

Open Budget Survey 2017

Questionnaire

Russia

January 2018

COUNTRY QUESTIONNAIRE: RUSSIA

PBS-1: What is the fiscal year of the PBS evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2017-19

Sources: PBS 2017 - "Main directions of budget policy for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" - is available at the Parliament's web-site: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82))

Comments: Researcher: "Main directions of budget policy for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" - ОСНОВНЫЕ НАПРАВЛЕНИЯ БЮДЖЕТНОЙ ПОЛИТИКИ НА 2017 ГОД И НА ПЛАНОВЫЙ ПЕРИОД 2018 И 2019 ГОДОВ were tabled at the same time as the EBP 2017 and published at the web-site on 31 October 2016 within the whole package on EBP 2017 - [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October to 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council on 6 October for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Link:

<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...

(http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget and Taxes Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490) (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 October). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP.

PBS-2: When is the PBS made available to the public?

- a. (100) At least four months in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature
- b. (67) At least two months, but less than four months, in advance of the budget year, and at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature
- c. (33) Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced in the legislature
- d. (0) The PBS is not released to the public, or is released less than one month before the Executive's Budget Proposal is introduced to the legislature

Answer: d.

Sources: PBS 2017 was released together with the EBP 2017 on 31 October 2016 (published at the website of the Parliament). EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016 according to relevant press coverage. The budget year begins on 1 January. The previous PBS, for BY 2016, was released on 1 July 2015. See: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=64713 (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=64713)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October to 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions

of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council on 6 October for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Link:

<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...

(http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget and Taxes Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490) (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 October). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP.

PBS-3a: If the PBS is published, what is the date of publication of the PBS? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer: 31 October 2016 PBS 2017 was released together with the EBP 2017 on 31 October 2016 (published at the web-site of the Parliament). EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016 according to press-coverage.

Sources: The PBS 2017 was released together with the EBP 2017 on 31 October 2016 (published at the web-site of the Parliament [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...)) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7)). The EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016 according to relevant press coverage. See: <http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html>); <http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html>); <http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603> (<http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: 6 October 2016

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October to 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council on 06 October for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Link:

<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...

(http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget and Taxes Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490) (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 October). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP.

Researcher response: The Pre-Budget Statement -- the document that is the basis for further development of the EBP -- should be published 1 month prior to the EBP. According to Russian law, the Russian Government introduces the EBP in the State Duma and publishes the document by November 1. In 2016, the EBP was tabled on October 28. According to the comment submitted by the Government Reviewer, it looks like the PBS was posted less than 1 month prior to the tabling of the EBP. In addition, when requesting the name of the PBS through the search engine of the website of the Council of Federations (<http://www.council.gov.ru/services/search/>) (<http://www.council.gov.ru/services/search/>) the request has not led to the results. The response remains unchanged, also because it won't change the assessment of the status of this document, which is considered "published late."

PBS-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the PBS. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: The date of publication at the web-site of Parliament is noted as 28.10.2016 15:55. The press publications confirm the date 28 October 2016 as the date of tabling the EBP 2017 (this year the PBS is the part of the EBP package). In fact the documents were placed (published) on Monday 31 October 2016 (we were monitoring every day).

Sources: [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7)) <http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html>); <http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html>); <http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603> (<http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: The project of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council on 6 October 2016 for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Links: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table (http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table)...

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October o 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council for the purpose of public hearings on this document on 6 October 2016. Link: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...> (<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget an Taxes Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490 (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490)). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 october). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP.

Researcher response: See the response to the previous question (the PBS was published too late, i.e., less than 1 month prior to the tabling of the EBP). In addition, the link provided for the website of the Council of Federations does not work; the request in the search engine at the web-site for the name of the document has not led to any results either. The response remains unchanged.

PBS-4: If the PBS is published, what is the URL or weblink of the PBS? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/d...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/d...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82))

Sources: The document itself is here - [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/d...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/d...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) It is found within the package for the EBP 2017 - [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-5: If the PBS is published, are the numerical data contained in the PBS available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: The document is in pdf

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-6a: If the PBS is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: a.

Sources: For BY 2017, the PBS is made available at the same time as the EBP.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October o 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council on 6 october for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Links:

<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...

(http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget an Taxes

Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490 (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490)). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 october). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP.

PBS-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question PBS-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the PBS was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question PBS-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-7: If the PBS is produced, please write the full title of the PBS. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: Main Directions of the Budget Policy for 2017 and planned period of 2018-2019 - Основные направления бюджетной политики на 2017 год и на плановый период 2018 и 2019 годов

Sources: [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/d...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/d...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

PBS-8: Is there a "citizens version" of the PBS?

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-1a: What is the fiscal year of the EBP evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: EBP 2017

Sources: The EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016, according to the information of press agencies. See:

<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html>);

<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html>);

<http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603> (<http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603>). All documents were placed on the website of the Parliament on 31 October 2016 [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-1b: When is the EBP submitted to the legislature for consideration? Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016.

Answer: 31 October 2016

Sources: The EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016, according to the information of press agencies. See:

<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html>);

<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html>);

<http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603> (<http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603>). All documents were placed in the website of Parliament on 31 October 2016 [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-2: When is the EBP made available to the public?

- a. (100) At least three months in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- b. (67) At least two months, but less than three months, in advance of the budget year, and in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- c. (33) Less than two months in advance of the budget year, but at least in advance of the budget being approved by the legislature
- d. (0) The EBP is not released to the public, or is released after the budget has been approved by the legislature

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: The EBP was published on the 31st of October 2016. The fiscal year in Russia runs from 1 January to 31 December.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation", item 2, article 185, the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October to 1st November. Please note that this legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 was needed in order to organize a budget process in difficult macroeconomic conditions, and it is not a usual practice. Finally, note also that the main reason that this year in Russia there were parliamentary elections in September and not in December as it used to be in the past. So the Budget Code was amended with the deadline of EBP tabling - the 1st of November (previously it was October 1).

EBP-3a: If the EBP is published, what is the date of publication of the EBP? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a." In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their date of publication.

Answer: 31 October 2016

Sources: The date of publication EBP 2017 on the website of Parliament is noted as 28.10.2016 h: 15:55. The press publications confirm the date of 28 October 2016 as the date when the EBP 2017 was tabled. In fact, the documents were published (placed on the web) on Monday 31 October 2016 (we were monitoring every day). [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EBP. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: The date of publication at the web-site of Parliament is noted as 28.10.2016 15:55. The press publications confirm the date 28 October 2016 as the date of tabling the EBP 2017. In fact the documents were placed (published) on Monday 31 October 2016 (we were monitoring every day).

Sources: See the following sources: [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7)) <http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html>); <http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html>); <http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603> (<http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603>)
The Budget Code defines the time frame for the stages of budget consideration. These stages are followed correctly. The press-releases are published on the official web-sites and more detailed information is found. Mass media cover and discuss the publication of the EBP.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-4: If the EBP is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EBP? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a." In the comment boxes below, researchers should also list any supporting documents to the EBP and their URL or weblink.

Answer: [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))

Sources: All documents related to the EBP 2017 are published in the website of Parliament.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-5: If the EBP is published, are the numerical data contained in the EBP or its supporting documents available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format

- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: b.

Sources: The various parts of the documentation are in Word and Excel.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: The various parts of the documentation are in Word or in pdf-format. [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...)
([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Researcher response: Indeed, some files are still only available in Word, and Word files are not qualified as machine readable, some numerical data presented in a text format. I would agree with peer reviewer and suggest response "b" instead of "a."

EBP-6a: If the EBP is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EBP-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the EBP was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EBP-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EBP-7: If the EBP is produced, please write the full title of the EBP. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a." If there are any supporting documents to the EBP, please enter their full titles in the comment box below.

Answer: Draft of the Federal Budget "On Federal Budget for the 2017 year and for the Planning Period of 2018 and 2019 years"» - ПРОЕКТ ФЕДЕРАЛЬНОГО ЗАКОНА «О ФЕДЕРАЛЬНОМ БЮДЖЕТЕ НА 2016 ГОД И НА ПЛАНОВЫЙ ПЕРИОД 2018 И 2019 ГОДОВ», produced by the Ministry of Finance, the Russian Federation.

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: Draft Federal Law on the Federal Budget for 2017 and for the Planning Period 2018 and 2019, produced by the Government of the Russian Federation.

Comments: The full title of the Executive's Budget Proposal is "Draft Federal Law on the Federal Budget for 2017 and for the Planning Period 2018 and 2019". See:<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/SearchUD?OpenForm&Seq=2> (<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/SearchUD?OpenForm&Seq=2>)

Researcher response: The Government Reviewer is right, the full title of the Executive's Budget Proposal is "Draft Federal Law on the Federal Budget for 2017 and for the Planning Period 2018 and 2019".

EBP-8: Is there a "citizens version" of the EBP?

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Considering that the Budget Code was amended with the deadline of EBP tabling - the 1st of November (previously it was October 1) and all the timetable cut, it was decided to publish only the "citizens version" of the EB. But it is not a usual practice.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-1a: What is the fiscal year of the EB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2017

Sources: This year there were parliamentary elections in September and not in December as it used to be in the past. So the Budget Code was amended with the deadline of EBP tabling - the 1st of November (previously it was October 1). EBP 2017 is tabled on 28 October 2016, according to the information of press agencies. <http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562795.html>); <http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html> (<http://www.rosbalt.ru/russia/2016/10/28/1562857.html>); <http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603> (<http://www.interfax.ru/business/534603>). All documents were placed at the web-site of the Parliament on 31 October 2016 [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=154...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=154...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-1b: When was the EB approved (enacted) by the legislature? Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016.

Answer: EB 2017 - Federal law from 19.12.2016 No. 415-FZ "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" Approved by the State Duma – 09 December 2016 Signed by the President – 19 December 2016

Sources: EB 2017 - Federal law from 19.12.2016 No. 415-FZ "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/FZ415-FZ...> (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/FZ415-FZ_ot_191216.pdf) Approved by the State Duma – 9 December 2016 Signed by the President – 19 December 2016 http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/17/?id_65=116918&page_id=4199&popup=Y&area_id=65) Date of publication at the web-site of the Ministry of Finance - 21 Dec.2016

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-2: When is the EB made available to the public?

- a. (100) Two weeks or less after the budget has been enacted
- b. (67) Between two weeks and six weeks after the budget has been enacted
- c. (33) More than six weeks, but less than three months, after the budget has been enacted
- d. (0) The EB is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the budget has been enacted

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The date of the Federal law on the federal budget 2017 approval is 19 December 2016 Date of publication at the web-site of the Ministry of Finance - 21 Dec.2016 http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...
(http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/17/?id_65=116918&page_id=4199&popup=Y&area_id=65#)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-3a: If the EB is published, what is the date of publication of the EB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a." Note that the date of publication is not necessarily the same date that is printed on the document.

Answer: 21 December 2016

Sources: The date of the Federal law on the federal budget 2017 approval is 19 December 2016 Date of publication at the web-site of the Ministry of Finance - 21 December 2016 http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...
(http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/17/?id_65=116918&page_id=4199&popup=Y&area_id=65)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the EB. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: Date of EB 2017 publication is reflected at the web-site of the Ministry of Finance - 21 December 2016

Sources: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/17/?id_65=116918&page_id=4199&popup=Y&area_id=65)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-4: If the EB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the EB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/FZ415-FZ...> (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/FZ415-FZ_ot_191216.pdf)

Sources: EB 2017 - Federal law from 19.12.2016 No. 415-FZ "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" Title in Russian: Федеральный закон от 19.12.2016 № 415-ФЗ «О федеральном бюджете на 2017 год и плановый период 2018 и 2019 годов»

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-5: If the EB is published, are the numerical data contained in the EB available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: File in pdf format is of 2384 pages

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-6a: If the EB is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question EB-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the EB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question EB-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-7: If the EB is produced, please write the full title of the EB. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: EB 2017 - Federal law from 19.12.2016 No. 415-FZ "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" Title in Russian: Федеральный закон от 19.12.2016 № 415-ФЗ «О федеральном бюджете на 2017 год и плановый период 2018 и 2019 годов»

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

EB-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the EB?

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961 (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961)
http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG...
(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG_2017.pdf) The document is in pdf

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-1: What is the fiscal year of the CB evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.” If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB please indicate the document the CB simplifies/refers to, and the fiscal year.

Answer: FY 2017

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-2a: For the fiscal year indicated above, what is the public availability status of the CB. If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this questions for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their public availability status.

- a.** Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b.** Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c.** Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d.** Not produced at all
- e.** Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: A citizens budget to the Federal law on the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 - Бюджет для граждан к Федеральному закону о федеральном бюджете на 2017 год и на плановый период 2018 и 2019 годов
http://minfin.ru/common/pdf_reader/web/viewer.html?file=/com... (http://minfin.ru/common/pdf_reader/web/viewer.html?file=/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG_2017.pdf#page=1&zoom=auto,-16,850) Date of publication: 21.12.2016
Comments: Researcher: A Citizens Budget to the Federal law on the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 Publication date: 21.12.2016 18:08 http://minfin.ru/ru/document/index.php?id_4=116961 (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/index.php?id_4=116961)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-2b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question CB-2a above, please specify how you determined whether the CB was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question CB-2a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-3a: If the CB is published, what is the date of publication of the CB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.” If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their dates of publication.

Answer: 21 December 2016

Sources: The date of placing the document is stated at the web-page of the Ministry of Finance http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961 (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the CB. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: The date of placing the document is stated at the web-page of the Ministry of Finance http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961 (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961) There was a presentation of the Citizens budget 2017 at the web-site of the "Open Government" <http://open.gov.ru/events/5515672/> - (<http://open.gov.ru/events/5515672/>) the Citizens budget is the joint initiative of the Open Government of Russia and the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-4: If the CB is published, what is the URL or weblink of the CB? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” If more than one Citizens Budget is published, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and their URL or weblink.

Answer: http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG...
(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG_2017.pdf)

Sources: at the web-site of the Ministry of Finance. The document is in pdf

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-5: If the CB is produced, please write the full title of the CB. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a." If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, for each CB, indicate the document the CB refers to and, next to it, its full title.

Answer: A citizens budget to the Federal law on the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019. Title in Russian - Бюджет для граждан к Федеральному закону о федеральном бюджете на 2017 год и на плановый период 2018 и 2019 годов

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

CB-6: If the CB is produced, please indicate which budget document it corresponds to. If more than one Citizens Budget is produced, please complete this question for one of them, specifying in the comment box below which document you are referring to, and – in the same comment box – which other Citizens Budgets are produced and which budget documents they simplify.

Answer: Citizens Budget to the Enacted Budget

Sources: 1. Citizens Budget to the Enacted Budget 2. Citizens Budget to the Year-End Report

http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/05/main/Kniga_It...

(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/05/main/Kniga_Itoji_ispolneniya_2015_goda.pdf) - Illustrated information brochure "Execution of the Federal budget and budgets of budgetary system of the Russian Federation for 2015 (preliminary results)". Date of publication 27 May 2016

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-1: What is the fiscal year of the IYRs evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2016

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Maybe expert misprinted. It should be "FY 2016".

IBP comment: Indeed, the government reviewer spotted a typo. Typo has been corrected (from FY2 2016 to FY 2016).

IYRs-2: When are the IYRs made available to the public?

- a. (100) At least every month, and within one month of the period covered
- b. (67) At least every quarter, and within one month of the period covered
- c. (33) At least every quarter, and within three months of the period covered
- d. (0) The IYRs are not released to the public, or are released more than three months after the period covered

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byud...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byudzhetrov/poyasneniya-k-razdelu/>). This is the web-page where the dates of placing all the reports are noted according with the legislation. All reports may be easily found at the web-site of the Federal Treasury: <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/>). They are always placed there in a timely manner, according to the legislation requirements.

Comments: Researcher: <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byud...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byudzhetrov/poyasneniya-k-razdelu/>) The information contained in the section "Information about execution of the Federal budget", formed in accordance with the Order of the Ministry of Finance of Russia dated 04.05.2008 № 49n, by order of the Ministry of Finance of Russia dated 28.12.2010 No. 191n, by order of the Ministry of Finance of Russia dated 07.07.2005 No. 84n. The office that is responsible for formation of the reporting about execution of the Federal budget is the Federal Treasury (Chapter 25.1 Budget code of the Russian Federation). Reports are prepared on an accrual basis from the beginning of year in rubles accurate to the second decimal place after comma. The section is operational, monthly, quarterly and annual reporting about execution of the Federal budget: operational – on the 15th calendar day after the reporting period (monthly), on the 25th calendar day after reporting date (annually); monthly – on the 37th calendar day after the reporting date; quarterly – for the 1 quarter to 22 May of the current fiscal year, for the 1st half - until August 17 of the current fiscal year, for 9 months - until 17 November of the current fiscal year; per annum until May 15 of the year following the reporting financial year.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-3a: If the IYRs are published, what are the dates of publication of the IYRs? Specifically: if quarterly In-Year Reports are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least three of the last four IYRs that were publicly available. If monthly IYRs are published, indicate the dates of publication of at least seven of the last 12 IYRs that were publicly available. Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer: On 27.09.2016 the dates of publication of the IYRs are the following: 15 September 2016 The report on the Federal budget for 01.09.2016 (operational) 01 September 2016 The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (monthly) 15 August 2016 The report on the Federal budget for 01.07.2016 08 August 2016 The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (operational) 07 July 2016 The report on the Federal budget for 01.07.2016 (operational) 09 August 2016 The report on Federal budget execution for 6 months of 2016 05 July 2016 The report on the Federal budget for 01.06.2016 (monthly) 10 June 2016 The report on the Federal budget for 01.06.2016 (operational)

Sources: On 27.09.2016 there are the following monthly reports for the 2016: 1. 15 September 2016. For the 01 Sept 2016 Operational report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/5bb/01.09.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/5bb/01.09.2016_operativnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.09.2016 (operational).xls Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.09.2016 (оперативный).xls 2. 01 September 2016 for the 01 august 2016 Monthly report <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/e49/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/e49/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-na-01.08.2016-_ezhemesyachnyy_.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (monthly).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.08.2016 (ежемесячный).xls 3. 15 August 2016 for the 1 July 2016 Monthly report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/c81/01.07.2016_ejemesya... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/c81/01.07.2016_ejemesyachnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.07.2016 (monthly).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.07.2016 (ежемесячный).xls 4. 08 August 2016 for the 1 August 2016 Operational report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/1eb/01.08.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/1eb/01.08.2016_operativnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (operational).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.08.2016 (оперативный).xls 5. 07 July 2016 for the 1 July 2016 Operational report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/735/01.07.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/735/01.07.2016_operativnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.07.2016 (operational).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.07.2016 (оперативный).xls 6. 09 August 2016 for the 01 June 2016 (Quarter report, more detailed) http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/d22/01.07.2016_ejekvart... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/d22/01.07.2016_ejekvartalnyy.zip) The report on Federal budget execution for 6 months of 2016 - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета за 6 месяцев 2016 7. 05 July 2016 for the 01 June 2016 Monthly report - <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/619/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/619/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-na-01.06.2016-_ezhemesyachnyy_.xls.zip) - The report on the Federal budget for 01.06.2016 (monthly).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.06.2016 (ежемесячный).xls 8. 10 June 2016 for the 01 June 2016 Operational report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/61a/01.06.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/61a/01.06.2016_operativnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.06.2016 (operational).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.06.2016 (оперативный).xls

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the IYRs. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: Operational, monthly, quarterly and annual reporting about execution of the Federal budget is placed in the section: • operational – publication is on the 15th calendar day after reporting date (for the monthly reports), and on the 25th calendar day after reporting date (for the annual report); • monthly – publication is on the 37th calendar day after the reporting date; • quarterly – publication for the 1st quarter is done by the 22nd of May of the current fiscal year; for the 1st half of the year (cumulative second quarter), publication is done by the 17th of August of the current fiscal year; publication for the (cumulative) third quarter report done by the 17th of November of the current fiscal year; • annual up to 15 May of the year following the reporting financial year. The prescribed dates for issuing the reports are followed. The calendar of placing to the web-site the reports is presented, see <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/kalendar-na-2011...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/kalendar-na-2015/index.php>). It shows deadlines for posting information on execution of budgets of budgetary system of the Russian Federation on the official website of the Federal Treasury in the Internet in 2016.

Sources: <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byud...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byudzhetrov/poyasneniya-k-razdelu/>) <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/kalendar-na-2011...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/kalendar-na-2015/index.php>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-4: If the IYRs are published, what is the URL or weblink of the IYRs? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” Researchers should provide the weblink to the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the weblinks to older IYRs.

Answer: On 27.09.2016 there are 2 last monthly reports for the 2016: 1. 15 Sept. 2016. The report on the Federal budget for 01.09.2016 http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/5bb/01.09.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/5bb/01.09.2016_operativnyy.zip) 2. 01 Sept. 2016. The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/e49/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/e49/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-na-01.08.2016-_ezhemesyachnyy_.zip)

Sources: In the website of the Federal Treasury, all the operational, monthly, quarterly and annual reports on the Federal budget execution are posted within the schedule. How to access all the reports: --On the official website of the Federal Treasury roskazna.ru (<http://roskazna.ru>). --On the main news feed of the site there is a section "Budget Performance." --Under "Budget Execution" pick the subsection "Federal budget" <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byud...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byudzhetrov/1020/>) -- Next one can choose the period of report – annual, quarterly, monthly, operational, and year of reporting. --When selecting a report "monthly" and choosing the year "2016," one gets all available reports on the first day of each month cumulatively. --Monthly report for the selected date, for example on 01.09.2016, are presented in file with extension "*.xlsx" with a name that reflects the date of report, the report on execution of the Federal budget up until 01.09.2016 (monthly).xlsx, but in archived form (zip format) here: <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/9e6/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/9e6/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-na-01.09.2016-_ezhemesyachnyy_.zip).

Comments: Researcher: On 27.09.2016 the following monthly reports were available for BY 2016: 1. 15 Sept. 2016. For the 1 Sept 2016 Operational report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/5bb/01.09.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/5bb/01.09.2016_operativnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.09.2016 (operational).xls Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.09.2016 (оперативный).xls 2. 01 Sept. 2016 for the 1 August 2016 Monthly report <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/e49/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/e49/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-na-01.08.2016-_ezhemesyachnyy_.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (monthly).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.08.2016 (ежемесячный).xls 3. 15 August 2016 for the 1 July 2016 Monthly report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/c81/01.07.2016_ejemesya... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/c81/01.07.2016_ejemesyachnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.07.2016 (monthly).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.07.2016 (ежемесячный).xls 4. 08 August 2016 for the 1 August 2016 Operational report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/1eb/01.08.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/1eb/01.08.2016_operativnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (operational).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.08.2016 (оперативный).xls 5. 07 July 2016 for the 1 July 2016 Operational report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/735/01.07.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/735/01.07.2016_operativnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.07.2016 (operational).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.07.2016 (оперативный).xls 6. 09 August 2016 for the 01 June 2016 (Quarter report, more detailed) http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/d22/01.07.2016_ejekvart... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/d22/01.07.2016_ejekvartalnyy.zip) The report on Federal budget execution for 6 months of 2016 - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета за 6 месяцев 2016 7. 05 July 2016 for the 01 June 2016 Monthly report - <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/619/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/619/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-na-01.06.2016-_ezhemesyachnyy_.xls.zip) - The report on the Federal budget for 01.06.2016 (monthly).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.06.2016 (ежемесячный).xls 8. 10 June 2016 for the 01 June 2016 Operational report http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/61a/01.06.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/61a/01.06.2016_operativnyy.zip) The report on the Federal budget for 01.06.2016 (operational).xls - Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.06.2016 (оперативный).xls

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-5: If the IYRs are published, are the numerical data contained in the IYRs available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: a.

Sources: The documents are in excel

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-6a: If the IYRs are not publicly available, are they still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question IYRs-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the IYRs were produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question IYRs-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-7: If the IYRs are produced, please write the full title of the IYRs. If In-Year Reports are not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.” Researchers should provide the full title of the most recent In-Year Report in the space below, and – in the comment box underneath – the full titles of older IYRs.

Answer: The most recent reports on 27.09.2016 are: The report on the Federal budget for 01.09.2016 (operational), published on 15 Sept. 2016, see - http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/5bb/01.09.2016_operativ... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/5bb/01.09.2016_operativnyy.zip) and The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (monthly), published on 01 Sept. 2016, see - <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/e49/otchet->

ob-ispolneni... (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/e49/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-na-01.08.2016-_ezhemesyachnyy_.zip)

Sources: f. 0503117 means the number of the report form, approved by the order

Comments: Researcher: On 27.09.2016 there are the following monthly reports for the 2016: 1. 1 Sept 2016 Operational report: "The report on the Federal budget for 01.09.2016 (operational).xls" (Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.09.2016 (оперативный).xls") 2. 1 August 2016 Monthly report: "The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (monthly).xls" ("Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.08.2016 (ежемесячный).xls") 3. 1 July 2016 Monthly report: "The report on the Federal budget for 01.07.2016 (monthly).xls" ("Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.07.2016 (ежемесячный).xls") 4. 1 August 2016 Operational report: "The report on the Federal budget for 01.08.2016 (operational).xls" ("Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.08.2016 (оперативный).xls") 5. 1 July 2016 Operational report: "The report on the Federal budget for 01.07.2016 (operational).xls" ("Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.07.2016 (оперативный).xls") 6. 01 June 2016 (Quarter report, more detailed): "The report on Federal budget execution for 6 months of 2016" ("Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета за 6 месяцев 2016") 7. 01 June 2016 Monthly report: "The report on the Federal budget for 01.06.2016 (monthly).xls" ("Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.06.2016 (ежемесячный).xls") 8. 01 June 2016 Operational report: "The report on the Federal budget for 01.06.2016 (operational).xls" ("Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.06.2016 (оперативный).xls")

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

IYRs-8: Is there a "citizens version" of the IYRs?

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-1: What is the fiscal year of the MYR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2016

Sources: <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...>

(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip) Explanatory note to the Report on the Federal budget execution for the first half of 2016 year Пояснительная записка к отчету об исполнении федерального бюджета за I полугодие 2016 года

Comments: Researcher: Document from 21 Sept. 2016

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-2: When is the MYR made available to the public?

a. (100) Six weeks or less after the midpoint

b. (67) Nine weeks or less, but more than six weeks, after the midpoint

c. (33) More than nine weeks, but less than three months, after the midpoint

d. (0) The MYR is not released to the public, or is released more than three months after the midpoint

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116061&area_id=4&page_id=... (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116061&area_id=4&page_id=2104&popup=Y#) Date of publication - 21 September 2016

Comments: Researcher: Date of publication - 21 September 2016

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-3a: If the MYR is published, what is the date of publication of the MYR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer: 21 September 2016

Sources: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116061&area_id=4&page_id=... (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116061&area_id=4&page_id=2104&popup=Y)

Comments: Researcher: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the MYR. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: As a rule, the time framework of the budget consideration stages is followed. The date of publication of the MYR we determine by the date of placing it to the Ministry of Finance web-site, where the date of placing the documents is automatically displayed. This date is 21 September 2016

Sources: Date of publication, displayed at the official web-site of the Ministry of Finance: 21.09.2016 http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116060&area_id=4&page_id=... (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116060&area_id=4&page_id=2104&popup=Y#ixzz4Xq4wmJYP) (Explanatory note to the Report on Execution of the federal budget for the 1 half of the 2016 year)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-4: If the MYR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the MYR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Prilozhe...>
(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Prilozheniya_k_PZ_1polug2016.zip)

Sources: Explanatory note to the Report on the Federal budget execution for the first half of 2016 year

Comments: Researcher: The reference is to the placed document in zip. The document we refer to includes all the information: the text and the annexes.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-5: If the MYR is published, are the numerical data contained in the MYR available in a machine readable format?

a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format

- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: a.

Sources: The document is presented in zip archive, zip, 2.27 Mb, files are machine readable (excel)

Comments: Researcher: The document is presented in zip archive, zip, 2.27 Mb, files are machine readable (excel)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-6a: If the MYR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question MYR-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the MYR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question MYR-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-7: If the MYR is produced, please write the full title of the MYR. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: Explanatory note to the Report on the Federal budget execution for the first half of 2016 year. Title in Russian: Пояснительная записка к отчету об исполнении федерального бюджета за I полугодие 2016 года

Sources: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116061&area_id=4&page_id=... (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116061&area_id=4&page_id=2104&popup=Y)

Comments: Researcher: The document listed above includes all the information: the text of the report and all the annexes which are digital tables in excel

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

MYR-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the MYR?

- a. Yes
- b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-1: What is the fiscal year of the YER evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: “FY YYYY” or “FY YYYY-YY.”

Answer: FY 2015

Sources: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02> The status of the draft in the State Duma: Bill No. 1134020-6 - On consideration All related documents are available at this link.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-2: When is the YER made available to the public?

- a. (100) Six months or less after the end of the budget year
- b. (67) Nine months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year
- c. (33) More than nine months, but within 12 months, after the end of the budget year
- d. (0) The YER is not released to the public, or is released more than 12 months after the end of the budget year

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-3a: If the YER is published, what is the date of publication of the YER? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: “DD Month YYYY.” For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: The date of introduction to the State Duma is 25 July 2016.

Sources: Since that date, all materials are publicly available and presented at the web-site of the State Duma <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>. According to the Budget law, the YER will be approved by the State Duma and signed by the President In October 2016.

Comments: Researcher: As expected YER was approved in October 2016 (31 October 2016 is the date of signing by the President). Chronology of passing the law - <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the YER. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: In accordance with the law. Also there are announcements in the press, on the website of the government of the Russian Federation and the State Duma of the Russian Federation, and by search by name in Internet as well.

Sources: On introducing to the State Duma a Draft law on the Federal budget for 2015, 22 July 2016 h21:00, <http://m.government.ru/all/23949/> (<http://m.government.ru/all/23949/>) See also: <http://www.gosman.ru/?news=45881> (<http://www.gosman.ru/?news=45881>), dated 25 July 2016 h10:04

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-4: If the YER is published, what is the URL or weblink of the YER? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02> (<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>)

Sources: On execution of the Federal budget for 2015 Об исполнении федерального бюджета за 2015 год In the website of the State Duma there are 25 separate documents - tables, explanatory notes, annexes, other supporting documents - see link above.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-5: If the YER is published, are the numerical data contained in the YER available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: The files are Word and PDFs

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-6a: If the YER is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-6b: If you selected option "c" or "d" in question YER-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the YER was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option "a," "b," or "e" was selected in question YER-6a, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-7: If the YER is produced, please write the full title of the YER. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: The draft Federal law of the Russian Federation "About execution of the Federal budget for 2015" Проект федерального закона Российской Федерации «Об исполнении федерального бюджета за 2015 год»

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

YER-8: Is there a "citizens version" of the YER?

- a. Yes
- b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/index.php#) Document from 29.09.2016 Illustrated information brochure "Execution of the Federal budget and budgets of budgetary system of the Russian Federation in 2015" Publication date: 29.09.2016 Download pdf, 9.75 MB

Comments: Researcher: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-1: What is the fiscal year of the AR evaluated in this Open Budget Survey questionnaire? Please enter the fiscal year in the following format: "FY YYYY" or "FY YYYY-YY."

Answer: FY 2015

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-2: When is the AR made available to the public?

- a. (100) Six months or less after the end of the budget year
- b. (67) 12 months or less, but more than six months, after the end of the budget year
- c. (33) More than 12 months, but within 18 months, after the end of the budget year
- d. (0) Does not release to the public, or is released more than 18 months after the end of the budget year

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: On 07 September 2016, the Board of the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation approved the Report on execution of the Federal budget for 2015: http://audit.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051 (http://audit.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-3a: If the AR is published, what is the date of publication of the AR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. Please enter the date in the following format: "DD Month YYYY." For example, 5 September 2016 should be entered as 05 September 2016. If the document is not published or not produced, please mark this question "n/a."

Answer: 07 September 2016

Sources: Date of publication: 07 September 2016, see http://audit.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051 (http://audit.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051)
The reference for the report is at the page of its announcement (see above) The Audit Report itself is available here:
<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/fef/fefefe7f2a95f426a1648e...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/fef/fefefe7f2a95f426a1648eaa6b8d77f2.pdf>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-3b: In the box below, please explain how you determined the date of publication of the AR. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question "n/a."

Answer: Date of publication: 07 September 2016 http://audit.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051 (http://audit.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051)

Sources: The link above refers to the announcement of the release of the report. The Audit Report itself is here:
<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/fef/fefefe7f2a95f426a1648e...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/fef/fefefe7f2a95f426a1648eaa6b8d77f2.pdf>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-4: If the AR is published, what is the URL or weblink of the AR? Researchers should respond to this question if the document is published either within the time frame accepted by the OBS methodology or too late. If the document is not published at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: <http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/feffefefe7f2a95f426a1648e...>
(<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/feffefefe7f2a95f426a1648eaa6b8d77f2.pdf>)

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-5: If the AR is published, are the numerical data contained in the AR available in a machine readable format?

