are identified individually. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>47. What percentage of expenditure in the budget year is dedicated to spending on secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. One percent or less of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.b. Three percent or less, but more than one percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.c. Eight percent or less, but more than three percent, of expenditure is dedicated to secret items.d. More than eight percent of expenditure is dedicated to secret items, or the percentage is not available to the public.e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
--	----------

The Budget Narrative & Performance Monitoring	
<p>48. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category), for the budget year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals, by administrative unit (or functional category) is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the link between major policy goals and the budget, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>49. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation explain how the proposed budget is linked to government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the major policy goals, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals over a multi-year period is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>50. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present non-financial data, such as the number of beneficiaries, for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Non-financial data are presented for all programs. b. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Non-financial data are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditure. d. No non-financial data are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>51. Are the non-financial data presented useful for assessing how an expenditure program is performing?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The non-financial data are very useful for assessing program performance. b. The non-financial data are mostly useful for assessing program performance. c. The non-financial data are somewhat useful for assessing program performance. d. No non-financial data are provided or they are not useful for assessing program performance. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>52. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation contain performance indicators for expenditure programs?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Performance indicators are presented for all programs. b. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures. c. Performance indicators are presented for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No performance indicators are presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>53. Are the performance indicators sufficiently well designed, such that one can assess whether there has been progress toward meeting policy goals?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. All performance indicators are well designed. b. Most performance indicators are well designed. c. Some performance indicators are well designed, but most are not. d. No programs have performance indicators, or they are not well designed. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>54. Are performance indicators used in conjunction with performance targets presented in the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation?</p> <p>a. All performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. b. Most performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. c. Some performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets, but most are not. d. No performance indicators are used in conjunction with performance targets. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>55. Does the executive’s budget or any supporting budget documentation present information on policies (both proposals and existing commitments) in at least the budget year that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations?</p> <p>a. Yes, extensive information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the impact of key policies intended to alleviate poverty, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on policies intended to alleviate poverty is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Additional Key Information for Budget Analysis & Monitoring	
<p><i>Please note that the questions in this section ask about information that is generally available to the public. The information need not be included in the executive’s budget proposal or supporting documents, but may be found in other documents issued by the executive.</i></p>	

56. Does the executive make available to the public a description of the tax rate or fee schedule for all revenue sources, including commercial projects involving the private sector?

- a. Yes, extensive information on tax rates, fees, royalties and other revenues sources is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates.
- b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting the rates and fees for major revenue sources, but some details are excluded.
- c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details.
- d. No, information is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

All information about all kinds of tax rates and fees and related guidelines could be found at the website of the General Taxation Office:

<http://www.gdt.gov.vn/index.jsp?sid=7&scr=1024&progid=22002&cateid=7>

Comment:

Information relating to tax rates and fees is also printed and sold widely at book stores throughout the country.

Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "Information on terms and conditions applicable to commercial projects entered into by government entities with private partners, such as oil and gas agreements, is available publicly, but not as part of the general GTO tax rate and fee information suggested. The information has been publicly available before September 2007. See for example

http://www.ccop.or.th/epf/vietnam/vietnam_terms.html giving details of the basic terms of petroleum contracts under the Petroleum Law 2000 (concessions, production sharing agreements, joint operating agreements, listing royalty tax rates for 'incentive projects' and 'other projects' of different size for oil and gas). This provides a general framework while the specifics of profit-sharing and financial contribution remain to be negotiated. Even though, as this source cites, that element of negotiability is normal for the petroleum industry, it suggests that "b" rather than "a" would be the appropriate response here."

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." The link that researchers cited does not work but we can find information on tax rates and fees and related guidelines in the website of the Ministry of Finance: www.mof.gov.vn. However, it is difficult to find information regarding revenue sources of commercial projects. Terms and conditions of oil, gas, or mining contracts are not available to the public.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "b," in light of both peer reviewers' comments.

b

<p>57. Does the executive make available to the public an analysis of the distribution of the tax burden?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed analysis of the distribution of the tax burden is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an analysis is presented, highlighting key aspects of the distribution, but some details are excluded. Yes, some analysis is presented, but it lacks important details. No analysis on the distribution of the tax burden is presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> In the official letter responding to researchers' questions dated 03/07/2007, the Vice Minister of the Ministry of Finance (MoF) informed that the ministry did analyze the distribution of tax burden. However this document cannot be found on the MoF website or in other publications.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>58. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from international financial institutions (IFI)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, information on conditions associated with IFI assistance is not presented. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Hanoi Core Statement on Aid Effectiveness has been posted on the website of the Ministry of Planning and Investment (http://oda.mpi.gov.vn/Home/ODASpecStory.aspx?zone=211&sz=316&id=60653). However, this only provides for a general agreement between the Vietnamese government and donor countries as well as IFIs.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The link cited does not work. In practice, the only news about the assistance statement is in the http://oda.mpi.gov.vn website and other e-papers without any explanation of conditions associated with assistance.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors choose answer “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	c

