

Open Budget Survey 2017

Questionnaire

Azerbaijan

January 2018

COUNTRY QUESTIONNAIRE: AZERBAIJAN

PBS-1: What is the fiscal year of the PBS evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2017

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: Initial draft budget is prepared by the Budget Department of MoF to be submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers. But this document is for internal use only, not publicly available. According to the Article 11, Clause 5 of the Budget System Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

Comments: Initial draft budget is prepared by the Budget Department of MoF to be submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers. But this document is for internal use only, not publicly available. According to the Article 11, Clause 5 of the Budget System Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

PBS-2: When is the PBS made available to the public?

- a. (100) At least four months in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature
- b. (67) At least two months, but less than four months, in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature
- c. (33) Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature
- d. (0) The PBS is not released to the public, or is released less than one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced to the legislature

Answer: d.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-3a: If the PBS is published, what is the date of publication of the PBS? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the PBS. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the Article 11, Clause 5 of the Budget System Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

PBS-4: If the PBS is published, what is the URL or weblink of the PBS? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-5: If the PBS is published, are the numerical data contained in the PBS available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: d.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-6a: If the PBS is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)

- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: d.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The Pre-budget Statement is putting on web cite of Ministry of Finance

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: According to the Article 11, Clause 5 of the Budget System Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

Researcher response: Initial draft budget can't be considered as a Pre-Budget Statement (PBS). This is a routine component of the beginning of the budget round, not PBS. Due to the IBP methodology PBS produces usually two months (plus, minus) before EBP submit to the Parliament, and consist of the key parametres of the forthcoming budget year. So, the mentioned doc. doesn't meet the PBS requirements (plans of forthcoming budget year, which should encourage public debates).

PBS-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question PBS-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the PBS was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question PBS-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: No practice PBS

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: N/A

Comments: N/A

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: According to the Article 11, clause 5 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

Comments: According to the Article 11, clause 5 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

Researcher response: Initial draft budget can't be considered as a Pre-Budget Statement (PBS). This is a routine component of the beginning of the budget round, not PBS. Due to the IBP methodology PBS produces usually two months (plus, minus) before EBP submit to the Parliament, and consist of the key parametres of the forthcoming budget year. So, the mentioned doc. doesn't meet the PBS requirements (plans of forthcoming budget year, which should encourage public debates). The answer is unchanged.

PBS-7: If the PBS is produced, please write the full title of the PBS. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer**Opinion:** Disagree**Suggested answer:** Initial draft of the state budget**Comments:** Initial draft of the state budget

Researcher response: Initial draft budget can't be considered as a Pre-Budget Statement (PBS). This is a routine component of the beginning of the budget round, not PBS. Due to the IBP methodology PBS produces usually two months (plus, minus) before EBP submit to the Parliament, and consist of the key parameters of the forthcoming budget year. So, the mentioned doc. doesn't meet the PBS requirements (plans of forthcoming budget year, which should encourage public debates). The answer is unchanged.

PBS-8: Is there a "citizens version" of the PBS?**a.** Yes**b.** No**Answer:** b.**Sources:** n/a**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**EBP-1a:** What is the fiscal year of the EBP evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."**Answer:** FY 2017

Sources: Draft law on state budget of 2017 Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan Original: 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında qanun layihəsi 2017-ci il dövlət və icmal büdcələrinin layihələrinin təqdimatı <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)

Peer Reviewer**Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**EBP-1b:** When is the EBP submitted to the legislature for consideration? Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016.**Answer:** 15 November 2016

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>) The web site of the Ministry of Finance

Peer Reviewer**Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree with Comments

Comments: This is the publication date, so it seems some days before the documents were submitted to the legislature. According to the Article 13 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan, late submission has occurred: Draft law on the state budget of the next year, alongside with other documents enclosed to it, should be submitted to the discussion and approval of the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan not later than the October 15 of the current year in accordance with the provision 2 of the article 109 of the Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The document is published within the timeframe accepted by OBS methodology. According to the Article 14 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: The draft law on the state budget of the next budget year is published at press within 10 days of submitting to the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan in concert with the documents specified in the provisions 12.1.1 and 12.1.10 of this Law.

Researcher response: The usual practice is EBP submit to the Parliament occurs timely, within IBP requirement frame. However, in 2016 the EBP was submitted too late, on November 16. The reason is the initial budget proposal, which was even put in the Ministry of Finance website was recall/revised and put the new version of it later, on November 16. No other evidence to approve the proposal submit to the legislatures earlier. So, no changes in my answer.

IBP comment: The article found at the following link (<http://en.apa.az/azerbaijan-politics/domestic-news/azerbaija...> (<http://en.apa.az/azerbaijan-politics/domestic-news/azerbaijan-s-2017-budget-package-submitted-to-parliament.html>)) indicates that the budget was submitted to the legislature for consideration on 15 November 2016. Therefore, the researcher's response is revised from 16 November 2016 to 15 November 2016.

EBP-2: When is the EBP made available to the public?

- a. (100) At least three months in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- b. (67) At least two months, but less than three months, in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- c. (33) Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- d. (0) The EBP is not released to the public, or is released after the budget has been approved by the legislature

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The public version of EBP is 54 pages' summary of the 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan and published in 16 November 2016.

EBP-3a: If the EBP is published, what is the date of publication of the EBP? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a." In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their date of publication.

Answer: 16 November 2016

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The public version of EBP is 54 pages' summary of the 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan and called the Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan is a detailed document consisting of 1600 pages, but it is not publicly available.

EBP-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EBP. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>) The official web site of the Ministry of Finance

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: The document is published within the timeframe accepted by OBS methodology. The date of publication is determined according to the Article 14 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: The draft law on the state budget of the next budget year is published at press within 10 days of submitting to the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan in concert with the documents specified in the provisions 12.1.1 and 12.1.10 of this Law.

Comments: The document is published within the timeframe accepted by OBS methodology. The date of publication is determined according to the Article 14 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: The draft law on the state budget of the next budget year is published at press within 10 days of submitting to the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan in concert with the documents specified in the provisions 12.1.1 and 12.1.10 of this Law.

Researcher response: no changes

IBP comment: IBP notes that the government reviewer's comments are well-received. However, the OBS methodology strictly looks at the 'online' date of publication, which is mentioned on the website as 16 Nov 2016.

EBP-4: If the EBP is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EBP? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a." In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their URL or weblink.

Answer: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: This link is given for the public version of EBP, which is 54 pages' summary of the 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan and called the Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan is a detailed document consisting of 1600 pages, but it is not publicly available.

EBP-5: If the EBP is published, are the numerical data contained in the EBP or its supporting documents available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: no machine readable format

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-6a: If the EBP is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/en/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/en/node/1988>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The public version of EBP is 54 pages' summary of the 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan and called the Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan is a detailed document consisting of 1600 pages, but it is not publicly available.

EBP-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EBP-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the EBP was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question

EBP-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-7: If the EBP is produced, please write the full title of the EBP. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” If there are any supporting documents to the EBP, please enter their full titles in the comment box below.

Answer: Draft law on state budget of 2017 Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2016 of the Republic of Azerbaijan Original: 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında qanun layihəsi 2017-cı ilin dövlət və icmal büdcələrinin layihələrinin təqdimatı

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the Article 13 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan, the following documents are included into the budget package: 12.1. Relevant executive power body submits the following documents related with the state budget of the next budget year to the Milli Majlis (Parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 12.1.1. Draft law on the state budget of the next budget year and its interpretation; 12.1.2. Social and economic development conception and forecast indicators of the Republic of Azerbaijan for the next year and following three years; 12.1.3. Key areas of budget-tax policy; 12.1.4. Targeted programs envisaged to be financed at the expense of the state budget funds; 12.1.5. Draft of incomes and expenditures at the level of the paragraphs of budget income classification and functional, economic and administrative classifications; 12.1.6. Data on public debt and other liabilities with the state guarantee; 12.1.7. Draft of the summary budget of the next year at the level of paragraphs pursuant to the functional, economic and administrative classification; 12.1.8. State investment program draft encompassing significant investment projects in compliance with the drafts of the state budget and summary budget for the next year, the summary budgets for the following three years; 12.1.9. Consolidated financial statement in the Republic of Azerbaijan; 12.1.10. Draft laws on the budgets of extra-budgetary state funds for the next budget year upon the approval of the Milli Majlis of the Republic of Azerbaijan in accordance with law; 12.1.11. Comparison of incomes and expenditures of the next year with the outcomes actual in the previous year and expected in the current year (by the classification incomes, at the level of the paragraphs of the functional, economic and administrative classification of expenditures); 12.1.12. Data on the expected execution of the summary budget of the current year; 12.1.13. Consolidated report on extra-budgetary transactions; 12.1.14. Statement of financing sources of state budget deficit actual in the previous year and expected in the current year; 12.1.15. Other documents specified by relevant executive power body.

EBP-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the EBP?

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-1a: What is the fiscal year of the EB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

Answer: FY 2017

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: FY 2017 is available as well.

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer. The FY -2017. 28.12.2016. Ministry of Finance <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> Therefore (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>Therefore), the answer is revised from FY 2016 to FY 2017.

EB-1b: When was the EB approved (enacted) by the legislature? Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016.

Answer: 16 December 2016

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: For FY 2017 The Milli Majlis (parliament) of Azerbaijan enacted this document in 16 December 2016. <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2003> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2003>) The president of Azerbaijan signed the document in 27 December 2016 <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>)

Researcher response: I agree with te reviewer. FY-201728.12.2016. Ministry of Finance <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>Therefore (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>Therefore), the answer is revised from 08 December 2015 to 28 December 2016.

EB-2: When is the EB made available to the public?

- a. (100) Two weeks or less after the budget has been enacted
- b. (67) Between two weeks and six weeks after the budget has been enacted
- c. (33) More than six weeks, but less than three months, after the budget has been enacted
- d. (0) The EB is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the budget has been enacted

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://president.az/articles/17078> (<http://president.az/articles/17078>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: For FY 2017, the budget was approved on 16 December 2016 and published on 28 December 2016. Ministry of Finance <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>)

EB-3a: If the EB is published, what is the date of publication of the EB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a." Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Answer: 28 December 2016

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: 28 December 2016 for FY 2017 <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>) The document is published within the timeframe accepted by OBS methodology. According to the Article 16, clause 3 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: The state budget of the next year is published at press after being approved and signed in the manner specified with law.

Researcher response: Agree.28.12.2016. Ministry of Finance<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>The (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>) answer is revised from 08 December 2015 to 28 December 2016 to reflect the publication date of the FY 2017 enacted budget, rather than the FY 2016 enacted budget.

EB-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EB. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: The date of publication on the Finance Ministry's website was determined from the date stamp on the Finance Ministry's website: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866>) the official web site of the Ministry of Finance

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: According to the Article 16, clause 3 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: The state budget of the next year is published at press after being approved and signed in the manner specified with law.

Comments: According to the Article 16, clause 3 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: The state budget of the next year is published at press after being approved and signed in the manner specified with law.

Researcher response: 28.12. 2016. Ministry of Finance<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>The (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>) answer has been revised to refer to the FY 2017 enacted budget, rather than the FY 2016 enacted budget.

EB-4: If the EB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866>) the official web site of the Ministry of Finance

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_Qanun_budce_2017_... (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_Qanun_budce_2017_.pdf)

Researcher response: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017"Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu"Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017"Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikası Qanununun tətbiqi barədə" Azərbaycan Respublikası Prezidentinin Fərmanı<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>'The (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>) answer has been revised to refer to the FY 2017 enacted budget.

EB-5: If the EB is published, are the numerical data contained in the EB available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: no machine readable format

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-6a: If the EB is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EB-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the EB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EB-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-7: If the EB is produced, please write the full title of the EB. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017 " (Azeri version: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017 - ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1866>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017 " (Azeri version: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017 - ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu)

Researcher response: The answer has been revised to refer to the enacted budget for FY 2017

EB-8: Is there a "citizens version" of the EB?

- a. Yes
- b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2016" Original: Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2016-cı il dövlət və icmal büdcələri üzrə Vətəndaşın büdcə bələdçisi <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2017" (Azeri version: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017 - ci il üçün dövlət və icmal büdcələrini özündə birləşdirən "Vətəndaşın büdcə bələdçisi" kitabı) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2019> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2019>)

IBP comment: IBP notes that the Citizens Budget for FY 2016, assessed in the OBS 2017, was published late.

CB-1: What is the fiscal year of the CB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY." If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB please indicate the document the CB simplifies/refers to, and the fiscal year.

Answer: FY 2016

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: FY 2017 <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2019> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2019>)

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer. the CB -2017 was published in the Ministry of Finance website timely - 10.02.2017 "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2017" Original: Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət və icmal büdcələri üzrə Vətəndaşın büdcə bələdçisi <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2019> <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/site...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2019> <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Binder1.compressed.protected.pdf> Thus), while Government is correct in assessing that the Citizens Budget for 2017 was published in a timely manner, it was published after the OBS 2017 research cut-off date of December 31st 2016. For this reason the Citizens Budget for 2016 is being considered.

CB-2a: For the fiscal year indicated above, what is the public availability status of the CB. If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this questions for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their public availability status.

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: a.

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: e.

Comments: It is available to public via official website of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer. Since 2012, when Government started to publish CB, it produces timely. Just 2016 was exceptional case. "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2017" Original: Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət və icmal büdcələri üzrə Vətəndaşın büdcə bələdçisi 10.02.2017 <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2019> <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/site...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2019> <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Binder1.compressed.protected.pdf>)

IBP comment: IBP also notes the following: (1) The Citizens Budget for 2016 is being considered as explained in CB-1. Therefore, the score will remain unchanged. We also acknowledge that the citizens budget for FY 2017 was published on time.

CB-2b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question CB-2a above, please specify how you determined whether the CB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question CB-2a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP comment: See researcher’s response to CB-1 and CB-2a.