- a. Yes, all of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- b. Yes, some of the numerical data are available in a machine readable format
- c. No
- d. Not applicable

Answer: c.

Sources: There are 1404 pages, all in pdf.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-6a: If the AR is not publicly available, is it still produced?

- a. Produced but made available online to the public too late (published after the acceptable time frame)
- b. Produced but made available only in hard copy or soft copy (not available online)
- c. Produced for internal purposes/use only
- d. Not produced at all
- e. Not applicable (the document is publicly available)

Answer: e.

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-6b: If you selected option “c” or “d” in question AR-6a above, please specify how you determined whether the AR was produced for internal use only, versus not produced at all. If option “a,” “b,” or “e” was selected in question AR-6a, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: n/a

Sources: n/a

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-7: If the AR is produced, please write the full title of the AR. If the document is not produced at all, researchers should mark this question “n/a.”

Answer: Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation on the Report on execution of the Federal budget for 2015 (approved by the Collegium of the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation (Protocol dated 26 August 2016 No43K (1118) Заключение Счетной палаты Российской Федерации на отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета за 2015 год (утверждено Коллегией Счетной палаты Российской Федерации (протокол от 26 августа 2016 г. No43K (1118)

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

AR-8: Is there a “citizens version” of the AR?

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: b.

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1a: Are there one or more websites or web portals for disseminating government fiscal information? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: The official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation: <http://minfin.ru/ru/#ixzz4LTAbYgNV> (<http://minfin.ru/ru/#ixzz4LTAbYgNV>) • The President of the Russian Federation, www.kremlin.ru (<http://www.kremlin.ru>) • The government of the Russian Federation, government.ru/ (<http://government.ru/>) • A single portal of public and municipal services (functions), www.gosuslugi.ru (<http://www.gosuslugi.ru>) • Portal of public procurement, www.zakupki.gov.ru (<http://www.zakupki.gov.ru>) • Federal portal of managerial staff, gosszluzhba.gov.ru (<http://gosszluzhba.gov.ru>) • Information system of the Ministry of Finance, minfin.ru/ru/ismf (<http://minfin.ru/ru/ismf>) • Letters of the Federal Tax Agency of Russia, directed to the territorial tax bodies, www.nalog.ru/rn77/about_fts/about_nalog/ (http://www.nalog.ru/rn77/about_fts/about_nalog/) • State programs, programs.gov.ru (<http://programs.gov.ru>) • Budget code, budcodex.ru (<http://budcodex.ru>) • Memo to the alien — highly qualified specialist, www.fms.gov.ru (<http://www.fms.gov.ru>) • Hotline. Accounting in small business, buhuchet.minfin.ru/buhfeedback/ (<http://buhuchet.minfin.ru/buhfeedback/>) • Federal Parliament – State Duma, <http://www.duma.gov.ru/> (<http://www.duma.gov.ru/>) • Public youth chamber under the State Duma of the Federal Parliament of the Russian Federation, <http://www.newparlament.ru/workspaces/federal> (<http://www.newparlament.ru/workspaces/federal>) • Parliamentary newspaper, <http://www.pnp.ru/> (<http://www.pnp.ru/>) • State authorities of the Russian Federation, <http://gov.ru/> (<http://gov.ru/>) • Journal of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation "Russian Federation today," <http://www.russia-today.ru/> (<http://www.russia-today.ru/>) • The website of the Council of legislators under Federal Parliament of the Russian Federation, <http://www.szrf.km.duma.gov.ru/> (<http://www.szrf.km.duma.gov.ru/>) • Official Internet portal of legal information, <http://www.pravo.gov.ru/> (<http://www.pravo.gov.ru/>) • Official website of the Federal Treasury, <http://roskazna.ru/opendata/> (<http://roskazna.ru/opendata/>) • Official site of Federal tax service, <http://nalog.ru/opendata/> (<http://nalog.ru/opendata/>) • The single portal of the budget system of the Russian Federation, <http://budget.gov.ru/data/opendata> (<http://budget.gov.ru/data/opendata>) • Official website for publishing information about state (municipal) institutions, <http://bus.gov.ru/pub/opendata> (<http://bus.gov.ru/pub/opendata>) • The website of the Federal information address system (FIAS) <http://fias.nalog.ru/Public/DownloadPage.aspx> (<http://fias.nalog.ru/Public/DownloadPage.aspx>) • Official site of the Russian Federation in the

Internet for posting information about placing of orders for deliveries of goods, performance of works, rendering of services ("Procurement"), <http://zakupki.gov.ru/epz/main/public/document/view.html?sec...> (http://zakupki.gov.ru/epz/main/public/document/view.html?sectionId=21&pageNo=1&categories=FZ44&_categories=on&categories=FZ94&_categories=on&categories=FZ223&_categories=on&categories=FZALL&_catego

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1b: On these websites/portals, can revenue and expenditure data for the current fiscal year be downloaded as a consolidated file (or set of files)? If yes, please provide the necessary links in the comment/citation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: Single portal of the budget system of the Russian Federation ELECTRONIC BUDGET is developed for the goal of realization of the principle of transparency (openness) of budget and it provides with the budget information in as a "citizens version" and as documents. <http://budget.gov.ru/> (<http://budget.gov.ru/>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byud...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byudzhetrov/poyasneniya-k-razdelu/>). This is the web-page where the dates of placing all the reports are noted according with the legislation. All reports may be easily found at the web-site of the Federal Treasury: <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/>). They are always placed there in a timely manner, according to the legislation requirements.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1c: On these websites/portals, can consolidated revenue and expenditure data be downloaded for multiple years in consistent formats? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: Revenues (2013-2015 years) <http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D...> (http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D0%B5%D1%82/%D0%94%D0%BE%D1%85%D0%BE%D0%B4%D1%8B?_afLoop=2138695228656931&_afWindowMode=0&_afWindowId=ewajkk8a0_311#!%40%40%3F_afWindowId%3Dewajkk8a0_311%26_afLoop%3D2138695228656931&_afWindowId=ewajkk8a0_335) Revenues (2011-2017) <http://info.minfin.ru/fbdohod.php> (<http://info.minfin.ru/fbdohod.php>) Expenditures (2013-2015) <http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D...> (http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D0%B5%D1%82/%D0%A0%D0%B0%D1%81%D1%85%D0%BE%D0%B4%D1%8B?_afLoop=2138754785063904&_afWindowMode=0&_afWindowId=ewajkk8a0_332#!%40%40%3F_afWindowId%3Dewajkk8a0_332%26_afLoop%3D2138754785063904&_afWindowId=ewajkk8a0_360) Expenditures (2011-2017) <http://info.minfin.ru/fbrash.php> (<http://info.minfin.ru/fbrash.php>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-1d: On these websites/portals, are infographics/visualizations or other similar tools used to simplify data access and analysis? If yes, please provide the necessary links and details in the comment/citation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: Government programs <http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D...> (http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D0%B5%D1%82/%D0%93%D0%BE%D1%81%D1%83%D0%B4%D0%B0%D1%8B?_afLoop=2138754785063904&_afWindowMode=0&_afWindowId=ewajkk8a0_332#!%40%40%3F_afWindowId%3Dewajkk8a0_332%26_afLoop%3D2138754785063904&_afWindowId=ewajkk8a0_360)

_afrLoop=2139337396662845&_afrWindowMode=0&_afrWindowId=ewajkk8a0_407#!%40%40%3F_afrWindowId%3Dewajkk8a0_407%26_afrLoop%3D213933state%3Dewajkk8a0_435) For example, development of Healthcare <http://programs.gov.ru/Portal/programs/quarterMonitoring?gpI...> (<http://programs.gov.ru/Portal/programs/quarterMonitoring?gpId=1>) All information on Program and subprograms, quarterly monitoring, year reporting, planned expenditures, actual expenditures as a chart, etc...

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: For example, here there is infographics/ visualisations about consolidated revenues and expenditures:

<http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D...>

(http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D0%B5%D1%82/%D0%94%D0%BE%D1%85%D0%BE%D0%B4%D1%8B/%D0%_afrLoop=18625687443810966&_afrWindowMode=0&_afrWindowId=164lv3yqaj_521#!%40%40%3F_afrWindowId%3D164lv3yqaj_521%26_afrLoop%3D186256state%3D164lv3yqaj_549) <http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D...>

(http://budget.gov.ru/epbs/faces/p/%D0%91%D1%8E%D0%B4%D0%B6%D0%B5%D1%82/%D0%A0%D0%B0%D1%81%D1%85%D0%BE%D0%B4%D1%_afrLoop=18625542220194468&_afrWindowMode=0&_afrWindowId=164lv3yqaj_471#!%40%40%3F_afrWindowId%3D164lv3yqaj_471%26_afrLoop%3D18625state%3D164lv3yqaj_503)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-2: Are there laws in place guiding public financial management and/or auditing? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where the law(s) contains specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: Budget Code, Chapter 25.1, <http://1bkrf.ru/gl25.1/> (<http://1bkrf.ru/gl25.1/>) Fundamentals of drawing up, external auditing, consideration and endorsement of budgetary reporting of the Article 264.1. Fundamentals of budget accounting and budget reporting Article 264.2. Preparation of budget reporting Article 264.3. Formation of reporting on execution of the consolidated budget and budgets of state extra-budgetary funds Article 264.4. External auditing of an annual report on performance Budget Code, Chapter 264.4 and following, <http://1bkrf.ru/st264.4/> (<http://1bkrf.ru/st264.4/>) Article 264.5. The submission, consideration and approval of the annual report on the budget execution by the legislative (representative) body Article 264.6. The law (decision) on the budget execution The Federal law from April 5, 2013 № 41-FZ "On the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation" i.e., Article 18. Preliminary audit of the formation of the Federal budget and budgets of state extrabudgetary funds of the Russian Federation. See: <http://www.ach.gov.ru/about/document/> (<http://www.ach.gov.ru/about/document/>).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

GQ-3: Are there additional laws regulating: (1) access to information; (2) government transparency; or (3) citizens participation? If yes, please provide the necessary details and links in the comment/citation, and specify whether and where these laws contain specific provisions for budget transparency and/or participation.

a. Yes

b. No

Answer: a.

Sources: <http://1bkrf.ru/st36/> (<http://1bkrf.ru/st36/>) The Budget Code of the Russian Federation. Article 36. Principle of Transparency (Openness). <http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/ebudget/npa/> (<http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/ebudget/npa/>) Legislative-normative base of the e-budget Formation, updating and the decision on the termination of the updating of the datasets of the Ministry of Finance of Russia: procedure and powers of the participants. See: <http://minfin.ru/ru/opendata/legislation/index.php> (<http://minfin.ru/ru/opendata/legislation/index.php>), and <http://minfin.ru/ru/opendata/legislation/index.php#ixzz4LTL9...> (<http://minfin.ru/ru/opendata/legislation/index.php#ixzz4LTL9mXgn>) (the official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: There are not special laws on it but the principles of transparency and citizens participation are really indicated in the Budget Code and in some normative acts of the Government.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

1: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year that are classified by administrative unit (that is, by ministry, department, or agency)?

- a. (100) Yes, administrative units accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, administrative units accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, administrative units accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- d. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by administrative unit.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: The draft Federal law of the Russian Federation "On the Federal budget for 2017 and for the planning period of 2018 and 2019" In the documents, presented on the web-site of the State Duma on EBP2017-2019 there is a document where are presented the textual articles of the EBP – The text of the proposed law - [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669)) Article 6 is at the pages 22-27 of the document. Article 6. Budget appropriations of the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 The departmental structure of Federal budget expenditures for 2017 is posted on the website of the State Duma in the documents on the draft Federal budget for 2017-2019. It is approved in the text of the draft law on the federal budget (article 6) and in Annex 9 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&72C38AA801DC6D2A4325805A0052E350](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&72C38AA801DC6D2A4325805A0052E350)) Percentage of the federal budget, which is presented by administrative unit: Expenditures classified by administrative unit - 13 469,1 billion rub. Expenditures not classified by administrative unit - 2 771,7 billion rub. Share of expenditures not classified by administrative unit 17%

Comments: Researcher: The draft Federal law of the Russian Federation "On the Federal budget for 2017 and for the planning period of 2018 and 2019" Article 6. Budget appropriations of the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 To be approved: the departmental structure of Federal budget expenditures; the distribution of budget allocations by sections, subsections, target articles; budget allocations for the target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation and non-program activities), groups, types of expenditures, sections, subsections of classification of expenditures of the Federal budget budget allocations for the implementation of Federal target programs

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Article 6, item 2 and 1) states that all Federal Budget expenditures are presented by administrative unit in accordance with Annexes 9, 10 and 11 to the Federal Budget Draft. Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669)), page 22. At the same time, Annexes 10 and 11 are fallen under the requirements established in the Law of the Russian Federation of 21 July 1993 № 5485-1 "On state secrets" (link: http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_2481/ (http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_2481/), article 5, item 4, paragraph 10).

Researcher response: In the text of the draft Federal budget for 2017-2019, article 1 mentions that the total expenditures of the Federal budget is 16,240,809,139.5 thousand rubles. In Annex 9 to the text of the draft Federal budget for 2017-2019 "Departmental structure of expenditures of the Federal budget for 2017," expenditures are 13,469,105,675.9 thousand rubles. Not all expenditures are classified by administrative unit. The response remains unchanged.

2: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by functional classification?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditures are presented by functional classification.
- b. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by functional classification.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 6 to the Explanatory note (Federal budget expenditure by sections and sub-sections) – summary functional classification - [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&9575646A8FF2D3194325805A005FC9CD](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&9575646A8FF2D3194325805A005FC9CD)) Annex 15 to the text of the bill (the Distribution of budget allocations by sections, subsections, target articles for 2017) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A44BDE239483D1684325805A005415C2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A44BDE239483D1684325805A005415C2)) Annex 15 is 534 pages. The functional structure of Federal budget is presented on 14 sections, including Section 01 NATIONAL ISSUES (presented in Annex 15 on page 1-93 with a further breakdown of the costs) Section 02 NATIONAL DEFENCE (p. 93-105) Section 03 NATIONAL SECURITY AND LAW ENFORCEMENT (pp. 105-141) etc. for all listed fields National economy, Housing and utilities, Environment, Education, Culture, cinematography, Healthcare, Social policy, Physical culture and sport, Mass media Annex 15 is a functional classification for 2017 Annex 17 to the text of the bill (the Distribution of budget allocations by sections, subsections, target articles, kinds of expenditures in 2018 and 2019) – p.1 of the Annex (p. 2571 of the EBP): [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&53AC31EA95387FFB4325805A00548FFA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&53AC31EA95387FFB4325805A00548FFA)) Budget allocations on sections, subsections, target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation and non-program activities), groups, types of expenditure of the classification of the Federal budget expenditure for the planning period of 2018 and 2019 (TABLE, in thousand rubles) NATIONAL ISSUES for 2018 year - 1 080 175 019,9; for 2019 year - 1 068 317 775,2 The Functioning of the President of the Russian Federation for 2018 year - 15 888 403,7; for 2019 year - 15 840 929,5 ANNEX 17 is a functional classification for 2018 and 2019 Annex 19 to the text of the bill (budget allocations for the target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation), groups, types of expenses, sections, subsections for 2017) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D608454FBF2C2BF94325805A0054E6CB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D608454FBF2C2BF94325805A0054E6CB)) in Annex 19 in the column "RZ" are indicated the codes of the section (from 01 to 14), that is the detailed breakdown of the expenditures of state programs for the year 2017, including the functional structure. in Annex 19 in the column "BP" are indicated the codes of expenditure, that is, is shown the breakdown of expenditures of state programs for the year 2017, including the economic structure 100 Expenditure on payments to staff in order to ensure the performance of the functions of the state (municipal) authorities, state agencies, management bodies of state extra-budgetary funds (p.4,7,11,15, etc.) 200 Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs (p.1,18,19,20,23 etc) 400 Capital investments in objects of state (municipal) property (p.5,7,9,10) Annex 21 to the text of the bill (budget allocations for the target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation), groups, types of expenses, sections, subsections in 2018 and 2019) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B2846547A69CA8754325805A00554161](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B2846547A69CA8754325805A00554161)) In Annex 21 is presented a detailed breakdown of the expenditure of state programs in 2018 and 2019 100 Expenditure on payments to staff in order to ensure the performance of the functions of the state (municipal) authorities, state agencies, management bodies of state extra-budgetary funds (p.6,9,13,29, etc.) 200 Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs (p.2,3,4,19,29 etc) 400 Capital investments in objects of state (municipal) property (p.3,4,7,8, etc.)

Comments: Researcher:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

3: If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by functional classification, is the functional classification compatible with international standards?

- a. (100) Yes, the functional classification is compatible with international standards.
- b. (0) No, the functional classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by functional classification.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 15 to the text of the bill (the Distribution of budget allocations by sections, subsections, target articles for 2017) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A44BDE239483D1684325805A005415C2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A44BDE239483D1684325805A005415C2)) Annex 15 is 534 pages. The functional structure of Federal budget is presented on 14 sections, including Section 01 NATIONAL ISSUES (presented in Annex 15 on page 1-93 with a further breakdown of the costs) Section 02 NATIONAL DEFENCE (p. 93-105) Section 03 NATIONAL SECURITY AND LAW ENFORCEMENT (pp. 105-141) etc. Annex 17 to the text of the bill (the Distribution of budget allocations by sections, subsections, target articles, kinds of expenditures in 2018 and 2019) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&53AC31EA95387FFB4325805A00548FFA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&53AC31EA95387FFB4325805A00548FFA)) For example – p.1: Budget allocations on sections, subsections, target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation and non-program activities), groups, types of expenditure of the classification of the Federal budget expenditure for the planning period of 2018 and 2019 (TABLE, in thousand rubles) NATIONAL ISSUES for 2018 year; The Functioning of the President of the Russian Federation for 2018 year - Annex 19 to the text of the bill (budget allocations for the target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation), groups, types of expenses, sections, subsections for 2017) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D608454FBF2C2BF94325805A0054E6CB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D608454FBF2C2BF94325805A0054E6CB)) 100 Expenditure on payments to staff in order to ensure the performance of the functions of the state (municipal) authorities, state agencies, management bodies of state extra-budgetary funds (p.4,7,11,15, etc.) 200 Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs (p.1,18,19,20,23 etc) 400 Capital investments in objects of state (municipal) property (p.5,7,9,10) Annex 21 to the text of the bill (budget allocations for the target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation), groups, types of expenses, sections, subsections in 2018 and 2019) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B2846547A69CA8754325805A00554161](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B2846547A69CA8754325805A00554161)) 100 Expenditure on payments to staff in order to ensure the performance of the functions of the state (municipal) authorities, state agencies, management bodies of state extra-budgetary funds (p.6,9,13,29, etc.) 200 Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs (p.2,3,4,19,29 etc) 400 Capital investments in objects of state (municipal) property (p.3,4,7,8, etc.) The sections of the classification of expenditures (for each section – details on subsection): 1 National issues 2 National defense 3 National security and law enforcement 4 The national economy 5 Housing and utilities 6 Environmental Protection 7 Education 8 Culture, film 9 Health 10 Social policy 11 Physical culture and sports 12 Mass media 13 Maintenance of state and municipal debt 14 Interbudgetary transfers

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: There are some differences between the functional classification in Russia and the international classification: 14 functions instead of 10. But in general they are very close to each other.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

4: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the budget year by economic classification?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditures are presented by economic classification.
- b. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by economic classification.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Details of expenditures are presented in the following way: Administrative structure: Ministry – Section – Subsection – Target article – Type of expenditure There are 95 departments, for which expenditures are presented in sections and subsections, then by the target articles (953 target "article"), each article is divided into types of expenditures Expenditures by type (i.e., economic classification): 100 Expenditures for staff entitlements 200 Procurement of goods, works and services 300 Social security 400 Capital investments 500 Intergovernmental transfers 600 Subsidies 700 Debt Service 800 Additional budgetary allocations

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

5: If the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation presents expenditures for the budget year by economic classification, is the economic classification compatible with international standards?

- a. (100) Yes, the economic classification is compatible with international standards.
- b. (0) No, the economic classification is not compatible with international standards, or expenditures are not presented by economic classification.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Expenditures by types The costs of staff entitlements Procurement of goods, works and services Social security Capital investments Intergovernmental transfers Subsidies Public debt service Other budget allocations

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

6: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- d. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Annex 25 to the text of the bill (Distribution of budgetary allocations on the implementation of Federal target programs in 2017) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F2CEB1F09169C2BE4325805A0055A555](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F2CEB1F09169C2BE4325805A0055A555)) Annex 28 to the text of the bill (Distribution of budgetary allocations on the implementation of the Federal target program for 2018 and 2019) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&18180F12F08881784325805A005603E1](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&18180F12F08881784325805A005603E1)) Annex 25 covers expenditure for BY 2017; annex 28 covers expenditures for BY 2018 and 2019. The level of detail is such that for Annex 28 answer "b" would apply; however, in Annex 5 the sum of program-classified expenditures over the total budgeted expenditures is only 54%, hence our "c" answer. See also Annex 5 to the Explanatory note (Federal expenditures in 2016-2019 in the context of state programs) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3COA0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3COA0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C))

Comments: Researcher: Information about 2017 expenditures by program is posted on the Duma website together with the rest of the documents of the Draft Federal Budget for 2017-2019. See also Article 6 of the Draft law on the federal budget: Budget allocations for the implementation of Federal target programs in annexes 25-30 to the Bill (in accordance with article 25 of the Federal law from May 7, 2013 No. 104-FZ "On amendments to the Budget code of the Russian Federation and certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation in connection with improving the budget process"). The Explanatory note to the draft federal budget, pages 110-294, describes the cost structure of the target programs, including stated that, in accordance with the list of state programs of the Russian Federation, the approved order of the Government of the Russian Federation, November 11, 2010 no 1950-R, state programs are grouped for 5 main areas (table 4.2.1). Information about Federal expenditures in 2016-2019 in the context of state programs is provided in Annex 5 to this explanatory note.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Incorrect reference to Annexes 25 and 28 to the draft of Budget Law. This distribution is on the Federal Target Programs which are included in the composition of the State Programs. It is necessary to focus on the Annex 19 dealing with the State Programs except of the closed part of budget expenditures in accordance with Annex 5 to the Explanatory Note to the Draft Budget Law. However, it also does not exceed 2/3 of the budget expenditures. Links: Annex 19. "Приложение 19 к тексту законопроекта (Распределение бюджетных ассигнований по целевым статьям (государственным программам РФ), группам видов расходов, разделам, подразделам на 2017 год)", [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D608454FBF2C2BF94325805A0054E6CB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D608454FBF2C2BF94325805A0054E6CB)) Annex 5 to the Explanatory Note to the Draft Budget Law "Прил.5 к пояснительной записке (Расходы федерального бюджета в 2016-2019 годах в разрезе государственных программ) (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)", [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0A0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0A0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C))

7: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 12 to the text of the bill (the Departmental structure of Federal budget expenditures for the planning period of 2018 and 2019) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&78FEFAAB2BA1C9C24325805D003C4517](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&78FEFAAB2BA1C9C24325805D003C4517)) Annex 12 – 966 pages For example, Page 1 FEDERAL AGENCY OF SCIENTIFIC ORGANIZATIONS Page 138 THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION Page 170 THE MINISTRY OF CONSTRUCTION AND HOUSING AND COMMUNAL SERVICES OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION Page 197 THE MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND SCIENCE OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION Annex 17 to the text of the bill (the Distribution of budget allocations by sections, subsections, target articles, types of expenditures in 2018 and 2019) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&53AC31EA95387FFB4325805A00548FFA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&53AC31EA95387FFB4325805A00548FFA)) – 644 pages (functional classification) For example, – section 01 NATIONAL ISSUES on page 01 – for 2018 and 2019 (data are presented in two columns) section 02 NATIONAL DEFENCE (p. 115) section 09 HEALTH care (p. 491) Annex 21 to the text of the bill (budget allocations for the target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation), groups, types of expenditures, sections, subsections in 2018 and 2019) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B2846547A69CA8754325805A00554161](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B2846547A69CA8754325805A00554161))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

8: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditure estimates for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year) by program?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, multi-year estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented.
- d. (0) No, multi-year estimates for programs are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: The expenditures of the Federal budget 2018-2019 under Federal programs are posted on the website of the State Duma in the documents on the draft Federal budget for 2017-2019 (they are contained in the text of the draft law on federal budget (article 6) and in Annex 28). [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669)) Article 6 is on the pp. 22-27 Annex 28 to the text of the bill (Distribution of budgetary allocations on the implementation of the Federal target program for 2018 and 2019) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&18180F12F08881784325805A005603E1](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&18180F12F08881784325805A005603E1)) 83% of the Federal budget expenditures are detailed, including for Government programs In the explanatory note to the bill on pages 110-294 is described the structure of expenditures for state programs, including stated that, in accordance with the list of state programs of the Russian Federation, approved by the order of the Government of the Russian Federation from November 11, 2010 N 1950-R.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Incorrect reference to Annex 28 to the draft of Budget Law. This distribution is on the Federal Target Programs which are included in the composition of the State Programs. It is necessary to focus on the Annex 21 dealing with the State Programs except of the closed part of budget expenditures in accordance with Annex 5 to the Explanatory Note to the Draft Budget Law. However, it also does not exceed 2/3 of the budget expenditures. Links: Annex 21. "Приложение 21 к тексту законопроекта (Распределение бюджетных ассигнований по целевым статьям (государственным программам РФ), группам видов расходов, разделам, подразделам на 2018 и 2019 г.г.) (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)", [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B2846547A69CA8754325805A00554161](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B2846547A69CA8754325805A00554161)). Annex 5 to the Explanatory Note to the Draft Budget Law "Прил.5 к пояснительной записке (Расходы федерального бюджета в 2016-2019 годах в разрезе государственных программ) (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)", [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0A0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0A0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C))

9: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of tax revenue (such as income tax or VAT) for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for all tax revenue are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, tax revenues are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, individual sources of tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all tax revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, individual sources of tax revenue are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 4 to the Explanatory note (the Forecast of tax revenues of the Federal budget) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C))
Description of the revenues part, see also the explanatory note to the draft law on page 25-90 Explanatory note to the bill: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

10: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present the individual sources of non-tax revenue (such as grants, property income, and sales of government-produced goods and services) for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for all non-tax revenue are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, non-tax revenues are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, individual sources of non-tax revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all non-tax revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, individual sources of non-tax revenue are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 4 to the Explanatory note (the Forecast of tax revenues of the Federal budget) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C))
Description of the profitable part, see also the explanatory note to the draft law on pages 25-90 Explanatory note to the bill: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

11: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year estimates of revenue are presented by category.
- b. (0) No, multi-year estimates of revenue are not presented by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Information about tax and non-tax revenues for BY 2015-2019 is included in the documents on the draft Federal budget for 2017-2019. See Annex 4 to the Explanatory note (the Forecast of tax revenues of the Federal budget) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

12: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates for individual sources of revenue presented for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of revenue are presented.
- d. (0) No, multi-year estimates for individual sources of revenue are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Information about tax and non-tax revenues for BY 2015-2019 is presented in the documents on the draft Federal budget for 2017-2019. See Annex 4 to the Explanatory note (The forecast of tax revenues of the Federal budget) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

13: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Upper limit of the external debt: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E45B9A05E23BF5204325805A00645CE0](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E45B9A05E23BF5204325805A00645CE0)) External debt: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&396B6641E0DA8FF34325805A0064868E](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&396B6641E0DA8FF34325805A0064868E)) Upper limit and the draft structure of the Federation's internal debt [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D1935FD87149271D4325805A0065836D](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D1935FD87149271D4325805A0065836D)) Annex 44 to the text of the bill (Program of state internal borrowings) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A1978AFA0BB37B314325805A005A8AAD](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A1978AFA0BB37B314325805A005A8AAD)) Annex 45 to the text of the bill (Programme of state guarantees in local currency) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&795E4BBB2D622CE84325805A005ACEA2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&795E4BBB2D622CE84325805A005ACEA2)) Annex 46 to the text of the bill (Programme of state foreign borrowings) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0E53044FF469994325805A005B0049](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0E53044FF469994325805A005B0049)) Annex 47 to the text of the bill (Programme of state guarantees in foreign currency) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&4225DFB9FBDE67034325805A005B38B5](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&4225DFB9FBDE67034325805A005B38B5)) Passport of the state program 39 "Public Finance Management and regulation of financial markets" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1968CFFF3143A9464325805A0068C017](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1968CFFF3143A9464325805A0068C017)) Explanatory note to the draft Federal budget, see pages 278-282 (State program "Public Finance Management and regulation of financial markets") and pp. 377-380 (Section "State and municipal debt servicing") [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F))

Comments: Researcher: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669)) Text of the bill on the federal budget for 2017 Articles 13 and 14 of the Bill regulate the management of the internal and external debt of the Russian Federation, including its approval, in accordance with the requirements of the Budget Code (articles 108, 108.1, 110 and 110.2), for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019. Information is also presented on the

plans for the Federation's internal borrowings (Annex 44 to the Bill), foreign borrowing (Annex 46 to the Bill), state guarantees in the local currency (Annex 45 to the Bill), and state guarantees in foreign currency (Annex 47 to the Bill)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

14: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information related to the composition of the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total debt outstanding.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to composition of total debt outstanding is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: 1) There is no information on interest rates 2) There is no debt repayment schedule 3) In the Explanatory Note on page 379 is stated that "Expenditure obligations of the Russian Federation for servicing the state foreign debt of the Russian Federation are determined on the basis of international treaties and agreements, original schedules of payments to foreign creditors in accordance with bilateral agreements, the conditions of issue and volumes of government securities and the forecasted level of interest rates." Explanatory note to the draft Federal budget - SECTION "STATE AND MUNICIPAL DEBT SERVICING" -[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) But in annexes there are no original payment schedules and projected level of interest rates Internal debt – (on two pages) Annex 44 to the text of the bill (Program of state internal borrowings) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A1978AFA0BB37B314325805A005A8AAD](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A1978AFA0BB37B314325805A005A8AAD)) Domestic government borrowing is the total volume in 2017 (page 1), 2018 and 2019 (page 2) External debt - Annex 46 on 20 pages. The state external borrowings of the Russian Federation, the total volumes for 2017 (page 1), 2018 and 2019 (page 11)

Comments: Researcher:

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

15: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: 1) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669)) Text of the bill on the federal budget for 2017-2019 2) Nominal GDP level and inflation rate are found in the Article 1 pp 1-3 of the Text of the bill on the federal budget for 2017, on 2018-2019 - p.2 3) Real GDP growth – in the Explanatory Note to the draft Federal budget - pages 23 Table 2.1 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) 4) No information on interest rates is presented

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The supporting budget documentation to the Executive's Budget Proposal present different core information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based. It is on Pages 22-30. [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) The interest rates are set by the Central Bank of the Russian Federation which is independent from the Government. <http://cbr.ru/> (<http://cbr.ru/>)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Information on interest rates in the draft of Budget Law is presented on page 45 (Table "Parameters of the monetary sector and balance of payments") of the Forecast of socio-economic development of the Russian Federation in 2017 and in the planning period of 2018 and 2019. Also the Forecast of socio-economic development submitted with the draft of Budget Law contains information beyond the core elements. Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DD8ABC291A0E8C8B4325805A00638F9D](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DD8ABC291A0E8C8B4325805A00638F9D)), "прогноз социально-экономического развития российской федерации на 2017 год и на плановый период 2018 и 2019 годов (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)"

Researcher response: In light of the input provided by the Government Reviewer, and having read though the document, we change the response from "c" to "b." Indeed, page 45 of the "Forecast of socio-economic development of the Russian Federation in 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" shows the forecast of growth of credit to nonfinancial organizations and loans for the years 2016-2019. But we could not find information on interest rates. The Forecast is the part of the EBP, and includes comprehensive information otherwise.