<p>59. Does the executive make available to the public an explanation of the conditions associated with assistance from donor countries?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is presented, including a narrative discussion and any quantitative targets related to both macro-economic conditionality and project-specific conditionality. b. Yes, information is presented, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information on conditions associated with donor country assistance is not presented. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Hanoi Core Statement on Aid Effectiveness has been posted on the website of the Ministry of Planning and Investment. (http://oda.mpi.gov.vn/Home/ODASpecStory.aspx?zone=211&sz=316&id=60653). However, this only provides general agreement between the Vietnamese government and donor countries as well as IFIs.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “c.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The link cited does not work. In practice, the only news about total amount of assistance is published in http://oda.mpi.gov.vn and other e-papers. Citizens can not find any explanation of conditions associated with assistance.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors choose answer “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------

<p>60. Does the executive make available to the public a summary that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it provides a summary that is very informative. b. Yes, it provides a summary that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the summary is not very informative. d. No, it does not provide a summary. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The Budget Summary for the 2007 budget, which for the first time was posted on the website of the Ministry of Finance, and printed in a book.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “b.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” The cited Budget Summary is part of enacted budget, not the budget proposal.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “b” consistent with the researcher’s response.</p>	b
<p>61. Does the executive publish a “citizens budget” or some non-technical presentation intended for a wide audience that describes the budget and its proposals?</p> <p>a. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is very informative. b. Yes, it publishes a citizens budget that is somewhat informative. c. Yes, but the citizens budget is not very informative. d. No, it does not publish a citizens budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> There is no citizens budget being produced in Vietnam.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>62. Does the executive make available to the public non-technical definitions of terms used in the budget and other budget-related documents (for instance, in a glossary)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, thorough definitions of budget terms are provided. b. Yes, definitions are provided, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some definitions are provided, but it lacks important details. d. No, definitions are not provided. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is a brief explanation on state budget; state revenue; state expenditure published in the Annual Statistical Yearbook.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> Sometimes, there are differences in using of terms between budget documents and other publications such as Statistical Yearbook.</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>63. Do citizens have the right <i>in law</i> to access government information, including budget information?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the right has been codified into law, and citizens are generally able in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is sometimes not possible for citizens in practice to obtain government information, including budget information. Yes, the right has been codified into law, but it is frequently or always impossible in practice to obtain access to government information, including budget information. No, the right to access government information has not been codified into law, or this right does not include access to budget information. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Right to information has been clearly stated in Article 69 of the Constitution of Vietnam. More detail on right to information has been promulgated in decree 79/2003/ND-CP dated 7 July 2003 of the Government of Vietnam. And on 20 April 2007, the government issued a new ordinance on Grassroots democracy which specifies the information that must be made available to the people. This shows the great commitment of the government on ensuring the right to information. However it is not easy for citizens to get access to information that not available to the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “b.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” In practice, it is very difficult and almost impossible for citizens to obtain government information except information published in websites and other publications.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>64. Are citizens able in practice to obtain financial information on expenditures for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it (for example, from a ministry or agency)?</p> <p>a. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</p> <p>b. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</p> <p>c. In practice, highly disaggregated information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</p> <p>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated expenditure information is available.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In practice, citizens can ask for financial information by coming or writing directly to the Ministry of Finance and/or its website. Citizens can also find the information in the Annual Statistical Yearbook.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree that the answer is “c” but with different reasons. Citizens cannot access the executive’s budget proposal so they do not know which individual programs and level of detail is presented. However, they can find some informative reports in websites of government agencies. These reports are produced without official connection to executives’ budget proposal. http://www.ubdt.gov.vn/modules.php?name=Doc&op=detaildoc&pid=381 or at http://baocao.demo.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=137&News=28&CatID=14.</p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

<p>65. Are citizens able in practice to obtain non-financial information related to expenditures (for example, number of beneficiaries, number of persons employed by the program, etc.) for individual programs in a format that is more highly disaggregated than that which appears in the executive’s budget proposal if they request it from a ministry or agency?</p> <p>a. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for all programs except those considered related to national security or military intelligence.</p> <p>b. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</p> <p>c. In practice, highly disaggregated non-financial information is available to the public for programs representing less than two-thirds of expenditures.</p> <p>d. In practice, no highly disaggregated non-financial expenditure information is available.</p> <p>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In practice, citizens can ask for non-financial information by coming or writing directly to the concerned ministries and or visiting their website. Citizens can also find the information in the Annual Statistical Yearbook.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree that the answer is “c” but with different reasons. Citizens cannot access the executive’s budget proposal so they do not know which individual programs and level of detail is presented. However, they can find some informative reports in websites of government agencies. These reports are produced without official connection to executives’ budget proposal. http://www.ubdt.gov.vn/modules.php?name=Doc&op=detaildoc&pid=381 or at http://baocao.demo.vn/Default.aspx?tabid=137&News=28&CatID=14.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