CB-3a: If the CB is published, what is the date of publication of the CB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.” If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their dates of publication.

Answer: 11 March 2016

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: 10 February 2017 for FY 2017 The document is published within the timeframe accepted by OBS methodology.

IBP comment: See researcher’s response to CB-1 and CB-2a.

CB-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the CB. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: This document has been published since 2014, but the date of publication is not defined in law.

Comments: This document has been published since 2014, but the date of publication is not defined in law.

IBP comment: See researcher’s response to CB-1 and CB-2a.

CB-4: If the CB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the CB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their URL or weblink.

Answer: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>) the official web site of the Ministry of Finance

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2019> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2019>)

IBP comment: See researcher's response to CB-1 and CB-2a.

CB-5: If the CB is produced, please write the full title of the CB. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a." If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB, indicate the document the CB refers to and, next to it, its full title.

Answer: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2016" Original: Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2016-cı il dövlət və icmal büdcələri üzrə Vətəndaşın büdcə bələdçisi

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/PEFA_ENG%20FINAL.p...

(http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/PEFA_ENG%20FINAL.protected.pdf) See also Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability Performance report: Repeat assessment

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: For FY 2017: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2017" (Azeri version: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017 - ci il üçün dövlət və icmal büdcələrini özündə birləşdirən "Vətəndaşın büdcə bələdçisi" kitabı)

IBP comment: See researcher's response to CB-1 and CB-2a.

CB-6: If the CB is produced, please indicate which budget document it corresponds to. If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and which budget documents they simplify.

Answer: Enacted budget 2016

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1905>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The enacted Budget of 2017

IBP comment: See researcher's response to CB-1 and CB-2a.

IYRs-1: What is the fiscal year of the IYRs evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2016

Sources: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-2: When are the IYRs made available to the public?

- a. (100) At least every month, and within one month of the period covered
- b. (67) At least every quarter, and within one month of the period covered
- c. (33) At least every quarter, and within three months of the period covered
- d. (0) The IYRs are not released to the public, or are released more than three months after the period covered

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: Operative information on the state budget execution for 1st quarter of 2016 Original: 2016-cı ilin birinci rübündə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915>) Operative information on the state budget execution for 6 months of 2016 Original: 2016-cı ilin altı ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949>) Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016 Original: 2016-cı ilin doqquz ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-3a: If the IYRs are published, what are the dates of publication of the IYRs? Specifically: if quarterly In-Year Reports are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least three of the last four IYRs that were publicly available. If monthly IYRs are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least seven of the last 12 IYRs that were publicly available. Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer: 14 October 2016

Sources: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: 14.10.2016

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: 05 April 2016 "Operative information on the state budget execution for 1st quarter of 2016" (Azeri version: "2016-cı ilin 1-ci rübündə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat") <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915>) 18 July 2016 Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for the 6 months of 2016 (Azeri version: "2016-cı ilin 6 ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat") <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949>) 14 October 2016 Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for the 9 months of 2016 (Azeri version: "2016-cı ilin 9 ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat") <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>) 25 January 2017 Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for 2016 (Azeri version: "2016-cı ilin dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat") <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010>)

Comments: 05 April 2016 "Operative information on the state budget execution for 1st quarter of 2016" (Azeri version: "2016-cı ilin 1-ci rübündə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat") <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915>) 18 July 2016 Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for the 6 months of 2016 (Azeri version: "2016-cı ilin 6 ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat") <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949>) 14 October 2016 Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for the 9 months of 2016 (Azeri version: "2016-cı ilin 9 ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat") <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>) 25 January 2017 Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for 2016 (Azeri version: "2016-cı ilin dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat") <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010>)

IYRs-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the IYRs. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Sources: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>) The official web site of the Ministry of Finance

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: According to the Article 20 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 20.2. Quarterly report on the execution of the state budget is submitted to the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan, relevant executive power bodies and the Chamber of Accounts of Azerbaijan by the end of the first month of the next quarter. The report is published at press. Quarterly report reflects comparative analysis of the execution of incomes and expenditures alongside with approved numbers. In case differences occur between actual indicators and approved figures in financing of expenditures, the report also covers explanation on the differences and data on projects of national significance.

Comments: According to the Article 20 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 20.2. Quarterly report on the execution of the state budget is submitted to the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan, relevant executive power bodies and the Chamber of Accounts of Azerbaijan by the end of the first month of the next quarter. The report is published at press. Quarterly report reflects comparative analysis of the execution of incomes and expenditures alongside with approved numbers. In case differences occur between actual indicators and approved figures in financing of expenditures, the report also covers explanation on the differences and data on projects of national significance.

IYRs-4: If the IYRs are published, what is the URL or weblink of the IYRs? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” Researchers should provide the weblink to the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the weblinks to older IYRs.

Answer: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Sources: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010>) These documents are published within the timeframe accepted by the OBS methodology.

Comments: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010>) These documents are published within the timeframe accepted by the OBS methodology.

IYRs-5: If the IYRs are published, are the numerical data contained in the IYRs available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-6a: If the IYRs are not publicly available, are they still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer**Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree with Comments

Comments: Monthly reports are published for internal purposes only. According to the Article 20 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 20.1. Monthly report on the execution of the state budget is prepared and submitted to relevant executive power bodies and the Chamber of Accounts of Azerbaijan by 25th of the month after the reporting month. The execution of the state budget is described cumulatively on the basis of functional and economic classification.

IYRs-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question IYRs-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the IYRs were produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question IYRs-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a**Sources:** n/a**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree

IYRs-7: If the IYRs are produced, please write the full title of the IYRs. If In-Year Reports are not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” Researchers should provide the full title of the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the full titles of older IYRs.

Answer: Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016 Original: 2016-cı ilin doqquz ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat

Sources: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Peer Reviewer**Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Disagree

Suggested answer: “Operative information on the state budget execution for 1st quarter of 2016” (Azeri version: “2016-cı ilin 1-ci rübündə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat”) Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for the 6 months of 2016 (Azeri version: “2016-cı ilin 6 ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat”) Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for the 9 months of 2016 (Azeri version: “2016-cı ilin 9 ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat”) Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for 2016 (Azeri version: “2016-cı ilin dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat”)

Comments: “Operative information on the state budget execution for 1st quarter of 2016” (Azeri version: “2016-cı ilin 1-ci rübündə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat”) Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for the 6 months of 2016 (Azeri version: “2016-cı ilin 6 ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat”) Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for the 9 months of 2016 (Azeri version: “2016-cı ilin 9 ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat”) Information (operative) about execution of the state budget for 2016 (Azeri version: “2016-cı ilin dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat”)

IYRs-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the IYRs?

a. Yes**b.** No**Answer:** b.**Sources:** no practice**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree

MYR-1: What is the fiscal year of the MYR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-2: When is the MYR made available to the public?

- a. (100) Six weeks or less after the midpoint
- b. (67) Nine weeks or less, but more than six weeks, after the midpoint
- c. (33) More than nine weeks, but less than three months, after the midpoint
- d. (0) The MYR is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the midpoint

Answer: d.

Sources: no practice

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-3a: If the MYR is published, what is the date of publication of the MYR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the MYR. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-4: If the MYR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the MYR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-5: If the MYR is published, are the numerical data contained in the MYR available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: d.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-6a: If the MYR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: d.

Sources: no practice

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question MYR-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the MYR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question MYR-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: no practice

Sources: no practice

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-7: If the MYR is produced, please write the full title of the MYR. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-8: Is there a "citizens version" of the MYR?

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-1: What is the fiscal year of the YER evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2015

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP comment: IBP accepts the following two documents as the YER for FY 2015: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft) (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...) (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>) (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)

YER-2: When is the YER made available to the public?

a. (100) Six months or less after the end of the budget year

b. (67) Nine months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year

c. (33) More than nine months, but within 12 months, after the end of the budget year

d. (0) The YER is not released to the public, or is released more than 12 months after the end of the budget year

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Peer Reviewer**Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the Article 20 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 20.3. Annual report on the execution of the state budget and related draft laws are submitted to the approval of the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan by relevant executive power body not later than the May 15 of the next year. The report includes information on public debts received during the year, including government securities issued and government guarantees, as well as use of funds of the Reserve Fund of the state budget and the Reserve Fund of the president of the Republic of Azerbaijan during the year. 20.4. Report on the execution of the state budget is prepared by agencies ensuring the execution of the state budget incomes on quarterly, monthly and cumulative statements of incomes classification in the forms specified by relevant executive power body. 20.5. The Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan gives opinion on reports on the execution of the state budget and related draft laws in accordance with its charter. 20.6. The Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan discusses documents submitted and approves the law on the execution of the state budget of relevant target year (including the following key indicators): 20.6.1. Total amount of the execution of incomes and expenditures correspondingly; 20.6.2. Amount of the execution of revenue sources of incomes; 20.6.3. Gain or loss as a result of changes in the rate of manat compared to foreign currencies; 20.6.4. Execution of expenditure amounts in the section and auxiliary section level, based on functional and administrative classification; 20.6.5. Amount of the execution of expenditures at the level of paragraphs pursuant to functional classification; 20.6.6. Amount of the highest verge of the budget deficit and profit; 20.6.7. Balance of the state budget in the unified treasury account for the January 1 of the current year. 20.7. Quarterly and annual reports on the execution of summary budget (including incomes and expenditures of the budget, amount of the public debt, loans and other data) are published at press. The answer to this question was considered to be the operative report for the year-end on the implementation of the state budget, but this is also a summary for public. Detailed report on budget execution was made available to public for 2013. This kind of detailed report is prepared for internal purposes only and to be sent to the Cabinet. From the link below you can access that report. <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/6218-izahat-2014.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/6218-izahat-2014.pdf>) 2015 Budget Execution Law is considered to be the base for these questions.

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer, and my response is revised to "a".

IBP comment: IBP accepts answer choice "a" as the "The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)) were published in May 2016

YER-3a: If the YER is published, what is the date of publication of the YER? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer: 19 May 2016**Sources:** <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree with Comments

Comments: 2015 Budget Execution law was published in 31 May 2016. <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/33023> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/33023>)

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: IBP has revised the researcher's response from January 21, 2016 to May 19, 2016. IBP accepts the Year-end Report based on the following documents: "The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)) were published in May 2016

YER-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the YER. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929>)**Sources:** <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>) the official web site of the Ministry of Finance**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer**

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 20.7. Quarterly and annual reports on the execution of summary budget (including incomes and expenditures of the budget, amount of the public debt, loans and other data) are published at press.

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, IBP has revised the researcher's response from "<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>" (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)" to "<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929>" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929>"). IBP accepts the following documents as the YER:"The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...) (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>) (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>) were published in May 2016

YER-4: If the YER is published, what is the URL or weblink of the YER? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929>)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: 2015 Budget Execution law: <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/33023> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/33023>)

Researcher response: Information (operative) on the execution of the state budget for the 2016Original: 2016-cı il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2010> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2010>) <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/44> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/44>) http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/ICRA-2016-SON_FINAL.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/ICRA-2016-SON_FINAL.pdf)

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, IBP has revised the researcher's response from "<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>" (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)" to "<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929>" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929>)".

YER-5: If the YER is published, are the numerical data contained in the YER available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: no practice

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-6a: If the YER is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: 2015 Budget Execution law: <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/33023> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/33023>)

Researcher response: no necessity to change. The document is publicly available

IBP comment: IBP accepts the following two documents as the YER: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...) (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>) (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)) were published in May 2016

YER-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question YER-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the YER was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question YER-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP comment: n/a

YER-7: If the YER is produced, please write the full title of the YER. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...) (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>) (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>))

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: 2015 Budget Execution law of the Republic of Azerbaijan

IBP comment: n/a

YER-8: Is there a "citizens version" of the YER?

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: no practice

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-1: What is the fiscal year of the AR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2015

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/>) http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf) 17.05.2016 <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/432> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/432>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-2: When is the AR made available to the public?

- a. (100) Six months or less after the end of the budget year
- b. (67) 12 months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year
- c. (33) More than 12 months, but within 18 months, after the end of the budget year
- d. (0) Does not release to the public, or is released more than 18 months after the end of the budget year

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44>) this link in sources section is for 2014 budget execution report.

Researcher response: Please see the update SAI report, produced timely: Audit Report on the Law 'On execution of state budget for 2016 of the Republic of Azerbaijan' and annual report on state budget execution. "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2016-cı il dövlət büdcəsinin icrası haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanun layihəsinə və dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına dair illik hesabatla Azərbaycan Respublikası Hesablama Palatasının Rəyi <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/44> <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/ICRA-201...> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/44>) http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/ICRA-2016-SON_FINAL.pdf31) May 2017

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, IBP confirms that the FY 2015 Audit Report is assessed. This report is published online on July 22, 2016, according to a javascript command. Therefore, the answer is revised from "a" to "b". This link for the report is: http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf)

AR-3a: If the AR is published, what is the date of publication of the AR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer: 22 July 2016

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The date given is for 2014 audit report. 31 May 2016 for 2015 audit report. <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/442> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/442>) This date is accepted by the OBS methodology.

Researcher response: Chamber of Accounts website: <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/4431> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/4431>) May 2017

IBP comment: The link provided by the government reviewer discusses when the audit report was discussed in parliament and when the speech of the Chairman of Accounts was published. The OBS, however, assesses the date the Audit Report was published online. The date of publication of the FY 2015 Audit Report is July 22, 2016. The researcher's response has been updated to reflect the date of publication for the FY 2015 audit report, rather than the FY 2014 audit report.