16: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions (i.e., sensitivity analysis) on the budget? (The core information must include estimates of the impact on expenditures, revenue, and debt of different assumptions for the inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented to show the impact of different macroeconomic assumptions on the budget.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to different macroeconomic assumptions is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Description of the variants of the forecast (three options - basic, "basic+" and "target" is given in the Forecast of socio-economic development of the Russian Federation in 2017 and the plans 2018 and 2019, at [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DD8ABC291A0E8C8B4325805A00638F9D](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DD8ABC291A0E8C8B4325805A00638F9D)). See for example page 7 and following.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

17: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect expenditure is presented.
- d. (0) No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented in the draft law on the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 tabled to the State Duma.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: There is a lot of information about how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect expenditures in the Explanatory Note to the Draft of Budget Law. First of all, it contains the estimates of all new government decisions on all expenditures along on sections and subsections of federal budget expenditures. Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)), "Пояснительная записка к законопроекту (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)", pages 318-394. In each section there is information about the changes in budget expenditures in connection with exact activities in comparison with the previous year. In addition there is an information on new priority government projects, adopted in 2016 - see Table 4.6.1 on p. 394. of the Explanatory Note. A narrative discussion is presented on p. 393. Besides, pp. 383-392 contain a narrative discussion and estimates on implementation of Presidential decrees provisions, which state, for example, increasing teachers and doctors salary for 2017-2019 years, housing and utilities expenditures etc.

Researcher response: Information that shows how new policy proposals affect expenditure is not presented in the draft law. The Explanatory note describes the changes of budgetary allocations compared to the previous year. The explanations are given on these changes by directions of expenditures. For example: Section "Social policy" (expenditure in this area in 2017 will amount to 5,083.5 billion or 31% in total expenditures of the Federal budget). This section states that changes in expenditures on "social policy" have been influenced by - the increase in budget appropriations compared with the previous year, provided for...- reduction in budgetary allocation compared to the previous year, provided for...Several examples of increases, such as: State pension - taking into account the forecast growth rate of the living wage in 2017; Payment of Federal social surcharge to pension in connection with growth of number of recipients and increase in the size of payments in 2017 Payment of pensions to persons discharged from military and similar services, and members of their families, as well as other payments in the framework of pension provision in connection with the annual increase of pensions to the projected inflation rateBut it does not seem to be possible to identify the new policy proposals and how new policy proposals affect expenditures. The information only refers to increase or decrease in expenditure for given policies, without specifying whether they are new or exiting from previous budget years. The response remains unchanged.

18: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information for at least the budget year that shows how new policy proposals, as distinct from existing policies, affect revenues?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, information that shows how some but not all new policy proposals affect revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, information that shows how new policy proposals affect revenues is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The main factors affecting the change in the forecast revenues of the Federal budget given in the Explanatory note to the draft Federal budget pages 44-108 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) Page 44 The increase in the base rate for tax on natural resources production (from 919 to 857 rubles per ton) within the "tax manoeuvre", have led to an increase in revenues for this source in 2017 for 183,3 183 million rubles. The revenue receipts from tax on natural resources production in the form of hydrocarbons is calculated on the basis of the indicators, given at page 50 Table 3.3 Indicators used to calculate the tax on natural resources production on hydrocarbons in 2017-2019 years Page 45, pp. 61-62 The change of the standard of admission of the excise tax and the amounts of increases or decreases of revenues Page 47, pp. 63-64 The change in receipt of the excise revenue as the result of changes in the volume of excisable products and the corresponding amounts of increase or reduction of revenues

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The Explanatory note to the Draft Budget Law contains all the information about all the new proposals which can impact on an increase or decrease of federal budget revenues. See the common Table 3.2 "Factor analysis of federal budget revenues changes in 2017-2019 years" on pages 44-47. A narrative discussion is presented on pages 48-108 in break down on types of revenues. Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F))

Researcher response: All things considered, it seems to us that the document shows how some, but not all, new policy proposals affect revenues, and certainly it lacks detail. Let's take for example a significant source of income for the Federal budget: receipt of value added tax on goods (works, services) sold on the territory of the Russian Federation. Income from this source will be 2,899,511.8 million rubles in 2017 (3.3% of GDP or 21% of revenues of the Federal budget). A narrative explanation is briefly presented on pages 59-61 of the Explanatory Note: "The main factors in the increase of tax revenue will be the increase in income tax in nominal terms and the increase of tax collection as a result of ongoing work to improve the quality of the revenue administration system, which will compensate the decline in revenues as a result of increased deductions related to imports and exports, amid weakening of the ruble and the growth in the value of foreign trade figures."The Note also mentions that the amount of revenue shortfall for BY 2017 (15.7 billion rubles) is due to the proposed change of legislation establishing the VAT rate of 0 percent for services for the carriage of passengers and luggage by railway transport in the far post from 1 January 2017 to 1 January 2030. This information is repeated in the table (table 3.11). And that is all the relevant information we could find, which we believe is insufficient to change our answer.

IBP comment: Even if the quality/level of detail of the narrative may be called into question by the researcher, the question only asks whether a narrative discussion is included, together with estimates. This seems to be the case. Response is changed, from "c" to "a."

19: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 5 to the explanatory note (Federal Expenditures in 2016-2019 in the context of state programs)

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0A0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0A0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C)) Annex 6 to the explanatory note (Federal Expenditures in 2016-2019 in the context of state programs) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&9575646A8FF2D3194325805A005FC9CD](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&9575646A8FF2D3194325805A005FC9CD)) Annex 9 of the Federal law "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" The departmental structure of Federal budget expenditures for 2017

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&72C38AA801DC6D2A4325805A0052E350](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&72C38AA801DC6D2A4325805A0052E350)) In the column "BP" specified expense 100 - Expenditures for payments to staff , the 200 - Procurement of goods, works and services, 300 Social security and other payments to the population 400 - Capital investment 500 - Intergovernmental transfers, 600 - subsidies. Each Department submitted expenditure details to the mentioned types of costs, reflecting the economic structure

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F))

OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&72C38AA801DC6D2A4325805A0052E350) In the column "BP" specified expense 100 - Expenditures for payments to staff , the 200 - Procurement of goods, works and services, 300 Social security and other payments to the population 400 - Capital investment 500 - Intergovernmental transfers, 600 - subsidies. Each Department submitted expenditure details to the mentioned types of costs, reflecting the economic structure

Comments: Researcher: 83% of expenditures is classified by department (admin); 100% is classified by function (sections and subsections); 83% is classified by economic classification

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: Besides the others, there is a functional classification of the Budget in Annex 17. [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F))

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F))

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

20: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- b. (67) Yes, programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- c. (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-1.
- d. (0) No, expenditures are not presented by program for BY-1.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Expenditures by individual "program" that correspond to the given definition "any level of detail below an administrative unit, such as a ministry or department" are not presented for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1); expenditure by individual "programs" that are in the budget presented separately – the state programs – are presented for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1), but they are of less than 50% of the budget. "Programs that are in the budget presented separately – the state programs" – they are set aside in the Annex 5 to the Explanatory note (Federal Expenditures in 2016-2019 on the state programs) -[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0A0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0A0BCB412C47AE4325805A005F949C))

Comments: Researcher: Federal law of June 28, 2014 № 172-FZ "On strategic planning in the Russian Federation" (page 4) -

<http://economy.gov.ru/minec/activity/sections/strategicplann...>

(<http://economy.gov.ru/minec/activity/sections/strategicplanning/regulation/20151113>): state program («государственная программа») of the Russian Federation - the strategic planning document, containing a set of planned activities linked by objectives, the implementation timeline, performers and resources and instruments of state policy, providing the framework of key state functions achieving the priorities and objectives of state policy in the sphere of socio-economic development and national security of the Russian Federation; The list of state programmes of the Russian Federation, approved by the RF Government decree - <http://government.ru/programs/> (<http://government.ru/programs/>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

21: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have expenditure estimates of the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated from the original enacted levels to reflect actual expenditures?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.
- b. (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Information about performance evaluation of expenditures in 2016 is presented in the Explanatory note on page 26,

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)). See Table 2.2 The main characteristics of the Federal budget for 2017 and

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)). See Table 2.2 The main characteristics of the Federal budget for 2017 and

plans for BY 2018 and 2019. For BY-1 (2016), three columns are available: Закон № 359-ФЗ (Law -- the approved budget) Оценка (Evaluation -- performance) Откло-нение (Deviation)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

22: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of expenditure for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years) by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, expenditure estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

23: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present expenditures for individual programs for more than one year preceding the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- a. (100) Yes, programs accounting for all expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- b. (67) Yes, programs accounting for at Least two-Thirds of, but not all, expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- c. (33) Yes, programs accounting for less than two-Thirds of expenditures are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
- d. (0) No, not expenditures are presented by program for BY-2 and prior years.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Expenditures on government programs (GP) are about 50% of the budget. In the list of supporting documents to the draft Federal budget are presented the passports to the GP. GP approved for the period 2013-2019 (there is some for 2012 and 2020), the expenditures for each year of the specified period are presented in the passports of the GP. For example. Passport GP 01 "Development of Healthcare" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB))

Comments: Researcher: Passport of the state program of the Russian Federation is the document about the state program, containing the following information: Responsible executor of the program The partners in the programme The participants of the program Sub-programs (including Federal target programs) Goal of the program Objectives of the program Target indicators and program indicators Stages and terms of project realization The budget allocation of the program The expected results of the program Passport of the state program is approved according to Annex 1 to the Order of the development, implementation and evaluation of the effectiveness of state programmes of the Russian Federation (approved by decree of the RF Government dated August 2, 2010 N 588) <http://pravo.garant.ru/document?id=98991&byPara=1> (<http://pravo.garant.ru/document?id=98991&byPara=1>) the link is provided on the portal of state programs of the Russian Federation in the section "Normative base" <http://programs.gov.ru/Portal/programs/documents> (<http://programs.gov.ru/Portal/programs/documents>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

24: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all expenditures reflect actual outcomes?

- a. (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).

- b. (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- c. (33) Before BY-3.
- d. (0) No actual data for all expenditures are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>) On execution of the Federal budget for 2015 Date of tabling to the Parliament: 25 July 2016 31 October 2016, the law was signed. Federal law No. 377-FZ All expenditure for 2015 are reported as "actual".

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

25: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax) for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 are presented by category.
- b. (0) No, revenue estimates for BY-1 are not presented by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Information on the actual revenue for BY 2016 is presented on page 27 of the Explanatory Note of the draft Federal budget for 2017-2019, at [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) See also Table 2.3 "Forecast revenues of the Federal budget for 2017 and plans for BY 2018 and 2019". More detailed revenue estimate for BY 2016 is presented in Annex 4 to the Explanatory note - "Forecast of tax revenues of the Federal budget for 2017 and plans for BY 2018 and 2019." See: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/0C72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C/\\$File/%D0%9F%D1%80%D0%B8%D0%BB%D0%BE%D0%B6%D0%OpenElement](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/0C72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C/$File/%D0%9F%D1%80%D0%B8%D0%BB%D0%BE%D0%B6%D0%OpenElement)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

26: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for the year preceding the budget year (BY-1)?

- a. (100) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-1.
- b. (67) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue for BY-1 are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues for BY-1 are presented.
- d. (0) No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-1.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Detailed revenue estimate for 2016 is presented in Annex 4 to the Explanatory note - Forecast of tax revenues of the Federal budget [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0C72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0C72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

27: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, have the original estimates of revenue for the year prior to the budget year (BY-1) been updated to reflect actual revenue collections?

- a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates for BY-1 have been updated from the original enacted levels.

- b. (0) No, revenue estimates for BY-1 have not been updated from the original enacted levels.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: In the Explanatory Note, whenever a change is indicated between the revenue forecast for 2017 relative to the revenue estimates for 2016, revenue for BY 2016 are indicated as "revised". For example, see pages 37, 43, 46, 48, 50, 57, 58, 66 ... etc.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

28: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax) for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are presented by category.
b. (0) No, revenue estimates for BY-2 and prior years are not presented by category.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 4 to the Explanatory note - Forecast of tax revenues of the Federal budget [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

29: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present individual sources of revenue for more than one year prior to the budget year (that is, BY-2 and prior years)?

- a. (100) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
b. (67) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
c. (33) Yes, individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues are presented for BY-2 and prior years.
d. (0) No, individual sources of revenue are not presented for BY-2 and prior years.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 4 to the Explanatory note - [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

30: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which all revenues reflect actual outcomes?

- a. (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
b. (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
c. (33) Before BY-3.
d. (0) No actual data for all revenues are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 4 to the Explanatory note - [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&OC72035E1311E8924325805A005F518C)). The heading for BY-2

(2015) is the following "2015 год (исполнение)" = "results"

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

31: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the year proceeding the budget year (BY-1)? (The core information must include the total debt outstanding at the end of BY-1; the amount of net new borrowing required during BY-1; interest payments on the debt; interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic or external debt.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for government debt.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for government debt.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to government debt is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Explanatory note to EBP [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) See specifically pp. 278-285 (changes in 2017 compared to the BY 2016, a year in the framework of the State program "Public Finance Management and regulation of financial markets"), p. 280 (debt service costs in 2016-2019), pp. 377-380 (given the amount of change in 2017 compared to the previous one, that is 2016, a year

Comments: Researcher: A detailed description of the calculations and substantiation of revenue, budget and sources of covering the deficit of the Federal budget given in the relevant sections of this explanatory note. pp. 35-36 - In 2017-2019 years will be the growth of the public debt of the Russian Federation. By the end of 2017 the volume of state debt of the Russian Federation will be 13 972,2 billion rubles, 2018 – 15 177,1 billion and 2019 – 16 651,9 billion (table 2.7 The volume of state debt of the Russian Federation).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

32: In the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation, what is the most recent year presented for which the debt figures reflect actual outcomes?

- a. (100) Two years prior to the budget year (BY-2).
- b. (67) Three years prior to the budget year (BY-3).
- c. (33) Before BY-3.
- d. (0) No actual data for government debt are presented in the budget or supporting budget documentation.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Explanatory note to EBP [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) Table 2.7 The volume of state debt of the Russian Federation). The heading for 2015 explicitly says "report" (2015 год (отчет)) as opposed to "estimates."

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

33: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on extra-budgetary funds for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the extra-budgetary fund; and complete income, expenditure, and financing data on a gross basis.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all extra-budgetary funds.

- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some extra-budgetary funds.
d. (0) No, information related to extra-budgetary funds is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The "Draft laws on extra-budgetary funds of the Russian Federation in 2017-2019" were tabled on 28.10.2016 together with the draft budget, see: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=15456-7&O2> - Bill No. 15456-7 On the budget of the Pension Fund of the Russian Federation in 2017 and plans for BY 2018-19: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=15457-7&O2> - Bill No. 15457-7 On the budget of the Federal Compulsory Medical Insurance Fund in 2017 and plans for BY 2018 and 2019, <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=15458-7&O2> - Bill No. 15458-7 On the budget of the Social Insurance Fund of the Russian Federation in 2017 and plans for BY 2018-19, <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=15458-7&O2> The description given in the Explanatory Note to the draft budget law, pp. 394-405. See: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)
Comments: Researcher: the Explanatory Note to the EBP 2017-2019 - p.394-395 table 5.1 in the Section 5: Inter Budgetary relations with the extra-budgetary funds - [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

34: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present central government finances (both budgetary and extra-budgetary) on a consolidated basis for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, central government finances are presented on a consolidated basis.
b. (0) No, central government finances are not presented on a consolidated basis.
c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The consolidated budget is presented in the following Annex with title "The forecast of the main parameters of the consolidated budget of the Russian Federation for 2017-2019" It shows the consolidation of the Federal budget and regional budgets. See: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BE4F0C34584F1CF84325805A00557F4B](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BE4F0C34584F1CF84325805A00557F4B) Explanatory Note to EBP 2017-2019 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F) Discription – pp. 395-405 Detailed information – on each draft extra-budgetary fund. For example, the list of materials supporting the Bill No. 15456-7 (The budget of the Pension Fund of the Russian Federation for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019) contain the Explanatory note: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&2760C34D6FEF79244325805A00544470](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&2760C34D6FEF79244325805A00544470) with all details Annex "The forecast of the main parameters of the budget system of the Russian Federation, including the consolidated budget of the Russian Federation in 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1E1015EE179DFC024325805A0055512D](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1E1015EE179DFC024325805A0055512D)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

35: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
b. (67) Yes, estimates of all intergovernmental transfers are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all intergovernmental transfers are presented.
d. (0) No, estimates of intergovernmental transfers are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: See Annex 8 of the Explanatory Note (Intergovernmental transfers from the Federal budget to budgets of subjects of the Russian Federation for the years 2016-2019), [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&43ADD1A6D295EF924325805A00603EA2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&43ADD1A6D295EF924325805A00603EA2) Calculation for the allocation of intergovernmental transfers between the

entities of the Russian Federation (Subventions to budgets of the Republic of Crimea and the Federal city of Sevastopol for the implementation of part of the transferred powers of the Russian Federation in the sphere of Federal property management), [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&75D6FAEAC2AA6D1F4325805B003604B6](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&75D6FAEAC2AA6D1F4325805B003604B6)) Calculation for the allocation of intergovernmental transfers between the entities of the Russian Federation (Subventions for the exercise of certain powers in the field of water relations) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&609D3D8A3EC65BCA4325805B003748B8](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&609D3D8A3EC65BCA4325805B003748B8)) Resolution of the government of the Russian Federation from 30 December 2010 N1199 "About granting from the federal budget of interbudgetary transfers to budgets of subjects of the Russian Federation and the budget of the city of Baikonur to exercise certain powers in the field of drug supply" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BD1700467D0E0E9F4325805B00378E6C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BD1700467D0E0E9F4325805B00378E6C)) Supporting budget documentation present estimates of intergovernmental transfers – there are many annexes on intergovernmental transfers (including dotations, subsidies, grants. Description is in the Explanatory Note for EBP2017-2019 p.406 (section VI Interbudgetary relations)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

36: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present alternative displays of expenditures (such as by gender, by age, by income, or by region) to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens, for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, at least three alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- b. (67) Yes, two alternative displays of expenditures are presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- c. (33) Yes, one alternative display of expenditures is presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- d. (0) No, alternative displays of expenditures are not presented to illustrate the financial impact of policies on different groups of citizens.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: There are data on Federal spending by region (annexes on intergovernmental transfers - they are presented by region). In addition, on page 131 of the Explanatory note to the draft Federal budget ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F))), expenditures are shown within the state program "Social support of citizens", which are presented in the following groups: State program "Social support of citizens": Federal spending in 2016-2019 for the implementation of the state program "Social support of citizens" are presented in table 4.2.4. - subprogram "Provision of measures of social support of separate categories of citizens" - subprogram "Modernization and development of social service of the population" - subprogram "State support of the families having children" - subprogram "Improving the effectiveness of government support to socially oriented nonprofit organizations" - subprogram "Senior generation" - subprogram "Ensuring the conditions for the implementation of the state program of the Russian Federation "Social support of citizens" The information is presented similarly as for the EBP 2014-16, For example, in the documents shown below, which are presented together with the EBP 2017-2019 there is the displays of expenditures for the definite purposes between regions ("subjects of Russian Federation") Drug provision (calculation) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&42BAA19D33D499244325805B003821D1](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&42BAA19D33D499244325805B003821D1)) Calculation of distribution of subventions for payments between subjects of the Russian Federation [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0C7C701COCBA73B4325805B0036AFE2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0C7C701COCBA73B4325805B0036AFE2)) Calculation of distribution of subventions for payments between subjects of the Russian Federation [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0C7C701COCBA73B4325805B0036AFE2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0C7C701COCBA73B4325805B0036AFE2)) Calculation of subsidies for implementation of separate measures of the state program of the Russian Federation "Development of health" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&867577A9DFA2BE0E4325805B003DE804](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&867577A9DFA2BE0E4325805B003DE804)) Subventions housing&utilities management (Calculation) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&8C81E8AA47F5772B4325805B003C4E30](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&8C81E8AA47F5772B4325805B003C4E30))

Comments: Researcher: For example, supporting budget documentation Calculation of distribution of subventions for payments between subjects of the Russian Federation [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0C7C701COCBA73B4325805B0036AFE2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0C7C701COCBA73B4325805B0036AFE2)) CALCULATION of Subsidies for implementation of separate measures of the state program of the Russian Federation "Development of health" (the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&867577A9DFA2BE0E4325805B003DE804](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&867577A9DFA2BE0E4325805B003DE804))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: There are data on Federal spending on some territories by geographical principle. For example, there are following State programs of Russian Federation: Development of the North Caucasian Federal District <http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/190126A8E558213143...> ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/190126A8E55821314325805A0067A50E/\\$File/%D0%93%D0%9F%20%D0%A0%D0%A4%2035.pdf?OpenElement](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/190126A8E55821314325805A0067A50E/$File/%D0%93%D0%9F%20%D0%A0%D0%A4%2035.pdf?OpenElement)) ; Social and economic development of the Republic of Crimea and the city of Sevastopol [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/d...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/d...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1A5F3F0F58A723214325805A0068DAE9](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1A5F3F0F58A723214325805A0068DAE9)) ; Social and economic development of the Kaliningrad region <http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/4BFDB26DCD8ABA7143...> ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/4BFDB26DCD8ABA714325805A00685885/\\$File/%D0%93%D0%9F%20%D0%A0%D0%A4%2037.pdf?OpenElement](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/4BFDB26DCD8ABA714325805A00685885/$File/%D0%93%D0%9F%20%D0%A0%D0%A4%2037.pdf?OpenElement)) ; Social and economic development of the Far East and the Baikal region [http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/d...](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/d...) ([http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F82B84951250E4BC4325805A006775B4](http://asozd.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F82B84951250E4BC4325805A006775B4)) . All information about spendings connected with realization of these programmes is in Appendixes to EPS.

Comments: Budget expenditures on state corporations and state companies are reflected in the Annex 9 "The Departmental (Administrative) structure of Federal budget expenditures in 2017" and in the Explanatory Note to the Budget Law Draft (for example, pages 202, 204). The Annex contains information on the subsidies to a number of companies: Rosatom, the Federal space Agency, United Aircraft Corporation, United Engine Corporation, United Shipbuilding Corporation, the Fund of Reforming Housing and Communal Services Assistance, Vneshekonombank etc. Pages 108-318 of the Explanatory Note present specific examples and links to the public joint-stock companies. Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7)) Files: «Приложение 9 к тексту законопроекта (Ведомственная структура расходов федерального бюджета на 2017 год) (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)»; «Пояснительная записка к законопроекту (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)».

Researcher response: There are some secret/unknown public transfers to public corporations and inter-budgetary transfers to budgets of subjects of the Russian Federation in the Federal budget amounting to 169,308,143.9 thousand rubles (See: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0780A64EE6E1704E4325805A0050F669)). See) text of the Draft Law. Pages 32-35, article 9. Paragraph 5 of article 9: " #5. To establish that certain subsidies to legal entities and individual inter-budgetary transfers to budgets of subjects of the Russian Federation:1) in 2017, according to Annex 37 (secret) to this Federal law are provided according the procedure established by the Government of the Russian Federation, within the limits of revenues of the Federal budget according to Appendix 38 (secretly) to the present Federal law in the amount of up to 169,308,143.9 thousand rubles.

IBP comment: The government reviewer mentions subsidies to a "number" of companies, which does not confirm that all transfers to public corporations are included. In light of this, as well as the researcher's response above, the response remains unchanged.

38: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all quasi-fiscal activities.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some quasi-fiscal activities.
- d. (0) No, information related to quasi-fiscal activities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: No such information is presented in the 2017 EBP documentation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: We can hardly agree with the expert's answer. We pretend to have an answer A. There are a number of examples that present information on quasi-fiscal activities for at least the budget year. This information includes a statement of purpose or policy rationale for the quasi-fiscal activity and the intended beneficiaries. For example: - page 243 of the Explanatory Note (financial support of the main Program activity implementation "Supporting agro-industrial sector preferential lending" in 2017 – 5 124.6 million rubles, in 2018 – 4 955.5 million rubles, in 2019 – 4 834.4 million rubles). Read more about the purposes of lending and beneficiaries in the State Program 25 Passport "State Program for the Development of Agriculture and Markets of Agricultural Products Regulation, raw materials and food for 2013 - 2020" (the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes). - page 340 of the Explanatory Note (Contribution to the authorized capital of the public joint-stock company "State Transport Leasing Company" in order to provide a mechanism to support sales of aircraft Il-96-400 M in 2017 4 000.0 million rubles, in 2018 6 000.0 million rubles) Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7)) Files: «Приложение 9 к тексту законопроекта (Ведомственная структура расходов федерального бюджета на 2017 год) (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)».

Researcher response: The departmental structure of the expenditures of EBP 2017 shows the following expenses:-- Subsidies to Russian credit organisations on compensation of shortfall of their income on loans issued to agricultural producers, organizations and individual entrepreneurs engaged in the production, primary and (or) subsequent (industrial) processing of agricultural products and its implementation, at a reduced rate (Additional budget appropriations) - 5 124 623 thousand rubles;-- Subsidies to rail transport organizations to compensate losses in income resulting from the establishment of privileges on tariffs on transportation of students and pupils of educational institutions over 10 years of railway transport in General and second-class carriages in trains of all categories (Additional budget appropriations) 1 052 655 thousand rubles; Only these expenditures represent quasi-fiscal activities. In sum, these expenditures amount to 6 billion rubles, or 0,038% in total Federal budget expenditures (16 240,8 billion rubles) We may increase the score from "d" to "c." The information presented in the EBP does not allow to see the full/consolidated picture of quasi-fiscal activities of Russia.

IBP comment: Given the input provided by the Government Reviewer and the lack of evidence that any quasi-fiscal activities are missing, to maintain consistency of responses across countries, the response has been changed from "c" to "a." However, it must be noted that the information is scattered across many parts of the EBP package, making it very difficult in practice to identify all quasi-fiscal activities.

39: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on financial assets held by the government? (The core information must include a listing of the assets, and an estimate of their value.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all financial assets.

- d. (0) No, estimates of expenditure arrears are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Such information is not presented in the 2017 EBP documentation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

42: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on contingent liabilities, such as government loan guarantees or insurance programs? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each contingent liability; the new guarantees or insurance commitments proposed for the budget year; and the total amount of outstanding guarantees or insurance commitments (the gross exposure) at the end of the budget year.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all contingent liabilities.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all contingent liabilities.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some contingent liabilities.
d. (0) No, information related to contingent liabilities is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: See: - State guarantees of the Russian Federation in local currency (Annex 45 to the Bill) - State guarantees of the Russian Federation in foreign currency (Annex 47 to the Bill). These are in accordance with the requirements of the Budget Code (article 108, 108.1, 110 and 110.2) for 2017 and plans for BY 2018-19. Annex 45 to the text of the bill, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&795E4BBB2D622CE84325805A005ACEA2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&795E4BBB2D622CE84325805A005ACEA2)) Annex 47 to the text of the bill, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&4225DFB9FBDE67034325805A005B38B5](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&4225DFB9FBDE67034325805A005B38B5))

Comments: Researcher: The article 108.1 of the Budget code of the Russian Federation stated that "The program of government guarantees of the Russian Federation in foreign currency is attached to the Federal law on the Federal budget for the next financial year and planning period." <http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/108.1> (<http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/108.1>) In article 110.2 of the Budget code of the Russian Federation stated that "The program of government guarantees of the Russian Federation in the currency of the Russian Federation is an Annex to the budget law" <http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/110.2> (<http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/110.2>) in articles 13 and 14 of the approved program of the government guarantees of the Russian Federation in the currency of the Russian Federation (Annex 45 to the Bill) and the programme of government guarantees of the Russian Federation in foreign currency (Annex 47 to the Bill).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

43: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present projections that assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term? (The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented to assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.
b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented to assess the government's future liabilities and the sustainability of its finances over the longer term.
c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
d. (0) No, information related to future liabilities and the sustainability of finances over the longer term is not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: The budget forecast of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2034 (draft) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0FE64BE50F17DB644325805A006353C5](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0FE64BE50F17DB644325805A006353C5)) The document is 9 pages long, including a section ("2. The conditions of formation of the budget forecast") that presents the main parameters of the forecast (p. 4-8) and the application which presents the forecast parameters of the budget system of the Russian Federation as a percentage of GDP (income, expenditure, deficit) But we haven't found the demographic assumptions.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The demographic assumptions which was not found by the expert are presented on the page 21 of the Main Directions of the Budget Policy. It contains long-term (up to 2030) demographic forecast and description of discussions about the needs for the resources allocations in favor of the retirees. Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) File: ОСНОВНЫЕ НАПРАВЛЕНИЯ БЮДЖЕТНОЙ ПОЛИТИКИ НА 2017 ГОД И НА ПЛАНОВЫЙ ПЕРИОД 2018 И 2019 ГОДОВ (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)

Researcher response: We agree with the Government Reviewer's comment, change the answer from "c" to "b." In the document "Budget forecast of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2034 (draft)" there is no information on demographic assumptions. In the document "Main Directions of the Budget Policy" (which is the document cited by the Government Reviewer, and part of the EBP package) charts are presented, based on the Russian Federal service of government statistics data, which show the projected tendencies up to 2030 in three variants. The core information must cover a period of at least 10 years and include the macroeconomic and demographic assumptions used and a discussion of the fiscal implications and risks highlighted by the projections.

44: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of the sources of donor assistance, both financial and in-kind?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all sources of donor assistance are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all sources of donor assistance are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the sources of donor assistance are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: e.

Sources: Russia does not get donor assistance. There is the Programme of state foreign borrowings of the Russian Federation in 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 where are specified unbound (financial) loans of the Russian Federation", including as a source of attracting the "international capital market" and EBRD projects. But this borrowings are within the framework of specific projects rather than donor assistance. Annex 46 to the text of the bill (Programme of state foreign borrowings of the Russian Federation) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0E53044FF469994325805A005B0049](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3C0E53044FF469994325805A005B0049))

Comments: Researcher: Russia is not a recipient country anymore.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

45: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on tax expenditures for at least the budget year? (The core information must include a statement of purpose or policy rationale for each tax expenditure, the intended beneficiaries, and an estimate of the revenue foregone.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for all tax expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for all tax expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements or some tax expenditures.
- d. (0) No, information related to tax expenditures is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Explanatory note pp 92-93: Measures to optimize the existing system of privileges and preferences

Comments: Researcher: From Explanatory note pp. 92-93: "Measures to optimize the existing system of privileges and preferences" In order to increase the revenues of sub-national levels budgets, the government planned a phased abolition of the tax privileges established at federal level on regional and local taxes, with the transfer of the relevant powers to the regional (local) level. It is supposed to allocate existing federal tax incentives for regional and local taxes into three categories depending on the duration of their mandatory application of subjects of the Russian Federation on its territory: the benefits required to provide in the entire territory of the Russian Federation for five years, three years and one year. Upon expiry of the validity period for the mandatory application of benefits, the subject gets the right to make the decision to provide on its territory the respective tax benefits or not. It also assumes the introduction of the rule of "two keys" for certain types of benefits and preferences provided for the income tax and tax on profit. It is supposed to apply these benefits (similar to the reduced rate of tax on profit in relation to the implementation of investment projects) in case of adoption of the relevant decision the subject of the Russian Federation. In addition, there will be the full implementation of the tax and non-tax expenditures into the budget process. The Budget Code will require fixing of the concept of tax and non-tax costs and approach to the establishment of lists of tax and non-tax costs on all levels of the country's budget system; in addition legislative intervention is required to assess the need of the tax and non-tax expenditures allotment of the Ministry of Finance's authority, to establish general requirements for identifying approaches to the assessment of efficiency of tax and non-tax costs. In turn, this will strengthen the need to make a list of benefits and preferences at all levels of the budget system, which will further contribute to the implementation of rapid assessment of the volume of tax and non-tax expenditures on an

ongoing basis. Base on an effectiveness evaluation, proposals will be prepared to streamline the system of providing benefits, including taking into account their impact on economic growth.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: There are some examples of tax expenditures estimates: - VAT (VALUE ADDED TAX ON GOODS (WORKS, SERVICES)

<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/9865CFC5FF450A654...>

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/9865CFC5FF450A654325805A005E0B9A/\\$File/1%2003,%201%2004%20%D0%9D%D0%94%D0%A1.pdf](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/9865CFC5FF450A654325805A005E0B9A/$File/1%2003,%201%2004%20%D0%9D%D0%94%D0%A1.pdf))
OpenElement) - TAXES, FEES AND REGULAR PAYMENTS FOR USING NATURAL RESOURCES (estimates of tax expenditures reported for 2016 and 2017)

<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/53BED9D4CBA28E384...>

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/53BED9D4CBA28E384325805A005E375E/\\$File/1%2007%20%D0%9D%D0%B0%D0%BB%D0%BE%D0%B3%20OpenElement](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/53BED9D4CBA28E384325805A005E375E/$File/1%2007%20%D0%9D%D0%B0%D0%BB%D0%BE%D0%B3%20OpenElement)) - Profit tax (FEDERAL PROFIT TAX ON the PROFIT of ORGANIZATIONS)

<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/20D6FFF47822032D4...>

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/20D6FFF47822032D4325805A005D7347/\\$File/1%2001%20%D0%9D%D0%B0%D0%BB%D0%BE%D0%B3%20OpenElement](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/20D6FFF47822032D4325805A005D7347/$File/1%2001%20%D0%9D%D0%B0%D0%BB%D0%BE%D0%B3%20OpenElement)) Beneficiaries are often specified in the table calculations. Explanation of the purpose of providing tax relief on newly introduced benefits (see Main Directions of Tax Policy p.17 Link:[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&2EE40DA77737158E4325805A0060F73E](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&2EE40DA77737158E4325805A0060F73E))

Researcher response: In agreement with the Government Reviewer, the response has been changed from "d" to "c."

