COUNTRY QUESTIONNAIRE: BURUNDI

PBS-1: What is the fiscal year of the PBS evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

**Answer:** AF 2017

**Sources:** The document is produced by the Ministry of Public Finances usually in August of every year. Before 2015 (elections and instability) this Ministry produced the Pre Budget statement (called Document d'Orientation Budgetaire ou Lettre de Cadrage Budgetaire) regularly for two years (eg. 2014-2016) and openly (shared with partners under the IMF supervision). But now, the publication is rare. [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/dob_2014_2016.pdf](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/dob_2014_2016.pdf)

**Comments:** Researcher: For the last two years, 2015 and 2016, there are no support documents. I will wait for the official published documents in November 2016.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree with Comments
**Comments:** As of March 2017, there is no published DOB on the website of Ministry of Finance for 2016-2018.

PBS-2: When is the PBS made available to the public?

**a.** (100) At least four months in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the Executive’s Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature

**b.** (67) At least two months, but less than four months, in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the Executive’s Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature

**c.** (33) Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least one month before the Executive’s Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature

**d.** (0) The PBS is not released to the public, or is released less than one month before the Executive’s Budget Proposal is introduced to the legislature

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The PBS is an internal document sent to the secretary of government only for discussion before it is sent to the National Assembly (Parliament).

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree with Comments
**Comments:** The PBS used to be published (in August) but it is not the case anymore.

PBS-3a: If the PBS is published, what is the date of publication of the PBS? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** The PBS is an internal document not published but sent by the Ministry of Finance usually one month before it goes to the Parliament. By law, it was supposed to be sent 3 months before it is enacted.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree
**PBS-3b:** In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the PBS. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** The document is not published but is sent to Parliament after being adopted by the Government. There is a period in which it should be sent to the Parliament (3 months), which means September 30 for each year. But in fact, it is sent in November or in December.

---

**PBS-4:** If the PBS is published, what is the URL or weblink of the PBS? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** The document is not available since 2015 and even now (2017) due to instability.

---

**PBS-5:** If the PBS is published, are the numerical data contained in the PBS available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** n/a

---

**PBS-6a:** If the PBS is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

**Answer:** c.

**Sources:** Till 2014, the PBS was published for internal purpose, Budget discussion between the Ministry of Finances and other Government members. After agreed, the Budget was sent for adoption at the Government Council. Since, 2015 and till now (2016), the Government discusses and sends it to the Parliament.
**PBS-6b:** If you selected option “c” or “d” in question PBS-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the PBS was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question PBS-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** The PBS is produced for Government discussion and is not published anywhere before being sent to the Parliament.

**Sources:** The PBS could be available on the National Assembly website (published) during the period of discussion (in December). Therefore, the comments from the Finance Committee could be available but not published before it is enacted.

**PBS-7:** If the PBS is produced, please write the full title of the PBS. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** In 2013, the document was sent as ‘Lettre de Cadrage Budgétaire’ but the document is called Document d’Orientation Budgétaire (DOB). There were available in August for each year. [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/dob_2014_2016.pdf](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/dob_2014_2016.pdf)

**PBS-8:** Is there a “citizens version” of the PBS?

- a. Yes
- b. No

**Answer:** b.

**Sources:** The document doesn’t exist at all since the PBS is sent for internal purposes. But the idea of preparing that version is underway. Till today, the only version that refers to citizens version is published after the Enacted Budget.

**Comments:** Researcher: It is follow the discussion on the Budget on the official website of the Senate (including questions and comments addressed to the Minister of Finance). [http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597](http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597)

**EBP-1a:** What is the fiscal year of the EBP evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

**Answer:** FY 2017
**Sources:** The Executive Budget was adopted and it is the Enacted Budget that is published on the Ministry web site: http://finances.gov.bi/index.php/budgets with the following title: Loi N°1/20 du 31 Décembre 2016 portant fixation du Budget général de la République du Burundi pour l'exercice 2017

**Comments:** Researcher: Please note the Proposal itself is not be published (since 2015). The only version that exists is the Enacted.

**EBP-1b:** When is the EBP submitted to the legislature for consideration? Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016.

**Answer:** 25 November 2016.

**Sources:** http://www.burundi.gov.bi/spip.php?article1699

**Comments:** Researcher: It's expected that Budget Proposal for 2017 will be adopted by the Parliament in December, as the Finance Committee is still analysing it and preparing questions.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-2:** When is the EBP made available to the public?

- **a.** (100) At least three months in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- **b.** (67) At least two months, but less than three months, in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- **c.** (33) Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- **d.** (0) The EBP is not released to the public, or is released after the budget has been approved by the legislature

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The Budget Proposal is submitted as an internal document even to the Parliament without any official publication!

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-3a:** If the EBP is published, what is the date of publication of the EBP? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.” In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their date of publication.

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** The Budget proposal is not published.

**Comments:** Researcher: The Enacted Budget 2017 is the only document published.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

**EBP-3b:** In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EBP. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a
Sources: But by law, the Budget proposal is submitted to the Parliament, 3 months, before it is enacted!

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

**EBP-4:** If the EBP is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EBP? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their URL or weblink.

**Answer:** n/a

Sources: The EBP is for 2015 and 2016, not published. However, the Cour des Comptes publishes comments to facilitate discussion at the Parliament. For example, the last EBP comments are linked below: [http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/commentairesbudget2016.pdf](http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/commentairesbudget2016.pdf)

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

**EBP-5:** If the EBP is published, are the numerical data contained in the EBP or its supporting documents available in a machine readable format?

a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
c. No
d. Not applicable

d. **Answer:**

d. SOURCES: The EBP is not published, but during discussion, all data are available.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

**EBP-6a:** If the EBP is not publicly available, is it still produced?

a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
d. Not produced at all
e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

c. **Answer:**

c. SOURCES: The only reliable copy is available during discussion. This is an exception for this period of instability. Otherwise, the EBP 2015 was available on time.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

**EBP-6b:** If you selected option “c” or “d” in question EBP-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the EBP was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question EBP-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”
Answer: For the EBP used to be available online and on hard copy before it is submitted. But for 2016, the EBP is sent as an internal document and only available during it is submitted to the Parliament. The Parliement publishes highlights through the 'Cour des Comptes' portal (website, support documents).

Sources: The EBP is not published but the Cour des Comptes publishes highlights on their website:

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EBP-7: If the EBP is produced, please write the full title of the EBP. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” If there are any supporting documents to the EBP, please enter their full titles in the comment box below.

Answer: The EBP 2017 is called “PROJET DE BUDGET GENERAL DE L’ETAT, EXERCICE 2017”


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EBP-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the EBP?

a. Yes
b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: There is no citizens version till now. However, a similar version but for the Enacted Budget exists. A kind of summary and comments of the EB. http://finances.gov.bi/index.php/129-discours-d-ouverture-de… (http://finances.gov.bi/index.php/129-discours-d-ouverture-de-l-atelier-de-restitution-des-recommandations-et-observations-des-ateliers-provinciaux-de-dissemination-de-la-loi-de-finances-2016-par-son-excellence-dr-par-domtien-ndihokubwayo-ministre-des-finances-du-budget-et-de-la-privatisation)

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EB-1a: What is the fiscal year of the EB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

Answer: FY 2016


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EB-1b: When was the EB approved (enacted) by the legislature? Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016.

Answer: 

Sources:
**Answer:** 28 December 2015.