AR-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the AR. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/442> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/442>)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/>) The official web site of the Chamber of Accounts

Comments: Researcher: Date of publication: 17.05.2016 <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/432> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/432>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the Budget system law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 20.3. Annual report on the execution of the state budget and related draft laws are submitted to the approval of the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan by relevant executive power body not later than the May 15 of the next year. The report includes information on public debts received during the year, including government securities issued and government guarantees, as well as use of funds of the Reserve Fund of the state budget and the Reserve Fund of the president of the Republic of Azerbaijan during the year. According to “The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on approval of Internal Regulation of the Chamber of Accounts”: According to Article 17, Clause 1 of “The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on approval of Internal Regulation of the Chamber of Accounts”: 17.1. Annual reports on the implementation of the state budget and related draft laws are given to the Chamber of Accounts for review and feedback by the National Assembly of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The Chairman of the National Assembly of the Republic of Azerbaijan determines the date of the report submission. Taking into account that the spring session of the Milli Majlis (parliament) continues until 31st of May, Chamber of Accounts should post the report on the official website until this date.

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: The date of publication for the FY 2015 audit report was confirmed using a javascript command. The date of publication is July 22, 2016.

AR-4: If the AR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the AR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: 2015 Audit report: <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41>) 2014 Audit report: <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/35> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/35>)

IBP comment: The researcher's response has been updated to refer to the FY 2015 audit.

AR-5: If the AR is published, are the numerical data contained in the AR available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: no machine readable format

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-6a: If the AR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question AR-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the AR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question AR-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-7: If the AR is produced, please write the full title of the AR. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: Audit Report on the draft Law ‘On execution of state budget for 2015 of the Republic of Azerbaijan’ and annual report on state budget execution. “Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2015-ci il dövlət büdcəsinin icrası haqqında” Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanun layihəsinə və dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına dair illik hesabatı Azərbaycan Respublikası Hesablama Palatasının Rəyi

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/44>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Audit Report on the draft Law ‘On execution of state budget for 2015 of the Republic of Azerbaijan’ and annual report on state budget execution. “Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2015-ci il dövlət büdcəsinin icrası haqqında” Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanun layihəsinə və dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına dair illik hesabatı Azərbaycan Respublikası Hesablama Palatasının Rəyi

IBP comment: The researcher’s response has been updated to refer to the FY 2015 audit report.

AR-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the AR?

- a. Yes
- b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: no practice

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1a: Are there one or more websites or web portals for disseminating government fiscal information? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: [www. budget.az \(http://budget.az\)](http://budget.az) This online portal was created in 2010 by group of civil society organisations - National Budget Group (NBG). Although this is not government resource purely, however through this popular portal government, independent researchers, civic leaders disseminate comprehensive budget information on budget database, legislation and practice. also; [www.maliyye.gov.az \(http://www.maliyye.gov.az\)](http://www.maliyye.gov.az)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: [http://www.stat.gov.az \(http://www.stat.gov.az\)](http://www.stat.gov.az) The official website of the State Statistical Committee of the Republic of Azerbaijan
[www.cbar.az \(http://www.cbar.az\)](http://www.cbar.az) The official website of the Central Bank of the Republic of Azerbaijan

GQ-1b: On these websites/portals, can revenue and expenditure data for the current fiscal year be downloaded as a consolidated file (or set of files)? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: [http://www.budget.az/en/main?content=519 \(http://www.budget.az/en/main?content=519\)](http://www.budget.az/en/main?content=519) There are tables consolidated in comparative multi year format, which can be copy paced by users. Unfortunately since 2012 the online portal www.budget.az has not updated, therefore the information is older.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: It is not possible to download the required data via the stated link. Below you are given a link from the official website of the State Statistical Committee of the Republic of Azerbaijan to download the required data: <http://www.stat.gov.az/source/finance/>
(<http://www.stat.gov.az/source/finance/>)

GQ-1c: On these websites/portals, can consolidated revenue and expenditure data be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: [http://www.budget.az/en/main?content=334 \(http://www.budget.az/en/main?content=334\)](http://www.budget.az/en/main?content=334)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: It is not possible to download the required data via the stated link. Below you are given a link from the official website of the State Statistical Committee of the Republic of Azerbaijan to download the required data: <http://www.stat.gov.az/source/finance/>
(<http://www.stat.gov.az/source/finance/>)

Researcher response: The State Statistical Committee website indicates budget information as well, but the info is too old.

GQ-1d: On these websites/portals, are infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

- a. Yes
- b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: [www. budget.az \(http://budget.az\)](http://budget.az)

Comments: Researcher: There isn't any info graphics, or other similar tools, besides of presentation materials.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: By clicking the following link you can access infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis. <http://esasodi.cbar.az:9704/obiee/ESAHS.jsp> (<http://esasodi.cbar.az:9704/obiee/ESAHS.jsp>)

Researcher response: Yes, I agree with the reviewer, the score might be a

GQ-2: Are there laws in place guiding public financial management and/or auditing? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where the law(s) contains specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

- a. Yes
- b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: <http://www.huquqiaktlar.gov.az/StatementDetails.aspx?stateme...> (<http://www.huquqiaktlar.gov.az/StatementDetails.aspx?statementId=18564>)

Comments: Researcher: Law on internal audit (2007)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Only the law on "Internal auditing" was shown. Others: The Budget System law The law on public debt The law about "Auditing service" The decree of the Cabinet of Ministers of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the "Application of unified budget classification" Normative documents of the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Azerbaijan

Researcher response: The government reviewer's comment is noted.

GQ-3: Are there additional laws regulating: (1) access to information; (2) government transparency; or (3) citizens participation? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where these laws contain specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

- a. Yes
- b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879>) <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/11142> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/11142>) <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/13657> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/13657>)

Comments: Researcher: The links are i) Law on Public Participation (2013), ii) Law on Access to Information (2005), iii) President Decree "National Strategy on increasing transparency and fighting corruption" (2007)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

1: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

- a. (100) Yes, administrative units accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, administrative units accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, administrative units accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- d. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017"
Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikası Qanununun tətbiqi barədə" Azərbaycan Respublikası Prezidentinin Fərmanı http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_F%C9%99rman_budce...
(http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_F%C9%99rman_budce_2017_.pdf) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)
Comments: Researcher: "The presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017" in the Ministry of Finance website doesn't include administrative unit classification. However, the paper version of the EBP package, disseminated among MP's has such kind of classification.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The public version of EBP is 54 pages' summary of the 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan and called the Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan. The 2017 State budget package of the Republic of Azerbaijan is a detailed document consisting of 1600 pages, but it is not publicly available. As stated in the comment above, Presentation document doesn't include administrative classification, but the 2017 State budget package constitutes this information. According to the Article 12 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 12.1.5. Draft of incomes and expenditures at the level of the paragraphs of budget income classification and functional, economic and administrative classifications;

Researcher response: "Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017" includes administrative unit classification

IBP comment: The government reviewer's comment is well-noted. As the publicly available version of the budget proposal (Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan) does not present expenditures by administrative unit, the answer is revised from "a" to "d".

2: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification.
- b. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by functional classification.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan
<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)
Comments: Researcher: The Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 includes functional classification of budget expenditure, such as Defense, Education, Healthcare, Social protection and social security, Activities in the field of culture, art, information, sport, etc. p.32-41

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the Article 12 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 12.1.5. Draft of incomes and expenditures at the level of the paragraphs of budget income classification and functional, economic and administrative classifications;

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer. The Law on Budget system consists of requirement on such kind of classification and the Presentation provides functional classification of expenditures.

3: If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the functional classification compatible with international standards?

- a. (100) Yes, the functional classification is compatible with international standards.
- b. (0) No, the functional classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by functional classification.

c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Azerbaijan's functional classification is mostly compatible with "Classification of Expense by Function of Government" in IMF Government Finance Statistics Manual 2001 (Page 76) and UN's Classification of the Functions of Government (COFOG), but partly compatible with OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency (lack of information on non-financial assets, tax expenditure etc.). Azerbaijan government has changed some sub-categories of functional classification in budget envelope for 2017. After reassessment and comparison of functional classification with appropriate international documents, we can come into conclusion that generally existing classification is compatible with international standards with some deficiencies.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

4: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?

a. (100) Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.

b. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by economic classification.

c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) p.31

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" includes economic classification of budget expenditure, such as Salary, Salary supplements, Pension, other social allowances and payments, etc.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the Article 12 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 12.1.5. Draft of incomes and expenditures at the level of the paragraphs of budget income classification and functional, economic and administrative classifications;

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer. The presentation provides economic classification of the expenditures. p. 31

5: If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?

a. (100) Yes, the economic classification is compatible with international standards.

b. (0) No, the economic classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by economic classification.

c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Azerbaijan's economic classification is mostly compatible with "Economic Classification of Expense" in IMF Government Finance Statistics Manual 2001 (Page 63). Azerbaijan government has changed some sub-categories of economic classification in budget envelope for 2014. After careful reassessment and comparison of functional classification with appropriate international documents, we can come into conclusion that generally existing economic classification is compatible with international standards with some deficiencies.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The Presentation provides such kind of information on economic classification, compatible with international standards.p.31

6: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- d. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" includes some individual programs financing, within education programs (p.34-35), health programs (p.36-37), etc.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: According to the Article 12 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 12.1.4. Targeted programs envisaged to be financed at the expense of the state budget funds; 12.1.8. State investment program draft encompassing significant investment projects in compliance with the drafts of the state budget and summary budget for the next year, the summary budgets for the following three years;

Researcher response: The Government reviewer refers on the Law on Budget system. However, the target document for this assessment is only EBP online version- Presentation. Taking into account all possible expenditures, the score might be changed to b.

7: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes multi-year period estimation, "the presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include multi year expenditures estimates

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: As stated in the comment as well, 2017 state budget package provides functional classification for multi-year expenditures.

Researcher response: Due to the IBP methodology, the target document for the assessment is only online version of EBP, which doesn't consist of such kind of information.

8: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- d. (0) No, multi-year estimates for programs are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes multi-year period estimation, "the presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include multi year expenditures estimates by program

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

9: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for all tax revenue are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) (p.16-17)

Comments: Researcher: "The main source and structure of state budget revenues" includes revenue stream appropriately.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The presentation indicates other taxes share in the total budget revenues 376 mln. AZN (292+84), which is 2,3%. p 19.

IBP comment: IBP accepts answer choice "a" based on the revenue information included in the Bill on the State Budget on pages 1 and 2.

10: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" (page 27-28)

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Other sources" section includes such kind of non-taxes sources, like government property rent, etc.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: IBP accepts answer choice "a" based on the detailed revenue information presented in the Bill on the State Budget for 2017 on pages 1-2.

11: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year estimates of revenue are presented by category.
b. (0) No, multi-year estimates of revenue are not presented by category.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes multi-year period estimation, "the presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include revenue estimates by category

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) This document open to public. For example in oil-field revenue part of the document we can read about income for 2017-2020. There is written that during next 3 years the oil income will reduce. After 2020 the main revenue of the budget will from non-oil sector. Etc

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The multi-year revenue estimates by category are prepared as part of the documents within the budget envelope but are not published.

Researcher response: The online version of the Presentation provides relevant info only related oil revenues reduction in the budget till 2020, which must be compensated by non-oil revenues.P.15. But it's not a typical tax and non- tax estimation.

IBP comment: IBP acknowledges the GR's comments that multi-year revenue estimates are produced but for internal use only. Therefore, the answer is unchanged.

12: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented.
b. (67) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented.
c. (33) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of revenue are presented.
d. (0) No, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes multi-year period estimation, "the presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include multi year expenditures estimates for individual sources of revenues.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) This document open to public. For example in oil-field revenue part of the document we can read about income for 2017-2020. There is written that during next 3 years the oil income will reduce. After 2020 the main revenue of the budget will from non-oil sector. Etc

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Individual sources are prepared as part of the documents composing the budget envelope but are not published.

Researcher response: Taking into account the information on oil revenues gradual reduction till 2020 (p.15), the score might be changed to c.

IBP comment: IBP acknowledge GR's comments that multi-year revenue estimates are produced but for internal use only. Therefore, the answer is not revised to "a" but to "c" based on the peer reviewer's comment.

13: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) (p.43-44) Bill on the state budget for 2017 (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_2017%20%2812... (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_2017%20%2812%20noyabr%29.pdf)) (page 8)

Comments: Researcher: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan provides information about the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year and the interest payments on the outstanding debt for the budget year. But there is no information about the central government's total debt burden at the end of the budget year. EBP provides information on the central government's total debt burden only for mid-year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The presentation consist of government borrowing and debt info, mentioned in the comments.p.43-44

14: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to composition of total debt outstanding is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) (p.43-44)

Comments: Researcher: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan partly covers general amounts, currency breakdown and maturity profile of the debt. For example, maturity period for 41,2 percent of the debts is between 10- 20 years. (p.43)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: 2017 state budget package indicates the internal and external debt items separately and shows the amount of debt in different currencies.

Researcher response: The budget package can't be considered as a publicly available doc.

IBP comment: Because the debt information cited by the researcher is as of July 2016, rather than providing information on the composition of debt at the end of the budget year, the response is revised from "c" to "d" for cross-country consistency.

15: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) (P. 5-6)

Comments: Researcher: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan describes main macroeconomic indicators (core components) including nominal GDP level, inflation rate, and real GDP growth. Beyond these core components, budget documents indicate economic parameters and forecasts such as oil and non-oil GDP (nominal amount and real growth rate), population income, average wage dynamics and other segregated data. There is no information on interest rates.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: There's no information for interest rates, which is considered to be one of the core elements. That's why criteria c should be chosen.

Researcher response: The presentation provides macroeconomic forecast for 2017 and further 3 years in p.5-6., which includes real growth, oil/non-oil sector's share, private sector's input, etc. No info related interest rate. the score b can be maintained

IBP comment: IBP acknowledges the government reviewer's comments. The EBP does not provide info about interest rates (a core element), however, IBP notes that the OBS methodology allows for "upgrade" of the assessment to "b" from "c" when only one core element is missing and documentation also provides substantive information "beyond the core elements", as is the case for this question (e.g. forecasts for world market price of oil, some breakdown of total GDP forecasts by broad sectors, wage dynamics, etc.)