Section Three: The Budget Process

The Budget Process	
Executive's Formulation of the Budget	
<p>66. How far in advance of the release of the budget is the day of its release known?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The release date is set in permanent law. The executive announces the release date at least two months in advance. The executive announces the release date less than two months but more than two weeks in advance. The executive announces the release date two weeks or less before the release, or makes no announcement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive submits its proposal to the legislature in October so that budget will be discussed and approved at the year-end assembly of the National Assembly in November every year.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c
<p>67. Does the executive release to the public its timetable for preparation of the executive's budget proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the ministry of finance or what ever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public. Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded. Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details. No, a timetable is not issued to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The timetable for budget preparation is included in a circular issued by the Ministry of Finance in June every year.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b

<p>68. Does the executive adhere to its timetable for the preparation and release of the budget?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The executive adheres to the dates in its timetable. b. The executive adheres to most of the key dates in its timetable. c. The executive has difficulty adhering to most of the dates in its timetable. d. The executive does not adhere to the dates in its timetable, or it does not release to the public its timetable. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> A late issuance of the circular guiding the budget process is observed during the budget process of financial year 2007.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> There is no report on whether or not the executive sticks to the timetable. However, approving the budget is an important agenda of the National Assembly meeting in November every year and legislators are provided with budget proposals 10 days before this meeting. This suggests that executives must adhere to the timetable in order to submit budget proposals to legislators on time.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree with the researchers. The executive did adhere to most past of timetable in recent years.</p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

<p>69. Does the executive hold consultations with members of the legislature as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of legislators. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of legislators, but some key members are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few members of the legislature. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with members of the legislature as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive normally discusses budget priorities with the Standing Committee of the National Assembly. Then the Standing committee will release a resolution on budget priority and budget allocation.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree with the researcher that the answer is “b.” The roles of legislators in budgeting processes are now improving. There is Finance and Budget Committee of National Assembly who work with executives in determining budget priorities. The roles and list of members can be found at the website of National Assembly http://www.na.gov.vn/htx/Vietnamese/C1333/?cateid=1414. The members of this Committee come from various provinces and they always ask for budget priorities in favor of their local provinces.</p>	<p>b</p>
---	----------

<p>70. Does the executive hold consultations with the public as part of its process of determining budget priorities?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive holds extensive consultations with a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, the executive holds consultations with a range of constituencies, but some key constituencies are excluded. c. Yes, the executive holds very limited consultations, involving only a few constituencies. d. No, the executive does not typically consult with the public as part of the budget preparation process. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The executive normally holds consultations with representatives from mass organizations, such as the Fatherland Front, not with the general public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “c.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” Mass organizations such as the Fatherland Front in practice are not an appropriate proxy for the general public.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>71. When does the executive release a pre-budget statement to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least four months in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement at least two months (but less than four months) in advance of the start of the budget year. The executive releases a pre-budget statement, but it is released less than two months before the start of the budget year. The executive does not release a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> A pre-budget statement is not produced.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In fact in June every year the Prime Minister issues a Directive on socio-economic development plans and budget formation. However this document does not contain key elements of a Pre-budget Statement as mentioned in OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency document.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>72. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s macroeconomic and fiscal framework?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s fiscal and macroeconomic policy is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the fiscal and macroeconomic framework, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> A pre-budget statement is not produced.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>73. Does the pre-budget statement describe the government’s policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the government’s budget policies and priorities is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key aspects of the government’s budget policies and priorities, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or the executive does not release to the public a pre-budget statement. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> A pre-budget statement is not produced.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
Legislative Approval of the Budget	
<p>74. How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The legislature receives the budget at least three months before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget at least six weeks, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year. The legislature receives the budget less than six weeks before the start of the budget year. The legislature does not receive the budget before the start of the budget year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The year-end assembly of the National Assembly is in November and the legislature is provided with the budget proposal 10 days before the assembly.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The answer is appropriate. The last meeting of the year of National Assembly is held from the end of October to mid-November with an important agenda of this meeting being budget approval. http://www.na.gov.vn/htx/Vietnamese/C1396/C1745/C1781/?cateid=1792</p>	b

<p>75. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework presented in the budget in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, public hearings are held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and a wide range of constituencies. b. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony is heard from the executive branch and some constituencies. c. Yes, hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard, but no testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the macroeconomic and fiscal framework in which testimony from the executive branch and the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The discussion on macroeconomic and fiscal framework have been discussed among the committees of the National Assembly and the cabinet. However, only selected media are able to attend and there is normally a short news about the hearing is broadcasted on TV and or reported in newspapers.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>76. Do legislative committees hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the executive branch is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the executive branch is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> During the November assembly, hearings on the individual budgets are held in which representatives from executive branch explain their budgets. These hearings are normally live broadcasted on the national TV.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “c.” There are a limited number of hearings regarding the formulation of the budget.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “c” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	<p>C</p>
--	----------