**Sources:** Comments and discussion were reported on the Senate website as the two chambers met with the Minister of Finance: [http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597](http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597)

---

**EB-2:** When is the EB made available to the public?

a. (100) Two weeks or less after the budget has been enacted  
b. (67) Between two weeks and six weeks after the budget has been enacted  
c. (33) More than six weeks, but less than three months, after the budget has been enacted  
d. (0) The EB is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the budget has been enacted

**Answer:** a. (100)


---

**EB-3a:** If the EB is published, what is the date of publication of the EB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.” Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

**Answer:** 05 January 2016

**Sources:** [http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597](http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597)

---

**EB-3b:** In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EB. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** The EB is published on the official website of the Ministry of Finance, at least one week after signature.


---

**EB-4:** If the EB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

---

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree
EB-5: If the EB is published, are the numerical data contained in the EB available in a machine readable format?

a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
c. No
d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: The EB is published in a PDF format, but not easily readable.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EB-6a: If the EB is not publicly available, is it still produced?

a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
d. Not produced at all
e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: The EB document is available/accessible to all.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EB-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question EB-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the EB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question EB-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: The source is accessible.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

EB-7: If the EB is produced, please write the full title of the EB. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”
EB-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the EB?

a. Yes  
b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: The CB doesn’t exist in the usual version. It is produced three months after the Enacted Budget. Moreover it is not accessible to public to all. The Ministry of Finance and the Institut for Development collaborate in producing the annual report.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

CB-1: What is the fiscal year of the CB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.” If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB please indicate the document the CB simplifies/refers to, and the fiscal year.

Answer: FY 2016

Sources: The document is produced for an internal use.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree  
Researcher response: Following the reviewer’s comment under CB-2b, I would like to add a clarification. The document is produced and a hard copy is available at the Ministry of Finance; it is accessible to everyone.

CB-2a: For the fiscal year indicated above, what is the public availability status of the CB. If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this questions for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their public availability status.

a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)  
b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)  
c. Produced for internal purposes/use only  
d. Not produced at all  
e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: b.

Sources: The document is available (displayed) in hard copy at each commune (district) of the country.

Peer Reviewer  
Opinion: Agree

CB-2b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question CB-2a above, please specify how you determined whether the CB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question CB-2a,
Answer: n/a

Sources: The hard copy is available to all. The reference link for the document present is the following http://finances.gov.bi/index.php/129-seance-de-questions-debat-sur-le-projet-de-loi-des-finances-2014-entre-le-ministere-des-finances-et-de-la-planification-du-developpement-economique-et-la-societe-civile

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree with Comments
Comments: answer to CB1 read: "Moreover it is not accessible to public to all" so it should be clarified how "The hard copy is available to all."
Researcher response: Thank you, this is correct. I added a note under CB-1. The hard copy is available to the public.

CB-3a: If the CB is published, what is the date of publication of the CB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.” If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their dates of publication.

Answer: n/a

Sources: There exist a Budget dissemination that is called Citizen Budget but that doesn't fit with the true definition.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

CB-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the CB. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: A discussion was done on Budget but no published document: http://www.finances.gov.bi/index.php/129-discours-d-ouverture-de-l-atelier-de-restitution-des-recommandations-et-observations-des-ateliers-provinciaux-de-dissemination-de-la-loi-de-finances-2016-par-son-excellence-dr-par-domitien-ndihokubwayo-ministre-des-finances-du-budget-et-de-la-privatisation
Comments: Researcher: The Citizen Budget doesn't exist in Burundi following the IBP definition. But there is a workshop on the Budget for discussion where Partners are invited to discuss with the Government. The called Citizen Budget was done under the World Bank supervision but it is not published..

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

CB-4: If the CB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the CB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their URL or weblink.

Answer: n/a

Sources: Ministry of Finance.
**CB-5:** If the CB is produced, please write the full title of the CB. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB, indicate the document the CB refers to and, next to it, its full title.

| Answer | Dissémination de la Loi de Finances 2016. |
| Sources | Ministry of Finance, Internal document. |

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

| Suggested answer | n/a Title is: Le Budget des Citoyens de 2016 |
| Comments | answer should be n/a |

**Researcher response:** The answer is correct, the document was produced (see responses to previous questions).

**CB-6:** If the CB is produced, please indicate which budget document it corresponds to. If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and which budget documents they simplify.

| Answer | The CB corresponds to the EB for 2016. It's a kind of summary report. |
| Sources | Ministry of Finance, internal document. |

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

**IYRs-1:** What is the fiscal year of the IYRs evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

| Answer | FY 2015 et FY 2016 |
| Sources | For 2015 and 2016, the In-Year Report are produced for internal purpose. |
| Comments | Researcher: The 2015 and 2016, traditional donors recuced their grants. |

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

**IYRs-2:** When are the IYRs made available to the public?

- a. (100) At least every month, and within one month of the period covered
- b. (67) At least every quarter, and within one month of the period covered
- c. (33) At least every quarter, and within three months of the period covered
- d. (0) The IYRs are not released to the public, or are released more than three months after the period covered

| Answer | d. |
| Sources | The IYRs are not accessible and not regular published except for internal purpose. |
Opinion: Agree

**IYRs-3a:** If the IYRs are published, what are the dates of publication of the IYRs? Specifically: if quarterly In-Year Reports are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least three of the last four IYRs that were publicly available. If monthly IYRs are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least seven of the last 12 IYRs that were publicly available. Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** The only copies are available late. [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/Execution_du_budget_de_l_Etat_trim_3_%202014.pdf](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/Execution_du_budget_de_l_Etat_trim_3_%202014.pdf)

Peer Reviewer
*Opinion: Agree*

**IYRs-3b:** In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the IYRs. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** The publication is not regular

Peer Reviewer
*Opinion: Agree*

**IYRs-4:** If the IYRs are published, what is the URL or weblink of the IYRs? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” Researchers should provide the weblink to the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the weblinks to older IYRs.

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** Late publication of 2014: [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/Execution_du_budget_de_l_Etat_trim_3_%202014.pdf](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/Execution_du_budget_de_l_Etat_trim_3_%202014.pdf) Late production of In-year report (Tableau des Opérations Financières de l’Etat), but not published!

Peer Reviewer
*Opinion: Agree*

**IYRs-5:** If the IYRs are published, are the numerical data contained in the IYRs available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** This document is produced but but not published on time. [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/rapport_execution_budget_2eme_trimestre_2014.pdf](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/rapport_execution_budget_2eme_trimestre_2014.pdf)
Comments: Researcher: The TOFE is regularly produced but lately published. It looks like this:
http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/tofe_fin...

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

IYRs-6a: If the IYRs are not publicly available, are they still produced?

a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
d. Not produced at all
e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: c.

Sources: The example are the links available on the website but published too late (for 2014):

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree with Comments
Comments: Is there certainty that those documents are still produced and distributed inside the government?
Researcher response: The documents are published with delay, hence not ‘publicly available’ according to the survey methodology but still produced.

IYRs-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question IYRs-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the IYRs were produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question IYRs-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: The Ministry of Finances has not published the In-year reports 2015.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

IYRs-7: If the IYRs are produced, please write the full title of the IYRs. If In-Year Reports are not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” Researchers should provide the full title of the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the full titles of older IYRs.