16: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget? (The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) (P. 49-50)

Comments: Researcher: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan doesn't provide Sensitivity analysis including inter-correlation between macroeconomic and fiscal indicators. Also The Presentation doesn't indicate how different macroeconomic assumptions affect the budget estimates ("sensitivity analysis"). However, "Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan" includes sub-chapter on the "Potential risks and threats to the state budget" (page 49-50) where you can find different scenarios (pessimist, base, and optimist) about how different level of the crude oil prices, non-oil GDP growth and exchange rates can change (+-) state budget revenues

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: agree, revised on "c"

17: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect expenditure is presented.
- d. (0) No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) (p.8-13)

Comments: Researcher: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan includes only a narrative discussion about impacts of new policy proposals on budget expenditures. Budget documents provide Information impacts only for some new policy proposals. For example, improvement for the financial conditions (wages and pensions) of scholars and other related increased science expenditures comparison to 2016.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

18: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect revenues is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan includes only a narrative discussion about impacts of new policy proposals on budget revenues. For example, revenues from Customs Duty increases on 21,5% comparatively 2016 forecasts, because of implementing of electron customs declaration, etc. (p.25).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

19: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan" includes information on comparison of expenditures based on functional classification, between 2016 and 2017. Therefore the option "c" (the only one of the expenditure classification) is correct.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: yes, agree and revised

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency purposes, the researcher's response is revised from "c" to "d".

20: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- b. (67) Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- c. (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- d. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-1.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan" includes the information on comparison of expenditures, based on individual programs (p. 28-45) between 2016 and 2017.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, the answer is revised from "c" to "d" as the information in the pages cited by the researcher does not present the absolute figures for 2016. Information for 2016 is generally only presented as percentages. Moreover, the information presented does not qualify as programs according to the survey methodology.

21: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?

a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.

b. (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.

c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes update from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include the estimate expenditures info for BY-1, updated from the enacted budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels. EBP for the next budget year is submitted to the legislative body before the confirmation of the enacted budget for the current year. 2017 budget package documents update information for the 9 months of the year prior to the budget year.

Researcher response: The online version of EBP doesn't consist of information related BY-1 update from the original enacted level.

IBP comment: n/a

22: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

b. (67) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.

c. (33) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

d. (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any expenditure classification.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes expenditures estimates for BY-2, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification). 2017 budget package documents present the estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is BY -2) by all three expenditure classifications.

Researcher response: The online version of EBP (the Presentation) doesn't provide such kind of information

IBP comment: IBP acknowledges the government reviewer's comments, but notes that the EBP documentation assessed according to OBS methodology as being publicly available (posted online) do not provide estimates for BY-2 expenditures for any of the 3 expenditure classifications, even though the full EBP document that is only made available in hard copy may in fact provide that information. Thus, the answer is unchanged.

23: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- a. (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- b. (67) Yes, programs accounting for at Least two-Thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- c. (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-Thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- d. (0) No, not expenditures are presented by program for BY-2 and prior years.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan
<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes expenditures for individual programs for BY-2 and prior years estimates for BY-2, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

24: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

- a. (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- b. (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- c. (33) Before BY-3.
- d. (0) No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan
<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes expenditures reflecting actual data, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). 2017 budget package documents present the actual outcomes for 2015.

Researcher response: The presentation (p.16) provides BY-2 info in the table. The score might be upgrated to a.

25: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category.
- b. (0) No, revenue estimates for BY-1 are not presented by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes revenue estimates by category for BY-1, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category. 2017 budget package documents present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1).

Researcher response: The presentation shows revenue presented by broad categories on pp. 17-18, table. The score changed to a.

26: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. (100) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-1.
- b. (67) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue for BY-1 are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues for BY-1 are presented.
- d. (0) No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-1.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information related individual sources of revenue for the BY-1, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-1. 2017 budget package documents present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1).

Researcher response: The Presentation of the State Budget and Consolidated Budget Projects provides individual sources of revenue for BY-1 in the pp. 17-18 table. The score might be changed to a.

27: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?

- a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.
- b. (0) No, revenue estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information on estimates of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1), "The

presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels. EBP for the next budget year is submitted to the legislative body before the confirmation of the enacted budget for the current year. 2017 budget package documents update information for the 9 months of the year prior to the budget year.

Researcher response: The online version of Presentation doesn't provide such kind of info.

IBP comment: n/a

28: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by category.
- b. (0) No, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information on revenue estimates by category for BY-2 and prior years, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Yes, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by category. 2017 budget package documents present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (BY-2).

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: The researcher's response of "b" has been maintained as some information on individual sources of revenue is presented for BY-2; however, information on the broad categories of tax and non-tax revenues for BY-2 is not presented in the publicly available EBP documents.

29: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- a. (100) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- b. (67) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- c. (33) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- d. (0) No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information on individual sources of revenue for BY-2 and prior years, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years. 2017 budget package documents present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (BY-1).

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, the answer is revised from "d" to "c" as the Presentation on the Budget provides estimates of individual sources of tax revenues for FY 2015. Additionally, the government reviewer's comment is noted. However, only publicly available EBP documents are considered in responding to the Survey questions in Sections 2 and 3.

30: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

- a. (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- b. (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- c. (33) Before BY-3.
- d. (0) No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information on the recent year reflecting actual outcomes, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). 2017 budget package documents present the actual outcomes for 2015.

Researcher response: The Presentation of the State Budget on page 16 shows of necessary information on all actual revenues for BY-2 (FY 2015).The score is revised to a.

31: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year proceeding the budget year (BY-1)? (The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for government debt.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for government debt.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to government debt is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year BY-1, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements. 2017 budget package documents provide detailed data on public debt issues, except there are no information on the maturity profiles of the debt and interest rates on the debt instruments.

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer. Changed to c.

IBP comment: As there is some limited debt information provided on a year-to-date basis as well as a comparison of total debt outstanding to BY-1 levels, answer choice "c" is accepted.

32: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

- a. (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- b. (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- c. (33) Before BY-3.
- d. (0) No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information on the most recent year debt figures reflected actual outcomes, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2). 2017 budget package documents present the actual outcomes for 2015.

Researcher response: The presentation (pp.43-44) indicates government debt statement on July 1, 2016. Also this part includes info related on 2017 services, etc. The score might be changed to a.

IBP comment: As actual debt figures are not presented for BY-2 in the publicly available EBP documents, the researcher's response is revised to "d" for cross-country consistency. IBP also acknowledges the government reviewer's comment but notes that only publicly available documents are considered for the Survey indicators in Sections 2 and 3.

33: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some extra-budgetary funds.
- d. (0) No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

<http://sspf.gov.az/view.php?lang=az&menu=0> (<http://sspf.gov.az/view.php?lang=az&menu=0>) http://www.oilfund.az/en_US/

(http://www.oilfund.az/en_US/)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" provides some information on extra-budgetary funds including their revenues (especially, about SOFAZ). But there is no information on statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary funds. Information about State Oil Fund's budget is part of the Presentation (p. 14-15)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: No, I do not agree with the score. There is no information on statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary funds.

Researcher response: The Presentation of the State Budget includes revenue transfers from the SOFAZ, but no info on the statement of purposes. The researcher agrees with the government reviewer that the score should be revised from "b" to "c".

34: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, central government finances are presented on a consolidated basis.
- b. (0) No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" provides information on consolidated budget, which includes State Budget, Nakhcivan Autonomy Republic budget, Social Protection Fund's budget and State oil Fund budget (p.14)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: EBP presents this info in the pp. 13-16, which includes transfers from SOFAZ to the State Budget. Additionally SOFAZ budget itself discusses and approves by MP's during the budget discussion. So, separately SOFAZ budget proposal and then approved budget for the given year is publicly available on the very rich resource: www.oilfund.az (<http://www.oilfund.az>)

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, IBP has revised the response from "a" to "b".

35: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all intergovernmental transfers are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of intergovernmental transfers are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) (p.44-47)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" provides information on estimates of amount of the transfers from central government budget to the budgets of cities and Nakhcivan Autonomic Republic (NAR) (p.44-47)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

36: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, at least three alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- b. (67) Yes, two alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- c. (33) Yes, one alternative display of expenditures is presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- d. (0) No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information on the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer**Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Disagree**Suggested answer:** c.**Comments:** 2017 budget package documents display the expenditures by regions.**Researcher response:** Due to the OBS methodology we can't refer to budget package (hard copy). The only publicly available version is online one, which doesn't include of such information. Thus, the researcher's response of "d" is unchanged.**37: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of transfers to public corporations for at least the budget year?**

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all transfers to public corporations are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of transfers to public corporations are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.**Sources:** Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017" http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_F%C (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_F%C)**Comments:** Researcher: Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017" presents estimates of transfers to public corporations.**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Researcher response:** As the Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017" presents estimates of transfers to public corporations, the score might be b.**IBP comment:** The researcher's response references the Enacted Budget, rather than the Executive's Budget Proposal. For cross-country consistency, the answer is revised from "b" to "d".**38: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)**

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some quasi-fiscal activities.
- d. (0) No, information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.**Sources:** Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)**Comments:** Researcher: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan doesn't provide any information on quasi-fiscal activities**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Disagree**Suggested answer:** b.**Comments:** 2017 budget package documents present information about subsidies.**Researcher response:** The online version of the Presentation of the State Budget does not provide information on Quasi-Fiscal Activities. The government reviewer's comment is acknowledged, but only publicly available documents are considered in responding to this indicator. The budget package is available in hard copy only and therefore is not considered to be publicly available.

39: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all financial assets.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all financial assets.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some financial assets.
- d. (0) No, information related to financial assets is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan
<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>) (p. 5)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan" (page 5) presents an estimate of total value of financial assets/reserves of State Oil Fund and Central Bank.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: b. Criteria Yes, the core information is presented for all financial assets. 2017 budget package documents present this information in financial statement.

Researcher response: The researcher acknowledge the government reviewer's comment about availability of information about financial assets, but notes that EBP documentation assessed according to OBS methodology as being publicly available (posted online),while provided some information about foreign exchange reserves, currency reserves and assets of the State Oil Fund, does not appear to provide the core elements for all financial assets as required to support the government reviewer's recommended "b" response (even though the full EBP document that is only made available in hard copy may in fact provide that information).

40: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on nonfinancial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets by category.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all nonfinancial assets.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all nonfinancial assets.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some nonfinancial assets.
- d. (0) No, information related to nonfinancial assets is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" doesn't provide any information on nonfinancial assets held by the government

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: 2017 budget package documents present this information.

Researcher response: The researcher acknowledges the government reviewer's comment, but notes that EBP documentation assessed according to OBS methodology as being publicly available (posted online) does not appear to provide a listing (and valuation) of the government's non-financial assets. The budget package is not available online and therefore not considered publicly available. (though the full EBP document that is only made available in hard copy may in fact provide that information).

41: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure arrears for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all expenditure arrears are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of expenditure arrears are not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: e.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "e" is the appropriate response, as expenditures arrears are not created due to the specifics of Treasury control/commitments mechanisms.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: The most recent PEFA (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/PEFA_ENG%20FIN...

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/PEFA_ENG%20FINAL.protected.pdf)) also indicates on 34 that there are no payment arrears

42: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all contingent liabilities.

b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all contingent liabilities.

c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some contingent liabilities.

d. (0) No, information related to contingent liabilities is not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" (page 44) presents estimates of upper limits for state guarantee to loans.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: agree, revised

43: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term? (The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.

b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented to assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.

c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

d. (0) No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" doesn't include projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term. The section "Expenditures related government debt management" (p.43) provides only the general information on current statement of external debt, such as size, % to GDP, maturity, etc.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

44: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all sources of donor assistance are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the sources of donor assistance are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan doesn't include the information on estimates of the sources of donor assistance

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: 2017 budget package documents present this information.

Researcher response: The researcher acknowledges the government reviewer's comment and notes that further review of the EBP documentation assessed according to OBS methodology as being publicly available (posted online) indicates there is one reference to an EU grant (Article 15). This is sufficient to support a change in the response to "c". Further information about donor assistance has not been found in the two EBP documents assessed as publicly available, though the full EBP document that is only made available in hard copy may in fact provide additional information. The response is changed from "d" to "c". The score might be changed to c.

45: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the revenue foregone.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all tax expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all tax expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some tax expenditures.
- d. (0) No, information related to tax expenditures is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" doesn't include information on tax expenditures

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

46: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all earmarked revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of earmarked revenues are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan" includes information on earmarked revenues for "Highways" Special Budget Fund (page 42-47)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan" includes information on earmarked revenues for "Highways" Special Budget Fund (page 42-47)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: "Presentation on the draft state and consolidated budgets for 2017 of the Republic of Azerbaijan" includes information on earmarked revenues for "Highways" Special Budget Fund (page 42-47) Revised to a.

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency purposes, the researcher's response is revised from "a" to "c" as limited information on earmarked revenues is presented in the EBP.

47: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for the budget year is presented.
- d. (0) No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for the budget year is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" ("Macroeconomic forecast for 2107 and further 3 years", "Main directions of fiscal policy", page 5-13) <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" provides information for the most important policy goals. Also, there is narrative discussion on links between proposed budget, midterm fiscal policy goals and "Azerbaijan 2020: Vision to Future" Development Concept. It seems "The Presentation" includes the proposed budget linked to all government policy goals, such as macroeconomy, fiscal, tax, etc. policy. So, the option "a" is relevant

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, the researcher's response is revised from "a" to "c". There is a good narrative presentation of policy priorities, but the scope of information for expenditure estimates does not present the explicit linkage of each spending proposal to specific/stated policy priorities .

48: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for a multi-year period is presented.
- d. (0) No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" ("Macroeconomic forecast for 2107 and further 3 years", "Main directions of fiscal policy", page 5-13) <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...>

(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" ("Macroeconomic forecast for 2107 and further 3 years") provides the information about how multi-year state programs, policies and priorities towards economic diversification will have impacts on budget variables

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

49: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).
- b. (67) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.
- c. (33) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).
- d. (0) No, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" doesn't include the information on nonfinancial data inputs

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: 2017 budget package documents present this information.