46: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of earmarked revenues?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all earmarked revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all earmarked revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of earmarked revenues are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The answer is "a". Article 192 of the Budget code of the Russian Federation <http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/192>

(<http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/192>) Calculations of the projected amount of the Reserve Fund and national welfare Fund at beginning and end of the next fiscal year and each year of the planning period, as well as estimates of their use are included in the materials introduced to the State Duma with a draft of the Federal law on the Federal budget. The article 96.9 of the Budget code of the Russian Federation <http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/96.9> (<http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/96.9>) states that the Reserve Fund represents a part of means of the Federal budget, which are subject to separate accounting, management and use to ensure balance (deficit) Federal budget. The Federal law on the Federal budget set the normative size of Reserve Fund in absolute amount determined on the basis of 7% of the projected GDP, specified in the Federal law on the Federal budget for the next financial year and planning period. The Reserve Fund is formed at the expense of additional oil and gas revenues of the Federal budget if the accumulated amount of the Reserve Fund reaches its normative values listed above; The article 96.10 of Budget code of the Russian Federation <http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/96.10> (<http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/96.10>) states that the national Welfare Fund represents a part of funds of the Federal budget which are subject to separate accounting and management to ensure co-financing of the voluntary pension savings of citizens of the Russian Federation, as well as balance (deficit) budget of the Pension Fund of the Russian Federation. The Federal law on the Federal budget sets the volume of Federal budget funds allocated for these purposes. The national Welfare Fund is formed due to additional oil and gas revenues of the Federal budget and revenues from managing assets of the national welfare Fund Article 179.4 of the Budget code of the Russian Federation <http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/179.4>

(<http://budcodex.ru/budcodex#currclauses/179.4>) The Road Fund is part of the budget to be used for the purposes of financial provision of road activities in respect of public roads, as well as the overhaul and repair of domestic territories of apartment houses, driveways to courtyards of apartment buildings and settlements. Calculation of the estimated amount of the Reserve Fund and National Welfare Fund in 2017-2019 years [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&83C990370628A7FF4325805A005D4782](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&83C990370628A7FF4325805A005D4782)) Explanatory note to the EBP2017-19

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) on pages 34-35 the Table with the forecast of the volumes of the Reserve Fund and the National Welfare Fund on 2016-2019 is given. The revenues from managing the assets of the Funds is also shown in Txplanatory note, for example, on p. 79-80 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&6BA0F805720581384325805A0065DA8D](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&6BA0F805720581384325805A0065DA8D)) The Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation publishes monthly the data on receipt and use of oil revenues of the Federal budget, assets of the National Welfare Fund at the beginning of the month, also about the funds transfer to the Fund, their placing and use in accounting month. From 1 January 2010 till 1 January 2014 the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation does not publish data on receipt and use of oil revenues of the Federal budget, and also about transfer of means in Reserve Fund and the National Welfare Fund http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/nationalwealthfund/fnb_otch_a...

(http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/nationalwealthfund/fnb_otch_audit/#ixzz4ZFhrksnK) On the website of the Ministry of Finance is given information about the National Welfare Fund and the Reserve Fund, including their purpose, formation, management and use.

<http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/nationalwealthfund/> (<http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/nationalwealthfund/>)

<http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/reservfund/> (<http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/reservfund/>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The narrative discussion is not included.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Revenues of Reserve Fund, National Welfare Fund and Federal road Fund are classified as earmarked funds and supporting budget documentation presents estimates of earmarked revenues along with a narrative discussion. Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A44BDE239483D1684325805A005415C2) (estimates of all earmarked revenues) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F) (narrative discussion on pages 77-80, 34-35, Tables 2.5, 2.6)

IBP comment: The original response "c," which peer and government reviewers disagree upon, was actually a typo. The researcher confirm response "a" in the first place. Response changed accordingly.

47: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for the budget year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for the budget year is presented.
- d. (0) No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for the budget year is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: Explanatory note to EBP 2017-2019 (pp. 393-394): In accordance with paragraph 1 of the minutes of the meeting of the presidential Council of the Russian Federation for strategic development and priority projects, on July 13, 2016 the main directions for the country's strategic development were approved for 2018 and for the period up to 2025 (hereinafter – the "priority projects"). Within the formation of the draft EBP for 2017 and plans for BY 2018-19, costs are provided for individual activities of priority projects, approved by the Presidium of the Presidential Council of the Russian Federation for Strategic Development and Priority Projects (Table 4.6.1). Priority projects (from table 4.6.1): "Healthcare" "Education" "Mortgage and rental housing" "Housing and the urban environment" "International cooperation and exports" "Small business and support of individual business initiative" "Safe and quality roads" "The integrated development of towns" "Ecology"

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: In the attached file, on pages 110-294, there are facts and figures on financing state (governmental) programs with specific structures of those programs which are related to the governmental goals.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The logic of program budgeting of the Federal Budget intends that government's policy goals are presented in the structure of the state programs goals. It is stated in the Federal Law "On Strategic Planning" 28.06.2014 N 172-FZ, Article 3, item 31 which says that state program is a strategic planning document which contain a set of planned activities, linked by goals, implementation timelines, performers and resources of government policy instruments, providing the framework of key state functions on achieving the priorities and objectives of government policy in the sphere of social-economic development and national defence of the Russian Federation. That is why all the other instruments like priority projects, federal targeted programs, Presidential decrees on raising the salary of some specific groups of citizens are part of the state programs and their goals.

Researcher response: In light of the reviewers' comments and suggestions, we changed the response from "c" to "b."

48: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present information on how the proposed budget (both new proposals and existing policies) is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period (for at least two years beyond the budget year)?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates that show how the proposed budget is linked to all the government's policy goals for a multi-year period are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, information that shows how the proposed budget is linked to some but not all of the government's policy goals for a multi-year period is presented.
- d. (0) No, information on the link between the budget and the government's stated policy goals for a multi-year period is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: no comment

Comments: Researcher: In 2015 OBS was "a" answer. As part of the materials for the draft Federal budget for 2014-2016 years was the Annex 1 on the implementation of the Budget message of the President. [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&894A73B16EAE038C43257BF6004EA517](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&894A73B16EAE038C43257BF6004EA517)) There are no any similar annexes, which present information on how the proposed budget is linked to government's policy goals for a multi-year period, in the draft Federal budget for 2017-2019. The answer is "d" now.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: In the attached file to the Question 47, on pages 110-294, there are facts and figures on financing state (governmental) programs with specific structures of those programs which are related to the governmental goals.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The logic of program budgeting of the Federal Budget intends that government's policy goals are presented in the structure of the state programs goals. It is stated in the Federal Law "On Strategic Planning" 28.06.2014 N 172-FZ, Article 3, item 31 which says that state program is a strategic planning document which contain a set of planned activities, linked by goals, implementation timelines, performers and resources of government policy instruments, providing the framework of key state functions on achieving the priorities and objectives of government policy in the sphere of social-economic development and national defence of the Russian Federation. That is why all the other instruments like priority projects, federal targeted programs, Presidential decrees on raising the salary of some specific groups of citizens are part of the state programs and their goals. As the state programs are strategic documents they have a multi-year characteristics. For example, the state program "Accessible environment for 2011-2020 years". See file: "Паспорт ГП 04 "Доступная среда" на 2011 - 2020 годы (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)", [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3D15729B2CAB7BDC4325805A005FB580](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3D15729B2CAB7BDC4325805A005FB580))

Researcher response: In light of the reviewer's comments and suggestions, and given that the information is included in the EBP package, the response has been changed from "d" to "b."

49: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).
- b. (67) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.
- c. (33) Yes, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).
- d. (0) No, nonfinancial data on inputs to be acquired are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Expenditures on government programs (GP) are about 50% of the budget. In the list of supporting documents to the EBP, one can see the "passports" to the GP. Government Programs are approved for the period 2013-2019 (there are some for 2012 and 2020). For example. Passport GP 01 "Development of Healthcare," [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB))

Comments: Researcher: Passport of the state program of the Russian Federation is the document about the state program, containing the following information: Responsible executor of the program The partners in the programme The participants of the program Sub-programs (including Federal target programs) Goal of the program Objectives of the program Target indicators and program indicators Stages and terms of project realization The budget allocation of the program The expected results of the program Passport of the state program is approved according to Annex 1 to the Order of the development, implementation and evaluation of the effectiveness of state programmes of the Russian Federation (approved by decree of the RF Government dated August 2, 2010 N 588) <http://pravo.garant.ru/document?id=98991&byPara=1> (<http://pravo.garant.ru/document?id=98991&byPara=1>) the link is provided on the portal of state programs of the Russian Federation in the section "Normative base" <http://programs.gov.ru/Portal/programs/documents> (<http://programs.gov.ru/Portal/programs/documents>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Executive's Budget Proposal consists passports of all state programs and the summary of all state programs (files posted at [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))) Budget Proposal provides information on nonfinancial indicators for all state programs. State programs identify the responsible contractor and the subcontractors of the program. As programs' participants stated all federal executive bodies (ministries, federal services, federal agencies), regulatory authorities (the Prosecutor General), the judiciary (Supreme Court, Constitutional Court, etc.). For example, as participants of the State program "Development of health" are stated 19 Federal bodies of Executive power, including the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation, Federal service of execution of punishments, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation etc. Russian legislation on state programs drawing up does not use terms "nonfinancial data on inputs" (data on nonfinancial inputs) or "nonfinancial intermediate outcomes" (nonfinancial data on results). However, some programs' goals and indicators might be considered as nonfinancial outcomes and individual performance (indicators) and some of them act as a nonfinancial data on input. For example, the passport and the summary information on the state program "Healthcare development" (Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB))) has an infant mortality indicator that could be considered as nonfinancial result (intermediate result reflects the nonfinancial indicator of the subprogram "Mother and Child Health Care" - Coverage of neonatal screening or the survival rate of children with extremely low birth body weight. The number of doctors (the number of doctors per 1,000 inhabitants) and the number of

nurses (number of nurses per 1 doctor) might be considered as nonfinancial data on input for this indicator. Such indicators as the number of doctors and paramedical staff; the number of specialists trained on the medical and pharmacological educational program in the state professional education organizations; number of students; trained in training simulation centers etc., could be also considered as nonfinancial data on input.

Researcher response: We understand it is not our task to assess the quality of the type of information that represents inputs, and we acknowledge that there are some data presenting such information in all programs. We therefore agree to upgrade the response from "d" to "a".

50: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present nonfinancial data on results (in terms of outputs or outcomes) for at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are provided for each program within all administrative units (or functions).
- b. (67) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for all administrative units (or functions) but not for all (or any) programs.
- c. (33) Yes, nonfinancial data on results are presented for some programs and/or some administrative units (or functions).
- d. (0) No, nonfinancial data on results are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Nonfinancial data on results are presented only for governmental programs (GP). In each GP are approved objective, goals, target indicators and performance targets. Expenditures on GP are about 50% of the budget. In the list of supporting documents to the draft Federal budget are presented the passports to the GP. Government Programs are approved for the period 2013-2019 (there are some for 2012 and 2020). For example: Passport GP 01 "Development of Healthcare," [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB))

Comments: Researcher: At p. 6-7 see non-financial results, i.e.: reduction of mortality from all causes up to 13 cases per 1000 population; increasing life expectancy at birth to 74 years

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Executive's Budget Proposal consists passports of all state programs and the summary of all state programs (files posted at [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7))) Budget Proposal provides information on nonfinancial indicators for all state programs. State programs identify the responsible contractor and the subcontractors of the program. As programs' participants stated all federal executive bodies (ministries, federal services, federal agencies), regulatory authorities (the Prosecutor General), the judiciary (Supreme Court, Constitutional Court, etc.). For example, as participants of the State program "Development of health" are stated 19 Federal bodies of Executive power, including the Ministry of Defense of the Russian Federation, Federal service of execution of punishments, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation etc. Russian legislation on state programs drawing up does not use terms "nonfinancial data on inputs" (data on nonfinancial inputs) or "nonfinancial intermediate outcomes" (nonfinancial data on results). However, some programs' goals and indicators might be considered as nonfinancial outcomes and individual performance (indicators) and some of them act as a nonfinancial data on input. For example, the passport and the summary information on the state program "Healthcare development" (Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB))) has an infant mortality indicator that could be considered as nonfinancial result (intermediate result reflects the nonfinancial indicator of the subprogram "Mother and Child Health Care" - Coverage of neonatal screening or the survival rate of children with extremely low birth body weight. The number of doctors (the number of doctors per 1,000 inhabitants) and the number of nurses (number of nurses per 1 doctor) might be considered as nonfinancial data on input for this indicator. Such indicators as the number of doctors and paramedical staff; the number of specialists trained on the medical and pharmacological educational program in the state professional education organizations; number of students; trained in training simulation centers etc., could be also considered as nonfinancial data on input.

Researcher response: Indeed, the question asks whether - for all programs that exist in the budget - those programs have information on output. So, even if only 50% of the budget is organized by program, all existing programs have data on output. According to the Order of the Ministry of economic development of the Russian Federation from December 26, 2012 N 817 "On approval of Methodical guidelines on development and implementation of state programs of the Russian Federation" (see <https://rg.ru/2013/02/22/ukazaniya-dok.html> (<https://rg.ru/2013/02/22/ukazaniya-dok.html>)), there should be clear measurable outcomes for each program. Response is upgraded from "c" to "a."

51: Are performance targets assigned to nonfinancial data on results in the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation?

- a. (100) Yes, performance targets are assigned to all nonfinancial data on results.
- b. (67) Yes, performance targets are assigned to most nonfinancial data on results.
- c. (33) Yes, performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results.
- d. (0) No, performance targets are not assigned to nonfinancial data on results, or the budget does not present nonfinancial data on results.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Performance targets are assigned to some nonfinancial data on results - see governmental programs (GP). In each GP are approved objective, goals, target indicators and performance targets. Expenditures on GP are about 50% of the budget. In the list of supporting documents to the draft Federal budget are presented the passports to the GP. Government Programs are approved for the period 2013-2019 (there are some for

2012 and 2020). For example: Passport GP 01 "Development of Healthcare," [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB))

Comments: Researcher: Passport GP 01 "Development of Healthcare," [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB)) Goals, p.4: - improving the efficiency of rendering specialized, including high-tech medical aid; - ensuring the health system highly qualified and motivated personnel Outputs: p.4 - mortality from all causes (per 1000 population); p.5 - life expectancy at birth (years) Performance targets: p.6: reduction of mortality from all causes up to 13 cases per 1000 population; p.7 increasing life expectancy at birth to 74 years

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The question has no link with the volume of budget expenditures allocated by the state programs. That is why the answer of an expert is not accurate. The EBP-2017 provide approved objective, goals, target indicators and performance targets in connection with expenditures on all the State programs of the Federal Budget.

Researcher response: In agreement with the reviewer, the response has been changed from "c" to "a."

52: Does the Executive's Budget Proposal or any supporting budget documentation present estimates of policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations in at least the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of some but not all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Among the supporting budget documents, see annex "List of public regulatory obligations to be performed at the expense of the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019," [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0C0E37D3D4DD7D874325805A005A1AAB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0C0E37D3D4DD7D874325805A005A1AAB)) It shows categories of recipients; and the size of payments established by the normative legal act. For example: - page 42 includes a normative commitment on the "implementation of monthly cash payments to disabled people". Information includes recipients (persons with disabilities 1, 2, 3 groups, children with disabilities) and the corresponding monthly payments in 2016-2019 in rubles. - page 81 shows "the compensation to women with children under three years, dismissed in connection with liquidation of the organization." Information includes recipients (unemployed women with children under 3 years, dismissed in connection with liquidation of the organization if they were at the time of dismissal of the leave to care for a child and not receiving unemployment benefits) and the related amount of the monthly compensation payments in 2016-2019 in rubles (50 rubles). Also, estimates are included on the number of recipients (persons), average annual payout per beneficiary (thousand rubles/year), the volume of budgetary allocations on the implementation of the normative legal act (thousand rubles) See: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0DCA091BDF02F4D04325805A005AB137](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0DCA091BDF02F4D04325805A005AB137)) For example, page 42 mentions that for the implementation of the resolution of the Government of the Russian Federation of 4 August 2006, №472 "About financing of monthly compensation payments to not employed women having children under three years, dismissed in connection with liquidation of the organization," in 2017 there are 3,796 thousand rubles, and the number of recipients – 6,223 persons. In addition: information is presented until 2020 on approved state programs aimed at supporting the most vulnerable segments of the population. See: -- Passport of the state program 03 "Social support of citizens" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3F62DDF17868AD1C4325805A005F6CF6](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3F62DDF17868AD1C4325805A005F6CF6)) -- Passport of the state program 04 "Accessible environment" for 2011 - 2020 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3D15729B2CAB7BDC4325805A005FB580](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&3D15729B2CAB7BDC4325805A005FB580)) -- Passport of the state program 05 "Providing affordable and comfortable housing and utilities of citizens of the Russian Federation" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&95E80BA1DAC878EA4325805A00600059](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&95E80BA1DAC878EA4325805A00600059)) -- Passport of the state program 07 "Promotion of employment" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FD6E3410515B37704325805A00605242](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FD6E3410515B37704325805A00605242)) These programs are part of the supporting documentation to the EBP, the expenditures for their implementation are presented in the annexes to the draft law on the Federal budget, the explanations given in the Explanatory Note to the bill. Link to the Explanatory Note: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&17854ABF92DF36F64325805A005E375F)) For example: -- p.131 table 4.2.4 Federal Spending in 2016-2019 to implement of the state program "Social support of citizens" -- p.149 table 4.2.7 Federal Spending in 2016-2019 to implement the state program "Assistance of employment of the population."

Comments: Researcher: In the EBP 2017-2019 there is no idea of "impoverished populations" at all. Social assistance enshrined in the laws of the Russian Federation, is by belonging to a certain category of the population, and not according to the principle needs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

53: Does the executive release to the public its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal (that is, a document setting deadlines for submissions from other government entities, such as line ministries or subnational government, to the Ministry of Finance or whatever central government agency is in charge of coordinating the budget's formulation)?

- a. (100) Yes, a detailed timetable is released to the public.
- b. (67) Yes, a timetable is released, but some details are excluded.
- c. (33) Yes, a timetable is released, but it lacks important details.
- d. (0) No, a timetable is not issued to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Schedule of preparation and consideration, in 2016, of the draft federal laws, documents and materials developed during the preparation of the draft federal budget and draft budgets of state extrabudgetary funds of the Russian Federation in 2017, and plans for BY 2018 and 2019 (the order of the first Deputy Chairman of the Government of the Russian Federation I. I. Shuvalov, dated 26 Feb 2016 N ISH-P13-1044).

<http://irkobl.ru/sites/economy/targeted/federal/%D0%93%D1%80...>

(<http://irkobl.ru/sites/economy/targeted/federal/%D0%93%D1%80%D0%B0%D1%84%D0%B8%D0%BA%20%D0%BF%D0%BE%D0%B4%D0%B3%D0%...>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

54: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget projections are based? (The core information must include a discussion of the economic outlook with estimates of nominal GDP level, inflation rate, real GDP growth, and interest rates.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the macroeconomic forecast.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to the macroeconomic forecast is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The PBS - MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) Pp.22-23, including the following parameters of the medium-term forecast of socio-economic development of Russia Table 2.3.1. The main parameters of the medium-term forecast of socio-economic development of Russia

Comments: Researcher: This document, however, was published too late with respect to the time frame requested by the OBS methodology (at least a month prior to the tabling of the EBP), therefore it is considered as not publicly available. Hence, all the questions related to this document will receive a "d" response.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: The PBS - MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) Pp.22-23, including the following parameters of the medium-term forecast of socio-economic development of Russia Table 2.3.1. The main parameters of the medium-term forecast of socio-economic development of Russia This document was published too late, but the Pre-Budget Statement present some information on the macroeconomic forecast, so the answer should be C.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October to 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council 6 October for the purpose of conducting an open round on this document on 20 October 2016. Links:

<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...

(http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget and Taxes Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490) (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-

2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 October). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP. File "The project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019" link: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...> (<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) Pp.25-26, including the main parameters of the medium-term forecast of socio-economic development of Russia Table 1.3.1. The main parameters of the medium-term forecast of socio-economic development of Russia

IBP comment: The methodology of the Open Budget Survey is very clear, in that if a document is considered not-publicly-available (as it is the case of the Pre-Budget statement in Russia), all questions related to such document in Sections 2 and 3 receive a "d" answer. Thus, the responses to this and all the following questions on the Pre-Budget Statement, remain unchanged.

55: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of expenditure policies and priorities and an estimate of total expenditures.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government's expenditure policies and priorities.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the government's expenditure policies and priorities.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to the government's expenditure policies and priorities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: PBS - MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) Specifically, see: pp.22-23, including the following parameters of the medium-term forecast of socio-economic development of Russia pp.24-41 Section 3. THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017-2019 pp.46-49 Section 5. THE MAIN PARAMETERS OF THE BUDGET SYSTEM, 5.1. FEDERAL BUDGET; and Table 5.1.1. The main characteristics of the Federal budget in 2016-2019 Table 5.1.3. Expenditures* of the Federal budget on sections of functional classification in 2016-2019
Comments: Researcher: PBS - MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019 - was released simultaneously with the draft federal budget on 28 Nov 2016. Therefore response to this and following questions will receive a "d", as it was published too late.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: This document was published too late (EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016, not on 28 November 2016), but the Pre-Budget Statement present some information on the government's expenditure policies and priorities, so the answer should be C

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October to 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council 6 October for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Links: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...> (<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table... (http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget and Taxes Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490) (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 October). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP. File "The project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019" link: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...> (<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) Specifically, see: pp.27-53 Section 2. THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017-2019 pp.57-63 Section 4. THE MAIN PARAMETERS OF THE BUDGET SYSTEM, 4.1. FEDERAL BUDGET; and Table 4.1.1. The main characteristics of the Federal budget in 2016-2019 Table 4.1.3. Expenditures* of the Federal budget on sections of functional classification in 2016-2019

56: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present information on the government's revenue policies and priorities that will guide the development of detailed estimates for the upcoming budget? (The core information must include a discussion of revenue policies and priorities and an estimate of total revenues.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the government's revenue policies and priorities.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the government's revenue policies and priorities.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to the government's revenue policies and priorities is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) See pp 45-46, Item 3. "The main parameters of the budget system"

Comments: Researcher: PBS - MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019 - was released simultaneously with the draft federal budget on 28 Nov 2016. Answer "d" applies.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October o 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council 6 october for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Links:

<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...

(http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget an Taxes

Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490) (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 october). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP.

File "The project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019" link: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) Specifically, see: pp.27-53 Section 2. THE GOALS AND OBJECTIVES OF THE BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017-2019 pp.57-63 Section 4. THE MAIN PARAMETERS OF THE BUDGET SYSTEM, 4.1. FEDERAL BUDGET; and Table 4.1.1.

The main characteristics of the Federal budget in 2016-2019 Table 4.1.2. Revenues of the Federal budget in 2017-2019

57: Does Pre-Budget Statement present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) See pp 49-51, The sources of financing the deficit; Table 5.1.4. Sources of funding the Federal budget deficit in 2016-2019; Table 5.1.5. Sovereign funds and public debt in the 2017-2019

Comments: Researcher: PBS - MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019 - was released simultaneously with the draft federal budget on 28 Nov 2016. Answer "d" applies.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: At least the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year is presented in the MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) See Page 58.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October o 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council 6 october for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Links:

<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...>

(<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...

(http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget an Taxes

Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490) (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490). Taking into account the above-

mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 October). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP. File "The project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019" link: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...> (<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) See pp.54-56 Section 3. STRATEGY FOR FINANCING THE BUDGET DEFICIT and pp 61-63 The sources of financing the deficit; Table 4.1.4. Sources of funding the Federal budget deficit in 2016-2019; Table 4.1.5. Sovereign funds and public debt in the 2017-2019

58: Does the Pre-Budget Statement present estimates of total expenditures for a multi-year period (at least two-years beyond the budget year)?

- a. (100) Yes, multi-year expenditure estimates are presented.
- b. (0) No, multi-year expenditure estimates are not presented.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82)) See pp. 48-49 Table 5.1.3. Federal budget expenditures on sections of functional classification in 2016-2019
Comments: Researcher: PBS - MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019 - was released simultaneously with the draft federal budget on 28 Nov 2016. Answer "d" applies.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: See Page 56 of the MAIN DIRECTIONS OF BUDGET POLICY FOR 2017 AND THE PLANNING PERIOD OF 2018 AND 2019, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&54958FA236486A614325805A00639A82))

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: In connection with legal postponement of the budget process in the Russian Federation in 2016 (Federal Law of 02.06.2016 №158-FZ "On The Suspension of Certain Provisions of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation and Amendments to certain legislative acts of the Russian Federation, item 2, article 185 of the Draft Federal Budget has been delayed from 1st October to 1st November, that delay the time of preparation and publication of Pre-Budget Statement (Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019). Given the legislative basis of this postponement the project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 has been published previously by Budget and Financial Market Committee on the web-site of the Federation Council 6 October for the purpose of conducting an open round table on this document on 20 October 2016. Links: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...> (<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table... (http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/round_table...) This document was published simultaneously on the web-site of Budget and Taxes Committee of the State Duma. However the link to download the document from the site of State Duma is currently not working (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490 (http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/Novosti_Komiteta/item/8490)). Taking into account the above-mentioned, on our opinion, this fact might be considered as a reason of delay (8 days) of publication of the Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019 prior to the tabling of the EBP (28 October). But the answer of the expert is not accurate, the document was published before tabling of the EBP. File "The project of Main Directions of Budget Policy for 2017-2019" link: <http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmA...> (<http://www.council.gov.ru/media/files/bMJxsnBCWlrASjcUgjkHmAbXcXFF9VxC.pdf>) See pp. 59-61 Table 4.1.3. Federal budget expenditures on sections of functional classification in 2016-2019

59: Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: EB 2017, Federal law from 19.12.2016 No. 415-FZ "On Federal budget for 2017-2019", available at: Official Internet portal of legal information (presented here page by page, but also in PDF format) <http://publication.pravo.gov.ru/Document/View/00012016122100...> (<http://publication.pravo.gov.ru/Document/View/0001201612210008?index=24&rangeSize=1>) or the official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&it's (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&it's) page_id=2104&popup=Y#ixzz4Y572thy1 by administrative - Annex 9 (for 2017) pp. 245-1084, Annex 12 (2018-2019) page 1085-2056 in these applications the costs for each Agency are represented on the functional structure - sections and subsections, and each direction also is detailed to the target articles by type of expenditure (economic classification) functional and economic classification for 2017 -

Annex 15 (page 2057-2611) and to 2018-2019 Appendix 17 (2612-3258) While in these applications the expenditure on the functional structure – in sections (column P3) and subsections (column ПП) have been itemized to the target article (column ЛСР) by type of expenditure (column BP) (economic classification) functional and economic classification for 2017 – Annex 19 (pp. 3259-3685) 2018-2019 Annex 21 (pp. 3685-4208) Thus, in these applications, the expenditure target expenditure (column CSR) is presented with detail by type of expenditure (column BP) (economic classification), as well as detailed functional structure - sections (column P3) and subsections (column ПП)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

60: Does the Enacted Budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present expenditure estimates by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: EB 2017, Federal law from 19.12.2016 No. 415-FZ "On Federal budget for 2017-2019", available at: Official Internet portal of legal information (presented here page by page, but also in PDF format) <http://publication.pravo.gov.ru/Document/View/0001201612210008?index=24&rangeSize=1> or the official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&it's (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&it's) http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&it's page_id=2104&popup=Y#ixzz4Y572thy1 Understanding expenditure estimates presented by program as meaning of any level of detail below an administrative unit, broken down into smaller, more detailed units in the case of the federal budget – this is the Annex 6 on administrative structure (this is very detailed annex). Annex 9 page 245-1084 expenditures for each Agency represented on the functional structure – sections and subsections, and each direction also detailed to the target articles by type of expenditure (economic classification) Annex 15 (p. 2057-2611) spending on the functional structure – in sections (column P3) and subsections (column ПП) have been drilled to the target article (column ЛСР) by type of expenditure (column BP) (economic classification) Annex 19 (pp. 3259-3685) costs target expenditure (column ЛСР) is presented with detail by type of expenditure (column BP) (economic classification)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

61: Does the Enacted Budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents revenue estimates by category.
- b. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present revenue estimates by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: Federal law from 19.12.2016 No. 415-FZ "On Federal budget for 2017-2019" http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&page_id=... (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&page_id=2104&popup=Y#ixzz4Y572thy1) p. 1 Article 1 The main characteristics of Federal budget for 2017 To approve the main characteristics of Federal budget for 2017, based on the projected gross domestic product in the amount of 86 806,0 billion rubles and the inflation rate not exceeding 4,0 per cent (December 2017 to December 2016): 1) the projected total Federal revenues in the amount of 13 487 556 771,6 thousand rubles

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

62: Does the Enacted Budget present individual sources of revenue?

- a. (100) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
- b. (67) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- c. (33) Yes, the Enacted Budget presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.

- d. (0) No, the Enacted Budget does not present individual sources of revenue.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

63: Does the Enacted Budget present three estimates related to government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing required during the budget year; the total debt outstanding at the end of the budget year; and interest payments on the debt for the budget year?

- a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Federal law from 19.12.2016 No. 415-FZ "On Federal budget for 2017-2019" http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&page_id=... (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116918&area_id=4&page_id=2104&popup=Y#ixzz4Y572thy1) p.1 Article 1. The main characteristics of Federal budget for 2017 4) the upper limit of the state internal debt of the Russian Federation on January 1, 2017 in the amount of 10 351 623 798,0 thousand rubles; 5) the upper limit of the state external debt of the Russian Federation on January 1, 2018 in the amount of 53.6 billion, or 48.7 billion euros; p.44 Article 13. State internal borrowings of the Russian Federation, the state internal debt of the Russian Federation and granting of the state guarantees of the Russian Federation in the currency of the Russian Federation 1. To approve the Program of state internal borrowings of the Russian Federation for 2017-2019 according to the Appendix 44 to the present Federal law. p.47 Article 14. The state external borrowings of the Russian Federation, the state external debt of the Russian Federation and granting of the state guarantees of the Russian Federation in foreign currency 1. To approve the Program of state foreign borrowings of the Russian Federation for 2017-2019 according to the Appendix 46 to the present Federal law. The debt service costs are presented: interest payments on the debt for the budget year - for 2017 - Annex 15 (page 2603-2604) and 2018-2019 Appendix 17 (p. 3251-3252)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

64: What information is provided in the Citizens Budget? (The core information must include expenditure and revenue totals, the main policy initiatives in the budget, the macroeconomic forecast upon which the budget is based, and contact information for follow-up by citizens.)

- a. (100) The Citizens Budget provides information beyond the core elements.
b. (67) The Citizens Budget provides the core information.
c. (33) The Citizens Budget provides information, but it excludes some core elements.
d. (0) The Citizens Budget is not published.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: A citizens budget to the Federal law on the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019, date posted: 21.12.2016 – at the official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961&area_id=4&it's (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961&area_id=4&it's) page_id=2104&popup=Y#ixzz4Y5fzj8zP On page 83 (the last page) of the material is indicated that it is prepared by the Department of budget methodology and financial reporting in the public sector with the participation of the analytical center under the government of the Russian Federation and the company of Acronis. Feedback about the document, please send an E-mail: o0208@minfin.ru (mailto:o0208@minfin.ru)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

65: How is the Citizens Budget disseminated to the public?