Answer: RAPPORT D'EXECUTION DU BUDGET DE L'ETAT POUR LE TROISIEME TRIMESTRE 2014


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

IYRs-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the IYRs?
**MYR-1:** What is the fiscal year of the MYR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

**Answer:** FY 2016

**Sources:** The Mid Year Review is a report produced by the Finance in June for each year and published in July. For example, in 2014 it was produced and published as follows: [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/budgets/projet_budget_revise_2014_adopte_conseil_ministre_16_07_2014.pdf](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/budgets/projet_budget_revise_2014_adopte_conseil_ministre_16_07_2014.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-2:** When is the MYR made available to the public?

a. (100) Six weeks or less after the midpoint 
b. (67) Nine weeks or less, but more than six weeks, after the midpoint 
c. (33) More than nine weeks, but less than three months, after the midpoint 
d. (0) The MYR is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the midpoint

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** Usually the 3rd week of July, it is published. But the MYR 2015 and 2016 were not produced.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-3a:** If the MYR is published, what is the date of publication of the MYR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** Due to instability, the MYR 2015 and 2016 were not produced.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

**MYR-3b:** In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the MYR. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a
Sources: The source of information and date is the Ministry of Finance.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

**MYR-4:** If the MYR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the MYR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

**MYR-5:** If the MYR is published, are the numerical data contained in the MYR available in a machine readable format?

a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
c. No
d. Not applicable

c

**Answer:** d.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

**MYR-6a:** If the MYR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
d. Not produced at all
e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

**Answer:** d.


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

**MYR-6b:** If you selected option “c” or “d” in question MYR-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the MYR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question MYR-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: d.

MYR-7: If the MYR is produced, please write the full title of the MYR. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a


MYR-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the MYR?

a. Yes
b. No

c. (33) More than nine months, but within 12 months, after the end of the budget year
d. (0) The MYR is not released to the public, or is released more than 12 months after the end of the budget year

Answer: d.

Sources: n/a

YER-1: What is the fiscal year of the YER evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

Answer: FY 2015

Sources: The YER is usually available in september of the next year by law (Law 1/35 of December 04 2008 related to Public Finance)

YER-2: When is the YER made available to the public?

a. (100) Six months or less after the end of the budget year
b. (67) Nine months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year
c. (33) More than nine months, but within 12 months, after the end of the budget year
d. (0) The YER is not released to the public, or is released more than 12 months after the end of the budget year

Answer: d.

Sources: It was published in 2016 in mid-june and sent to the Account Court for the audit.
**YER-3a:** If the YER is published, what is the date of publication of the YER? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** The YER 2015 is not yet produced yet then not published.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-3b:** In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the YER. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** The YER 2015 is not produced till now.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

**Comments:**
As of mid-April 2017, YER 2015 has not been published on the ministry of Finance website

**YER-4:** If the YER is published, what is the URL or weblink of the YER? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

**Answer:** n/a

**Sources:** idem

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

**YER-5:** If the YER is published, are the numerical data contained in the YER available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** They are published in Pdf.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree
YER-6a: If the YER is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: d.

Sources: The YER 2015 is not produced till now; an internal version mayb exist however.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Disagree
Suggested answer: d.
Comments: With not certainty that YER has been produced answer D is safer

Researcher response: I agree and change my answer from a to d. Until now, the YER for 2015 has not yet been published and it is not certain that it was produced.

YER-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question YER-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the YER was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question YER-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: Previous reports were produced and are available (2014, 2013. The problems of 2015 led to instability and the YER 2015 may be not ready as some grants were dropped (Eupean Union, GIZ...). The YER for 2015 is not prroduced till now!

Sources: The YER for 2015 was not produced or if it is produced it may be used for internal purpose.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Disagree
Suggested answer: n/a
Comments: answer should be n/a

Researcher response: Following your comment, I revised question YER-6a to “d”. Due to that, I'm explaining here how I determined that the document is not produced.

YER-7: If the YER is produced, please write the full title of the YER. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Disagree
Suggested answer: n/a full title: Rapport d'Exécution du Budget de l'Etat pour 2014.
Comments: answer should be n/a

Researcher response: Thank you. This is correct, the YER for the FY being analyzed here has not been produced until now and I am changing my answer to n/a. In 2014, the document was called “Rapport d'Exécution du Budget de l'Etat pour 2014”.

YER-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the YER?

- a. Yes
- b. No
AR-1: What is the fiscal year of the AR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

Answer: FY 2014

Sources: The AR is produced and published on the Account Cour web site.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-2: When is the AR made available to the public?

a. (100) Six months or less after the end of the budget year
b. (67) 12 months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year
c. (33) More than 12 months, but within 18 months, after the end of the budget year
d. (0) Does not release to the public, or is released more than 18 months after the end of the budget year

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: The Ministry of Finance and the Parliament websites.

Comments: Researcher: The Ministry of Finance make it in 12 months or 18 months. The Parliament through the Account Coirt audits within 3 months and publishes the next month.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-3a: If the AR is published, what is the date of publication of the AR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: 26 November 2015

Sources: The date may be correct because even the presentation of the report was done later, on december, 16, 2015. http://www.assemblee.bi/Presentation-du-Rapport-definitif

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the AR. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: The publication was done on the official web site. Selon la Revue Burundi Eco
AR-4: If the AR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the AR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."


Sources: [http://www.courdescomptes.bi](http://www.courdescomptes.bi/)

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-5: If the AR is published, are the numerical data contained in the AR available in a machine readable format?

a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
c. No
d. Not applicable

Answer: c.


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-6a: If the AR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
d. Not produced at all
e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: Produced and published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

AR-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question AR-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the AR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question AR-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Answer</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AR-7: If the AR is produced, please write</td>
<td>RAPPORT</td>
<td><a href="http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget2014.pdf">http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget2014.pdf</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the full title of the AR. If the document</td>
<td>DEFINITIF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>is not produced at all, researchers should</td>
<td>DE CONTROLE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>mark this question “n/a.”</td>
<td>DE l’EXECUTION</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>DU BUDGET</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>GENERAL DE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>L’ETAT,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EXERCICE 2014.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AR-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the</td>
<td>b.</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AR?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GQ-1a: Are there one or more websites or</td>
<td>a.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.assemblee.bi/">http://www.assemblee.bi/</a> (<a href="http://www.assemblee.bi/">http://www.assemblee.bi/</a>) provides very</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fiscal information? If yes, please provide</td>
<td></td>
<td>comptes.bi/) is for the Audit Report <a href="http://www.senat.bi/">http://www.senat.bi/</a> (<a href="http://www">http://www</a>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>the necessary links in the comment/citation.</td>
<td></td>
<td>senat.bi/) is for fiscal and debt informations. <a href="http://finances.gov">http://finances.gov</a>.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>is the portal of the Ministry of Finance information and publication.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GQ-1b: On these websites/portals, can</td>
<td>a.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>revenue and expenditure data for the current</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>fiscal year be downloaded as a consolidated</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>file (or set of files)? If yes, please</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>provide the necessary links in the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>comment/citation.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GQ-1c: On these websites/portals, can consolidated revenue and expenditure data be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

a. Yes
b. No

Answer: b.
Sources: n/a
Comments: Researcher: Most documents are posted for one fiscal year.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

GQ-1d: On these websites/portals, are infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

a. Yes
b. No

Answer: b.
Sources: n/a
Comments: Researcher: There is no simplified data access.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

GQ-2: Are there laws in place guiding public financial management and/or auditing? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where the law(s) contains specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

a. Yes
b. No

Answer: a.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree with Comments
GQ-3: Are there additional laws regulating: (1) access to information; (2) government transparency; or (3) citizens participation? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where these laws contain specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

a. Yes
b. No

Answer: b.