Researcher response: The researcher acknowledge the government reviewer's comment, noting that assessment is based on EBP documentation considered to be publicly available according to OBS methodology (posted online). That documentation does not appear to provide any information on non-financial inputs, although the full EBP document that is only made available in hard copy may in fact provide some of that information.

50: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).
- b. (67) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.
- c. (33) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).
- d. (0) No, nonfinancial data on results are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Since OBS 2017 assess public availability of the document only if it's available on the web site, the score has been changed. Though the paper version of the draft budget includes information on nonfinancial data on results partly, "The presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects for 2017" which has been put in the Ministry of Finance web site doesn't include such kind of information.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: 2017 budget package documents present this information.

Researcher response: OBS methodology requires to take into account only the online version of EBP, which does include information on non-financial data on results.

51: Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?

- a. (100) Yes, performance targets are assigned to all nonfinancial data on results.
- b. (67) Yes, performance targets are assigned to most nonfinancial data on results.
- c. (33) Yes, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results.
- d. (0) No, performance targets are not assigned to nonfinancial data on results, or the budget does not present nonfinancial data on results.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017"

<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Due to the "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017", number of beneficiaries in social policy expenditures is provided in mentioned budget documents can be considered as performance targets.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The "Presentation" provides info on social policy expenditures in the p. 32.

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, the researcher's response is revised from "c" to "d" as information on performance targets was not observed in the publicly available version of the EBP.

52: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" ("Social related expenditures", page 32-38) <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.p...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Budce-16-11-2016.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Due to the "Presentation of the state budget and consolidated budget projects of Azerbaijan Republic for 2017" ("Social related expenditures", page 32-38), there are very limited estimates and narrative on how country's most impoverished populations will be affected by new or existing budget policy.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: 2017 budget package documents present this information.

Researcher response: The researcher acknowledge the government reviewer's comment, noting that assessment is based on EBP documentation considered to be publicly available according to OBS methodology (posted online). That documentation does not appear to provide information about all policies intended to benefit impoverished or vulnerable population groups to meet the requirements of a "b" response, although the full EBP document that is only made available in hard copy may in fact provide additional information. Therefore, answer "c" remains.

53: Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

- a. (100) Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
- b. (67) Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
- c. (33) Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
- d. (0) No, a timetable is not issued to the public.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2016", page 10-12 (The stages of budget process).
http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015...
(http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015%20arial.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: Citizen's Budget Guide devoted 3 pages to the explanation of detailed timetable for official budget process. Also, it is determined and explained in the Law on Budget System (2 July 2002).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

54: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: No Pre-Budget Statement is presented and available

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: Initial draft budget is prepared by the Budget Department of MoF to be submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers. But this document is for internal use only, not publicly available. According to the Article 11, Clause 5 of the Budget System Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

Researcher response: Due to the OBS methodology initial draft budget prepared for the internal use cannot be considered as a PBS as it is not publicly available. Moreover, it is not clear that this document would qualify as a PBS based on its contents.

55: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government's expenditure policies and priorities.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the government's expenditure policies and priorities.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: No Pre-Budget Statement is presented and available

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Initial draft budget is prepared by the Budget Department of MoF to be submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers. But this document is for internal use only, not publicly available. According to the Article 11, Clause 5 of the Budget System Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 11.5. Relevant

executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

Researcher response: Due to the OBS methodology initial draft budget prepared for the internal use cannot be considered as a PBS as it is not publicly available. Moreover, it is not clear that this document would qualify as a PBS based on its contents.

56: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government's revenue policies and priorities.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the government's revenue policies and priorities.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: No Pre-Budget Statement is presented and available

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Initial draft budget is prepared by the Budget Department of MoF to be submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers. But this document is for internal use only, not publicly available. According to the Article 11, Clause 5 of the Budget System Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

Researcher response: Due to the OBS methodology initial draft budget prepared for the internal use cannot be considered as a PBS as it is not publicly available. Moreover, it is not clear that this document would qualify as a PBS based on its contents.

57: Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: No Pre-Budget Statement is presented and available

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: Only interest payments on the debt for the budget year is presented.

Researcher response: Due to the OBS methodology initial draft budget prepared for the internal use cannot be considered as a PBS as it is not publicly available. Moreover, it is not clear that this document would qualify as a PBS based on its contents.

58: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented.

- b. (0) No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: No Pre-Budget Statement is presented and available

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Initial draft budget is prepared by the Budget Department of MoF to be submitted to the Cabinet of Ministers. But this document is for internal use only, not publicly available. According to the Article 11, Clause 5 of the Budget System Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 11.5. Relevant executive power body presents initial draft of the state budget of the next year, basic fields of budget-tax policy, the highest verge of incomes and expenditures at the level of budget classification items, public debts, priority expenditures, forecast of summary budget of the next year and following three years, drafts of legislative acts necessary for preparation and execution process of the state budget, as well as relevant executive power body presents the initial draft of the state investment program to relevant executive power body till the April 15 of the current year.

Researcher response: Due to the OBS methodology initial draft budget prepared for the internal use cannot be considered as a PBS as it is not publicly available. Moreover, it is not clear that this document would qualify as a PBS based on its contents.

59: Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
b. (67) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
c. (33) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
d. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: "Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017" The President Decree on the implementation of Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017"

http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_Qanun_budce_2017_... (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_Qanun_budce_2017_.pdf)

http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_F%C9%99rman_budce... (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_F%C9%99rman_budce_2017_.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: The Enacted Budget for 2017 include functional and administrative classification, but not economic one.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: As the executive body (parliament) enacts EBP documents (2017 state budget package), which contain this information, consequently, Enacted Budget presents this information.

Researcher response: Due to the OBS methodology, we have to refer on the publicly available version of the EB, put in the websites. Due to the Decree of President and Law on Budget for 2017, there aren't any information on the economic classification of the expenditures.

60: Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
b. (67) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
c. (33) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
d. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by program.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: "Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017" The President Decree on the implementation of Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017"

http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_Qanun_budce_2017_... (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_Qanun_budce_2017_.pdf)

http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_F%C9%99rman_budce... (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_F%C9%99rman_budce_2017_.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: Enacted Budget includes some expenditures on individual programs as well

Peer Reviewer**Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Disagree**Suggested answer:** a.**Comments:** As the executive body (parliament) enacts EBP documents (2017 state budget package), which contain this information, consequently, Enacted Budget presents this information.**Researcher response:** The researcher acknowledges the government reviewer's comment, noting that the assessment of EB questions is based on the content of the two EB documents made publicly available (posted online), as noted in Section 1. Further assessment of these documents has led to revising the response to "b" based on the information presented in the document titled, "On the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017" On application of the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan**61: Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?**

- a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.
b. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present revenue estimates by category.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.**Sources:** Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017" Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu "Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017" Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikası Qanununun tətbiqi barədə" Azərbaycan Respublikası Prezidentinin Fərmanı <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>)**Comments:** Researcher: Enacted Budget for 2017 provides revenue estimation by tax and non-tax categories**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree with Comments**Comments:** As the executive body (parliament) enacts EBP documents (2017 state budget package), which contain this information, consequently, Enacted Budget presents this information.**Researcher response:** n/a**IBP comment:** While individual sources of revenue are presented in the Enacted Budget, revenue estimates are not presented by the broad categories of tax and non-tax. Therefore, the researcher's response is revised from "a" to "b".**62: Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?**

- a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
b. (67) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
c. (33) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
d. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present individual sources of revenue.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)**Sources:** Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017" Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu "Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017" Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikası Qanununun tətbiqi barədə" Azərbaycan Respublikası Prezidentinin Fərmanı <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>)**Comments:** Researcher: Enacted budget provides the information on individual sources of revenues on page 1 of the following document: http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_Qanun_budce_2017_... (http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/_Qanun_budce_2017_...)**Peer Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Government Reviewer****Opinion:** Agree**Researcher response:** done**63: Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?**

- a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on "The State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2017" Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanunu "Decree of the President of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the implementation of the "Law on the state budget of Azerbaijan for 2017" Original: "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2017-ci il dövlət büdcəsi haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikası Qanununun tətbiqi barədə" Azərbaycan Respublikası Prezidentinin Fərmanı <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2006>) p.9.

Comments: Researcher: Enacted Budget presents all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, the researcher's response has been revised to "b" as information on total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year is not presented.

64: What information is provided in the Citizens Budget? (The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)

- a. (100) The Citizens Budget provides information beyond the core elements.
- b. (67) The Citizens Budget provides the core information.
- c. (33) The Citizens Budget provides information, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) The Citizens Budget is not published.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2016"
http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015...
(http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015%20arial.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: In addition to core elements Citizen's Budget Guide provide the budget calendar and explanation of key definitions and terms.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: As per OBS methodology, if a document is not published within a given time frame, it is not considered publicly available. The citizens budget for for FY 2016 was published late. Therefore, the answer has been revised to "d".

65: How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

- a. (100) A Citizens Budget is disseminated widely through a combination of at least three different appropriate tools and media (such as the Internet, billboards, radio programs, newspapers, etc.).
- b. (67) A Citizens Budget is published by using at least two, but less than three, means of dissemination, but no other dissemination efforts are undertaken by the executive.
- c. (33) A Citizens Budget is disseminated only by using one means of dissemination.
- d. (0) A Citizens Budget is not published.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2016"
http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015...
(http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015%20arial.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: Ministry of Finance disseminated Citizen Budget through its website and publication in hard copy version of report which is available on request.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: As per OBS methodology, if a document is not published within a given time frame, it is not considered publicly available. The citizens budget for for FY 2016 was published late. Therefore, the answer has been revised to "d".

66: Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
- d. (0) No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2016"

http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015...

(http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015%20arial.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: Citizen's Budget are providing contact numbers to identify public requirements, however there aren't wide public accessibility to this process.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The Citizens's budget contains the contact details for the public to submit feedback

Researcher response: As per OBS methodology, if a document is not published within a given time frame, it is not considered publicly available. The citizens budget for for FY 2016 was published late. Therefore, the answer has been revised to "d".

67: Are "citizens" versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?

- a. (100) A citizens version of budget documents is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit).
- b. (67) A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process.
- c. (33) A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least one stage of the budget process.
- d. (0) No citizens version of budget documents is published.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Citizen's Budget Guide for the state and consolidated budgets of 2016"

http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015...

(http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015%20arial.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: Citizen Budget covers only enacted budget and there isn't any practice to prepare such kind of guides for the rest of the stages of the budget process.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: As per OBS methodology, if a document is not published within a given time frame, it is not considered publicly available. The citizens budget for for FY 2016 was published late. Therefore, the answer has been revised to "d".

68: Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016 <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: The In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only functional classification of expenditure

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only economic classification of expenditure <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1915>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1949>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010>)

Researcher response: I've upgraded the score to b., as in the 6 months budget execution there are 2 classification (economic and functional) of expenditures. See below; Operative information on the state budget execution for 6 months of 2017 Original: 2017-ci ilin altı ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2062> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2062>)

IBP comment: IBP has revised the researcher's response to "d" as subsequent IBP review has pointed to the information provided not meeting the minimum criteria expected for any of the 3 expenditure classifications, including both economic and functional.

69: Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?

- a. (100) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. (0) No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016" <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

70: Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. (100) Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.
- b. (0) No, comparisons are not made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016" <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: In-Year reports provide information comparatively the same period in the previous year

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: I keep the score a., as due to the 6 months budget execution info there are info compare to the previous year. Operative information on the state budget execution for 6 months of 2017Original: 2017-ci ilin altı ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2062> ([/www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2062](http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2062))

71: Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- a. (100) Yes, In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.
- b. (0) No, In-Year Reports do not present actual revenue by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: "Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016" <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: In-Year reports provide information on actual revenues by category, such as oil/non-oil taxes, custom duties, etc., mentioned in the "Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016"

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The 6 months budget execution provides tax and non-tax collection of the revenues. Operative information on the state budget execution for 6 months of 2017Original: 2017-ci ilin altı ayı üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2062> ([/www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2062](http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/2062))

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, the researcher's response is revised from "a" to "b", as the IYR does not provide information for tax and non-tax categories.

72: Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?

- a. (100) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for all revenue.
- b. (67) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- c. (33) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenue.
- d. (0) No, In-Year Reports do not present individual sources of actual revenue.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016" <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: Ministry of Taxes publishes information on budget revenue collections of individual sources of revenue including all taxes. But detailed information about all non-tax revenues in quarterly basis is only partly available .

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: Option b is more relevant. The 6 months budget execution info provides more than 2/3 of total revenues individual sources.

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, IBP has revised the researcher's response from "b" to "c", as information for revenue from individual sources of revenue is very limited

73: Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. (100) Yes, comparisons are made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.
- b. (0) No, comparisons are not made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016" <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: In-Year reports compare actual revenues with the same period in the previous year

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

74: Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding; and interest payments?

- a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016" <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: No information related borrowing/debt

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

75: Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Operative information on the state budget execution for 9 months of 2016 <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1979>)

Comments: Researcher: Related report on state debt is prepared comprehensively and submitted to the President of Azerbaijan Republic, and also is placed on the official website of Ministry of Finance, but is not included in the In-Year reports.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: d.

Comments: The separate comments above also confirms this.

Researcher response: No information on debt outstanding in the 6 months budget execution. the score has been changed to d.

76: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?

- a. (100) Yes, the estimates for the macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.
- b. (67) Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.
- c. (33) Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated forecast is not presented.
- d. (0) No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Mid-year Review is not produced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: e.

Comments: Answer should be e criteria, because of the nonexistence of this report.

Researcher response: Due to OBS methodology, responses to all MYR questions are "d" on account of the document not being produced (and/or not being made publicly available).