<p>77. Does a legislative committee (or committees) hold public hearings on the individual budgets of central government administrative units (that is, ministries, departments, and agencies) in which testimony from the public is heard?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive public hearings are held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. b. Yes, hearings are held, covering key administrative units, in which testimony from the public is heard. c. Yes, a limited number of hearings are held in which testimony from the public is heard. d. No, public hearings are not held on the budgets of administrative units in which testimony from the public is heard. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> The hearing is only attended by representatives of mass organizations and media. An ordinary citizen cannot attend the hearing.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree with the researchers in this question. There is no speech of public or its proxy institutions regarding to the budget during the National Assembly meeting.</p>	d
<p>78. Do the legislative committees that hold public hearings release reports to the public on these hearings?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the committees release very informative reports, which include all written testimony presented at the hearings. b. Yes, the committees release reports, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, the committees release reports, but they are not very informative. d. No, the committees do not release reports or do not hold public hearings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> No report on the hearing is made available to the public.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>79. Is the legislature (or the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature) given full information for the budget year on the spending of all secret items relating to, for instance, national security and military intelligence?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the appropriate legislative committee or members of the legislature is provided extensive information on all spending on secret items, which includes detailed, line item descriptions of all expenditures. b. No, the legislature is provided information on spending on secret items, but some details are excluded, or some categories are presented in an aggregated manner, or the legislature is provided no information on secret items. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Spending on security and military is considered strictly confidential.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>80. Does the legislature have authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget presented by the executive?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. b. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, with some limitations. c. Yes, the legislature has authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget, but its authority is very limited. d. No, the legislature does not have any authority <i>in law</i> to amend the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The authority to amend the budget has been stated in point 6, article 15 of the State Budget Law 2002.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>81. What is the most detail provided in the appropriation (expenditure budget) approved by the legislature?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The approved budget includes program-level detail. The approved budget includes departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). The approved budget includes only departmental totals. The approved budget includes less information than departmental totals. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The budgets include the budgets of the ministries and provinces. They have been broken down into more detail such as spending on investment and development, spending on social economic development and spending on focus programs. They then are broken down in sub-headlines.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree with the researcher. The level of detail of 2007 enacted budget can be found this link http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5734&ItemID=47619</p>	<p>b</p>
--	----------

Executive's Implementation of the Budget	
<p>82. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every month. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least every quarter. In-year reports on actual expenditure are released at least semi-annually. In-year reports on actual expenditure are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year report is presented in the cabinet meeting every month and posted in the website of the Government (short version) and on the website of the Ministry of Planning and Investment (full version).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> While the short version of the in-year report is posted on the website of the government within next 4 weeks of next month, the full reports for July, August and September are not available on the website of the Ministry of Planning and Investment by end of October.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree with the researcher on this question. The detail financial data quarterly report can be found at http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=4912&ItemID=43052</p>	a

<p>83. What share of expenditure is covered by in-year reports on actual expenditure (organized by administrative unit, economic classification and/or function)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, in-year reports cover all expenditures. b. Yes, in-year reports cover at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, in-year reports cover less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year report reports the expenditures by economic classification only.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The financial data quarterly reports can be found at the link below with full details of expenditure up to the report date. http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=4912&ItemID=43052</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “c.” The document mentioned by the peer reviewer is entitled “<i>Estimates</i> Quarter I - 2007” and therefore does not provide actual data.</p>	<p>c</p>
---	----------

<p>84. What is the most detail provided in the in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by <i>administrative unit</i>?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain program-level detail. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain departmental totals and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit contain only departmental totals. The in-year reports on actual expenditures organized by administrative unit are not released to the public, not produced, or contain less information than departmental totals. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The in-year report does not report expenditure by administrative units.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The financial data quarterly report can be found at the link below. The data are organized by administrative units but contain only department totals. http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=4912&ItemID=43052</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries. The tables available at the link suggested by the peer reviewer do not present information by administrative unit, but only functional classification. Moreover the document mentioned by the peer reviewer is entitled “<i>Estimates</i> Quarter I - 2007” and therefore does not provide information on actuals.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>85. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date expenditure with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, comparisons are made for all expenditures. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds, but not all, of expenditures. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of expenditures. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The May report does not compare actual year-to-date expenditure with the original estimate for that period but it compares with the same period last year.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>86. How often does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are released at least every month. b. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least every quarter. c. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are released at least semi-annually. d. In-year reports on actual revenue collections by source of revenue are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation and/or comment:</u> The in-year report has been issued and made available to the public on monthly basis which reports actual revenue collections by sources.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> The financial data quarterly report can be found at the link below. http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=4912&ItemID=43052</p>	a