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

1: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

a. (100) Yes, administrative units accounting for all expenditures are presented.
b. (67) Yes, administrative units accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
c. (33) Yes, administrative units accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
d. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The administrative units accounting figure out in the annex. The Budget Proposal was adopted by the Government on November, 16th, 2016 but the proposal was not published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

2: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?

a. (100) Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification.
b. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by functional classification.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

3: If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the functional classification compatible with international standards?

a. (100) Yes, the functional classification is compatible with international standards.
b. (0) No, the functional classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by functional classification.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.
Sources: The classification follows international standards, and the Ministry was even assisted by the IMF and the W till 2015 BUT the proposal is not published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

4: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?

a. (100) Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.
b. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by economic classification.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: Some documents are available, but the Budget proposal is not.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

5: If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?

a. (100) Yes, the economic classification is compatible with international standards.
b. (0) No, the economic classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by economic classification.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The proposal is not published, only the Enacted Budget is published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

6: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
b. (67) Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
c. (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
d. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by program.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Proposal is presented by ministries and by programs BUT not published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

7: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?
a. (100) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
b. (67) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
c. (33) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
d. (0) No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any expenditure classification.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Budget Proposal is a multi-year document as but there is NO latest version.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

8: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?

a. (100) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
b. (67) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
c. (33) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
d. (0) No, multi-year estimates for programs are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Budget Proposal explains the hypothesis standing the projection by global program for 3 years BUT the last publication was done in 2013.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

9: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for all tax revenue are presented.
b. (67) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are presented.
c. (33) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are presented.
d. (0) No, individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The E. Budget Proposal is NOT published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

10: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented.
b. (67) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are presented.
c. (33) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues are presented.
d. (0) No, individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
### 11: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>(100) Yes, multi-year estimates of revenue are presented by category.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>(0) No, multi-year estimates of revenue are not presented by category.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** b.

**Sources:** The EBP is not published.

---

### 12: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>(100) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>(67) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>(33) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of revenue are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>(0) No, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The document is NOT published.

---

### 13: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a.</td>
<td>(100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b.</td>
<td>(67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>(33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d.</td>
<td>(0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The latest version for this fiscal year is NOT published.

---

### 14: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)
15: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
d. (0) No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: But for the FY 2017, the document is not available.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

16: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget? (The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
d. (0) No, information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: These informations are only included in the Pre Budget document: http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/dob_2014...

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

17: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
c. (33) Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect expenditure is presented.
d. (0) No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented.
18: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

- **a.** (100) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- **b.** (67) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- **c.** (33) Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented.
- **d.** (0) No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect revenues is not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The EB Proposal is NOT published.

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

19: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- **a.** (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- **b.** (67) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- **c.** (33) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- **d.** (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The document is not available.

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

20: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- **a.** (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- **b.** (67) Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- **c.** (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- **d.** (0) No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-1.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The document is NOT published for this fiscal year.

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree
21: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?

- (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.
- (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.
- Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.
Sources: The EBP is not published for this fiscal year.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

22: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- (67) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- (33) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: The Executive Budget Proposal is NOT published for this FY.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

23: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- (67) Yes, programs accounting for at least two-Thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-Thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- (0) No, not expenditures are presented by program for BY-2 and prior years.
- Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: The EBP is NOT published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

24: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

- (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- (33) Before BY-3.
- (0) No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
25: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category.
b. (0) No, revenue estimates for BY-1 are not presented by category.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The E.Budget Proposal is NOT published for this fiscal year.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

26: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

a. (100) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-1.
b. (67) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue for BY-1 are presented.
c. (33) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues for BY-1 are presented.
d. (0) No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-1.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP is NOT published for this FY.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

27: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?

a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.
b. (0) No, revenue estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The EBP is NOT published for this FY.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

28: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?
29: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

a. (100) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
b. (67) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
c. (33) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
d. (0) No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-2 and prior years.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The E. Budget Proposal is NOT published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

30: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

a. (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
b. (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
c. (33) Before BY-3.
d. (0) No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Executive Budget Proposal is NOT published for this FY.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

31: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year proceeding the budget year (BY-1)? (The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for government debt.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for government debt.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
d. (0) No, information related to government debt is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
32: In the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

a. (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
b. (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
c. (33) Before BY-3.
d. (0) No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The information on BY-2 or BY-1 can be found in other documents.

33: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some extra-budgetary funds.
d. (0) No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP is NOT published.

34: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, central government finances are presented on a consolidated basis.
b. (0) No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The document is NOT published for this FY.

35: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget year?
a. (100) Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
b. (67) Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all intergovernmental transfers are presented.
d. (0) No, estimates of intergovernmental transfers are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: EBP is NOT published for this FY.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

36: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, at least three alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
b. (67) Yes, two alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
c. (33) Yes, one alternative display of expenditures is presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
d. (0) No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP is not published!

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

37: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of transfers to public corporations for at least the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
b. (67) Yes, estimates of all transfers to public corporations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all transfers to public corporations are presented.
d. (0) No, estimates of transfers to public corporations are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The document is NOT published for this FY.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

38: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some quasi-fiscal activities.
d. (0) No, information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
39: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all financial assets.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all financial assets.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some financial assets.
d. (0) No, information related to financial assets is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP is NOT published!

40: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on nonfinancial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets by category.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all nonfinancial assets.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all nonfinancial assets.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some nonfinancial assets.
d. (0) No, information related to nonfinancial assets is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP is not published for this fiscal year.

41: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure arrears for at least the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
b. (67) Yes, estimates of all expenditure arrears are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all expenditure arrears are presented.
d. (0) No, estimates of expenditure arrears are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP is NOT published!
42: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all contingent liabilities.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all contingent liabilities.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some contingent liabilities.
- d. (0) No, information related to contingent liabilities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The document is not published for this Fiscal Year.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

43: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government’s future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term? (The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to assess the government’s future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented to assess the government’s future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The document is not published.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

44: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all sources of donor assistance are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the sources of donor assistance are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The EBP for 2017 was not published.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

45: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the revenue foregone.)
### 46: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues?

- **a.** Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- **b.** Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- **c.** Yes, estimates of some but not all earmarked revenues are presented.
- **d.** No, estimates of earmarked revenues are not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The document (EBP) is not published for this fiscal year.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

---

### 47: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government’s policy goals for the budget year?

- **a.** Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government’s policy goals for the budget year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- **b.** Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government’s policy goals for the budget year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- **c.** Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government’s policy goals for the budget year is presented.
- **d.** No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals for the budget year is not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The EBP 2017 is not published and no information was presented with free access.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

---

### 48: Does the Executive’s Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government’s policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

- **a.** Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government’s policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- **b.** Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government’s policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- **c.** Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government’s policy goals for a multi-year period is presented.
- **d.** No, information on the link between the budget and the government’s stated policy goals for a multi-year period is not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The EBP 2017 was not published.
d. (0) No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The document is not published/available.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

49: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).
b. (67) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.
c. (33) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).
d. (0) No, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The document is NOT published!