77: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.
- b. (67) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.
- c. (33) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is not presented.
- d. (0) No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Mid-year Review is not produced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: Due to OBS methodology, responses to all MYR questions are "d" on account of the document not being produced (and/or not being made publicly available).

78: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Mid-year Review is not produced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: e.

Comments: Answer should be e criteria, because of the nonexistence of this report.

Researcher response: Due to OBS methodology, responses to all MYR questions are “d” on account of the document not being produced (and/or not being made publicly available).

79: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Mid-year Review is not produced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: e.

Comments: Answer should be e criteria, because of the nonexistence of this report.

Researcher response: Due to OBS methodology, responses to all MYR questions are “d” on account of the document not being produced (and/or not being made publicly available).

80: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.
- b. (67) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.
- c. (33) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is not presented.
- d. (0) No, revenue estimates have not been updated.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Mid-year Review is not produced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: e.

Comments: Answer should be e criteria, because of the nonexistence of this report

Researcher response: Due to OBS methodology, responses to all MYR questions are “d” on account of the document not being produced (and/or not being made publicly available).

81: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents revenue estimates by category.
- b. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The Mid-year Review is not produced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: Answer should be c criteria, because of the nonexistence of this report

Researcher response: Due to OBS methodology, responses to all MYR questions are “b” on account of the document not being produced (and/or not being made publicly available).

IBP comment: Yes, it is correct.

82: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present individual sources of revenue?

- a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
- b. (67) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- c. (33) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
- d. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present individual sources of revenue.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Mid-year Review is not produced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: e.

Comments: Answer should be e criteria, because of the nonexistence of this report

Researcher response: Due to OBS methodology, responses to all MYR questions are “d” on account of the document not being produced (and/or not being made publicly available).

83: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on all of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on some of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, but information on the differences between the original and updated estimates is not presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Mid-year Review is not produced.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: e.

Comments: Year-End Report This is a key accountability document produced by the executive after the end of the fiscal year that reports extensively on the government's financial activities and its performance on implementing the budget during the entire fiscal year. In many countries, the executive issues one Year-End Report that consolidates information on revenue collections, debt, and expenditures for administrative units. In other countries, individual administrative units issue their own Year-End Reports. The reports ought to cover all of the major items included in the budget, explaining differences between the original estimates (as amended by the legislature during the year) and the actual outcomes for expenditure, revenue, debt, and the macroeconomic assumptions. These reports should also review nonfinancial performance information and other important policy areas. They can also include a financial statement.

Researcher response: Due to OBS methodology, responses to all MYR questions are “d” on account of the document not being produced (and/or not being made publicly available).

84: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all expenditures are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>) "Year-End Report for the 2015" <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1933> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1933>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End Report provides the information on differences between enacted and actual levels

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: IBP accepts answer choice "a" based on the information provided in the following two documents (rather than the documents cited in the researcher's original response): Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft) (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>))

85: Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report provides only limited functional classification expenditures information

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: According to the Article 20 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 20.6. The Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan discusses documents submitted and approves the law on the execution of the state budget of relevant target year (including the following key indicators): 20.6.1. Total amount of the execution of incomes and expenditures correspondingly; 20.6.2. Amount of the execution of revenue sources of incomes; 20.6.3. Gain or loss as a result of changes in the rate of manat compared to foreign currencies; 20.6.4. Execution of expenditure amounts in the section and auxiliary section level, based on functional and administrative classification; 20.6.5. Amount of the execution of expenditures at the level of paragraphs pursuant to functional classification; 20.6.6. Amount of the highest verge of the budget deficit and profit; 20.6.7. Balance of the state budget in the unified treasury account for the January 1 of the current year.

Researcher response: n/a

IBP comment: IBP acknowledges the government reviewer's comments and the researcher's response is revised to "b" based on the expenditures being presented according to the economic and functional classification in the following two documents: The Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft) (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015 (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>))

86: Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>) "The Law on Budget System of the Republic of Azerbaijan" <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report doesn't provide information on programs expenditures

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The explanation given to this question: However, for the purposes of answering the questionnaire, researchers should understand the term "program" to mean any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department. According to the Article 20 of The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan: 20.6. The Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan discusses documents submitted and approves the law on the execution of the state budget of relevant target year (including the following key indicators): 20.6.1. Total amount of the execution of incomes and expenditures correspondingly; 20.6.2. Amount of the execution of revenue sources of incomes; 20.6.3. Gain or loss as a result of changes in the rate of manat compared to foreign currencies; 20.6.4. Execution of expenditure amounts in the section and auxiliary section level, based on functional and administrative classification; 20.6.5. Amount of the execution of expenditures at the level of paragraphs pursuant to functional classification; 20.6.6. Amount of the highest verge of the budget deficit and profit; 20.6.7. Balance of the state budget in the unified treasury account for the January 1 of the current year.

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law (pp. 26-27) provides individual programs info.

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score might be upgraded to a.

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency, IBP has revised the researcher's response from "a" to "c". IBP notes the following two documents are accepted as the YER: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft) (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>))

87: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for revenues are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report provides differences between enacted levels and actual outcome for revenues

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: 2016-cı il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2016" <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2010>) In this document doesn't clear information about all expenditure. Also there isn't clear compare of enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law provides such kind of info.

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score a. is more relevant

IBP comment: IBP accepts answer choice "a" based on the information included in the following two documents: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf))

son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015"
(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>))

88: Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents revenue estimates by category.
- b. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present revenue estimates by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report provide information on revenue estimation by category

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law provides tax and non-tax info.

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)The score a. might be maintained.

IBP comment: IBP accepts answer choice "a" based on the information included in the following two documents:Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)"

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015"

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>))

89: Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?

- a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
- b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
- d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present individual sources of revenue.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End Report provides information on the individual sources of revenues, such as, taxes, (oil/non-oil), custome duties, transfers from the Oil Fund, etc.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law provides individual sources of revenue info.

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)The score a. might be maintained

IBP comment: IBP accepts answer choice "a" based on the information included in the following two documents:Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)"

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015"

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>))

90: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report doesn't include any information on government borrowing/debt

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law (pp. 24-25) provides borrowing and debt info.

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score might be upgraded to a.

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency purposes, IBP accepts answer choice "c" as estimates between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented in the following two documents: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)"

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i... (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015"

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)).

91: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year -End report doesn't include any information on macroeconomic assumptions, actual data, etc.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law (pp. 1-4) provides macroeconomic part info.

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score might be upgraded to a.

IBP comment: IBP considers the following two documents to qualify as the YER: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>) While the narrative report includes a significant discussion of the macro-economic environment, differences between original estimates and actual outcomes are not presented. Thus, the researcher's original response of "d" is maintained.

92: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report doesn't include any non financial data information

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law (p. 7) provides nonfinancial data info.

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score might be upgraded to a.

IBP comment: IBP considers the following two documents to qualify as the YER: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)Based) on the information available in these reports, IBP agrees with the researcher's original response of "d".

93: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: "Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report doesn't include any nonfinancial data information

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law provides nonfinancial data info, but no the differences between original estimates and actual outcomes. <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score c. might be relevant

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score c. might be relevant

IBP comment: IBP considers the following two documents to qualify as the YER: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>

(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)As) the researcher notes, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented. Thus, the researcher's original response of "d" is maintained.

94: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Law on Budget System : <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)
"Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat
<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report doesn't include information on estimation of benefits for any group of populations

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law (pp.11-16)provides such kind of info, but not substantially.
<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>
(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score c. might be relevant

IBP comment: IBP accepts the following two documents as the YER: Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...
(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>
(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)For) cross-country consistency, the researcher's original response of "d" is maintained.

95: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: The Law on Budget System : <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)
"Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat
<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report doesn't include information related extra-budgetary funds

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: The MoF report on 2015 execution law (pp. 29-30) provides info related SOFAZ expenditures and differences from the original estimates. <http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az...>
(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1929><http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>The) score might be upgraded to a.

IBP comment: IBP considers the following two documents to qualify as the YER:Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan "On the Implementation of the State Budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (draft)" (http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20i...
(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/Qanun_budc%20icrasi%202015-son.pdf)) and "Report on implementation of the state budget of the Republic of Azerbaijan for 2015" (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat...>
(<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/2015%20hesabat.pdf>)Based) on the information available in this report, IBP would accept answer choice "b".

96: Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?

- a. (100) Yes, a financial statement is part of the Year-End Report or is released as a separate report.
- b. (0) No, a financial statement is neither part of the Year-End Report nor released as a separate report.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The Law on Budget System : <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)
"Operative information on the execution of the state budget for the 2015" Original: 2015-ci il üzrə dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına (operativ) dair Məlumat
<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/1871>)

Comments: Researcher: The Year-End report doesn't include financial statement, no within the report, neither separately

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

97: What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?

- a. (100) The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.
- b. (67) The SAI has conducted two of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.
- c. (33) The SAI has conducted one of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.
- d. (0) The SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Audit Report on the draft Law 'On execution of state budget for 2015 of the Republic of Azerbaijan' and annual report on state budget execution. "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2015-ci il dövlət büdcəsinin icrası haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanun layihəsinə və dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına dair illik hesabat Azərbaycan Respublikası Hesablama Palatasının Rəyi <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/>
(<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/>) http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: The Chamber of Accounts conducted compliance and financial audits and made them available for the public

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/ICRA-2016-SON_FINAL.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/ICRA-2016-SON_FINAL.pdf) Audit Report on the draft Law 'On execution of state budget for 2016 of the Republic of Azerbaijan' and annual report on state budget execution. "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2016-cı il dövlət büdcəsinin icrası haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanun layihəsinə və dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına dair illik hesabat Azərbaycan Respublikası Hesablama Palatasının Rəyi The Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan conducted compliance, financial, and performance audits and made them available for the society

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The Chamber of Commerce has conducted performance audits as the pilot projects and provided information on them in its annual report <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/HP%202016%20fealiyyet.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/HP%202016%20fealiyyet.pdf>)

Researcher response: During our face-to face discussion with SAI representatives and round table, which was organized on July 11, 2017 in Baku, The Chamber representatives mentioned that they have already started to conduct performance audit in the pilot scheme. The score might be upgraded to a.

98: What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

- a. (100) All expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- b. (67) Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- c. (33) Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- d. (0) No expenditures have been audited.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Audit Report on the draft Law 'On execution of state budget for 2015 of the Republic of Azerbaijan' and annual report on state budget execution. "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2015-ci il dövlət büdcəsinin icrası haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanun layihəsinə və dövlət

büdcəsinin icrasına dair illik hesabat Azərbaycan Respublikası Hesablama Palatasının Rəyi <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/>) http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: Expenditures towards military and security sector either not audited or results not published.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: n/a

99: What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

- a. (100) All extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- b. (67) Extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- c. (33) Extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- d. (0) No extra-budgetary funds have been audited.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Audit Report on the draft Law 'On execution of state budget for 2015 of the Republic of Azerbaijan' and annual report on state budget execution. "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2015-ci il dövlət büdcəsinin icrası haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanun layihəsinə və dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına dair illik hesabat Azərbaycan Respublikası Hesablama Palatasının Rəyi <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/>) http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: The State Oil Fund which is largest extra-budgetary fund of Azerbaijan Republic either is not audited or that audit report is not published. The Chamber of Accounts audits State Social Protection Fund (second largest extra-budgetary fund) and issues special report on it.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

100: Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?

- a. (100) Yes, the annual Audit Report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.
- b. (0) No, the annual Audit Report(s) does not include an executive summary.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Audit Report on the draft Law 'On execution of state budget for 2015 of the Republic of Azerbaijan' and annual report on state budget execution. "Azərbaycan Respublikasının 2015-ci il dövlət büdcəsinin icrası haqqında" Azərbaycan Respublikasının Qanun layihəsinə və dövlət büdcəsinin icrasına dair illik hesabat Azərbaycan Respublikası Hesablama Palatasının Rəyi <http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/rej/41/>) http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf (http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/REY_ICRA-2015.pdf)

Comments: Researcher: Audit Report prepared by the Chamber of Accounts includes short executive summary

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

101: Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
- d. (0) No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: www.maliyye.gov.az (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az>)

Comments: Researcher: Audit recommendations of the Chamber of Accounts are submitted to relevant bodies. Entities are implementing relevant measures and respond regarding recommendations to the Chamber of Accounts. This information are reflected on the summary report of Chamber of Accounts, discussed on the Milli Majlis (Parliament), printed as special book and published on the website.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

102: Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

a. (100) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit recommendations.

b. (67) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on most audit recommendations.

c. (33) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on some audit recommendations.

d. (0) No, neither the SAI nor legislature reports on steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: www.sai.gov.az (<http://www.sai.gov.az>) www.meclis.gov.az (<http://www.meclis.gov.az>)

Comments: Researcher: Audit recommendations of the Chamber of Accounts are submitted to relevant bodies. Entities are implementing relevant measures and respond regarding recommendations to the Chamber of Accounts. This information are reflected on the summary report of Chamber of Accounts, discussed on the Milli Majlis (Parliament), printed as special book and published on the website.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The Cabinet of Ministers informs the Chamber of Accounts but the information is not shared with the public

Researcher response: The government reviewer's comment is noted.

103: Is there an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) that conducts budget analyses for the budget formulation and/or approval process?

a. (100) Yes, there is an IFI, its independence is set in law, and it has sufficient staffing and resources, including funding, to carry out its tasks.

b. (67) Yes, there is an IFI, but either its independence is not set in law or its staffing and resources, including funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.

c. (33) Yes, there is an IFI, but its independence is not set in law and its staffing and resources, including funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.

d. (0) No, there is no IFI.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The law on budget system: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>

(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: There isn't any independent institute, focusing on fiscal issues, based on public finding. National Budget Group (NBG) previously has done the similar work, however it was no public, but civil society alliance, which at present doesn't function.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

104: Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts?