<p>87. What share of revenue is covered by the in-year reports on actual revenue collections?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of all sources of revenue. In-year reports cover the actual revenue collections of at least two-thirds of, but not all, sources of revenue. In-year reports cover actual revenue collections of less than two-thirds of revenue sources. In-year reports on actual revenue collections are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The report reports all actual revenue collections but not all sources of revenues (for instant borrowings).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “b.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “a.” The financial data quarterly report can be found at the link below with full detail of revenue up to report date. http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=4912&ItemID=43052</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries. In the document cited by the second peer reviewer revenues are indicated, but there is no specification of whether they are actual revenues or estimates. Moreover the title of the document is “<i>Estimates</i> Quarter I – 2007” No data on actuals is presented.</p>	b
--	---

<p>88. Do the in-year reports released to the public compare actual year-to-date revenue collections with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?</p> <p>a. Yes, comparisons are made for all revenue sources. b. Yes, comparisons are made for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue sources. c. Yes, but comparisons are made for less than two-thirds of revenue sources. d. No, comparisons are not made, or no in-year reports are released to the public. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The report compares actual revenue collection with the same period last year and with the whole year estimate but not compares with original estimate for that period.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>b</p>
<p>89. Does the executive release to the public in-year reports on actual borrowing?</p> <p>a. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every month. b. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least every quarter. c. Yes, in-year reports on actual borrowing are released at least semi-annually. d. No, in-year reports on actual borrowing are not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</p> <p><u>Citation:</u> The report does not mention about actual borrowing but foreign aid.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” The financial data quarterly report can be found at the link below with amount borrowing and repayment up to the report date. http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=4912&ItemID=43052</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “d.” Some information on borrowing is presented, but the title of the document (<i>Estimates</i> Quarter I - 2007) suggests that these are estimates and not actuals.</p>	<p>d</p>

<p>90. Do in-year reports released to the public on actual borrowing present information related to the composition of government debt (such as interest rates on the debt, maturity profile of the debt, and currency denomination of the debt) for the budget year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, extensive information related to the composition of government debt is presented. Yes, key additional information is presented, but some details are excluded. Yes, some additional information is presented, but it lacks important details. No, additional information related to the composition of government debt is not presented, or such in-year reports on borrowing are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No information on borrowing is reported in the In-Year Report.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>91. For in-year reports on actual expenditure released to the public by the executive, how much time typically elapses between the end of the reporting period and when the report is released (e.g., are quarterly reports released less than 4 weeks after the end of the quarter)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Reports are released 1 month or less after the end of the period. Reports are released 2 months or less (but more than 1 month) after the end of the period. Reports are released more than 2 months after the end of the period. In-year reports are not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The short version of the In-Year Report has been released to the public within a month after the end of the period. However for some periods (July, August) the full versions is released more than 2 months after the end of the period.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” On average, reports are released within two months.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	b

<p>92. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that discusses the changes in economic outlook since the budget was enacted?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes an extensive discussion of the economy that includes a revised forecast for the full fiscal year and its effects on the budget. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks some details. Yes, the mid-year review includes a discussion of the economy, but it lacks important details. No, the mid-year review does not include a discussion of the economy, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No Mid-Year Review is produced.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u> In fact there is a report on progress of the socio-economic development plan for June and six months of 2007. However, this report is not qualified as a mid-year report as it does not meet all criteria of a Mid-Year Review as stated in OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency.</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>93. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the mid-year review includes updated expenditure estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of expenditure, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. No, the mid-year review does not include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No Mid-Year Review is produced.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>94. What is the most detail provided in the mid-year review for expenditures?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The mid-year review includes program-level detail for expenditures. b. The mid-year review includes departmental totals (or functional totals) and some additional details (for instance, sub-department totals or major programs). c. The mid-year review includes only departmental totals (or functional totals). d. The mid-year review includes less information than departmental totals (or functional totals) for expenditures, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No Mid-Year Review is produced.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>95. Does the executive release to the public a mid-year review of the budget that includes updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated revenue estimates for the full fiscal year, providing extensive information on why estimates have changed from the original enacted levels. b. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but some details on why estimates have changed are not provided. c. Yes, the mid-year review includes updated estimates of revenue, but important details on why estimates have changed are not provided. d. No, the mid-year review does not include updated revenue estimates for the budget year, or the executive does not release a mid-year review of the budget. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No Mid-Year Review is produced.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

96. Does the executive seek input from the legislature when the executive shifts funds between administrative units (except when the amounts are below a certain *minimal* level specified in law or regulation)?

- a. Yes, the executive seeks approval from the legislature before shifting funds between administrative units.
- b. Yes, the executive gives prior notification to the legislature before shifting funds, giving the legislature an opportunity to block or modify the proposed adjustment.
- c. Yes, the executive seeks legislative approval, but only after the shift of funds has been implemented.
- d. No, the executive shifts funds between administrative units without seeking input from the legislature, or the amount allowed under the law or by regulation is significantly large enough to undermine public scrutiny and accountability (please describe arrangements below).
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

Article 49 of the State Budget Law 2002 and article 43 of the decree 60/2003/ND-CP dated 6 June 2003 stipulated that if the amendment of the budget "significantly affects the overall budget, government must get approval from the National Assembly." In case the amendment does not make significant changes in the overall budget, government can seek approval from the Standing Committee of the National Assembly then report to the National Assembly about the amendment at the next meeting.