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

50: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).
b. (67) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.
c. (33) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).
d. (0) No, nonfinancial data on results are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The document is not published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

51: Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?

a. (100) Yes, performance targets are assigned to all nonfinancial data on results.
b. (67) Yes, performance targets are assigned to most nonfinancial data on results.
c. (33) Yes, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results.
d. (0) No, performance targets are not assigned to nonfinancial data on results, or the budget does not present nonfinancial data on results.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP report is not published for this FY.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree
52: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
b. (67) Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations are presented.
d. (0) No, estimates of policies that are intended to benefit directly the country’s most impoverished populations are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The document is not published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

53: Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget’s formulation)?

a. (100) Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
b. (67) Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
c. (33) Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
d. (0) No, a timetable is not issued to the public.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP is not published and not accessible to the public.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

54: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
d. (0) No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The document is not published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

55: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government’s expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a
discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)

**a.** (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government’s expenditure policies and priorities.

**b.** (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the government’s expenditure policies and priorities.

**c.** (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

**d.** (0) No, information related to the government’s expenditure policies and priorities is not presented.

**e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The PBS is not published for this FY-2017.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

---

**56:** Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government’s revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)

**a.** (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government’s revenue policies and priorities.

**b.** (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the government’s revenue policies and priorities.

**c.** (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.

**d.** (0) No, information related to the government’s revenue policies and priorities is not presented.

**e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The document is not published.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

---

**57:** Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

**a.** (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

**b.** (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

**c.** (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.

**d.** (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.

**e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The PBS is not published for this fiscal year

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

---

**58:** Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

**a.** (100) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented.

**b.** (0) No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.

**c.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** b.
### 59: Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** b. (67)

**Sources:** The Enacted Budget is published on the official web site where expenditures are classified by administrative units from page 33. [http://finances.gov.bi/images/Loi%20Budgtaire%202017.pdf](http://finances.gov.bi/images/Loi%20Budgtaire%202017.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Disagree  
**Suggested answer:** b.  
**Comments:** There are both administrative (per each ministry) and economic classifications in the EB  
**Researcher response:** This is correct, I changed my answer from c to b.

### 60: Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by program.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** a. (100)

**Sources:** All programmes with resources allocation are presented in the BY 2017. Here is the link: [http://www.finances.gov.bi/images/Loi%20Budgtaire%202017.pdf](http://www.finances.gov.bi/images/Loi%20Budgtaire%202017.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Not Qualified

### 61: Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. No, the Enacted Budget does not present revenue estimates by category.</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** a. (100)

**Sources:** Yes, following international standards: Tax, non tax revenue and grant. Pages 1-9

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree
62: Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?

a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
b. (67) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
c. (33) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
d. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present individual sources of revenue.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Individual sources are presented. Pages 1-9

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

63: Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: On the following, page 4/179 is the amount on net debt, no interest payment: http://finances.gov.bi/images/Loi%20Budgtaire%202017.pdf

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

64: What information is provided in the Citizens Budget? (The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)

a. (100) The Citizens Budget provides information beyond the core elements.
b. (67) The Citizens Budget provides the core information.
c. (33) The Citizens Budget provides information, but it excludes some core elements.
d. (0) The Citizens Budget is not published.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The so called citizen budget in Burundi is produced after the enacted budget to bring some inputs and comments on the Enacted Budget. The CB is produced usually three months after the EB, but this year it is was produced in june.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

65: How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

a. (100) A Citizens Budget is disseminated widely through a combination of at least three different appropriate tools and media (such as the Internet, billboards, radio programs, newspapers, etc.).
b. (67) A Citizens Budget is published by using at least two, but less than three, means of dissemination, but no other dissemination efforts are undertaken by the executive.
c. (33) A Citizens Budget is disseminated only by using one means of dissemination.
d. (0) A Citizens Budget is not published.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** http://finances.gov.bi/index.php/129-discours-d-ouverture-de-l-atelier-de-restitution-des-recommandations-et-observations-des-ateliers-provinciaux-de-dissemination-de-la-loi-de-finances-2016-par-son-excellence-dr-par-domitien-ndihokubwayo-ministre-des-finances-du-budget-et-de-la-privatisation) Because the citizens budget was not put online, this is scored "d". However, it seems that the citizens budget was produced in paper copy.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

---

**66:** Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public’s requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?

a. (100) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public’s requirements for budget information in the Citizen’s Budget, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
b. (67) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public’s requirements for budget information in the Citizen’s Budget; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.
c. (33) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public’s requirements for budget information in the Citizen’s Budget, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
d. (0) No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public’s requirements for budget information in the Citizen’s Budget.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The Citizen Budget requires some inputs from partners, ministries, administration and only some representatives of local community.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

---

**67:** Are “citizens” versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?

a. (100) A citizens version of budget documents is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit).
b. (67) A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process.
c. (33) A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least one stage of the budget process.
d. (0) No citizens version of budget documents is published.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** It’s produced during the dissemination and may be published (not sure), but is not online.

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

---

**68:** Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

a. (100) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
b. (67) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by two of the three expenditure classifications.
c. (33) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
d. (0) No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by any expenditure classification.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:**
69: Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?

- (100) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- (67) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- (33) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- (0) No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Individual programmes are presented, but not enough execution reports are available to be considered.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree with Comments
Comments: By ministry and by broad category of expense (wages, goods and services, subsidies and investments)

70: Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- (100) Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.
- (0) No, comparisons are not made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The execution reports are not available, however in older reports, the comparison is made between execution and prediction.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

71: Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- (100) Yes, In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.
- (0) No, In-Year Reports do not present actual revenue by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The execution reports are not available, however in older reports, resources execution is presented. (Table n°1, page 16/25)

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree
**72**: Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a.</strong></td>
<td>(100) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for all revenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b.</strong></td>
<td>(67) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c.</strong></td>
<td>(33) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>d.</strong></td>
<td>(0) No, In-Year Reports do not present individual sources of actual revenue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>e.</strong></td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer**: d.

**Sources**: The execution reports are not available, however in older reports, All revenues are presented.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion**: Agree

**73**: Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a.</strong></td>
<td>(100) Yes, comparisons are made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b.</strong></td>
<td>(0) No, comparisons are not made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c.</strong></td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer**: b.

**Sources**: The execution reports are not available, and in older reports, Comparison is between execution and prediction, and the two periods.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion**: Agree

**74**: Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding; and interest payments?

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a.</strong></td>
<td>(100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b.</strong></td>
<td>(67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c.</strong></td>
<td>(33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>d.</strong></td>
<td>(0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>e.</strong></td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer**: d.

**Sources**: The execution reports are not available, however in older reports, the borrowing is not presented entirely. The page 12/25 presents only some elements. [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/rapport_...](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/rapport_execution_budget_2eme_trimestre_2014.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion**: Agree

**75**: Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>a.</strong></td>
<td>(100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>b.</strong></td>
<td>(67) Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>c.</strong></td>
<td>(33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>d.</strong></td>
<td>(0) No, information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>e.</strong></td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer**: d.

**Sources**: The execution reports are not available, however in older reports, the borrowing is not presented entirely. The page 12/25 presents only some elements. [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/rapport_...](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/rapport_execution_budget_2eme_trimestre_2014.pdf)
76: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?

a. (100) Yes, the estimates for the macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.

b. (67) Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.

c. (33) Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated forecast is not presented.

d. (0) No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The execution reports are not available, however in older reports, The document is comparable to the Enacted Budget but doesn't exist since 2014: http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/budgets/projet_budget...

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

77: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.

b. (67) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.

c. (33) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is not presented.

d. (0) No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The document seems to have disappeared or exist for internal use.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

78: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

b. (67) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.

c. (33) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

d. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
79: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
b. (67) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
c. (33) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
d. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Not produced after 2014.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Disagree
Suggested answer: d.
Comments: should be d
Researcher response: This is correct, thank you.