- a. (100) Yes, the IFI publishes its own macroeconomic and fiscal forecasts.
- b. (67) Yes, the IFI publishes its own macroeconomic or fiscal forecast.
- c. (33) No, the IFI does not publish its own macroeconomic or fiscal forecast, but it does publish an assessment of the official macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts produced by the executive.
- d. (0) No, there is no IFI; or the IFI neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts produced by the executive.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Law on budget system: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: No IFI in Azerbaijan

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

105: Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish its own costings of new policy proposals, to assess their impact on the budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of all new policy proposals.
- b. (67) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of major new policy proposals.
- c. (33) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of a limited number of new policy proposals.
- d. (0) No, there is no IFI; or the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Law on budget system: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: No IFI in Azerbaijan

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

106: In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

- a. (100) Frequently (i.e., five times or more).
- b. (67) Sometimes (i.e., three times or more, but less than five times).
- c. (33) Rarely (i.e., once or twice).
- d. (0) Never.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Law on Budget System; <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: No IFI's

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

107: Does the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, the full legislature debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the upcoming budget.
- b. (67) Yes, a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the upcoming budget.
- c. (33) Yes, the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, but it does not approve recommendations for the upcoming budget.
- d. (0) No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- e. (0) Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: The official web site of the Parliament of Azerbaijan: <http://meclis.gov.az/> (<http://meclis.gov.az/>)

Comments: Researcher: The Committee of Economic Policy, Industry and Entrepreneurship of the Parliament (Milli Meclis) has such kind of practice to discuss budget policy prior to the tabling of the EBP, with no approve recommendations and no records of the debates. Therefore, there isn't any public source, notice this practice.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

108: How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least three months before the start of the budget year.
- b. (67) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.
- c. (33) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two months, before the start of the budget year.
- d. (0) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month before the start of the budget year, or does not receive it all.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Budget calendar: P.11-12. http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%200411...

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015%20arial.pdf) The Law on Budget System of the Republic of Azerbaijan:

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/34> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/34>) The official web site of the Ministry of Finance:

<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1988> (<http://www.maliyye.gov.az/node/1988>)

Comments: Researcher: In 2016, Parliament (Milli Meclis) of Azerbaijan received the EBP on November 16, which was indicated putting the draft on the Ministry of Finance official website and news on various media (mostly internet), noted that this year the EBP was publicly available too late, rather than in the previous years. Due to the Law on Bydget System "Draft law on the state budget of the next year, alongside with other documents enclosed to it, should be submitted to the discussion and approval of the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan not later than the October 15 of the current year in accordance with the provision 2 of the article 109 of the Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan".

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: Budget proposal has to be submitted to the Parliament by October 15 by the President. With the budget year starting on January 1, the Parliament receives the budget proposal 3 at least 2 months and half earlier

Researcher response: The researcher acknowledges the government reviewer's comment about the Budget System Law requiring submission of the annual EBP to Parliament by 15 October, but notes that in the case of EBP FY2017, the draft budget was submitted just over a month late (16 November). Therefore the answer is unchanged.

109: When does the legislature approve the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) The legislature approves the budget at least one month in advance of the start of the budget year.
- b. (67) The legislature approves the budget less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year.
- c. (33) The legislature approves the budget less than one month after the start of the budget year.
- d. (0) The legislature approves the budget more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: Budget calendar: p.11-12. http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%200411...

(http://www.maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015%20arial.pdf) <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2003>

(<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/2003>) <http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3505/> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3505/>)

<http://en.trend.az/business/economy/2698809.html> (<http://en.trend.az/business/economy/2698809.html>) (Azerbaijani parliament adopts state budget for 2017/16 December 2016 13:05)

Comments: Researcher: Due to the Law on Budget System article: 15.3. "The state budget of the next budget year is approved with law not later than the December 20 of the current year in the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan". After a relatively long (precisely 1 month) and intensive discussion Milli Meclis approved the state budget for 2017 on December 16, 2016, with some changes.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

110: Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- b. (67) Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, with some limitations.
- c. (33) Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but its authority is very limited.
- d. (0) No, the legislature does not have any authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/node/34> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/node/34>) "The Law on budget system of the Republic of Azerbaijan" (Article 15): <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>

(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Due to "The Law on Budget System", article 15.5 "A question on additions and changes to the Law on the state budget of the current year can be raised before the Milli Majlis (Parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan as a legislative initiative taking into consideration the provision 2 of the article 109 of the Constitution of the Republic of Azerbaijan.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

111: During the most recent budget approval process, did the legislature use its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, and (at least some of) its amendments were adopted.
- b. (67) Yes, the legislature used its authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive's Budget Proposal, but no amendments were adopted.
- c. (33) No, while the legislature has the authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive's Budget Proposal, no amendments were offered.
- d. (0) No, the legislature does not have any such authority.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3505/> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3505/>) <http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3492/> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3492/>) <http://oxu.az/economy/165841> (<http://oxu.az/economy/165841>)

<http://www.1news.az/economy/20160224023939996.html> (<http://www.1news.az/economy/20160224023939996.html>)

<http://musavat.com/news/iqtisadiyyat/budce-muzakirelerinde-i...> (http://musavat.com/news/iqtisadiyyat/budce-muzakirelerinde-ikinci-gun-hokumetle-pul-davasi_397111.html)

Comments: Researcher: During the discussion in Milli Meclis, MP's provide a dozen of suggestions to amend to the budget 2017 law, taking into account the tight socio-economic conditions in the country. The suggestions mostly were focused on increasing the amount of budget spending to the socially vulnerable group of people. After a long discussion government decided to increase the budget spending for cultural programs, Parliament itself maintenance, etc.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

112: During the last budget approval process, did a specialized budget or finance committee in the legislature examine the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee had at least one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- b. (67) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee had less than one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- c. (33) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee examined the Executive's Budget Proposal, but it did not publish a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- d. (0) No, a specialized budget or finance committee did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: <http://www.meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3479/> (<http://www.meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3479/>)
<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3500/> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3500/>)
<http://www.1news.az/economy/20161202025212640.html> (<http://www.1news.az/economy/20161202025212640.html>)

Comments: Researcher: The Committee of Economic Policy, Industry and Entrepreneurship, which is the specialized committee on budget as well, examined the EBP, right after entering this document into Parliament, Novmbr 16, 2016. and after that initiates the joint meeting with other related committees.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

113: During the last approval process, did legislative committees, responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.), examine spending in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the sector for which they are responsible?

- a. (100) Yes, sector committees had at least one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and they published reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- b. (67) Yes, sector committees had less than one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and they published reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- c. (33) Yes, sector committees examined the Executive's Budget Proposal, but they did not publish reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- d. (0) No, sector committees did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: <http://www.meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3479/> (<http://www.meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3479/>)
<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3500/> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/news/view/3500/>)
<http://www.1news.az/economy/20161202025212640.html> (<http://www.1news.az/economy/20161202025212640.html>)

Comments: Researcher: Yes, during the discussion all related committees have participated in the 2017 budget law draft and have a joint committees meeting as well. Particularly the Committee of Law, Labour and Social Policy, Science and Education, Human Rights, Youth Policy, International Affairs committees were active in these discussions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

114: In the past 12 months, did a committee of the legislature examine in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period?

- a. (100) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation on at least three occasions during a fiscal year, and it published reports with findings and recommendations.
- b. (67) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation on one or more occasion (but less than three times), and it published a report with findings and recommendations.
- c. (33) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation, but it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.
- d. (0) No, a committee did not examine in-year implementation.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: <http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/content/202> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/content/202>)

Comments: Researcher: The Committee of Economic Policy, Industry and Entrepreneurship of the Parliament (Milli Meclis) has such kind of practice to discuss in-year budget implementation, inviting for this senior representatives from the relevant government agencies. However, these discussion are not regular and frequently. Besides, there aren't any records and recommadtions which might be an evidence.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

115: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

- a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice.
- b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but in practice the executive shifts funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and in practice the executive shifts funds between administrative units before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Law on Budget System of AR: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>

(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Due to the Law on Budget System, article 18.4. "If necessary, relevant executive power body can make changes at budget allocation limits, within sections of functional classification, among the sections, sub-sections, paragraphs, items and subtotals of economic classification".

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

116: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

- a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and it does so in practice.
- b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, but in practice the executive spends these funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and in practice the executive spends these funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The Law on Budget System of AR <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>

(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Due to the Article 18. of the Law on Budget System "The execution of the state budget"; 18.4. If necessary, relevant executive power body can make changes at budget allocation limits, within sections of functional classification, among the sections, sub-sections, paragraphs, items and subtotals of economic classification. 18.5. In case incomes and funds envisaged for financing of deficit are less than the approved amount in the process of state budget execution, expenditures of functional and economic classification (excluding justified provisions of expenditures) can be reduced proportionally, while expenditures of administrative classification can be reduced in the manner specified by relevant executive power body. 18.6. The amount of funds envisaged in the state budget of the next year can be increased by 20 percent or reduced in the amount of additional funds entered in comparison with the forecast of local incomes by relevant executive power body in order to regulate local incomes and expenditures of the state budget in the process of state budget execution.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

117: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls (that is, revenues lower than originally anticipated) or other reasons during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

- a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the enacted levels in response to revenue shortfalls or other reasons, and it does so in practice.
- b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, but in practice the executive implements these cuts before seeking approval from the legislature.
- d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, and in practice the executive implements these spending cuts before seeking prior approval from the legislature.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The Law on Budget System of AR: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>

(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Due to the Article 18. of the Law on Budget System "The execution of the state budget"; 18.4. If necessary, relevant executive power body can make changes at budget allocation limits, within sections of functional classification, among the sections, sub-sections, paragraphs, items and subtotals of economic classification. 18.5. In case incomes and funds envisaged for financing of deficit are less than the approved amount in the process of state budget execution, expenditures of functional and economic classification (excluding justified provisions of expenditures) can be reduced proportionally, while expenditures of administrative classification can be reduced in the manner specified by relevant executive power body. 18.6. The amount of funds envisaged in the state budget of the next year can be increased by 20 percent or reduced in the amount of additional funds entered in comparison with the forecast of local incomes by relevant executive power body in order to regulate local incomes and expenditures of the state budget in the process of state budget execution. Due to the Article 23. of the Law on Budget System "Review of the state budget and application of curtailment to expenditures"; 23.8. According to the provisions 23.2, 23.3 and 23.4 of this Law, if it is considered to make changes to at the level of sections of the budget income classification and functional classification of the budget expenditures in the framework of approved incomes and expenditures of the state budget, relevant executive power body submits the following documents to the Milli Majlis (parliament) of the Republic of Azerbaijan:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the provision 18.5 of the Law on the Budget System of the RA, in case revenues are lower than projected, expenses can be reduced in the indicated way, a decision at the discretion of the relevant executive power. However, according to the provision 23.3 of the Law on the Budget System, if the revenue-expenses balance in the budget cannot be ensured with the measures taken in accordance with several provisions from Article 18 including the provision 18.5, the parliament (Milli Majlis) should be notified about the proposals of changes to the budget.

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer.

118: Did a committee of the legislature examine the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

- a. (100) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget within three months of its availability, and it published a report with findings and recommendations
- b. (67) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget within six months (but more than three months) of its availability, and it published a report with findings and recommendations.
- c. (33) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget, but it did so after the report had been available for more than six months or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.
- d. (0) No, a committee did not examine the Audit Report on the annual budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/1/nestr/21> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/nestr/21>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/HESABAT%20HP-2015.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/HESABAT%20HP-2015.pdf>) <http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/content/202> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/content/202>)

Comments: Researcher: The Committee of Economic Policy, Industry and Entrepreneurship of the Parliament (Milli Meclis) examines Audit Report on the annual budget within 3 months and prepared its finding and recommendations to be improved further.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the provision 17.2 of the Law of the Republic of Azerbaijan on the Internal Regulation of the Chamber of Accounts, The Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) submits the audit report on the implemented budget to the speaker of the Milli Majlis, who in turn submits it to the relevant

committees of the Milli Majlis including the Committee on the Economic Policy, Industry, and Entrepreneurship. In the provision, the date of the examination by the committees has not been indicated.

Researcher response: Agree with the reviewer.

IBP comment: IBP has revised the response on this indicator from 'a' to 'c', as there was no citation of any report with findings and recommendations, either on this questionnaire or on the website of the committee.

119: Was the process of appointing (or re-appointing) the current head of the SAI carried out in a way that ensures his or her independence?

- a. (100) Yes, the head of the SAI may only be appointed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the appointment takes effect.
- b. (0) No, the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>) <http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/content/39> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/content/39>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law on Chamber of Accounts and the Internal Regulation of the Chamber of Accounts, as well as the Internal Regulation of the Parliament of Azerbaijan indicate that the head of the Chamber appointed by Parliament of Azerbaijan

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

120: Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

- a. (100) Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.
- b. (0) No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>) <http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/content/39> (<http://meclis.gov.az/?/az/content/39>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law on Chamber of Accounts and the Internal Regulation of the Chamber of Accounts, as well as the Internal Regulation of the Parliament of Azerbaijan indicate that Parliament has to have a final consent before removing of the head of the Chamber of Accounts

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

121: Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

- a. (100) The SAI determines its own budget (i.e., submits it to the executive, which accepts it with little or no change, or directly to the legislature), or the budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. (67) The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. (33) The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. (0) The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law of Republic of Azerbaijan "On Chamber of Accounts" indicates that the Chamber of Accounts budget determines by Parliament (Milli Meclis) of Azerbaijan

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The SAI determines its own budget (i.e., submits it to the executive, which accepts it with little or no change, or directly to the legislature), or the budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.

Researcher response: I agree with the reviewer. The score should be changed to a.

122: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

- a. (100) The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- b. (67) The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
- c. (33) The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
- d. (0) The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law on Chamber of Accounts and the Internal Regulation of the Chamber of Accounts indicate that the Chamber has the right to decide which audits they wish. The only limit is, this list of audits must be included to the workplan beforehand.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

123: Are the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) reviewed by an independent agency?