Comment:

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "d," given the vagueness of what could constitute a 'significant' change, which is open to interpretation.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: I agree with the researchers.

Article 10 of the Decree 60/2003/ND-CP dated 6 June 2003 stipulates that the Prime Minister decides on the allocation planning of the budget and seeks the approval of the Standing Committee of the National Assembly before enacting such budget.

Article 43 of the same decree stipulates that: (i) in case of substantial movements of the budget compared to the allocated plan that requires adjustment of the overall budget, the government prepares the amendment and submit it to the National Assembly for its decision at the next meeting of the National Assembly, and (ii) in case of adjustment is needed for reasons of defense or security or other objective reasons without causing movements to the overall budget or its structure, the government prepares the amendment and submit to the Standing Committee of the National Assembly for its decision, then notify the National Assembly.

It is therefore possible for the government to propose shifts of funds between administrative units and seek approval only from the Standing Committee of the National Assembly if such shifts of funds do not cause large movements to the overall budget and its structure.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" in light of peer reviewer two's observations.

C

<p>97. During the past year, have there been credible reported instances in which the procurement of goods and services has not followed an open and competitive process in practice?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> There were no credible reported instances of procurement failing to follow an open and competitive process in practice during the past year. The procurement of goods and services frequently followed an open and competitive process in practice, but there were some reported instances of irregularities. The procurement of goods and service followed an open and competitive process in many instances, but there were significant reported examples of irregularities. No, the procurement process was not open and competitive in practice. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u></p> <p><u>Comment:</u> Recently, there were incidents of under-valuation of some state-owned enterprises which were in process of privatization (for example Intimex in Hanoi).</p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree with the researchers. There are many cases of violation of open and competitive biddings, auctions in practice, both in SOEs' (state-owned enterprises) equalization auctions and large government contracts such as Can Tho Bridge project, My Dinh stadium project, etc.</p>	c
<p>98. When does the legislature typically approve supplemental budgets?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are approved before the funds are expended, or the executive rarely proposes a supplemental budget (please specify). Supplemental budgets are approved after the funds are expended, or the executive implements supplemental budgets without ever receiving approval from the legislature (please specify). Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> If the supplemental budget is within the contingency level, the executives can expend then report to the National Assembly after that (as per point 1, article 9 of the State Budget Law 2002).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree with the researchers. In practice, the supplemental budgets usually approved by National Assembly in the meeting for End year report or in the meeting for next year budget.</p>	b

<p>99. In most years, how large are supplemental budget requests relative to the size of the original budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Supplemental budgets are generally equal to 2 percent or less of the original budget. Supplemental budgets are generally equal to more than 2 percent, but less than 5 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to more than 5 percent, but less than 10 percent, of the original budget. Supplemental budget are generally equal to 10 percent or more of the original budget, or insufficient information is available to the public regarding the amount of supplemental budgets. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> In 2005, total actual expenditure was 6% higher than budgeted.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c
<p>100. When does the legislature approve the expenditure of contingency funds or other funds for which no specific purpose was identified in the budget?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Expenditures are approved before the funds are expended, or contingency funds or other funds with no specific purposes are not included in the budget. Expenditures are approved after the funds are expended, but before the end of the fiscal year. Expenditures are approved after the end of the fiscal year, for example in the next budget. Such expenditure takes place without legislative approval. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 9 of the State Budget Law 2002 stipulated that the executive has the discretion to spend contingency funds then report to the Standing Committee of the National Assembly.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

Executive's Year-end Report and the Supreme Audit Institution	
<p>101. How long after the end of the budget year does the executive release to the public a year-end report that discusses the budget's actual outcome for the year?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The report is released six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. b. The report is released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. c. The report is released more than 12 months after the end of the fiscal year. d. The executive does not release a year-end report. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 67 of the State Budget Law 2002 stipulated that the National Assembly approves the year-end report no later than 18 months after the end of the budget year. In fact, the Year End Report 2005 was released to the public on 23 September 2007.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C

102. In the year-end report have the data on the actual outcomes been audited?

- a. Yes, all data on actual outcomes have been audited.
- b. At least two-thirds, but not all, of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.
- c. Less than two-thirds of the data on actual outcomes have been audited.
- d. None of the data on actual outcomes has been audited, or a year-end report is not released.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

In the official letter responding to researchers' questions dated 03/07/2007, the Vice Minister of the Ministry of Finance (MoF) informed that the Year End Report must be audited before it is approved by the National Assembly. In fact, the Audit Report 2006 (for year 2005) had been issued almost a month before the release of the 2005 Year End Report.