- a. (100) A Citizens Budget is disseminated widely through a combination of at least three different appropriate tools and media (such as the Internet, billboards, radio programs, newspapers, etc.).
- b. (67) A Citizens Budget is published by using at least two, but less than three, means of dissemination, but no other dissemination efforts are undertaken by the executive.
- c. (33) A Citizens Budget is disseminated only by using one means of dissemination.
- d. (0) A Citizens Budget is not published.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: A citizens budget to the Federal law on the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019, date posted: 21.12.2016 – at the official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961&area_id=4&it's (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961&area_id=4&it's) page_id=2104&popup=Y#ixzz4Y5fzj8zP At the Open Budget portal - http://openbudget.gfu.ru/upload/iblock/da8/1288_BDG_2017.pdf (http://openbudget.gfu.ru/upload/iblock/da8/1288_BDG_2017.pdf) It was announced in the official Russian newspaper "Rossiyskaya Gazeta" - <https://rg.ru/2016/12/27/minfin-opublikoval-poniatnuii-versiiu-novogo-trehletnego-biudzheta.html> (<https://rg.ru/2016/12/27/minfin-opublikoval-poniatnuii-versiiu-novogo-trehletnego-biudzheta.html>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation disseminates the printed version of the Citizens Budget to the leading Russian economic universities for the use it in educational process (Moscow state University, Higher school of Economics, Plekhanov Academy, Financial University etc.). In 2016, the Ministry of Finance disseminated the Citizens Budget with the official letters. The Ministry of Finance has also developed business card with QR-code for downloading Citizens Budget 2017 (might be provided). This business card was disseminated among students of the leading economic higher educational institutions as well as among public finance experts (in working group which includes representatives of the Government Office of the Russian Federation, the Ministry of Finance, the Ministry of Education, financial bodies of subjects of the Russian Federation, Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation and expert community). Thus, taking into account the efforts of the Ministry of Finance of Russia, undertaken for the dissemination of the Citizens Budget, we might pretend to have an answer A, as there were three channels for distribution: Internet, official letters of the Ministry of Finance to the economic universities and business card with QR-code.

Researcher response: Looking at the Ministry of Finance website, in the section "Activities", subsection "Reform," "Budget reform," "Budget for citizens," it is possible to find the Citizens Budget, at: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/reforms/budget/budget_citizen... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/reforms/budget/budget_citizen/.A) search for publications with the same name on the website "E-catalogs. Search of books in Russian libraries" Электронные каталоги. Поиск книг в российских библиотеках <http://book.uraic.ru/internet/guide/books.htm> (<http://book.uraic.ru/internet/guide/books.htm>) did not lead to a positive result. We can also confirm that hard copies of "Citizens Budget" are published. But the number of printed copies is not known (we were not able to find this information). In light of these two means of dissemination, the response is changed, from "c" to "b."

66: Has the executive established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information prior to publishing the Citizens Budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, and these mechanisms are accessible and widely used by the public.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget; while these mechanisms are accessible they are not widely used by the public.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive has established mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget, but these mechanisms are not accessible.
- d. (0) No, the executive has not established any mechanisms to identify the public's requirements for budget information in the Citizen's Budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: The executive has not created any mechanisms to seek feedback from the public on the content of the Citizens Budget.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The Ministry of Finance, starting in 2013, organizes the competition of ideas on contain of the "Citizens Budget". The operator of the competition is the Financial University under the Government of the Russian Federation. Links: 2013 - http://old.minfin.ru/ru/press/press_releases/index.php?id_4=... (http://old.minfin.ru/ru/press/press_releases/index.php?id_4=20395); 2014 - http://old.minfin.ru/ru/press/speech/index.php?id_4=23176 (http://old.minfin.ru/ru/press/speech/index.php?id_4=23176); 2015 - <http://www.fa.ru/faculty/finec/Pages/conkurs.aspx> (<http://www.fa.ru/faculty/finec/Pages/conkurs.aspx>); 2016 - <http://www.fa.ru/faculty/finec/Pages/conkurs.aspx> (<http://www.fa.ru/faculty/finec/Pages/conkurs.aspx>); 2017 - <http://minfin.ru/ru/press-center/?>

id_4=34687&area_id=4&page_... (http://minfin.ru/ru/press-center/?id_4=34687&area_id=4&page_id=2119&popup=Y);
<http://www.fa.ru/faculty/finec/news/Pages/2017-03-14-konkurs...> (<http://www.fa.ru/faculty/finec/news/Pages/2017-03-14-konkurs-proektov-po-predstavleniyu-byudzhetu-dlya-grazhdan-2017-goda.aspx>) Representatives of the Ministry of Finance are included in the Tender Committee and annually analyze all submitted works. Each year the leaders of the Ministry award winners, who offered the most interesting ideas. Ministry of Finance uses citizens' ideas in the process of developing Citizens Budget for the next year. For example, see CB-2017-2019 p. 8-9:
http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG... (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG_2017.pdf). This was one of the winners of the competition ideas on which information can be presented in CB.

Researcher response: We agree with the Government Reviewer, that this consultation mechanism exists. But we can not confirm the extent to which it is known or used by citizens. These mechanisms are accessible, but it is unclear to us whether the citizens know about them at all, and to what extent they are used. For example, this is the reference to announcement of the 2017 Contest of projects on presentation of budget for citizens at the official web site of the Ministry of Finance: http://minfin.ru/ru/press-center/?id_4=34687&area_id=4&page_... (http://minfin.ru/ru/press-center/?id_4=34687&area_id=4&page_id=2119&popup=Y;%20http://www.fa.ru/faculty/finec/news/Pages/2017-03-14-konkurs-proektov-po-predstavleniyu-byudzhetu-dlya-grazhdan-2017-goda.aspx#ixzz4i0LM7bkc). But we did not manage to find out that resulted of it.

IBP comment: In light of the government reviewer's input and the researcher's response, for consistency of answers across countries, the response has been changed from "d" to "b."

67: Are "citizens" versions of budget documents published throughout the budget process?

- a. (100) A citizens version of budget documents is published for each of the four stages of the budget process (budget formulation, enactment, execution, and audit).
- b. (67) A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least two of the four stages of the budget process.
- c. (33) A citizens version of budget documents is published for at least one stage of the budget process.
- d. (0) No citizens version of budget documents is published.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: A citizens budget is published for the enacted budget A citizens budget to the Federal law on the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019, date posted: 21.12.2016 – at the official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961&area_id=4&it's (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961&area_id=4&it's)
http://openbudget.gfu.ru/upload/iblock/da8/1288_BDG_2017.pdf At the Open Budget portal - http://openbudget.gfu.ru/upload/iblock/da8/1288_BDG_2017.pdf (http://openbudget.gfu.ru/upload/iblock/da8/1288_BDG_2017.pdf)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: A Citizens Budget is published for the Enacted Budget A Citizens Budget to the Federal law on the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019, date posted: 21.12.2016 – at the official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961&area_id=4&it's (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116961&area_id=4&it's)
http://openbudget.gfu.ru/upload/iblock/da8/1288_BDG_2017.pdf At the Open Budget portal - http://openbudget.gfu.ru/upload/iblock/da8/1288_BDG_2017.pdf (http://openbudget.gfu.ru/upload/iblock/da8/1288_BDG_2017.pdf) There is a document from 29.09.2016, an illustrated information brochure "Execution of the Federal budget and budgets of budgetary system of the Russian Federation in 2015"

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The CB in 2016 was published for two stages of the budget process: to the Enacted Budget and the Year-End Report. See links: http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG... (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/12/main/1288_BDG_2017.pdf)
http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/05/main/Kniga_It...
(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/05/main/Kniga_Itogi_ispolneniya_2015_goda.pdf) - Illustrated information brochure "Execution of the Federal budget and budgets of budgetary system of the Russian Federation for 2015 (preliminary results)". Date of publication 27 May 2016

Researcher response: In agreement with the Government Reviewer, the response has been changed from "c" to "b."

68: Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: General page of IYRs: <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetov/federalnyj-byud...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetov/federalnyj-byudzhet/188/>) Report as of 1 October 2016 <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzhetu-za-9-mesyatsev.zip>) The report includes the following tabs:

1. Federal budget revenues 1.1 Revenues to the Federal budget 1.2 Revenues to the Federal budget by the chief administrators 2. Federal budget expenditures 2.1 Departmental structure of Federal budget expenditures 2.2 Distribution of budget allocations by sections, subsections, target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation and non-program activities), groups of types of expenditure of the classification of budget expenditures 2.3 Budget allocations for target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation and non-program activities), groups, types of expenditures, sections and subsections of classification of expenditures of budgets 2.4 Budget allocations for the sections and subsections of classification of expenditures of budgets 3. Sources of financing Federal budget deficit 3.1 Sources of funding the Federal budget deficit 3.2 Sources of financing of deficit of the Federal budget for main administrators

Comments: Researcher: The second reference is to the zipped file "Quarterly report for 2016 01.10.2016" «Квартальный отчет за 2016 года на 01.10.2016» (archived files on the Federal budget execution for the 9 months January-September), including file «0507011 на 01.10.2016.xlsx» where all pages have numbers. On each page-table number there is a necessary information, including expenditure Administrative classification is presented in tab 2.1 Departmental structure of Federal budget expenditures Economic classification is presented in a mix of programs and administrative descriptions, in tabs -- 2.2 Distribution of budget allocations by sections, subsections, target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation and non-program activities), groups of types of expenditure of the classification of budget expenditures -- 2.3 Budget allocations for target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation and non-program activities), groups, types of expenditures, sections and subsections of classification of expenditures of budgets Functional classification is presented in tab 2.4 Budget allocations for the sections and subsections of classification of expenditures of budgets

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

69: Do the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for individual programs?

- a. (100) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, the In-Year Reports present actual expenditures for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. (0) No, the In-Year Reports do not present actual expenditures by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: See <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-za-9-mesyatsev.zip> This is the link to the Federal Treasury's "Quarterly report for 2016 01.10.2016" (archived files on the Federal budget execution for the 9 months January-September). It includes file "0507011 на 01.10.2016.xlsx" («0507011 на 01.10.2016.xlsx») - Report on execution of the federal budget on 1 October 2016 - the file in which the tabs are numbered. For each tab, information is presented for at least two-thirds of expenditures, with a high degree of detail. See tabs: 2.1 The departmental structure of Federal budget expenditure – by department, section, subsection, target article, by type of expenditure. 2.3 Budget allocations for target articles (state programs of the Russian Federation and non-program activities), groups, types of expenditures, sections and subsections of classification of expenditures of budgets We see that not all programs are covered. For example: file «0507011 на 01.10.2016.xlsx», tab 2.4, expenditure execution by function is 10,804,897,809,743.03 file «0507011 на 01.10.2016.xlsx» tab 2.1, expenditure execution by departments is 9,073,391,265,756.52 file «0507011 на 01.10.2016.xlsx» tab 2.4, expenditure execution by function, section 0100 "General government expenditure" is 745,440,029,588.43 file «0507011 на 01.10.2016.xlsx» tab 2.1, expenditure execution by department [section 0100 by departments] is 653,297,389,993.53.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

70: Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date expenditures with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. (100) Yes, comparisons are made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.
- b. (0) No, comparisons are not made for expenditures presented in the In-Year Reports.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета за 9 месяцев (2016) Quarterly report on execution of the federal budget for 9 months (January-September 2016), dated 01.10.2016 <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-za-9-mesyatsev.zip> This zipped file includes file «0507011 на 01.10.2016.xlsx», where all tabs are numbered. The tab consists of: Budget allocations approved by the Federal law on the Federal budget for 2016; Budget appropriations approved the consolidated budgetary list with the changes; Performed/Actual.

Comments: Researcher: As noted in the guidelines for this question: "The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date expenditures in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast expenditures (based on enacted levels) for the same period." Article 228 of the Budget Code of the Russian Federation confirms that "Approved indices of the summary budget inventory shall conform to the budget law" - <http://budcodex.ru/discussion#clauses/228/4/comments> (http://budcodex.ru/discussion#clauses/228/4/comments) Endorsed indices of the

summary budget list of the Federal budget, regional budget, local budget must conform to departmental structure of expenses of the approved budget (the budget law).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

71: Do In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- a. (100) Yes, In-Year Reports present actual revenue by category.
- b. (0) No, In-Year Reports do not present actual revenue by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: See file "Federal budget execution for 01 Oct.2016 (quarterly reports), at <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-za-9-mesyatsev.zip>) Annex 1. "Federal budget revenues," specifically tab 1.1 Revenues to the Federal budget (there are over 1000 rows with actual revenue by category (as well as individual items))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

72: Do In-Year Reports present the individual sources of revenue for actual revenues collected?

- a. (100) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for all revenue.
- b. (67) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- c. (33) Yes, In-Year Reports present individual sources of actual revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenue.
- d. (0) No, In-Year Reports do not present individual sources of actual revenue.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: See file "Federal budget execution for 01 Oct.2016 (quarterly reports), at <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-za-9-mesyatsev.zip>) Annex 1. "Federal budget revenues," specifically tab 1.1 Revenues to the Federal budget (there are over 1000 rows with actual revenue by category (as well as individual items))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

73: Do the In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with either the original estimate for that period (based on the enacted budget) or the same period in the previous year?

- a. (100) Yes, comparisons are made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.
- b. (0) No, comparisons are not made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: See file "Federal budget execution for 01 Oct.2016 (quarterly reports), at <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-za-9-mesyatsev.zip>) Annex 1. "Federal budget revenues," specifically tab 1.1 Revenues to the Federal budget (there are over 1000 rows with actual revenue by category (as well as individual items)). Unfortunately, there are two columns, one showing the revenue classification code, and a second one showing the executed amounts, but no comparison with the budgeted amounts.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: We can hardly agree with the expert's answer. In our opinion, the option "a" should be chosen. The In-Year Reports compare actual year-to-date revenues with the original estimate for that period. The aggregated data exists in the monthly report on the budget execution (form N 0503117), which was not named by the expert. There is a web-link to this report in the Part 1 "The Public Availability of Key Budget Documents" of the Open Budget Questionnaire. Web-link: <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/2bb/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/2bb/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-na-01.10.2016-_ezhemesyachnyy_.zip) File name <Отчет об исполнении федерального бюджета на 01.10.2016 (ежемесячный).xlsx> Table <Доходы>

Researcher response: The report, mentioned in the Government Reviewer's comment was considered. The Report, however, does not contain data on approved (budgeted) revenues, there are only data on actual execution. The OECD recommends that the reports contain the total year-to-date revenues in a format that allows for a comparison with the budget's forecast revenues (based on enacted levels) for the same period. To answer "a," comparisons must be made for revenues presented in the In-Year Reports. The response remains unchanged.

74: Do In-Year Reports present three estimates related to actual government borrowing and debt: the amount of net new borrowing; the total debt outstanding; and interest payments?

- a. (100) Yes, all three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- b. (67) Yes, two of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- c. (33) Yes, one of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are presented.
- d. (0) No, none of the three estimates related to government borrowing and debt are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Information on the government debt is presented on the web-site of the Ministry of Finance http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/ (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/) including on internal debt http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/ (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/) in the Table "State internal debt of the Russian Federation, expressed in government securities (million rubles) on the 1st day of the month." Dates of publication/updating information in the section up to the 5th day of the month following the reporting and a Table of "Planned auctions for a month." Dates of publication/updating information in the section, two business days before the reporting month on external debt http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/ (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/) including data on the monthly volume of state external debt in million U.S. dollars http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structur... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structure/#) for example, on 2016-08-01 - 50 871.5 million, on 2016-09-01 - 50 864,6 million on 2016-10-01 - 51 475,7 million and monthly external debt structure, for example, on 2016-10-01 http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structur...

(http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structure/#) Payments to service internal and external debt are reflected in the functional classification under section 1300 "Debt service expenditures" link on expenditure by function is provided in the section "debt service expenditures (interest payments) including internal debt (section 13 subsection 1301 and external debt (section 13 subsection 1302) in the current reporting on execution of the Federal budget For example, "Federal budget execution for 01 Oct.2016" (quarterly report), at <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-za-9-mesyatsev.zip>). See tab 2.4 "Allocation of budget appropriations by functional and sub-functional classification of expenditures"

Comments: Researcher: <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-za-9-mesyatsev.zip>) - in an archived form presented two files, including the file "0507011 on 01.10.2016.xlsx" at page "3.1"; in the annex "Sources of funding of the Federal budget deficit" provided information on sources of internal and external financing in the context of indicators; are shown the volume of borrowing and repayment. For example. Placement of state (municipal) securities with the nominal value stated in the currency of the Russian Federation (row 10) Repayment of the state (municipal) securities with the nominal value stated in the currency of the Russian Federation (line 11) at page "2.2" in the line 8640 given the expenditure of servicing of state and municipal debt, including interest payments on domestic debt (line 8641) and interest payments on external debt (line 8647) on the website of the Ministry of Finance in the section "PUBLIC DEBT" is shown the following information The monthly change of public debt (consolidated information since 01.01.2011) http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structur... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structure/?id_38=69444&page_id=241&popup=Y&area_id=38) The volume of repayment of government securities http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/structur... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/structure/release/#) about the placement and results of placement of bonds of Federal loans http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/informat... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/information/#) For example Schedule of auctions on placing of bonds of Federal loans for the first quarter of 2017, including amounts and timing http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/informat... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/information/#) On the results of placement of OFZ-PK of No. 29012RMFS at auction December 28, 2016 The official web site of the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/informat... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/information/#ixzz4Z3u8sNRF)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: In Table 3.1 (see attached file), in line 10, we can find new net borrowings in Rubles made by bond issues.

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

75: Do In-Year Reports present information related to the composition of the total actual debt outstanding? (The core information must include interest rates on the debt instruments; maturity profile of the debt; and whether it is domestic

or external debt.)

- a. (100) Yes, information beyond the core elements is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.
- b. (67) Yes, the core information is presented for the composition of the total actual debt outstanding.
- c. (33) Yes, information is presented, but it excludes some core elements.
- d. (0) No, information related to composition of total actual debt outstanding is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: "Federal budget execution for 01 Oct.2016" (quarterly report), at <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/eb2/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzheta-za-9-mesyatsev.zip>). See tab 2.4 "Allocation of budget appropriations by functional and sub-functional classification of expenditures" The volume of the state internal debt of the Russian Federation (2016), see: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/structur... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/structure/total/) - Table of monthly values of the volume of the state internal debt of the Russian Federation The volume of state external debt of the Russian Federation, see: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structur... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structure/)

Comments: Researcher: Information on the current state of public debt is presented in the Ministry of Finance's website. http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/ (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/), and it includes the following topics: issuing of securities, main directions of the state debt policy, internal and external debt of the Russian Federation. Information on disclosure on domestic debt order, http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/reveal/ (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/internal/reveal/). For example, table on "Internal debt of the Russian Federation, expressed in government securities (million rubles) on 1st day of month" is released before the 5th day of the month following the reporting month. "News" section, http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/news/# (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/news/#). It shows information for BY 2016 on the completion of placing of newly released Eurobonds, and the issue of bonds for external loans. For example: - Eurobonds of the Russian Federation - information posted on 27.05.2016 http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/news/?id... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/news/?id_39=114169&page_id=245&popup=Y&area_id=39) - Ministry of Finance's order № 179, dated 24.05.2016, "On the issue of bonds of external bonded loans of the Russian Federation." Information posted on 24.05.2016 - Page 2 shows the parameters for issuing the bonds, including bond amount, rate of coupon income payment date of the coupon income on bonds Structure of external debt, http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structur... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structure/) Examples: - structure of the State's external debt as of 1 December 2016 was presented on the website on 20.12.2016 http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structur... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structure/?id_39=116898&page_id=241&popup=Y&area_id=39) - structure of the State's external debt as of November 1, 2016 was presented on the website 25.11.2016 http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structur... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/public_debt/external/structure/?id_39=116645&page_id=241&popup=Y&area_id=39)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

76: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include an updated macroeconomic forecast for the budget year underway?

- a. (100) Yes, the estimates for the macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.
- b. (67) Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated forecasts is presented.
- c. (33) Yes, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated forecast is not presented.
- d. (0) No, the estimates for macroeconomic forecast have not been updated.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: The mid-year review includes updated macroeconomic forecasts, but does not provide an explanation of changes. Explanatory note to the report on the Federal budget in the first half of 2016 http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) or direct to file <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...> (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1_polug2016.zip) Information is given in the archived file, where we find file named: «1-3.2. (МЭУ, Осн. Параметры, Доходы) 1 полуr.doc». (Main parameters, Revenues) pages 1-11 The main macroeconomic indicators. At page 11 are shown main macroeconomic indicators, including GDP, CPI, export and import of goods, as for I and II quarter of 2016, for the first half of the year - Annexes to the Explanatory note can be viewed and downloaded here: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57)

Comments: Researcher: The narrative includes: For example, on GDP: At page 6 (See file: 1-3.2 (МЭУ, Осн. параметры, Доходы) I полуr.doc) is indicated that the pace of decline in GDP in the first half of 2016 amounted to (-) 0.9 percent. The main impact of the slowdown of economic recession in the second quarter had industrial production, transport, agriculture. In the 1st half-year industrial production showed an increase of ((+) 0.4% y/y) due to the positive dynamics of the second quarter: the decline in output early in the year (down 0.6% yoy in the first quarter of 2016) was offset by the increase in production (+1% yoy in the second quarter). An example on Consumer Price Index: At page 9 of the file: "1-3.2 (МЭУ, Осн. параметры, Доходы) I полуr.doc ": The rate of consumer prices growth from the beginning of the year are steadily fading: in January-June inflation amounted to 3.3%, which is almost three times below the values of last year (8.5% in the first half of 2015) (figure 2). The restraining influence on

inflation was rendered by low consumer demand, slowing price growth in the food segment at the background of favorable situation with the harvest, and celebrating March 2016 and the strengthening of the ruble.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The expert says that the revised macroeconomic indicators forecast is given, but there is no any explanation of the deviation compared to the forecast included in the budget. This is not accurate. Pages 16-17 (link: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116060 (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116060) file «1-3.2 (МЭУ, Осн. параметры,, Доходы) I полу. .doc», pages 16-17) provide an analysis of the variance (compared with the forecast laid on the basis for the budget draft development) of the main macroeconomic indicators which influence the Federal budget parameters. In particular, the text refers to the world prices deviation of Urals oil prices by 11.9 US dollars per barrel lower than forecast for natural gas production by 4.1% and petroleum products export by 1.3%. At the same time there are refers to the appreciation of the US dollar against the ruble over the planned 7.0 rubles. In addition, there are refers to the excess the planned of oil and gas condensate production (1.7 and 6.7 percent, respectively), oil and natural gas export (by 9.8% and 5.1%, respectively).

Researcher response: We agree with the examples provided by the Government Reviewer, although we think the explanations are not sufficiently detailed. However, if for consistency of answers across countries, IBP finds it appropriate to award a higher response, we are comfortable with changing the answer from "c" to "b."

77: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated expenditure estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. (100) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.
- b. (67) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented.
- c. (33) Yes, expenditure estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is not presented.
- d. (0) No, expenditure estimates have not been updated.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: - Explanatory note to the report on the Federal budget execution in the first half of 2016 (dated Sept 21st, 2016), at <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...> (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip) See files: 4-4.1 Расходы 1 пол 2016.docx 4.2 Government programs 1-12, Word 4.2 Government programs 26-37,45, Word 4.2 Government programs 13-25, Word 4.2-4.3 Government programs 38-42, 44 + non program activities, Word 4.4 "Federal budget expenditures undertaken in the framework of federal target programs" - Annexes to the Explanatory note can be viewed and downloaded here: http://minfin.ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) See files: Annex 4 Прил 1 пол 2016 Роспись РзПР.xlsx Annex 5 Прил 1 пол 2016 Роспись ГРБС.xlsx Annex 6 Прил 1 пол 2016 Роспись ГП_ПП.xlsx

Comments: Researcher: In 2015 the response was "a", now it is "b". To answer A is necessary to explain all of the differences between the initial levels presented in the Executive's Budget Proposal (or the Enacted Budget) and the updated estimates.) Differences are given in the files, including difference of the functional structure (Annex 4 Прил 1 пол 2016 Роспись РзПР.xlsx) and departmental structure (Annex 5 Прил 1 пол 2016 Роспись ГРБС.xlsx). Detailed explanation of these differences is missing. In Explanatory note to the report of execution in section 4 (file «4 - 4.1 Расходы 9м16.docx» - from archived file is presented brief description of differences without explanation, without detailing - pages 87-88 of Explanatory note or pages 3-4 of the mentioned file)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: We can hardly agree with the expert's answer. In our opinion, the option "a" should be chosen, especially since the principles for Mid-Year Review Preparation was not changed in comparison with the previous periods. To prove the correctness of option b, the expert refers to the file "4 - 4.1 Expenses 9m16.docx". However, the details are contained in other files, where the full explanation on the issues of redistribution (change) of budgetary financing in the context of state programs and non-program activities is given: - 4.2 ГП 1-12 1 пол 2016.docx - 4.2 ГП 26-37,45 1 пол 2016.docx - 4.2 ГП 13-25 1 пол 2016.docx - 4.2-4.3 ГП 38-42, 44+непрогр 1 пол 2016.docx. Web-link: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) See files: - 4.2 ГП 1-12 1 пол 2016.docx - 4.2 ГП 26-37,45 1 пол 2016.docx - 4.2 ГП 13-25 1 пол 2016.docx - 4.2-4.3 ГП 38-42, 44+непрогр 1 пол 2016.docx.

Researcher response: Indeed, expenditure estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated expenditure estimates is presented by state programs. Given the amounts and causes of differences, for each program the following data is provided in the tables: 1) differences in the summary budget list of the Federal budget in absolute amounts; 2) the amount of the originally approved budget, updated list, execution. For example, 4.2 ГП 1-12 1 пол 2016.docx. The response has been changed, from "b" to "a."

78: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: - Explanatory note to the report on the Federal budget execution in the first half of 2016 (dated Sept 21st, 2016), at <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...>
(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip) - Annexes to the Explanatory note can be viewed and downloaded here: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...
(http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) See files: Annex 9 (excel) (by functional classification) Annex 10 (excel) (by administrative classification)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: We can hardly agree with the expert's answer. In our opinion, the option "a" should be chosen. The economic classification of expenditure estimates makes it possible to obtain the information on detailed distribution of expenditure according to their subject matter. The economic classification displays what the money is spent on. These purposes are met by the classification used in the Russian Federation. We mean the classification by the type of expenditure. Data in the context of the classification by the type of expenditure is available both in the reporting forms and in the explanatory notes (Review to the report). Web-link: [Http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...](http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...)
(http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) See file: 8 Прил 9 мес 2016 ЛБО Вр 200,400,500.xls

Researcher response: Having taken into consideration the Government Reviewer's input, and looking at Annex 8, [Http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...](http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...) (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) See file: 8 Прил 9 мес 2016 ЛБО Вр 200,400,500.xls, the response is changed from "b" to "a."

79: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present expenditure estimates by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: - Explanatory note to the report on the Federal budget execution in the first half of 2016 (dated Sept 21st, 2016), at <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...>
(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip) See files: 4.2 Government programs 1-12, Word 4.2 Government programs 26-37,45, Word 4.2 Government programs 13-25, Word 4.2-4.3 Government programs 38-42, 44 + non program activities, Word 4.4 "Federal budget expenditures undertaken in the framework of federal target programs" - Annexes to the Explanatory note can be viewed and downloaded here: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...
(http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57)

Comments: Researcher: For example, in the Annex on execution of expenditures on departmental structure file «10 Прил 1 пол 2016 Касса ГРБС.xlsx» is given the sum of executing the expenditures - 7 297 948,7 mln rubles, then are listed departments, the sum of expenditures on which is 5 998 966,8 mln rubles... That is not all expenditures are presented with detailing by departments. Also on execution expenditures on state programs (file «11 Прил 1 пол 2016 Касса ГП_ПП.xlsx») is given the sum of execution the expenditures 7 297 948,7 mln rubles. Then are listed state programs, sum on which is 5 818 926,9 mln rubles. So that is not all expenditures of budget are presented with specification on state programs

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

80: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated revenue estimates for the budget year underway?

- a. (100) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of all of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.
- b. (67) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, and an explanation of some of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is presented.
- c. (33) Yes, revenue estimates have been updated, but an explanation of the differences between the original and updated revenue estimates is not presented.
- d. (0) No, revenue estimates have not been updated.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: - Explanatory note to the report on the Federal budget execution in the first half of 2016 (dated Sept 21st, 2016), at <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...> (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip) See file 1-3.2 (МЭУ, Осн. параметры, Доходы) I полугр.doc (стр.15-66) - Annexes to the Explanatory note can be viewed and downloaded here: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) See Annex 2, excel file It's a detailed table with title: "Receipt of revenues in the Federal budget in the context of classification of revenues of budgets of the Russian Federation for the first half of 2016" and the following columns: -Forecast for the 2016 federal budget (in accordance with the Federal Law of 12.14.2015 № 359-FZ) -Forecast of the federal budget for the I half-year 2016 " - Cash execution -Deviation of the cash execution from the forecast for 1st half of 2016" % Cash performance to: -- forecast of the federal budget for 2016 -- forecast for 1st half of 2016"

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Pages 23-47 of the Explanatory Note show a deviation indicating with the factor of variances on all the revenues in the file 1-3.2. (link: http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116060 (http://minfin.ru/ru/document/?id_4=116060) file «1-3.2 (МЭУ, Осн. параметры,, Доходы) I полугр.doc», pages 23-47)

Researcher response: In light of the Government Reviewer's comment and support citation, the response has been changed, from "b" to "a."

81: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents revenue estimates by category.
- b. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present revenue estimates by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: - Explanatory note to the report on the Federal budget execution in the first half of 2016 (dated Sept 21st, 2016), at <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...> (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip) See file 1-3.2 (МЭУ, Осн. параметры, Доходы) I полугр.doc (стр.15-66), Word - Annexes to the Explanatory note can be viewed and downloaded here: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) See Annex 2, excel file (It consists of a detailed table with title "Statement of receipt of revenues in the Federal budget in the context of classification of revenues of budgets of the Russian Federation for the first half of 2016")

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

82: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget present individual sources of revenue?

- a. (100) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
- b. (67) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- c. (33) Yes, the Mid-Year Review presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
- d. (0) No, the Mid-Year Review does not present individual sources of revenue.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: - Explanatory note to the report on the Federal budget execution in the first half of 2016 (dated Sept 21st, 2016), at <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...> (http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip) See file 1-3.2 (МЭУ, Осн. параметры, Доходы) I

пояр..doc (стр.15-66), Word - Annexes to the Explanatory note can be viewed and downloaded here:
http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti... (http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57) See Annex 2, excel file (It consists of a detailed table with title "Statement of receipt of revenues in the Federal budget in the context of classification of revenues of budgets of the Russian Federation for the first half of 2016")

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

83: Does the Mid-Year Review of the budget include updated estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the budget year underway?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on all of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, and information on some of the differences between the original and updated estimates is presented.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of government borrowing and debt have been updated, but information on the differences between the original and updated estimates is not presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of government borrowing and debt have not been updated.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: - Explanatory note to the report on the Federal budget execution in the first half of 2016 (dated Sept 21st, 2016), at <http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnit...>

(http://minfin.ru/common/upload/library/2016/09/main/Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip) - Annexes to the Explanatory note can be viewed and downloaded here: http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti...