- a. (100) Yes, an independent agency conducts and publishes a review of the audit processes of the SAI on an annual basis.
- b. (67) Yes, an independent agency conducts and publishes a review of the audit processes of the SAI at least once in the past five years, but not annually.
- c. (33) No, but a unit within the SAI conducts a review of the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis.
- d. (0) No, the audit processes of the SAI are reviewed neither by an independent agency nor by a unit within the SAI.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law of Republic of Azerbaijan "On Chamber of Accounts and the Internal Regulation of the Chamber of Accounts doesn't consist any of such kind of requirement. However, the Internal Regulation of SAI (article 25.2.2.) indicates that all official reports must be approved by the Board of SAI, and jsut after that (board meetings recorded) have to be sent to the Parliament

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

124: In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

- a. (100) Frequently (i.e., five times or more).
- b. (67) Sometimes (i.e., three times or more, but less than five times).
- c. (33) Rarely (i.e., once or twice).

- d. (0) Never.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/506> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/506>) <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/457> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/457>) <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/510> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/510>) <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/503> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/503>) <http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/442> (<http://sai.gov.az/1/newsmore/442>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law of Republic of Azerbaijan "On Chamber of Accounts and the Internal Regulation of the Chamber of Accounts indicate to have hearings in the Economic Policy, Industry and Entrepreneurship Committee of the Parliament and usually it happens twice a year. Besides CA has a rare meetings with other stakeholders, including media representatives.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

125: Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation of the annual budget (prior to the budget being tabled in parliament)?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on the budget.
b. (67) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on the budget.
c. (33) Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Law on "the Public Participation" ; <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law on the Public Participation indicates the engagement of the public to the discussion and getting the feedback from citizens on formulating and implementation of the government policy (projects), including budget discussion. However, in the practice the are rare cases when Ministry of Finance, or Ministry of Economy are conducts such kind of meetings with the relevant groups, mostly in the regions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

126: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive take concrete steps to include vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to include individuals and/or CSOs representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget.
b. (0) The requirements for an "a" response are not met.
c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The Law on "the Public Participation" ; <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879>)

Comments: Researcher: Answer choice "d" was selected for question 125. Therefore, per the OBS methodology the appropriate response is "b".

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

127:

During the budget formulation stage, which of the following key topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

- a. (100) The executive's engagement with citizens covers all six topics
b. (67) The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics
c. (33) The executive's engagement with citizens cover at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics
d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met
e. Not applicable (please comment)

Answer: d.

Sources: The Law on "the Public Participation" ; <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

128: Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on budget implementation.
b. (67) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on budget implementation.
c. (33) Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget implementation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: <http://budget.az> (<http://budget.az>) <http://www.refugees-idps-committee.gov.az/az/news/498.html> (<http://www.refugees-idps-committee.gov.az/az/news/498.html>) http://economy.gov.az/index.php?option=com_content&view=arti... (http://economy.gov.az/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=2645:iieti-22-09-2014&catid=8:news&Itemid=263&lang=en)
http://iqtisadiislahat.org/trainings/iqtisadi_islahatlarin_t...
(http://iqtisadiislahat.org/trainings/iqtisadi_islahatlarin_tehlili_ve_kommunikasiya_merkezinde_strateji_idareetme_movzusunda_telim_kecirilmisdir-30)

Comments: Researcher: The civic alliance National Budget Group initiates such kind of inputs in the monitoring and implementation of the annual budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: Executives, particularly MoF, have such kind of practice to invite independent experts and civic representatives to discuss monitoring and implementation of the budget, but no evidence of such meetings in the public sources. My (<http://sources.My>) opinion is the score "c" should be maintained.

IBP comment: IBP agrees that answer choice "c" should be retained based on the additional information provided by the researcher in the researcher comment box, rather than the information provided in the Sources and Comments boxes.

129: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive take concrete steps to receive input from vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to receive input from individuals from and/or organizations representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget.
b. (0) The requirements for an "a" response are not met.
c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

130:

During the implementation of the annual budget, which of the following topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Changes in macroeconomic circumstances
2. Delivery of public services
3. Collection of revenue
4. Implementation of social spending
5. Changes in deficit and debt levels
6. Implementation of public investment projects

- a. (100) The executive's engagement with citizens covers all six topics
- b. (67) The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics
- c. (33) The executive's engagement with citizens cover at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

131:

When the executive engages with the public, does it provide comprehensive prior information on the process of the engagement, so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

Comprehensive information must include at least three of the following elements:

1. Purpose
2. Scope
3. Constraints
4. Intended outcomes
5. Process and timeline

- a. (100) Comprehensive information is provided in a timely manner prior to citizens engagement in both budget formulation and implementation phases.
- b. (67) Comprehensive information is provided in a timely manner prior to citizens engagement only prior to one of the two phases (formulation OR implementation).
- c. (33) Information is provided in a timely manner in both or one of the two phases, but it is not comprehensive.
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (Please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: Agree. Changed to d.

IBP comment: IBP notes that for cross-country consistency purposes, the researcher revised the response from "c" to "d".

132: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used in the formulation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received and a detailed report of how the inputs were used in the formulation of the annual budget.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used in the formulation of the annual budget.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879>)

Comments: Researcher: The executive doesn't provide any further comments on citizen's feedback use.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

133: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive provide the public with information on how citizens' inputs have been used to assist in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received from the public and a detailed report of how the inputs were used to assist in monitoring the annual budget.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used to assist in monitoring the annual budget.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879>)

Comments: Researcher: The executive doesn't provide information how citizens' inputs have been used.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

134: Are participation mechanisms incorporated into the timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive incorporates participation into its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal and the timetable is available to the public.
- b. (0) The requirements for an "a" response are not met.
- c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>
(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)
http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015...
(http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/CB_2016%2004112015%20arial.pdf) <http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879> (<http://www.e-qanun.az/framework/26879>)

Comments: Researcher: No Budget Law, neither Citizen Budget Guide don't consist of information related participation mechanism incorporation into timetable for formulationg EBP.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

135: Do one or more line ministries use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation or implementation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, at least one line ministry uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on the budget.
- b. (67) Yes, at least one line ministry uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on the budget.
- c. (33) Yes, at least one line ministry uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation or implementation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: <http://www.refugees-idps-committee.gov.az/az/news/498.html> (<http://www.refugees-idps-committee.gov.az/az/news/498.html>)

Comments: Researcher: The State Committee of Refugees can provide such kind of inputs from the relevant group of people

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: The line ministries use participation mechanisms but do not publish the information on the input from the public.

Researcher response: The score c. is relevant, as, as minimum one line ministry (State Committe of Refugees) uses this mechanism.

IBP comment: IBP agrees with the reviewer suggesting "c" response. The State Committee of the Republic of Azerbaijan for Affairs of Refugees and IDPs is a governmental agency within the Cabinet of Ministers of Azerbaijan in charge of regulation of the issues related to refugees and internally displaced persons in Azerbaijan, including humanitarian aid and accommodation. One of the main tasks of the committee is to participate in the formulation of state policy in the field of problem solving and to ensure its implementation on an annual basis. To achieve this, they get involved with relevant government agencies, international and non-governmental organizations in order to facilitate the implementation of various types of ongoing projects. The reports of the activities of this agency for 2016 can be found at: <http://www.refugees-idps-committee.gov.az/az/pages/26.html> (<http://www.refugees-idps-committee.gov.az/az/pages/26.html>)

136: Does the legislature or the relevant legislative committee(s) hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the formulation of the annual budget (pre-budget and/or approval stages)?

- a. (100) Yes, public hearings are held, and members of the public/CSOs testify.
- b. (67) Yes, public hearings are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the public hearings, but contributions from the public are received through other means.
- c. (33) Yes, public hearings are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the public hearings, and there are no other mechanisms through which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: <http://meclis.gov.az/> (<http://meclis.gov.az/>) http://www.mia.az/w124686/Sakin%C9%99rin_t%C9%99%C5%9F%C9%99... (http://www.mia.az/w124686/Sakin%C9%99rin_t%C9%99%C5%9F%C9%99bb%C3%BCs%C3%BC_il%C9%99_Azay_Quliyevin_t%C9%99krar_g%C3%B6r...) <http://sia.az/az/news/politics/565037-qadin-seccilerle-novb...> (<http://sia.az/az/news/politics/565037-qadin-seccilerle-novbeti-gorus>)

Comments: Researcher: MP's use public hearing mechanism with their votes, to have a necessary feedback . Comparatively 2015, the overall situation has been improved due to the more frequent meetings and activeness of many of legislatures.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: National Parliament of Azerbaijan provided listening of MPs during discussion of Public budget. But before this discussions the budget proposal is giving to some MPs to discuss it with their experts (such as University teachers, academics etc.). After that MPs express this offers to NP.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: The website of the Milli Majlis allows the public to add their feedback on all draft laws.

Researcher response: The researcher acknowledges the peer and government reviewer comments. However, from a cross-country consistency perspective, none of the evidence cited qualifies for a "c" response or above. Therefore, the response is revised to "d".

IBP comment: IBP agrees with the researcher. Article 88 (IV) of the constitution states that "The assemblies of the sessions of the Milli Majlis of the Republic of Azerbaijan shall be open to the public", but there is no evidence that any member of public can testify or be invited to testify.

137:

During the legislative deliberations on the annual budget (pre-budget or approval stages), which of the following key topics does the legislature's (or relevant legislative budget committee) engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

- a. (100) The legislature seeks input on all six topics
- b. (67) The legislature seeks input on at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics
- c. (33) The legislature seeks input on at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: <http://meclis.gov.az/> (<http://meclis.gov.az/>) <http://m.lent.az/news/231500> (<http://m.lent.az/news/231500>) <http://metbuat.az/news/261428/qenire-pasayeva-elimerdanlida-...> (<http://metbuat.az/news/261428/qenire-pasayeva-elimerdanlida-gorus-kecirib.html>)

Comments: Researcher: Leguslatures' mostly focus on social spending policy and public investment projects.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IBP comment: For cross-country consistency purposes, the researcher's response is revised to "d" as the researcher revised the response to question 136 to "d".

138: Does the legislature provide feedback to the public on how citizens' inputs have been used during legislative deliberations on the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received from the public and a detailed report of how the inputs were used during legislative deliberations on the budget.
- b. (67) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used.
- c. (33) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...> (<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: Leguslatures' don't provide any feedback on inputs have been used

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

139: Does the legislature hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the Audit Report?

- a. (100) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held, and members of the public/CSOs testify.
- b. (67) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the hearings, but contributions from the public are received through other means.
- c. (33) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the hearings and there are no other mechanisms through which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
- d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: <http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20b...>

(<http://maliyye.gov.az/sites/default/files/The%20Law%20on%20budget%20system%20of%20the%20Republic%20of%20Azerbaijan.pdf>)

<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>

(<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law on Budget system and the Law on "Chambe of Accounts" don't include such kind of requirements for the legislature to hold public hearings on the Audit Report

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

140: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program (for example, by bringing ideas on agencies, programs, or projects that could be audited)?

- a. (100) Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in its audit program
- b. (0) The requirements for an “a” response are not met.
- c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>

(<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law on "Chambe of Accounts" and The Internal Regulation of Chamber of Accounts don't provide such kind of opportunities to get public suggestions, ideas to be included to the audit program of the Chamber of Accounts of Azerbaijan

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The Internal Regulation of Chamber of Accounts don't provide such kind of opportunities. Also Chamber of Accounts don't make discussion about audit opinion with public

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Provision 3.4 of “The Rules Determining the Functioning of the Chamber of Accounts” states that the input from the public is one of the components to be included to the work plan of the Chamber of Accounts.

Researcher response: The SAI reviewer is right, there is such legal base and practice, which Chamber uses in it's dayly work and partly ibdicates in the report.The Chamber's website includes feedback from citizens window and in the annual report it mentioned in the explaining of choosing the audit objects.The score a. might be maintained.

IBP comment: n/a

141: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used to determine its audit program?

- a. (100) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received and a detailed report of how the inputs were used to determine its audit program.
- b. (67) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used to determine its audit program.

- c. (33) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: The annual report of the Chamber of Accounts: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/HESABAT%20HP-2015.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/HESABAT%20HP-2015.pdf>) (p.69) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law on "Chamber of Accounts" and The Internal Regulation of Chamber of Accounts don't provide such kind of information related citizen's input and no evidence of such kind of feedback in the activity of the Chamber of Accounts of Azerbaijan. However, the annual report of Chamber of Accounts on 2015 includes the information on some appeals, received from the citizens, which have been used in the Chamber activity (p.69)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

142: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?

- a. (100) Yes, SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations.
b. (0) The requirements for an "a" response are not met.
c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q13.pdf>) <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/Q12.pdf>)

Comments: Researcher: The Law on "Chamber of Accounts" and The Internal Regulation of Chamber of Accounts don't provide such kind of mechanisms and there isn't any evidence of public contribution to the audit investigation, lead by Chamber of Accounts of Azerbaijan

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: According to the "Rules on attracting representatives of auditor organizations of the state government bodies, independent auditors, experts and separate experts in order to ensure the functioning of the Chamber of Accounts of the Republic of Azerbaijan", the Chamber of Accounts can engage experts, independent auditors etc. <http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/N8.pdf> (<http://sai.gov.az/upload/files/N8.pdf>)

Researcher response: The researcher acknowledges the government reviewer's comment. However, as there is no evidence to support public contribution to audit investigations, answer choice "b" is maintained.

JOIN OUR INTERNATIONAL NETWORK



Connect with organizations working to improve government budget systems, policies and outcomes!

JOIN

([HTTP://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/JOIN-OUR-NETWORK/](http://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/JOIN-OUR-NETWORK/)) FIND GROUPS

([HTTP://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/FINDGROUP/](http://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/FINDGROUP/))