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: I agree with the researchers that an audit of the Year End Report as a whole does not necessitate a (performance) audit of every unit, and in fact most countries would only audit a small percentage of units in a given year; however, since the announcement for public auditing plans for Vietnam issued on 12/01/2007 by State Audit or (Mr. Vuong Dinh Hue) explained that the audit of the 2006 report on state budget collection would cover 54% of state budget collection, compared to 45% in the previous year (i.e. the 2005 Report under discussion here), it does not appear right to answer "a" to this question and "c" would be appropriate, (since 'actual outcomes' would include revenue and expenditure outcomes in this question).

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "c." In fact, SAI only audited less than half of total actual data in the two most recent audit reports.

Researcher's Response:

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c" to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.

C

<p>103. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is no explanation of the differences between actual expenditure and enacted budget in the Year End Report 2005.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> I agree that there are no explanations between Final account budget and enacted budget, found at http://www.mof.gov.vn/DefaultE.aspx?tabid=5740. So I agree with the researchers in all remaining answers regarding year-end reports.</p>	d
<p>104. What level of detail is the focus of the explanation of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures presented in the year-end report?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The explanation of the differences between the enacted expenditure levels and the actual outcome focuses on the program level. The explanation focuses on departmental totals (or functional totals) or some lower level of detail (but not the program level in all cases). The explanation focuses on a higher level of aggregation than departmental totals (or functional totals). No explanation of the differences is provided, or such a report is not released. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is no explanation of the differences between actual expenditure and enacted budget in Year End Report 2005.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>105. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is no explanation of the differences between actual expenditure and enacted budget.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>
<p>106. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is no explanation about the difference between the original macroeconomic forecast and actual outcome.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>d</p>

<p>107. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original estimates of non-financial data and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No explanation is provided.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>108. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the original performance indicators and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No explanation is provided.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d

<p>109. Does the year-end report explain the difference between the enacted level of funds intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, an extensive explanation of the differences is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, an explanation is presented, highlighting key differences, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some explanation is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, an explanation is not presented, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No explanation is provided.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>110. Does the year-end report present the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, extensive information on the actual outcome for extra-budgetary funds is presented, including both a narrative discussion and quantitative estimates. b. Yes, information is presented, highlighting key issues, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, some information is presented, but it lacks important details. d. No, information is not presented on extra-budgetary funds, or such a report is not released. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> There is information about extra-budgetary funds, but it lacks detail.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c
<p><i>The Independence and Performance of the Supreme Audit Institution</i></p>	

<p>111. How long after the end of the fiscal year are the final annual expenditures of national departments audited and (except for secret programs) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Final audited accounts are released to the public six months or less after the end of the fiscal year. Final audited accounts are released 12 months or less (but more than six months) after the end of the fiscal year. Final audit accounts are released more than 12 months, but within 24 months of the end of the fiscal year. Final audited accounts are not completed within 24 months after the end of the fiscal year or they are not released to the public. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The final audit report for 2005 was released in early September 2007.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C
<p>112. Two years after the completion of a fiscal year, what percentage of annual expenditures has been audited and (except for secret programs) the report(s) released to the public?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> All expenditures have been audited and the reports released to the public. Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditure have been audited. Expenditure representing less than two-thirds of expenditure have been audited. No expenditures have been audited, the reports have not been released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The first paragraph of the state audit report 2006 stated that the state audit office had audited 32 provinces, accounted for 48.7% provincial budget; 10 ministries, accounted for 6.8% of central budget.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	C

<p>113. Does the annual audit report(s) that is released to the public include an executive summary?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The annual audit report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content. b. No, the audit report(s) does not include an executive summary, or such reports are not released to the public, or was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The report had been released but no executive summary in the report.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	b
<p>114. Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before they are removed. b. No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature. c. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> Article 17 of State audit law stated that the General State Auditor is voted by the National Assembly. The National Assembly has the authority to terminate or remove the General State Auditor.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>115. Does the Supreme Audit Institution release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Yes, the SAI releases to the public audits of all extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, extra-budgetary funds. Yes, the SAI releases audits representing less than two-thirds of all extra-budgetary funds. No, the SAI does not release to the public audits of extra-budgetary funds, or it does not audit such funds, or such a report was released more than 24 months after the end of the fiscal year. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> No, extra-budgetary funds have not been audited.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>116. Beyond the established year-end attestation audits, does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have <i>the discretion in law</i> to undertake those audits it may wish to?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations. The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations. The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The Supreme Audit Institution has the discretion to undertake its audit as per the State Audit Law (articles 15, 16).</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “b.” According to Article 75 of State Audit Law (http://laws.dongnai.gov.vn/2001_to_2010/2005/200506/200506140014), SAI has to seek approval of the Standing Committee of the National Assembly before auditing.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “b” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	b

117. Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution?

- a. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Citation:

As per article 67 of the State Audit Law, the SAI proposes budget for its operation and submit to the National Assembly for approval as part of the government budget.