(http://minfin.ru/ru/performance/budget/federal_budget/budgeti/11-16/?id_57=116060&page_id=2170&popup=Y&area_id=57)

Comments: Researcher: In the archived file Poyasnitelnaya_zapiska_1polug2016.zip is a file "4.4 - 11 разделы ПЗ 1 пол 2016.doc" – see pages 278-378. On pages 282-301 (in the file these are pages 3-25) is presented information on debt and debt service. For example, The change in the volume of state debt of the Russian Federation for the first half of 2016 are presented in table 160 on page 285 The structure and volume of the state internal debt of the Russian Federation for the first half of 2016 is presented in table 161 on page 286 The structure and volume of the state external debt of the Russian Federation are presented in table 163 on page 289

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

84: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for expenditures?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all expenditures are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all expenditures are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for expenditures are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 4 to the Explanatory Note: classification of federal expenditures by function and sub-function,

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&2DBF4F9B6A2E293743257FFC0038CE66](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&2DBF4F9B6A2E293743257FFC0038CE66)) Annex 5: administrative classification of expenditure (translated as "main managers"),

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&6DFB5E3E7D4735BE43257FFC0038DB31](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&6DFB5E3E7D4735BE43257FFC0038DB31)) Annex 6: state programs, sub-programs and non-program areas,

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DCF9C0EF69EA73B943257FFC0038FC55](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DCF9C0EF69EA73B943257FFC0038FC55)) See also the following: Annex 8 to the Explanatory Note: functional and sub-functional classification of expenses,

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1ABB5E56A6E8252943257FFC00392B8C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1ABB5E56A6E8252943257FFC00392B8C)) Annex 9: administrative classification,

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&ED6AB90C941685E543257FFC00392D21](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&ED6AB90C941685E543257FFC00392D21)) Annex 10: government programs, sub-programs, non-program areas and activities by main managers,

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F57C93EF77C9211343257FFC0039643E](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F57C93EF77C9211343257FFC0039643E)) Annex 11: Reference by type of expenditure 200 "Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs" for targeted items and chief administrators of the federal budget,

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F57C93EF77C9211343257FFC0039643E](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F57C93EF77C9211343257FFC0039643E)) Annex 11: Reference by type of expenditure 200 "Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs" for targeted items and chief administrators of the federal budget,

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189))

Comments: Researcher: Explanatory Note to the Year-end Report [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DEF5BC0194665E343257FFC0037BB90](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DEF5BC0194665E343257FFC0037BB90)) general Year-End Report page [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F208B3728CD6BFF043257FFC003573ED](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F208B3728CD6BFF043257FFC003573ED)) Section 5.2 of the Explanatory Note ("Execution on Federal budget expenditure by government programs") shows an analysis of the changes between allocations from the Enacted Budget 2015 and budget execution for expenditure presented by program and sub-program. Section 5.3 of the Explanatory Note ("Execution of Federal budget expenditure for non-program activities" shows an analysis of the changes between budget allocations and actuals, given the implementation of non-program-related activities for BY 2015. Relevant information is also provided in the secret/undisclosed part of the Explanatory Note to the report on execution of the Federal budget for 2015. See article 216 of the Budget Code, <http://budcodex.ru/discussion#clauses/216> (<http://budcodex.ru/discussion#clauses/216>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

85: Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates by any of the three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, or functional classification)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification).
- b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by two of the three expenditure classifications.
- c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by only one of the three expenditure classifications.
- d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by any expenditure classification.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: See annexes to the Explanatory Note: Annex 8: functional and sub-functional classification of expenses, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1ABB5E56A6E8252943257FFC00392B8C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1ABB5E56A6E8252943257FFC00392B8C)) Annex 9: administrative classification, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&ED6AB90C941685E543257FFC00392D21](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&ED6AB90C941685E543257FFC00392D21)) Annex 11: Reference by type of expenditure 200 "Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs" for targeted items and chief administrators of the federal budget, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: We can hardly agree with the expert's answer. In our opinion, the option "a" should be chosen. The economic classification of expenditure estimates makes it possible to obtain the information on detailed distribution of expenditure according to their subject matter. The economic classification displays what the money is spent on. These purposes are met by the classification used in the Russian Federation. We mean the classification by the type of expenditure and the classification of public sector transactions. Data in the context of the classification by the type of expenditure is available both in the reporting forms and in the explanatory notes (Review to the report). Data in the context of the classification of public sector transactions could be found in the Cash Flow Statement (form № 0507060). Web-link: Annex 11: for example, reference by type of expenditure 200 "Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs" for targeted goods and chief administrators of the federal budget [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189)) <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/907/otchet-ob-ispolneni...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/907/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-federalnogo-byudzhet-a-2015-god.zip>), file 0507060

Researcher response: Federal expenditures are presented on economic structure by the following areas: 100 Expenditure on payments to staff in order to ensure the performance of the functions of the state (municipal) authorities, state agencies, management bodies of state extra-budgetary funds 200 Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs 300 Social security and other payments to the population 400 Capital investments in objects of state (municipal) property 500 Intergovernmental transfers 600 Subsidies to budgetary, independent establishments and other non-profit organizations 700 Service of the state (municipal) debt 800 Additional budgetary allocations Year-End Report contains Annex 11: Reference by type of expenditure 200 "Procurement of goods, works and services for state (municipal) needs" for targeted items and chief administrators of the federal budget, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189)) Thus, the Year-End Report presents expenditure estimates by all three expenditure classifications (by administrative, economic, and functional classification). The original answer "b" was given due to the fact that not all expenditures are presented by economic structure, but if it is not necessary we have to increase the score to "a" answer

IBP comment: The question does not ask about the proportion of expenditures presented by each classification. Hence, response "a" applies.

86: Does the Year-End Report present expenditure estimates for individual programs?

- a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for all expenditures.
- b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures.
- c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents estimates for programs accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures.
- d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present expenditure estimates by program.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: Year-End Report - bill № 1134020-6 - On federal budget execution for 2015 <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02> the link to the general Year-End Report page [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F208B3728CD6BFF043257FFC003573ED) the link to the Explanatory Note [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DEFF5BC0194665E343257FFC0037BB90) Explanatory Note to the Report (5.2 GP), [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&1888A1D9F11A808243257FFC003810BC) Annex 10 to the Explanatory Note, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F57C93EF77C9211343257FFC0039643E) There is no detail on the target articles, only the program-subprogram - office Annex 11 to the Explanatory Note, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&BA0DA94A6F026EBE43257FFC00395189)

Comments: Researcher: Total spending for BY 2015: 15,620.3 Costs distributed by program (BY 2015): 12,639.5 Share of expenditure by program (BY 2015): 78% Expenditures by type of expenditure 200 (BY 2015): 3,641.3 Share of expenditure in type 200 (BY 2015): 23% In the 2015 report detailing actual expenditures (only by type of expenditure 200) what is provided in Annex 11 is the amount of 3,641.3 billion or 23% of [total expenditure]. Target article – is the specification of the functional structure of expenditure By code "200" (Code of Operations of Public Service sector 200) are shown the budget expenditures for the purchase of goods, works and services for governmental (municipal) needs. The most complete list of documents on the annual report is presented on the website of the State Duma of the Russian Federation in the section "Search bills" <http://www.duma.gov.ru/systems/law/> (http://www.duma.gov.ru/systems/law/) - when we type in Search engine the title of the document – we get the draft of this document (bill). The query is a project of the Federal law "About execution of the Federal budget for 2015" <http://www.budcodex.ru/discussion#clauses/26> (http://www.budcodex.ru/discussion#clauses/26) article 26 of the Budget code – "Classification of budget expenditure" 1. Code of budget expenditures classification consists of: 1) code of the chief administrator of budget expenditures; 2) code of section, subsection, target article and type of expenditure. 11. Code of type of expenditure includes the group, subgroup and item type of expenditure. 12. Uniform groups of types of expenditure for budgets are: 100 Expenditure on payments to staff in order to ensure the performance of the functions of the government(municipal) authorities, state agencies, management bodies of state extra-budgetary funds 200 Procurement of goods, works and services for government (municipal) needs 300 Social security and other payments to the population 400 Capital investments in objects of government (municipal) property 500 Intergovernmental transfers 600 Subsidies to budgetary, independent establishments and other non-profit organizations 700 Service of the government (municipal) debt 800 Additional budgetary allocations 14. List of main managers of budget expenditure altogether, sections, subsections, target articles (state (municipal) programs and additional areas of activity), groups (groups and subgroups) of the types of expenses of the budget is approved as part of the departmental structure of budget expenditures by budget law.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

87: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted levels (including in-year changes approved by the legislature) and the actual outcome for revenues?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for all revenues are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for some but not all revenues are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted levels and the actual outcome for revenues are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Year-End Report - bill № 1134020-6 - On federal budget execution for 2015 <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02> Explanatory Note to the Report (1-4) Pp.6-104, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329) Specifically, see the following sections: 4. Revenues of the Federal budget p.30 4.1 Analysis of the execution of Federal budget revenues p.30 4.2 Factor analysis of the revenues of the Federal budget p.40 4.3 Analysis of revenue execution in the context of administrator of Federal budget revenues p.71 Explanatory Note to the Report (5.2 GP 1-5, 7-13) pp.120-310, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&045DF15087924D2D43257FFC0037E465) Annex 2 to the Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution: "Information on federal revenue [in]flow in the context of revenue classification for BY 2015", [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&22A09BF3AFAD353A43257FFC0038982A)

Comments: Researcher: Explanatory note to YER 2015 is presented in few files. File «1-4 МакроДох.doc» is on pages 5-104. In this file on pages 31-33 is presented a table 4: Main indicators of revenue of the federal budget for 2015 – [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) (http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329) For

example, on page 32, we see the amounts of revenues from tax on profit, including in accordance with the approved indicators, fact, deviation from the approved values (columns in the table). Then on page 46 is given a description of the deviation reason – three reasons – three amounts Similarly is presented information on the most important sources of revenues, which are listed in table 4.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Answer “a” should be chosen as estimates of the differences for all revenues are presented. A narrative discussion is available in the Explanatory Note to the Report on the Federal Budget Execution. For example, in the Report on the Execution of the Federal Budget (form N 0507011) information on sources of deficit financing contains the following: budgetary allocations approved by the law on the federal budget, aggregate schedule of budget with all changes, executed positions. The information on income, as the expert correctly points out, is interpreted in the explanatory note (Review to the Report). Web-links: <http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byud...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byudzhzet/>) File <0507011 > Вкладка 2.1, вкладка 3.1. <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgen...> (<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>) File <Пояснительная записка к Отчету (1-4 Макро_ОХ_Доходы) (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)> Pages 40-71, Section 4.2. “Factor analysis of the Federal Budget Revenues” Факторный анализ поступления доходов федерального бюджета.

Researcher response: The first link provided by the Government Reviewer (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byud...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/ispolnenie-byudzhetrov/federalnyj-byudzhzet/>)) cannot be accepted, as this document is not the part of the documentation on 2015 Year-End Report. Moreover, tab 2.1 in the document shows expenditures of the Federal budget according to departmental structure 3.1. Sources of funding the Federal budget deficit.(tab 1.1. presents the actual receipt of revenue, but does not present the approved level for that revenue)The second link provided by the Government Reviewer is also given in our response. [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&22A09BF3AFAD353A43257FFC0038982A](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&22A09BF3AFAD353A43257FFC0038982A)). This is reference to Annex 2 to the Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution (included in materials for the Year-End Report): "Information on federal revenue [in]flow in the context of revenue classification for BY 2015", - 18 pagesInformation is presented on sources of revenue, the revenues forecast for 2015 Federal budget (in accordance with the law), execution, differences of performance from the forecast (amount and % of execution).Not all differences are presented, for example:Appendix 2 provides details on -- differences on excise taxes on ethyl alcohol; see in Explanatory note on page 49 differences and clarification are integrated together in one line "Revenues from excise duties on ethyl alcohol from all types of raw materials and alcohol-containing products"-- differences in taxes and payments on mineral extraction; in Explanatory note on page 52 differences and clarification are integrated together in one line "Other minerals"-- differences in revenues from use of property in state ownership, in Explanatory note on page 65 differences and explanations presented only in four positions.A similar situation exists with the payments for use of natural resources. The response remains "c."

88: Does the Year-End Report present revenue estimates by category (such as tax and non-tax)?

- a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents revenue estimates by category.
- b. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present revenue estimates by category.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 2 to the Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution: "Information on federal revenue [in]flow in the context of revenue classification for BY 2015," [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&22A09BF3AFAD353A43257FFC0038982A](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&22A09BF3AFAD353A43257FFC0038982A))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

89: Does the Year-End Report present individual sources of revenue?

- a. (100) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for all revenue.
- b. (67) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, revenue.
- c. (33) Yes, the Year-End Report presents individual sources of revenue accounting for less than two-thirds of all revenues.
- d. (0) No, the Year-End Report does not present individual sources of revenue.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 2 to the Explanatory note to the report on execution "Information on federal revenue [in]flow in the context of revenue classification for BY 2015," [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&22A09BF3AFAD353A43257FFC0038982A](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&22A09BF3AFAD353A43257FFC0038982A))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

90: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt, including its composition, for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Explanatory Note to the Report (6-13 state debt method_2015) Pp.899-923, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&16396EA53437809D43257FFC0038667A](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&16396EA53437809D43257FFC0038667A)) In particular, see the following sections: 6 "Public debt of the Russian Federation," p. 899 6.1 Domestic debt, p.899 6.2 External Public debt, p.907 7 "Sources of funding for the Federal budget deficit," p.909 7.1 Sources of internal financing, p.909 7.2 Sources of external financing, p.919

Comments: Researcher: Explanatory note to the YER-2015 is in several files. File «6-13 долг.doc» is at pp.899-1033.

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&16396EA53437809D43257FFC0038667A](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&16396EA53437809D43257FFC0038667A))

It is found here estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of government borrowing and debt for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion For example at p.909 (7 "Sources of funding for the Federal budget deficit," p.909) noted that according to the Program of the state internal borrowings of the Russian Federation for 2015 the volume of funds attraction was planned is 900 769,6 mln rubl. Then the changes are explained Then in the Table 353 (p.912) are presented data on sources of internal funding of the federal budget deficit for 2015 In Annex 13 "Information sheet on execution of sources of financing of deficit of the Federal budget for 2015" «СПРАВКА об исполнении источников финансирования дефицита федерального бюджета за 2015 год» are listed sources, approved planned indicators and execution - Annex 13 to Explanatory note [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B915A63E6FD7D6D843257FFC00397476](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B915A63E6FD7D6D843257FFC00397476))

For example, Government securities with the nominal value indicated in foreign currency: the budget law (-188 262,7 mln) fact (-182 542,2 million rubles) Or Loans from foreign States, including target foreign credits (borrowings), international financial organizations and other subjects of international law and foreign legal entities in foreign currency: the budget law -51 195,8 mln) fact (-50 528,million rubles) Etc. See in particular the following sections: 6 "Public debt of the Russian Federation," p. 899 6.1 Domestic debt, p.899 6.2 External Public debt, p.907 7 "Sources of funding for the Federal budget deficit," p.909 7.1 Sources of internal financing, p.909 7.2 Sources of external financing, p.919

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

91: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original macroeconomic forecast for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Explanatory Note to the [budget execution] Report (1-4 Makro... revenues) pp. 5-13 "Section 1: Macroeconomic conditions for the execution of the Federal budget", [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329))

Comments: Researcher: Explanatory note to YER-2015 is submitted in several files. File "1-4 МакроДоx.doc" is at pages 5-104. In this file, on pages 5-13, one can find the "Macroeconomic conditions of execution of the federal budget." [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329)) On pages 12-13 (in Table 1) one can find macroeconomic indicators, influenced on execution of the budgets of the budget system of the Russian

Federation. And there is NO COMPARISON BETWEEN THE APPROVED MACROECONOMIC INDICATORS AND ACTUAL, AS WELL AS THEIR DETAILED DESCRIPTION

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: We can hardly agree with the expert's answer. In our opinion, the option "c" should be chosen. In accordance with the Guide to the Open Budget Questionnaire, a "d" response applies if estimates of the differences are not presented at all. The Annual Report Review provides a description of the macroeconomic conditions for the execution of the federal budget: - GDP - The rate of inflation - Dynamics of prices for Urals crude oil - Data on export / import of goods - EUR to USD currency chart. There is the estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year and the actual outcome for that year in the Annual Report Review. So in our opinion answer "c" should be chosen (as well as in a similar question 76). For example, data on the initial macroeconomic forecast for Urals oil prices are contained on the page 26 of the file "1-4 МакроДох.doc", and the actual outcome could be found on the page 11 and the figure 6. With respect to GDP, the absence of data on the original macroeconomic assumptions for the fiscal year could be explained by the following. Since the Federal State Statistics Service of Russia revised the original GDP indicators because of the SNA2008 implementation, it would be incorrect to cite comparative figures. In addition the Table 7 of the Explanatory Note (pages 41-42) shows some of the indicators of the socio-economic development forecast and numeric values of their deviation. Web-link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329)) File "1-4 МакроДох.doc" See footnote after figure 1, figure 6, p. 11, 26, table 7, pages 41-42.

Researcher response: In the Explanatory note to YER-2015 File "1-4 МакроДох.doc" ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329))), Section 4 "The Revenues of the Federal Budget," on page 31 or 32 (in Table 3) we can see the approved and actual values for the following indicators: GDP, billion rubles, volume of imports (at the range of goods taken into account FCS of Russia) bln \$USA, volume of exports (in the range of goods taken into account FCS of Russia) bln \$USA, combined profit organizations, billion rubles. We agree to change the answer, from "d" to "c."

92: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on inputs and the actual outcome are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 14 to the Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution. "Information on results according to the main administrative heads for BY 2015", showing the classification according to cost code and subcode and (column 2) "indicator" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0680B73BA48E2C643257FFC0039B4FA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0680B73BA48E2C643257FFC0039B4FA)) Budgeted (all) 4,299,346,996,867.7 RUB Actuals (total) 4,183,657,445,586.4 RUB (which amounts to roughly 97% of the total budgeted expenditure) Annex 15 to the Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution. "Data on results, according to sub-administration heads managing the federal budget and the budget of autonomous institutions, for the implementation of public tasks and the achievement of other goals for BY 2015" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&093D580DFFC8F1B443257FFC00399776](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&093D580DFFC8F1B443257FFC00399776)) Budgeted (total) 480,506,257,873 RUB Actuals (total) 475,241,916,830.1 RUB (which amounts to roughly 99% of the total budgeted expenditure)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Additional documents to the Year-End report contain information on nonfinancial indicators for all state programs. Russian legislation on state programs drawing up does not use terms "nonfinancial data on inputs" (data on nonfinancial inputs) or "nonfinancial intermediate outcomes" (nonfinancial data on results). However, some programs' goals and indicators might be considered as nonfinancial outcomes and individual performance (indicators) and some of them act as a nonfinancial data on input. For example, the passport and the summary information on the state program "Healthcare development" (Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB))) has an infant mortality indicator that could be considered as nonfinancial result (intermediate result reflects the nonfinancial indicator of the subprogram "Mother and Child Health Care" - Coverage of neonatal screening or the survival rate of children with extremely low birth body weight. The number of doctors (the number of doctors per 1,000 inhabitants) and the number of nurses (number of nurses per 1 doctor) might be considered as nonfinancial data on input for this indicator. Such indicators as the number of doctors and paramedical staff; the number of specialists trained on the medical and pharmacological educational program in the state professional education organizations; number of students; trained in training simulation centers etc., could be also considered as nonfinancial data on input. In this case see "Consolidated Annual Progress Report on the Implementation and Evaluation of the State Programs Effectiveness of the Russian Federation by the End of 2015 (with annexes, link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=11...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=11...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=11...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=11...)))

OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6))". It provides information on all indicators of state programs with estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates and the actual outcome, along with a narrative discussion.

Researcher response: With the understanding that the nonfinancial information cited by the Government Reviewer in Q.49 are indeed inputs, we agree to change the response from "d" to "a." References should be given to reports on budget execution on state programs that are part of the Year-End Report [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&7EBA29392706001F43257FFC0048B114](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&7EBA29392706001F43257FFC0048B114)). See the "Consolidated Year-End Report on the progress of implementation, and evaluation of the effectiveness of state programs of the Russian Federation for 2015." It shows differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome (Annexes 1-9, and Appendix 10). Specific links: Annex 1 (sub-sections 1-4): [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F76329EE504196F243257FFC00486EA1](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F76329EE504196F243257FFC00486EA1)) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FA16A6E95653416F43257FFC0048B474Annex](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FA16A6E95653416F43257FFC0048B474Annex)) 2: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&8D1BB96103DE667943257FFC0048D361](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&8D1BB96103DE667943257FFC0048D361)) Annex 3: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&381EE42914488BA443257FFC0048DCF2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&381EE42914488BA443257FFC0048DCF2)) Annex 4: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&788D2E61155908D043257FFC0048F40F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&788D2E61155908D043257FFC0048F40F)) Annex 5: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&6B5DAE660AA8762A43257FFC0048FBC3](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&6B5DAE660AA8762A43257FFC0048FBC3)) Annex 6: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&2D9EC277E91DC56743257FFC00491EF1](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&2D9EC277E91DC56743257FFC00491EF1)) Appendix 8: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FB7D04B832F057D543257FFC0049374B](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FB7D04B832F057D543257FFC0049374B)) Annex 9: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FB7D04B832F057D543257FFC0049374B](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FB7D04B832F057D543257FFC0049374B))

93: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimate of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of nonfinancial data on results and the actual outcome are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Annex 14 to the Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution. "Information on results according to the main administrative heads for BY 2015", showing the classification according to cost code and subcode and (column 2) "indicator" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0680B73BA48E2C643257FFC0039B4FA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0680B73BA48E2C643257FFC0039B4FA)) Budgeted (all) 4,299,346,996,867.7 RUB Actuals (total) 4,183,657,445,586.4 RUB (which amounts to roughly 97% of the total budgeted expenditure) Annex 15 to the Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution. "Data on results, according to sub-administration heads managing the federal budget and the budget of autonomous institutions, for the implementation of public tasks and the achievement of other goals for BY 2015" [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&093D580DFFC8F1B443257FFC00399776](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&093D580DFFC8F1B443257FFC00399776)) Budgeted (total) 480,506,257,873 RUB Actuals (total) 475,241,916,830.1 RUB (which amounts to roughly 99% of the total budgeted expenditure) The consolidated annual progress report on the implementation and evaluation of the effectiveness of state programs of the Russian Federation by the end of 2015, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F76329EE504196F243257FFC00486EA1](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F76329EE504196F243257FFC00486EA1)) Consolidated annual report on the progress of implementation and evaluating the effectiveness of state programs of the Russian Federation for 2015 (Annex 1) (number of pages – 84, for all programs), [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&7EBA29392706001F43257FFC0048B114](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&7EBA29392706001F43257FFC0048B114))

Comments: Researcher: The Explanatory Note does not include information regarding target indicators, performance of government programs and results of implementation of state programs (except for separate socially important results given in the text of this explanatory note), since in accordance with article 264.10 of the Budget Code, together with the Report on federal budget execution, the government must present a consolidated annual report on the implementation status and evaluation of effectiveness of state programs. The report, formed in accordance with the governmental decree n.588 of August 2, 2010 ("On approval of the Procedure for the development, implementation and evaluation of the effectiveness of state programs of the Russian Federation") contains information about the matching set and achieved the target indicators of public programs.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Additional documents to the Year-End report contain information on nonfinancial indicators for all state programs. Russian legislation on state programs drawing up does not use terms "nonfinancial data on inputs" (data on nonfinancial inputs) or "nonfinancial intermediate outcomes"

(nonfinancial data on results). However, some programs' goals and indicators might be considered as nonfinancial outcomes and individual performance (indicators) and some of them act as a nonfinancial data on input. For example, the passport and the summary information on the state program "Healthcare development" (Link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&E5AF0D1456706ED54325805A005DFDCB))) has an infant mortality indicator that could be considered as nonfinancial result (intermediate result reflects the nonfinancial indicator of the subprogram "Mother and Child Health Care" - Coverage of neonatal screening or the survival rate of children with extremely low birth body weight. The number of doctors (the number of doctors per 1,000 inhabitants) and the number of nurses (number of nurses per 1 doctor) might be considered as nonfinancial data on input for this indicator. Such indicators as the number of doctors and paramedical staff; the number of specialists trained on the medical and pharmacological educational program in the state professional education organizations; number of students; trained in training simulation centers etc., could be also considered as nonfinancial data on input. In this case see "Consolidated Annual Progress Report on the Implementation and Evaluation of the State Programs Effectiveness of the Russian Federation by the End of 2015 (with annexes, link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=11...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=11...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6))). It provides information on all indicators of state programs with estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates and the actual outcome, along with a narrative discussion.

Researcher response: Indeed, part of the Year-End Report package includes reports on execution of state programs, including performance on non-financial indicators – "target indicators" - the achievement in 2015 of the values of the indicators (indicators) of level of state programs of the Russian Federation See: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&7EBA29392706001F43257FFC0048B114](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&7EBA29392706001F43257FFC0048B114).Response) changed from "c" to "a."However, we would like to note that, in our assessment, the explanations included in the document are not very good (See Annex 1, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F76329EE504196F243257FFC00486EA11](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F76329EE504196F243257FFC00486EA11))).

94: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the enacted level of funds for policies (both new proposals and existing policies) that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for all policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for some but not all of the policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the enacted level for policies that are intended to benefit directly the country's most impoverished populations and the actual outcome are not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution (1-4.. Macro.. Revenues), "The results of the implementation of the main directions of the budget policy", pp.14-26, [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D252D7B9722BE06A43257FFC0037C329))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: Annex to the Explanatory Note to the Year-End Report (Приложение к пояснительной записке к Отчету (14 3 Приложение Результаты ГРБС 3, link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0680B73BA48E2C643257FFC0039B4FA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0680B73BA48E2C643257FFC0039B4FA))) provides some indicators on the support of the most vulnerable categories of the citizens. For example, subsidies for the purchase of housing to internally displaced persons, subsidies for the provision of housing to participants of liquidation of consequences of radiation accidents, social care of orphans and children without parental care. In addition, the Explanatory Note to the Year-End Report (Пояснительная записка к Отчету (5.2 ГП 1-5, 7-13) link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&045DF15087924D2D43257FFC0037E465](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&045DF15087924D2D43257FFC0037E465)), on pages 169-197, specifies the budget allocations to support some of the most vulnerable categories of the citizens. Section 5.7 of the Explanatory Note contains information in the context of the benefits to various categories of citizens, pages 877-880.

Researcher response: The first link provided by the Government Reviewer, indeed shows an annex to the Explanatory Note to the Year-End Report (Приложение к пояснительной записке к Отчету (14 3 Приложение Результаты ГРБС 3, link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0680B73BA48E2C643257FFC0039B4FA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&A0680B73BA48E2C643257FFC0039B4FA))), which provides some indicators on the support of the most vulnerable categories of the citizens. Information is presented for departments, items of expenditure and amounts of expenditures ac (both approved and actual), including on non-financial metrics. In our opinion, it does not represent in general the differences between the enacted and actual spending for policies (both new and existing) that are intended to directly benefit the country's most impoverished populations. The second link (to the Explanatory Note to the Year-End Report - Пояснительная записка к Отчету (5.2 ГП 1-5, 7-13) link: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&045DF15087924D2D43257FFC0037E465](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&045DF15087924D2D43257FFC0037E465))) shows information on transfers to the budget of the Pension Fund. It includes budgeted and actual funds for pensions and social security, for example: implementation of monthly payments to disabled people; implementation of monthly payments to veterans; payment of Federal social surcharge to pension. But this information does not focus on the most impoverished populations (i.e., support for the poorest).

IBP comment: In light of both Government Reviewer and Researchers's comments, and the first link provided in these comments, it looks like there is information on at least some of the policies that benefit the most impoverished populations, so the response has been changed from "d" to "c."

95: Does the Year-End Report present the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome?

- a. (100) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, along with a narrative discussion.
- b. (67) Yes, estimates of the differences between all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented, but a narrative discussion is not included.
- c. (33) Yes, estimates of the differences between some but not all of the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome are presented.
- d. (0) No, estimates of the differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome is not presented.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Explanatory Note to the Report on [budget] Execution (Sections 5.4-5.7), available at: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F0B555D5BE03626843257FFC003843EE](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F0B555D5BE03626843257FFC003843EE)) Specifically, see section 5. Federal budget expenditures, p.105; Subsection 5.7. Intergovernmental transfers to state extra-budgetary funds of the Russian Federation, pp. 875-888 Federal Law No. 379-FZ "On the budget of the Federal Fund of Obligatory Medical Insurance for 2015," <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgen...> (<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1090506-6&02>) Date of submission by the government (executive) to the State Duma: 3 Jun 2016. The bill was approved by the Duma, and signed by the president on October 31, 2016.

Comments: Researcher: The law on the budget of the Federal Fund of Obligatory Medical Insurance for 2015 is not part of the Year-End Report. Information on this law is given to clarify: the Year-End Report 2015 includes information on federal funds transferred to extra-budgetary funds (this is the content of Section 5.7 of the Explanatory Note), but to get the full information on each extra-budgetary fund, one should refer to the draft law on execution of the corresponding extra-budgetary fund. The execution of expenditures and revenues for each extra-budgetary fund are approved by separate federal laws for each fund.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The expert refers to the Report on the Execution of the Federal Budget. However, the data on non-budget funds are not included in the federal budget. This approach is consistent with the international documents (see, for example, paragraph 2.78 of the IMF's Government Finance Statistics Manual 2014). The information on differences between the original estimates of extra-budgetary funds and the actual outcome for the year is contained in the Report on the Implementation of the Consolidated Budget of the Russian Federation and the Budgets of State Non-Budgetary Funds (form N 0507021). In this report information on the TFCMI (Territorial Funds of Compulsory Medical Insurance) is presented separately. Data on the remaining three non-budgetary funds (Pension Fund, Social Insurance Fund, Federal Fund of Compulsory Medical Insurance) are presented in the laws on the executions of these funds. Web-links: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=10...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=10...)

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=1088479-6](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=1088479-6)) "Об исполнении бюджета Пенсионного фонда Российской Федерации за 2015 год"; [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=10...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=10...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=1090506-6](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=1090506-6)) "Об исполнении бюджета Федерального фонда обязательного медицинского страхования за 2015 год"; [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(Spravka\)?OpenAgent&RN=1088247-6](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(Spravka)?OpenAgent&RN=1088247-6)) "Об исполнении бюджета Фонда социального страхования Российской Федерации за 2015 год"; <http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/138/otchet-ob-ispolnenii...> (<http://www.roskazna.ru/upload/iblock/138/otchet-ob-ispolnenii-kbrf-za-2015-god.zip>), file 0507021_01012016.xls, tabs 2 и 3.

Researcher response: This is a link to the list of documents that were submitted to the State Duma 25.07.2016 simultaneously with the draft Federal law on execution of the Federal budget for 2015 (the YER):<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgen...> (<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>) This is the link to the list of documents that were submitted to the State Duma 03.06.2016 simultaneously with the draft Federal law "On Execution of the budget of the Federal Fund of Obligatory Medical Insurance for 2015" <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgen...> (<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1090506-6&02>) The laws on execution of the budgets of the Pension Fund, Social Insurance Fund, Federal Fund of Compulsory Medical Insurance for 2015 and the Report on the Implementation of the Consolidated Budget of the Russian Federation are not part of the Year-End Report, they are not submitted together with the YER. However, the YER and the extra-budgetary funds execution law are discussed by the Duma at the same time. Response changed from "c" to "a."

96: Is a financial statement included as part of the Year-End Report or released as a separate report?

- a. (100) Yes, a financial statement is part of the Year-End Report or is released as a separate report.
- b. (0) No, a financial statement is neither part of the Year-End Report nor released as a separate report.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Explanatory Note to the Report on Budget Execution (Sections 6-13), available at: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&16396EA53437809D43257FFC0038667A](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&16396EA53437809D43257FFC0038667A)) Specifically, see the following sections: 10. Operations on management the balance of accounts on accounting the Federal budget funds, including the placement of Federal budget funds in Bank deposits p.930 11. Analysis of balance sheet data of the Federal budget and the report on financial results p. 945 12. Main indicators of budget system of the Russian Federation p. 1010 12.1 Execution of the consolidated budget and budgets of state extra-budgetary funds p. 1013 12.2 Performance of the consolidated budgets of the constituent entities of the Russian Federation p. 1017 See also the

Annex to Explanatory note to the YER 2015, available at: [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F4BAEFA14798E2D743257FFC0039E2A5](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&F4BAEFA14798E2D743257FFC0039E2A5))

Comments: Researcher: A financial statement is part of the Year-End Report See section 11 of the Explanatory Note to YER 2015: "Data analysis balance the Federal budget and the report on financial results" («11. Анализ данных баланса исполнения федерального бюджета и отчета о финансовом результате»), pages 945-1009 For example: -page 947, figure 63, "Dynamics of balances of non-financial assets for 2011-2015" -page 958, table 361 (as of January 1, 2016) shows non-financial assets of the Treasury for the main administrators See also Annex 17 in the Appendix to the Explanatory Note: "Analysis of the statement of financial activities for the Federal budget for 2015" «Анализ отчета о финансовых результатах деятельности по федеральному бюджету за 2015 год». This document lists the titles of the indicators (financial and non-financial assets) and their change in million of rubles in 2015

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

97: What type of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) has the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) conducted and made available to the public?

- a. (100) The SAI has conducted all three types of audits (compliance, financial, or performance) and made them available to the public.
- b. (67) The SAI has conducted two of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.
- c. (33) The SAI has conducted one of the three types of audits, and made them available to the public.
- d. (0) The SAI has not conducted any of the three types of audits, or has not made them available to the public.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://www.ach.gov.ru/en/activities/federal-budget-audit/> (<http://www.ach.gov.ru/en/activities/federal-budget-audit/>) • Preliminary audit • Operational analysis • Follow-up control Performance audit is not conducted.