80: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.
b. (67) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.
c. (33) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is not presented.
d. (0) No, revenue estimates have not been updated.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: See previous comment.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

81: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents revenue estimates by category.
b. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: Same comment

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

82: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present individual sources of revenue?
83: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?

- **a.** (100) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on all of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.
- **b.** (67) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on some of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.
- **c.** (33) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, but information on the differences between the original and updated estimates is not presented.
- **d.** (0) No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The document is no more published.

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

84: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

- **a.** (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- **b.** (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- **c.** (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all expenditures are presented.
- **d.** (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures are not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The End Year Report (Revue de Fin d'année) is not produced. Only the In Year report was produced for the 9 first months (Revue du troisième trimestre) and serve to prepare the Budget for the following year. However, the executed budget is produced almost two years after the fiscal year: [http://www.finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/Execution_du_budget_de_l_Etat_2014_Version_finale.pdf](http://www.finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/Execution_du_budget_de_l_Etat_2014_Version_finale.pdf)

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

85: Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?
a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).

b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.

c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.

d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The document is produced after conventional period.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

86: Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.

b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.

c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.

d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by program.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: See comment on Q.85.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

87: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.

b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.

c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all revenues are presented.

d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for revenues are not presented.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Idem

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

88: Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents revenue estimates by category.

b. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present revenue estimates by category.

c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: Idem

Peer Reviewer
89: Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?

a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present individual sources of revenue.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: Same comment.

90: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.
d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: Idem

91: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.
d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: Same comment.
### 92: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?

- **a.** (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- **b.** (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- **c.** (33) Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented.
- **d.** (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** Same comment.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

### 93: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?

- **a.** (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- **b.** (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- **c.** (33) Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented.
- **d.** (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** Same comment.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree

### 94: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

- **a.** (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- **b.** (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- **c.** (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented.
- **d.** (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are not presented.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** Same comment.

**Peer Reviewer**  
**Opinion:** Agree
### 95: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. (100)</td>
<td>Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. (67)</td>
<td>Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. (33)</td>
<td>Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. (0)</td>
<td>No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome is not presented.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** Idem

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

### 96: Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. (100)</td>
<td>Yes, a financial statement is part of the Year-End Report or is released as a separate report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. (0)</td>
<td>No, a financial statement is neither part of the Year-End Report nor released as a separate report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** b.

**Sources:** The financial statement is a small monthly report (TOFE) and produced separately from the Year End Report! http://finances.gov.bi/index.php/publications/85-publication... (http://finances.gov.bi/index.php/publications/85-publications-ministere-des-finances)

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

### 97: What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. (100)</td>
<td>The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. (67)</td>
<td>The SAI has conducted two of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. (33)</td>
<td>The SAI has conducted one of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. (0)</td>
<td>The SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e.</td>
<td>Not applicable/other (please comment).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The Audit Court has not conducted any kind of audit in the recent period. The latest covered 2014 and was published on the following website: http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget20… (http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget2014.pdf)

**Peer Reviewer**
**Opinion:** Agree

### 98: What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Option</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>a. (100)</td>
<td>All expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. (67)</td>
<td>Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. (33)</td>
<td>Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Answer:**
d. (0) No expenditures have been audited.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d. (100)
Sources: http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget20...

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

99: What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

a. (100) All extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
b. (67) Extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
c. (33) Extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
d. (0) No extra-budgetary funds have been audited.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: From the last audit report: http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget20...
(http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget2014.pdf)

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

100: Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?

a. (100) Yes, the annual Audit Report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.
b. (0) No, the annual Audit Report(s) does not include an executive summary.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)
Sources: http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget20...

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

101: Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

a. (100) Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
b. (67) Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
c. (33) Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
d. (0) No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: No, the executive doesn't report on steps.
102: Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

a. (100) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit recommendations.
b. (67) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on most audit recommendations.
c. (33) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on some audit recommendations.
d. (0) No, neither the SAI nor legislature reports on steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: No recent audit report published by the SAI.

103: Is there an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) that conducts budget analyses for the budget formulation and/or approval process?

a. (100) Yes, there is an IFI, its independence is set in law, and it has sufficient staffing and resources, including funding, to carry out its tasks.
b. (67) Yes, there is an IFI, but either its independence is not set in law or its staffing and resources, including funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.
c. (33) Yes, there is an IFI, but its independence is not set in law and its staffing and resources, including funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.
d. (0) No, there is no IFI.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Law n°1/18 of september 06 2013 related to the fiscal procedures. Law n°1/5 of December 04 2008 related to the Public Finances.

104: Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts?

a. (100) Yes, the IFI publishes its own macroeconomic and fiscal forecasts.
b. (67) Yes, the IFI publishes its own macroeconomic or fiscal forecast.
c. (33) No, the IFI does not publish its own macroeconomic or fiscal forecast, but it does publish an assessment of the official macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts produced by the executive.
d. (0) No, there is no IFI; or the IFI neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts produced by the executive.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: There is no IFI. The FI does exist but an internal service of the Ministry.
Comments: Researcher: The macroeconomic forecasts is done by an internal service to the Ministry of Finance.

105: Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish its own costings of new policy proposals, to assess their impact on the budget?
a. (100) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of all new policy proposals.
b. (67) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of major new policy proposals.
c. (33) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of a limited number of new policy proposals.
d. (0) No, there is no IFI; or the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The IFI doesn't exist by law.
Comments: Researcher: By law and in fact, the IFI doesn't exist with the known mandate. However, some institutes and research services can comment on the enacted budget or provide some clarification on the Budget balance or deficit and how to finance it and other implications.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

106: In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

a. (100) Frequently (i.e., five times or more).
b. (67) Sometimes (i.e., three times or more, but less than five times).
c. (33) Rarely (i.e., once or twice).
d. (0) Never.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: There is no IFI in Burundi.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

107: Does the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?

a. (100) Yes, the full legislature debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the upcoming budget.
b. (67) Yes, a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the upcoming budget.
c. (33) Yes, the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, but it does not approve recommendations for the upcoming budget.
d. (0) No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.
e. (0) Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: There is no debate.
Comments: Researcher: Usually, the Finance Commission has no mandate to debate on the tabling of the Executive Budget Proposal. Only the ministries can debate when they are invited by the Ministry of Finances.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

108: How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive's Budget Proposal?

a. (100) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least three months before the start of the budget year.
b. (67) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.
c. (33) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two months, before the start of the budget year.
d. (0) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month before the start of the budget year, or does not receive it all.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).
109: When does the legislature approve the Executive’s Budget Proposal?

- **d.** The legislature approves the budget more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The senate website comment: [http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597](http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597) It was received on December 1st 2015.

**Comments:** Researcher: Usually, the legislature receive it in December as the fiscal year starts in January. However, by law, they should receive it three months before the next fiscal year; which means September.

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

110: Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive’s Budget Proposal?

- **b.** The legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive’s Budget Proposal, with some limitations.

**Answer:** b. (67)


**Comments:** Researcher: In fact, the legislature approves the budget the last week of December.

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

111: During the most recent budget approval process, did the legislature use its authority in law to amend the Executive’s Budget Proposal?

- **c.** No, while the legislature has the authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive’s Budget Proposal, but no amendments were offered.

**Answer:** c. (33)

**Sources:** Law n°1/35 of December 04 2008 dedicated to the Public Finances, article n°34 (available online on www.assemblee.bi/IMG/pdf/loi_n1-35_du_04_decembre_2008.pdf).