Comment:

Researcher's Response to this Question was "a."

Peer Reviewer One Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would I think be "c.," given the expansion of activities needed to fulfill the mandate under the governance reform agenda at the time.

Peer Reviewer Two Comment: A more appropriate response to this question would be "b." Article 67 of the State Audit Law stipulates that (i) the SAI propose a budget needed for its operations and request the government to submit to the National Assembly for its decision, and (ii) the management, issuance, and use of operational budget of the SAI are implemented in accordance with the law on state budget.

The SAI does not itself submit its budget proposal to the National Assembly but submitting the budget proposal is done by the executive. Besides, the SAI's budget is part of the state budget, which is determined by the executive. Therefore, the National Assembly does not independently decide on the SAI's budget.

Although the argument that the budget appears to be insufficient for its needs are intuitively valid, the law states that the SAI prepares the budget based on its needs to fulfill its mandate.

IBP Comment: IBP editors chose answer "c.," consistently with peer reviewer one's observation.

C

<p>118. Does the Supreme Audit Institution employ designated staff for undertaking audits of the central government agencies pertaining to the security sector (military, police, and intelligence services)?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. The SAI employs designated staff, and the staffing levels are broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate. b. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels are a cause of some constraints to the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. c. The SAI employs designated staff, but the staffing levels pose a significant constraint on the SAI in fulfilling its mandate. d. The SAI does not employ designated staff for auditing of the security sector, or does not undertake audits of the security sector. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The SAI employs staff as per plan approved by the National Assembly.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Researcher’s Response to this Question was “d.”</u></p> <p><u>Peer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Two Comment:</u> A more appropriate response to this question would be “d.” In practice, SAI doesn’t have designated staff to do audit on security sectors.</p> <p><u>IBP Comment:</u> IBP editors chose answer “d” to maintain consistency with the criteria used for selecting answers across countries.</p>	<p>d</p>
--	----------

<p>119. Does the Supreme Audit Institution maintain formal mechanisms of communication with the public to receive complaints and suggestions to assist it in determining its audit program (that is, to identify the agencies, programs, or projects it will audit)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received more than 100 communications from the public during the past year. b. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public, and received less than 100 but more than ten communications from the public during the past year. c. Yes, the SAI maintains mechanisms of communication with the public but it receives very little (less than ten) or no information from the public on potential subjects for audit. d. No, the SAI does not maintain any formal mechanisms of communication with the public. e. Not applicable. <p><u>Citation:</u> No formal mechanism of communication has been set up (by the SAI) to receive complaints and suggestions from the public.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>120. Does a committee of the legislature view and scrutinize the audit reports?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, all audit reports are scrutinized. b. Yes, most audit reports are scrutinized. c. Yes, some audit reports are scrutinized. d. No, audit reports are not scrutinized. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The audit reports are scrutinized by the Committee for Economic and Budget of the National Assembly.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	a

<p>121. Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings. b. Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings. c. Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings. d. No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings. e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> So far, there is no report from the executive on following up audit findings and recommendations.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	d
<p>122. Does either the Supreme Audit Institution or the legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Yes, a comprehensive report is released regularly that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations. b. Yes, a report is released, covering key audit recommendations, but some details are excluded. c. Yes, a report is released, but it lacks important details. d. No, a report is not produced or it is prepared for internal purposes only (please specify). e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> The audit report 2006 tracked actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations but not in detail.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	c

<p>123. Are audit reports of the annual accounts of the security sector (military, police, intelligence services) and other secret programs provided to the legislature (or relevant committee)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a. Yes, legislators are provided with detailed audit reports related to the security sector and other secret programs.b. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but some details are excluded.c. Yes, legislators are provided audit reports on secret items, but they lack important details.d. No, legislators are not provided audit reports on secret items, or secret programs are not audited (please specify).e. Not applicable/other (please comment). <p><u>Citation:</u> SAI conducted audits of some units/department under the Ministry of Defense and the Ministry of Public Security. But the reports provided to the legislature lack details.</p> <p><u>Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer One Comment:</u></p> <p><u>Peer Reviewer Two Comment:</u></p>	<p>C</p>
---	----------

Additional Comments:

Please use this section to add any additional comments.

Researcher Additional Comments:

- The budget processes in Vietnam are more transparent and open from year to year.
- It should be recognized that these processes in Vietnam are not fully the same as those in OECD countries. Therefore applying OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency may lead to the inaccuracy of the research results (for example Vietnam issues a document setting the budget priorities and guiding the budget processes. But this document is not considered as pre-budget statement as per OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency).

Peer Reviewer One Additional Comments:

I agree with the researchers' comments above in that the Vietnamese budget transparency process is clearly developing year by year; but the questionnaire relates to documents/ processes which are not the most recent. In the case of Vietnam, therefore, more change may be expected in the answers from year to year than in many countries.