Comments: Researcher: The Preliminary Audit involves: • determining compliance of the federal budget laws and laws on extra budgetary funds with applicable legislation; • determining validity and reliability of the indicators contained in the estimates of the federal budget and the budgets of federal extra-budgetary funds; • appraising the estimates of the federal budget and the budgets of extra-budgetary funds as instruments of the state's socioeconomic policies, their compliance with the provisions of the Russian President's addresses and other program documents; • appraising the quality of forecast for revenue, budget spending, investment and debt policies and also the efficiency of intergovernmental relations. Operational Analysis of execution and control of federal budget execution is carried out in accordance with Article 19 of the Federal Law "On the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation" and the provisions of the SGA 202 government audit standard "Operational Analysis of the Execution and Control Over Organization of Federal Budget Execution." During budget execution, the SAI analyzes the fullness and timeliness of revenue inflow, cash outflows against the indicators approved in the Enacted Budget; it reveals and analyzes discrepancies and breaches, and initiates proposals to eliminate them. Follow-up control over budget and extra budgetary funds execution is effected according to: - Article 264/9 of the Budget Code, - Article 20 of the Federal Law "On the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation" a - External public audit (control) standard SGA 203 "Follow up control of the federal budget management" -External public audit (control) standard SGA 205 "Follow up control of the management of budgets of the public extra-budgetary funds". Follow up control is a set of control, expert and analytical measures to check performance of the enacted budget and the budgets of extra-budgetary funds in the reporting financial year. The Accounts Chamber shall carry out external audit of annual budgetary reporting of chief administrators of federal budget funds and prepare opinions on each chief administrator of federal budget funds. Opinions on each chief administrator of federal budget funds shall be submitted to the State Duma and the Federation Council. The Accounts Chamber shall carry out external audit of the annual report on federal budget execution and prepare its opinion on the annual report on federal budget execution. The opinion on the annual report on federal budget execution shall be submitted to the State Duma and the Federation Council. The Accounts Chamber shall check reports on execution of budgets of federal extra-budgetary funds of the Russian Federation and prepare opinions on reports on budgets execution of federal extra-budgetary funds of the Russian Federation. Decisions on reports on budget execution of federal extra-budgetary funds of the Russian Federation shall be submitted to the State Duma and the Federation Council, and also to the Government of the Russian Federation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The expert refers to the fact that the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation does not evaluate expenditures effectiveness (performance audit). However, in accordance with Article 5 of the Federal law of 05.04.2013 N 41-FZ (ed. 07.02.2017) "On the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation" (http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_144621/) (http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_144621/)) tasks of the Accounts Chamber include: •control over the targeted and efficient use of federal budget funds, budgets of state extra-budgetary funds; •determination of the effectiveness and compliance with regulatory legal acts of the Russian Federation of the procedure of formation, management and disposition of federal property (within the competence of the accounts chamber), including for the purposes of strategic planning in the Russian Federation. In 2014 the Accounts Chamber in conjunction with the Ministry of Finance, has developed the Criteria and Methodology for Assessing Budget Expenditures Effectiveness, taking into account peculiarities, specified by the type of expenditure (http://gov.cap.ru/UserFiles/orgs/GrvId_108/kriterii_i_metodika) (http://gov.cap.ru/UserFiles/orgs/GrvId_108/kriterii_i_metodika)...). This technique is used for the developing the Opinion of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation on the Federal Budget Execution Report for 2015 (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/29956?sphrase_id=377...) (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/29956?sphrase_id=3770559). For example, on page 275 the analysis of federal spending on additional activities aimed at reducing tensions on the labor market based on efficiency criterion, i.e. the level of registered unemployment. Pages 385-923 provide an assessment of the effectiveness of all government programs according to the results of the control and analytical activities based on 7 indicators.

Researcher response: The link provided by the Government Reviewer (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/29956?sphrase_id=377... (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/29956?sphrase_id=3770559)) shows a Survey by the Accounting Chamber on the Citizens Budget. However, we found the following references: 1) "Audit of efficiency of use of public funds" (app. "The decision of the Collegium of the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation, Protocol dated 09.06.2009 N 31K (668)"), together with "Order of actions in the process of organization and carrying out of performance audit". http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_119213/ (http://www.consultant.ru/document/cons_doc_LAW_119213/) "104)2 The standard of the External State Audit (Control) 104 "Efficiency Audit" (Resolution of the Collegium of the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation from November 30, 2016 No. 4PCS), http://www.ach.gov.ru/about/document/CGA_104.pdf (http://www.ach.gov.ru/about/document/CGA_104.pdf). The document describes the recommended procedure in the process of organization and conduct of performance audit We therefore may agree with answer a. However, this type of audit should be further developed in Russia. Its standards are far from the modern developed practice. According to the Chairman of the Accounting Chamber, Tatyana Golikova, the implementation of programs included in the Federal budget has not led to the improvement of the efficiency of use of budgetary funds (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/30335 (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/30335) Tatyana Golikova at St.Petersburg International Economic Forum-2017: 1/3 existing state programs are ineffective).

IBP comment: The Audit Report pages suggested by the Government Reviewer refer to a section that indeed shows performance-related information (<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/fe7/fe7efe7f2a95f426a1648e...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/fe7/fe7efe7f2a95f426a1648eaa6b8d77f2.pdf>)). This may not be up to the expected standards, and it may not have led to improved efficiency; but the fact is that the Audit Report includes a substantial section on performance. Accordingly, the response has been upgraded from "b" to "a."

98: What percentage of expenditures within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

- a. (100) All expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- b. (67) Expenditures representing at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- c. (33) Expenditures representing less than two-thirds of expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- d. (0) No expenditures have been audited.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: 7 Sep 2016, Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation on the report on execution of the Federal budget for 2015 <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/2...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28047/>) 7 Sep 2016, Conclusion for the report of the Federal Fund of obligatory medical insurance on performance in 2015 <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/2...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28048/>) 7 Sep 2016, Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation on the report on the budget of the Pension Fund of the Russian Federation for the year 2015 submitted by the Government of the Russian Federation to the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/2...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28049/>) 7 Sep 2016, Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation on the report on the budget of Fund of social insurance of the Russian Federation for the year 2015 submitted by the Government of the Russian Federation to the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/2...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28050/>)

Comments: Researcher: All expenditures within the SAI's mandate have been audited.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

99: What percentage of extra-budgetary funds within the mandate of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) has been audited?

- a. (100) All extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- b. (67) Extra-budgetary funds accounting for at least two-thirds of, but not all, expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- c. (33) Extra-budgetary funds accounting for less than two-thirds of expenditures associated with extra-budgetary funds within the SAI's mandate have been audited.
- d. (0) No extra-budgetary funds have been audited.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: 7 Sep 2016 Conclusion on the Report of the Federal Mandatory Medical Insurance Fund for BY 2015 <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/2...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28048/>) 7 Sep 2016 Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation on the Performance Report on the budget of the Pension Fund for BY 2015, submitted by the Government of the Russian Federation to the Accounting Chamber, <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/2...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28049/>) 7 Sep 2016 Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation on the Performance Report of the Social Insurance Fund for BY 2015, submitted by the Government of the Russian Federation to the Accounting Chamber, <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/2...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28050/>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

100: Does the annual Audit Report(s) prepared by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) include an executive summary?

- a. (100) Yes, the annual Audit Report(s) includes one or more executive summaries summarizing the report's content.
- b. (0) No, the annual Audit Report(s) does not include an executive summary.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: Link to the Accounting chamber web-site, where the annual reports are posted: http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/annual_report/ (http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/annual_report/) In accordance with the Federal law "On the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation" the control office presents to the chambers of the Federal Assembly, to which it is accountable, an annual report on its work, approved by the Board of the Accounting chamber and it is the subject to mandatory publication. The annual report consists of a summary part containing General data characterizing the work of the Accounting chamber as a whole, their analysis, and reports on areas of activity of the Accounting chamber. http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/annual_report/874/ (http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/annual_report/874/) Executive summary – page 1-2

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: The Chapter One of the Annual Report of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation is really an executive summary summarizing the report's content. http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/annual_report/#874 (http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/annual_report/#874)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Accounts Chamber Opinion on the Federal Budget Execution Report for 2015 (link: http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/29956?sphrase_id=377... (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/29956?sphrase_id=3770559)) is a huge document. However, as a brief overview of the contents of the Report might be considered Section 24 of the "Opinion" (p. 1320 – 1400). In addition, the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation issued a Press Release on the results of the analysis of the Federal budget, consolidated regional budgets and federal extra budgetary funds execution in 2015. link: http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051 (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051).

Researcher response: The link originally included referred to the annual report on the works of the SAI, not the actual Audit Report. The Audit Report is available here: <http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/c2b/c2bc6bb05993e610c93526...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/c2b/c2bc6bb05993e610c9352644dd9397.docx>) <http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/fef/fefefe7f2a95f426a1648e...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/upload/iblock/fef/fefefe7f2a95f426a1648eaa6b8d77f2.pdf>) "Conclusion" of the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation for the report on execution of the Federal budget for 2015 (approved by the Collegium of the Accounting chamber of the Russian Federation (minutes of August 26, 2016 No. 43K (1118)); "There is no executive summary at the beginning of the report, but a press release is available, which summarizes the findings, here: http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051 (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/28051) <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/2...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28047/>)

101: Does the executive make available to the public a report on what steps it has taken to address audit recommendations or findings that indicate a need for remedial action?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive reports publicly on what steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive reports publicly on most audit findings.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive reports publicly on some audit findings.
- d. (0) No, the executive does not report on steps it has taken to address audit findings.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: Some of the Russian Federation executive authorities on their official websites are publishing information on the steps undertaken in response to audit recommendations. For example, Federal Property Management Agency places on its website information on the execution of the directions of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation: <http://www.rosim.ru/press/news/247351> (<http://www.rosim.ru/press/news/247351>) <http://www.rosim.ru/press/news/276322> (<http://www.rosim.ru/press/news/276322>) The Ministry of Transport of the Russian Federation informs citizens about all of the inspections carried out and their results, including the enforcement of regulations of the Accounting Chamber: http://www.mintrans.ru/activity/detail.php?SECTION_ID=2993&s... (http://www.mintrans.ru/activity/detail.php?SECTION_ID=2993&sphrase_id=119602)

Researcher response: We agree in changing the answer from "d" to "c." The links provided by the Government Reviewer show the steps undertaken in response to audit recommendations. This section however, could not be found in the website at the time of answering the question.

102: Does either the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) or legislature release to the public a report that tracks actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations?

- a. (100) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit recommendations.
- b. (67) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on most audit recommendations.
- c. (33) Yes, the SAI or legislature reports publicly on some audit recommendations.
- d. (0) No, neither the SAI nor legislature reports on steps the executive has taken to address audit recommendations.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: <http://audit.gov.ru/activities/control/elimination-of-violat...> (<http://audit.gov.ru/activities/control/elimination-of-violations/>) In the section "Activities/Audit/Corrective actions" of the Accounting Chamber's website, information is currently available as on 28 April 2016. In the section "Activities/Audit/Reports," reports are presented for 2015.

Comments: Researcher: The release to the public of some information is a bit behind. On the website of the Accounting Chamber, in the section "Activities/Audit/Corrective actions," information is currently available as on 28 April 2016; in the section "Activities/Audit/Reports" reports are presented for 2015. At the same time, for example, on page 162 of the Report of the Accounting Chamber Work for the 2015 (available at <http://www.ach.gov.ru/upload/uf/483/4830aed0a9653b4c89e0ed73...> (<http://www.ach.gov.ru/upload/uf/483/4830aed0a9653b4c89e0ed73badbe861.pdf>)), there is a table on "Measures [taken by] the Public Prosecutor in reaction to the results of audit activities of the Accounting Chamber".

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: Analysis of revealed violations contained in the Account Chamber's directives sent to the main managers of federal ministries and agencies and in appeals to law enforcement agencies, is a part of the Opinion of the Accounts Chamber on the Federal Budget Execution Report for 2015. (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/29956?sphrase_id=377... (http://www.ach.gov.ru/press_center/news/29956?sphrase_id=3770559)). Real-time information about detected violations, directed and executed (and partially executed) and the requirements placed on the portal "The Results of the External Audit" of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation (<http://results.audit.gov.ru/> (<http://results.audit.gov.ru/>)). Information about performance requirements is available at <http://results.audit.gov.ru/arrangement/?filter=pp:2017-0~20...> (<http://results.audit.gov.ru/arrangement/?filter=pp:2017-0~2017-0;pt:all;gt1:1;ct:table;s1:d1>), Information about performance requirements is available at <http://results.audit.gov.ru/penalty/?filter=pp:2017-0~2017-0...> (<http://results.audit.gov.ru/penalty/?filter=pp:2017-0~2017-0;pt:all;gt1:1;ct:table;s1:d1;f1>). On the portal you can see all the submissions of the Accounts Chamber and response to them. Link to the document from the electronic database of the portal <http://results.audit.gov.ru/public/files/43ccbd2949676987eb9...> (<http://results.audit.gov.ru/public/files/43ccbd2949676987eb92240da12a7f78.pdf>), shows how Emergency Situations Ministry reports on the implementation of the prescriptions.

Researcher response: The first link provided by the Government Reviewer takes us to a survey of the Accounting Chamber on the Citizens Budget (on April 7, 2017, the Chamber invited everyone to take part in the survey to assess the effectiveness of implementation of the project "Budget for citizens", held in the framework of increasing the openness and transparency of information on public Finance management)The second link (<http://results.audit.gov.ru> (<http://results.audit.gov.ru>)) does not present any actions taken by the executive to address audit recommendations.The third link presents performance requirements information, but neither the SAI nor legislature report on what steps the executive has taken to address all audit recommendations; The fourth link presents some (or are these few are all? it is uncertain.) submissions of the Accounts Chamber, but there is no information on what has been done. Everywhere is written: "considered".The fifth link <http://results.audit.gov.ru/public/files/43ccbd2949676987eb9...> (<http://results.audit.gov.ru/public/files/43ccbd2949676987eb92240da12a7f78.pdf>), shows how the Emergency Situations Ministry reports on the implementation of the audit recommendations, but we have not found any other Ministries reports to the Accounting Chamber. Response "b" applies.

103: Is there an Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) that conducts budget analyses for the budget formulation and/or approval process?

- a. (100) Yes, there is an IFI, its independence is set in law, and it has sufficient staffing and resources, including funding, to carry out its tasks.
- b. (67) Yes, there is an IFI, but either its independence is not set in law or its staffing and resources, including funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.
- c. (33) Yes, there is an IFI, but its independence is not set in law and its staffing and resources, including funding, are insufficient to carry out its tasks.
- d. (0) No, there is no IFI.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

104: Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts?

- a. (100) Yes, the IFI publishes its own macroeconomic and fiscal forecasts.
- b. (67) Yes, the IFI publishes its own macroeconomic or fiscal forecast.
- c. (33) No, the IFI does not publish its own macroeconomic or fiscal forecast, but it does publish an assessment of the official macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts produced by the executive.
- d. (0) No, there is no IFI; or the IFI neither publishes its own macroeconomic and/or fiscal forecasts, nor a commentary on the official forecasts produced by the executive.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: no comment

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

105: Does the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) publish its own costings of new policy proposals, to assess their impact on the budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of all new policy proposals.
- b. (67) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of major new policy proposals.
- c. (33) Yes, the IFI publishes its own costings of a limited number of new policy proposals.
- d. (0) No, there is no IFI; or the IFI does not publish its own costings of new policy proposals.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: no IFI

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

106: In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Independent Fiscal Institution (IFI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

- a. (100) Frequently (i.e., five times or more).
- b. (67) Sometimes (i.e., three times or more, but less than five times).
- c. (33) Rarely (i.e., once or twice).
- d. (0) Never.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: no IFI

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

107: Does the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, the full legislature debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the upcoming budget.
- b. (67) Yes, a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, and approves recommendations for the upcoming budget.
- c. (33) Yes, the full legislature and/or a legislative committee debates budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal, but it does not approve recommendations for the upcoming budget.
- d. (0) No, neither the full legislature nor any legislative committee debate budget policy prior to the tabling of the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- e. (0) Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://www.duma.gov.ru/analytics/library/federal-budget/bud...> (http://www.duma.gov.ru/analytics/library/federal-budget/bud_2017_2019.pdf) - Chronicle of the passing of the draft Federal law "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019"

Comments: Researcher: March 30, 2016 The Council of Federation of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation adopted a resolution "On proposals of Council of Federations on the formation of the concept of the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019". 29 July 2016 - The government of the Russian Federation held a meeting on Federal budget expenditures for 2017 – 2019 in terms of balancing the budgets of constituent entities of the Russian Federation. 10 October 2016 - In the State Duma were held Parliamentary hearings on the theme "Main directions of budget and tax and customs tariff policy: the choice of priorities." Workshop materials can be found on the website of the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes (<http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru> (<http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru>)). On the website of the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes the Main directions of budgetary policy for the year 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 at 11 <http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/site.xp/0530530491240520490...> (<http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/site.xp/053053049124052049050048.html>) (date accessed: 10.10.2016). Main directions of budgetary policy for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 <http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3855203&fn=%CE%...> (<http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3855203&fn=%CE%F1%ED%EE%E2%ED%FB%E5%20%ED%E0%EF%F0%E0%E2%EB%E5%ED%E8%FF%20%E1%FE%E4%E6%E5%F2%ED%EE%E5>) The draft guidelines for tax policy of the Russian Federation in 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019 <http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3828626&fn=%CE%...> (<http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3828626&fn=%CE%F1%ED%EE%E2%ED.%20%ED%E0%EF%F0.%20%ED%E0%EB%EE%E3.%20%EF%EE%EB%E8%F2.pdf&size=448391>) The draft guidelines for customs tariff policy in 2017 and the planned period 2018-2019 <http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3829160&fn=%D2%...> (<http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3829160&fn=%D2%00%EC%EE%E6%E5%ED%ED%FB%E5%20%ED%E0%EF%F0%E0%E2%EB%E5%ED%E8%FF.pdf&size=1559805>) Transcript of the Parliamentary hearings <http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3858458&fn=%CF%...> (<http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3858458&fn=%CF%E0%F0%EB%E0%EC%E5%ED%F2%F1%EA%E8%E5%20%F1%EB%F3%F8%E0%ED%E8%FF%20%CA%EE%EC%E8%F2%E5%F>) The recommendations of the Parliamentary hearings on "Main directions of budget and tax and customs tariff policy: the choice of priorities." <http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3865819&fn=%F0%...> (<http://komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/file.xp?idb=3865819&fn=%F0%E5%EA%EE%EC%E5%ED%E4%E0%F6%E8%E8%20%CF%D1%2010.10.16.docx&size=80996>) 13 Oct 2016 At a meeting of the Government of the Russian Federation approved the draft Federal law "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019". 28 Oct 2016 The draft Federal law "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019", and the accompanying documents introduced by the Government of the Russian Federation in the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

108: How far in advance of the start of the budget year does the legislature receive the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least three months before the start of the budget year.
- b. (67) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least two months, but less than three months, before the start of the budget year.
- c. (33) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal at least one month, but less than two months, before the start of the budget year.
- d. (0) The legislature receives the Executive's Budget Proposal less than one month before the start of the budget year, or does not receive it all.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: <https://rg.ru/2016/06/02/putin-podpisal-zakon-o-perenose-v-2...> (<https://rg.ru/2016/06/02/putin-podpisal-zakon-o-perenose-v-2016-godu-sroka-vneseniia-biudzheta-v-gd.html>) In 2016 the deadline of receiving the EBP by the legislature is 1 November.

Comments: Researcher: In 2016 the deadline of receiving the EBP by the legislature is 1 November. It was rescheduled in June 2016 by the decision of the State Duma as the amendments to the Budget Code. The reason is the autumn elections in September 2016. So that with the corrected dates the new State Duma will approve the budget for 2017. Previously the elections were always in December and the deadline of receiving the EBP by the legislature was 1 October. 28 Oct 2016 The materials of the draft Federal law "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" can be found on the official website of the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation at the following address: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7&O2>). Materials dedicated to the preparation and passage of the draft Federal law "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" are available in the reading room of the Parliamentary library (Okhotniy Ryad str., 1, K. 11-16). Evidence is

confirmed by multiple media publications as well, for example, https://www.1tv.ru/news/2016/10/28/312966-pravitelstvo_vnesl... (https://www.1tv.ru/news/2016/10/28/312966-pravitelstvo_vneslo_na_rassmotrenie_gosdumy_proekt_byudzheta_na_blizhayshie_tri_goda) <https://lenta.ru/news/2016/10/28/budget/> (<https://lenta.ru/news/2016/10/28/budget/>) The draft Federal law "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019", and the accompanying documents introduced by the Government of the Russian Federation in the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation. The Minister of Finance of the Russian Federation Anton Siluanov was appointed the official representative of the Government of the Russian Federation by consideration by chambers of Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation of the draft Federal law. The order of the Government of the Russian Federation of 28 October 2016 No. 2263-R. The bill was in the Management of information technology and documentation ensuring of the apparatus of the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation under the number 15455-7 and forwarded to the Chairman of the State Duma of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation and the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes. For any feedback, comments and suggestions to the draft law "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" sent to the President of the Russian Federation, committees, commissions of the State Duma of the faction in the State Duma, the Federation Council of the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation, the Government of the Russian Federation, the Public chamber of the Russian Federation. The State Duma Committee on budget and taxes, appointed the Executive Committee, which will be sent feedback, suggestions, comments and conclusions up to 18 hours on 6 November 2016.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

109: When does the legislature approve the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) The legislature approves the budget at least one month in advance of the start of the budget year.
- b. (67) The legislature approves the budget less than one month in advance of the start of the budget year, but at least by the start of the budget year.
- c. (33) The legislature approves the budget less than one month after the start of the budget year.
- d. (0) The legislature approves the budget more than one month after the start of the budget year, or does not approve the budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: Chapter 22 Budget Code: Consideration and Approval of the Federal Law on the Federal Budget (articles 192-210); in article 196 is stated that the State Duma is considering the draft federal law on the federal budget for the next fiscal year during 60 days in three readings.

Comments: Researcher: As far as the date of the receiving of the EBP was changed to 1 November (question 108) and the fiscal year starts on 1 January and the budget is to be approved by the start of the budget year the answer is B.

<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgen...> (<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7&O2>). Registration of the bill and materials to it in System of automation of document circulation for the office of the State Duma registered and sent to the Chairman of the State Duma 28.10.2016 15:55 sent to the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes 28.10.2016 16:25 The decision of the relevant Committee to submit the bill to the State Duma Council offer to take the bill to consideration (terms of representation of responses, offers and remarks in Committee 06.11.2016, the proposed date for consideration by the State Duma 18.11.2016) 28.10.2016 offer to take the bill in the first reading (offered date of consideration by the State Duma 18.11.2016) 16.11.2016 The consideration of the bill by the State Duma to pass the bill in the first reading; to introduce amendments to the bill to 18 hours 25 Nov 2016 18.11.2016 The adoption of responsible Committee decision on submission of the bill in the Duma Council offer to take the bill in the second reading (offered date of consideration by the State Duma 07.12.2016); 05.12.2016 The consideration of the bill by the State Duma make the bill a second reading 07.12.2016 The adoption of responsible Committee decision on submission of the bill in the Duma Council to offer to adopt the bill in third reading (offered date of consideration by the State Duma 09.12.2016) 07.12.2016 The consideration of the bill by the State Duma to adopt a law (submitted to the Federation Council 09.12.2016) 09.12.2016 Receipt of the law from the State Duma sent to the committees (commissions) responsible appointed: the Committee of the Council of the Federation on budget and financial markets 10.12.2016 came from the State Duma 10.12.2016 A preliminary review of the law by the responsible Committee (Commission) consideration of the law by the Federation Council is required; to propose to approve the law 13.12.2016

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

110: Does the legislature have the authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, the legislature has unlimited authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- b. (67) Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, with some limitations.
- c. (33) Yes, the legislature has authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, but its authority is very limited.
- d. (0) No, the legislature does not have any authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: Adoption of amendments is regulated by the Budget code. In the case in which the State Duma approves the draft budget law in its first reading, the main characteristics of the federal budget are approved. When doing so, the State Duma has no right to raise revenues and deficit of the

federal budget, if there is no positive conclusion of the Government of the Russian Federation for these changes. Consideration of amendments during the second reading is held in the Budget Committee, after their consideration in the relevant profile Committee. When it is considered in the third reading, the draft budget law shall be put to the vote as a whole. Budget Code, Chapter 22 Consideration and adoption of the Federal law on the federal budget. In particular: Articles 200-204 on the First Reading Article 205 on the Second Reading Article 207 on the Third Reading See: <http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/pe/BudgetLaws/Budget...> (http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/pe/BudgetLaws/Budget_Code_Russia_Eng1998.pdf)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

111: During the most recent budget approval process, did the legislature use its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, the legislature used its authority in law to amend the Executive's Budget Proposal, and (at least some of) its amendments were adopted.
- b. (67) Yes, the legislature used its authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive's Budget Proposal, but no amendments were adopted.
- c. (33) No, while the legislature has the authority in law to propose amendments to the Executive's Budget Proposal, no amendments were offered.
- d. (0) No, the legislature does not have any such authority.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=911755-6&02>) At the official web-site of the State Duma is placed the detailed information on consideration of the EBP and are presented amendments which were tabled by the deputies <http://pda.transcript.duma.gov.ru/search/index.php?sessid=45...> (http://pda.transcript.duma.gov.ru/search/index.php?sessid=4519&doctype=0&day_start=07&month_start=12&year_start=2016&day_end=07&month_end=12&year_end=2016&phrase1=) Database "the Transcripts of the meetings of the State Duma" <http://pda.transcript.duma.gov.ru/node/4558/> (<http://pda.transcript.duma.gov.ru/node/4558/>) this is a transcript from 7.12.2016, 2nd reading. Submitted 500 amendments, 301 amendments approved

Comments: Researcher: The adoption by the responsible Committee a decision on submission of the bill in the Duma Council: offer to take the bill in the second reading (offered date of consideration by the State Duma 02.12.2015); 30.11.2015 318 n. 1 Table of amendments recommended for rejection is section 4 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&41BB07018FB91875B43257F0D0080151A](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&41BB07018FB91875B43257F0D0080151A)) Table of amendments recommended for rejection - section 5 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&F4F6E5F80A117EBB43257F0D00802FF3](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&F4F6E5F80A117EBB43257F0D00802FF3)) Table of amendments recommended for rejection in section 7 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&6966984F81054D0D43257F0D008084B99](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&6966984F81054D0D43257F0D008084B99)) Table of amendments recommended for rejection - section 8 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&739200EFE984795243257F0D00806849](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&739200EFE984795243257F0D00806849)) Table of amendments recommended for rejection - section 9 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&9FBE07C11FE2616A43257F0D008083DF](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&9FBE07C11FE2616A43257F0D008083DF)) Table of amendments recommended for adoption the table.50 amendment 1 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&0E2F305935FDD44943257F0E0001349E](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&0E2F305935FDD44943257F0E0001349E)) Table of amendments recommended for adoption the table.40 amendment 1 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&4834615C60D87E5B43257F0E00015B49](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&4834615C60D87E5B43257F0E00015B49)) Table of amendments recommended for adoption application 30 to amendment 1 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&6F23EABD41CA1A5A43257F0E0001805C](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&6F23EABD41CA1A5A43257F0E0001805C)) Table of amendments recommended for adoption application 27 to amendment 1 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&FCCF2A99BEA26F0D43257F0E0001A102](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&FCCF2A99BEA26F0D43257F0E0001A102)) The consideration of the bill by the State Duma in a second reading 02.12.2015 1.The text of the bill adopted in the second reading [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&A85596C7A0D3D16A43257F0F004E76DC](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&A85596C7A0D3D16A43257F0F004E76DC)) 2. ADJ.1 the text of the bill adopted in the second reading [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&FE69289354A1BDC843257F0F004E9B17](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&FE69289354A1BDC843257F0F004E9B17)) 3. ADJ.2 the text of the bill adopted in the second reading [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&EF1C8318C02E160D43257F0F004EBF98](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&EF1C8318C02E160D43257F0F004EBF98)) The resolution of the State Duma [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&779803999B8B383F43257F0F005771DF](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&arhiv/a_dz_6.nsf/ByID&779803999B8B383F43257F0F005771DF))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

112: During the last budget approval process, did a specialized budget or finance committee in the legislature examine the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee had at least one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- b. (67) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee had less than one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and it published a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- c. (33) Yes, a specialized budget or finance committee examined the Executive's Budget Proposal, but it did not publish a report with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- d. (0) No, a specialized budget or finance committee did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: There is a specialized State Duma Committee on the Budget and Taxes (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам) - <http://www.duma.gov.ru/structure/committees/1760702/> (<http://www.duma.gov.ru/structure/committees/1760702/>) <http://www.komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/> (<http://www.komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/>) - The official web-site of the Committee The Committee has to preliminary consider the EBP, the amendments, the report on execution of the federal budget, all amendments to the Budget and tax legislation. The Committee organizes the parliamentary hearings on budget. The Committee consists of 28 deputies. It did not publish a report with findings and recommendations

Comments: Researcher: The amendments are published before the budget is approved in the last 3d reading – on 27.11.2016: <http://www.komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/site.xp/054048049124052...> (<http://www.komitet-bn.km.duma.gov.ru/site.xp/054048049124052052048057.html>) Table of amendments 27.11.2016 Amendments to draft Federal law No. 15455-7 "On the Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019"

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: The conclusion of the Budget Committee was published on 16.11.16 in the composition of the materials of the draft law (the law was signed 13.12.16). File name: «Заключение ответственного комитета (Комитет Государственной Думы по бюджету и налогам)». Link: <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/4C865FDA0A645DD24...>

([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/4C865FDA0A645DD24325806E00348056/\\$File/%D0%B7%D0%B0%D0%BA%D0%BB%D1%8E%D1%87%D0%OpenElement](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/4C865FDA0A645DD24325806E00348056/$File/%D0%B7%D0%B0%D0%BA%D0%BB%D1%8E%D1%87%D0%OpenElement))

Researcher response: The report of the Budget Commission and its conclusions were posted on 16 November 2016 – 20 days after the EBP was submitted to Parliament, at the time of the 1st reading of the budget, when deputies approve the main parameters of the budget. The conclusions mention that there are suggestions on submission of amendments, but they are presented in separate document (...), which suggests amendments for the 2nd reading - on 5 December. For the Conclusions of the Budget Committee (Consolidated statement Committee of the State Duma on Budget and Taxes On the draft federal law No. 15455-7 "On the federal Budget for 2017 and for the planning period 2018 and 2019"), see:

[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&4C865FDA0A645DD24325806E00348056](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&4C865FDA0A645DD24325806E00348056))

The amendments to the 2nd reading were published in December 2016

<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent...> (<http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=15455-7&02>)

The response has been upgraded from "c" to "b," because the committee examined the draft budget and published a report within less than a month from receiving the budget.

113: During the last approval process, did legislative committees, responsible for particular sectors (e.g., health, education, defense, etc.), examine spending in the Executive's Budget Proposal related to the sector for which they are responsible?

- a. (100) Yes, sector committees had at least one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and they published reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- b. (67) Yes, sector committees had less than one month to examine the Executive's Budget Proposal, and they published reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- c. (33) Yes, sector committees examined the Executive's Budget Proposal, but they did not publish reports with findings and recommendations prior to the budget being adopted.
- d. (0) No, sector committees did not examine the Executive's Budget Proposal.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: According to the Budget Code and the Order of consideration of draft laws in the State Duma the committees, responsible for particular sectors, examine the EBP, and they publish reports with their findings and recommendations (Conclusions).