**Comments:** Researcher: In fact, the Parliament can’t increase expenditures without increasing equivalent resources to respect Budget balance.

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

**Sources:** The official Senate website presented all discussions with the Minister of Finances, part IV related to the The Conclusion.

**Comments:** Researcher: The Finance Commission has sent their report (including amendments and recommendations) to the Parliament and then to the Senate who approved the Budget Proposal at 100%.
112: During the last budget approval process, did a specialized budget or finance committee in the legislature examine the Executive’s Budget Proposal?

a. (100) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee had at least one month to examine the Executive’s Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
b. (67) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee had less than one month to examine the Executive’s Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
c. (33) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee examined the Executive’s Budget Proposal, but it did not publish a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
d. (0) No, a specialized budget or finance committee did not examine the Executive’s Budget Proposal.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: There Finance Commission examines the Budget and proposes amendments and recommendation to the Parliament or the Senate.
http://www.senat.bi/?p=1597

Comments: Researcher: The Finance Commission received the Budget Proposal on November 24, 2016 and had less than one month to discuss and adopt it. The Budget was approved by the two Parliament Chambers on December 22 & 23, 2016. The publication of the highlights and discussion summary were published after adoption, on the next day, Saturday 24. https://www.rtnb.bi/fr/art.php?idapi=0/5/179

113: During the last approval process, did legislative committees, responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.), examine spending in the Executive’s Budget Proposal related to the sector for which they are responsible?

a. (100) Yes, sector committees had at least one month to examine the Executive’s Budget Proposal, and they published reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
b. (67) Yes, sector committees had less than one month to examine the Executive’s Budget Proposal, and they published reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
c. (33) Yes, sector committees examined the Executive’s Budget Proposal, but they did not publish reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
d. (0) No, sector committees did not examine the Executive’s Budget Proposal.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: There are many commissions but they don’t publish reports but as are either for internal use but recommendations help to instruct laws.
http://www.assemblee.bi/-Commissions-permanentes- It’s the only committee that is usually involved is the Finances Committee. It raised concerns, prepares questions that will be addressed to the Minister of Finances and suggest some recommendations before adopting the Budget.

Comments: Researcher: The other sector committees didn’t publish report during this year.

114: In the past 12 months, did a committee of the legislature examine in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period?

a. (100) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation on at least three occasions during a fiscal year, and it published reports with findings and recommendations.
b. (67) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation on one or more occasion (but less than three times), and it published a report with findings and recommendations.
c. (33) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation, but it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.
d. (0) No, a committee did not examine in-year implementation.
115: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

- a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice.
- b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but in practice the executive shifts funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and in practice the executive shifts funds between administrative units before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: According to the Law n°1/35 of December 04 2008 on Public Finances Publiques (art.56), The In-Year implementation of the EB is approved by the Parliament.


Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

116: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

- a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and it does so in practice.
- b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, but in practice the executive spends these funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and in practice the executive spends these funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.


Comments: Researcher: According to the Law N°1/35 of December 04/2008, article n°25 states up that "les textes réglementaires modifiant les crédits doivent être ratifiés dans la plus prochaine la loi de finances rectificative de l'exercice considéré...".

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

117: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls (that is, revenues lower than originally anticipated) or other reasons during
the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the enacted levels in response to revenue shortfalls or other reasons, and it does so in practice.

b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.

c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, but in practice the executive implements these cuts before seeking approval from the legislature.

d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, and in practice the executive implements these spending cuts before seeking prior approval from the legislature.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The law does exist, but the Executive will just notice the fact in the In-Year Report.
Comments: Researcher: In practice, in time of shortage, the Ministry will refer to the art.24 of the Law 1/35 of December 2008.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

118: Did a committee of the legislature examine the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

a. (100) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget within three months of its availability, and it published a report with findings and recommendations.

b. (67) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget within six months (but more than three months) of its availability, and it published a report with findings and recommendations.

c. (33) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget, but it did so after the report had been available for more than six months or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.

d. (0) No, a committee did not examine the Audit Report on the annual budget.

e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Audit Court was done by the Cour des Compte (Account Court) and approved on November, 11 of 2015 the In-Year report sent on 2015, within 6 months. Source: http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/executionbudget2014.pdf , page x (Preambule).

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

IBP comment: The response was changed from 'b' to 'd'. The report cited by the researcher is from the court of accounts and not the legislature. In the absence of evidence of a legislative committee having examined the Audit Report, the response is ‘d’.http://www.assemblee.bi/Commission-des-Comptes-Publics-et (http://www.assemblee.bi/Commission-des-Comptes-Publics-et)

119: Was the process of appointing (or re-appointing) the current head of the SAI carried out in a way that ensures his or her independence?

a. (100) Yes, the head of the SAI may only be appointed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the appointment takes effect.

b. (0) No, the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.

c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: There a two laws that can provide information of the appointment process:
Comments: Researcher: The art.15 of the Law n°1/017 of 2005 May 12th states that the SAI members are independent. But the art.4 precisesthat the SAI members are nominated by the executive and art.6 mentions that members are recruited from the public services!
120: Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

a. (100) Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.
b. (0) No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: [http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/magistrats.pdf](http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/magistrats.pdf), Art.4. The SAI Head is nominated by decree (President) but on the proposition and with the approval of the Parliament. In theory, he can't be removed (art.15), and has to finish his term (mandate). But the art.51 makes an exception.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

121: Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

a. (100) The SAI determines its own budget (i.e., submits it to the executive, which accepts it with little or no change, or directly to the legislature), or the budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
b. (67) The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
c. (33) The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
d. (0) The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The SAI is assumed to have the required resources (from the executive) but in fact they are not consistent as the budget resources have not changed since 2015. However and by law n°1/017 of May, 12, 2005; the SAI members benefit from multiple advantages: art. 22-33 Comments: Researcher: The SAI, here the Cour des Comptes had a budget of Fbu 971 millions in 2016; in 2017, they have the same budget. [http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/loi_du_budget_2016.pdf](http://finances.gov.bi/images/download/publications/loi_du_budget_2016.pdf) on page 39/172 and page 85/180 of the Budget 2017.

122: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

a. (100) The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
b. (67) The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
c. (33) The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
d. (0) The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: By law n°1/002 of Marc, 31, 2004 creating the SAI (Cour des Comptes), the art.2 states out that the SAI assists the Parliament for the audit control. The art. 3 adds that SAI can make complements but at the Parliament request. The art.51 may emphasize on the deep investigation that may be made. [http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/magcreation_mission_fonct.pdf](http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/magcreation_mission_fonct.pdf)
123: Are the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) reviewed by an independent agency?

- **a.** (100) Yes, an independent agency conducts and publishes a review of the audit processes of the SAI on an annual basis.
- **b.** (67) Yes, an independent agency conducts and publishes a review of the audit processes of the SAI at least once in the past five years, but not annually.
- **c.** (33) No, but a unit within the SAI conducts a review of the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis.
- **d.** (0) No, the audit processes of the SAI are reviewed neither by an independent agency nor by a unit within the SAI.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** By law, they can make investigation (using an expert) but not using an independent agency. See mission of the Cour des Comptes on: [http://www.courdescomptes.bi/](http://www.courdescomptes.bi/)

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

124: In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

- **a.** (100) Frequently (i.e., five times or more).
- **b.** (67) Sometimes (i.e., three times or more, but less than five times).
- **c.** (33) Rarely (i.e., once or twice).
- **d.** (0) Never.
- **e.** Not applicable/other (please comment).