Comments: Researcher: Conclusions of legislative committees, responsible for particular sectors: The summary conclusion of the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes on EBP 2017 [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&4C865FDA0A645DD24325806E00348056](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&4C865FDA0A645DD24325806E00348056)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee for security and countering corruption) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&6ECB8E29E1CDF8CF4325805E004171FF](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&6ECB8E29E1CDF8CF4325805E004171FF)) The conclusion of the State Duma Committee on defense (the State Duma Committee on defense) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&31C9551770FEFA234325805F005B8DC3](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&31C9551770FEFA234325805F005B8DC3)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on housing policy and housing and communal services) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&5ACCF79FB9A9BD82432580600020B9FD](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&5ACCF79FB9A9BD82432580600020B9FD)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on information policy, information technologies and communications) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FE59119AA3243DA44325806000257A6E](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FE59119AA3243DA44325806000257A6E)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee for education and science) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0B6BE141DF1D2A2E432580600048244D](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&0B6BE141DF1D2A2E432580600048244D)) Conclusion (the State

Duma Committee on transport and construction) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&731ACEB3FBEA64924325806000484FFE](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&731ACEB3FBEA64924325806000484FFE)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on physical culture, sport, tourism and youth Affairs) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&AEA1941441DFC50D4325806000498ED6](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&AEA1941441DFC50D4325806000498ED6)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on international Affairs) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&02D2F4BA2A73FE4C43258060004B4267](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&02D2F4BA2A73FE4C43258060004B4267)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on family, women and children) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&26BD5ABC3404B3B74325806000515FA6](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&26BD5ABC3404B3B74325806000515FA6)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on labor, social policy and veterans ' Affairs) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&CDD58B459A10C64D432580600052650B](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&CDD58B459A10C64D432580600052650B)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on Commonwealth of Independent States, Eurasian integration and relations with compatriots)
[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D1623FB19F09776C432580600052BF41](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D1623FB19F09776C432580600052BF41)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on energy)
[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DCCD309856F91500432580600052C5C1](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DCCD309856F91500432580600052C5C1)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on regional policy and problems of North and Far East) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&AE6CFB4B2623B5DE43258060005536BA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&AE6CFB4B2623B5DE43258060005536BA)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on nationalities)
[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DFA421CD0FEBB9864325806000576E2D](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&DFA421CD0FEBB9864325806000576E2D)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee for health protection)
[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FB4737B0AE290ED2432580600057FCDB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&FB4737B0AE290ED2432580600057FCDB)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on financial markets)
[http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&726D9D211BC92FCB43258060005912F2](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&726D9D211BC92FCB43258060005912F2)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on Federal structure and local self-government) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&C7DEF6E0B3254F5043258060005934C8](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&C7DEF6E0B3254F5043258060005934C8)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on economic policy, industry, innovative development and entrepreneurship) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&CCF1BA6AFA5A28A04325806400270A4F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&CCF1BA6AFA5A28A04325806400270A4F)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on ecology and the environment) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D3CDE2D492439B1A432580640031DACB](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&D3CDE2D492439B1A432580640031DACB)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on natural resources, property and land relations) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&ODDFD886386B1A843258065003FC9AA](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&ODDFD886386B1A843258065003FC9AA)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on agrarian issues) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...)
([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&923E0918C61D4B93432580650048B6B0](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&923E0918C61D4B93432580650048B6B0)) Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on culture) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B953B95C083E53C243258060003B8365](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B953B95C083E53C243258060003B8365))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

114: In the past 12 months, did a committee of the legislature examine in-year implementation of the Enacted Budget during the relevant budget execution period?

- a. (100) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation on at least three occasions during a fiscal year, and it published reports with findings and recommendations.
- b. (67) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation on one or more occasion (but less than three times), and it published a report with findings and recommendations.
- c. (33) Yes, a committee examined in-year implementation, but it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.
- d. (0) No, a committee did not examine in-year implementation.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Federal law 384-fz from 1 Dec.2014 "On federal budget for 2015" was amended few times during the year: federal law 93-fz from 20 April 2015; federal law 211-fz from 13 July 2015 and federal law 329-fz from 28 Nov.2015. The federal law 359-fz from 14 Dec. 2015 "On federal budget for the 2016" is now amended for the 1st time (Government regulation 2105-r from 6 Oct.2016). State Duma Committee on the Budget and Taxes did not examine in-year implementation

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

115: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units that receive explicit funding in the Enacted Budget, and is it legally required to do so?

- a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and it does so in practice.
- b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, but in practice the executive shifts funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to shifting funds between administrative units, and in practice the executive shifts funds between administrative units before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: Article 217 Budget Code (2.1): The endorsed indices of the summary budget inventory shall comply with the law on the budget. (3): In the summary budget inventory the amendments may be introduced in accordance with the decisions of the head of the financial body (head of the state extra-budgetary fund) without amending the law on budget in some cases, defined in the point 3 article 217 of the Budget Code. Article 217. Summary budget inventory - Source: <http://budkod.ru/chast-3/razdel-8/glava-24/st-217-bk-rf> (<http://budkod.ru/chast-3/razdel-8/glava-24/st-217-bk-rf>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

116: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue (that is, amounts higher than originally anticipated) that may become available during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

- a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and it does so in practice.
- b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenue, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, but in practice the executive spends these funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to spending excess revenues, and in practice the executive spends these funds before obtaining approval from the legislature.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The article 232 of the Budget Code - Use of revenues, actually received during the budget execution exceeding the approved by the law (decision) on the budget. (item 1) regulates where the Ministry of Finance may spend excess revenues without obtaining approval from legislature: only on replacement of public borrowings, the repayment of the state debt of the Russian Federation, and on execution of public standard obligations of the Russian Federation in case of insufficiency provided for their implementation budget allocations. <http://budkod.ru/chast-3/razdel-8/glava-24/st-232-bk-rf> (<http://budkod.ru/chast-3/razdel-8/glava-24/st-232-bk-rf>)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

117: Does the executive seek approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the levels in the Enacted Budget in response to revenue shortfalls (that is, revenues lower than originally anticipated) or other reasons during the budget execution period, and is it legally required to do so?

- a. (100) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below the enacted levels in response to revenue shortfalls or other reasons, and it does so in practice.
- b. (67) The executive obtains approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, but is not required to do so by law or regulation.
- c. (33) The executive is required by law or regulation to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, but in practice the executive implements these cuts before seeking approval from the legislature.
- d. (0) There is no law or regulation requiring the executive to obtain approval from the legislature prior to reducing spending below enacted levels, and in practice the executive implements these spending cuts before seeking prior approval from the legislature.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: In the Budget Code, article 192 (Tabling in the State Duma the draft federal law on the federal budget for the next financial year and planned period) item 6: In case if in the next fiscal year and planned period the total volume of expenditures is insufficient for the fiscal covering the

expenditure obligations approved by the law the Government of Russia tables in the State Duma the draft federal law on changing the deadlines of entry into force (suspension) of some statements of the federal laws, not secured with financial sources.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

118: Did a committee of the legislature examine the Audit Report on the annual budget produced by the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

- a. (100) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget within three months of its availability, and it published a report with findings and recommendations
- b. (67) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget within six months (but more than three months) of its availability, and it published a report with findings and recommendations.
- c. (33) Yes, a committee examined the Audit Report on the annual budget, but it did so after the report had been available for more than six months or it did not publish any report with findings and recommendations.
- d. (0) No, a committee did not examine the Audit Report on the annual budget.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: 25 July 2016 was registered and sent to the Chairman of State Duma; from July to October – on the consideration in State Duma. In October is considered as a law, 21 October 2016 – in the 1st reading <http://www.duma.gov.ru/news/273/1764017/#photo1> On 17 October was held a meeting of the Committee on budget and taxes. Commenting on the results of the event, the Chairman of the Committee Andrew Makarov noted that "for consideration of the draft budget for the next three-year period Parliament begins its work with a report on the execution of the 2015 budget and amendments to the budget act of 2016". "The fact, – said Alexander Makarov, – that the year 2015 is perhaps the most difficult budget year in the history of our country, and he gives very serious grounds for conclusions. In addition, the Budget code requires that a report on the budget of the previous year were reviewed prior to consideration of the new budget". <http://www.duma.gov.ru/legislative/consideration/council/> (<http://www.duma.gov.ru/legislative/consideration/council/>) The Council agreed with the Committee on budget and taxes of the order of consideration at the meeting of the State Duma on 21 October 2016 draft Federal laws: No. 2428-7 "On amendments to the Federal law "On Federal budget for 2016" (first reading); No. 1134020-6 "On execution of the Federal budget for 2015" <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>) Draft law On budget Execution for 2015 No 1134020-6 is on consideration since 25.07.2016

Comments: Researcher: Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber on the report of the Federal budget for 2015 was prepared in August 2016 and posted on the website of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation on 7 September 2016. Also these findings became part of the documents available on the website of the State Duma in October 2016. The first reference is just to confirm that the State Duma is considering in October 2016. Report 2015 presented in July 2016, and which should be considered prior to consideration of a new budget (for 2017) <http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget...> (<http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/>) 7 Sep 2016 <http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget...> (<http://www.ach.gov.ru/activities/audit-of-the-federal-budget/28047/>) Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation on the report on execution of the Federal budget for 2015 (approved by the Collegium of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation (Minutes of August 26, 2016 No. 43K (1118) Bill No. 1134020-6 execution of the Federal budget for 2015 registered and sent to the Chairman of the State Duma 25.07.2016 09:41 <http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/%28SpravkaNew%29?OpenAgent&RN=1134020-6&02>) The adoption of responsible Committee decision on submission of the bill in the Duma Council: offer to take the bill in the first reading and in General (the proposed date for consideration by the State Duma 21.10.2016) Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation (the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B425EDD8066C9C994325804500496D97](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&B425EDD8066C9C994325804500496D97)) Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation (Application) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&947BB6F76F700C9C43258045004A0B22](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&947BB6F76F700C9C43258045004A0B22)) Conclusion of the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation (covering letter) [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/...](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/...) ([http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/\(ViewDoc\)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&C74AD76826480D0A43258045004A590F](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/main.nsf/(ViewDoc)?OpenAgent&work/dz.nsf/ByID&C74AD76826480D0A43258045004A590F))

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: File "Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation Conclusion (the State Duma Committee on Budget and Taxes)" officially submitted for consideration to the State Duma Committee on 31.08.16. [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/C74AD76826480D0A43258045004A590F/\\$File/%D0%A1%D1%87%D0%B5%D1%82.%20%D0%BF%D0%B0%20%D0%92%D0%AB%D0%A5%D0%9E%D0%94-%D0%91%D0%9B%D0%90%D0%9D%D0%9A.doc?OpenElement](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/C74AD76826480D0A43258045004A590F/$File/%D0%A1%D1%87%D0%B5%D1%82.%20%D0%BF%D0%B0%20%D0%92%D0%AB%D0%A5%D0%9E%D0%94-%D0%91%D0%9B%D0%90%D0%9D%D0%9A.doc?OpenElement) "The Opinion of the responsible Committee (Committee of the State Duma on Budget and Taxes)" published on 20.10.16. Materials of the Accounts Chamber form the basis of the findings, as the file contains more than 150 references to the opinion of the Accounts Chamber. [http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/3DB1FEA4BEA99426432580520069206E/\\$File/%D0%97%D0%90%D0%9A%D0%9B%D0%AE%D0%A7%D0%92%D0%92%D0%AB%D0%A5%D0%9E%D0%94-%D0%91%D0%9B%D0%90%D0%9D%D0%9A.doc?OpenElement](http://asozd2.duma.gov.ru/work/dz.nsf/ByID/3DB1FEA4BEA99426432580520069206E/$File/%D0%97%D0%90%D0%9A%D0%9B%D0%AE%D0%A7%D0%92%D0%92%D0%AB%D0%A5%D0%9E%D0%94-%D0%91%D0%9B%D0%90%D0%9D%D0%9A.doc?OpenElement)

Researcher response: In agreement with the Government Reviewer, the response has been upgraded to "a". Starting from October 20, 2016, one could see the -- on the Duma website -- the Conclusion of the State Duma Committee on budget and taxes on draft Federal law no 1134020-6 "On execution of the Federal budget for 2015", which takes into account the conclusions of the Accounting Chamber. See:

119: Was the process of appointing (or re-appointing) the current head of the SAI carried out in a way that ensures his or her independence?

- a. (100) Yes, the head of the SAI may only be appointed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before the appointment takes effect.
- b. (0) No, the executive may appoint the head of the SAI without the final consent of the legislature or judiciary.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: According with the article 103 (item D) of the Constitution of the Russian Federation the Chairman of the Accounting Chamber is appointed by the State Duma for a term of six years. According with the article 7 part 1 of the federal law "On Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation" The Chairman of the Accounting Chamber is appointed for a term of six years. The Constitution does not regulate precisely who presents the candidate to the position of the chairman to the State Duma but the practice is that that the chairman of the Accounting Chamber is appointed upon recommendation of the President of the Russian Federation and it is not against the law and do not contradict the principle of separation of powers. The Deputy Chairman of the Accounting Chamber is appointed by the Federation Council upon recommendation of the President of the Russian Federation for a term of six years as well. Upon recommendation of the President of the Russian Federation, the Federation Council and the State Duma each appoint six auditors of the Accounting Chamber for a term of six years. See: <http://audit.gov.ru/en/about/> (<http://audit.gov.ru/en/about/>).

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

120: Must a branch of government other than the executive (such as the legislature or the judiciary) give final consent before the head of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) can be removed from office?

- a. (100) Yes, the head of the SAI may only be removed by the legislature or judiciary, or the legislature or judiciary must give final consent before he or she is removed.
- b. (0) No, the executive may remove the head of the SAI without the final consent of the judiciary or legislature.
- c. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The Federal law 41-fz from 5 April 2013 "On Accounting Chamber", article 7, item 8 regulates the removing of the chairman of the Accounting Chamber. He may be removed prematurely only by the State Duma only in the special cases: 1) violation of the legislation of the Russian Federation or the Commission of abuses in the service, if this decision receives a majority vote from total number of deputies of the State Duma; 2) personal application for resignation; 3) his recognition as legally incapable by a legally effective court decision; 4) in connection with loss of trust in the cases stipulated by the Federal law of 25 December 2008 No. 273-FZ "On combating corruption".

Comments: Researcher: <http://www.ach.gov.ru/about/document/> (<http://www.ach.gov.ru/about/document/>) The Federal law from April 5, 2013 No 41-FZ "On the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation"

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

121: Who determines the budget of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI)?

- a. (100) The SAI determines its own budget (i.e., submits it to the executive, which accepts it with little or no change, or directly to the legislature), or the budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- b. (67) The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is broadly consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- c. (33) The budget of the SAI is determined by the legislature or judiciary (or some independent body), but the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- d. (0) The budget of the SAI is determined by the executive, and the funding level is not consistent with the resources the SAI needs to fulfill its mandate.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The Federal law from 05.04.2013 N 41-FZ "On the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation" Article 41. Financial security for the activities of the Accounting Chamber 1. Funding the activities of the Accounting Chamber are at levels that allow providing the possibility of implementing the mandates assigned to it. 2. Budgetary allocations for maintenance of activity of the Accounting Chamber stipulated in the Federal law on the Federal budget for the next financial year and planning period. The budget allocations can be changed during the consideration of the draft Federal law on the Federal budget (on amendments to the Federal law on the Federal budget) only with the consent of the Federal Assembly. 3. Control over the use by the Accounting Chamber of the federal budget funds is carried out on the basis of decisions of the President of the Russian Federation, decrees of the Council of Federation and (or) decrees of the State Duma.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

122: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) have the discretion in law to undertake those audits it may wish to?

- a. (100) The SAI has full discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- b. (67) The SAI has significant discretion, but faces some limitations.
- c. (33) The SAI has some discretion, but faces considerable limitations.
- d. (0) The SAI has no discretion to decide which audits it wishes to undertake.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: The Federal law from 05.04.2013 N 41-FZ "On the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation" articles 3, 4, 5 In its activity the Accounting Chamber is guided by the Constitution of the Russian Federation, generally recognized principles and norms of international law, international treaties of the Russian Federation, the present Federal law, other Federal laws and international legal principles of independent auditing (control). In the implementation of its tasks, the Accounting Chamber has the organizational, functional and financial independence and operates independently. <http://audit.gov.ru/about/document/> (<http://audit.gov.ru/about/document/>) See, in particular articles 2, 14 and 15.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

123: Are the audit processes of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) reviewed by an independent agency?

- a. (100) Yes, an independent agency conducts and publishes a review of the audit processes of the SAI on an annual basis.
- b. (67) Yes, an independent agency conducts and publishes a review of the audit processes of the SAI at least once in the past five years, but not annually.
- c. (33) No, but a unit within the SAI conducts a review of the audit processes of the SAI on a regular basis.
- d. (0) No, the audit processes of the SAI are reviewed neither by an independent agency nor by a unit within the SAI.
- e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The Accounting Chamber is not reviewed by a peer SAI, an international organization, an academic institution with relevant expertise, or an independent domestic agency with quality assurance functions in the area of financial reporting

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

124: In the past 12 months, how frequently did the head or a senior staff member of the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) take part and testify in hearings of a committee of the legislature?

- a. (100) Frequently (i.e., five times or more).
- b. (67) Sometimes (i.e., three times or more, but less than five times).
- c. (33) Rarely (i.e., once or twice).

- d. (0) Never.
e. Not applicable/other (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: In the Data base on the State Duma web-site in the search tool for the “transcripts of the meetings of the State Duma” where was the Chairman of the Accounting Chamber - <http://transcript.duma.gov.ru/> (<http://transcript.duma.gov.ru/>) - was quite a long list of the meetings Transcript of the meetings, on 18 may 2016 Text: 347 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 19 January 2016 Text: 268 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 17 may 2016 Text: 277 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 11 may 2016 Text: 295 KB Chronicle of the meeting-may 18, 2016 Text: 34 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 20 may 2016 Text: 355 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 14 June 2016 Text: 233 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 19 April 2016 Text: 334 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 20 January 2016 Text: 294 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 26 January 2016 Text: 305 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 16 February 2016 Text: 282 KB Transcript of the meetings, on 08 June 2016 Text: 341 KB Transcript of the meetings of June 10, 2016 Text: 334 KB Chronicle of the meeting of 14 June 2016. Text: 41 KB

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

125: Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation of the annual budget (prior to the budget being tabled in parliament)?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on the budget.
b. (67) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on the budget.
c. (33) Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
d. (0) The requirements for a “c” response or above are not met.
e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: The government uses some participation mechanisms during the budget formulation phase, but participation is not, in practice, open to everyone The Russian Government announced the goal to be opened to the public. Concept of Open Government: <http://open.gov.ru/upload/iblock/37a/37a15dc7026ed84ae9a886b...> (<http://open.gov.ru/upload/iblock/37a/37a15dc7026ed84ae9a886bed7eab8a1.pdf>) And they use some participation mechanisms: working with reference groups; accepting of the public declarations of the goals and targets for each year; publication of information on the work of the agencies; public reporting; independent anti-corruption expertise and public monitoring; ensuring comprehensiveness; working with open data; interaction with community councils; interaction with mass media; work with citizens, organizations and public associations. But this participation is not, in practice, open to everyone during the formulation of the annual budget

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree with Comments

Comments: There is a Public Council under the Ministry of Finance which consists of 24 experts elected by business and non-governmental organizations. http://minfin.ru/ru/om/focal_advisory/os/ (http://minfin.ru/ru/om/focal_advisory/os/) The Public Council is a place for public discussion of the main budget draft documents.

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

126: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive take concrete steps to include vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to include individuals and/or CSOs representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population in the formulation of the annual budget.
b. (0) The requirements for an “a” response are not met.
c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: no examples have been found

Peer Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer
Opinion: Agree

127:

During the budget formulation stage, which of the following key topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

- a. (100) The executive's engagement with citizens covers all six topics
- b. (67) The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics
- c. (33) The executive's engagement with citizens cover at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met
- e. Not applicable (please comment)

Answer: d.

Sources: no examples have been found

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

128: Does the executive use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on budget implementation.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on budget implementation.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive uses participation mechanisms during the budget implementation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: no examples have been found

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

129: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive take concrete steps to receive input from vulnerable and under-represented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive takes concrete steps to receive input from individuals from and/or organizations representing vulnerable and underrepresented parts of the population on the implementation of the annual budget.
- b. (0) The requirements for an "a" response are not met.
- c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: no examples have been found

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

130:

During the implementation of the annual budget, which of the following topics does the executive's engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Changes in macroeconomic circumstances
2. Delivery of public services
3. Collection of revenue
4. Implementation of social spending
5. Changes in deficit and debt levels
6. Implementation of public investment projects

a. (100) The executive's engagement with citizens covers all six topics

b. (67) The executive's engagement with citizens covers at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics

c. (33) The executive's engagement with citizens cover at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics

d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: No examples have been found.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

131:

When the executive engages with the public, does it provide comprehensive prior information on the process of the engagement, so that the public can participate in an informed manner?

Comprehensive information must include at least three of the following elements:

1. Purpose
2. Scope
3. Constraints
4. Intended outcomes
5. Process and timeline

a. (100) Comprehensive information is provided in a timely manner prior to citizens engagement in both budget formulation and implementation phases.

b. (67) Comprehensive information is provided in a timely manner prior to citizens engagement only prior to one of the two phases (formulation OR implementation).

c. (33) Information is provided in a timely manner in both or one of the two phases, but it is not comprehensive.

d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.

e. Not applicable (Please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: the executive doesn't engage with the public

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

132: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 125, does the executive provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used in the formulation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received and a detailed report of how the inputs were used in the formulation of the annual budget.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used in the formulation of the annual budget.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: the executive doesn't engage with the public

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

133: With regard to the mechanism identified in question 128, does the executive provide the public with information on how citizens' inputs have been used to assist in monitoring the implementation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received from the public and a detailed report of how the inputs were used to assist in monitoring the annual budget.
- b. (67) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used to assist in monitoring the annual budget.
- c. (33) Yes, the executive provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: the executive doesn't engage with the public

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

134: Are participation mechanisms incorporated into the timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal?

- a. (100) Yes, the executive incorporates participation into its timetable for formulating the Executive's Budget Proposal and the timetable is available to the public.
- b. (0) The requirements for an "a" response are not met.
- c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: the executive doesn't engage with the public

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

135: Do one or more line ministries use participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during the formulation or implementation of the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, at least one line ministry uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public and government officials exchange views on the budget.
- b. (67) Yes, at least one line ministry uses open participation mechanisms through which members of the public provide their inputs on the budget.
- c. (33) Yes, at least one line ministry uses participation mechanisms during the budget formulation or implementation phase, but either these mechanisms capture only some ad-hoc views, or the executive invites specific individuals or groups for budget discussions (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: the executive doesn't engage with the public

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: There are so called Public Councils under all federal ministries and agencies. They include independent members elected by business and non-governmental organisations. These Councils are places for discussions of different questions included the ones related to the budget. See, e.g., Ministry of Health Care [https://www.rosminzdrav.ru/documents/9083-prikaz-ministerstva-zdravoohraneniya-rossiyskoy-federatsii-ot-28-marta-2014-g-143-ob-obschestvennom-sovete-pri-ministerstve-zdravoohraneniya-rossiyskoy-federatsii](https://www.rosminzdrav.ru/documents/9083-prikaz-ministerstv...)) Ministry of Education and Science <http://xn--80abucjiibhv9a.xn--p1ai/%D0%BE%D0%B1%D1%89%D0%B5%D1%81%D1%82%D0%B2%D0%B5%D0%BD%D0%BD%D1%8B%D0%B9-%D1%81%D0%BE%D0%B2%D0%B5%D1%82>)

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Not Qualified

Researcher response: In response to the Peer Reviewer: it is true that all the Ministries have their "public councils," but these councils do not seem to be formed on the basis of transparency, it is not possible to find out how they are formed. We could not find evidence that these Public Councils have ever discussed the budget at the formulation or implementation stage. If the budget was on the agenda, technically they could be considered as participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input.

IBP comment: This question asks whether the public participation mechanisms are USED, and it was not possible to confirm that these Public Councils discuss budgetary issues (the Peer Reviewer's citations mention a law establishing the Health Public Council, and minutes from the Public Council on Education, which do not cover budget formulation or implementation). The response is therefore maintained as "d."

136: Does the legislature or the relevant legislative committee(s) hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the formulation of the annual budget (pre-budget and/or approval stages)?

- a. (100) Yes, public hearings are held, and members of the public/CSOs testify.
- b. (67) Yes, public hearings are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the public hearings, but contributions from the public are received through other means.
- c. (33) Yes, public hearings are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the public hearings, and there are no other mechanisms through which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: c. (33)

Sources: The EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016. The EBP 2017 was published at the web-site of the Parliament on 31 October 2016.. There are no any deliberations and citizens engagement yet.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: The Federation Council Committee on Budget and Financial Markets has held, on 8.11.2016, open parliamentary hearings on a theme "About the parameters of the draft Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019." Materials of parliamentary hearings is available at: <http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/parliamenta...> (<http://budget.council.gov.ru/activity/activities/parliamentary/73417/>). In accordance with Article 86 of the regulations of Council of Federation, open parliamentary hearings may be attended by the representatives of the media and the public. Information on the subject, time and place of holding the parliamentary hearings is transmitted to the media no later than 10 days prior to the hearing (<http://www.council.gov.ru/structure/council/regulations/3282...> (<http://www.council.gov.ru/structure/council/regulations/32822/>)).

Researcher response: We agree with the Government Reviewer. We missed these hearings in our initial assessment. The hearings were held in the Council of Federations. There is no evidence that there was any contribution from the public or even who was participating, but it is true that the legislature hold parliamentary hearings where - legally -there is space for public presence. Response changed from "d" to "c."

137:

During the legislative deliberations on the annual budget (pre-budget or approval stages), which of the following key topics does the legislature's (or relevant legislative budget committee) engagement with citizens cover?

For the purpose of this question, key topics are considered to be:

1. Macroeconomic issues
2. Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration
3. Social spending policies
4. Deficit and debt levels
5. Public investment projects
6. Public services

- a. (100) The legislature seeks input on all six topics
 b. (67) The legislature seeks input on at least three (but less than six) of the above-mentioned topics
 c. (33) The legislature seeks input on at least one (but less than three) of the above-mentioned topics
 d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
 e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b. (67)

Sources: The EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016. The EBP 2017 was published at the web-site of the Parliament on 31 October 2016. There are no any deliberations and citizens engagement yet.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: b.

Comments: Transcript of the parliamentary hearings on the theme "About the parameters of the draft Federal budget for 2017 and the planning period of 2018 and 2019" is available at: <http://council.gov.ru/media/files/SLtmgQLz7zEugwyLnL0k6FebjA...>

(<http://council.gov.ru/media/files/SLtmgQLz7zEugwyLnL0k6FebjAKjh0Mt.pdf>) It covers such issues as: •Revenue forecasts, policies, and administration •Deficit and debt levels •Public investment projects

Researcher response: In agreement with the government reviewer we can change the response from "d" to "b."

IBP comment: A careful reading the question's text shows that a key requirement for an a-b-c response is that the legislature seeks input from citizens. This does not happen in Russia, where public hearings take place but the public does not provide input. Given this, to maintain consistency of responses across countries, the response remains "d."

138: Does the legislature provide feedback to the public on how citizens' inputs have been used during legislative deliberations on the annual budget?

- a. (100) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received from the public and a detailed report of how the inputs were used during legislative deliberations on the budget.
 b. (67) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used.
 c. (33) Yes, the legislature provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
 d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
 e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: The EBP 2017 was tabled on 28 October 2016. The EBP 2017 was published at the web-site of the Parliament on 31 October 2016. There are no any deliberations and citizens engagement yet.

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

139: Does the legislature hold public hearings and/or use other participation mechanisms through which the public can provide input during its public deliberations on the Audit Report?

- a. (100) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held, and members of the public/CSOs testify.

- b. (67) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the hearings, but contributions from the public are received through other means.
- c. (33) Yes, public hearings on the Audit Report are held. No testimony from the public is provided during the hearings and there are no other mechanisms through which public contributions are received, but the legislature invites specific individuals or groups to testify or provide input (participation is not, in practice, open to everyone).
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: Legislature does not use public participation mechanisms during its deliberations on the Audit Report

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

140: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in the SAI's audit program (for example, by bringing ideas on agencies, programs, or projects that could be audited)?

- a. (100) Yes, the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can suggest issues/topics to include in its audit program
- b. (0) The requirements for an "a" response are not met.
- c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: b.

Sources: There is mechanism of feedback at the web-site of the Accounting Chamber http://audit.gov.ru/public_reception/ (http://audit.gov.ru/public_reception/); but there isn't any example that it was ever used and any voice ever considered. The Audit program is developed only by the auditors

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: On the official website of the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation, there is a section called "Public Reception" (http://www.ach.gov.ru/public_reception/ (http://www.ach.gov.ru/public_reception/)). Every citizen can appeal to the Accounts Chamber.

Researcher response: There is mechanism of feedback on the web-site of the Accounting Chamber http://audit.gov.ru/public_reception/ (http://audit.gov.ru/public_reception/); but there isn't any example that this mechanism was ever used, and more specifically that any public suggestion of audit topic was ever considered. To our knowledge, the audit program (agenda and schedule) is developed only by the auditors. The response remains unchanged.

141: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) provide the public with feedback on how citizens' inputs have been used to determine its audit program?

- a. (100) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes both the list of the inputs received and a detailed report of how the inputs were used to determine its audit program.
- b. (67) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes both the list of inputs received and a summary of the how the inputs were used to determine its audit program.
- c. (33) Yes, the SAI provides a written record which includes either the list of the inputs received or a report or summary on how they were used.
- d. (0) The requirements for a "c" response or above are not met.
- e. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: d.

Sources: http://audit.gov.ru/public_reception/the-work-appeals (http://audit.gov.ru/public_reception/the-work-appeals) An overview on the work with applications of citizens, associations of citizens, including legal entities in the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation in III quarter of 2016 In the third quarter of 2016, the Accounting Chamber of the Russian Federation was considered and 551 appeal from citizens and organizations and projects of other government agencies. They were raised 771 questions. The information is only on the amount of addresses and thematic scope

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: c.

Comments: On the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation website of there is a section "Public reception", so every citizen can appeal to the Accounts Chamber. This section also publishes the report on work with appeals of citizens, associations of citizens (including legal entities). (http://www.ach.gov.ru/public_reception/the-work-appeals/) (http://www.ach.gov.ru/public_reception/the-work-appeals/)). This section also publishes a detailed report on work with appeals of citizens, associations of citizens (including legal entities). For example, in 2016, the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation considered 2405 complaints from citizens and representatives of organizations. More than 60 percent of them came in the form of an electronic document "Public reception". The information contained in the complaints of citizens was taken into account in the implementation of control and analytical activities.

Researcher response: In reading the cited report, we observe that the information provided only covers the amount of inputs and thematic scope. For example: n. complaints were received; n. complaints were redirected to other agencies; n. complaints were on the topics of... i.e. housing, education etc.; n. complaints were answered; on n. complaints appeals were prepared to the other agencies, i.e. to the prosecutor's office. We do not think this is sufficient to award a "c" answer, as this is not a list of the inputs or a report/summary on how they were used.

142: Does the Supreme Audit Institution (SAI) maintain formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)?

- a. (100) Yes, SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations.
- b. (0) The requirements for an "a" response are not met.
- c. Not applicable (please comment).

Answer: a. (100)

Sources: There is mechanism of feedback at the web-site of the Accounting Chamber http://audit.gov.ru/public_reception/ (http://audit.gov.ru/public_reception/); but the public can not contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.)

Peer Reviewer

Opinion: Agree

Government Reviewer

Opinion: Disagree

Suggested answer: a.

Comments: In the framework of the implementation of control measures, the Accounts Chamber of the Russian Federation conducts surveys of citizens' opinion on the effectiveness of budget spending. (<http://portal.audit.gov.ru/#/surveys/announcements> (<http://portal.audit.gov.ru/#/surveys/announcements>)). For example, the Survey "Rate the quality of works on construction, reconstruction, overhaul, repair and maintenance of motor roads" (Dates: 01.06.2016 - 15.12.2016) was conducted in the framework of control activity "Check the formation and budgetary expenditures on road funds in Saratov, Yaroslavl region, Voronezh region, Kaluga region (Dates — 31.05.2016 – 30.06.2016). The results of the survey is available at: <http://portal.audit.gov.ru/#/surveys/announcements/view/2138...> (<http://portal.audit.gov.ru/#/surveys/announcements/view/21381332>)

Researcher response: We do not believe that the 5 questionnaires are examples of how the SAI maintains formal mechanisms through which the public can contribute to audit investigations (as respondents, witnesses, etc.). There is no way to assess this. Who may participate in completing the questionnaires, for example? We do not think this is enough to award an "a" response.

IBP comment: The public engagement mechanisms described by the Government Reviewer are clearly inscribed within the SAI's audit activities (this is clearly stated in the introduction to each citizens' opinion survey). Therefore, to maintain consistency of responses across countries, the answer to this question has been changed from "b" to "a."

JOIN OUR INTERNATIONAL NETWORK



Connect with organizations working to improve government budget systems, policies and outcomes!

JOIN

([HTTP://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/JOIN-OUR-NETWORK/](http://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/JOIN-OUR-NETWORK/)) FIND GROUPS
([HTTP://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/FINDGROUP/](http://INTERNATIONALBUDGET.ORG/BUDGET-WORK-BY-COUNTRY/FINDGROUP/))