**Answer:** c. (33)

**Sources:** During a parliament session, the President of the Account Court presents the audit report. Otherwise, it's not usual to hear about the account court. [http://www.assemblee.bi/Presentation-du-Rapport-definitif](http://www.assemblee.bi/Presentation-du-Rapport-definitif)

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree

125: Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation of the annual budget (prior to the budget being tabled in parliament)?

- **a.** (100) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on the budget.
- **b.** (67) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on the budget.
- **c.** (33) Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
- **d.** (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
- **e.** Not applicable (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** There is an open discussion between the Ministry of Finance and other ministries during the phase of budget budget. Public or groups are not invited. However, the Budget formulation follow a development planning (5 years, such as the Poverty Reduction Framework) that provides key elements for the annual budget.

Peer Reviewer
**Opinion:** Agree
126: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive take concrete steps to include vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget?

a. (100) Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to include individuals and/or CSOs representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget.

b. (0) The requirements for an “a” response are not met.

c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: The discussion on inclusiveness often takes place during the Parliament session and doesn't include public in the budget formulation.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

127: During the budget formulation stage, which of the following key topics does the executive’s engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:
1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

a. (100) The executive's engagement with citizens covers all six topics

b. (67) The executive’s engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics

c. (33) The executive’s engagement with citizens cover at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics

d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met

e. Not applicable (please comment)

Answer: d.

Sources: The budget formulation covers the six key elements and can be found in the 'exposés des motifs'.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

128: Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

a. (100) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on budget implementation.

b. (67) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on budget implementation.

c. (33) Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget implementation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).

d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.

e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The executive invites Partners (IMF, WB and others) and not individuals or groups for budget discussions.

Peer Reviewer
129: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive take concrete steps to receive input from vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget?

a. (100) Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to receive input from individuals from and/or organizations representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget.
b. (0) The requirements for an “a” response are not met.
c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: There is no mechanism which should allow to the vulnerable groups or represent to the executive; except, through the Ministry of solidarity or social affairs which is dedicated to those kind of activities.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

130: During the implementation of the annual budget, which of the following topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:
1. Changes in macroeconomic circumstances
2. Delivery of public services
3. Collection of revenue
4. Implementation of social spending
5. Changes in deficit and debt levels
6. Implementation of public investment projects

a. (100) The executive's engagement with citizens covers all six topics
b. (67) The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics
c. (33) The executive's engagement with citizens cover at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics
d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: There is a called ‘citizen budget’ published by the Ministry of Finance and the Institute for Economic Development (www.idec.org.bi). The main objectives of this document are to inform citizens on the priorities included in the enacted budget. The dissemination/discussion done under this citizen budget doesn't aim to make changes in the implementation but to inform.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

131: When the executive engages with the public, does it provide comprehensive prior information on the process of the engagement, so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

Comprehensive information must include at least three of the following elements:
1. Purpose
2. Scope
3. Constraints
4. Intended outcomes
5. Process and timeline
132: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive provide the public with feedback on how citizens’ inputs have been used in the formulation of the annual budget?

- **a.** (100) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received and a detailed report of how the inputs were used in the formulation of the annual budget.
- **b.** (67) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of how the inputs were used in the formulation of the annual budget.
- **c.** (33) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
- **d.** (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
- **e.** Not applicable (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** Inputs included in the budget formulation don't come from the public, but from Ministries and public services.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

133: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive provide the public with information on how citizens' inputs have been used to assist in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

- **a.** (100) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received from the public and a detailed report of how the inputs were used to assist in monitoring the annual budget.
- **b.** (67) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of how the inputs were used to assist in monitoring the annual budget.
- **c.** (33) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
- **d.** (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
- **e.** Not applicable (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The executive doesn't receive directly citizens inputs.

**Peer Reviewer**

**Opinion:** Agree

134: Are participation mechanisms incorporated into the timetable for formulating the Executive’s Budget Proposal?

- **a.** (100) Yes, the executive incorporates participation into its timetable for formulating the Executive’s Budget Proposal and the timetable is available to the public.
- **b.** (0) The requirements for an “a” response are not met.
- **c.** Not applicable (please comment).

**Answer:** a.
Answer: b.
Sources: Citizens or civil servants are included in the process. Only public institutions are involved.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

135: Do one or more line ministries use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation or implementation of the annual budget?

a. (100) Yes, at least one line ministry uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on the budget.
b. (67) Yes, at least one line ministry uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on the budget.
c. (33) Yes, at least one line ministry uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation or implementation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: There is no direct public participation in the budget formulation or implementation.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

136: Does the legislature or the relevant legislative committee(s) hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the formulation of the annual budget (pre-budget and/or approval stages)?

a. (100) Yes, public hearings are held, and members of the public/CSOs testify.
b. (67) Yes, public hearings are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the public hearings, but contributions from the public are received through other means.
c. (33) Yes, public hearings are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the public hearings, and there are no other mechanisms through which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.
Sources: There is no public hearings in this process.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

137: During the legislative deliberations on the annual budget (pre-budget or approval stages), which of the following key topics does the legislature's (or relevant legislative budget committee) engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:
1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services
a. (100) The legislature seeks input on all six topics.
b. (67) The legislature seeks input on at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics.
c. (33) The legislature seeks input on at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics.
d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The public/citizens is not invited in the process.
Comments: Researcher: The public is not invited.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

138: Does the legislature provide feedback to the public on how citizens’ inputs have been used during legislative deliberations on the annual budget?

a. (100) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received from the public and a detailed report of how the inputs were used during legislative deliberations on the budget.
b. (67) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of how the inputs were used.
c. (33) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: No feedback since the public is not invited in the process.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

139: Does the legislature hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the Audit Report?

a. (100) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held, and members of the public/CSOs testify.
b. (67) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the hearings, but contributions from the public are received through other means.
c. (33) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the hearings and there are no other mechanisms through which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: There is no direct hearings from the public; however, any specialized commission or the audit court can investigate if there is a concern expressed by the public through medias or other channels.

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

140: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in the SAI’s audit program (for example, by bringing ideas on agencies, programs, or projects that could be audited)?

a. (100) Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in its audit program.
b. (0) The requirements for an “a” response are not met.
c. Not applicable (please comment).

**Answer:** b.

**Sources:** The public can't suggest any topic or issue directly to the SAI. The SAI can investigate at the request of the national assembly http://www.courdescomptes.bi/assets/images/magcreation_mission_fonct.pdf (page3, mission and coverage)

---

**141:** Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide the public with feedback on how citizens’ inputs have been used to determine its audit program?

a. (100) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received and a detailed report of how the inputs were used to determine its audit program.
b. (67) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used to determine its audit program.
c. (33) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

**Answer:** d.

**Sources:** The public is not invited by the SAI; but can pass by the Parliament or Senate.

---

**142:** Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?

a. (100) Yes, SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations.
b. (0) The requirements for an “a” response are not met.
c. Not applicable (please comment).

**Answer:** b.

**Sources:** The public can only collaborate with the Parliament or Senate for any investigation that can then reach the SAI.

---

JOIN OUR INTERNATIONAL NETWORK

Connect with organizations working to improve government budget systems, policies and outcomes!

JOIN
(HTTPS://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/JOIN-OUR-NETWORK/)
FIND GROUPS
(HTTPS://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/FINDGROUP/)